

G OPEN ACCESS

Citation: Paramita RI, Nelwan EJ, Fadilah F, Renesteen E, Puspandari N, Erlina L (2020) Genome-based characterization of *Escherichia coli* causing bloodstream infection through nextgeneration sequencing. PLoS ONE 15(12): e0244358. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal. pone.0244358

Editor: Iddya Karunasagar, Nitte University, INDIA

Received: August 21, 2020

Accepted: December 9, 2020

Published: December 23, 2020

Copyright: © 2020 Paramita et al. This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

Data Availability Statement: All FASTA raw files are available from BioProject accession number PRJNA596854 and Sequence Read Archive accession numbers SRR10761126– SRR10761147.

Funding: This research was funded by Universitas Indonesia (Q1Q2 Grant; grant number NBK-0220/ UN2.R3.1/HKP.05.00/2019).

Competing interests: The authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

RESEARCH ARTICLE

Genome-based characterization of *Escherichia coli* causing bloodstream infection through next-generation sequencing

Rafika Indah Paramita^{1,2,3}, Erni Juwita Nelwan^{4,5}, Fadilah Fadilah^{1,2,3}, Editha Renesteen⁵, Nelly Puspandari⁶, Linda Erlina^{1,2,3}*

 Department of Medical Chemistry, Faculty of Medicine, Universitas Indonesia, DKI Jakarta, Indonesia,
Bioinformatics Core Facilities—IMERI, Faculty of Medicine, Universitas Indonesia, DKI Jakarta, Indonesia,
Master's Programme in Biomedical Sciences, Faculty of Medicine, Universitas Indonesia, DKI Jakarta, Indonesia, 4 Department of Internal Medicine, Faculty of Medicine, Universitas Indonesia, DKI Jakarta, Indonesia, 5 Infectious Disease and Immunology Research Center—IMERI, Faculty of Medicine, Universitas Indonesia, DKI Jakarta, Indonesia, 6 Centre for Research and Development of Biomedical and Basic Health Technology, National Institute of Health Research and Development, Ministry of Health, DKI Jakarta, Indonesia

* linda.erlina22@ui.ac.id

Abstract

Escherichia coli are one of the commonest bacteria causing bloodstream infection (BSI). The aim of the research was to identify the serotypes, MLST (Multi Locus Sequence Type), virulence genes, and antimicrobial resistance of E. coli isolated from bloodstream infection hospitalized patients in Cipto Mangunkusumo National Hospital Jakarta. We used whole genome sequencing methods rather than the conventional one, to characterized the serotypes, MLST (Multi Locus Sequence Type), virulence genes, and antimicrobial resistance (AMR) of E. coli. The composition of E. coli sequence types (ST) was as follows: ST131 (n = 5), ST38 (*n* = 3), ST405 (*n* = 3), ST69 (*n* = 3), and other STs (ST1057, ST127, ST167, ST3033, ST349, ST40, ST58, ST6630). Enteroaggregative E. coli (EAEC) and Extra-intestinal pathogenic E. coli (ExPEC) groups were found dominant in our samples. Twenty isolates carried virulence genes for host cells adherence and 15 for genes that encourage E. coli immune evasion by enhancing survival in serum. ESBL-genes were present in 17 E. coli isolates. Other AMR genes also encoded resistance against aminoglycosides, quinolones, chloramphenicol, macrolides and trimethoprim. The phylogeny analysis showed that phylogroup D is dominated and followed by phylogroup B2. The E. coli isolated from 22 patients in Cipto Mangunkusumo National Hospital Jakarta showed high diversity in serotypes, sequence types, virulence genes, and AMR genes. Based on this finding, routinely screening all bacterial isolates in health care facilities can improve clinical significance. By using Whole Genome Sequencing for laboratory-based surveillance can be a valuable early warning system for emerging pathogens and resistance mechanisms.

Introduction

There is currently enlarge in the prevalence of infections worldwide due to multidrug-resistant (MDR). Due to their correlation with a high level of mortality and morbidity which are triggered by the insufficient of potent antibiotics, Gram-negative bacteria became a critical threat to global public health [1-3]. The production of Extended-spectrum beta-lactamase (ESBL) became the most significant determinant of AMR that spreads rapidly among Enterobacteriaceae [4, 5].

Escherichia coli naturally inhabits the human gastrointestinal tract (GIT) and classified as Gram-negative commensals bacterium. Two main classification of pathogenic *E. coli*—diar-rheagenic *E. coli* (DEC) and extra-intestinal pathogenic *E. coli* (ExPEC)—are perceived, vary-ing in their associated clinical syndromes and virulence genes. Extraintestinal pathogenic *E. coli* (ExPEC) can cause a diversity of infections, including sepsis, neonatal meningitis, and uri-nary tract infections (UTI). The urinary tract is the most commonly infected by these bacteria, which then, is a common source for bloodstream infections [6]. Through horizontal transfer and other mechanisms, commensal *E. coli* regularly obtains pathogenicity, virulence and multi-drug resistance characteristics of the pathogenic *E. coli*. Virulent *E. coli* strains then share pathogenic, virulence, and resistance genes with avirulent or less virulent strains, allowing the appearance of pathogenesis beyond their natural characters [7].

There are six well-recognized pathotypes of DEC such as enterotoxigenic *E. coli* [ETEC], enteropathogenic *E. coli* [EPEC], enteroaggregative *E. coli* [EAEC], Shiga toxin (Stx)-producing *E. coli* [STEC], enteroinvasive *E. coli* [EIEC], and diffusely adherent *E. coli* [DAEC], are identified as the leading etiological agents of childhood and travellers' diarrhoea. EAEC has long been considered as an intestinal pathogen and thereof unlikely to cause disease in normal patients outside of the intestinal tract [8]. However, current studies have related EAEC strains with fatal haemolytic uremic syndrome outbreaks and urinary tract infection [8, 9].

