# High Frequency of Normal $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ Joints in B Cell Progenitors in Severe Combined Immunodeficiency Mice 

By Jacqueline L. Pennycook, Yenhui Chang, Jakub Celler, Robert A. Phillips,* and Gillian E. Wu

From the Department of Immunology and *The Hospital for Sick Children Research Institute, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada, M5S 1A8


#### Abstract

Summary The severe combined immunodeficiency (scid) mouse has a defective $V(D) J$ recombinase activity that results in arrested lymphoid development at the pro-B cell stage in the B lineage. The defect is not absolute and scid mice do attempt gene rearrangement. Indeed, $\sim 15 \%$ of all scid mice develop detectable levels of oligoclonal serum immunoglobulin and T cell activity. To gain more insight into the scid defect and its effect on V(D)J rearrangement, we analyzed $D J_{H}$ recombination in scid bone marrow. We determined that $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ structures are present in scid bone marrow and occur at a frequency only $10-100$ times less than C.B-17 $+/+$. The scid $D \mathrm{~J}_{\mathrm{r}}$ repertoire is limited and resembles fetal liver $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ junctions, with few N insertions and predominant usage of reading frame 1 . Moreover, $70 \%$ of the $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ structures were potentially productive, indicating that normal $V(D) J$ recombinants should be arising continually.


The formation of functional Ig and TCR genes requires the rearrangement of several genetic elements encoding the variable regions: V, J, and, in some cases, D (1). The mechanism of this recombination is only now beginning to be elucidated, and most of what we know about the process is derived from studies of its substrates and its products (for review, see references 2 and 3 ). The process of rearrangement is mediated by an enzymatic system, the $V(D) J$ recombinase, which is targeted by the recombination signal sequences (RSS) ${ }^{1}$ flanking the elements to be rearranged. RSS consist of three parts; a heptamer, a 12 - or $23-\mathrm{bp}$ spacer, and a nonamer. As a result of $V(D) J$ recombination, two types of junctions are formed: signal joints and coding joints (4). In the signal joints, which are usually precise, RSS are joined in a head-tohead orientation. Coding joints, which are usually imprecise, have a few nucleotides added and/or deleted at the coding termini.
$\mathrm{V}(\mathrm{D}) \mathrm{J}$ recombination is essential for normal lymphoid development. Mice deficient for the recombinase activating genes, Rag-1 and Rag-2, as well as scid mice, have defective V(D)J recombinase activity (5-8), and lymphoid development in all these mice is arrested at the pro-B cell stage. Unlike the Rag-1 ${ }^{-}$and Rag-2- mice, however, scid mice attempt gene rearrangement, but these attempts fail to produce functional

[^0]receptors. In Abelson murine leukemia virus (A-MuLV)transformed scid bone marrow lines $(5,9)$ and in long-term cultures of scid bone marrow (10), there are large deletions in the coding joints even though signal joints are relatively normal ( 8,11 ).
The scid defect is leaky. Approximately $15 \%$ of all scid mice develop detectable levels of oligoclonal serum Ig and T cell activity (12-15). The incidence of leakiness varies with both the age of the mice and their environment (12). Petrini et al. (16) have postulated that a genetic reversion occurs in a B cell precursor permitting normal V(D)J recombination in subsequent daughter cells. In support of this hypothesis, some functional T cell clones derived from leaky scid mice have normal rearrangements on their nonexpressed TCR alleles. This result is unexpected from the high frequency of abnormal coding joints found in A-MuLV scid lines (16, 17). Further, normal TCR rearrangement at the $\delta \mathrm{DJ}$ locus has been observed in scid thymocytes $(18,19)$. However, there is no evidence of attempted $\mathrm{V} \delta$ rearrangement or rearrangement at the $\beta$ and $\gamma$ loci (20). An alternative hypothesis to explain the leaky phenotype is that scid mice make productive rearrangements at a higher frequency than previously expected (see below), so that a few B cells are produced each day depending on the chance occurrence of several rearrangement events. Thus, whether or not a mouse becomes leaky depends in part on whether a chance clone of B cells is stimulated by antigen before it is eliminated as part of the normal B cell turn-over.

To gain more insight into scid defect and its effect on the mechanism of $\mathrm{V}(\mathrm{D}) \mathrm{J}$ rearrangement, we have analyzed $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ recombination products in scid mice. Using a quantitative PCR assay devised to determine the extent of $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ formation (21), we found $D J_{H}$ structures in scid mice occur at a frequency only $10-100$ times less than in C.B-17 $+/+$ mice. Sequencing of these structures revealed that the scid $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ repertoire is limited and resembles fetal liver $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{a}}$ junctions, with few N insertions and predominant usage of reading frame 1. Moreover, $70 \%$ of these structures were potentially productive, indicating that normal $V(D) J$ recombinants should be arising continually in scid mice.

## Materials and Methods

Mice and Cell Lines. The C.B-17scid (referred to in the text as scid mice) and C.B-17 wild type (referred to in the text as C.B$17+/+$ mice) were originally obtained from Melvin Bosma (Fox Chase Cancer Center, Philadelphia, PA). C57BL/6 mice were purchased from The Jackson Laboratory (Bar Harbor, ME). All mouse strains were bred and maintained in the animal colony of the Ontario Cancer Institute (Toronto, Canada) under defined flora conditions. Nonleaky and leaky scid mice were differentiated on the basis of serum Ig detected by Ouchterlony diffusion. Bone marrow ( BM ) and spleens were removed from individual mice at 6 or 27 wk of age. A-MuLV cell lines were derived and maintained as described (22).

DNA Preparation. Single-cell suspensions were prepared from the adult BM and spleens using standard procedures (23). Genomic DNA was isolated from the BM, spleen, and cultured cell lines by the "spooling" method as previously described (22).

