

Association between IRGM polymorphisms and tuberculosis risk

A meta-analysis

Haojun Xie, PhD^{a,b}, Chufang Li, PhD^a, Mincong Zhang, MS^a, Nanshan Zhong, MD, PhD^{a,*}, Ling Chen, PhD^{a,*}

Abstract

Background: The human immunity-related GTPase M (IRGM) is involved in regulating autophagy against invading pathogens. Recently, inconsistent results have been reported about the association between IRGM polymorphisms and tuberculosis risk in several studies.

Methods: We searched the PubMed, Embase, and Web of Knowledge, and extracted data from eligible articles to estimate the associations between IRGM polymorphisms (rs10065172, rs4958842, rs4859843, rs4859846, and rs72553867) and tuberculosis risk. The pooled odds ratio (OR) with 95% confidence intervals (CIs) were calculated using Review manager 5.3. The studies heterogeneity was assessed by Cochran Q test. Funnel plot, Begg test, and Egger linear regression test were used to evaluate the publication bias.

Results: Nine case-control studies in 8 articles involving 3780 tuberculosis and 4835 control were analyzed. The analysis showed that IRGM rs10065172 and rs4859846 were significantly associated with tuberculosis risk in all genetic models whereas the latent tuberculosis infection group in 1 study was excluded. However, stratified analysis revealed significant associations for IRGM rs10065172 in all genetic models among Asians, but not for African/African-Americans. Significant associations were observed in recessive and dominant model for rs4958842, allele and recessive model for rs4859843, and all genetic models for rs4859846. No significant associations between rs72553867 polymorphism and tuberculosis risk was identified. Publication bias was detected in allele and additive model of rs4859843.

Conclusions: IRGM rs10065172 was associated with decreased risk of tuberculosis in Asian populations, but not in African/ Africa-Americans. rs4958842, rs4859843, and rs4859846, had a large protective effect in Asians, whereas rs72553867 was not associated with tuberculosis risk.

Abbreviations: CI = confidence intervals, HWE = Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium, IRGM = immunity-related GTPase M, kb = kilobases, LTBI = latent tuberculosis infection, Mtb = *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*, OR = odds ratio, PRISMA = Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses, TB = tuberculosis.

Keywords: immunity-related GTPase M, meta-analysis, polymorphism, tuberculosis

1. Introduction

Tuberculosis, caused by *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* (Mtb), remains a major cause of death around the world especially in developing countries. In 2015, there was an estimated 10.4 million new TB cases worldwide. Of all TB cases worldwide, 60% occurred in just 6 countries, including India, China, Indonesia,

Pakistan, Nigeria, and South Africa.^[1] Actually, the risk of developing active disease is estimated to be approximately 10% in those individuals infected by Mtb,^[2] indicating that host factors play an important role in disease susceptibility and development.

Mtb is an intracellular pathogen which can prevent phagosome-lysosome fusion,^[3] and regulate the autophagy pathway

Copyright © 2017 the Author(s). Published by Wolters Kluwer Health, Inc.

Received: 13 July 2017 / Received in final form: 6 September 2017 / Accepted: 8 September 2017 http://dx.doi.org/10.1097/MD.00000000008189

Editor: Mehmet Bakir.

HX and CL equally contributed to the manuscript, and should be considered as the co-first author. HX and CL contributed to the conceptualization of the study. NZ and LC supervised the study. HX, MZ, and CL performed the experiments. HX, MZ, and CL analyzed the data. HX and CL drafted the manuscript.

The authors have no conflicts of interest to disclose.

Supplemental Digital Content is available for this article.

^a State Key Laboratory of Respiratory Diseases, Guangzhou Institute of Respiratory Disease, The First Affiliated Hospital of Guangzhou Medical University, ^b Academy of Orthopedics of Guangdong Province, Department of Respiratory Disease, The Third Affiliated Hospital of Southern Medical University, Guangzhou, China.

^{*} Correspondence: Nanshan Zhong, State Key Laboratory of Respiratory Diseases, Guangzhou Institute of Respiratory Disease, The First Affiliated Hospital of Guangzhou Medical University, Guangzhou, China (e-mail: nanshan@vip.163.com); Ling Chen, State Key Laboratory of Respiratory Diseases, Guangzhou Institute of Respiratory Disease, The First Affiliated Hospital of Guangzhou Medical University, Guangzhou, China (e-mail: chenling@gibh.ac.cn).

This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Non Commercial-No Derivatives License 4.0 (CCBY-NC-ND), where it is permissible to download and share the work provided it is properly cited. The work cannot be changed in any way or used commercially without permission from the journal.