Whole genome sequencing (WGS) as a sophisticated molecular diagnostics have shown the emergence of *E. coli* strains that cause fatal diarrhoea due to the combination of the virulence genes [10]. The virulence genes are important to understand the pathogenic properties of the causative organisms. The virulence gene is an agent that forms itself in or within its host by increasing its able to trigger disease effectively and efficiently. The virulence genes in certain *E. coli* strains was associated with serious outbreaks in Denmark between 2014–2015 [11]; in Italia between 2016–2017, where it caused 7.1% 30-day mortality rate [12]; in China in 1999, where it caused 177 deaths [13]; and in Germany in 2011, where it killed 54 people [14]. Molecular genomic studies of human infections of *E. coli* in Indonesia, especially in Jakarta are unusual and no report is available regarding specific subtypes causing infections in Jakarta. The purpose of the study was to characterize the serotypes, MLST (Multi Locus Sequence Type), virulence genes, and antimicrobial resistance of *E. coli* isolated from bloodstream infection patients in Cipto Mangunkusumo National Hospital Jakarta.

Methods

DNA isolation and whole genome sequencing

From blood samples from bloodstream infection patients the *E. coli* were isolated and then it cultured in Lactose Broth medium in the laboratory facilities at the Centre for Research and Development of Biomedical and Basic Health Technology, National Institute of Health Research and Development, Ministry of Health, Indonesia, between January–December 2018. The DNA was isolated from cultured *E. coli using* a Geneaid PrestoTM Mini gDNA Bacteria Kit. All of the isolation and whole genome sequencing methods of 22 samples of *Escherichia coli* were described in Nelwan, *et al*, 2020 [15]. This research was performed in strict

conformity with the suggestions in the guide of Helsinki Declaration and the research protocol was approved by Health Research Ethics Committee, National Institute of Health Research and Development (HREC-NIHRD) with protocol approval number: LB.02.01/KE.014/2019.

Bioinformatics analysis

The paired-end reads from each *Escherichia coli* isolate were checked for the quality using FastQC 0.11.4 [16]. Before assembly, all reads with low quality were removed after quality control with Trimmomatic software [17]. Raw genome data have been submitted to the NCBI (https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/) and are available under BioProject accession number PRJNA596854 (https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/bioproject/PRJNA596854). According to this research aim, the analyses included: Multi-Locus Sequence Typing (MLST) determination using MLST 2.0.4 [18] (database version: 2.0.0 (2020-06-29)), serotyping using SeroTypeFinder 2.0.1 [19] (database version: 2.0.0 (2020-05-29), and antimicrobial resistance (AMR) genes identification using ResFinder 3.2 [21] (database version: 2020-06-02). VirulenceFinder identified 29 virulence genes, of which 12 are ExPEC-associated, 16 are EAEC-associated, and 1 is EPEC-associated, irrespective of pathotype. For the detection standard parameters were set as follows: VirulenceFinder and SerotypeFinder, 85% sequence identity and 60% sequence coverage; ResFinder, 90% sequence identity and 60% sequence coverage; MLST, using the seven loci (gyrB, adk, icd, purA, recA, fumC, and mdh) scheme.

In this research, the 24 *E. coli* genomes were analyzed and compared with 26 diverse *E. coli* genomes (S1 Table) using PhaME pipelines [22] which applied a maximum likelihood phylogeny by RAxML v7.2.8, with the GTR model of nucleotide substitution, for model of rate heterogeneity we use the GAMMA, and 100 bootstrap replicates. The phylogeny was midpointrooted and diagramed using the interactive Tree of Life software (iTOL v.3).

Results

Multi-locus sequence typing and serotyping

From total of 22 *E. coli* isolates, 12 different STs were identified. Five (22,7%) *E. coli* samples are belonged to ST131 and all of this five had serotype O25:H4. Each of ST38, ST405, and ST69 were observed three (13,6%) out of 22 *E. coli* isolates. Of these three, two (66,7%) ST38 had serotype O86:H18, and another one had serotype unknown O-group but belonged to H30. All of the ST405 had serotype O102:H6 and the three of ST69 had different serotype, i.e O15:H6, O15:H18, O15:H1 (Table 1). Each of ST1057, ST127, ST167, ST3033, ST349, ST40, ST58, ST6630 were observed one (4,5%) out of 22 *E. coli* isolates. Strains with the same serotype and ST typically harboured the same set of virulence genes, such as O25:H4 (ST131) isolates, O102: H6 (ST405), and O86:H18 (ST38).

Distribution of virulence genes

Table 1 as well display the classification of virulence genes among the sequenced *E. coli* isolates. The virulence genes distribution in pathotypes species of *E. coli* were described in Table 2. A total of 20 (20,9%) *E. coli* isolates carried virulence genes for host cells adherence. These contained 11 (55%) for *eilA*, 10 (50%) for *air*, 7 (35%) for *lpfA*, 6 (30%) for *iha*, 3 (15%) for each *nfaE* and *aap*, 2 (10%) for each *aggR* and *aatA*, 1 (5%) for each *aar*, *sfaS* and *eae*. A total of 14 *E. coli* isolates had virulence genes that promote toxin production. The composition of virulence genes that promote toxin was 4 (28,6%) for *cnf1*, 6 (42,8%) for *sat*, 3 (21,4%) for *vat*, 5 (35,7%) for *senB*, 2 (14,3%) for each *pic* and *astA*, 1 (7,1%) for each *ireA* and *tsh*. A total of 5 *E*.

Sample name	Serotype	e Phylogroup	Virulence Genes				
				Adhesins	Toxin	Siderophores	Protectins
RSCM_EC_0203	ST40	H21	B1	lpfA, eae		iroN	iss
RSCM_EC_0709	ST58	O8:H10	B1	lpfA			iss
RSCM_EC_0507	ST167	O89:H21	А				
RSCM_EC_1316	ST127	O6:H31	B2	sfaS	cnf1, vat, senB, pic	iroN	iss
RSCM_EC_1114	ST3033	O25:H31	B2		vat		
RSCM_EC_0102	ST1057	O154:H5	B2	lpfA	cnf1, ireA, sat, vat	ireA, iroN	
RSCM_EC_0406	ST131	O25:H4	B2	iha	sat, senB		iss
RSCM_EC_0911	ST131	O25:H4	B2	iha	cnf1, sat		iss
RSCM_EC_2442	ST131	O25:H4	B2	iha	sat, senB		iss
RSCM_EC_2137	ST131	O25:H4	B2	iha	cnf1, sat, senB		iss
RSCM_EC_1833	ST131	O25:H4	B2	nfaE	pic		iss
RSCM_EC_0608	ST6630	O1:H25	F	lpfA, air, eilA			
RSCM_EC_2240	ST349	O86:H2	D	eilA		iroN	iss
RSCM_EC_2036	ST405	O102:H6	D	air, eilA			
RSCM_EC_1526	ST405	O102:H6	D	air, eilA			
RSCM_EC_1013	ST405	O102:H6	D	air, eilA			
RSCM_EC_0305	ST38	O86:H18	D	aap, air, eilA, nfaE	astA		iss
RSCM_EC_1628	ST38	O86:H18	D	aap, air, eilA, nfaE	astA		iss
RSCM_EC_1418	ST38	H30	D	aap, air, eilA, iha, aatA, agg3B, agg3C, agg3D, agg5A, aggR	sat		iss
RSCM_EC_2341	ST69	O15:H1	D	lpfA, air, eilA	senB		iss
RSCM_EC_1732	ST69	O15:H6	D	lpfA, air, eilA	tsh	iroN	iss
RSCM_EC_1935	ST69	O15:H18	D	lpfA, iha, aap, air, eilA, aatA, aar, aggA, aggB, aggC, aggD, aggR	sat		iss

