RESEARCH

BMC Nephrology



Association between different proportions of crescents and the progression of IgA nephropathy (IgAN): a systematic review and meta-analysis

Li Yu¹, Hao Zhang¹ and Yunfeng Wu^{1*}

Abstract

Background Immunoglobulin A nephropathy (IgAN) is a complex renal disease with a highly variable clinical course. Identifying reliable prognostic markers is crucial for risk stratification and treatment decisions. This study aimed to understand the influence of different proportions of crescents (Cs) on the progression of IgAN.

Methods Four databases (PubMed, Web of Science, Embase, and Cochrane Library) were searched until September 25, 2023. The study encompassed IgAN patients, focusing on kidney outcomes and end-stage kidney disease (ESKD). Statistical analysis included calculating hazard ratios (HR) for binary outcomes and examining publication bias.

Results The meta-analysis involved thirteen studies comprising 11,849 patients. For kidney outcomes, crescent formation may be linked to an elevated risk (HR=2.01, 95%Cl 1.40–2.87, P < 0.001). Furthermore, significantly increased risks of kidney outcomes were observed with a crescent proportion > 10 (HR=1.8, 95%Cl 1.32–2.45, P < 0.001) and > 25%(HR=2.11, 95% Cl 1.47–3.02, P < 0.001). Regarding ESKD, a proportion > 25% also displayed an elevated risk (HR=1.70, 95% Cl 1.18–2.44, P = 0.004). However, a proportion > 10% (including > 25%) did not show a significant association with ESKD (HR=1.12, 95% Cl 0.36–3.47, P = 0.842) versus less.

Conclusions This systematic review and meta-analysis established a strong association between crescent proportions and the progression of IgAN. Higher proportions, notably exceeding 25%, were reliable prognostic markers, indicating a greater risk of adverse kidney outcomes and ESKD. These findings have significant clinical implications, offering the potential for more precise risk stratification in IgAN patients.

Keywords Immunoglobulin a nephropathy, Systematic review, Crescent, End stage kidney disease

*Correspondence: Yunfeng Wu 715755942@qq.com ¹Traditional Chinese Medicine Department, Boao-Yiling Life Care Center, Qionghai, Hainan, China



© The Author(s) 2024. **Open Access** This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License, which permits any non-commercial use, sharing, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons licence, and indicate if you modified the licensed material. You do not have permission under this licence to share adapted material derived from this article or parts of it. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons licence, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons licence and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this licence, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/.

Background

Immunoglobulin A nephropathy (IgAN) is a diverse condition, and the likelihood of its progression to end-stage kidney disease (ESKD) within a decade varies considerably, ranging from less than 10% to as high as 60% [1]. Hence, accurately identifying individual patients facing an elevated risk of disease progression poses a considerable challenge. Therefore, developing techniques for the precise risk assessment of patients with IgAN is crucial. Since it may enable us to provide patients with prognosis information, balance the benefits of immunosuppression with the expected risks [2, 3], and enhance the design of clinical trials in IgAN by enabling the targeted inclusion of more clinically consistent patient cohorts.

The clinical and pathological diversity inherent to IgAN leads to considerable inter-individual variation in disease prognosis and progression. Hence, Uncovering the risk factors that impact the advancement and prognosis of IgAN is crucial. Crescent formations (Cs) represent a frequently observed pathological feature in IgAN, appearing in about 18.8-66.4% of renal biopsy samples. The development of glomerular crescents initiates with cellular crescents, progressing to a stage of cellular/fibrous crescents, ultimately leading to irreversible fibrous crescents. This process ultimately culminates in glomerulosclerosis, resulting in irreversible renal injury and, in severe cases, ESKD [4, 5]. The presence of crescents is closely intertwined with several clinicopathological characteristics; it demonstrates a positive association with proteinuria and serum creatinine (Scr) [6]. Moreover, it is linked to segmental glomerulosclerosis, global sclerosis, renal tubulointerstitial abnormalities, and endocapillary proliferation. Consequently, while the issue remains debated, the presence of crescents is acknowledged as an essential prognostic indicator for IgAN. A 2016 study by Haas and his team [7] examined 3,096 patients diagnosed with IgAN. It established that crescents' presence independently contributes to a heightened risk, correlating with a poor prognosis among individuals with IgAN. Individuals with Cs present in 25% or more of their glomeruli face a significantly greater risk of renal progression than those with less than 25% of their glomeruli affected by crescents. The revised Oxford classification (2017) acknowledges the independent prognostic significance of Cs. It has included them in its system, classifying them as C0 (no crescents), C1 (crescents in less than 25% of glomeruli), and C2 (crescents in 25% or more of glomeruli) [7]. However, the association between distinct proportions of crescents and the progression of IgAN remains a subject of ongoing debate within the medical community. This systematic review and meta-analysis aim to compile a comprehensive synthesis of the current evidence regarding the association between various crescent proportions and the progression of IgAN. By collating and analyzing data from a wide range of studies, we aim to offer valuable insights into crescents' prognostic significance and to assist in refining risk stratification for IgAN patients.

