Citation: Woldu M, Minzi 0, Shibeshi W, Shewaamare A, Engidawork E (2021) Predicting the risk of atherosclerotic cardiovascular disease among adults living with HIV/AIDS in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: A hospital-based study. PLoS ONE 16(11): e0260109. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal. pone. 0260109

Editor: Gualtiero I. Colombo, Centro Cardiologico Monzino, ITALY

Received: June 8, 2021
Accepted: November 2, 2021
Published: November 29, 2021
Peer Review History: PLOS recognizes the benefits of transparency in the peer review process; therefore, we enable the publication of all of the content of peer review and author responses alongside final, published articles. The editorial history of this article is available here: https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone. 0260109

Copyright: © 2021 Woldu et al. This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

Data Availability Statement: All relevant data are within the paper and its Supporting Information files.

# Predicting the risk of atherosclerotic cardiovascular disease among adults living with HIV/AIDS in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: A hospital-based study 

Minyahil Woldu ${ }^{1,2 \varnothing}$, Omary Minzi ${ }^{1 ®}$, Workineh Shibeshi ${ }^{2 \ddagger}$, Aster Shewaamare ${ }^{3 \ddagger}$, Ephrem Engidawork $\mathbb{D}^{20 *}$<br>1 Department of Clinical Pharmacy and Pharmacology, Muhimbili University of Health and Allied Sciences, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania, 2 Department of Pharmacology and Clinical Pharmacy, School of Pharmacy, College of Health Sciences, Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, 3 Zewditu Memorial Hospital, ART Clinic, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia<br>- These authors contributed equally to this work. $\ddagger$ These authors also contributed equally to this work.<br>* ephrem.engidawork@aau.edu.et


#### Abstract

\section*{Background}

Atherosclerotic Cardiovascular Disease (ASCVD) is an emerging problem among People living with HIV/AIDS (PLWHA). The current study aimed at determining the risk of ASCVD among PLWHA using the Pooled Cohort Equation (PCE) and the Framingham Risk score (FRS).

\section*{Methods}

A hospital-based study was carried out from January 2019 to February 2020 in PLWHA. The prevalence of ASCVD risk was determined in individuals aged between 20 to 79 and 40 to 79 years using the FRS and PCE as appropriate. Chi-square, univariate and multivariate logistic regressions were employed for analysis.

\section*{Results}

The prevalence of high-risk ASCVD for subjects aged 20 and above using both tools was $11.5 \%$. For those aged 40 to 79 years, PCE yielded an increased risk ( $28 \%$ ) than FRS (17.7\%). Using both tools; advanced age, male gender, smoking, and increased systolic blood pressure were associated with an increased risk of ASCVD. Younger age (adjusted odds ratio, AOR) $0.20,95 \% \mathrm{Cl}$ : $0.004,0.091$; $\mathrm{P}<0.001$ ), lower systolic blood pressure (AOR $0.221,95 \% \mathrm{Cl}: 0.074,0.605 \mathrm{P}<0.004$ ), and lower total cholesterol (AOR $0.270,95 \% \mathrm{Cl}$ : $0.073,0.997 ; \mathrm{p}<0.049$ ) were found to be independent predictors of reduced risk of ASCVD. Likewise, younger age ( 40 to 64 years), female gender, and lower systolic blood pressure were significantly associated with lower risk of ASCVD among patients aged 40 to 79 years using both PCE and FRS.


Funding: The author(s) received no specific funding for this work.

Competing interests: The authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

## Conclusions

A considerable number of PLWHA have been identified to be at risk for ASCVD. ASCVD risk was significantly associated with advanced age, male gender, higher blood pressure, and smoking using both FRS and PCE. These factors should therefore be taken into account for designing management strategies.

## Introduction

The Human Immunodeficiency Virus (HIV) associated morbidity and mortality have declined significantly since the introduction of Antiretroviral Therapy (ART) [1], which extended the life expectancy of People Living with HIV/AIDS (PLWHA). However, Cardiovascular Diseases (CVDs) and related other non-communicable diseases remain an increased concern among PLWHA [2, 3]. On top of this, the etiology of Atherosclerotic Cardiovascular Disease (ASCVD) in PLWHA is also multi-factorial [4]. Several risk factors for CVDs in PLWHA including age, dyslipidemia, diabetes mellitus, hypertension, family history, sedentary life, cigarette smoking, and cocaine use have been reported [5, 6].

Heart attack, ASCVD, stroke, and other forms of CVDs have been reported to be nearly doubled in PLWHA compared to the general population, despite well-control of HIV-infections with combination ARTs (cARTs) [7-9]. This could be attributed to complexity of the management as well as the need for lifetime intervention [10]. It is therefore prudent to adequately determine the risk of such CVDs for proper monitoring as well as improving outcomes of cART [11].

ASCVD has become the major factor, limiting life expectancy, and causing death in participants age 45 years and above [12]. The intensity of efforts to prevent CVDs depends on the absolute risk of ASCVD, which can be calculated either using the Pooled Cohort Equation (PCE) or the Framingham Risk Score (FRS) [13, 14]. PCE and FRS have been considered as reliable and accurate benchmark for assessing cardiovascular risks in the general population [15]. Indeed, the 10 year PCE \& FRS estimations are the most widely used tools for ASCVD risk evaluation $[16,17]$ and both share similar variables to determine the risk, even though few variations exist [3, 10, 18].

The PCE was designed to determine the risk among population age 40 to 79 years, whereas the FRS was designed to evaluate ASCVD risk among people age 20 to 79 years as well as age 40 to 79 years [19, 20].

The risk can be classified as low-risk ( $<10 \%$ ), moderate risk ( $10-20 \%$ ), and high-risk ( $>20 \%$ ) using FRS [21], and as low risk ( $<7.5 \%$ ) and elevated-risk ( $\geq 7.5 \%$ ) using PCE [18]. The prevalence of ASCVD is reported to be in the range of $70-90 \%$ for the low-risk, 20-30\% for the moderate risk, and $0-20 \%$ for the high-risk using FRS [22-25]. The overall prevalence of elevated ASCVD risk using either of the tools was approximately $25 \%$ [26].

Although CVD is an emerging and significant cause for morbidity and mortality in HIVinfected patients, the main guidelines of HIV therapy are still focusing on HIV and opportunistic infections, with little or no emphasis on non-communicable diseases [27]. Moreover, though the issue is well investigated in developed countries, there is paucity of such data in resource-constrained regions such as sub-Saharan Africa, particularly Ethiopia. Thus, the present study aimed at determining the risk and outcome of ASCVD among PLWHA using PCE and FRS.

## Methods

## Study setting

This was a hospital-based study conducted in PLWHA on follow-up care between January 2019 and February 2020 at Zewditu Memorial Hospital, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. It was the first hospital that commenced and initiated the subsidized fee-based scheme of ART service in Ethiopia in 2003. Currently, there are about 7,674 active adults and 2,558 children in its fol-low-up nest [28].

## Patients and sampling

Patients were sampled from newly registered as well as existing PLWHA on follow-up care at ZMH. Adult (aged 20 years and above) HIV positive patients and willing to participate were included. Severely ill patients as well as pregnant and breastfeeding women were excluded from the study. Sample size was calculated using the formula for descriptive studies: Sample size $(\mathrm{n})=\left[\mathrm{DEFF}^{*} \mathrm{~Np}(1-\mathrm{p})\right] /\left[\left(\mathrm{d} 2 / \mathrm{z} 21-\alpha / 2^{*}(\mathrm{~N}-1)+\mathrm{p}^{*}(1-\mathrm{p})\right]\right.$ : where N is population size (7674); $\mathrm{P}(\cong 25 \% \pm 5 \%)$ is the estimated prevalence for ASCVD in HIV- infected population obtained from the literature [23]; DEEF, design effect (1.5); d, precision (0.1); and z21- $\alpha / 2$, 1.96. Considering $10 \%$ contingency (lost to follow-up and defaulters). An estimated sample size of 314 was obtained using the aforementioned assumptions. A systematic random sampling technique was used to recruit study participants. The sample interval (K) was calculated using the formula $\mathrm{N} / \mathrm{n}(7674 / 314 \cong 24)$. The first participant was selected using a lottery method from patients having an appointment during the first day. Since the number of adult ART clinics in the hospital were four; every six $(24 / 4)$ volunteer participants were then enrolled in the study. Negative response and refusal to continue participation following prior consent was managed by enrolling the next participant automatically.