Oligonucleotide PCR Primers. The DFS primer is a 31mer hybridizing to the $5^{\prime}$ RSS of the $D_{H}$ elements of both the Dsp and the DFL families. Its sequence is $5^{\prime}$-AGGGATCCTTGTGAAGGG-ATCTACTACTGTG-3'. The DQ52 primer is 5'-GCGGAGCAC-CACAGTGCAACTGGGAC-3'. It is a 26 mer specific for DQ52; it hybridizes to the region within the $5^{\prime}$ spacer through the heptamer and contains all of the DQ52 coding region. The $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 4$ primer is $5^{\prime}$-AAAGACCTGCAGAGGCCATTCTTACC-3'. It is a 26 mer containing sequences of the major J-C intron immediately $3^{\prime}$ of $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 4$. The $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 2$-IN primer is $5^{\prime}$-TGGCCAGGATCCCTATAAATC-TCTGG-3'. It is a 26 mer that contains sequences $\sim 200 \mathrm{bp} 3^{\prime}$ of $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 2$ in the $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 2-\mathrm{J}_{4} 3$ intergenic sequence. The $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 4-\mathrm{IN}$ primer is $5^{\prime}$-GAGGAGACGGTGACTGAGGTTCCTTG-3' It is a 26 mer that is entirely contained within the $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ element and shares no overlapping sequence with the $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 4$ primer (described above). The oligonucleotides were synthesized on a DNA synthesizer (Applied Biosystems, Inc., Foster City, CA) and purified using NENSORB PREP cartridges (Du Pont Co., Wilmington, DE).

Standard PCR Assay. PCR amplifications were performed as described (21). Fresh aliquots of reagents were used for each set of experiments. In brief, a set of standard DNAs derived from A-MuLV lines containing known numbers of $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ targets were diluted into DNA that had no $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ targets (CB32, a VDJ/VDJ A-MuLV line). The diluted standards were amplified at the same time as the experimental and control DNAs. A hot start method with Ampliwax (Perkin-Elmer, Emeryville, CA) was used, with the Taq polymerase (Boehringer Mannheim Biochemicals, Indianapolis, IN) being added when the reaction temperature reached $80^{\circ} \mathrm{C} .30$ cycles were carried out. To facilitate the cloning of the larger $D \mathrm{~J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ structures ( $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}} 1$ and $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}} 2$ ), secondary amplifications were performed on 10 - and 100 -fold diluted primary scid and C.B-
$17+/+$ amplifications, respectively; one of the nested primers $\left(\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 2-\right.$ IN or $\mathrm{J}_{4} 4-\mathrm{IN}$ ) was used with the same cycling conditions.
Southern Hybridization Analysis. 10\% of each PCR amplification reaction was loaded on a $1 \%$ agarose gel (Sigma Chemical Co., St. Louis, MO) and electrophoresis in TAE buffer (23). Gels were Southern blotted on Zeta Probe nylon membrane (Bio-Rad Laboratories, Richmond, CA) using a vacuum blotting system (Vacugene; LKB Pharmacia). Filters were probed with a ${ }^{32 P}$-labeled $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 4$ probe under conditions previously described (24). Autoradiographs were exposed without intensifying screens either with Kodak film or in a phosphorimager cassette.

Densitometry. Densitometry was used to measure the relative intensities of bands on the autoradiographs. Several exposures of Southern blots were scanned using a densitometer (Molecular Dynamics, Sunnyvale, CA). An example of the raw data output for one analysis is shown in Table 1. The data were entered in an Macintosh Excel data base and the number of $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ structures was calculated using the TREND function based on the curves generated by the standard values. The averages of a number of experiments and their standard errors were determined using StatviewII. The values obtained were per microgram of DNA. These values were converted (Table 2) into numbers per organ using the factors: 1 $\mu \mathrm{g}$ of DNA is $1.8 \times 10^{5}$ haploid genome equivalents; $2 \times 10^{7}$ nucleated cells are in a femur; $1.5 \times 10^{8}$ nucleated cells are in a C.B-17+ $/+$ spleen; and $3 \times 10^{7}$ nucleated cells are in a scid spleen (25). At times the data from the C.B-17 $+/+$ mice lay outside the standard curve. These estimates were necessarily less accurate.

Cloning and Sequencing of $D J_{H}$ Products. Products derived from the $\mathrm{DFS} / \mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ primer pair were cloned from amplifications separate from those used for quantification. To prevent contamination, scid and C.B-17+/+ DNA were not amplified at the same time, nor were their amplified products run on the same gel. Negative controls were included with all rounds of amplification. These controls consisted of no DNA and targetless DNA from the 70Z/3 cell line. 70Z/3 has a VDJ and a DQ52/J $\mathrm{J}^{2}$ rearrangement, and thus cannot be amplified with the $\mathrm{DFS} / \mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ primers. Some primary C.B-17+/+ and scid amplifications were cloned directly, and others were cloned after secondary amplification. In these cases, either secondary amplification proceeded directly or primary amplified samples were run on lo-melt gels (Nusieve), and plugs, taken from the control and experimental lanes, were amplified in parallel using nested primers. Whenever a product was detected in the negative control lanes, the amplifications were discarded.
The amplified structures were cloned by means of the TA Cloning Kit (Invitrogen) or by the embedded restriction endonuclease sites in the PCR primers. Bacteria harboring positive plasmids were identified by antibiotic selection. Nitrocellulose membranes (Schleicher \& Schuell, Inc., Keene, NH) bearing bacterial DNA were hybridized at $42^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ or $37^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ overnight with DIG-dUTPlabeled (Biochemica; Boehringer Mannheim Biochemicals) $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 2$ or $J_{\mathrm{H}} 4$ probes, respectively. The filters were washed twice with $2 \times$ SSC, $0.1 \%$ SDS for $5-\mathrm{min}$ intervals followed by two $1 \times$ SSC, $0.1 \%$ SDS washes, at $60^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ or $42^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ for 30 min . The reduced hybridization and washing temperatures for the $\mathrm{J}_{4} 4$ probe allowed detection of the 50 -nucleotide homology in the $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}} 4$ structure. To detect the signal, filters were blocked in a solution of $5 \times$ SSC, $5 \%$ skim milk solution, $50 \%$ formamide, $0.1 \% ~ N$-lauryl sarcosyl, and $0.02 \%$ SDS for 3 h and then exposed to an anti-DIG horseradish peroxidase (POD)-conjugated antibody (Biochemica; Boehringer Mannheim Biochemicals) diluted $1 / 1,000$ in blocking solution for 1 h . The filters were washed in 100 mM Tris, $\mathrm{pH} 7.5,150 \mathrm{mM}$ NaCl , and $0.02 \%$ Tween 20 four times for 15 min each, and then subjected to the enhanced chemiluminescence (ECL) detection
system (Amersham Corp., Arlington Heights, IL). Positive colonies were selected and plasmid DNA was extracted. Sequencing was performed using the double-stranded method with the T7 Sequencing Kit (Pharmacia Fine Chemicals, Piscataway, NJ); both the reverse and universal sequencing primers were utilized.

