

GOPEN ACCESS

Citation: Gharehbolagh SA, Fallah B, Izadi A, Ardestani ZS, Malekifar P, M. Borman A, et al. (2020) Distribution, antifungal susceptibility pattern and intra-*Candida albicans* species complex prevalence of *Candida africana*: A systematic review and meta-analysis. PLoS ONE 15(8): e0237046. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal. pone.0237046

Editor: Joy Sturtevant, Louisiana State University, UNITED STATES

Received: May 9, 2020

Accepted: July 17, 2020

Published: August 20, 2020

Peer Review History: PLOS recognizes the benefits of transparency in the peer review process; therefore, we enable the publication of all of the content of peer review and author responses alongside final, published articles. The editorial history of this article is available here: https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0237046

Copyright: © 2020 Gharehbolagh et al. This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

RESEARCH ARTICLE

Distribution, antifungal susceptibility pattern and intra-*Candida albicans* species complex prevalence of *Candida africana*: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Sanaz Aghaei Gharehbolagh¹, Bahareh Fallah², Alireza Izadi¹, Zeinab Sadeghi Ardestani², Pooneh Malekifar³, Andrew M. Borman⁴, Shahram Mahmoudi⁵*

1 Department of Medical Parasitology and Mycology, School of Public Health, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran, 2 Department of Mycology, Faculty of Medical Sciences, Tarbiat Modares University, Tehran, Iran, 3 Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics, School of Public Health, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran, 4 Public Health England UK National Mycology Reference Laboratory, Southmead Hospital Bristol, Medical Research Council Centre for Medical Mycology (MRC CMM), University of Exeter, Exeter, United Kingdom, 5 Department of Medical Parasitology and Mycology, School of Medicine, Iran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran

* Mahmoudi.sh@iums.ac.ir, sh.mahmoudi93@gmail.com

Abstract

Candida africana is a pathogenic species within the Candida albicans species complex. Due to the limited knowledge concerning its prevalence and antifungal susceptibility profiles. a comprehensive study is overdue. Accordingly, we performed a search of the electronic databases for literature published in the English language between 1 January 2001 and 21 March 2020. Citations were screened, relevant articles were identified, and data were extracted to determine overall intra-C. albicans complex prevalence, geographical distribution, and antifungal susceptibility profiles for C. africana. From a total of 366 articles, 41 were eligible for inclusion in this study. Our results showed that C. africana has a worldwide distribution. The pooled intra-C. albicans complex prevalence of C. africana was 1.67% (95% CI 0.98–2.49). Prevalence data were available for 11 countries from 4 continents. Iran (3.02%, 95%CI 1.51-4.92) and Honduras (3.03%, 95% CI 0.83-10.39) had the highest values and Malaysia (0%) had the lowest prevalence. Vaginal specimens were the most common source of C. africana (92.81%; 155 out of 167 isolates with available data). However, this species has also been isolated from cases of balanitis, from patients with oral lesions, and from respiratory, urine, and cutaneous samples. Data concerning the susceptibility of C. africana to 16 antifungal drugs were available in the literature. Generally, the minimum inhibitory concentrations of antifungal drugs against this species were low.

In conclusion, *C. africana* demonstrates geographical variation in prevalence and high susceptibility to antifungal drugs. However, due to the relative scarcity of existing data concerning this species, further studies will be required to establish more firm conclusions.

Data Availability Statement: All relevant data are within the manuscript and its Supporting Information files.

Funding: The authors received no specific funding for this work.

Competing interests: The authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

Introduction

The medically important polyphyletic genus *Candida* contains more than 300 different yeast species, around 20 of which are regularly reported from human infections ranging in spectrum from superficial mycoses to deep-seated and disseminated infections [1–3]. *Candida albicans* is widely accepted as the most virulent species in the genus, and is the etiological agent in approximately 50%, 95%, and 80–90% of cases of nosocomial bloodstream *Candida* infections, oropharyngeal and vulvovaginal candidiasis, respectively [4–7].

C. albicans is a complex of three closely-related species, *C. albicans sensu stricto*, *C. dubliniensis*, and *C. africana* [6, 8]. *C. africana*, which was first isolated in Africa in 1995, was proposed as a new species within the *C. albicans* complex in 2001 [9, 10]. With a worldwide distribution, *C. africana* has been isolated from diverse clinical specimens (mucous membranes, cutaneous samples, specimens from the urinary and respiratory tracts, blood) and has been reported to cause a wide variety of human infections including vulvovaginal candidiasis, oral thrush, and blood stream infections. [11–15].

Unlike the other members of *C. albicans* complex, *C. africana* is unable to form chlamydospores and cannot assimilate glucosamine, N-acetylglucosamine, trehalose, or DL-lactate. However, in common with *C. albicans* and *C. dubliniensis* it has retained the capacity to produce germ-tubes. Moreover, molecular studies have demonstrated high levels of genetic relatedness between *C. africana* and *C. albicans* [16–18]. Thus, differentiation of *C. africana* from the other members of *C. albicans* complex using conventional identification techniques is difficult [19, 20].

Given these issues, molecular methods such as an end point PCR based on size polymorphism of the *hwp1* gene (*C. albicans*: 941bp, *C. dubliniensis*: 569 bp, and *C. africana*: 700 bp) have been designed to discriminate between *C. albicans*, *C. dubliniensis*, and *C. africana* [21]. Using such approaches, the prevalence of *C. africana* within the *C. albicans* complex has been reported to vary significantly from 0 to 8.4% depending on the geographic regions in which analyses were performed [11, 19, 22–24]. Furthermore, while some studies have suggested that the susceptibility profiles of *C. africana* to antifungal drugs are similar to those of *C. albicans* [25], others have reported different antifungal susceptibility patterns for these species [8, 26]. In light of the above discrepancies concerning *C. africana* prevalence and antifungal susceptibility, the present review and meta-analysis was designed to summarize all of the available data concerning this recent addition to the *C. albicans* species complex.