## Data collection

Detailed information about the participants was obtained through laboratory tests, clinical examination/measurement, patient interviews, and chart review. The instrument for a face-toface interview was adapted from the structured questionnaire used by the WHO stepwise approach to non-communicable disease risk factor surveillance (STEPS-2014) [29]. The questionnaire included information related to socio-demographic characteristics (age, gender, religion, civil status, address, educational level, occupation, monthly income), clinical characteristics (Family History of CVD, Viral Load, CD4 Count, Time Since ART Initiated, WHO Staging, ART Medication Regimen, and Frequency of ART Medication Switch), tobacco use (active, passive and smoking history), alcohol consumption (active, alcohol use history), coffee, and khat use. The questionnaire was pre-tested prior to the actual data collection and appropriate modifications were performed accordingly.

The online version of PCE calculator (originally created by the American College of Cardiology/American Heart Association) was used with prior permission, and the online free version of the FRS tool (originally created by the National, Heart, Lung, and Blood Institute) was accessed from the GlobalRPH.com.

## Data analysis

Data were cleaned, coded, double-entered, and analyzed using IBM SPSS Statistics software version 25 for Windows. All categorical variables were coded as 0 (for female and no responses) and ( 1 for male and yes responses). To make comparison easier, the risk calculated using FRS was treated as dichotomous (low and elevated risk) by considering moderate and
high risk as elevated risk. Hence, low-risk ( $<10 \%$ for FRS or $<7.5 \%$ for PCE) was coded as " 0 " and elevated-risk ( $\geq 10 \%$ for FRS or $\geq 7.5 \%$ for PCE) as " 1 ". Permission was obtained from ClinCalc.com to use the online calculator.

Variables including age, gender, lipid profile (total cholesterol \& HDL), systolic blood pressure, smoking status, and blood pressure medications were used to calculate the risk of ASCVD in both PCE and FRS. In addition, race for PCE and LDL for FRS were used [18, 30].

Determination of the risk of ASCVD among patients aged 20 to 79 years $(\mathrm{n}=288)$ was carried out using the FRS tool. A separate determination of the risk for patients aged 40 to 79 years was also carried out using both tools.

Chi-square, univariate, bivariate, and multivariate log-linear regression analyses as well as the Pearson's chi-square with continuity correction and odds ratio (OR) with the corresponding $95 \%$ confidence interval (CI) were used to estimate the relations, associations, and interactions between variables. The outputs of bivariate analysis with p-value $\leq 0.20$ were further analyzed in multivariate logistic regression to control the effect of confounders. Statistical significance was considered at p-value $\leq 0.05$.

## Ethics statement

The study was approved by several Institutional Review Boards, including the Muhimbili University of Health and Allied Sciences, Office of the Director of Research and Publications, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania (Ref. No. 2018-04-23/AEC//Vol. XII/88), School of Pharmacy (ERB/SOP/ 41/11/2018), College of Health Sciences (Meeting number 08/2018), Addis Ababa University, and City Government of Addis Ababa Health Bureau, (Ref no. A/A/HB/344438/227), Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. The study was carried out under the tenets of the Declaration of Helsinki. Patients provided written informed consent before they participated in the study. Confidentiality and anonymity were maintained by restricting data access and removing identifiers.

## Results

## Enrolment

Initially, 314 patients were enrolled. However, 26 participants were later excluded for a variety of reasons: 10 were defaulter (unknown reasons); 4 due to critical illness (three due to high blood pressure, one due to high blood sugar); and 2 discontinued due to change of address (Fig 1). Hence, data for 288 patients were used for analysis.

## Sociodemographic and clinical characteristics

The sociodemographic and clinical characteristics of patients, as determined by FRS, are depicted in Table 1. Majority of the patients were female (69.4\%) and under 50 years of age (69.4\%). Close to half $(45.1 \%)$ were married and a third of them ( $32.3 \%$ ) completed high school education.
About $12 \%$ of the patients had an elevated-risk for ASCVD. Chi-square analysis revealed that the male gender ( $93.9 \%$ ) had a significantly elevated-risk $\left(\chi^{2}=35.881, p<0.001\right.$ ) than the female gender (6.1\%). Likewise, the risk increased with age, with patients aged $\geq 50$ years ( $93.9 \%$ ) having a significant elevated-risk for $\operatorname{ASCVD}\left(\chi^{2}=67.233, p<0.001\right)$ than those under 50 years of age. Although married participants (51.5\%) and low-income generating group (81.8\%) tended to have an increased risk for ASCVD, it failed to reach a statistical significance (Table 1).

## Association studies

The calculated risk using both tools is presented in Table 2. Accordingly, individual aged 65 to 79 years had a significantly higher risk for ASCVD than their younger compatriots (40-64


## Ascertainment of the primary outcomes was complete for $91.7 \%$ of the potential patient-years on follow-up

Fig 1. Enrolment, screening and follow up.
https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0260109.g001
years) in both PCE ( $\chi 2=20.758, \mathrm{p}<0.001$ ), and FRS ( $\chi 2=28.207, \mathrm{p}<0.001$ ) methods. Characteristics such as blood group, WHO staging, and family history did not have significant contribution to ASCVD risk. Smoking was also identified as a significant predictor of ASCVD in both tools, though one cell had a count of less than 5\% (Table 2). Hence, Fisher's Exact Test was used in place of Pearson Chi-square.

Logistic regression was utilized to determine predictors of FRS score in both total patients (Table 3) as well as those 40 to 79 years of age (Table 4). When the total patients were considered, younger age (adjusted odds ratio (AOR) $0.20,95 \% \mathrm{CI}(0.004,0.091) ; \mathrm{p}<0.001$ ), lower systolic blood pressure (AOR $0.221(0.074,0.605) ; \mathrm{p}<0.004)$, and lower total cholesterol (AOR $0.270,95 \%$ CI ( $0.073,0.997 ; \mathrm{p}<0.049$ ) were found to be independent predictors of reduced risk for ASCVD (Table 3). Similarly, only younger age (age 40 to 59), the female gender, and lower systolic blood pressure were associated with lower risk for ASCVD among PLWHA age 40 to 79 years using both the FRS (Table 4) and PCE (Table 5).

To see the effect of ART regimen on mean score, ASCVD risk was calculated based on FRS and PCE, and a curve was plotted for age (Fig 2), sex (Fig 3), and blood group (Fig 4). The

Table 1. Socio-demographic characteristics of HIV-infected patients with 20 and above years of age on ART follow up care at Zewditu Memorial Hospital, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

| Socio-demographic | ASCVD risk using FRS |  | $\chi^{2}$-value | $P$ value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Low risk (\%) | Elevated risk |  |  |
| Number (\%) | 255 (88.5) | 33 (11.5) |  |  |
| Gender |  |  |  |  |
| Female | 160 (62.7) | 2 (6.1) | $35.881^{* a}$ | $p<0.001$ |
| Male | 95 (37.3) | 31 (93.9) |  |  |
| Age |  |  |  |  |
| 20-49 | 198 (77.6) | 2 (6.1) | $67.233^{* a}$ | $p<0.001$ |
| $\geq 50$ | 57 (22.4) | 31 (93.9) |  |  |
| Civil status |  |  |  |  |
| Never married | 49 (19.2) | 4 (12.1) | $1.138^{\# a}$ | $p=0.768$ |
| Married | 113 (44.3) | 17 (51.5) |  |  |
| Divorced | 55 (21.6) | 7 (21.2) |  |  |
| Widowed/r | 38 (14.9) | 5 (15.2) |  |  |
| Educational status |  |  |  |  |
| No formal education | 34 (13.3) | 1 (3.0) | $7.944^{\# \mathrm{a}}$ | $p=0.159$ |
| Primary (1-6 ${ }^{\text {th }}$ grade) | 58 (22.7) | 7 (21.2) |  |  |
| Secondary Junior ( $7-8^{\text {th }}$ grade) | 24 (9.4) | 3 (9.1) |  |  |
| High school (9-12 ${ }^{\text {th }}$ grade) | 87 (34.1) | 9 (27.3) |  |  |
| College/university diploma | 37 (14.5) | 10 (30.3) |  |  |
| College/ University Degree/master or above | 15 (5.9) | 3 (9.1) |  |  |
| Occupational status ${ }^{\ddagger}$ |  |  |  |  |
| A-list (intermediate to high income) | 38 (14.9) | 6 (18.2) | $5.211^{\# a}$ | $p=0.74$ |
| B-list (small to intermediate income) | 171 (67.1) | 16 (48.5) |  |  |
| C-list (non-income generating) | 46 (18) | 11 (33.3) |  |  |

$\mathrm{n}=288$; Data presented as \% prevalence
*Continuity Correction is computed for a 2 x 2 table
\#Pearson Chi-square; ASCVD, atherosclerotic cardiovascular disease; FRS, Framingham Risk Score

* Classification is based on ISEC (International Socio-Economic Classes) [31]. A-List (Higher-level professional; Higher level manager and entrepreneur; Lower-level professional; Lower-level manager; Clerical routine non-manual worker; Sales and service routine non-manual worker). B-List (Small self-employed with employee; Small self-employed without employer; Small self-employed in agriculture; Manual supervisor; Skilled manual worker; Semi- and unskilled manual worker. C-List (Agricultural laborers; Retired; Students; unemployed).
https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0260109.t001
mean score for the risk based on both FRS was found to be higher with NNRTI-based regimen, age 40-64 years, the male gender, and blood type ' $O$ '. On the other hand, the highest marginal mean was observed in NNRTI based regimen, the male gender, age 65-79 years, and blood type 'A' in the PCE method.