## Results

Quantification of $D J_{H}$ Structures. To quantitatively assay $D J_{\mathrm{H}}$ structures by PCR we used primers flanking $D$ and $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 4$, which results in a "ladder" of $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}} 1, \mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}} 2, \mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}} 3$, and $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}} 4$ when the products are analyzed by gel electrophoresis (Fig. 1 a). By simultaneously amplifying standards containing equimolar concentrations of targets of each of the four $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ products, we can estimate their number in tissues. We previously showed that none of these products are preferentially amplified
by the $\mathrm{DFS} / \mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 4$ primers (21). Fig. 1, $b$ and $c$, show examples of typical PCR amplifications of $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ rearrangements in BM and spleen DNA from individual scid and C.B-17 $+1+$ mice. There are four discrete bands of sizes corresponding to $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}} 1$, $D J_{H} 2, D J_{H} 3$, and $D J_{H} 4$ structures in all samples. The discrete nature of the bands was somewhat surprising due to the paucity and aberrant nature of the scid coding junctions found previously $(5,11)$. We quantified these products using data derived from seven C.B-17+/+BM, five C.B-17+/+ spleens, five scid BM, and four scid spleens. One of the scids was serum Ig positive. The raw data from a typical quantification are shown in Table 1; a summary of the quantification data is shown in Table 2. The data are presented as the sum of the four $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ 's because in some cases individual scid mice had unequal usage of the $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ segments (Fig. $1, b$ and $c$, and Discussion). This unequal usage of $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ was not observed in other


PCR Products

| DQ52 segment | $\rightarrow$ DSF primer |
| :--- | :--- |
| DFL16 segments | DSS2 primer |
| DSP2 segments | JH4 primer |

DJH1 ( 1.3 kb )


DJH2 ( 1.0 kb )

DJH3 ( 0.7 kb )

$\square \mathrm{JH}$ segments
DJH4 ( 0.12 kb )


Figure 1. (a) Genomic map of the $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ locus showing oligomer primer position sites and expected products (20), not drawn to scale. (b) Southern blot analysis of PCR amplification of scid and C.B-17+/+ BM and spleen ( $S P$ ) DNA using the DFS $/ \mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 4$ primer pair. Amplifications of the titration standards were run in parallel. (c) Southern blot analysis of PCR-amplified BM and SP DNA from nonleaky ( $I_{g^{-}}$) and leaky ( $I g^{+}$) scid and C.B-17 $+/+$ mice. 14D FL is 14-d C57BL/6 fetal liver DNA amplified for comparison (see reference 21), CB32.12 is a negative control. Titration standards were amplified in parallel as in $b$.

Table 1. Typical Densitometric Analysis

| DNA source | $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}} 1$ |  | $D J_{H} 2$ |  | $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}} 3$ |  | DJ ${ }_{4} 4$ |  | Total No./ <br> $1 \mu \mathrm{~g}^{S}$ | No. per organ ${ }^{11}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | cpm* | No. ${ }^{\ddagger}$ | cpm | No. | cpm | No. | cpm | No. |  |  |
| 500T | 113 | 500 | 353 | 500 | 142 | 500 | 295 | 500 | 2,000 |  |
| 1,000 T | 202 | 1,000 | 595 | 1,000 | 195 | 1,000 | 733 | 1,000 | 4,000 |  |
| 5,000 T | 743 | 5,000 | 1,750 | 5,000 | 875 | 5,000 | 1,860 | 5,000 | 20,000 |  |
| $+/+\mathrm{BM}-11^{9}$ | 719 | 4,816 | 1,480 | 4,081 | 1,400 | 8,172 | 1,030 | 2,369 | 19,000 | $2.1 \times 10^{6}$ |
| $+/+$ spleen-10 | 439 | 2,790 | 1,100 | 2,828 | 1,020 | 5,881 | 987 | 2,240 | 14,000 | $1.2 \times 10^{7}$ |
| $+/+$ spleen-12 | 398 | 2,490 | 1,090 | 2,795 | 963 | 5,537 | 877 | 1,909 | 13,000 | $1.1 \times 10^{7}$ |
| scid BM-17 | 698 | 4,662 | 273 | $<500$ (101) | 218 | 1,045 | 124 | $<500$ (143) | 6,000 | $6.7 \times 10^{5}$ |
| scid BM-19 | 274 | 1,598 | 359 | $<500$ (385) | 212 | 1,009 | 862 | 1,864 | 4,900 | $5.4 \times 10^{5}$ |
| scid BM-1 | 221 | 1,215 | 521 | 919 | 286 | 1,455 | 349 | $<500$ (320) | 3,900 | $4.3 \times 10^{5}$ |
| scid spleen-18 | 123 | 506 | 154 | $<500$ (209) | 91.3 | $<500$ (281) | 165 | $<500$ (266) | 1,300 | $2.1 \times 10^{5}$ |
| scid spleen-20 | 146 | 672 | 104 | <500 (44) | 41.9 | $<500$ (483) | 134 | <500 (173) | 1,400 | $2.3 \times 10^{5}$ |

See Materials and Methods for quantification.