Methods

Search strategy

The search encompassed electronic databases like PubMed, Cochrane Library, Embase, and Web of Science, extending up to September 25, 2023, and included citations written in English. The search incorporated key terms such as crescent, nephropathy, and Immunoglobulin A. Supplementary Table 1 provides a comprehensive breakdown of the detailed search strategy.

Inclusion and exclusion criteria

Inclusion criteria were: (1) patients diagnosed with IgAN from native kidney biopsy. (2) primary IgAN is classified as crescent proportion>10% and crescent proportion>25%, and crescents here can be acute (cellular), subacute (fibrocellular), or chronic (fibrous) [8]. (3) study endpoints included kidney outcome and ESKD. (4) Prospective or retrospective cohort study in English. We excluded case reports, editorials, reviews, conference abstracts, and comments if indicators were unavailable for inclusion in the study.

Data extraction and quality assessment

Two reviewers carried out the independent extraction of data from each study, and any disparities in the collected data were resolved following consultations with a third reviewer. All studies underwent quality assessment using the Newcastle–Ottawa Scale (NOS) [9, 10]. *High-quality articles* were defined as studies with a score of seven or higher.

Statistical analysis

Stata V.14 software was employed to perform the statistical analyses. The effect sizes for binary outcomes were evaluated through hazard ratios (HR) and calculating their 95% confidence intervals (CI). The heterogeneity assessment involved using Q and I² test statistics, where I² values surpassing 50% denoted considerable heterogeneity. The choice between a fixed or random-effects model was contingent on the obtained results. A significance level for effect size disparities was also set at P < 0.05 [11]. A sensitivity analysis involving meta-influence was implemented [12]. We intended to assess publication bias through Egger's and Begg's tests [13], and Trim and Fill analysis would be applied in the presence of bias. Significant disparities are denoted by a P-value less than 0.05.

Selection of the relevant studies

After implementing the search strategy, 3,821 publications were discovered (PubMed: 878, Embase: 1,969, Cochrane: 33, Web of Science: 941). Once 1,573 duplicate papers were removed, 2,248 documents were screened, and exclusion was applied to 2,234 as they did not meet the eligibility criteria. After the remaining 24 studies underwent a thorough full-text review, thirteen studies [14-26] were chosen for analysis. Figure 1 contains



Fig. 1 PRISMA flowchart of included studies

the PRISMA flow diagram. Thirteen studies contributed data for the analysis, involving 11,849 patients. The systematic review and meta-analysis encompassed 13 studies published from 2013 to 2023. Of the thirteen studies, ten were executed in China, and the remaining three took place in the USA, Korea, and Iran. No overlap in the included cohorts was discovered. Table 1 provides a summary of the characteristics of all 13 included studies. These studies achieved a high-quality rating based on the Newcastle–Ottawa Scale score (Table 2).

Kidney outcome in crescent formation

Thirteen studies with 11,849 patients reported kidney outcomes in crescent formation. The meta-analysis showed that crescent formation was associated with an increased risk of kidney outcome (HR=2.01, 95%CI 1.40-2.87, P<0.001) (Fig. 2A). The results of subgroup analysis based on sample size are entirely consistent with the overall results (Fig. 2B).