Medicine (2017) 96:43(e8189)

for its own survival, thus reside and replicate within host-derived phagosome in infected macrophages.^[4] Susceptibility to TB is partly genetically determined, and variations in genes involved in the autonomous immunity pathway may affect the host response to Mtb infection. For example, autophagy physically removes damaged components through lysosome to promote protein turnover, and serves as an autonomous immunity to eliminate invading pathogens.^[6] Human immunity-related GTPase M (IRGM), an autophagy-related protein, has been shown to be in association with inflammatory and infection disease. IRGMs coordinate multiple classes of effectors, including SNARE and BLOC adaptors, autophagy, and lipid droplet proteins, to promote cell-autonomous immunity to intracellular pathogens occupying different vacuolar habitats. IRGM can efficiently induce autophagy to control Mtb infection.^[7]

IRGM (syn: LRG47, IFI1) is encoded by the immunity-related GTPase protein family, M gene (IRGM; 5q33.1). IRGM consists of a long first exon encoding 181 amino acids, and 4 shorter putative exons that span more than 50 kilobases (kb) downstream of the first exon. A 20.1 kb upstream deletion polymorphism of IRGM has been found as an increased risk of developing Crohn disease in Caucasians. Intemann CD and colleagues first reported that IRGM polymorphism was related to tuberculosis susceptibility and indicated that rs9637876 (261TT) was significantly associated with protection from TB caused by Mtb, but not by Mycobacterium africanum/Mycobacterium bovis.^[8] Recently, IRGM polymorphisms, such as rs10065172, rs4958842, rs4859843, rs4859846, and rs72553867 were reported in several subsequent studies in different human population. However, there were inconsistent results of association between IRGM polymorphism and tuberculosis susceptibility.^[9-15]

To comprehensively evaluate association between IRGM polymorphisms and tuberculosis susceptibility, we searched and retrieved all eligible studies and performed this meta-analysis.

2. Materials and methods

This meta-analysis was performed in accordance with the PRISMA (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses) guidance (Supplementary Table S1, http://links.lww.com/MD/B897). No published review protocol existed for the present study.

2.1. Publication search

In accordance with the PRISMA, we searched the database of PubMed, Embase, and Web of Knowledge for articles published until October 14, 2016 (HX and MZ). The following keywords were used in our study as search strategy: IRGM or LRG47 or "immunity-related GTPase M," and "polymorphism*" or "variant*" or "genetic" or "mutant*," and combined with "tuberculosis." No publication language restrictions were imposed. In addition, the references of selected articles were also checked to identify additional potential studies. The detailed search strategy of this study is presented in Supplementary Table S2, http://links.lww.com/MD/B897.

2.2. Inclusion and exclusion criteria

The inclusion criteria of our study were as follows: studies evaluating associations between IRGM polymorphisms and

tuberculosis susceptibility, case-control study, genotype distributions should be available for estimating an odds ratio (OR) with 95% confidence interval (CI). In addition, studies were excluded if fulfilled the following criteria: not related to IRGM polymorphisms or tuberculosis, the design based on family or sibling pairs, and publications were abstracts, reviews, letters to the editor, or animal studies.

2.3. Data extraction

Two investigators independently examined full manuscripts of all included studies, and extracted relevant data into collection form. We evaluated accuracy of data by comparing collection forms from each investigator. Any disagreement was verified by a third author. The following information was collected from each eligible study: first author's name, year of publication, original country, ethnicity, sample size, genotyping method, age, and genotype frequencies in cases and controls.

2.4. Publication bias

Publication bias was assessed by funnel plot. Both Begg test and Egger linear regression test were used to assess publication bias and P < .05 was considered statistically significant.

2.5. Statistical analysis

We tested the Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium (HWE) in control group using the chi-square test. The associations of the IRGM polymorphisms with the risk of tuberculosis were assessed by the pooled ORs with the corresponding 95% CIs under the following genetic models: allele model, additive model, dominant model, and recessive model. The pooled OR was calculated for each study by fixed or random effect model. Subgroup analyses were performed in term of ethnicity. The heterogeneity between the studies was investigated by using Cochrane Q test. I^2 was also used to test the heterogeneity among the included studies. A P value >.10 for the O test indicates a lack of heterogeneity among the studies, then the pooled OR estimate of each study was calculated by the fixedeffects model. Otherwise, the random-effects model was used. Sensitivity analysis was performed by sequentially excluding individual study. Statistical analyses were performed using the RevMan 5.3 software, STATA 12.0 software.

3. Results

3.1. Selection and characteristics of studies

A total of 71 articles were identified in the initial search: 16 from Embase, 22 from PubMed, and 33 from Web of Knowledge. Thirty-three articles were discarded because of duplicate records. After title/abstract and full-text screening, 8 articles including 9 case-control studies were included in this meta-analysis. These eligible studies contained 3780 cases and 4835 controls in total. For the rs10065172 polymorphism, 2084 cases and 3302 controls are available in 5 studies.^[8,10,13,14] Three studies reported 603 cases and 694 controls for rs4958842, 613 cases and 694 controls for rs4959846, respectively.^[9,12,14] There are also 1036 cases and 1051 controls for rs72553867 in 2 studies.^[11,13] The distributions of the IRGM gene polymorphism in control group were consistent with HWE in all studies except 1. The whole study selection process and the detailed information of included studies are displayed in PRISMA flow diagram and Table 1, respectively.