Table 1.	Sequence type	s, serotypes, a	nd virulence genes	s of 22 <i>E. coli</i> isolates
----------	---------------	-----------------	--------------------	---------------------------------

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0244358.t001

coli isolates had virulence genes that produce iron acquisition systems (siderophores). Of these five, 5 (100%) for *iroN* and 1 (20%) for *ireA*. A total of 15 (68,2%) *E. coli* isolates had *iss*, a component that promotes *E. coli* immune evasion by increasing serum survival.

Isolates that harboured the virulence genes of EAEC were characteristically typical EAEC by genomic criteria. The EAEC showed highly heterogeneous with the existence of a substantial number of genes typically correlated with other *E. coli* pathotypes, i.e. extraintestinal pathogenic *E. coli* (ExPEC) and EPEC. ExPEC genes found among the EAEC strains included i) increased serum survival-encoding gene, iss (63.6%); ii) Secreted autotransporter toxin, *sat* (18.2%); iii) Plasmid encoded enterotoxin, *senB* (9.1%); iv) Temperature-sensitive hemagglutinin, *tsh* (9.1%), and Salmochelin receptor, *iroN* (18.2%). *LpfA* was the only virulence gene to differ in frequency between the phylogenetic groups, as it was found in all B1 isolates, phylogroup B2, phylogroup F, and phylogroup D.

Antimicrobial resistance

A total of 22 (100%) *E. coli* carried genes encoding macrolide resistance enzymes (Table 3). Those include 22 (100%) of mdf(A), 9 (40.9%) of mph(A), 1 (4.5%) for ere(B), 1 (4.5%) of erm(*B*), and 1 (4.5%) for Inu(F). A total of 19 (86.4%) *E. coli* isolates showed anti beta-lactam resistance genes. The proportions of genes encoding the beta-lactam enzymes are blaCTX-M-15 in 6 (27.3%) isolates, blaCTX-M-27 in 5 (22.7%) isolates, blaTEM-1B in 8 (36.4%) isolates, blaDHA-1 in 3 (13.6%) isolates, blaOXA-10 in 1 (4.5%) isolate, blaOXA-1 in 3 (13.6%) isolates, blaCTX-M-55 in 2 (9.1%) isolates, blaCARB-2 in 1 (4.5%) isolate and blaSHV-120 in 1 (4.5%) isolate. The overall proportion of dfrA genes encoding trimethoprim resistance enzymes was

Gene	Gene description	Pathotype Species	References
aggR	Transcriptional activator	EAEC	[23]
aar	AggR-activated regulator	EAEC	[23]
аар	Dispersin, antiaggregation protein	EAEC	[23]
aatA	Dispersin transporter protein	EAEC	[23]
aggA	AAF/I fimbrial subunit	EAEC	[23]
aggB	AAF/I fimbrial subunit	EAEC	[23]
aggC	AAF/I fimbrial subunit	EAEC	[23]
aggD	AAF/I fimbrial subunit	EAEC	[23]
agg3B	AAF/III fimbrial subunit	EAEC	[23]
agg3C	AAF/III fimbrial subunit	EAEC	[23]
agg3D	AAF/III fimbrial subunit	EAEC	[23]
agg5A	AAF/V fimbrial subunit	EAEC	[23]
air	Enteroaggregative immunoglobulin repeat protein	EAEC	[23]
astA	Heat-stable enterotoxin 1	EAEC	[23]
cnf1	cytotoxic necrotizing factor 1	ExPEC	[23]
eilA	Salmonella HilA homolog	EAEC	[23]
eae	intimin	EPEC	[24]
iha	Adherence protein	ExPEC	[25]
ireA	Siderophore receptor	ExPEC	[23]
iroN	Salmochelin receptor	ExPEC	[25]
iss	Increased serum survival	ExPEC	[23]
lpfA	Long polar fimbriae	EAEC	[23]
pic	Serin protease autotransporter	ExPEC	[25]
nfaE	Diffuse adherence fibrillar adhesin	ExPEC	[26]
sfaS	S-fimbriae	ExPEC	[23]
sat	Secreted autotransporter toxin	ExPEC	[25]
senB	Plasmid encoded enterotoxin	ExPEC	[27]
tsh	Temperature-sensitive hemagglutinin	ExPEC	[28]
vat	Vacuolating autotransporter toxin	ExPEC	[28]

Table 2. Virulence genes distribution in E. coli.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0244358.t002

12 (54.5%) isolates. The composition of dfrA17 was 5 (22.7%) isolates, followed by 3 (13.6%) for dfrA14, 2 (9.1%) for dfrA12 and 1 (4.5%) for each dfrA1, dfrA7, and dfrA16 genes. The compositions of genes encoding chloramphenicol resistance enzymes were 3 (13.6%) for catB3, 3 (13.6%) for catA1, 3 (13.6%) for floR and 1 (4.5%) for catA2. A total of 15 (63.6%) isolates carried genes against aminoglycoside. The gene aadA5 was detected in 4 (18.2%), aph(6)-Id in 8 (36.4%), aac(3)-IId in 5 (22.7%), aac(6')-Ib-cr in 3 (13.6%), aadA2 in 2 (9.1%), each aadA1 and aph(3'')-Ib in 2 (4.5%), aph(6)-Id in 1(4.5%), Aac(6'')-Iai in 1(4.5%), aac(3)-IIa in 3 (13.6%), and aadA2 in 2 (9.1%) E. coli isolates.