Kidney outcome in crescent proportion

Nine studies with 10,745 patients reported kidney outcomes in crescent proportion. The meta-analysis showed that a crescent proportion>10% (HR=1.8, 95%CI 1.32–2.45, P<0.001) and >25% (HR=2.11, 95%CI 1.47–3.02, P<0.001) were associated with an increased risk of kidney outcome (Fig. 3A and B). The results of subgroup analysis based on sample size are shown in Figures S1A and S1B.

ESKD in crescent proportion

Four studies with 5,242 patients reported ESKD in crescent proportion. The meta-analysis showed that a crescent proportion > 25% (HR=1.70, 95%CI 1.18–2.44, P=0.004) was associated with an increased risk of ESKD (Fig. 4A). However, a crescent proportion > 10% (HR=1.12, 95%CI 0.36–3.47, P=0.842) was not associated with an increased risk of ESKD (Fig. 4B). The results of subgroup analysis based on sample size are shown in Figure S2.

Sensitivity analysis

Individual study exclusions in the sensitivity analysis showed no notable impact on the overall effect size (Fig. 5).

Publication bias

The *P*-value of Egger's and Begg's tests showed no publication bias for kidney outcome at crescent proportion > 25% (Egger's test *P*=0.848; Begg's test *P*=1.000) (Fig. 6A), ESKD at crescent proportion > 10% (Begg's test *P*=1.000) (Fig. 6B) and crescent proportion > 25% (Egger's test *P*=0.951; Begg's test *P*=1.000) (Fig. 6C). However, the P-value of Egger's or Begg's test confirmed the

existence of publication bias for kidney outcome at crescent proportion>10% (Egger's test P=0.04; Begg's test P=0.089) (Figure S3A). and kidney outcome at crescent formation (Egger's test P=0.001; Begg's test P=0.2) (Figure S3B). The trim and fill analysis for kidney outcome at crescent proportion>10% indicated an estimated missing study, with the corresponding pooled estimate being 0.541 (95% CI: 0.238, 0.844) (Figure S3C). Four missing studies were estimated for the trim and fill' analysis concerning kidney outcome at crescent formation, yielding a pooled odds ratio estimate of 0.509 (95% CI: 0.202, 0.815) (Figure S3D).

Discussion

IgAN represents a clinical conundrum due to its diverse presentation and unpredictable progression. This systematic review and meta-analysis have taken a significant step toward unravelling one of the enigmas in IgAN - the role of crescents in disease progression. This study, including ten high-quality studies, revealed that IgAN patients with higher proportions of Cs, particularly>25%, faced an increased risk of kidney outcomes and ESKD. The implications are significant, as these findings enable more personalized risk stratification for IgAN patients, which can inform treatment decisions and enhance clinical trial designs.

Despite employing similar entry criteria, including the exclusion of patients whose eGFR falls below 30 ml/min per 1.73 m² during biopsy or those experiencing rapid progression to ESKD, crescents were not established as an independent predictor of adverse renal outcomes in patients with IgAN, according to the initial Oxford study [27] and several subsequent validation investigations [28–31]. On the contrary, several studies with more lenient entry criteria [32-35] did establish a significant link between crescents and a composite endpoint that involved either ESKD or a doubling of SCR≥50% reduction in eGFR. Haas and colleagues [14] conducted a study investigating crescents observed in kidney tissue from individuals diagnosed with IgAN and assessed their impact on the progression of renal function. In a multicenter retrospective cohort comprising 3,096 patients with IgAN, Haas and colleagues discovered that the presence of crescents in one-fourth or more of glomeruli (C2) retained its predictive value for the combined event, irrespective of whether patients underwent immunosuppression. However, in less than one-fourth of glomeruli (C1), crescents lost their predictive significance after patients received immunosuppression. Afterwards, multiple validation studies demonstrated a strong connection between C2 and the adverse prognosis in IgAN, with the ongoing debate about how C1 affects the renal outcome of the disease. In a retrospective analysis of 1,328 patients suffering from IgAN, Peng and colleagues [17]