## Discussion

This is the first study that attempted to determine the ASCVD risk prevalence and predictors among PLWHA based on both PCE and FRS methods. Several studies investigated the risk of ASCVD in PLWHA using the FRS/PCE tools and reported that both FRS and PCE are equally important in both PLWHA and the general population, although some prefer PCE [3, 17, 18, $32,33]$ and others FRS $[19,34]$. We used both tools because this is the first study conducted in the country and wanted it to serve as a basis for future similar studies.

Table 2. The risk for atherosclerosis cardiovascular disease using the Pooled Cohort Equation and the Framingham Risk Score in HIV-infected patients aged 40 to 79 years at Zewditu Memorial Hospital, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

| Characteristics |  | ASCVD risk using PCE |  | $\chi^{2} \text {-value }$ | P value | ASCVD risk using FRS |  | $\chi^{2} \text {-value }$ | $P$ value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Low risk | Elevated risk |  |  | Low risk | Elevated risk |  |  |
| Number (\%) |  | 134 (72) | 52 (28) |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & 153 \\ & (82.3) \end{aligned}$ | 33 (17.7) |  |  |
| Age (Year) | 40-64 | $\begin{array}{\|l} 134 \\ (100) \end{array}$ | 43 (82.7) | 20.758*a | $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} \hline 139 \\ (90.8) \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 17(51.5) | 28.207*a | $p<0.001$ |
|  | 65-79 | 0 (0) | 9 (17.3) |  |  | 14 (9.2) | 16 (48.5) |  |  |
| Gender | Female | 72 (53.7) | 13 (25.0) | 11.331*a | $p=0.001$ | 83 (54.2) | 2 (6.1) | 23.496*a | $p=0.001$ |
|  | Male | 62 (46.3) | 39 (75.0) |  |  | 70 (45.8) | 31 (93.9) |  |  |
| Civil status | Never married | 18 (13.4) | 5 (9.6) | $0.679^{\# a}$ | $p=0.787$ | 19 (12.4) | 4 (12.1) | $0.207^{\# a}$ | $p=0.976$ |
|  | Married | 65 (48.5) | 28 (53.8) |  |  | 76 (49.7) | 17 (51.5) |  |  |
|  | Divorced | 27 (20.1) | 10 (19.2) |  |  | 30 (19.6) | $7(21.2)$ |  |  |
|  | Widowed | 24 (17.9) | 9 (17.3) |  |  | 28 (18.3) | 5 (15.2) |  |  |
| Educational status | No formal education | 23 (17.2) | 6 (11.5) | $7.140^{\# a}$ | $p=0.068$ | 28 (18.3) | 1 (3.0) | $13.575$ | $p=0.004$ |
|  | Primary ( $1-6^{\text {th }}$ grade) | 32(23.9) | 9 (17.3) |  |  | 34(22.2) | 7 (21.2) |  |  |
|  | Secondary Junior/high school (7-12 ${ }^{\text {th }}$ grade) | 60(44.8) | 21 (40.4) |  |  | 69(45.1) | 12 (36.4) |  |  |
|  | College/University (diploma/degree) | 19(14.2) | 16 (30.8) |  |  | 22(14.4) | 13 (39.4) |  |  |
| Family history ${ }^{\text {b }}$ | No | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 110 \\ (82.1) \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 47 (90.4) | $1.379^{* a}$ | $p=0.240$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 126 \\ (82.4) \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 31 (93.9) | 1.959*a | $p=0.162$ |
|  | Yes | 24 (17.9) | 5(9.6) |  |  | 27 (17.6) | 2(6.1) |  |  |
| Blood type | A | 45 (33.6) | 15 (28.8) | $3.955^{\# a}$ | $p=0.138$ | 52 (34.0) | 8 (24.2) | $1.556^{* a}$ | $p=0.459$ |
|  | B \& $\mathrm{AB}^{\text {g }}$ | 45 (33.6) | 12 (23.1) |  |  | 47 (30.7) | 10(30.3) |  |  |
|  | O | 44 (32.8) | 25 (48.1) |  |  | 54 (35.3) | 15 (45.5) |  |  |
| The WHO staging at baseline | Stage I | 18 (13.4) | 7 (13.5) | $1.867^{\# a}$ | $p=0.601$ | 22 (14.4) | 3 (9.1) | $1.253^{\# \mathrm{a}}$ | $p=0.740$ |
|  | Stage II | 26 (19.4) | 12 (23.1) |  |  | 32 (20.9) | 6 (18.2) |  |  |
|  | Stage III | 70 (52.2) | 22 (42.3) |  |  | 73 (47.7) | 19 (57.6) |  |  |
|  | Stage IV | 20 (14.9) | 11 (21.2) |  |  | 26 (17.0) | 5 (15.5) |  |  |
| TB prophylaxis | No | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 117 \\ (87.3) \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 48 (92.3) | 0.51 *a | $P=0.479$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 134 \\ (87.6) \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 31 (93.9) | 0.553*a | $p=0.457$ |
|  | Yes | 17 (12.7) | 4 (7.7) |  |  | 19 (12.4) | 2 (6.1) |  |  |
| ART class regimen | 2 NRTIs + 1 INI | 68 (50.7) | 25 (48.1) | $3.925^{\# a}$ | $P=0.141$ | 84 (54.9) | 9 (27.3) | $8.624^{\# a}$ | $p=0.013$ |
|  | 2 NRTIs + 1 NNRTI | 43 (32.1) | 23 (44.2) |  |  | 48 (31.4) | 18 (54.5) |  |  |
|  | $2 \mathrm{NRTIs}+1 \mathrm{PI}{ }^{\text {d }}$ | 23 (17.2) | 4 (7.7) |  |  | 21 (13.7) | 6 (18.2) |  |  |
| ART regimen as $1^{\text {st }}, 2^{\text {nd }}$, and $3^{\text {rd }}$ line | $1^{\text {st }}$ line | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 111 \\ (82.8) \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 48 (92.3) | $1.999^{* a}$ | $P=0.157$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 132 \\ (86.3) \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 27 (81.8) | 0.150*a | $p=0.699$ |
|  | $2^{\text {nd }}$ and $3^{\text {rd }}{ }^{\text {line }}{ }^{\text {e }}$ | 23 (17.2) | 4 (7.7) |  |  | 21 (13.7) | 6 (18.2) |  |  |
| Change of ART regimen | No change from the baseline | 26 (19.4) | 15 (28.8) | $3.083^{\# a}$ | $P=0.214$ | 31 (20.3) | 10 (30.3) | $1.894^{\# a}$ | $p=0.388$ |
|  | Changed one time | 58 (43.3) | 16 (30.8) |  |  | 61 (39.9) | 13 (39.4) |  |  |
|  | Changed two or more times ${ }^{\text {f }}$ | 50 (37.3) | 21 (40.4) |  |  | 61 (39.9) | 10 (30.3) |  |  |
| Current Medications | ARVs | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 125 \\ (93.3) \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 37 (71.2) | 14.415*a | $p<0.001$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 135 \\ (88.2) \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 27 (81.8) | 0.506*a | $p=0.477$ |
|  | ARVs with other medications ${ }^{\text {c }}$ | 9 (6.7) | 15 (28.8) |  |  | 18 (11.8) | 6 (18.2) |  |  |
|  | Yes | 25 (8.7) | 55 (24.9) |  |  | 25 (8.7) | 55 (24.9) |  |  |
| Coffee-drinking | No | 79 (59.0) | 19 (36.5) | 6.679*a | $P=0.006$ | 86 (56.2) | 12 (36.4) | $3.530^{* a}$ | $p=0.060$ |
|  | Yes | 55 (41.0) | 33 (63.5) |  |  | 67 (43.8) | 21 (63.6) |  |  |