		_
	L - 3	_

alysis.
n

First author	Year	Country	Ethnicity	Genotype	distribution (cas	e/control)	HIV infection status	HWE, P value/control group
SNP rs10065172				Π	TC	CC		
Intemann CD	2009	Ghana	African	280/675	506/1144	218/491	Negative	.87
King KY	2011	USA	Africa American	61/28	202/65	107/87	Negative	.01
King KY	2011	USA	Caucasian	1/1	36/17	140/92	Negative	.83
Lu Y	2016	China	Asian	51/99	114/236	103/140	Negative	.98
Song JH	2014	Korea	Asian	22/39	96/118	75/70	Negative	.37
SNP rs4958842				AA	AG	GG		
Bahari G	2012	Iran	Asian	20/14	130/136	0/0	Negative	<.01
Che N	2010	China	Asian	30/54	93/124	93/97	Negative	.21
Yuan L	2016	China	Asian	32/45	95/112	110/112	Negative	.07
SNP rs4859843				TT	TC	CC		
Bahari G	2012	Iran	Asian	77/9	73/141	0/0	Negative	<.01
Che N	2010	China	Asian	68/82	110/134	38/59	Negative	.75
Yuan L	2016	China	Asian	110/105	101/118	36/46	Negative	.19
SNP rs4859846				TT	TC	CC		
Bahari G	2012	Iran	Asian	138/113	12/35	0/2	Negative	.69
Che N	2010	China	Asian	30/38	97/112	89/125	Negative	.12
Yuan L	2016	China	Asian	181/106	42/114	14/49	Negative	.06
SNP rs72553867				AA	AC	CC		
Songane M	2012	Korea	Asian	1/2	81/91	762/753	Negative	.67
Song JH	2014	Korea	Asian	3/5	70/70	119/130	Negative	.21

HWE = Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium.

3.2. IRGM polymorphisms and tuberculosis susceptibility

Overall, no significant association between IRGM rs10065172 polymorphism and tuberculosis risk was observed under all genetic models. However, whereas latent tuberculosis infection (LTBI) group in 1 study^[11,13] was excluded, significant associations were observed in all genetic models, including allele model (OR = 0.86, 95% CI [0.80, 0.94]), additive model (OR = 0.82, 95% CI [0.72, 0.93]), recessive model (OR=0.77, 95% CI [0.65, 0.90]), and dominant model (OR=1.19, 95% CI [1.04, 1.37]) (Fig. 1).

	Tubercu	losis	Contr	lo		Odds Ratio	Odds	Ratio
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H. Fixed. 95% Cl	M-H. Fixe	d. 95% Cl
Internann CD 2009	1066	2142	2494	4620	63.2%	0.84 [0.76, 0.94]	and the second	
King KY-A 2011	324	560	121	360	4.9%	2.71 [2.06, 3.57]		-
King KY-C 2011	38	354	19	220	1.7%	1.27 [0.71, 2.27]	-	
Lu Y 2016	216	726	434	950	21.0%	0.50 10.41, 0.621	-	
Song JH 2014	140	386	196	454	9.1%	0.75 [0.57. 0.99]	-	
Total (95% CI)		4168		6604	100.0%	0.86 [0.80, 0.94]	•	
Total events	1784		3264					
Heterogeneity: Chi ² = 1	95.98, df =	4 (P < 0	00001);	1* = 961	¥-			10 10
Test for overall effect:	Z = 3.54 (F	= 0.000	04)				0.01 0.1	10 10
			-				Decreased nak	Increased risk
Parameters and the second second second	Tubercu	losis	Contr	lo	0000000000	Odds Ratio	Odds	Ratio
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H. Fixed. 95% CI	M-H. Fixe	d. 95% CI
Internann CD 2009	280	565	675	1166	65.9%	0.71 [0.58, 0.87]		
King KY-A 2011	61	78	28	115	1.5%	11.15 [5.62, 22.13]		
King KY-C 2011	1	141	1	93	0.4%	0.66 [0.04, 10.64]		
Lu Y 2016	51	249	99	239	23.8%	0.36 [0.24, 0.54]		
Song JH 2014	22	97	39	109	8.4%	0.53 [0.28, 0.97]		
Total (95% CD		1130		1722	100.0%	0.77 [0.65, 0.90]	•	
Total events	415		842					
Heterogeneite Chil =	73 68 df -	ADEC	000011		M.			
Test for overall effect	7 = 3 21 (= 0.00	1)		-		0.01 0.1 1	10 10
		0.00					Decreased risk	Increased risk
	Tubercu	losis	Contr	lo		Odds Ratio	Odds	Ratio
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H. Fixed, 95% Cl	M-H. Fixe	d. 95% Cl
Internann CD 2009	786	1071	1819	2310	56.2%	0.74 [0.63, 0.88]		
King KY-A 2011	263	280	93	180	1.3%	14.47 [8.18, 25.62]		
King KY-C 2011	37	177	18	110	3.2%	1.35 (0.73, 2.52)	_	-
Lu Y 2016	165	363	335	475	29.0%	0.35 10.26 0.461	-	
Song JH 2014	118	193	157	227	10.3%	0.70 [0.47, 1.05]	-	
Total (95% CD		2084		3302	100.0%	0.82 [0.72, 0.93]	•	
Total events	1369		2422					
Heterogeneiter Chille	135 84	- 4 /0 -	0 00001		194			
Tiotorogonony. Chi -	7 - 2 10 /		0.00001)		20		0.01 0.1 1	10 100
Test for overall effect.	2 - 3.10 (- 0.00	.,				Decreased risk	Increased risk
	Tubercu	losis	Contr	lor		Odds Ratio	Odds	Ratio
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H. Fixed. 95% Cl	M-H. Fixe	d. 95% Cl
Intemann CD 2009	791	1071	1635	2310	71.8%	1.17 [0.99, 1.37]		
King KY-A 2011	219	280	152	180	10.7%	0.66 [0.40, 1.08]		
King KY-C 2011	176	177	109	110	0.2%	1.61 [0.10, 26.08]		
Lu Y 2016	312	363	376	475	12.1%	1.61 [1.11, 2.33]		
Song JH 2014	171	193	188	227	5.2%	1.61 [0.92, 2.83]	1	-
Total (95% CI)		2084		3302	100.0%	1.19 [1.04, 1.37]		•
Total (95% CI) Total events	1669	2084	2460	3302	100.0%	1.19 [1.04, 1.37]		