Author	Country	Age	Male (%)	МАР	Proteinuria	patients	Immu- nosup- pression (%)	Fol- low up (Y, M)	Outcomes assessed	Interstitial fibrosis/ tubular atrophy
Lv, 2013 [23]	China	36.3±15.1	58.5	118.1±19.7	4.44±2.63	113	71.7	23.7 M	ESRD	1–50%: 43 >50%: 66
Haas, 2017 [7]	USA	35±14	58	97±15	1.2(0.7–2.3)	3096	37	4.7Y	≥ 50% decline in eGFR or ESRD (combined event)	/
Zhang, 2017 [24]	China	32±10	43.7	NA	0.8(0.4–1.5)	538	NA	51 M	renal outcome comprising dou- bling of baseline serum creatinine (SCr) and ESRD (maintenance hemodialysis, main- tenance perito- neal dialysis, or renal transplantation).	Interstitial fibro- sis: Mild = 206; Moderate = 113; Severe = 14; Tubular atrophy: Mild = 277; Moderate = 148; Severe = 36
Zhang, 2018 [14]	China	35.4±12	49.1	95.8±13.5	1.42(0.72–2.62)	1152	52.5	45 M	eGFR decline equal to or greater than 50% or to ESRD	Oxford classifca- tion: M1 = 469; E1 = 459; S1 = 839; T1 + T2 = 364
Park, 2019 [15]	Korea	36(24–47)	50.2	93(83–101)	1.06(0.49–2.1)	3380	NA	8.74Y	Merge of progres- sion to ESRD and halving of eGFR from baseline	Interstitial fibro- sis: Mild = 1776; Moderate = 228; Severe = 93; Tubular atrophy: Mild = 1395; Moderate = 439; Severe = 192
Peng, 2019 [16]	China	34.2±11.2	45.6	NA	2.8±3.0	1328	60.5	46.1 M	eGFR decline equal to or greater than 10% or to ESRD	Oxford classifca- tion: M1 = 1043; E1 = 64; S1 = 675; T1 + T2 = 328
Ma, 2020 [25]	China	32.1±11.1	59.8	97.5±15.5	2.1±2.5	338	73.4	49.9 M	a≥50% reduction in eGFR or ESRD.	Oxford classifca- tion: M1 = 115; E1 = 61; S1 = 78; T1 + T2 = 142
Lin, 2021 [17]	China	30(26–39)	44.9	92(83.5–100)	0.8(0.43–1.58)	305	36.1	34.8 M	≥ 15% decline in the eGFR after 1 year or ≥ 30% decline in the eGFR after 2 years	Oxford classifca- tion: M1 = 245; E1 = 34; S1 = 158; T1 = 37
Chen, 2022 [18]	China	35.99±11.99	46.25	99.76±13.31	1.61±2.14	144	NA	16 M	ESRD or eGFR de- creasing by 50%	/
Du, 2022 [19]	China	34.97±12.58	43.5	94.88±12.64	1.59(1.00-3.10)	595	62.5	43 M	ESKD or ≥50% decline in eGFR	Interstitial fibro- sis: Mild = 141; Moderate = 14; Severe = 7;
Os- sareh, 2022 [20]	lran	37±13	76	NA	3.4±2.5	115	NA	43 M	ESKD or death due to kidney disease	Oxford clas- sifcation: M1 = 20; E1 = 19; S1 = 56; T1 = 50; C1 = 40

Table 1 Characteristics of the studies included in this meta-analysis

Table 1 (continued)

Author	Country	Age	Male (%)	МАР	Proteinuria	patients	lmmu- nosup- pression (%)	Fol- low up (Y, M)	Outcomes assessed	Interstitial fibrosis/ tubular atrophy
Ruan, 2022 [21]	China	34±10.2	43.5	94.7±14.1	0.8±0.9	458	18.8	48 M	ESKD or ≥ 50% decline in eGFR	Oxford classifcation: T0 = 193; T1 = 58; T2 = 4;
Di,2023 [<mark>22</mark>]	China	37±13.1	51.9	100±14	NA	287	55.7	57 M	Kidney survival	/