Methods

Search strategy

Two independent researchers conducted bibliographic search in PubMed, Scopus, and Web of Science databases as well as in Google Scholar using keywords or phrases "*Candida africana*", "*C. africana*", "*Candida albicans* complex", "*Candida albicans* sibling species", and "*Candida albicans* cryptic species" and their combinations. Since *Candida africana* was first described as a novel species in 2001 [10], our search covered the literature published in the English language from 2001 to 21st March 2020.

Study selection

Citations were included into EndNote software version X8, duplicates were deleted and the title and abstract of remaining citations were reviewed to exclude irrelevant articles. For the remaining citations, full texts were downloaded and evaluated. All English language articles with available full texts that reported data on antifungal susceptibility patterns of *Candida*

africana and/or prevalence of *Candida africana* within the *Candida albicans* species complex using molecular methods met the inclusion criteria. Conference abstracts, review articles, and articles reporting data other than the susceptibility pattern and/or prevalence of *Candida africana* were excluded. The quality of the selected studies was checked using the STROBE checklist [27]. References cited in the eligible articles were also screened to guarantee the inclusion of all relevant studies.

Data extraction

Data including the name of the first author, publication year, country, number of *Candida albicans* complex isolates, number of identified *Candida africana* isolates, the source of *Candida africana* isolates, and the minimum inhibitory concentration (MIC) values of various drugs against *Candida africana* isolates were extracted into a pre-prepared excel file by two independent researchers. Corresponding authors of studies reporting only the summary data of antifungal susceptibility pattern such as MIC range, geometric mean (GM), and MIC₅₀ were contacted via email for the raw data. In the case of no response, the summarized data of antifungal susceptibility patterns were excluded from the final analysis.

Data analysis

The pooled estimated prevalence of *C. africana* within the *C. albicans* complex was calculated using Stata software version 14. Variances and their confidence intervals were calculated using exact method. The pooled estimate was between 0 to 1. For studies reporting a prevalence of 0%, Freeman-Tukey double arcsine transformation was used to stabilize variances. Heterogeneity was determined using the I² statistic which was calculated using the DerSimonian-Laird method. For quantification of heterogeneity, Cochrane Q test was used. In the presence of heterogeneity, random effect model provides better estimates [28, 29], accordingly, we used this model in calculations when heterogeneity was proved to exist. Subgroup analysis was done to define the prevalence of *C. africana* within the *C. albicans* complex in different countries and continents. The presence of publication bias was checked by using the funnel plot and the Begg's test. In the case of asymmetric funnel plot, Trim and Fill method was used to define the number of missing studies and the imputed estimated prevalence. To check for changes in prevalence over time, meta regression was conducted where the year of publication was set as the independent variable. In all calculations p-values <0.05 were considered to be significant.

Results

A summary of the results of the search strategy is depicted in Fig 1. The original bibliographic search identified 363 articles. An additional 3 articles were identified though examination of all of the literature cited in the retained articles (other sources, Fig 1). After de-duplication and exclusion of irrelevant citations based on the title and abstract, 73 articles were retained for full text evaluation. At this stage, 32 articles were excluded on the basis of the criteria listed in Fig 1 and 41 articles were eligible to be included in the present study (Table 1). Due to the presence of heterogeneity (I² = 66.02%, 95% CI 44–77, p<001), random-effect model was used. The pooled prevalence of *C. africana* within the *C. albicans* complex was 1.67% (95% CI 0.98–2.49) (Fig 2). Data on prevalence were available for 11 countries from 4 continents. Iran (3.02%, 95%CI 1.51–4.92) and Honduras (3.03%, 95% CI 0.83–10.39) had the highest values and Malaysia (0%) had the lowest reported prevalence. (Table 2, S1 Fig and S2 Fig).

As shown in Fig 3, the funnel plot was broadly symmetrical, suggesting the absence of publication bias. This finding was confirmed using Begg's test (Z = 1.26, p = 0.215). In meta-



Fig 1. The PRISMA flow diagram for selection of studies reporting data on intra-*Candida albicans* complex prevalence and/or antifungal susceptibility patterns of *Candida africana* from 2001 to March 2020.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0237046.g001

regression analysis, no evidence for significant change in the prevalence of *C. africana* over time was found (Coefficient = -0.0013, SE = 0.0052, p = 0.802) (S3 Fig).

Information on isolation source was available for a total of 167 isolates. Although the vast majority of isolates were from the female genital tract (vagina; n = 155, 92.81%), there were also isolates from patients with balanitis (n = 5, 2.99%), oral lesions (n = 4, 2.39%), and isolates from respiratory, urine, and skin samples (1 isolate each, 0.6%).

MIC values were available for *C. africana* isolates and 16 antifungal drugs including azoles, echinocandins, polyenes, allylamine, and 5-flucytosine. As shown in <u>Table 3</u>, the MIC ranges, MIC₅₀ and MIC₉₀ and geometric mean values were generally low.

Discussion

C. africana, a member of *C. albicans* species complex, is genetically and phenotypically closely related to *C. albicans*. The pathogenicity of *C. africana* and its impact on the health of humans is poorly understood. Moreover, the global prevalence and antifungal susceptibility profiles of this species are not clearly defined [16, 18, 30]. In this study we tried to provide an overview of the available data published to date on both of these aspects of *C. africana* epidemiology/ biology.