(Continued)

Table 2. (Continued)

| Characteristics |  | ASCVD risk using PCE |  | $\chi^{2}$-value | $P$ value | ASCVD risk using FRS |  | $\chi^{2}$-value | $P$ value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Low risk | Elevated risk |  |  | Low risk | Elevated risk |  |  |
| Smoking | No | $\begin{aligned} & 129 \\ & (96.3) \end{aligned}$ | 45 (86.5) | $4.375^{\text {e }}$ | $P=0.039$ | $\begin{aligned} & 146 \\ & (95.4) \end{aligned}$ | 28 (84.8) | $2.431^{\text {e } \ddagger}$ | $p=0.041$ |
|  | Yes ${ }^{\text {h }}$ | 5 (3.7) | 7 (13.5) |  |  | 7 (4.6) | 5 (2.7) |  |  |

$\mathrm{n}=186$; Data presented as \% prevalence
*Continuity Correction is computed for a 2 x 2 table
\#Pearson Chi-square; ASCVD, atherosclerotic cardiovascular disease; FRS, Framingham risk score; chi-square test); PCE, Pooled Cohort Equation

* Khat, plant/substance chewed in East-Africa and Middle East as a stimulant or benefit for the purpose of "recreational values"
a. 0 cells ( $0.0 \%$ ) had a count of less than 5
b, Family history: History of Cardiometabolic diseases among siblings
c, Other medications include BP lowering drugs, blood sugar lowering agents, lipid lowering agents and antiepileptic and antipsychotics
d, Only one case was on 2 NRTIs +1 INTI +1 PI regimen
e, Only one case was on $3^{\text {rd }}$ line
f, Eleven individual changed 3 times and four participants changed 4 times
g, Fourteen of the cases were with $A B$ blood type
h, 1 cell had a count of less than $5 \%$
$\ddagger$, Fisher's Exact Test was used
https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0260109.t002
The prevalence of elevated risk for ASCVD in all patients based on FRS was 11.5\%. It was $28 \%$ and $17.7 \%$ for those patients 40 to 79 years of age based on the PCE and FRS method, respectively. Since race has been incorporated as a predictor in determination of the risk for ASCVD by the PCE method, an exaggerated prevalence might be seen in such population, as evidenced in the present study ( $28 \%$ for PCE vs. $17.7 \%$ for FRS). Moreover, the lower cut-off point used for the PCE method ( $\geq 7.5 \%$ ) could also contribute to the observed higher prevalence.

The prevalence of elevated risk for ASCVD in all patients based on FRS in our study is found to be higher than the Chinese [35], Botswana [36] and Taiwan [37] studies, but lower than the Italian [38] and the US [26] studies. Moreover, the male gender and age $\geq 50$ years were found to be predictors of elevated-risk for ASCVD and this is consistent with studies conducted in the USA $[3,39]$. Study design, sample size, population genetics, and study duration could account for the observed discrepancies.

Our study revealed that age plays a major role in the prevalence of elevated ASCVD risk and this is in line with several studies conducted elsewhere [12, 39-41]. In our study, participants with 40 to 64 years of age had a low-risk for ASCVD than those with the age range 65 to 79 years based on both methods and this is in agreement with several studies done globally [10, 12, 23, 37, 42-44]. On the other hand, many other studies have also reported high prevalence of elevated ASCVD risk at 40 to 65 years of age that tended to decline with age above 65 years [44, 45].

Consistent with our finding, there is a sex-based difference in the lifetime risk for ASCVD, being $50 \%$ for men and $33.3 \%$ for women at 40 years of age and decreasing to $33 \%$ for men and $25 \%$ for women at 70 years of age [44]. The association of the male gender with increased risk for ASCVD is a subject of controversy. The female sex hormones have been assumed to confer a protective role for ASCVD. However, a recent published study [46] did not provide any evidence for the role of these hormones in ASCVD risk prevention, casting doubt on their protective role. As a result, post-menopausal hormone replacement therapy should not be

Table 3. Association between ASCVD risk using FRS and clinical characteristics among people living with HIV/AIDS at Zewditu Memorial Hospital, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

| Clinical characteristics | ASCVD risk using FRS |  | COR (95\% C.I.) | $P$ value | AOR (95\% C.I.) | $P$ value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Low risk ( $<10 \%$ ) $\mathrm{n}=255$ | High risk ( $>10 \%$ ) $\mathrm{n}=33$ |  |  |  |  |
| Age (year) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\geq 50$ | 57 (22.4) | 31 (93.9) | 1.00 |  | 1.00 |  |
| $<50$ | 198 (77.6) | 2 (6.1) | . 019 (.004-.080) | P<. 001 | . 020 (.004, .091) | $p<0.001$ |
| $\text { CD4 count (cells } / \mu \mathrm{L} \text { ) }$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $>/=500$ | 94 (36.9) | 13 (39.4) | 1.00 |  | 1.00 |  |
| <500 | 161 (63.1) | 20 (60.6) | .898(.427, 1.889) | $P=0.777$ | . 895 (.309, 2.591) | $p=0.838$ |
| Systolic blood pressure (mmHg) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $>/=130$ | 89 (34.9) | 25 (75.5) | 1.00 |  | 1.00 |  |
| <130 | 166 (65.1) | 8 (24.5) | . 172 (.074, .396) | P<0.001 | . 221 (.074, .605) | $p=0.004$ |
| Total cholesterol (mg/dL) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $>/=160$ | 164 (64.3) | 29 (87.9) | 1.00 |  | 1.00 |  |
| <160 | 91 (35.7) | 4 (12.1) | . 249 (.085, 0729) | $P=0.011$ | . 270 (.073, .997) | $p=0.049$ |
| HDL cholesterol (mg/dL) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <50 | 173 (67.8) | 27 81.8) | 1.00 |  | 1.00 |  |
| $>/=50$ | 82 (32.2) | 6 (18.2) | . 469 (.186, 1.180) | $P=0.108$ | . 365 (.106, 1.255) | $p=0.110$ |
| Duration on ART (year) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $>/=2$ years | 229 (89.8) | 32 (97) | 1.00 |  | 1.00 |  |
| $<2$ years | 26 (10.2) | 1 (3) | . 275 (0.036, 2.098) | $P=0.213$ | . 276 (.028, 2.739) | $p=0.271$ |
| Blood group |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Type 'O' | 82 (32.2) | 15 (5.2) | 1.00 |  | 1.00 |  |
| Type 'A' | 95 (37.3) | 8 (24.2) | . 460 (.186, 1.141) | $P=0.094$ | . 635 (.193, 2.083 | $p=0.454$ |
| Type 'B' \& 'AB' | 78 (30.6) | (30.3)10 | . 701 (.297, 1.653) | $P=0.417$ | 1.371 (.418, 4.497) | $p=0.603$ |
| Current ARV drug regimens |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2NRTIs + 1PI* | 48 (18.8) | 6 (18.2) | 1.00 |  | 1.00 |  |
| 2 NRTIs + 1 INI | 129 (50.6) | 9 (27.3) | . 323 (.095, 1.097) | $P=0.323$ | . 279 (.062, 1.254 | $p=0.096$ |
| 2 NRTIs + 1 NNRTI | 78 (30.6) | $1854.5)$ | . 535 (.180, 1.593) | $P=0.535$ | 1.254 (.304, 5.177) | $p=0.754$ |

$\mathrm{n}=288$; Data presented as \% prevalence; ASCVD, Atherosclerotic Cardiovascular Disease; CI, confidence interval; FRS, Framingham risk score; OR, odds ratio *two of the cases were on 2 NRTIs+ $1 \mathrm{INTI}+1 \mathrm{PI}$ ) regimen.
https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0260109.t003
considered as beneficial for ASCVD prevention strategies. Environmental factors (cigarette smoking and working in hazardous conditions) have also been suggested to play a major role in sex difference of ASCVD distribution [44, 45, 47, 48]. Although females tend to have a lower-risk for ASCVD, its occurrence is associated with poor prognosis and increased risk of mortality [ 3,45 ].