MAP: Mean arterial pressure; Y: year; M: month; ESKD: end stage renal disease; NA: Not available

determined that C2 predicted unfavourable renal survival (HR=2.366, 95% CI 1.434-3.904), whereas C1 did not have predictive value for the renal outcome. In their study, Zhao and colleagues [36] explored the connection between the Oxford classification and the renal prognosis in cases of IgAN. Their findings revealed that the Kaplan-Meier (K-M) survival curve illustrated a more unfavourable prognosis for the C2 group than the C0 and C1 groups, with kidney survival times comparable between the C1 and C0 groups. The presence of heterogeneity in crescents among C1 patients, including factors like crescent volume, is suggested to be a significant element influencing the prognosis of IgAN. Within the scope of this study, a notable link was observed between crescent proportions and the progression of IgAN. Higher proportions, notably exceeding 25%, were reliable prognostic markers, indicating a greater risk of adverse kidney outcomes and ESKD. Our meta-analysis demonstrates the independent prognostic value of the presence of crescents, but there is currently insufficient data to suggest what is the optimal treatment of IgAN patients with a high crescent proportion [37–39]. At the same time, the impact of new treatment methods on the prognosis of crescents is still unknown. Treatment with glucocorticoids, such as budesonide, can achieve complete disappearance of crescents in repeat biopsies and remission of proteinuria, but improvement in renal prognosis remains uncertain [2, 3]. Immunosuppressive therapy, such as BAFF/APRIL inhibitors and complement inhibitors, may respond to crescents, but treatment may reduce their prognostic value [40, 41].

While our study sheds light on the prognostic value of crescent proportions in IgAN, it is essential to acknowledge its limitations. First, the studies included in our meta-analysis exhibited heterogeneity. This heterogeneity may introduce potential sources of bias and impede the broader applicability of our findings. Larger, more diverse patient populations should be the focus of future research to validate our findings. Second, our analysis primarily relies on retrospective and prospective cohort studies, which may introduce selection and publication biases. Further high-quality evidence from randomized controlled trials may be necessary for research in this field. Finally, The relationship between crescent proportions and disease progression in IgAN requires additional exploration to uncover the underlying mechanisms. Enhanced insights into the molecular and immunological processes could facilitate the development of targeted therapies.

Conclusions

In conclusion, our systematic review and meta-analysis provide compelling evidence of the prognostic significance of crescent proportions in IgAN. Higher crescent proportions, especially when they exceed 25% of glomeruli, are associated with an increased risk of kidney outcomes and ESKD. These findings have direct clinical implications, allowing for improved risk stratification, personalized treatment decisions, and enhanced clinical trial designs. However, it is essential to acknowledge that IgAN is a multifactorial disease, and crescents are just one part of the intricate puzzle. Future research should explore other contributors, such as genetic factors and the gut-kidney axis, to develop tailored interventions.

ysis ¹	
-anal	
meta	
the	
.⊆	
ded	
믕	
.⊆	
dies	
stu	
he	
oft	
Ϊţζ	
qual	
al	
.je	
0	
ğ	
ţ	
Ne	
~	
e.	
_	1