C. africana appears to be globally distributed, with an intra-*C. albicans* complex prevalence that varies in different regions and countries [16, 31, 43]. To date, data concerning prevalence are available for 11 countries from 4 continents (Africa, America, Asia, and Europe), with a pooled intra-complex prevalence of 1.67% (95% CI 0.98–2.49). Based on the available

Reference	Year	Country	No. of <i>C. albicans</i> complex/ <i>C. africana</i>	Source of isolates (N)	Data of antifungal drugs	
Alonso-Vargas et al. [30]	2008	Spain	NA/1	Vagina (1)	Flu, ITR, VRC, KTC, AmB, FLC	
Borman et al. [17]	2013	United Kingdom	826/15	Vagina (15)	Flu, ITR, MCN, KTC, CLT, ECN, AmB, NYS	
Dieng et al. [31]	2012	Senegal	112/3	Vagina (3)	NA	
Fakhim et al. [32]	2020	Iran	114/3	Vagina (3)	Flu, ITR, VRC, AmB, FLC, CSP, ANF, MCF	
Farahyar et al. [33]	2020	Iran	100/3	Vagina (3)	Flu, ITR	
Feng et al. [22]	2015	China	49/0	-	NA	
Fontecha et al. [6]	2019	Honduras	66/2	Vagina (1), Urine (1)	NA	
Gil-Alonso et al. [8]	2015	Spain	NA/2	Vagina (1), Reference strain (1)	MCF	
Gil -Alonso et al. [34]	2015	Spain	NA/2	Vagina (1), Reference strain (1)	CSP, ANF, MCF	
Gil-Alonso et al. [26]	2016	Spain	NA/2	Vagina (1), Reference strain (1)	CSP	
Gil-Alonso et al. [<u>35</u>]	2019	Spain	NA/2	Vagina (1), Reference strain (1)	ANF	
Gumral et al. [23]	2011	Turkey	195/0	-	NA	
Guzel et al. [36]	2013	Turkey	58/0		NA	
Hashemi et al. [37]	2019	Iran	44/2	Vagina (2)	NA	
Hazirolana et al. [25]	2017	Turkey	376/3	Vagina (3)	Flu, VRC, KTC, AmB, ANF, MCF	
Hu et al. [<u>38</u>]	2015	China	129/5	Balanitis (5)	Flu, ITR, VRC, PSC, AmB, FLC, CSP, MCF	
Kardos et al. [39]	2017	Hungary	NA/2	Vagina (1), Reference strain (1)	MCF	
Khedri et al. [13]	2018	Iran	74/4	Oral lesions (4)	Flu, ITR, VRC, AmB, CSP	
Kova′cs et al. [<u>39</u>]	2017	Hungary	NA/2	Vagina (1), Reference strain (1)	MCF	
Lortholary et al. [40]	2007	France	NA/3	NA	Flu, VRC, PSC	
Majdabadi et al. [41]	2018	Iran	40/2	Vagina (2)	Flu, ITR, AmB	
Mucci et al. [5]	2017	Argentina	57/0		NA	
Naeimi et al. [19]	2018	Iran	119/10	Vagina (10)	Flu	
Ngouana et al. [20]	2014	Cameroon	115/2	Vagina (2)	Flu, ITR, KTC, AmB	
Ngouana et al. [42]	2019	Cameroon	115/2	Vagina (2)	NA	
Nnadi et al. [43]	2012	Italy	84/2	Vagina (2)	Flu, VRC, PSC, AmB, CSP, KTC, ITR, FLC	
Pakshir et al. [44]	2017	Iran	110/0	-	NA	
Rezazadeh et al. [45]	2016	Iran	67/4	Vagina (4)	NA	
Rezazadeh et al. [45]	2016	Iran	NA/4	NA	Flu, ITR, VRC, PSC, AmB, CSP	
Romeo et al. [46]	2009	Italy	376/27	Vagina (27)	NA	
Romeo et al. [46]	2009	Italy	134/1	Vagina (1)	NA	
Scordino et al. [1]	2019	Italy	21/0	-	NA	
Shan et al. [3]	2014	China	1014/15	Vagina (15)	Flu, ITR, NYS, MCN, CLT	
Sharifynia et al. [14]	2015	Iran	83/1	Lung (1)	Flu, ITR, AmB, CSP	
Sharma et al. [16]	2014	India	283/4	Vagina (4)	Flu, ITR, MCN, VRC, KTC, CLT, PSC, ISC, AmB, FLC,	
				0	CSP, ANF, MCF, TRB	
Shokohi et al. [47]	2018	Iran	47/1	Skin (1)	NA	
Solimani et al. [24]	2014	Iran	35/0	-	NA	
Theill et al. [2]	2016	Argentina	287/1	Vagina (1)	Flu, ITR, VRC, CLT, AmB, TRB, NYS	

Table 1. Characteristics of 41 studies reporting data on intra-*Candida albicans* complex prevalence and/or antifungal susceptibility pattern of *Candida africana* which were eligible to be included in the current systematic review and meta-analysis.