Smoking has been shown to be associated with ASCVD in both PLWHA and the general population $[49,50]$. Our study also showed that smoking is a significant predictor of ASCVD in both tools, although the proportion of smokers was less than $5 \%$, which is much lower than other studies conducted elsewhere (23.5\%) [51] and 68.7\% [49].

Several studies reported that hypertension is an important risk factor for cardiovascular, stroke, and cerbrovascular diseases [52-54]. Mostly hypertension and ASCVD appear together in clinical investigation, although which causes which is a paradox [55]. Lower systolic blood pressure ( $<130 \mathrm{mmHg}$ ) in HIV patients was associated with a decreased risk of ASCVD based on FRS and this is comparable with several other studies [56-58]. Systolic blood pressure was also a significant predictor of ASCVD among patients 40 to 79 years of age using both PCE

Table 4. Association between ASCVD risk using FRS and clinical characteristics among people living with HIV/AIDS age 4075 years at Zewditu Memorial Hospital, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

| Clinical characteristics | ASCVD risk using FRS |  | COR (95\% C.I.) | $P$ value | AOR (95\% C.I.) | $P$ value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Low risk ( $<\mathbf{1 0 \% \text { ) }}$ | High risk ( $\geq$ 10\%) |  |  |  |  |
| Number (\%) | 153 (82.3) | 33 (17.7) |  |  |  |  |
| Age (year) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 60-79 | 14 (9.2) | 16 (48.5) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| 40-59 | 139 (90.8) | 17 (51.5) | 0.107 (0.045, .257) | $p<0.001$ | 0.022 (.004, .115) | $p<0.001$ |
| Gender |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Male | 70 (45.8) | 31 (93.9) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| Female | 83 (54.2) | 2 (6.1) | 0.054 (0.013, .235) | $p<0.001$ | 0.017 (.002, .126) | $p<.0001$ |
| CD4 count (cells/ $\mu \mathrm{L}$ ) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\geq /=500$ | 56 (36.6) | 13 (39.4) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| <500 | 97 (63.4) | 20 (60.6) | 0.888 (0.410, 1.922) | $P=0.763$ | 0.380 (.110, 1.312) | $p=0.126$ |
| Systolic blood pressure ( mmHg ) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\geq /=130$ | 71 46.4) | 25 (75.8) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| $\leq 130$ | 82 (53.6) | 8 (24.2) | 0.277 (.118, .653) | $P=0.003$ | 0.190 (.054, .668) | $p=0.010$ |
| Total cholesterol (mg/dL) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\geq /=160$ | 107 (69.9) | 29 (87.9) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| <160 | 46 (30.1) | 4 (12.1) | 0.321 (.107, .965) | $P=0.043$ | 0.302 (.081, 1.131) | $p=0.075$ |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\leq 40$ in male \& $<50$ in women | 63 (41.2) | 11 (33.3) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| $\geq /=40$ in Male \& $>/=50$ in Female | 90 (58.8) | 22 (66.7) | 1.40 (.634, 3.091) | $P=0.405$ | 0.308 (.087, 1.095) | $p=0.069$ |
| Duration on ART (year) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\geq /=2$ years | 139 (90.8) | 32 (18.7) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| $\leq 2$ years | 14 (9.2) | 1 (3.0) | 0.310 (.039, 2.446) | $P=0.267$ | 0.571 (.046, 7.145) | $p=0.664$ |
| Blood group |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Type 'O' | 54 (35.3) | 15 (45.5) | 1 |  | 1 | - |
| Type 'A' | 52 (34.0) | 8 (24.2) | $0.554(.217,1.416)$ | $P=0.217$ | 0.486 (0.123, 1.924) | $p=0.304$ |
| Type 'B' \& 'AB' | 47 (30.7) | 10 (30.3) | 0.766 (.134, 1.866) | $P=0.557$ | 0.824 (0.227, 2.998) | $p=0.769$ |
| Current ARV drug regimens |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2NRTIs + 1PI* | 21 (13.7) | 6 (18.2) | 1 | - | 1 | . |
| 2 NRTIs + 1 INI | 84 (54.9) | 9 (27.3) | 0.375 (0.120, 1.171) | $P=0.091$ | 0.149 (0.029, .775) | $p=0.024$ |
| 2 NRTIs + 1 NNRTI | 48 (31.4) | 18 (54.5) | 1.313 (0.456, 3.776) | $P=0.614$ | 0.450 (.093, 2.177) | $p=0.321$ |

$\mathrm{n}=186$; Data presented as \% prevalence; ASCVD, Atherosclerotic Cardiovascular Disease; FRS, Framingham Risk Score; COR, Crude Odds Ratio; AOR, Adjusted Odds Ratio; CI, Confidence Interval
*two of the cases were on 2 NRTIs $+1 \mathrm{INTI}+1 \mathrm{PI}$ ) regimen
https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0260109.t004
and FRS, suggesting that lowering this pressure to below 130 mmHg could reduce the risk of acquiring ASCVD by 15 to $25 \%$, which is concordant with several studies [16, 59, 60].

Dyslipidemia is considered to be the most frequent risk factor for ASCVD as reported in the literature [58, 61]. A decrease in total cholesterol below $160 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{dL}$ was associated with a lower risk of ASCVD in all patients in the present study. However, it was not a significant predictor of ASCVD among population age 40 years and above, as reported elsewhere [62].

A significant lower-risk of ASCVD was observed among participants on ART regimen of ' 2 NRTIs +1 INI' and aged 40 to 79 years using FRS but the PCE-based calculation did not produce any significant association. The lack of association in PCE but not in FRS could be attributed to the difference in the number of lipid variables used by the two methods. FRS uses three

Table 5. Association between ASCVD risk using PCE and clinical characteristics among people living with HIV/AIDS age 40 to 75 years at Zewditu Memorial Hospital, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

| Clinical characteristics | ASCVD risk using PCE |  | COR (95\% C.I.) | $P$ value | AOR (95\% C.I.) | $P$ value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Low risk (<7.5\%) | High risk ( $\geq$ 7.5\%) |  |  |  |  |
| Number (\%) | 134 (72.0) | 52 (28.0) |  |  |  |  |
| Age (year) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 60-79 | 6 (4.5) | 24 (46.2) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| 40-59 | 128 (95.5) | 28 (53.8) | 0.55 (0.020, 0.146) | $p<0.001$ | 0.012 (0.002,.066) | $p<0.001$ |
| Gender |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Male | 62 (46.3) | 39 (75.0) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| Female | 72 (53.7) | 13 (25.0) | 0.287 (0.141, 0.586) | $p=0.001$ | 0.185 (0.054, 0.630 ) | $p=0.007$ |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\geq /=500$ | 52 (38.8) | 17 (32.7) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| <500 | 82 (61.2) | 35 (67.3) | 1.306 (0.664, 2.566) | $p=0.439$ | 1.045 (0.385, 2.833) | $p=0.931$ |
| Systolic blood pressure ( mmHg ) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\geq /=130$ | 53 (39.6) | 43 (82.7) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| $\leq 130$ | 81 (60.4) | 9 (17.3) | 0.137 (0.062, 0.304) | $p<.001$ | 0.034 (0.007, 0.162) | $p<0.001$ |
| Total cholesterol (mg/dL) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\geq /=160$ | 99 (73.9) | 37 (71.2) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| $\leq 160$ | 35 (26.1) | 15 (28.8) | 1.147 (0.562,2.340) | $p=0.707$ | 1.342 (0.499, 3.607) | $p=0.560$ |
| HDL cholesterol (mg/dL) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\leq 40$ in male \& $<50$ in women | 56 (41.8) | 18 (34.6) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| $\geq /=40$ in Male $\&>/=50$ in Female | 78 (58.2) | 34 (65.4) | 1.356 (0.696, 2.641$)$ | $p=0.370$ | 0.635 (0.206, 1.956) | $p=0.429$ |
| Duration on ART (year) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\geq /=2$ years | 125 (93.3) | 46 (88.5) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| $\leq 2$ years | 9 (6.7) | 6 (11.5) | $1.812(0.611,5.371)$ | $p=0.284$ | $1.952(0.365,10.437)$ | $p=0.434$ |
| Blood group |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Type 'O' | 44 (32.8) | 25 (48.1) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| Type 'A' | 45 (33.6) | 15 (28.8) | 0.587 (0.273, 1.258) | $p=0.171$ | 0.353 (0.116, 1.073) | $p=0.066$ |
| Type 'B' \& 'AB' | 45 (33.6) | 12 (23.1) | 0.469 (0.210, 1.049) | $p=0.065$ | 0.378 (0.122, 1.170) | $p=0.092$ |
| Current ARV drug regimens |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2NRTIs + 1 $\mathrm{PI}^{*}$ | 23 (17.2) | 4 (7.7) | 1 |  | 1 |  |
| 2 NRTIs + 1 INI | 68 (50.7) | 25 (48.1) | 2.114 (0.665, 6.720) | $p=0.205$ | $1.600(0.341,7.515)$ | $p=0.551$ |
| 2 NRTIs + 1 NNRTI | 43 (32.1) | 23 (44.2) | 3.076 (0.949, 9.972) | $p=0.061$ | 1.820 (0.372, 8.901) | $p=0.459$ |