* Output on the densitometer.
$\ddagger$ Number of structures calculated using Excel TRENDS.
${ }^{5} 1 \mu \mathrm{~g}$ is $1.8 \times 10^{5}$ cell equivalents.
$\|$ Calculation per organ is based on BM having $2 \times 10^{7}$ nucleated cells for all strains; C.B-17+ $/+$ spleen having $1.5 \times 10^{8}$ nucleated cells; scid spleen having $3 \times 10^{7}$ nucleated cells.
Numbers identify DNA preparations.
strains (Fig. 1, $b$ and $c$, and reference 21). There were $\sim 4.2$ $\pm 0.5 \times 10^{5} \mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ products per scid femur, which is $\sim 10 \%$ that of C.B-17+/+(3.0 $\left.\pm 0.6 \times 10^{6}\right)$. In the spleen, there were $\sim 2.8 \pm 1.0 \times 10^{5} \mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ structures in scid and $\sim 1.6 \pm$
$0.3 \times 10^{7}$ in C.B-17+/+. Serum $\mathrm{Ig}^{+}$leaky scid were not significantly different from nonleaky scid. Although easily detectable in C.B-17+/+ BM DNA, no DQ52J ${ }_{\text {H }}$ products were detected upon amplification of scid BM DNA using

Table 2. Quantification of $D J_{H}$ Structure in $B M$ and Spleen

| $\begin{aligned} & \text { C.B-17 } \\ & +/+\mathrm{BM} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} \text { scid } \\ \text { BM } \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} \text { C.B-17 } \\ +/+\begin{array}{r} \text { spleen } \end{array} \end{array}$ | scid spleen |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $1.4 \times 10^{6}$ | $6.7 \times 10^{5}$ | $3.0 \times 10^{7}$ | $2.1 \times 10^{5}$ |
| $1.0 \times 10^{6 *}$ | $5.4 \times 10^{5}$ | $1.6 \times 10^{7}$ | $2.3 \times 10^{5}$ |
| $2.1 \times 10^{6 *}$ | $4.3 \times 10^{55}$ | $1.3 \times 10^{7}$ | $5.7 \times 10^{5}$ |
| $6.7 \times 10^{6}$ | $2.8 \times 10^{55}$ | $1.6 \times 10^{711}$ | $1.2 \times 10^{5}$ |
| $3.9 \times 10^{64}$ | $4.8 \times 10^{55}$ | $1.1 \times 10^{711}$ |  |
| $4.7 \times 10^{64}$ | $3.0 \times 10^{5}$ | $1.2 \times 10^{7}$ |  |
| $1.9 \times 10^{6}$ | $3.9 \times 10^{5}$ |  |  |
| $2.3 \times 10^{6}$ |  |  |  |
| $3.3 \times 10^{6}$ |  |  |  |
| Average: $3.0 \times 10^{5}$ | $4.2 \times 10^{5}$ | $1.6 \times 10^{7}$ | $2.8 \times 10^{5}$ |
| SE: $\pm 0.61 \times 10^{6}$ | $\pm 0.49 \times 10^{5}$ | $\pm 0.29 \times 10^{7}$ | $0.99 \times 10^{5}$ |

[^1]Table 3. Comparison of $D J_{N}$ Structures Derived from scid and C.B-17+/+BM and BALB/c Fetal Liver (FL)

|  | scid | C.B-17+/+ | BALB/c FL |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| No. of structures analyzed | 57 | 57 | 40 |
| Average deletions (range) | 8.8 (2-42) | 9.1 (0-41) | 6.7 (2-15) |
| No. of structures containing nucleotide insertions | 14 | 47 | 0 |
| Average no. of nucleotide insertions for above structures | 5.4 | 4.2 | 0 |
| RF Usage: 1 | 63\% | 44\% | 70\% |
| 2 | 7\% | 18\% | 8\% |
| 3 | 30\% | 38\% | 22\% |
| Potentially productive joins | 70\% | 61\% | 90\% |
| DFL 16.1 usage | 39\% | $81 \%$ | 52\% |

Data are summarized from Figs. 2 and 3. BALB/c FL data are derived from Chang et al. (21).
$\mathrm{DQ} 52 / \mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 4$ primers. Since the sensitivity of the assay is $\sim 40$ targets $/ \mu \mathrm{g}$ DNA (21), this result indicates there are $<4.4 \times$ $10^{3} \mathrm{DQ} 52 \mathrm{~J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ rearrangements per femur (Southern analysis not shown). From these data, we conclude that scid BM and spleen have correctly sized $D J_{\mathrm{H}} 1-4$ products at $\sim 10$ and $\sim 1 \%$, respectively, of the frequency found in C.B-17+/+.