(Continued)

Reference	Year	Country	No. of <i>C. albicans</i> complex/ <i>C. africana</i>	Source of isolates (N)	Data of antifungal drugs
Yazdanpanah et al. [<u>11]</u>	2014	Malaysia	98/0	-	NA
Yazdanparast et al. [<u>48]</u>	2015	Iran	114/5	Vagina (5)	Flu, ITR, VRC, PSC, AmB, CSP, ANF, MCF
Zhu et al. [12]	2019	China	NA/43	Vagina (43)	Flu, ITR, MCN, VRC, CLT, BTC, TRC

Table 1. (Continued)

Abbreviations: NA: not available, Flu: fluconazole, ITR: itraconazole, VRC: voriconazole, KTC: ketoconazole, AmB: amphotericin B, FLC: 5-fluorocytosine, MCN: miconazole, CLT: clotrimazole, ECN: econazole, NYS: nystatin, CSP: caspofungin, ANF: anidulafungin, MCF: micafungin, PSC: posaconazole, TRB: terbinafine, ISC: isavuconazole, BTC: butoconazole, TRC: terconazole

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0237046.t001

literature, Malaysia (0.0%; 95% CI 0.0-3.77) has the lowest prevalence. Iran (3.02%; 95% CI 1.51-4.92) and Honduras (3.03%; 95% CI 0.83-10.39) have the highest prevalence. However, since prevalence in Iran was drawn from 12 different studies, it is likely to be a more reliable estimate than the prevalence reported for Honduras, which was based on a single study. Variation in prevalence could be seen between and across continents. For instance, although Iran has the highest prevalence, the prevalence of *C. africana* in a neighboring country, Turkey, is dramatically lower (0.22%; 95% CI 0.0-0.91). It is unclear whether this difference in relative prevalence is the result of an insufficient number of studies in Turkey, genuine local geographical variation, or a combination of both. It is also worth mentioning that the prevalence values reported in the current study are estimated with limited numbers of studies from each country. Data are also lacking for the majority of countries. Thus, the prevalence of *C. africana*.

The intra-complex prevalence of *C. africana* appears to be constant over time. In recent decades, the prevalence of non-*albicans Candida* species has increased [49, 50] and there are reports describing species other than *C. albicans* as being the most common etiologic agents of infection locally [51–53]. However, it seems that a similar scenario has not been occurring within the *C. albicans* species complex since the meta-regression analysis of our data indicates that there is no significant change in the intra-complex prevalence of *C. africana* with the passage of time. However, once again there are caveats to this suggestion. First, it is based on data from a limited number of countries. Moreover, the power of meta-regression analyses is low especially when the number of studies included is low, which is the case in the present study.

Female genital specimens are the most common source of isolation of *C. africana*. Of 167 *C. africana* isolates with available data, the majority (n = 155, 92.81%) were from the vagina. Vulvovaginal candidiasis due to *C. africana* has been reported in various countries [32]. This species was also isolated from cases of balanitis (n = 5, 2.99%) and oral lesions (n = 4, 2.39%), and from respiratory, urine, and skin samples (each 1 isolate, 0.6%), all of which could conceivably become contaminated with vaginal flora or pathogens. The apparent preponderance of *C. africana* for the female genital tract highlights the need for appropriate methods for discrimination of *C. africana* from *C. albicans* complex isolates, especially for vaginal specimens.

Data on antifungal susceptibility of *C. africana* to 16 antifungal drugs are available in the published literature (Table 3). It should be highlighted that the data presented in Table 3 are limited to articles in which detailed results of antifungal susceptibility testing are provided. Other articles that have reported their results as the number of resistant/susceptible isolates or as geometric mean and MIC range (and not the raw MICs) could not be included in Table 3. Similar patterns of susceptibility to various antifungal drugs has been reported for *C. africana* and *C. albicans* [25], while other studies have noted that *C. africana* exhibits a different

Studies (Year of Publication)	Prevalence (95% CI)	% Weight
Nnadi et al. (2012)	2.38 (00.66, 08.27)	2.93
Farahyar et al. (2020)	3.00 (01.03, 08.45)	3.18
Hashemi et al. (2019)	4.55 (01.26, 15.13)	2.02
Majdabadi et al. (2018)	5.00 (01.38, 16.50)	1.90
Dieng et al. (2012)	2.68 (00.92, 07.58)	3.34
Feng et al. (2015)	0.00 (00.00, 07.27)	2.16
Shan et al. (2014)	1.48 (00.90, 02.43)	5.39
Borman et al. (2013)	1.82 (01.10, 02.97)	5.30
Scordino et al. (2019)	0.00 (00.00, 15.46)	1.19
Yazdanpanah et al. (2014)	0.00 (00.00, 03.77)	3.15
Khedri et al. (2018)	5.41 (02.12, 13.09)	2.74
Shokohi et al. (2018)	2.13 (00.38, 11.11)	2.11
Romeo et al. (2009)	7.18 (04.98, 10.25)	4.77
Romeol et al. (2009)	0.75 (00.13, 04.11)	3.59
Solimani et al. (2014)	0.00 (00.00, 09.89)	1.73
Ngouana et al. (2014)	1.74 (00.48, 06.12)	3.38
Fakhim et al. (2020)	2.63 (00.90, 07.45)	3.37
Gumral et al. (2011)	0.00 (00.00, 01.93)	4.08
Sharma et al. (2014)	1.41 (00.55, 03.58)	4.50
Pakshir et al. (2017)	0.00 (00.00, 03.37)	3.31
Yazdanparast et al. (2015)	4.39 (01.89, 09.86)	3.37
Rezazadeh et al. (2016)	5.97 (02.35, 14.37)	2.60
Theill et al. (2016)	0.35 (00.06, 01.95)	4.52
Hazirolana et al. (2017)	0.80 (00.27, 02.32)	4.77
Hu et al. (2015)	3.88 (01.67, 08.75)	3.54
Naeimi et al. (2018)	8.40 (04.63, 14.78)	3.43
Ngouana et al. (2019)	1.74 (00.48, 06.12)	3.38
Mucci et al. (2017)	0.00 (00.00, 06.31)	2.37
Fontecha et al. (2019)	- 3.03 (00.83, 10.39)	2.58
Guzel et al. (2013)	0.00 (00.00, 06.21)	2.39
Sharifynia et al. (2015)	1.20 (00.21, 06.51)	2.91
Overall $(I^2 = 66.02\%, p = 0.00)$	1.67 (00.98, 02.49)	100.00
	1	
0 10	20	