Ten of *E. coli* isolates were predicted to be resistant to ciprofloxacin (Table 4) due to amino acid substitutions in quinolone-resistance-determining-regions (QRDR) of *parC* gene (S80I, E84V) and/or QRDR of *gyrA* gene (S83L, D87N). Moreover, several SNPs resulting in amino acid substitutions were also defined in *parE* gene (I529L, S458A). From this result, *E. coli* isolates that show Ciprofloxacin isolates were ST131, ST405, and ST167.

Phylogenomic analysis of the E. coli isolates

In general, *E. coli* may be distributed into 7 phylogenetic categories as follows: A, B1, B2, C, D, E, and F [29]. Based on the phylogenetic tree of the E. coli isolates and 26 E. coli references as

Sample_name	Antibiotics (Identity%; Query/Template length)							
	Aminoglycoside	Macrolide	Quinolones	Beta-Lactam	Phenicol	Trimethoprim		
RSCM_EC_0203		<i>mdf(A)</i> (99.11; 1233/ 1233)						
RSCM_EC_0709	aac(3)-IId (99.88; 861/ 861)	<i>mdf(A)</i> (98.46; 1233/ 1233)	qnrS1 (100; 657/ 657)	<i>blaCTX-M-55</i> (100; 876/ 876)				
RSCM_EC_0507	aac(3)-IId (99.88; 861/861) aadA2 (100; 792/792)	mdf(A) (99.92; 1233/1233) mph(A) (100; 906/906)	qepA4 (100; 1536/1536)	blaCTX-M-15 (100; 876/876) blaTEM-1B (100; 861/861)	<i>catA1</i> (99.85; 660/ 660)	dfrA12 (100; 498/ 498)		
RSCM_EC_1316		<i>mdf(A)</i> (97.89; 1233/1233)		<i>blaCTX-M-15</i> (100; 876/876)				
RSCM_EC_1114		<i>mdf(A)</i> (97.89; 1233/1233)						
RSCM_EC_0102	Aph(3")-Ib (100; 804/804) aph(6)-Id (100; 837/837)	mdf(A) (97.89; 1233/1233)		<i>blaTEM-1B</i> (100; 837/837)		dfrA7 (100; 474/474)		
RSCM_EC_0406	aac(3)-IId (99.88; 861/861) Aac(6")-Iai (100; 567/567)	mdf(A) (97.81; 1233/1233) mph(A) (100; 906/906)	qnrB4 (100; 645/645)	blaDHA-1 (100; 1140/1140) blaOXA-10 (100; 637/801) blaSHV-120, (100; 861/861) blaTEM-1B (100; 861/861)		dfrA16 (100; 474/474) dfrA17 (100; 474/474)		
RSCM_EC_0911	aac(3)-IIa (99.77; 861/861) aac(6')-Ib-cr (100; 600/600) aadA5 (100; 789/789)	mdf(A) (97.81; 1233/1233) mph(A) (99.58; 720/921)	aac(6')-Ib-cr (100; 600/600)	blaCTX-M-15 (100; 876/876) blaOXA-1 (100; 831/831)	<i>catB3</i> (100; 442/633)	dfrA17 (100; 474/474)		
RSCM_EC_2442	i	<i>mdf(A)</i> (97.81; 1233/1233)		<i>blaCTX-M-27</i> (100; 876/876)				
RSCM_EC_2137	aac(6')-Ib-cr (100; 600/600) aac(3)-IIa (99.77; 861/861)	<i>mdf(A)</i> (97.81; 1233/1233)	aac(6')-Ib-cr (100; 600/600)	blaCTX-M-15 (100; 876/876) blaOXA-1 (100; 831/831)	<i>catB3</i> (100; 442/633)			
RSCM_EC_1833	aac(3)-IId (99.88; 861/861) aac(6')-Ib-cr (100; 600/600) aadA2 (100; 565/792)	<i>mdf(A)</i> (97.81; 1233/1233) <i>mph</i> <i>(A)</i> (99.58; 720/921) <i>ere(B)</i> (100; 1189/1260)	aac(6')-Ib-cr (100; 600/600)	blaCARB-2 (100; 867/867) blaCTX-M-15 (100; 876/876) blaTEM-1B (100; 861/861) blaOXA-1 (100; 831/831)	<i>catA1</i> (99.85; 660/660) <i>catA2</i> (96.11; 642/642) <i>catB3</i> (100; 442/633)	dfrA12 (100; 498/498) dfrA14 (100; 474/474)		
RSCM_EC_0608		<i>mdf(A)</i> (98.46; 1233/1233)						
RSCM_EC_2240	aadA1 (99.87; 792/792)	<i>mdf(A)</i> (98.05; 1233/1233) <i>mph(A)</i> (100; 906/906)	<i>qnrB4</i> (100; 645/645)	<i>blaDHA-1</i> (100; 1140/1140)				
RSCM_EC_2036	aph(6)-Id (100; 837/837) aph(3'')-Ib (100; 804/804)	<i>mdf(A)</i> (97.97; 1233/1233)	qepA1 (100; 1536/1536)	<i>blaCTX-M-27</i> (100; 876/876)	floR (98.19; 1214/1215)			

Table 3. Antimicrobial resistance genes.