Characterization of $D J_{H}$ Structures. Based on the lack of mature lymphoid cells in scid mice and the aberrant nature of the coding junctions isolated from A-MuLV-transformed
lines from scid mice, we had expected to see few, if any, discrete normal-sized $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ fragments. To search for more subtle differences in the scid $\mathrm{DJ}_{H}$ joints, we cloned and sequenced the amplified products and compared them with those from C. $\mathrm{B}-17+/+$. Fig. 2 shows the $\mathrm{D}_{\mathrm{H}}$ structures derived from 6 - and 27 -wk-old BM of C.B-17+/+ mice. Fig. 3 shows the $\mathrm{DJ} \mathrm{H}_{\mathrm{H}}$ structures from 6-wk-old scid BM. Key features of the analysis are summarized in Tables 3 and 4.
$D J_{H}$ Rearrangements in C. $B-17+/+B M .57 \mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ struc-

Table 4. Comparison of $D J_{H}$ Structures with and without $N$ or $P$ Nucleotide Additions

|  | Total scid |  | Unique scid |  | Total C.B-17+/+ |  | Unique C.B-17+/+ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Total | Without N or P | Total | Without N or P | Total | Without <br> N or P | Total | Without <br> N or P |
| No. of structures | 57 | 43 (75\%) | 22 | 17 (77\%) | 57 | 9 (16\%) | 56 | 9 (16\%) |
| RF: 1 | 63\% | 79\% | 55\% | 59\% | 44\% | 67\% | 45\% | 67\% |
| 2 | 7\% | 2\% | 9\% | 6\% | 18\% | 11\% | 18\% | 11\% |
| 3 | 30\% | 19\% | 36\% | 35\% | 38\% | 22\% | 38\% | $22 \%$ |
| Dfl16.1 usage | 39\% | 21\% | 50\% | 32\% | 81\% | 90\% | 80\% | 90\% |
| Potentially productive | 70\% | 88\% | 55\% | 71\% | 61\% | 80\% | 63\% | 80\% |

Data are summarized from Figs. 2 and 3.



Figure 2. DNA sequences of $\mathrm{C} \cdot \mathrm{B}-17+/+\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ structures analyzed. Clones designated by A and B represent separate amplifications of BM DNA from a single 6 -wk-old C.B-17+/+ mouse. Clones designated with a C are derived from a 27 -wk-old C.B-17+/+ mouse. The nucleotides deleted from or added to the germline sequence of the recombining elements are indicated. In some structures the deleted nucleotides could have come from either the $\mathrm{D}_{\mathrm{H}}$ or $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ element. Possible $P$ insertions are underlined. In-frame stop codons are bold and italicized. Possible point mutations or Taq-induced errors are in lower-case letters.

Figure 3. DNA sequences of the nonleaky 6 -wk-old scid $B M D J_{H}$ structures. A, B, and $C$ designate different scid mice. Lower-case Roman numerals represent separate $P C R$ primary and secondary amplifications. The nucleotides deleted from or added to the germline sequences of the recombining elements are indicated. In some cases deleted nucleotides may have come from either recombining element. Possible $\mathbf{P}$ insertions are underlined. In-frame stop codons are italicized and bold. * A DJ $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ structure with a fusion of a partial $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 2$ to $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}} 4$. Mutations from germline sequences are indicated by lower-case letters. Clones whose mutations are not shown in this chart have their clone name bold.
tures from C.B-17+/+ were analyzed. Since no difference was observed between structures derived from 6-and 27 -wkold mice, the data in Fig. 2 are pooled from both sources. Deletions were present in most coding joints. An average of 9.1 nucleotides was deleted from $D$ and/or the $J_{H} . N$ and P insertions, which are a common feature in adult Ig gene rearrangement (26), were observed in $82 \%$ of the structures, with an average of 4.2 nucleotides being added. Nine structures contain possible $P$ nucleotides, of which seven also have N insertions.

Although $D_{H}$ elements can be read in all three reading frames ( RF ) and in either orientation, RF usage is not random. In the C.B-17+/+BM, RFs 1,2 , and 3 were used in 44, 18 , and $38 \%$ of the structures, respectively. RF1 is most markedly overused in the fetal repertoire where there are few if any N additions due to the lack of terminal deoxynucleotidyl transferase (TdT) activity (27). Terminal homologies of the recombining elements are thought to promote the RF1 usage in cases where there is no N addition (21, 26, 28). Indeed, upon analysis of structures within N nucleotides (nine structures), the RF1 bias becomes apparent: 67:11:22\% (Table 4).

Of the 57 C.B- $17+/+$ structures, $35(61 \%)$ were potentially productive; i.e., they lack stop codons in the used reading frame and invariant residues are present in the $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ element. $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}} 3$ structures were the least productive ( $40 \%$ ) due to the more frequent usage of RF3, which has many stop codons. The biased D usage reported by us (21) and others ( 29,30 ) was also present; genetic element Dfl16.1 was used in $81 \%$ of the $D J_{H}$ rearrangements.
$D J_{H}$ Rearrangements in scid BM. DNA derived from the BM of three 6 -wk-old, $\mathrm{Ig}^{-}$scid mice was individually amplified and cloned. Fig. 3 shows the sequences of $57 \mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ structures from scid BM DNA, and key features are summarized in Tables 3 and 4.