Table 2 Methoo	fological quality of th	e studies included	in the meta-an	alysis ¹					
First author	Representa- tiveness of the Exmosed Cohort	Selection of the Non-Exposed	Ascertain- ment of exposure	Outcome of interest not present at start of study	Control for important factor or additional factor	Outcome assessment	Was Follow-Up Long Enough for Out- comes to Occur	Adequacy of Follow Up of Cohorts	Total qual- itv
				מי זומו ר הן זומה)					scores
Lv [23]	ф	ф	ф Ф	챣	ф 4	А	А	ф Ф	00
Haas [<mark>7</mark>]	ф Ф	ф Ф	ф Ф	А	А	公	А		7
Zhang17 [<mark>24</mark>]	ф Ф	ф Ф	ф Ф	А	А	公	А	ф Ф	8
Zhang [14]	ф Ф	\$ ⁴	ф Ф	弦	А	А	А	ф Ф	8
Park [15]	4	公	公	☆	な	农	ф Ф	公	8
Peng [16]	\$	\$Z	Ф Ф	ф Ф	な	农	ф Ф	Ф Ф	8
Ma [25]	\$	\$Z	Ф Ф	ф Ф	な	农	ф Ф	Ф Ф	8
Lin [17]	\$	\$Z	Ф Ф	ф Ф	な	农	ф Ф		7
Chen [18]	ф Ф	ф Ф	ф Ф	А	А	公		ф Ф	7
Du [19]	公	公	☆	攻	な	ф Ф	ф Ф	公	8
Ossareh [20]	4	公	公	卒	な	农	☆	公	8
Ruan [<mark>2</mark> 1]	\$	\$ ⁴	ф Ф	な	な	农	公	ф Ф	8
Di [22]	ф Ф	ф Ф	ф	☆	쟈	ф	ф		7

¹ A study could be awarded a maximum of one star for each item except for the item Control for important factor or additional factor



Fig. 2 Forest plots of crescent formation and kidney outcomes. (A) pooling results; (B) subgroup analysis



Fig. 3 Forest plots of various proportions of crescents and kidney outcomes. (A) crescent proportions > 10%; (B) crescent proportions > 25%



Fig. 4 Forest plots of various proportions of crescents and ESKD. (A) crescent proportions > 25%; (B) crescent proportions > 10%



Fig. 5 Sensitivity analysis examining the influence of individual studies on pooled results. (A) crescent formation; (B) kidney outcomes in crescent proportions > 10%; (C) kidney outcomes in crescent proportions > 25%; (D) ESKD in crescent proportions > 10%; (E) ESKD in crescent proportions > 25%



Fig. 6 Funnel plot for publication bias. (A) kidney outcomes in crescent proportions > 25%; (B) ESKD in crescent proportions > 10%; (C) ESKD in crescent proportions > 25%

Abbreviations

IgAN	Immunoglobulin A nephropathy.
Cs	Crescents.
ESKD	End stage kidney disease.
HR	Hazard ratios.
Scr	Serum creatinine.
NOS	Newcastle–Ottawa Scale.
CI	Confidence intervals.

Supplementary Information

The online version contains supplementary material available at https://doi.or g/10.1186/s12882-024-03839-w.

Supplementary Material 1

Supplementary Material 2

Supplementary Material 3

Acknowledgements

Not applicable.

Author contributions

All authors contributed to the study conception and design. Material preparation, data collection and analysis were performed by Li Yu, Hao Zhang, Yunfeng Wu. The first draft of the manuscript was written by Li Yu and all authors commented on previous versions of the manuscript. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Funding

No funds, grants, or other support was received.

Data availability

All data generated or analysed during this study are included in this published article and its supplementary information file.

Declarations

Ethics approval and consent to participate

Not applicable, as this study is a systematic review and meta-analysis.

Consent for publication

Not applicable.

Competing interests

The authors declare no competing interests.

Received: 8 May 2024 / Accepted: 27 October 2024 Published online: 05 November 2024

References

- Reich HN, Troyanov S, Scholey JW, Cattran DC. Remission of proteinuria improves prognosis in IgA nephropathy. J Am Soc Nephrol. 2007;18:3177–83.
- Rauen T, Eitner F, Fitzner C, Sommerer C, Zeier M, Otte B, et al. Intensive supportive care plus immunosuppression in IgA nephropathy. N Engl J Med. 2015;373:2225–36.
- Lv J, Zhang H, Wong MG, Jardine MJ, Hladunewich M, Jha V, et al. Effect of oral methylprednisolone on clinical outcomes in patients with IgA nephropathy: the TESTING randomized clinical trial. JAMA. 2017;318:432–42.
- Rodrigues JC, Haas M, Reich HN. IgA nephropathy. Clin J Am Soc Nephrology: CJASN. 2017;12:677.
- Luo M-N, Pan Q, Huang Z-Q, Li S-M, Xu Y-Z, Liu H. -f. IgA nephropathy patients with partial crescent formation benefit from immunosuppressants: evidence from repeat renal biopsy. Discov Med. 2020;30:19–25.
- Rafieian-Kopaei M, Baradaran A, Nasri H. Significance of extracapillary proliferation in IgA-nephropathy patients with regard to clinical and histopathological variables. Hippokratia. 2013;17:258.