(Continued)

Sample_name	Antibiotics (Identity%; Query/Template length)							
	Aminoglycoside	Macrolide	Quinolones	Beta-Lactam	Phenicol	Trimethoprim		
RSCM_EC_1526	aph(6)-Id (100; 698/831) aadA5 (100; 789/789) aph(3")-Ib (100; 804/804)	mdf(A) (97.97; 1233/1233) mph(A) (100; 906/906)	<i>qepA1</i> (99.61; 1542/1536)	blaCTX-M-27 (100; 876/876)	floR (98.19; 1214/1215)	<i>dfrA17</i> (100; 474/474)		
RSCM_EC_1013	aac(3)-IIa (99.77; 861/861) aph(3")-Ib (100; 804/804) aph(6)-Id (100; 837/837) aadA5 (100; 789/789)	mdf(A) (97.97; 1233/1233) mph(A) (100; 906/906) erm(B) (99.73; 738/738)		blaCTX-M-15 (100; 876/876)	floR (98.19; 1214/1215)	<i>dfrA17</i> (100; 474/474)		
RSCM_EC_0305	aph(6)-Id (100; 831/831) Aph(3")-Ib (100; 804/804) aadA5 (100; 789/789)	mdf(A) (98.13; 1233/1233) mph(A) (100; 906/906)		blaCTX-M-27 (100; 876/876)		<i>dfrA17</i> (100; 474/474)		
RSCM_EC_1628		<i>mdf(A)</i> (98.13; 1233/1233)		<i>blaCTX-M-27</i> (100; 876/876)				
RSCM_EC_1418	aadA1 (100; 789/789) aph(3'')-Ib (100; 803/804) aph(6)-Id (100; 837/837)	mdf(A) (98.13; 1233/1233)		<i>blaTEM-1B</i> (100; 861/861)	<i>catA1</i> (99.55; 660/660)	dfrA1 (100; 474/474)		
RSCM_EC_2341		mdf(A) (97.57; 1233/1233)	qnrB4 (100; 645/645)	blaTEM-1B (100; 861/861) blaDHA-1 (100; 1140/1140)		<i>dfrA17</i> (100; 474/474)		
RSCM_EC_1732	aadA17 (98.86; 792/792) aph(3")-Ib (100; 804/804) aac(3)-IId (99.88; 861/861) aph(6)-Id (100; 837/837)	<i>mdf(A)</i> (97.57; 1233/1233) <i>mph(A)</i> (100; 906/906) <i>Inu(F)</i> (100; 822/822)	qnrS1 (100; 657/657)	blaCTX-M-55 (100; 876/876) blaTEM-1B (100; 861/861)		<i>dfrA14</i> (100; 474/474)		
RSCM_EC_1935	aph(6)-Id (100; 837/837) aph(3")-Ib (100; 529/804)	<i>mdf(A)</i> (97.57; 1233/1233)		<i>blaTEM-1B</i> (100; 861/861)		<i>dfrA14</i> (100; 474/474)		

Table 3. (Continued)

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0244358.t003

shown in Fig 1, eleven strains of the sequenced EAEC strains owned to the phylogroup D, and one strain of phylogroup F. Among phylogroup D, there were four subgroups, which showed in lineages 1–4. Strain ST349 was the only strain in lineage 1; lineage 2 strains included O102: H6 (ST405); lineage 3 strains included ST38; lineage 4 strains included ST69. Among phylogroup B2, there was also 4 lineage. In lineage 1, H31 isolate was included; O154:H5 (ST1057) isolate which is the only strain available, included in lineage 2; lineage 3 strains included four of O25:H4 (ST131); one of the O25:H4 (ST131) isolate was included in lineage 4 because it had different virulence genes than the other four (Fig 1).

Sample_name	Amino acid changes				
	gyrA	parC	parE		
RSCM_EC_0406	\$83L, D87N	S80I, E84V	I529L		
RSCM_EC_0911	\$83L, D87N	S80I, E84V	I529L		
RSCM_EC_1833	S83L	-	I529L		
RSCM_EC_2137	\$83L, D87N	S80I, E84V	I529L		
RSCM_EC_2442	\$83L, D87N	S80I, E84V	I529L		
RSCM_EC_0507	\$83L, D87N	S80I	S458A		
RSCM_EC_1013	\$83L, D87N	S80I	S458A		
RSCM_EC_1526	\$83L, D87N	S80I	S458A		
RSCM_EC_2036	\$83L, D87N	S80I	S458A		

Table 4. Amino acid substitutions related to ciprofloxacin predicted-resistance using ResFinder 2.1.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0244358.t004

Discussion

This research showed a huge variation of *E. coli* strains prevalent in Cipto Mangunkusumo hospital as assessed by Multi-Locus Sequence Typing (MLST) and Serotyping. Meanwhile, strains O25:H4-ST131 was found to predominate among other 11 ST: ST38, ST405, ST69, ST1057, ST127, ST167, ST3033, ST349, ST40, ST58, ST6630. Each of ST38, ST405, and ST69 was found in three isolates. But for each ST38 and ST69 have different serotypes within it.





https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0244358.g001

These results are identical to the results from other regions that described the distribution and prevalence of these endemic clones in health facilities [30-32]. The variation of clones discovered in the hospital might propose sporadic introductions of various strains to the hospital from the community. To investigate whether identical STs are clonal associated, SNP differences among isolates and phylogenetic assessment proposed the presence of multiple clones of *E. coli* in these settings.

Generally, the levels of antimicrobial resistance in *E. coli* isolates were inspected to be elevated. Based on assessment of resistance genes, 22 of the E. coli isolates carried genes encoding Macrolide, with mdf(A) being prevalent (100% appeared in 22 isolates) followed by mph(A), ere(B), erm(B), and Inu(F). Gene *mdfA* encodes a putative membrane protein (*mdfA*) of 410 amino acid residues which are the main facilitators of the transport protein superfamily. Cells that express *mdfA* from multicopy plasmids are considerably more resistant to various groups of zwitterionic lipophilic or cationic compounds such as benzalkonium, rhodamine, tetracycline, daunomycin, ethidium bromide, puromycin, rifampin, and tetraphenylphosphonium. Although, *mdfA* also provides resistance to chemically unrelated, clinically essential antibiotics such as fluoroquinolones, erythromycin, chloramphenicol, and aminoglycosides [33]. Gene mph(A) conferring resistance to macrolides including azithromycin and erythromycin also was discovered in a high quantity. The appearance of the mph(A) in E. coli isolates of the current research was 40.9%, and thus, higher than the 13% that was identified in E. coli from 5 countries from 4 continents by Nguyen et al [34]. and lower than the 50% that was found in E. coli from tertiary care hospital in Moshi, Tanzania by Sonda et al [7]. High risks to azithromycin and erythromycin can be one of the feasible reasons that allow the emergence of resistance to macrolides [35].