The scid $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ structures shown in Fig. 3 are, in fact, quite similar to those of C.B-17+/+ mice (Fig. 2) and other strains ( $21,26,28$ ). However, there are marked quantitative and qualitative differences, particularly in the degree of diversity. Of 57 scid structures isolated, only 22 were unique; 56 of 57 C.B- $17+/+\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ were unique. Moreover, only 14 of the 57 scid structures ( 5 of the 22 unique ones) contained N or $P$ nucleotide insertions. Of the five unique structures containing N or P , two contained N only, two contained possible P and N , and one structure contained possible P only. The average number of insertions for structures containing N and/or P was 5.4 ( 4.4 for unique structures), somewhat more than C.B-17+/+ ( 4.2 nucleotides [ nt ]). The mean number of nucleotides deleted from the recombined coding ends was 8.8 , which is about the same as C.B- $17+/+(9.1$ nt) (Table 3).
scid $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ structures used RF1 more frequently than C.B$17+/+$. Of the 57 scid $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ structures, 63,7 , and $30 \%$ used RFs 1,2 , and 3 respectively (compared with 44,18 , and $38 \%$, respectively, for C.B-17 $+/+$ ). Interestingly, RF1 was used more frequently in both strains when structures joined without N and/or P insertions (Table 4 ). $70 \%$ ( $55 \%$ of the 22 unique structures) of the scid structures could yield a functional Ig
protein as defined by the lack of stop codons and the presence of invariant residues in the $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ element. None of the scid $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}} 3$ structures were potentially productive. Df16.1 was overused, but less frequently than in C.B-17+/+. $39 \%$ of the scid ( $50 \%$ if the unique only are considered) structures use this $\mathrm{D}_{\mathrm{H}}$ element (Table 4).

## Discussion

Functional $D J_{H}$ Joints in scid Lymphoid Progenitors. In A-MuLV-transformed lymphocytes from scid mice, all $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ coding joints were grossly abnormal, containing large deletions of both D and $\mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ regions (5, 9). Therefore, we expected to observe few, if any, $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ joints in cells from scid bone marrow. To our surprise, normal $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ joints were observed in the present study. Moreover, the frequency of progenitor cells containing potentially functional joints was also close to normal. We arrived at this latter conclusion by determining the frequency of normal $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ joints detected by PCR and the proportion of cells in BM belonging to the B cell lineage. In normal BM, $\sim 30 \%$ of the cells belong to the $B$ lineage. Of these cells, approximately two-thirds are in the pre-B cell stage (i.e., contain cytoplasmic $\mu$ ) or $\mathbf{B}$ cell stage (i.e., express surface Ig). The remaining cells are in the pro-B stages. According to a recent study by Osmond et al. (31), the early and intermediate pro-B cells in scid mice are normal in frequency and proliferation kinetics. The late pre-B stage is markedly depleted in scid mice, so that overall the number of $B$ lineage cells in the BM of scid mice is only $\sim 10 \%$ of the number found in the BM of normal mice. Since scid mice contain $\sim 10 \%$ as many $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ joints as normal mice (Table 2), many of the pro-B cells in scid mice must contain potentially functional $\mathrm{D} \mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ joints.

These data appear to contradict previously published data on the frequency of normal $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ joints in pro-B cells transformed by A-MuLV $(5,9,32)$ and those pro-B cells produced in long-term BM cultures ( 10,33 ) derived from scid mice. In both instances, few, if any, normal $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ joints were observed in cells from scid mice. Several factors may contribute to this discrepancy: The low number of $\mathrm{B} 220^{+}$cells in the BM of scid mice (31) indicates that cells that fail to make a functional heavy chain gene are rapidly deleted in the BM. However, cells with nonfunctional rearrangements may be rescued either by transformation with A-MuLV or by the growth conditions in long-term BM cultures. It is also possible that during the continued growth of these rescued cells the abnormal recombinase system continues to function so that further gross deletions are generated under these two conditions. Thus, the abnormal rearrangements may be a result of the rescue of cells from programmed cell death, and they may not accurately reflect the ability of the recombinase system to carry out $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ recombination.

It is also possible that the major defect in gene rearrangement occurs when the cells attempt to form a $\mathrm{V}_{\mathrm{H}}-\mathrm{DJ} \mathrm{J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ joint. Quasi-normal DJ rearrangements have been reported in scid thymocytes at the $\delta$ locus, while there was no evidence of $\mathrm{V} \delta$ rearrangement (20). Studies in long-term BM cultures
and in A-MuLV-transformed cells provided little evidence for attempted V to DJ recombination, though it is possible that activation of this process is highly abnormal and leads to the gross deletions mentioned previously. Using primers that detect a large proportion of the $\mathrm{V}_{\mathrm{H}}$ joints, we are attempting to investigate $\mathrm{VD}_{\mathrm{H}}$ recombination with similar quantitative PCR studies of the type described in this paper.
Implications for the Leaky Phenotype. As mentioned above, scid is a leaky phenotype; normal Ig-secreting lymphocytes arise in scid mice (12). One model put forward to explain leakiness is the somatic reversion model. The premise of this model is that a genetic reversion in a pro-B or earlier cell leads to clones of cells capable of normal gene rearrangement. The major piece of evidence supporting the somatic reversion model is the observation of normal coding joints on the nonexpressed alleles in T cells obtained from leaky scid mice (16). This observation was taken as evidence that the recombination machinery was normal in these cells and hence that a reversion had taken place. Our hypothesis is, instead, that leakiness is the result of the chance occurrence of three functional Ig rearrangements in a single lymphoid cell. Indeed, if a cell ultimately makes a functional receptor (the requirement for leakiness), it is not unlikely that the rearrangement on the other allele is also functional. This explanation would account for the data from Petrini et al. (16), as described above, and does not require that there was a reversion in the recombinase machinery itself.

Fetal Nature of $D J_{H}$ Joints in scid Mice. Although the proportion of potentially functional $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ joints in scid mice was similar to that observed for normal mice, there were unusual features of the joints in scid mice. Very few additional ( N or P ) nucleotides are inserted into the joint. A similar low frequency is often observed in fetal liver cells $(21,26,28)$ and is attributed to the low levels of TdT in fetal liver (27,
28). As reported by Osmond et al. (31), the frequency of $\mathrm{TdT}{ }^{+}$cells in scid BM is identical to that observed in the BM of normal mice. Thus, the low level of N nucleotides is unlikely to result from overall reduced TdT levels.