$\mathrm{n}=186$; Data presented as \% prevalence; ASCVD, Atherosclerotic Cardiovascular Disease; FRS, Framingham Risk Score; COR, Crude odds ratio; AOR, adjusted odds ratio; CI , Confidence Interval *two of the cases were on 2 NRTIs $+1 \mathrm{INTI}+1 \mathrm{PI}$ ) regimen.
https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0260109.t005
different lipids (TC, HDL, and LDL) to predict the risk of ASCVD and cART increase the risk of ASCVD by altering lipid profiles [24, 63].

Between subject analysis for the variables cART, age, gender, and blood group against the risk of ASCVD was performed and the analysis revealed that mean score was highest with NNRTI-based regimen. The association of NNRTIs-based cART with the risk of ASCVD has been widely reported by several studies [64-66], but association was more commonly reported with PI- based cART [66-68]. However, we found no association with PI-based cART, which could possibly be due to the fact that many of the participants were on NNRTIs-based cART until the recent introduction of the integrase inhibitors and/or the small sample size employed.

a)

b)

Fig 2. The ASCVD risk based on ART regimen and age interaction among PLWHA age 40-79 years: using the pooled cohort equation (a), and the Framingham risk score (b) estimation.
https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0260109.g002


Fig 3. The ASCVD risk based on ART regimen and gender interaction among PLWHA age 40-79 years: using the pooled cohort equation (a), and the Framingham risk score (b) estimation.
https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0260109.g003
Only few studies are available that attempted to determine the risk for ASCVD in HIVinfected adults in Africa. Mosepele et al. [36] reported PCE to classify more participants in the elevated risk category than FRS ( $14.1 \mathrm{vs} .2 .6 \%$ ) and to a similar extent to those having


Fig 4. The ASCVD risk based on ART regimen and blood type interaction among PLWHA age 40-79 years: using the pooled cohort equation (a), and the Framingham risk score (b) estimation.
https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0260109.g004
established subclinical atherosclerosis. Mubiru et al [69] conducted a systematic review to find the most frequently used tool for screening the risk and did not find any detectable differences between lipid and non-lipid as well as HIV-specific and non-HIV-specific factors, although they suggested that the inclusion of HIV and ART history might improve accuracy of risk
determination. Similarly, a study done in Tanzania by Kingery et al [70] reported that the lifetime and 10-year ASCVD risk as well as the prevalence of metabolic syndrome was higher in ART-experienced than HIV-negative and ART-naïve subjects. All reports highlighted the need for further studies to better understand the risk of CVD in HIV patients, as the burden of the disease is greater in sub-Saharan Africa.

## Limitations of the study

The study may not be used as a representative for the entire PLWHA in Ethiopia as the data were obtained only from a single hospital. The ASCVD risk assessed in this study might not represent an actual ASCVD, as clinical events, or surrogate proofs such as coronary plaque were not determined using computed tomography. The anticipated risk of ASCVD can also be reverted by proper implementation of preventive clinical guidelines during the follow-up period and a healthier life style modification.

## Conclusions

This study highlighted that a significant number of PLWHA are at risk for developing ASCVD in the coming 10 years. In both FRS and PCE, ASCVD was significantly associated with advanced age, male gender, low blood pressure, and smoking. ASCVD management strategies should also take into consideration age, gender, smoking status, and blood pressure control. The ASVD risk calculators, PCE and FRS, have similar prediction capacity in PLWHA. However, PCE might yield an exaggerated prevalence of ASCVD due to the race variable and the lower cut-off point for risk stratification incorporated in the tool. Hence, the tools can be used interchangeably or together.

## Supporting information

## S1 File.

(SAV)

## Acknowledgments

We would like to thank Zewditu memorial Hospital, the study participants, and the research assistants involved in this study. We also acknowledge the ClinCalc.com for permitting us to use the online version of PCE calculator (originally created by the American College of Cardiology/American Heart Association) and the GlobalRPH.com for making available the online free version of the FRS tool (originally created by the National, Heart, Lung, and Blood Institute). Our thanks also goes to the German Academic Exchange program (DAAD) and the European and Developing Countries Clinical Trials Partnership (EDCTP) for providing fellowship to MW.

## Author Contributions

Conceptualization: Minyahil Woldu, Omary Minzi, Ephrem Engidawork.
Data curation: Minyahil Woldu, Aster Shewaamare.
Formal analysis: Minyahil Woldu, Omary Minzi, Ephrem Engidawork.
Investigation: Omary Minzi, Ephrem Engidawork.
Methodology: Minyahil Woldu, Workineh Shibeshi, Ephrem Engidawork.
Resources: Workineh Shibeshi.

Supervision: Workineh Shibeshi, Ephrem Engidawork.
Writing - original draft: Minyahil Woldu, Omary Minzi, Aster Shewaamare.
Writing - review \& editing: Omary Minzi, Workineh Shibeshi, Aster Shewaamare, Ephrem Engidawork.