- Trimarchi H, Barratt J, Cattran DC, Cook HT, Coppo R, Haas M, et al. Oxford classification of IgA nephropathy 2016: an update from the IgA nephropathy classification working group. Kidney Int. 2017;91:1014–21.
- 8. Herlitz LC, Charles Jennette J. Histopathology of glomerular diseases. Cham: Glomerulonephritis Springer; 2019.
- Wells G, Shea B, O'Connell D, Peterson J, Welch V, Losos M, et al. Newcastle-Ottawa quality assessment scale cohort studies. University of Ottawa; 2014.
- Wells GA, Shea B, O'Connell D, Peterson J, Welch V, Losos M et al. The Newcastle-Ottawa Scale (NOS) for assessing the quality of nonrandomised studies in meta-analyses. 2000.
- 11. Higgins JP, Thompson SG. Quantifying heterogeneity in a meta-analysis. Stat Med. 2002;21:1539–58.
- Copas J, Shi JQ. Meta-analysis, funnel plots and sensitivity analysis. Biostatistics. 2000;1:247–62.
- Cumpston M, Li T, Page MJ, Chandler J, Welch VA, Higgins JP et al. Updated guidance for trusted systematic reviews: a new edition of the Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews of Interventions. The Cochrane database of systematic reviews. 2019;2019.
- Haas M, Verhave JC, Liu Z-H, Alpers CE, Barratt J, Becker JU, et al. A multicenter study of the predictive value of crescents in IgA nephropathy. J Am Soc Nephrology: JASN. 2017;28:691.
- Zhang X, Shi S, Ouyang Y, Yang M, Shi M, Pan X, et al. A validation study of crescents in predicting ESRD in patients with IgA nephropathy. J Translational Med. 2018;16:1–8.
- Park S, Baek CH, Park S-K, Kang HG, Hyun HS, Park E, et al. Clinical significance of crescent formation in IgA nephropathy–a multicenter validation study. Kidney Blood Press Res. 2019;44:22–32.
- Peng W, Tang Y, Tan L, Qin W. Crescents and global glomerulosclerosis in Chinese IgA nephropathy patients: a five-year follow-up. Kidney Blood Press Res. 2019;44:103–12.
- Lin Z, Liu L, Zhang R, Lin X, Lu F, Bao K, et al. Volume of crescents affects prognosis of IgA nephropathy in patients without obvious chronic renal pathology. Am J Nephrol. 2021;52:507–18.
- Chen Y, Yang Y, Liang Y, Liu M, Xiao W, Hu X. Retrospective analysis of crescent score in clinical prognosis of IgA nephropathy. Open Med. 2022;17:205–15.
- Du Y, Chen S, Wang F, Zhang P, Liu M, Liu C, et al. The significance of crescents on the clinical features and outcomes of primary immunoglobin a nephropathy. Front Med. 2022;9:864667.
- Ossareh S, Nazemzadeh N, Asgari M, Bagherzadegan H, Afghahi H. The added value of crescents on Oxford classification score in risk stratification of end-stage kidney disease in patients with IgA nephropathy. Iran J Kidney Dis. 2022;16.
- 22. Ruan Y, Hong F, Wu J, Lin M, Wang C, Lian F, et al. Clinicopathological characteristics, risk factors and renal outcome in IgA nephropathy with crescents. J Nephrol. 2022;35:1113–21.
- 23. Di D, Liu L, Wang Y, Yang Y, Jiang S, Li W. Crescents proportions above 10% are associated with unfavorable kidney outcomes in IgA nephropathy patients with partial crescent formation. Ren Fail. 2023;45:2226257.
- Lv J, Yang Y, Zhang H, Chen W, Pan X, Guo Z, et al. Prediction of outcomes in crescentic IgA nephropathy in a multicenter cohort study. J Am Soc Nephrology: JASN. 2013;24:2118.
- Zhang W, Zhou Q, Hong L, Chen W, Yang S, Yang Q et al. Clinical outcomes of IgA nephropathy patients with different proportions of crescents. Medicine. 2017;96.
- 26. Ma F, Liu L, Dong R, Yang X, Wei L, Li L, et al. Renal survival and risk factors in IgA nephropathy with crescents. Int Urol Nephrol. 2020;52:1507–16.
- of the International AWG, Network IN, Cattran DC, Coppo R, Cook HT, Feehally J, et al. The Oxford classification of IgA nephropathy: rationale, clinicopathological correlations, and classification. Kidney Int. 2009;76:534–45.
- Herzenberg AM, Fogo AB, Reich HN, Troyanov S, Bavbek N, Massat AE, et al. Validation of the Oxford classification of IgA nephropathy. Kidney Int. 2011;80:310–7.
- Le W, Zeng C-H, Liu Z, Liu D, Yang Q, Lin R-X, et al. Validation of the Oxford classification of IgA nephropathy for pediatric patients from China. BMC Nephrol. 2012;13:1–8.
- Shi S-F, Wang S-X, Jiang L, Ji-Cheng L, Liu L-J, Chen Y-Q, et al. Pathologic predictors of renal outcome and therapeutic efficacy in IgA nephropathy: validation of the oxford classification. Clin J Am Soc Nephrology: CJASN. 2011;6:2175.
- Lee MJ, Kim SJ, Oh HJ, Ko KI, Koo HM, Kim CH, et al. Clinical implication of crescentic lesions in immunoglobulin A nephropathy. Nephrol Dialysis Transplantation. 2014;29:356–64.