https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0237046.g002

susceptibility pattern to *C. albicans* [8, 26]. Since there are no specified clinical breakpoints or epidemiological cut-off values (ECVs) for antifungal drugs against *C. africana*, the interpretation of MICs as susceptible/resistant or wild-type/non wild-type is potentially controversial. However, there are reports in which isolates of *C. africana* have been categorized as resistant to itraconazole, 5-flucytosine, terbinafine, fluconazole, and clotrimazole [28, 33, 54]. By applying the clinical breakpoints for *C. albicans* (CLSI M60) [55], the species most closely related to *C. africana*, it could be inferred that almost all isolates of *C. africana* with available MICs for fluconazole, voriconazole, anidulafungin, caspofungin, and micafungin are susceptible to these antifungal drugs. For itraconazole, in contrast to CLSI (M60 supplement) [55] which no longer proposes breakpoints for *C. andida* species, the European Committee on Antimicrobial

Continent	Country	Prevalence (%) (95% confidence interval)		
Africa	Cameroon	1.74 (0.65–4.54)		
	Senegal	2.68 (0.87–7.98)		
	Overall	2.09 (1-4.32)		
America	Argentina	0.11 (0.00-1.04)		
	Honduras	3.03 (0.83-10.39)		
	Overall	0.51 (0.00-2.46)		
Asia	China	1.50 (0.22–3.57)		
	India	1.41 (0.55–3.58)		
	Iran	3.02 (1.51-4.92)		
	Malaysia	0.00 (0.00-3.77)		
	Turkey	0.22 (0.00-0.91)		
	Overall	1.66 (0.81-2.73)		
Europe	Italy	2.33 (0.04-6.79)		
	United Kingdom	1.82 (1.10–2.97)		
	Overall	2.17 (0.29–5.25)		

 Table 2. The pooled intra-Candida albicans complex prevalence of Candida africana in different countries and continents based on the reported studies between 2001 to March 2020.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0237046.t002





https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0237046.g003

Antifungal drug	No. of isolates with available data	Minimum inhibit	Minimum inhibitory concentration (MIC) values (µg/mL)			
		MIC range	MIC ₅₀	MIC ₉₀	Geometric mean	
Fluconazole	53	0.063-1	0.125	0.5	0.13	
Itraconazole	43	0.016-0.25	0.031	0.125	0.031	
Voriconazole	30	0.008-0.25	0.016	0.25	0.022	
Ketoconazole	23	0.008-2	0.063	0.063	0.04	
Posaconazole	21	0.008-0.031	0.016	0.016	0.013	
Miconazole	18	0.016-0.063	0.063	0.063	0.046	
Clotrimazole	18	0.016-0.25	0.063	0.063	0.048	
Econazole	10	0.063-0.063	0.063	0.063	0.063	
Isavuconazole	4	0.016-0.016	0.016	0.016	-	
Caspofungin	27	0.008-0.5	0.031	0.25	0.040	
Micafungin	22	0.008-0.125	0.016	0.063	0.018	
Anidulafungin	13	0.008-0.063	0.016	0.031	0.016	
Amphotericin B	35	0.016-8	0.125	0.5	0.113	
Nystatin	15	0.031-2	1	2	0.758	
5-flucytosine	6	0.016-0.125	0.063	0.125	-	
Terbinafine	5	1-2	2	2	-	

Table 3. The summary of all data reporting antifungal susceptibility patterns of *Candida africana* during 2001 to March 2020 (studies without raw data of minimum inhibitory concentrations are not included).

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0237046.t003

Susceptibility Testing recently published new breakpoints for itraconazole against *C. albicans* and *C. dubliniensis* [29]. Using those breakpoints (>0.06 μ g/mL = resistance) 12 out of 43 (27.91%) *C. africana* isolates with available data would be itraconazole-resistant. Further studies will be required to generate MIC data for sufficient numbers of isolates of *C. africana* to allow the establishment of robust species-specific ECVs and clinical breakpoints for this species.

Conclusion

C. africana is a minor species within the *C. albicans* complex with a pooled prevalence of 1.67%. Reports of this species are available from a limited number of countries and further investigations are required internationally to fully address its global distribution. The vagina is the most common human source of *C. africana* and based on clinical breakpoints established for the related *C. albicans*, this species can be inferred to be generally susceptible to most currently available antifungal drugs.

Supporting information

S1 Fig. The forest plot of intra-*Candida albicans* complex prevalence of *Candida africana* in different countries based on the reported articles between 2001 to 2020 (size of squares is representative of the relative weight of studies). (TIF)

S2 Fig. The forest plot of intra-*Candida albicans* complex prevalence of *Candida africana* in different continents based on the reported articles between 2001 to 2020 (size of squares is representative of the relative weight of studies). (TIF)

S3 Fig. The meta-regression of intra-*Candida albicans* complex prevalence of *Candida africana* with the time (size of circles is representative of the relative weight of studies;

studies with a prevalence of 0% are not shown). (TIF)

S1 Appendix. The search strategy used in PubMed database to find relevant literature. (CSV)

S2 Appendix. The completed PRISMA checklist for systematic reviews. (DOC)

Author Contributions

Conceptualization: Shahram Mahmoudi.

Data curation: Sanaz Aghaei Gharehbolagh, Bahareh Fallah, Alireza Izadi, Zeinab Sadeghi Ardestani, Pooneh Malekifar, Andrew M. Borman, Shahram Mahmoudi.

Formal analysis: Pooneh Malekifar, Shahram Mahmoudi.