## References

1. Rapid antigen detection tests for group A Streptococcal infection: Evidence Note 83.
2. Dominick L, Midgley N, Swart L-M, Sprake D, Deshpande G, et al. (2020) HIV-related cardiovascular diseases: the search for a unifying hypothesis. American Journal of Physiology-Heart and Circulatory Physiology 318: H731-H746. https://doi.org/10.1152/ajpheart.00549.2019 PMID: 32083970
3. Grinspoon SK, Grunfeld C, Kotler DP, Currier JS, Lundgren JD, et al. (2008) State of the science conference: Initiative to decrease cardiovascular risk and increase quality of care for patients living with HIV/ AIDS: executive summary. Circulation 118: 198-210. https://doi.org/10.1161/CIRCULATIONAHA.107. 189622 PMID: 18566320
4. Lang S, Boccara F, Mary-Krause M, Cohen A (2015) Epidemiology of coronary heart disease in HIVinfected versus uninfected individuals in developed countries. Archives of cardiovascular diseases 108: 206-215. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.acvd.2015.01.004 PMID: 25725995
5. Durand M, Sheehy O, Baril J-G, Lelorier J, Tremblay CL (2011) Association between HIV infection, antiretroviral therapy, and risk of acute myocardial infarction: a cohort and nested case-control study using Quebec's public health insurance database. JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes 57: 245-253. https://doi.org/10.1097/QAI.0b013e31821d33a5 PMID: 21499115
6. Woldu M, Minzi O, Engidawork E (2020) Prevalence of cardiometabolic syndrome in HIV-infected persons: a systematic review. Journal of Diabetes \& Metabolic Disorders 19: 1671-1683.
7. Barbaro G, Di Lorenzo G, Grisorio B, Barbarini G, Baum M, et al. (1999) Dilated cardiomyopathy in HIVinfected patients. N Engl J Med 1999: 732-735.
8. Steven G Deeks, Sharon R Lewin, Diane V Havlir(2013) The end of AIDS: HIV infection as a chronic disease. The Lancet 382: 1525-1533.
9. Feinstein MJ, Bogorodskaya M, Bloomfield GS, Vedanthan R, Siedner MJ, et al. (2016) Cardiovascular complications of HIV in endemic countries. Current cardiology reports 18: 113. https://doi.org/10.1007/ s11886-016-0794-x PMID: 27730474
10. D'Agostino $\mathrm{RB} \operatorname{Sr}$ (2012) Cardiovascular risk estimation in 2012: lessons learned and applicability to the HIV population. Journal of Infectious Diseases 205: S362-S367. https://doi.org/10.1093/infdis/jis196 PMID: 22577209
11. Yousefzadeh G, Shokoohi M, Najafipour H, Shadkamfarokhi M (2015) Applying the Framingham risk score for prediction of metabolic syndrome: the Kerman Coronary Artery Disease Risk Study, Iran. ARYA atherosclerosis 11: 179. PMID: 26405450
12. Mateen FJ, Kanters S, Kalyesubula R, Mukasa B, Kawuma E, et al. (2013) Hypertension prevalence and Framingham risk score stratification in a large HIV-positive cohort in Uganda. Journal of Hypertension 31: 1372-1378. https://doi.org/10.1097/HJH.0b013e328360de1c PMID: 23615323
13. Lundgren JD, Battegay M, Behrens G, De Wit S, Guaraldi G, et al. (2008) European AIDS Clinical Society (EACS) guidelines on the prevention and management of metabolic diseases in HIV. HIV medicine 9: 72-81. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-1293.2007.00534.x PMID: 18257770
14. Muntner P, Safford MM, Cushman M, Howard G (2014) Comment on the reports of over-estimation of ASCVD risk using the 2013 AHA/ACC risk equation. Circulation 129: 266-267. https://doi.org/10.1161/ CIRCULATIONAHA.113.007648 PMID: 24334111
15. Nix LM, Tien PC (2014) Metabolic syndrome, diabetes, and cardiovascular risk in HIV. Current Hiv/aids Reports 11:271-278. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11904-014-0219-7 PMID: 25027062
16. Zhang X, Pawlikowski M, Olivo-Marston S, Williams KP, Bower JK, et al. (2021) Ten-year cardiovascular risk among cancer survivors: the National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey. PloS one 16: e0247919. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0247919 PMID: 33661978
17. Qureshi WT, Michos ED, Flueckiger P, Blaha M, Sandfort V, et al. (2016) Impact of Replacing the Pooled Cohort Equation With Other Cardiovascular Disease Risk Scores on Atherosclerotic Cardiovascular Disease Risk Assessment (from the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis [MESA]). The American Journal of Cardiology 118: 691-696. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amjcard.2016.06.015 PMID: 27445216
18. ClinCalc.com (2021) ASCVD Risk Calculator. ©2021—ClinCalc LLC. All rights reserved.
19. Zhang M, Jiang Y, Wang LM, Li YC, Huang ZJ, et al. (2017) prediction of 10-year atherosclerotic cardiovascular disease risk among adults aged 40-79 years in China: a nationally representative survey. Biomedical and Environmental Sciences 30: 244-254. https://doi.org/10.3967/bes2017.034 PMID: 28494834
20. Thompson-Paul AM, Lichtenstein KA, Armon C, Palella FJ Jr, Skarbinski J, et al. (2016) Cardiovascular disease risk prediction in the HIV outpatient study. Clinical infectious diseases 63: 1508-1516. https:// doi.org/10.1093/cid/ciw615 PMID: 27613562
21. Michos ED, Nasir K, Braunstein JB, Rumberger JA, Budoff MJ, et al. (2006) Framingham risk equation underestimates subclinical atherosclerosis risk in asymptomatic women. Atherosclerosis 184: 201206. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atherosclerosis.2005.04.004 PMID: 15907856
22. Parra S, Coll B, Aragones G, Marsillach J, Beltran R, et al. (2010) Nonconcordance between subclinical atherosclerosis and the calculated Framingham risk score in HIV-infected patients: relationships with serum markers of oxidation and inflammation. HIV medicine 11: 225-231. https://doi.org/10.1111/j. 1468-1293.2009.00766.x PMID: 19845792
23. Knobel H, Jerico C, Montero M, Sorli ML, Velat M, et al. (2007) Global cardiovascular risk in patients with HIV infection: concordance and differences in estimates according to three risk equations (Framingham, SCORE, and PROCAM). AIDS patient care and STDs 21:452-457. https://doi.org/10.1089/ apc.2006.0165 PMID: 17651026
24. Bergersen B, Sandvik L, Bruun J, Tonstad S (2004) Elevated Framingham risk score in HIV-positive patients on highly active antiretroviral therapy: results from a Norwegian study of 721 subjects. European Journal of Clinical Microbiology and Infectious Diseases 23: 625-630. https://doi.org/10.1007/ s10096-004-1177-6 PMID: 15322938
25. Pirš M, Jug B, Eržen B, Šabović M, Karner P, et al. (2014) Cardiovascular risk assessment in HIVinfected male patients: a comparison of Framingham, SCORE, PROCAM and DAD risk equations. Acta Dermatovenerol Alp Pannonica Adriat 23: 43-47. https://doi.org/10.15570/actaapa.2014.11 PMID: 25242159
26. Lo J, Abbara S, Shturman L, Soni A, Wei J, et al. (2010) Increased prevalence of subclinical coronary atherosclerosis detected by coronary computed tomography angiography in HIV-infected men. AIDS (London, England) 24: 243. https://doi.org/10.1097/QAD.0b013e328333ea9e PMID: 19996940
27. Melzi S, Carenzi L, Cossu MV, Passerini S, Capetti A, et al. (2010) Lipid Metabolism and Cardiovascular Risk in HIV-1 Infection and HAART: Present and Future Problems. Cholesterol 2010: 271504. https://doi.org/10.1155/2010/271504 PMID: 21490912
28. Mengistu N, Azale T, Yimer S, Fikreyesus M, Melaku E, et al. Quality of sleep and associated factors among people living with HIV/AIDS on follow up at Ethiopian Zewditu Memorial Hospital, 2018.
29. WHO (2014) Non-communicable diseases and their risk factors The WHO STEPwise approach to noncommunicable disease risk factor surveillance (STEPS) Geneva, Switzerland WHO.
30. National Heart LaBI (2013) Risk assessment tool for estimating your 10-year risk of having a heart attack.
31. Ganzeboom HBG, De Graaf PM, Treiman DJ (1992) A standard international socio-economic index of occupational status. Social Science Research 21: 1-56.
32. Chew KW, Bhattacharya D, McGinnis KA, Horwich TB, Tseng C-h, et al. (2015) coronary heart disease risk by Framingham risk score in hepatitis C and HIV/hepatitis C -coinfected persons. AIDS research and human retroviruses 31:718-722. https://doi.org/10.1089/AID.2014.0284 PMID: 25858663
33. van Zoest RA, Law M, Sabin CA, Vaartjes I, van der Valk M, et al. (2019) Predictive Performance of Cardiovascular Disease Risk Prediction Algorithms in People Living With HIV. JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes 81. https://doi.org/10.1097/QAI.0000000000002069 PMID: 31045648
34. Yadlowsky S, Hayward RA, Sussman JB, McClelland RL, Min Y-I, et al. (2018) Clinical implications of revised pooled cohort equations for estimating atherosclerotic cardiovascular disease risk. Annals of internal medicine 169: 20-29. https://doi.org/10.7326/M17-3011 PMID: 29868850
35. Guo F, Hsieh E, Lv W, Han Y, Xie J, et al. (2017) Cardiovascular disease risk among Chinese antiretro-viral-naïve adults with advanced HIV disease. BMC infectious diseases 17: 1-10. https://doi.org/10. 1186/s12879-016-2122-x PMID: 28049444