The second unusual feature of the $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ rearrangements in scid mice was the restricted repertoire observed. When we sequenced $57 \mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ joints isolated from C.B-17+/+ mice, we detected 56 unique sequences. In contrast, the $57 \mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ clones from scid mice contained only 22 unique sequences. Six of these sequences were isolated many times. If, as discussed above, the scid mutation results in a dissociation between the timing of gene rearrangement and the sequential transition of cells from pro- B to pre- B to B cells, it is possible that an abnormal expansion occurs in the late pro-B cell stage allowing minor clonal dominance of some $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ rearrangements. Support for this explanation can be seen in some of the Southern blots (Fig. 1, $b$ and $c$ ) where, at times, one of the four $D \mathrm{~J}_{\mathrm{H}}$ bands is unusually intense. Such band may represent an expanded clone.

Recently, possible intermediates in V(D)J recombination have been detected in scid thymocyte DNA. These intermediates are "hairpinned" D $\delta$ and J $\delta$ coding ends. The inability to isolate such structures from normal mouse DNA has lead to the speculation that the scid defect affects the resolution and/or generation of these structures ( 2,34 ). Taken with our finding of a general lack of N insertions in scid, these data suggest that the scid product might interact, or rather interfere, with TdT activity at the stage where the hairpins are resolved. In view of the observations that homologies at the coding ends promote recombination in the absence of $\mathrm{Td} \mathbf{T}(21,26)$, examination of $\mathrm{DJ}_{\mathrm{H}}$ joints in scid fetal liver, where recombination occurs solely without N addition, may be informative.

# We are thankful for the careful assistance of Clare Ellen Spencer and Lynne Omoto. We thank Dale Ramsden, Michael Atkinson, and Chris Paige for helpful discussions. <br> This work was funded by grants from the Medical Research Council of Canada and the National Cancer Institute of Canada with funds from the Terry Fox Marathon of Hope. G. Wu is an Medical Research Council Scholar. 

Address correspondence to Gillian E. Wu, Wellesley Hospital Research Institute, 160 Wellesley Street, East Toronto, Ontario, Canada M4Y 1 J 3.

Received for publication 4 May 1993 and in revised form 21 June 1993.

## References

1. Tonegawa, S. 1983. Somatic generation of antibody diversity. Nature (Lond.). 302:575.
2. Gellert, M. 1992. Molecular analysis of V (D)J recombination. Annu. Rev. Genet. 22:425.
3. Schatz, D.G., M.A. Oettinger, and M.S. Schlissel. 1992. V(D)J
recombination: molecular biology and regulation. Annu. Rev. Immunol. 10:359.
4. Lewis, S., A. Gifford, and D. Baltimore. 1985. DNA elements are asymmetrically joined during the site-specific recombination of kappa immunoglobulin genes. Science (Wash. DC).