Investigation: Sanaz Aghaei Gharehbolagh, Bahareh Fallah, Alireza Izadi, Zeinab Sadeghi Ardestani.

Methodology: Sanaz Aghaei Gharehbolagh, Shahram Mahmoudi.

Project administration: Shahram Mahmoudi.

Software: Pooneh Malekifar.

Supervision: Shahram Mahmoudi.

Writing – original draft: Sanaz Aghaei Gharehbolagh, Bahareh Fallah, Alireza Izadi, Shahram Mahmoudi.

Writing - review & editing: Andrew M. Borman, Shahram Mahmoudi.

References

- Scordino F, Giuffre L, Felice MR, Orlando MG, Medici MA, Merlo FM, et al. Genetic diversity of Candida albicans isolates recovered from hospital environments and patients with severe acquired brain injuries. Infect Genet Evol. 2019; 76: 7.
- Theill L, Dudiuk C, Morano S, Gamarra S, Nardin ME, Méndez E, et al. Prevalence and antifungal susceptibility of Candida albicans and its related species Candida dubliniensis and Candida africana isolated from vulvovaginal samples in a hospital of Argentina. Rev Argent Microbiol. 2016; 48(1): 43–49. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ram.2015.10.003 PMID: 26922471
- Shan Y, Fan S, Liu X, Li J. Prevalence of Candida albicans-closely related yeasts, Candida africana and Candida dubliniensis, in vulvovaginal candidiasis. Med Mycol. 2014; 52(6): 636–640. <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/mmy/myu003</u> PMID: 25023482
- Bitar I, Khalaf RA, Harastani H, Tokajian S. Identification, typing, antifungal resistance profile, and biofilm formation of Candida albicans isolates from Lebanese hospital patients. BioMed research international. 2014; 2014: 931372. https://doi.org/10.1155/2014/931372 PMID: 24982915
- Mucci MJ, Cuestas ML, Landanburu MF, Mujica MT. Prevalence of Candida albicans, Candida dubliniensis and Candida africana in pregnant women suffering from vulvovaginal candidiasis in Argentina. Rev Iberoam Micol. 2017; 34(2): 72–76. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.riam.2016.09.001 PMID: 28385421
- Fontecha G, Montes K, Ortiz B, Galindo C, Braham S. Identification of Cryptic Species of Four Candida Complexes in a Culture Collection. J Fungi (Basel). 2019; 5(4): 12.
- 7. Vila T, Sultan AS, Montelongo-Jauregui D, Jabra-Rizk MA. Oral Candidiasis: A Disease of Opportunity. J Fungi (Basel). 2020; 6(1): 15.
- Gil-Alonso S, Jauregizar N, Eraso E, Quindos G. Postantifungal Effect of Micafungin against the Species Complexes of Candida albicans and Candida parapsilosis. PloS one. 2015; 10(7): e0132730. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0132730 PMID: 26168269