Figure 1. ORs for associations between IRGM rs10065172 polymorphism and tuberculosis risk. (A) T versus C; (B) TT versus CC; (C) CC versus TC+TT; (D) TT versus TC+CC. The sizes of the squares indicate the relative weight of each study. Bars, 95% CI. CI = confidence interval, IRGM = immunity-related GTPase M, OR = odds ratio.

Table 2

Results of the subgroup analyses for the IRGM rs10065172 polymorphism and tuberculosis risk.

		• •	•											
Ethnicity	Number of studies	Case/ control	T versus C (allele mode	I)	TT/CC (additive model)			CC versus T (recessive m	TT versus TC+CC (dominant model)					
			OR [95% CI] (<i>P</i>)	<i>P</i> -het	f	OR [95% CI] (<i>P</i>)	<i>P</i> -het	f	OR [95% CI] (<i>P</i>)	<i>P</i> -het	f	OR [95% CI] (<i>P</i>)	<i>P</i> -het	f
Asian African/ African- American	2 2	556/702 1351/2490	0.58[0.49,0.68] (<.0001) 0.98[0.89,1.08] (.68)	.02 <.01	80% 97%	0.41[0.29,0.57] (<.0001) 0.94[0.78, 1.13] (.52)	.33 <.01	0% 98%	0.51[0.41, .63] < .0001 0.99[0.86, .15] .93	<.0001 <.0001	89% 98%	1.61[1.19, 2.19] .002 1.10[0.94, 1.28] .22	1 .03	0% 78%

CI = confidence interval, IRGM = immunity-related GTPase M, OR = odds ratio.

Stratified analysis based on race/ethnicity revealed significant associations in all genetic models among Asians, but not for African/African-Americans (Table 2).

Significant associations were also identified in recessive model (OR = 0.35, 95% CI [0.27, 0.45]) and dominant model for rs4958842 (OR = 3.95, 95% CI [2.87, 5.43]), allele model (OR = 0.72, 95% CI [0.61, 0.84]) (Fig. 2), and recessive model (OR = 0.56, 95% CI [0.45, 0.70]) for rs4859843 (Fig. 3) and all genetic models for rs4859846 (Fig. 4), including allelic model (OR = 0.58, 95% CI [0.48, 0.71]), additive model (OR = 0.50, 95% CI [0.33, 0.57]), and dominant model (OR = 1.49, 95% CI [1.10, 2.02]).

However, no significant associations between IRGM rs72553867 polymorphism and tuberculosis risk were identified.

3.3. IRGM haplotype and tuberculosis susceptibility

Haplotype constructed with 3 polymorphisms rs4958842, rs4958843, and rs4958846 were reported in 2 studies.^[9,15] Significant association was found between ACC haplotype and tuberculosis susceptibility, but not GTT haplotype (Table 3).

3.4. Sensitivity analysis

We performed a sensitivity analysis by sequentially excluding individual study. Overall, statistically similar results were obtained after sequentially excluding each study, which support the reliability of our meta-analysis results.

3.5. Publication bias

For rs10065172 polymorphism, the shape of funnel plot revealed asymmetry to some extent in allelic model (Fig. 5). However, no publication bias was found in both Begg test (*P* value, .462) and Egger linear regression test (*P* value, .405). In addition, publication bias was detected in allele model and additive model of rs4859843 by Egger test and Begg test (Supplementary Table S3, http://links.lww.com/MD/B897).

4. Discussion

Tuberculosis has been recognized as a global public health emergency since 1993,^[16] especially in the developing countries, including India, China, Indonesia, Pakistan, Nigeria, and South