36. Mosepele M, Hemphill LC, Palai T, Nkele I, Bennett K, et al. (2017) Cardiovascular disease risk prediction by the American College of Cardiology (ACC)/American Heart Association (AHA) Atherosclerotic Cardiovascular Disease (ASCVD) risk score among HIV-infected patients in sub-Saharan Africa. PloS one 12: e0172897. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0172897 PMID: 28235058
37. Wu P-Y, Chen M-Y, Sheng W-H, Hsieh S-M, Chuang Y-C, et al. (2019) Estimated risk of cardiovascular disease among the HIV-positive patients aged 40 years or older in Taiwan. Journal of Microbiology, Immunology and Infection 52: 549-555.
38. Guaraldi G, Milic J, Prandini N, Ligabue G, Esposito F, et al. (2020) 18Fluoride-based molecular imaging of coronary atherosclerosis in HIV infected patients. Atherosclerosis 297: 127-135. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.atherosclerosis.2020.02.014 PMID: 32113050
39. Monroe AK, Haberlen SA, Post WS, Palella FJ Jr., Kinsgley LA, et al. (2016) Cardiovascular disease risk scores' relationship to subclinical cardiovascular disease among HIV-infected and HIV-uninfected men. AIDS (London, England) 30: 2075-2084. https://doi.org/10.1097/QAD. 0000000000001163 PMID: 27203714
40. Ssinabulya I, Kayima J, Longenecker C, Luwedde M, Semitala F, et al. (2014) Subclinical atherosclerosis among HIV-infected adults attending HIV/AIDS care at two large ambulatory HIV clinics in Uganda. PloS one 9: e89537. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0089537 PMID: 24586854
41. Stein JH, Brown TT, Ribaudo HJ, Chen Y, Yan M, et al. (2013) Ultrasonographic measures of cardiovascular disease risk in antiretroviral treatment-naive individuals with HIV infection. AIDS (London, England) 27: 929. https://doi.org/10.1097/QAD.0b013e32835ce27e PMID: 23196938
42. Triant VA (2014) Epidemiology of coronary heart disease in HIV patients. Reviews in cardiovascular medicine 15: S 1 .
43. Boccara F, Lang S, Meuleman C, Ederhy S, Mary-Krause M, et al. (2013) HIV and coronary heart disease: time for a better understanding. Journal of the American College of Cardiology 61:511-523. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jacc.2012.06.063 PMID: 23369416
44. Lloyd-Jones DM, Larson MG, Beiser A, Levy D (1999) Lifetime risk of developing coronary heart disease. The Lancet 353: 89-92. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(98)10279-9 PMID: 10023892
45. Maas AH, Appelman YE (2010) Gender differences in coronary heart disease. Netherlands Heart Journal 18: 598-603. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12471-010-0841-y PMID: 21301622
46. Manson JE, Hsia J, Johnson KC, Rossouw JE, Assaf AR, et al. (2003) Estrogen plus progestin and the risk of coronary heart disease. New England Journal of Medicine 349: 523-534. https://doi.org/10. 1056/NEJMoa030808 PMID: 12904517
47. Barrett-Connor E (1997) Sex differences in coronary heart disease: why are women so superior? The 1995 Ancel Keys Lecture. Circulation 95: 252-264. https://doi.org/10.1161/01.cir.95.1.252 PMID: 8994444
48. Kolovou GD, Anagnostopoulou KK (2007) Apolipoprotein E polymorphism, age and coronary heart disease. Ageing research reviews 6: 94-108. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.arr.2006.11.001 PMID: 17224309
49. Escaut L, Monsuez JJ, Chironi G, Merad M, Teicher E, et al. (2003) Coronary artery disease in HIV infected patients. Intensive care medicine 29: 969-973. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00134-003-1740-0 PMID: 12739013
50. Patel AA, Budoff MJ (2015) Coronary artery disease in patients with HIV infection. American Journal of Cardiovascular Drugs 15: 81-87. https://doi.org/10.1007/s40256-015-0105-8 PMID: 25672641
51. Tesoriero JM, Gieryic SM, Carrascal A, Lavigne HE (2010) Smoking among HIV positive New Yorkers: prevalence, frequency, and opportunities for cessation. AIDS and Behavior 14: 824-835. https://doi. org/10.1007/s10461-008-9449-2 PMID: 18777131
52. Wilkins K, Campbell NR, Joffres MR, McAlister FA, Nichol M, et al. (2010) Blood pressure in Canadian adults. Health reports 21: 37. PMID: 20426225
53. Chiasson J-L, Josse RG, Gomis R, Hanefeld M, Karasik A, et al. (2003) Acarbose treatment and the risk of cardiovascular disease and hypertension in patients with impaired glucose tolerance: the STOPNIDDM trial. Jama 290: 486-494. https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.290.4.486 PMID: 12876091
54. Erdine S, Aran SN (2004) Current status of hypertension control around the world. Clinical and experimental hypertension (New York, NY: 1993) 26: 731-738. https://doi.org/10.1081/ceh-200032144 PMID: 15702628
55. Escobar E (2002) Hypertension and coronary heart disease. Journal of human hypertension 16: S61S63. https://doi.org/10.1038/sj.jhh. 1001345 PMID: 11986897
56. Stamler J, Neaton JD, Wentworth DN (1989) Blood pressure (systolic and diastolic) and risk of fatal coronary heart disease. Hypertension 13: I2. https://doi.org/10.1161/01.hyp.13.5_suppl.i2 PMID: 2490825
57. Gosmanova EO, Mikkelsen MK, Molnar MZ, Lu JL, Yessayan LT, et al. (2016) Association of systolic blood pressure variability with mortality, coronary heart disease, stroke, and renal disease. Journal of the American College of Cardiology 68: 1375-1386. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jacc.2016.06.054 PMID: 27659458
58. Antikainen R, Jousilahti P, Tuomilehto J (1998) Systolic blood pressure, isolated systolic hypertension and risk of coronary heart disease, strokes, cardiovascular disease and all-cause mortality in the mid-dle-aged population. Journal of hypertension 16: 577-583. https://doi.org/10.1097/00004872-199816050-00004 PMID: 9797168
59. Nanna MG, Peterson ED, Wojdyla D, Navar AM (2020) The accuracy of cardiovascular pooled cohort risk estimates in US older adults. Journal of general internal medicine 35: 1701-1708. https://doi.org/ 10.1007/s11606-019-05361-4 PMID: 31667745
60. Mortensen MB, Afzal S, Nordestgaard BG, Falk E (2015) Primary prevention with statins: ACC/AHA risk-based approach versus trial-based approaches to guide statin therapy. Journal of the American College of Cardiology 66: 2699-2709. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jacc.2015.09.089 PMID: 26700832
61. Husnah H (2018) Association of Central Obesity and Waist/Hip Circumference With Dislipidemia. World Nutrition Journal 1: 18-22.
62. Félix-Redondo FJ, Grau M, Fernández-Bergés D (2013) Cholesterol and cardiovascular disease in the elderly. Facts and gaps. Aging and disease 4: 154. PMID: 23730531
63. Asztalos BF, Schaefer EJ, Horvath KV, Cox CE, Skinner S, et al. (2006) Protease inhibitor-based HAART, HDL, and CHD-risk in HIV-infected patients. Atherosclerosis 184: 72-77. https://doi.org/10. 1016/j.atherosclerosis.2005.04.013 PMID: 15935358
64. Montrucchio C, Biagini R, Alcantarini C, Calcagno A, Barco A, et al. (2017) Cardiovascular risk and neurocognitive deficits in HIV-positive individuals. Infect Dis Trop Med 3: e370.
65. Krikke M, Hoogeveen R, Hoepelman A, Visseren F, Arends J (2016) Cardiovascular risk prediction in HIV-infected patients: comparing the Framingham, atherosclerotic cardiovascular disease risk score (ASCVD), Systematic Coronary Risk Evaluation for the N etherlands (SCORE-NL) and Data Collection on Adverse Events of Anti-HIV Drugs (D: A: D) risk prediction models. HIV medicine 17: 289-297. https://doi.org/10.1111/hiv. 12300 PMID: 26268806
66. Rosenson RS, Hubbard D, Monda KL, Reading SR, Chen L, et al. (2020) Excess risk for atherosclerotic cardiovascular outcomes among US adults with HIV in the current era. Journal of the American Heart Association 9: e013744. https://doi.org/10.1161/JAHA.119.013744 PMID: 31880980
67. Lambert C, Sandesara P, Hirsh B, Shaw L, Lewis W, et al. (2016) HIV, highly active antiretroviral therapy and the heart: a cellular to epidemiological review. HIV medicine 17:411-424. https://doi.org/10. 1111/hiv. 12346 PMID: 26611380
68. Tada H, Takamura M, Kawashiri M-a (2019) Lipoprotein (a) as an old and new causal risk factor of atherosclerotic cardiovascular disease. Journal of atherosclerosis and thrombosis: RV17034. https://doi. org/10.5551/jat.RV17034 PMID: 31061262
69. Mubiru F, Castelnuovo B, Reynolds SJ, Kiragga A, Tibakabikoba H, et al. (2021) Comparison of different cardiovascular risk tools used in HIV patient cohorts in sub-Saharan Africa; do we need to include laboratory tests? PloS one 16: e0243552. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone. 0243552 PMID: 33507945
70. Kingery JR, Alfred Y, Smart LR, Nash E, Todd J, et al. (2016) Short-term and long-term cardiovascular risk, metabolic syndrome and HIV in Tanzania. Heart 102: 1200-1205. https://doi.org/10.1136/heartjnl-2015-309026 PMID: 27105648