- Tietz H, Küssner A, Thanos M, De Andrade MP, Presber W, Schönian G. Phenotypic and genotypic characterization of unusual vaginal isolates of Candida albicans from Africa. J Clin Microbiol. 1995; 33 (9): 2462–2465. https://doi.org/10.1128/JCM.33.9.2462-2465.1995 PMID: 7494047
- Tietz HJ, Hopp M, Schmalreck A, Sterry W, Czaika V. Candida africana sp. nov., a new human pathogen or a variant of Candida albicans? Mycoses. 2001; 44(11–12): 437–445. <u>https://doi.org/10.1046/j.</u> 1439-0507.2001.00707.x PMID: 11820255
- 11. Yazdanpanah A, Khaithir TMN. Issues in identifying germ tube positive yeasts by conventional methods. J Clin Lab Anal. 2014; 28(1): 1–9. https://doi.org/10.1002/jcla.21635 PMID: 24375729
- Zhu YX, Shi Y, Fan SR, Liu XP, Yang J, Zhong SL. Multilocus sequence typing analysis of Candida africana from vulvovaginal candidiasis. BMC Infect Dis. 2019; 19(1).
- Khedri S, Santos ALS, Roudbary M, Hadighi R, Falahati M, Farahyar S, et al. Iranian HIV/AIDS patients with oropharyngeal candidiasis: identification, prevalence and antifungal susceptibility of Candida species. Lett Appl Microbiol. 2018; 67(4): 392–399. https://doi.org/10.1111/lam.13052 PMID: 30019443
- Sharifynia S, Badali H, Sorkherizi MS, Shidfar MR, Hadian A, Shahrokhi S, et al. In vitro antifungal susceptibility profiles of Candida albicans complex isolated from patients with respiratory infections. Acta Med Iran. 2016; 54(6): 376–381. PMID: 27306344
- Odds FC, Bougnoux M-E, Shaw DJ, Bain JM, Davidson AD, Diogo D, et al. Molecular phylogenetics of Candida albicans. Eukaryotic cell. 2007; 6(6): 1041–1052. https://doi.org/10.1128/EC.00041-07 PMID: 17416899
- Sharma C, Muralidhar S, Xu J, Meis JF, Chowdhary A. Multilocus sequence typing of Candida africana from patients with vulvovaginal candidiasis in New Delhi, India. Mycoses. 2014; 57(9): 544–552. https://doi.org/10.1111/myc.12193 PMID: 24697839
- Borman AM, Szekely A, Linton CJ, Palmer MD, Brown P, Johnson EM. Epidemiology, antifungal susceptibility, and pathogenicity of Candida africana isolates from the United Kingdom. J Clin Microbiol. 2013; 51(3): 967–972. https://doi.org/10.1128/JCM.02816-12 PMID: 23303503
- Felice MR, Gulati M, Giuffre L, Giosa D, Di Bella LM, Criseo G, et al. Molecular Characterization of the N-Acetylglucosamine Catabolic Genes in Candida africana, a Natural N-Acetylglucosamine Kinase (HXK1) Mutant. PloS one. 2016; 11(1): e0147902. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0147902 PMID: 26808192
- Naeimi B, Mirhendi H, Khamisipour G, Sadeghzadeh F, Ahmadi B. Candida africana in recurrent vulvovaginal candidiasis (RVVC) patients: Frequency and phenotypic and genotypic characteristics. J Med Microbiol. 2018; 67(11): 1601–1607. https://doi.org/10.1099/jmm.0.000834 PMID: 30248002
- Ngouana TK, Krasteva D, Drakulovski P, Toghueo RK, Kouanfack C, Ambe A, et al. Investigation of minor species Candida africana, Candida stellatoidea and Candida dubliniensis in the Candida albicans complex among Yaoundé (Cameroon) HIV-infected patients. Mycoses. 2015; 58(1): 33–39. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/myc.12266 PMID: 25289589</u>
- Romeo O, Criseo G. First molecular method for discriminating between Candida africana, Candida albicans, and Candida dubliniensis by using hwp1 gene. Diagn Microbiol Infect Dis. 2008; 62(2): 230–233. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.diagmicrobio.2008.05.014 PMID: 18640803
- Feng X, Ling B, Yang X, Liao W, Pan W, Yao Z. Molecular identification of Candida species isolated from onychomycosis in Shanghai, China. Mycopathologia. 2015; 180(5–6): 365–371. https://doi.org/ 10.1007/s11046-015-9927-9 PMID: 26227864
- Gumral R, Sancak B, Guzel AB, Saracli MA, Ilkit M. Lack of Candida africana and Candida dubliniensis in Vaginal Candida albicans Isolates in Turkey Using HWP1 Gene Polymorphisms. Mycopathologia. 2011; 172(1): 73–76. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11046-011-9401-2 PMID: 21380767
- Solimani P, Salari S, khalizadeh S, Hassanzad M, Khodavaisy S, Abastabar M, et al. Use of PCR-RFLP and PCR-HWP1 for identification of Candida species isolated from cystic fibrosis patients. Res Mol Med. 2014; 2(3): 23–27.
- Hazirolan G, Altun HU, Gumral R, Gursoy NC, Otlu B, Sancak B. Prevalence of Candida africana and Candida dubliniensis, in vulvovaginal candidiasis: First Turkish Candida africana isolates from vulvovaginal candidiasis. J Mycol Med. 2017; 27(3): 376–381. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mycmed.2017.04.106 PMID: 28641919
- 26. Gil-Alonso S, Jauregizar N, Eraso E, Quindós G. Postantifungal effect of caspofungin against the Candida albicans and Candida parapsilosis clades. Diagn Microbiol Infect Dis. 2016; 86(2): 172–177. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.diagmicrobio.2016.07.011 PMID: 27492134
- von Elm E, Altman DG, Egger M, Pocock SJ, Gotzsche PC, Vandenbroucke JP. The Strengthening the Reporting of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (STROBE) statement: guidelines for reporting observational studies. Annals of internal medicine. 2007; 147(8): 573–577. <u>https://doi.org/10.7326/</u> 0003-4819-147-8-200710160-00010 PMID: 17938396