	Experim	ental	Contr	lor		Odds Ratio	Odds	Ratio
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H. Fixed, 95% Cl	M-H. Fixe	ed. 95% Cl
Bahari G 2012	130	300	136	300	27.4%	0.92 [0.67, 1.27]	-	•
Che N 2010	279	432	318	550	35.2%	1.33 [1.03, 1.73]		-
Yuan L 2016	315	474	336	538	37.5%	1.19 [0.92, 1.54]		-
Total (95% CI)		1206		1388	100.0%	1.17 [0.99, 1.37]		•
Total events	724		790					
Heterogeneity: Chi ^z = 3	3.05, df = 2	(P = 0.1	22); 12 = 3	4%			0.01 01	10 10
Test for overall effect:	Z = 1.90 (P	= 0.06)					Decreased risk	Increased risk
4	Experim	ental	Contr	lor		Odds Ratio	Odds	Ratio
Study or Subaroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H. Fixed, 95% CI	M-H, Fix	ed. 95% CI
Babari G 2012	20	20	14	14		Not estimable	in the tax	
Che N 2010	30	123	54	151	54.9%	0.58 10.34, 0.981		-
Yuan L 2016	32	127	45	157	45.1%	0.84 [0.49, 1.42]	-	-
Total (95% CI)		270		322	100.0%	0.70 [0.48, 1.01]	•	
Total events	82		113					
Heterogeneity: Chi ² = 0 Test for overall effect:	0.94, df = 1 Z = 1.90 (P	(P = 0.:	33); P = 0	%			0.01 0.1	10 100
3	Experim	Intel	Contr	In		Odda Batio	Decreased hsk	Ratio
Study or Subaroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H. Fixed, 95% CI	M-H EIX	nd 95% CI
Babad G 2012	130	150	136	150	0.8%	0 67 10 32 1 381		-
Che N 2010	123	216	221	275	45.0%	0 32 10 22 0 481		
Yuan L 2016	142	237	224	269	45.2%	0.30 [0.20, 0.45]	-	
Total (95% CI)		603		694	100.0%	0.35 [0.27, 0.45]	•	
Total events	395		581					
Heteropeneity: Chi* = 3	3.75. df = 2	(P = 0.	15): 17 = 4	7%				
Test for overall effect:	Z = 7.79 (P	< 0.000	001)				0.01 0.1 Decreased risk	1 10 100 Increased risk
C	Experim	ental	Contr	lor		Odds Ratio	Odds	Ratio
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H. Fixed. 95% CI	M-H. Fixe	ed. 95% CI
Bahari G 2012	150	150	150	150		Not estimable		
Che N 2010	186	216	178	275	52.3%	3.38 [2.14, 5.34]		-
Yuan L 2016	205	237	157	269	47.7%	4.57 [2.93, 7.13]		-
Total (95% CI)		603		694	100.0%	3.95 [2.87, 5.43]		•
Total events	541		485					
Heterogeneity: Chi [#] = 0 Test for overall effect:	0.86, df = 1 Z = 8.44 (P	(P = 0.1	35); F = 0 001)	1%			0.001 0.1	1 10 1000

Figure 2. ORs for associations between IRGM rs4958842 polymorphism and tuberculosis risk. (A) A versus G; (B) AA versus GG; (C) AA versus AG+GG; and (D) GG versus AG+AA. The sizes of the squares indicate the relative weight of each study. Bars, 95% CI. CI = confidence interval, IRGM = immunity-related GTPase M, OR = odds ratio.

	Tubercu	losis	Cont	lon		Odds Ratio	Odds	Ratio	
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H. Fixed, 95% CI	M-H, Fixe	ed. 95% Cl	
Bahari G 2012	73	300	141	300	29.3%	0.36 [0.26, 0.51]	-		
Che N 2010	186	432	252	550	34.7%	0.89 [0.69, 1.15]		•	
Yuan L 2016	173	494	210	538	35.9%	0.84 [0.65, 1.08]		1	
Total (95% CI)		1226		1388	100.0%	0.72 [0.61, 0.84]	•		
Total events	432		603						
Heterogeneity: Chi ² = Test for overall effect:	19.20, df =	2 (P < 0	0.0001); P	= 90%			0.01 0.1	1 10	100
							Decreased risk	Increased risk	ĸ
	Tubercu	losis	Cont	Ion		Odds Ratio	Odds	Ratio	
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H. Fixed, 95% CI	M-H. Fixe	ed. 95% Cl	
Bahari G 2012	77	77	9	9		Not estimable			
Che N 2010	68	106	82	141	49.8%	1.29 [0.77, 2.16]	-	-	
Yuan L 2016	110	146	105	151	50.2%	1.34 [0.80, 2.23]		-	
Total (95% CI)		329		301	100.0%	1.31 [0.91, 1.89]	(3	•	
Total events	255		196			Here & Carlo Carlo (1993)			
Heterogeneity: Chi ² =	0.01, df = 1	(P = 0.1	92); F = 0	1%					
Test for overall effect:	Z = 1.47 (F	= 0.14)	1				Decreased risk	Increased risk	100 k
3	Tubercu	losis	Cont	lon		Odds Ratio	Odds	Ratio	
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H. Fixed, 95% CI	M-H. Fixe	ed. 95% Cl	
Bahari G 2012	73	150	141	150	37.0%	0.06 [0.03, 0.13]			
Che N 2010	148	216	193	275	27.3%	0.92 [0.63, 1.36]	-	•	
Yuan L 2016	137	247	164	269	35.7%	0.80 [0.56, 1.13]	-	1	
Total (95% CI)		613		694	100.0%	0.56 [0.45, 0.70]	•		
Total events	358		498						
Heterogeneity: Chi# =	44.56. df =	2 (P < 0	00001):	IZ = 969	%		H		
Test for overall effect:	Z = 4 97 (F	> < 0.000	001)				0.01 0.1	1 10	100
0	-						Decreased risk	Increased risk	ĸ
5	Tubercu	losis	Contr	rol		Odds Ratio	Odds	Ratio	
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H. Fixed, 95% CI	M-H, Fixe	ed. 95% CI	
Bahari G 2012	150	150	150	150		Not estimable			
Che N 2010	178	216	216	275	51.8%	1.28 [0.81, 2.01]			
Yuan L 2016	211	247	223	269	48.2%	1.21 [0.75, 1.94]		-	
Total (95% CI)		613		694	100.0%	1.25 [0.90, 1.73]		•	
Total events	539		589			the second second second second		5	
Heterogeneity: Chi# =	0.03, df = 1	(P = 0.4	87); I* = 0	1%			0.01 01	1	100
Test for overall effect:	Z = 1.31 (F	P = 0.19))				Decreased risk	Increased risk	k

Figure 3. ORs for associations between IRGM rs4859843 polymorphism and tuberculosis risk. (A) T versus C; (B) TT versus CC; (C) CC versus TC+TT; and (D) TT versus TC+CC. The sizes of the squares indicate the relative weight of each study. Bars, 95% CI. CI = confidence interval, IRGM = immunity-related GTPase M, OR = odds ratio.