228:677.
5. Malynn, B.A., T.K. Blackwell, G.M. Fulop, G.A. Rathburn, A.J.W. Furley, P. Ferrier, L.B. Heinke, R.A. Phillips, G.D. Yancopoulos, and F.W. Alt. 1988. The scid defect affects the final step of the immunoglobulin VDJ recombinase mechanism. Cell. 54:453.
6. Shinkai, Y., G. Rathburn, K. Lam, E.M. Oltz, V. Stewart, M. Mendelsohn, J. Charron, M. Datta, F. Young, A.M. Stall, and F. Alt. 1992. RAG-2-deficient mice lack mature lymphocytes owing to inability to initiate $\mathrm{V}(\mathrm{D}) \mathrm{J}$ rearrangement. Cell. 68:855.
7. Mombaerts, P., J. Iacomini, R.S. Johnson, K. Herrup, S. Tonegawa, and V.E. Papioannou. 1992. RAG-1-deficient mice have no mature B and T lymphocytes. Cell. 68:869.
8. Lieber, M.R., J.E. Hesse, S. Lewis, G.C. Bosma, N. Rosenberg, K. Mizuuchi, M.J. Bosma, and M. Gellert. 1988. The defect in murine severe combined immune deficiency: joining of signal sequences but not coding segments in $\mathrm{V}(\mathrm{D}) \mathrm{J}$ recombination. Cell. 55:7.
9. Kim, M.G., W. Schuler, M.J. Bosma, and K.B. Marcu. 1988. Abnormal recombination of $I g h \mathrm{D}$ and J gene segments in transformed pre-B cells of scid mice. J. Immunol. 141:1341.
10. Okazaki, K., S.I. Nishikawa, and H. Sakano. 1988. Aberrant immunoglobulin gene rearrangement in scid mouse bone marrow cells. J. Immunol. 141:1348.
11. Blackwell, T.K., B.A. Malynn, R.R. Pollock, P. Ferrier, L.R. Covey, G.M. Fulop, R.A. Phillips, G.D. Yancopoulos, and F.W. Alt. 1989. Isolation of scid pre-B cells that rearrange kappa light chain genes: formation of normal signal and abnormal coding joins. EMBO (Eur. Mol. Biol. Organ.) J. 8:735.
12. Bosma, G.C., M. Fried, R.P. Custer, A. Carroll, D.M. Gibson, and M.J. Bosma. 1988. Evidence of functional lymphocytes in some (leaky) scid mice. J. Exp. Med. 167:1016.
13. Gibson, D.M., G.C. Bosma, and M.J. Bosma. 1989. Limited clonal diversity of serum immunoglobulin in leaky scid mice. Curr. Top. Microbiol. Immunol. 152:125.
14. Kearney, J.F., N. Solvason, R. Stohrer, J. Ma, V. Van Cleave, A. Leheun, G. Fulop, and M. Fried. 1989. Pauciclonal B cell involvement in production of immunoglobulin in scid $\mathrm{Ig}^{+}$ mice. Curr. Top. Microbiol. Immunol. 152:137.
15. Carroll, A.M., R.R. Hardy, J. Petrini, and M.J. Bosma. 1989. T cell leakiness in scid mice. Curr. Top. Microbiol. Immunol. 152:117.
16. Petrini, J.H.J., A.M. Carroll, and M.J. Bosma. 1990. T-cell receptor gene rearrangements in functional T -cell clones from severe combined immune deficient (scid) mice: reversion of the scid phenotype in individual lymphocyte progenitors. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA. 87:3450.
17. Kienker, L.J., W.A. Kuziel, B.A. Garni-Wagner, V. Kumar, and P.W. Tucker. 1991. T cell receptor $\gamma$ and $\delta$ gene rearrangements in scid thymocytes: similarity to those in normal thymocytes. J. Immunol. 147:4351.
18. Carroll, A.M., J.K. Slcak, and X. Mu. 1993. V(D)J recombination generates a high frequency of non-standard TCR $\mathrm{D} \delta$ associated rearrangements in thymocytes. J. Immunol. In press.
19. Carroll, A.M., J.K. Slcak, and W. Chang. 1993. Biased TCR $\delta$ element recombination in SCID thymocytes. Mol. Cell. Biol. In press.
20. Carroll, A.M., and M.J. Bosma. 1991. T-lymphocyte development in scid mice is arrested shortly after the initiation of T-cell $\delta$ gene recombination. Genes. $\mathcal{E}$ Dev. 5:1357.
21. Chang, Y., C.J. Paige, and G.E. Wu. 1992. Enumeration and characterization of DJH structures in mouse fetal liver. EMBO (Eur. Mol. Biol. Organ.) J. 11:1891.
22. Atkinson, M.J., D.A. Michnick, C.J. Paige, and G.E. Wu. 1991. Immunoglobulin gene rearrangements on individual alleles of A-MuLV cell lines from (C57BL/6 $\times \mathrm{BALB} / \mathrm{c}$ )F1 fetal livers. J. Immunol. 146:2805.
23. Maniatis, T., E.F. Fritsch, and J. Sambrook. 1982. Molecular Cloning: A Laboratory Manual, Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory, Cold Spring Harbor, NY.
24. Eisen, A., M.J. Atkinson, J.C. Celler, and G.E. Wu. 1991. DJ/DJ A-MuLV pre-B cell lines have more recombinase activity than VDJ/VDJ lines. Int. Immunol. 3:477.
25. Fulop, G.M., G.C. Bosma, M.J. Bosma, and R.A. Phillips. 1988. Early B-cell precursors in scid mice: normal numbers of cells transformable with Abelson murine leukemia virus (A-MuLV). Cell. Immunol. 113:192.
26. Gu, H., I. Förster, and K. Rajewsky. 1990. Sequence homologies, $\mathbf{N}$ sequence insertion and JH gene utilization in VHDJH joining: implications for the joining mechanism and the ontogenic timing of Ly1 B cell and B-CLL progenitor generation. EMBO (Eur. Mol. Biol. Organ.) J. 9:2133.
27. Desiderio, S.V., G.D. Yancopoulos, M. Paskind, E. Thomas, M.A. Boss, N. Landau, F.W. Alt, and D. Baltimore. 1984. Insertion of N regions into heavy-chain genes is correlated with expression of terminal deoxynucleotidyl transferase in B cells. Nature (Lond.). 311:752.
28. Feeney, A.J. 1990. Lack of N regions in fetal and neonatal mouse immunoglobulin V-D-J junctional sequences. J. Exp. Med. 172:1377.
29. Feeney, A.J. 1992. Predominance of VH-D-JH junctions occurring in sites of short sequence homology results in a limited junctional diversity in neonatal antibodies. J. Immunol. 149:222.
30. Gu, H., D. Kitamura, and K. Rajewsky. 1991. B cell development regulated by gene rearrangement: arrest of maturation by membrane-bound $\mathrm{D} \mu$ protein and selection of DH element reading frames. Cell. 65:47.
31. Osmond, D.G., N. Kim, R. Manoukian, R.A. Phillips, S.A. Rico-Vargas, and K. Jacobsen. 1992. Dynamics and localization of early B-lymphocyte precursor cells (Pro-B cells) in the bone marrow of scid mice. Blood. 79:1695.
32. Schuler, W., I.J. Weiler, A. Schuler, R.A. Phillips, N. Rosenberg, T.W. Mak, J.F. Kearney, R.P. Perry, and M.J. Bosma. 1986. Rearrangement of antigen receptor genes is defective in mice with severe combined immune deficiency. Cell. 46:963.
33. Hirayoshi, K., S. Nishikawa, T. Kina, M. Hatanaka, S. Habu, T. Nomura, and Y. Katsura. 1987. Immunoglobulin heavy chain gene diversification in the long-term bone marrow culture of normal mice and mice with severe combined immunodeficiency. Eur. J. Immunol. 17:1051.
34. Roth, D.B., J.P. Menetski, P.B. Nakajima, M.J. Bosma, and M. Gellert. 1982. V(D)J recombination: broken DNA molecules with covalently sealed (hairpin) coding ends in scid mouse thymocytes. Cell. 70:983.


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Abbreviations used in this paper: A-MuLV, Abelson murine leukemia virus; BM, bone marrow; RF, reading frame; RSS, recombination signal sequence.

[^1]:    $2 \times 10^{7}$ nucleated BM cells for all strains. $1.5 \times 10^{8}$ nucleated spleen cells for C.B-17+/+ and $3 \times 10^{7}$ cells for scid.
    *FSII The same samples evaluated in different quantifications.
    Each value was determined from a set of data analyzed as detailed in Table 1.