In this study, *blaTEM-1B* being predominant among other genes encoding beta-lactamase and followed by blaCTX-M-15 and *blaCTX-M-27*. In a tertiary hospital in Dar es Salaam, Manyahi et al [36] found blaCTX-M-15 as the most predominant gene (90.6%) and Sonda et al. [7] who found *blaOXA-1* as the most predominant gene in a tertiary hospital in Moshi, Tanzania. In the previous research, O25:H4-ST131 was mentioned to be a main reason of MDR *E. coli* infections [7, 37, 38]. The presence of *aac*(6')*Ib-cr* encodes low ciprofloxacin resistance by itself (as well as aminoglycoside resistance), and generally requires further mutations (e.g. in the *gyrA* or *parC* chromosomes) to provide high levels of resistance. Other research in the Korea [32], US [39], and Brazil [40] have confirmed identical results with this research of the co-carriage of *aac*(6')*Ib-cr*, ESBL genes and the presence of ciprofloxacin resistance in *E. coli* ST131. This plausibly clarify the discovered relationship between transport of *aac*(6')*Ib-cr* and CTX-M ESBL and ciprofloxacin resistance [41].

This current research also characterized virulence genes in all *E. coli* isolates. Based on our results, we found the specific virulence genes in ExPEC and EAEC groups. Adherence protein *(iha)* was found dominating in ExPEC adherence virulence genes. We also found several toxins which belong to ExPEC group, such *as cnf1, ireA, sat, vat, senB, pic,* and *tsh.* Another prevalent group of virulence gene were liable for *E. coli* immune evasion by increasing serum survival *(iss)*. The *iss* gene recognized for its role in ExPEC for enhanced survival of bacteria in the serum. The *iss* gene is located on plasmid ColV, a huge virulence plasmid typical of avian pathogenic *E. coli* strains, which reveal that a replacement of plasmids and, as the result, replacement of those virulence genes is feasible between human and avian pathogenic *E. coli* strains [25].

EAEC-specific virulence genes present in our 12 isolates included aggregative adherence fimbria (AAF) variant I; AggR, a global regulator of EAEC virulence; AggR-activated regulator, *aar*; dispersin, required for proper dispersal of AAFs on the bacterial surface; and the *aat* transporter system, which mediates dispersin secretion [42]. The *aggR* gene was found in ST38

(H30) sample and both *aggR* and *aar*, was found in ST69 (O15:H18) sample. Strains harbouring the *aggR* regulon or its constituents have been termed typical EAEC. We also found two samples that harbouring EAEC toxin, i.e. *astA*, which both of them belong to ST38 (O86:H18). These virulence genes have been defined as suggestive of virulent serotypes and may be used as reliable markers for the detection of pathogenic *E. coli* [43].

Based on our results, the existence of a substantial number of genes characteristically correlated with another *E. coli* pathotypes, such extraintestinal pathogenic *E. coli* (ExPEC). ExPEC genes found among the EAEC strains included i) increased serum survival-encoding gene, iss (63.6%); ii) Secreted autotransporter toxin, *sat* (18.2%); iii) Plasmid encoded enterotoxin, *senB* (9.1%); iv) Temperature-sensitive hemagglutinin, *tsh* (9.1%), and Salmochelin receptor, *iroN* (18.2%). The similar result was also found in another study by Boisen *et. al.* 2020 [23], that showed ten ExPEC genes presented in EAEC strains. These finding showed that related to virulence genes, EAEC strains are highly heterogeneous.

Potential clinical implications for the results received are that caution must be taken when explaining and utilizing microbiology outcomes. A study from Havt *et al* [44], showed that malnutrition status of children aged 6–24 months was related to virulence genes of *aatA* and *aar*. This research underscore that *E. coli* should not be considered as non-pathogenic until the determinants of pathogenic and antimicrobial resistance have been verified to be missing. In addition, the WGS-based result suggested that there are nosocomial transmissions in the hospital, thus encouraging the formulation of pragmatic antimicrobial management, control initiatives and infection prevention.

We understand and acknowledge the limitations of this study. The assessment was carried out on a limited number of *E. coli* isolates, which may limit generalization of the results. With a limited number of the isolates analyzed, it is essential to figure out that another limitation that this work may suffer is the insufficiency of deeper statistical analysis to associate the isolates resistance and virulence results with patient characteristics such as room, age, ward, and gender. Also, the presence of genes that encode various resistance and virulence genes only shows the genes that are in the isolates.

Conclusions

The *E. coli* isolated from 22 patients in Cipto Mangunkusumo National Hospital Jakarta showed high diversity in serotypes, sequence types, virulence genes, and AMR genes. Based on this finding, routinely screening all bacterial isolates in health care facilities can improve clinical significance. By using Whole Genome Sequencing for laboratory-based surveillance can be a valuable early warning system for emerging pathogens and resistance mechanisms.

Supporting information

S1 Table. *E. coli* reference genomes included in the phylogenomic analysis. (XLSX)

Author Contributions

Conceptualization: Rafika Indah Paramita, Fadilah Fadilah, Linda Erlina.

Formal analysis: Rafika Indah Paramita.

Methodology: Rafika Indah Paramita, Editha Renesteen, Linda Erlina.

Resources: Nelly Puspandari.

Supervision: Erni Juwita Nelwan, Fadilah Fadilah.

Writing - original draft: Rafika Indah Paramita, Linda Erlina.

Writing - review & editing: Rafika Indah Paramita, Linda Erlina.