	Experim	ental	Contr	lor		Odds Ratio	Odds	Ratio
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H. Fixed, 95% CI	M-H. Fixe	d. 95% Cl
Bahari G 2012	12	300	39	300	13.1%	0.28 [0.14, 0.54]		
Che N 2010	275	432	362	550	40.4%	0.91 [0.70, 1.18]		
Yuan L 2016	70	348	212	538	46.5%	0.39 [0.28, 0.53]	-	
Total (95% CI)		1080		1388	100.0%	0.58 [0.48, 0.71]	•	
Total events	357		613					
Heterogeneity: Chi ² =	22.14, df =	2 (P < 0	.0001); P	= 91%			0.01 01	10 10
Test for overall effect:	Z = 5.58 (F	> < 0.000	001)				Decreased risk	Increased risk
A	Experim	Inter	Cont	In		Odde Ratio	Odda	Patio
Study or Subarous	Exects	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H Eixed 05% CI	M.H. Ely	d 95% CI
Babad C 2012	Lyunts	120	Cycina	116	2.05	0 10 10 01 3 451	t men. riki	0. 3376 01
Banan G 2012		130	105	100	3.9%	0.16 [0.01, 3.45]	-	-
Che N 2010	09	119	125	163	50.2%	0.90 [0.52, 1.56]		
Tuan L 2016	14	132	49	155	57.876	0.26 [0.13, 0.49]	-	
Total (95% CI)		389		433	100.0%	0.50 [0.34, 0.74]	+	
Total events	103		176					
Heterogeneity: Chi ² = Test for overall effect:	8.98, df = 2 Z = 3.42 (F	P = 0.000	01); I ² = 7 06)	8%			0.01 0.1 Decreased risk	1 10 100 Increased risk
В	Experim	ental	Contr	lo		Odds Ratio	Odds	Ratio
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H. Fixed, 95% CI	M-H. Fixe	d. 95% CI
Bahari G 2012	12	150	37	150	22.7%	0.27 [0.13, 0.53]		
Che N 2010	186	216	237	275	19.3%	0.99 [0.59, 1.67]	-	-
Yuan L 2016	56	174	163	269	58.0%	0.31 [0.21, 0.46]	-	
Total (95% CI)		540		694	100.0%	0.43 [0.33, 0.57]	•	
Total events	254		437					
Heterogeneity: Chi ² =	14.60, df =	2 (P = 0	.0007); P	= 86%				10 100
Test for overall effect:	Z = 5.88 (P	< 0.000	001)				Decreased risk	Increased risk
C	Experim	ental	Contr	loc		Odds Ratio	Odds	Ratio
	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H. Fixed, 95% CI	M-H. Fixe	d. 95% CI
Study or Subaroup			148	150	0.7%	5 07 10 24 106 451		
Study or Subgroup Bahari G 2012	150	150				1 19 10 83 1 701		
Study or Subgroup Bahari G 2012 Che N 2010	150	150	150	275	79.1%			
Study or Subgroup Bahari G 2012 Che N 2010 Yuan L 2016	150 127 160	150 216 174	150 220	275 269	79.1% 20.2%	2.55 [1.36, 4.77]		
Study or Subgroup Bahari G 2012 Che N 2010 Yuan L 2016 Total (95% CI)	150 127 160	150 216 174 540	150 220	275 269 694	79.1% 20.2%	2.55 [1.36, 4.77]		•
Study or Subgroup Bahari G 2012 Che N 2010 Yuan L 2016 Total (95% CI) Total events	150 127 160	150 216 174 540	150 220	275 269 694	79.1% 20.2% 100.0%	2.55 [1.36, 4.77] 1.49 [1.10, 2.02]		•
Study or Subgroup Bahari G 2012 Che N 2010 Yuan L 2016 Total (95% Cl) Total events Heterogeneity: Chi ² =	150 127 160 437 4.92, df = 2	150 216 174 540	150 220 518 09); P = 5	275 269 694	79.1% 20.2% 100.0%	2.55 [1.36, 4.77] 1.49 [1.10, 2.02]		•

Figure 4. ORs for associations between IRGM rs4859846 polymorphism and tuberculosis risk. (A) T versus C; (B) TT versus CC; (C) CC versus TC+TT; and (D) TT versus TC+CC. The sizes of the squares indicate the relative weight of each study. Bars, 95% CI. CI = confidence interval, IRGM = immunity-related GTPase M, OR = odds ratio.

Та	h		3	
	1.2	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	

Results of the pooled analyses for other IRGM haplotype and tuberculosis risk.