- Kontopantelis E, Reeves D. Performance of statistical methods for meta-analysis when true study effects are non-normally distributed: A simulation study. Statistical methods in medical research. 2012; 21(4): 409–426. https://doi.org/10.1177/0962280210392008 PMID: 21148194
- Brockwell SE, Gordon IR. A comparison of statistical methods for meta-analysis. Statistics in medicine. 2001; 20(6): 825–840. https://doi.org/10.1002/sim.650 PMID: 11252006
- Alonso-Vargas R, Elorduy L, Eraso E, Cano JF, Guarro J, Ponton J, et al. Isolation of Candida africana, probable atypical strains of Candida albicans, from a patient with vaginitis. Med Mycol. 2008; 46(2): 167–170. https://doi.org/10.1080/13693780701633101 PMID: 17885960
- Dieng Y, Sow D, Ndiaye M, Guichet E, Faye B, Tine R, et al. Identification of three Candida africana strains in Senegal. J Mycol Med. 2012; 22(4): 335–340. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mycmed.2012.07.052 PMID: 23518168
- Fakhim H, Vaezi A, Javidnia J, Nasri E, Mahdi D, Diba K, et al. Candida africana Vulvovaginitis: Prevalence and Geographical Distribution. J Mycol Med. 2020: 100966.
- Farahyar S, Izadi S, Razmjou E, Falahati M, Roudbary M, Ashrafi-Khozani M, et al. Low prevalence of antifungal resistant Candida africana, in the C. albicans complex causing vulvovaginal candidiasis. Heliyon. 2020; 6(3): e03619.
- 34. Gil-Alonso S, Jauregizar N, Cantón E, Eraso E, Quindós G. Comparison of the in vitro activity of echinocandins against Candida albicans, Candida dubliniensis, and Candida africana by time-kill curves. Diagn Microbiol Infect Dis. 2015; 82(1): 57–61. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.diagmicrobio.2015.01.010</u> PMID: 25703894
- Gil-Alonso S, Quindos G, Eraso E, Jauregizar N. Postantifungal effect of anidulafungin against Candida albicans, Candida dubliniensis, Candida africana, Candida parapsilosis, Candida metapsilosis and Candida orthopsilosis. Rev Esp Quimioter. 2019; 32(2): 183–188. PMID: 30847462
- Guzel AB, Kucukgoz-Gulec U, Aydin M, Gumral R, Kalkanci A, Ilkit M. Candida vaginitis during contraceptive use: the influence of methods, antifungal susceptibility and virulence patterns. Journal of obstetrics and gynaecology: the journal of the Institute of Obstetrics and Gynaecology. 2013; 33(8): 850–856.
- Hashemi SE, Shokohi T, Abastabar M, Aslani N, Ghadamzadeh M, Haghani I. Species distribution and susceptibility profiles of Candida species isolated from vulvovaginal candidiasis, emergence of C. lusitaniae. Current medical mycology. 2019; 5(4): 26–34. https://doi.org/10.18502/cmm.5.4.2062 PMID: 32104741
- Hu Y, Yu A, Chen X, Wang G, Feng X. Molecular Characterization of Candida africana in Genital Specimens in Shanghai, China. BioMed research international. 2015; 2015.
- Kovacs R, Saleh Q, Bozo A, Toth Z, Gesztelyi R, Kardos T, et al. Killing Activity of Micafungin Against Candida albicans, C. dubliniensis and Candida africana in the Presence of Human Serum. Mycopathologia. 2017; 182(11–12): 979–987. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11046-017-0178-9 PMID: 28699056
- Lortholary O, Dannaoui E, Raoux D, Hoinard D, Datry A, Paugam A, et al. In vitro susceptibility to posaconazole of 1,903 yeast isolates recovered in France from 2003 to 2006 and tested by the method of the European committee on antimicrobial susceptibility testing. Antimicrob Agents Chemother. 2007; 51(9): 3378–3380. https://doi.org/10.1128/AAC.00496-07 PMID: 17576839
- Majdabadi N, Falahati M, Heidarie-Kohan F, Farahyar S, Rahimi-Moghaddam P, Ashrafi-Khozani M, et al. Effect of 2-Phenylethanol as Antifungal Agent and Common Antifungals (Amphotericin B, Fluconazole, and Itraconazole) on Candida Species Isolated from Chronic and Recurrent Cases of Candidal Vulvovaginitis. Assay Drug Dev Technol. 2018; 16(3): 141–149. <u>https://doi.org/10.1089/adt.2017.837</u> PMID: 29658789
- Ngouana TK, Toghueo RMK, Kenfack IF, Lachaud L, Nana AK, Tadjou L, et al. Epidemiology and antifungal susceptibility testing of non-albicans Candida species colonizing mucosae of HIV-infected patients in Yaoundé (Cameroon). J Mycol Med. 2019; 29(3): 233–238. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.</u> mycmed.2019.06.003 PMID: 31204235
- 43. Nnadi NE, Ayanbimpe GM, Scordino F, Okolo MO, Enweani IB, Criseo G, et al. Isolation and molecular characterization of Candida africana from Jos, Nigeria. Med Mycol. 2012; 50(7): 765–767. https://doi.org/10.3109/13693786.2012.662598 PMID: 22380533
- Pakshir K, Bordbar M, Zomorodian K, Nouraei H, Khodadadi H. Evaluation of CAMP-like effect, biofilm formation, and discrimination of Candida africana from vaginal Candida albicans species. J Pathog. 2017; 2017.
- Rezazadeh E, Sabokbar A, Moazeni M, Rezai MS, Badali H. Microdilution in vitro antifungal susceptibility patterns of Candida species, from mild cutaneous to bloodstream infections. Jundishapur J Microbiol. 2016; 9(7).

- 46. Romeo O, Criseo G. Molecular epidemiology of Candida albicans and its closely related yeasts Candida dubliniensis and Candida africana. J Clin Microbiol. 2009; 47(1): 212–214. https://doi.org/10.1128/ JCM.01540-08 PMID: 18987171
- 47. Shokohi T, Moradi N, Badram L, Badali H, Ataollahi MR, Afsarian MH. Molecular Identification of Clinically Common and Uncommon Yeast Species. Jundishapur J Microbiol. 2018; 11(10): 6.
- Yazdanparast SA, Khodavaisy S, Fakhim H, Shokohi T, Haghani I, Nabili M, et al. Molecular Characterization of Highly Susceptible Candida africana from Vulvovaginal Candidiasis. Mycopathologia. 2015; 180(5–6): 317–323. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11046-015-9924-z PMID: 26183965
- 49. Ben-Ami R. Treatment of invasive candidiasis: A narrative review. J Fungi (Basel). 2018; 4(3): 97.
- Makanjuola O, Bongomin F, Fayemiwo SA. An update on the roles of non-albicans Candida species in vulvovaginitis. J Fungi (Basel). 2018; 4(4): 121.
- Juyal D, Sharma M, Pal S, Rathaur VK, Sharma N. Emergence of non-albicans Candida species in neonatal candidemia. N Am J Med Sci. 2013; 5(9): 541. https://doi.org/10.4103/1947-2714.118919 PMID: 24251272
- Rishi S, Jain B. Prevalence of Albicans and Non-Albicans Candiduria in a Tertiary Care Hospital of Jaipur, India. Galore International Journal of Health Sciences and Research. 2020; 5(1): 1–5.
- 53. Sun M, Chen C, Xiao W, Chang Y, Liu C, Xu Q. Increase in Candida parapsilosis candidemia in cancer patients. Mediterr J Hematol Infect Dis. 2019; 11(1).
- Al-Hedaithy SS, Fotedar R. Recovery and studies on chlamydospore-negative Candida albicans isolated from clinical specimens. Med Mycol. 2002; 40(3): 301–306. https://doi.org/10.1080/mmy.40.3. 301.306 PMID: 12146760
- 55. CLSI performance Standards for Antifungal Susceptibility Testing of Yeasts. 1st ed. CLSI supplement M60. Wayne, PA: CLinical and Laboratory Standards Institute; 2017.