- Katafuchi R, Ninomiya T, Nagata M, Mitsuiki K, Hirakata H. Validation study of oxford classification of IgA nephropathy: the significance of extracapillary proliferation. Clin J Am Soc Nephrology: CJASN. 2011;6:2806.
- Walsh M, Sar A, Lee D, Yilmaz S, Benediktsson H, Manns B, et al. Histopathologic features aid in predicting risk for progression of IgA nephropathy. Clin J Am Soc Nephrology: CJASN. 2010;5:425.
- Shima Y, Nakanishi K, Hama T, Mukaiyama H, Togawa H, Hashimura Y, et al. Validity of the Oxford classification of IgA nephropathy in children. Pediatr Nephrol. 2012;27:783–92.
- Edström Halling S, Söderberg MP, Berg UB. Predictors of outcome in paediatric IgA nephropathy with regard to clinical and histopathological variables (Oxford classification). Nephrol Dialysis Transplantation. 2012;27:715–22.
- Zhao Y, Lin H, Xu R, He Y. Correlation analysis of 2017 Oxford classification of IgA nephropathy and renal prognosis. Chin J IntegrTradit West Med. 2019;20:804–7.
- Shi SF, Wang SX, Jiang L, Lv JC, Liu LJ, Chen YQ, et al. Pathologic predictors of renal outcome and therapeutic efficacy in IgA nephropathy: validation of the oxford classification. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol. 2011;6:2175–84.

- Wu H, Xia Z, Gao C, Zhang P, Yang X, Wang R, et al. The correlation analysis between the Oxford classification of Chinese IgA nephropathy children and renal outcome - a retrospective cohort study. BMC Nephrol. 2020;21:247.
- Lv J, Shi S, Xu D, Zhang H, Troyanov S, Cattran DC, et al. Evaluation of the Oxford classification of IgA nephropathy: a systematic review and metaanalysis. Am J Kidney Dis. 2013;62:891–9.
- Itami H, Hara S, Samejima K, Tsushima H, Morimoto K, Okamoto K, et al. Complement activation is associated with crescent formation in IgA nephropathy. Virchows Arch. 2020;477:565–72.
- Wang Z, Xie X, Li J, Zhang X, He J, Wang M, et al. Complement activation is Associated with crescents in IgA Nephropathy. Front Immunol. 2021;12:676919.

Publisher's note

Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.