Variable	Number of studies	Case/control	OR [95% CI] (<i>P</i>)	<i>P</i> -het	f
ACC	2	193/415	0.44 [0.36, 0.54] <.0001	<.0001	98%
GTT	2	435/486	1.12 [0.94, 1.34] .22	.96	0%

Haplotype constructed with 3 polymorphisms rs4958842, rs4958843, and rs4958846. Cl = confidence interval, IRGM = immunity-related GTPase M, OR = odds ratio.



Figure 5. Funnel plot of publication bias for IRGM rs10065172 polymorphism under allele model. Funnel plot with pseudo 95% confidence limits was used. IRGM = immunity-related GTPase M.

Africa. Despite the enormous progress achieved in recent studies, the reason why only a part of the subjects infected with Mtb develops into clinical disease is unknown. Epidemiologic and linkage studies suggest that genetic factors are implicated in the pathogenesis of TB. Cell autonomous immunity is the important mechanism for host against Mtb. Recent progress in the genetic variations involved in the cell-autonomous immunity pathway has advanced understanding the host response to Mtb infection and disease pathogenesis. IRGM, as cell-autonomous immunity-related gene, plays efficient role in controlling Mtb infection. Since the first reports investigating IRGM polymorphisms and tuberculosis susceptibility published in 2009,^[8] further studies were conducted in different ethnic groups recently and somehow obtained inconsistent results.

Our meta-analysis enrolled 9 case-control studies containing 3780 cases and 4835 controls to evaluate the association between IRGM polymorphisms and tuberculosis susceptibility. For rs10065172 polymorphism, no significant association was observed under all genetic models whereas LTBI group in 1 study was included. However, after excluding LTBI group, significant associations were found in all genetic models. This suggests that IRGM rs10065172 polymorphism might be associated with disease status of tuberculosis. Stratified analysis based on race/ethnicity show significant associations in all genetic models among Asians. In addition, meta-analysis significant associations between rs4958842, revealed rs4859843, and rs4859846 polymorphism with tuberculosis. Haplotype ACC constructed with rs4958842, rs4958843, and rs4958846 is associated with decreased risk of tuberculosis. However, rs72553867 polymorphism was not found to be associated with tuberculosis susceptibility. Publication bias was detected in allele model and additive model of rs4859843 by Egger test. However, sensitivity analysis indicates the reliability

of our meta-analysis, as no single study significantly altered the overall results.

At an individual cell level, host possess the ability to control infection and restrict pathogen replication in a cell-intrinsic manner, which is often referred to as cell-autonomous immunity.^[17,18] Recent work demonstrates that induction of autophagy is an effective mechanism to enhance intracellular killing of Mtb in macrophages, and inhibition of this process by pathogen is important for its survival.^[19] Some potential disease-associated genetic variants, especially autophagy-related genes, that may predispose to tuberculosis have recently been identified.^[19,20] IRGM, one of the IFN-inducible GTPase superfamily, is shown to be involved in the regulation of autophagy^[7] and plays an inhibitory effect on the replication of Mtb.^[21] Previously, some studies have indicated that IRGM polymorphisms is associated with Crohn disease susceptibility,^[22–27] though other studies report no such association.^[28,29] To date, studies performed in different human population regarding IRGM polymorphism and tuberculosis susceptibility have yielded inconsistent results. Our meta-analysis results demonstrate significant associations between IRGM polymorphisms and tuberculosis risk for rs10065172, rs4958842, rs4859843, and rs4859846 after excluding LTBI patients.

The strengths of current meta-analysis could be listed as follows. First, to our knowledge, this is the first study aimed to clarify the inexplicit association between IRGM polymorphisms and tuberculosis susceptibility in a meta-analysis manner. Second, HIV tests were performed in all included case-control study. Only those HIV negative tuberculosis patients without immunosuppressive condition were recruited, which excluded the possibility that patient status are confounding factors of tuberculosis susceptibility.

There are some limitations in the present meta-analysis. First, only a small number of studies were found and included in our meta-analysis. Second, studies included in our meta-analysis were mainly conducted in Asian populations. This result should be interpreted with care, since the association found in the Asian population was supported by 5 studies from only 4 publications, which is far from sufficient. Third, gene-gene, gene and environmental factors interaction may have influenced tuberculosis susceptibility. Fourth, deviation from HWE may affect meta-analysis conclusions. However, the results were not significantly altered while excluding study inconsistent with HWE. Fifth, it is worth noting that not all patients are pulmonary tuberculosis, with a small proportion of patients diagnosed with tuberculous pleurisy^[9] and extrapulmonary TB.^[10] Therefore, the inclusion and exclusion criteria must be specific and comprehensive and should be strictly carried out in the future research.

In summary, the current meta-analysis suggests that IRGM rs10065172, rs4958842, rs4859843, and rs4859846 were associated with a decreased risk of tuberculosis in Asian

populations, whereas rs72553867 was not associated with tuberculosis risk. However, the associations found in Asian populations are needed to be confirmed in more studies. In addition, further researches are warranted to investigate the relations between latent TB infection and IRGM polymorphisms.