References

- Pitout JD, Laupland KB. Extended-spectrum β-lactamase-producing Enterobacteriaceae: an emerging public-health concern. The Lancet Infectious Diseases. 2008. https://doi.org/10.1016/S1473-3099(08) 70041-0 PMID: 18291338
- Frieri M, Kumar K, Boutin A. Antibiotic resistance. Journal of Infection and Public Health. 2017. https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.jiph.2016.08.007 PMID: 27616769
- Kaye KS, Pogue JM. Infections Caused by Resistant Gram-Negative Bacteria: Epidemiology and Management. Pharmacotherapy. 2015; https://doi.org/10.1002/phar.1636 PMID: 26497481
- Poirel L, Bonnin RA, Nordmann P. Genetic support and diversity of acquired extended-spectrum β-lactamases in Gram-negative rods. Infection, Genetics and Evolution. 2012. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. meegid.2012.02.008 PMID: 22414916
- Storberg V. ESBL-producing Enterobacteriaceae in Africa—a non-systematic literature review of research published 2008–2012. Infection Ecology and Epidemiology. 2014. <u>https://doi.org/10.3402/iee.</u> v4.20342 PMID: 24765249
- 6. Daga AP, Koga VL, Soncini JGM, De Matos CM, Perugini MRE, Pelisson M, et al. Escherichia coli Bloodstream Infections in Patients at a University Hospital: Virulence factors and clinical characteristics. Front Cell Infect Microbiol. 2019; 9(JUN).
- 7. Sonda T, Kumburu H, van Zwetselaar M, Alifrangis M, Mmbaga BT, Aarestrup FM, et al. Whole genome sequencing reveals high clonal diversity of Escherichia coli isolated from patients in a tertiary care hospital in Moshi, Tanzania. Antimicrob Resist Infect Control. 2018; 7(72):1–12.
- Mandomando I, Vubil D, Boisen N, Quintó L, Ruiz J, Sigaúque B, et al. Escherichia coli st131 clones harbouring AGGR and AAF/V fimbriae causing bacteremia in Mozambican children: Emergence of new variant of FIMH27 subclone. PLoS Negl Trop Dis. 2020; 14(5):1–21. <u>https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pntd.0008274 PMID</u>: 32357189
- Herzog K, Engeler Dusel J, Hugentobler M, Beutin L, Sägesser G, Stephan R, et al. Diarrheagenic enteroaggregative Escherichia coli causing urinary tract infection and bacteremia leading to sepsis. Infection. 2014 Apr 10; 42(2):441–4. https://doi.org/10.1007/s15010-013-0569-x PMID: 24323785
- Olesen B, Scheutz F, Andersen RL, Menard M, Boisen N, Johnston B, et al. Enteroaggregative Escherichia coli O78:H10, the cause of an outbreak of urinary tract infection. J Clin Microbiol. 2012; <u>https://doi.org/10.1128/JCM.01909-12 PMID: 22972830</u>
- Roer L, Hansen F, Thomsen MCF, Knudsen JD, Hansen DS, Wang M, et al. WGS-based surveillance of third-generation cephalosporin-resistant Escherichia coli from bloodstream infections in Denmark. J Antimicrob Chemother. 2017 Jul; 72(7):1922–9. https://doi.org/10.1093/jac/dkx092 PMID: 28369408
- Trecarichi EM, Pagano L, Martino B, Candoni A, Di Blasi R, Nadali G, et al. Bloodstream infections caused by Klebsiella pneumoniae in onco-hematological patients: clinical impact of carbapenem resistance in a multicentre prospective survey. Am J Hematol. 2016 Nov; 91(11):1076–81. https://doi.org/10. 1002/ajh.24489 PMID: 27428072
- Xiong Y, Wang P, Lan R, Ye C, Wang H, Ren J, et al. A novel escherichia coli O157:H7 clone causing a major hemolytic uremic syndrome outbreak in China. PLoS One. 2012;
- Frank C, Werber D, Cramer JP, Askar M, Faber M, An Der Heiden M, et al. Epidemic profile of Shigatoxin-producing Escherichia coli O104:H4 outbreak in Germany. N Engl J Med. 2011; <u>https://doi.org/10. 1056/NEJMoa1106483</u> PMID: 21696328
- Nelwan EJ, Puspandari N, Paramita RI, Erlina L, Renesteen E, Fadilah F. Whole genome sequencing data of Escherichia coli isolated from bloodstream infection patients in Cipto Mangunkusumo National Hospital, Jakarta, Indonesia. Data Br. 2020;
- Andrews S. FastQC—A quality control tool for high throughput sequence data. <u>http://www.bioinformatics.babraham.ac.uk/projects/fastqc/</u>. Babraham Bioinformatics. 2010.
- Bolger AM, Lohse M, Usadel B. Trimmomatic: A flexible trimmer for Illumina sequence data. Bioinformatics. 2014; https://doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btu170 PMID: 24695404
- Larsen M V., Cosentino S, Rasmussen S, Friis C, Hasman H, Marvig RL, et al. Multilocus sequence typing of total-genome-sequenced bacteria. J Clin Microbiol. 2012; https://doi.org/10.1128/JCM.06094-11 PMID: 22238442