References

- WHO Global tuberculosis report 2016. Available at: http://www.who. int/tb/publications/global_report/en/.
- [2] Zumla A, Raviglione M, Hafner R, et al. Tuberculosis. N Engl J Med 2013;368:745–55.
- [3] Goren MB, D'Arcy HP, Young MR, et al. Prevention of phagosomelysosome fusion in cultured macrophages by sulfatides of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 1976;73:2510–4.
- [4] Shin DM, Jeon BY, Lee HM, et al. Mycobacterium tuberculosis eis regulates autophagy, inflammation, and cell death through redoxdependent signaling. PLoS Pathog 2010;6:e1001230.
- [5] Deretic V. Autophagy in innate and adaptive immunity. Trends Immunol 2005;26:523–8.
- [6] Deretic V, Saitoh T, Akira S. Autophagy in infection, inflammation and immunity. Nat Rev Immunol 2013;13:722–37.
- [7] Singh SB, Davis AS, Taylor GA, et al. Human IRGM induces autophagy to eliminate intracellular mycobacteria. Science 2006;313:1438–41.
- [8] Intemann CD, Thye T, Niemann S, et al. Autophagy gene variant IRGM -261T contributes to protection from tuberculosis caused by *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* but not by M. africanum strains. PLoS Pathog 2009;5:e1000577.
- [9] Che N, Li S, Gao T, et al. Identification of a novel IRGM promoter single nucleotide polymorphism associated with tuberculosis. Clin Chim Acta 2010;411:1645–9.
- [10] King KY, Lew JD, Ha NP, et al. Polymorphic allele of human IRGM1 is associated with susceptibility to tuberculosis in African Americans. PLoS One 2011;6:e16317.
- [11] Songane M, Kleinnijenhuis J, Alisjahbana B, et al. Polymorphisms in autophagy genes and susceptibility to tuberculosis. PLoS One 2012;7: e41618.
- [12] Bahari G, Hashemi M, Taheri M, et al. Association of IRGM polymorphisms and susceptibility to pulmonary tuberculosis in Zahedan, Southeast Iran. ScientificWorldJournal 2012;2012:950801.
- [13] Song JH, Kim SY, Chung KS, et al. Association between genetic variants in the IRGM gene and tuberculosis in a Korean population. Infection 2014;42:655–60.

- [14] Lu Y, Li Q, Peng J, et al. Association of autophagy-related IRGM polymorphisms with latent versus active tuberculosis infection in a Chinese population. Tuberculosis (Edinb) 2016;97:47–51.
- [15] Yuan L, Ke Z, Ma J, et al. IRGM gene polymorphisms and haplotypes associate with susceptibility of pulmonary tuberculosis in Chinese Hubei Han population. Tuberculosis (Edinb) 2016;96:58–64.
- [16] Zumla A, George A, Sharma V, et al. WHO's 2013 global report on tuberculosis: successes, threats, and opportunities. Lancet 2013;382: 1765–7.
- [17] Meunier E, Broz P. Interferon-inducible GTPases in cell autonomous and innate immunity. Cell Microbiol 2016;18:168–80.
- [18] Kim BH, Shenoy AR, Kumar P, et al. IFN-inducible GTPases in host cell defense. Cell Host Microbe 2012;12:432–44.
- [19] Songane M, Kleinnijenhuis J, Netea MG, et al. The role of autophagy in host defence against *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* infection. Tuberculosis (Edinb) 2012;92:388–96.
- [20] Stein CM. Genetic epidemiology of tuberculosis susceptibility: impact of study design. PLoS Pathog 2011;7:e1001189.
- [21] MacMicking JD, Taylor GA, McKinney JD. Immune control of tuberculosis by IFN-gamma-inducible LRG-47. Science 2003;302: 654–9.
- [22] Parkes M, Barrett JC, Prescott NJ, et al. Sequence variants in the autophagy gene IRGM and multiple other replicating loci contribute to Crohn's disease susceptibility. Nat Genet 2007;39:830–2.
- [23] McCarroll SA, Huett A, Kuballa P, et al. Deletion polymorphism upstream of IRGM associated with altered IRGM expression and Crohn's disease. Nat Genet 2008;40:1107–12.
- [24] Palomino-Morales RJ, Oliver J, Gómez-García M, et al. Association of ATG16L1 and IRGM genes polymorphisms with inflammatory bowel disease: a meta-analysis approach. Genes Immun 2009;10:356–64.
- [25] Latiano A, Palmieri O, Cucchiara S, et al. Polymorphism of the IRGM gene might predispose to fistulizing behavior in Crohn's disease. Am J Gastroenterol 2009;104:110–6.
- [26] Moon CM, Shin DJ, Kim SW, et al. Associations between genetic variants in the IRGM gene and inflammatory bowel diseases in the Korean population. Inflamm Bowel Dis 2013;19:106–14.
- [27] Glas J, Seiderer J, Bues S, et al. IRGM variants and susceptibility to inflammatory bowel disease in the German population. PLoS One 2013;8:e54338.
- [28] Amre DK, Mack DR, Morgan K, et al. Autophagy gene ATG16L1 but not IRGM is associated with Crohn's disease in Canadian children. Inflamm Bowel Dis 2009;15:501–7.
- [29] Hirano A, Yamazaki K, Umeno J, et al. Association study of 71 European Crohn's disease susceptibility loci in a Japanese population. Inflamm Bowel Dis 2013;19:526–33.