- Joensen KG, Tetzschner AMM, Iguchi A, Aarestrup FM, Scheutz F. Rapid and easy in silico serotyping of Escherichia coli isolates by use of whole-genome sequencing data. J Clin Microbiol. 2015; <u>https://doi.org/10.1128/JCM.00008-15</u> PMID: 25972421
- Joensen KG, Scheutz F, Lund O, Hasman H, Kaas RS, Nielsen EM, et al. Real-time whole-genome sequencing for routine typing, surveillance, and outbreak detection of verotoxigenic Escherichia coli. J Clin Microbiol. 2014;
- Zankari E, Hasman H, Cosentino S, Vestergaard M, Rasmussen S, Lund O, et al. Identification of acquired antimicrobial resistance genes. J Antimicrob Chemother. 2012; <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/jac/ dks261 PMID: 22782487</u>
- Shakya M, Ahmed SA, Davenport KW, Flynn MC, Lo C-C, Chain PSG. Standardized phylogenetic and molecular evolutionary analysis applied to species across the microbial tree of life. Sci Rep. 2020 Dec 3; 10(1):1723. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-58356-1 PMID: 32015354
- Boisen N, Østerlund MT, Joensen KG, Santiago AE, Mandomando I, Cravioto A, et al. Redefining enteroaggregative Escherichia coli (EAEC): Genomic characterization of epidemiological EAEC strains. PLoS Negl Trop Dis. 2020; 14(9):e0008613. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pntd.0008613 PMID: 32898134
- Donnenberg MS, Tzipori S, McKee ML, O'Brien AD, Alroy J, Kaper JB. The role of the eae gene of enterohemorrhagic Escherichia coli in intimate attachment in vitro and in a porcine model. J Clin Invest. 1993 Sep 1; 92(3):1418–24. https://doi.org/10.1172/JCI116718 PMID: 8376595
- Sarowska J, Futoma-Koloch B, Jama-Kmiecik A, Frej-Madrzak M, Ksiazczyk M, Bugla-Ploskonska G, et al. Virulence factors, prevalence and potential transmission of extraintestinal pathogenic Escherichia coli isolated from different sources: recent reports. Gut Pathog. 2019 Dec 21; 11(1):10. <u>https://doi.org/ 10.1186/s13099-019-0290-0 PMID: 30828388</u>
- Johnson JR, Delavari P, Kuskowski M, Stell AL. Phylogenetic Distribution of Extraintestinal Virulence-Associated Traits in Escherichia coli. J Infect Dis [Internet]. 2001 Jan; 183(1):78–88. Available from: https://academic.oup.com/jid/article-lookup/doi/10.1086/317656 PMID: 11106538
- Huang W-C, Liao Y-J, Hashimoto M, Chen K-F, Chu C, Hsu P-C, et al. cjrABC-senB hinders survival of extraintestinal pathogenic E. coli in the bloodstream through triggering complement-mediated killing. J Biomed Sci. 2020 Dec 6; 27(1):86. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12929-020-00677-4 PMID: 32762693
- Habouria H, Pokharel P, Maris S, Garénaux A, Bessaiah H, Houle S, et al. Three new serine-protease autotransporters of Enterobacteriaceae (SPATEs) from extra-intestinal pathogenic Escherichia coli and combined role of SPATEs for cytotoxicity and colonization of the mouse kidney. Virulence. 2019 Jan 1; 10(1):568–87. https://doi.org/10.1080/21505594.2019.1624102 PMID: 31198092
- Clermont O, Christenson JK, Denamur E, Gordon DM. The Clermont Escherichia coli phylo-typing method revisited: improvement of specificity and detection of new phylo-groups. Environ Microbiol Rep. 2013 Feb; 5(1):58–65. https://doi.org/10.1111/1758-2229.12019 PMID: 23757131
- Aibinu I, Odugbemi T, Koenig W, Ghebremedhin B. Sequence Type ST131 and ST10 Complex (ST617) predominant among CTX-M-15-producing Escherichia coli isolates from Nigeria. Clin Microbiol Infect. 2012; https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-0691.2011.03730.x PMID: 22192452
- 31. Oteo J, Diestra K, Juan C, Bautista V, Novais Â, Pérez-Vázquez M, et al. Extended-spectrum β-lactamase-producing Escherichia coli in Spain belong to a large variety of multilocus sequence typing types, including ST10 complex/A, ST23 complex/A and ST131/B2. Int J Antimicrob Agents. 2009; https://doi. org/10.1016/j.ijantimicag.2009.03.006 PMID: 19464856
- 32. Cha MK, Kang CI, Kim SH, Cho SY, Ha YE, Wi YM, et al. Comparison of the microbiological characteristics and virulence factors of ST131 and non-ST131 clones among extended-spectrum β-lactamaseproducing Escherichia coli causing bacteremia. Diagn Microbiol Infect Dis. 2016; https://doi.org/10. 1016/j.diagmicrobio.2015.10.015 PMID: 26632660
- Edgar R, Bibi E. MdfA, an Escherichia coli multidrug resistance protein with an extraordinarily broad spectrum of drug recognition. J Bacteriol. 1997; https://doi.org/10.1128/jb.179.7.2274-2280.1997 PMID: 9079913
- Nguyen MCP, Woerther PL, Bouvet M, Andremont A, Leclercq R, Canu A. Escherichia coli as reservoir for macrolide resistance genes. Emerg Infect Dis. 2009;
- Noguchi N, Takada K, Katayama J, Emura A, Sasatsu M. Regulation of transcription of the mph(A) gene for macrolide 2'-phosphotransferase I in Escherichia coli: Characterization of the regulatory gene mphR(A). J Bacteriol. 2000;
- Manyahi J, Moyo SJ, Tellevik MG, Ndugulile F, Urassa W, Blomberg B, et al. Detection of CTX-M-15 beta-lactamases in Enterobacteriaceae causing hospital- and community-acquired urinary tract infections as early as 2004, in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. BMC Infect Dis. 2017;

- Johnson JR, Johnston B, Clabots C, Kuskowski MA, Castanheira M. Escherichia coli Sequence Type ST131 as the Major Cause of Serious Multidrug-Resistant E. coli Infections in the United States. Clin Infect Dis. 2010; https://doi.org/10.1086/653932 PMID: 20572763
- Johnson JR, Porter S, Thuras P, Castanheira M. The pandemic H30 subclone of sequence type 131 (ST131) as the leading cause of multidrug-resistant Escherichia coli infections in the United States (2011–2012). Open Forum Infect Dis. 2017;
- 39. Peirano G, Costello M, Pitout JDD. Molecular characteristics of extended-spectrum β-lactamase-producing Escherichia coli from the Chicago area: High prevalence of ST131 producing CTX-M-15 in community hospitals. Int J Antimicrob Agents. 2010; https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijantimicag.2010.02.016 PMID: 20359869
- 40. Seki LM, Pereira PS, de Souza Conceição M, Souza MJ, Marques EA, Carballido JM, et al. Molecular epidemiology of CTX-M producing Enterobacteriaceae isolated from bloodstream infections in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil: Emergence of CTX-M-15. Brazilian J Infect Dis. 2013;
- Valenza G, Nickel S, Pfeifer Y, Pietsch M, Voigtländer E, Lehner-Reindl V, et al. Prevalence and genetic diversity of extended-spectrum β-lactamase (ESBL)-producing Escherichia coli in nursing homes in Bavaria, Germany. Vet Microbiol. 2017; https://doi.org/10.1016/j.vetmic.2015.10.008 PMID: 26494113
- 42. Boll EJ, Struve C, Boisen N, Olesen B, Stahlhut SG, Krogfelt KA. Role of Enteroaggregative Escherichia coli Virulence Factors in Uropathogenesis. Bäumler AJ, editor. Infect Immun. 2013 Apr; 81(4):1164–71. https://doi.org/10.1128/IAI.01376-12 PMID: 23357383
- Torres AG, Blanco M, Valenzuela P, Slater TM, Patel SD, Dahbi G, et al. Genes related to long polar fimbriae of pathogenic Escherichia coli strains as reliable markers to identify virulent isolates. J Clin Microbiol. 2009;
- 44. Havt A, Lima IF, Medeiros PH, Clementino MA, Santos AK, Amaral MS, et al. Prevalence and virulence gene profiling of enteroaggregative Escherichia coli in malnourished and nourished Brazilian children. Diagn Microbiol Infect Dis. 2017; https://doi.org/10.1016/j.diagmicrobio.2017.06.024 PMID: 28780245