

# Combinatorial Herpes Simplex Vaccine Strategies: From Bedside to Bench and Back

Aziz A. Chentoufi<sup>1</sup>, Nisha R. Dhanushkodi<sup>1</sup>, Ruchi Srivastava<sup>1</sup>, Swayam Prakash<sup>1</sup>, Pierre-Gregoire A. Coulon<sup>1</sup>, Latifa Zayou<sup>1</sup>, Hawa Vahed<sup>2</sup>, Hiba A. Chentoufi<sup>3</sup>, Kathy K. Hormi-Carver<sup>1</sup> and Lbachir BenMohamed<sup>1,3,4\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Laboratory of Cellular and Molecular Immunology, Gavin Herbert Eye Institute, School of Medicine, University of California Irvine, Irvine, CA, United States, <sup>2</sup> Department of Vaccines and Immunotherapies, TechImmune, Limited Liability Company (LLC), University Lab Partners, Irvine, CA, United States, <sup>3</sup> Biomedical Sciences, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, ON, Canada, <sup>4</sup> Department of Molecular Biology & Biochemistry, Institute for Immunology, School of Medicine, University of California Irvine, Irvine, CA, United States

#### **OPEN ACCESS**

#### Edited by:

Susmit Suvas, Wayne State University, United States

#### Reviewed by:

Elmostafa Bahraoui, U1043 Centre de Physiopathologie de Toulouse Purpan (INSERM), France Pamela Rosato, Dartmouth College, United States

> \*Correspondence: Lbachir BenMohamed Lbenmoha@uci.edu

#### Specialty section:

This article was submitted to Viral Immunology, a section of the journal Frontiers in Immunology

Received: 06 January 2022 Accepted: 18 March 2022 Published: 25 April 2022

#### Citation:

Chentoufi AA, Dhanushkodi NR, Srivastava R, Prakash S, Coulon P-GA, Zayou L, Vahed H, Chentoufi HA, Hormi-Carver KK and BenMohamed L (2022) Combinatorial Herpes Simplex Vaccine Strategies: From Bedside to Bench and Back. Front. Immunol. 13:849515. doi: 10.3389/fimmu.2022.849515 The development of vaccines against herpes simplex virus type 1 and type 2 (HSV1 and HSV-2) is an important goal for global health. In this review we reexamined (i) the status of ocular herpes vaccines in clinical trials; and (ii) discusses the recent scientific advances in the understanding of differential immune response between HSV infected asymptomatic and symptomatic individuals that form the basis for the new combinatorial vaccine strategies targeting HSV; and (iii) shed light on our novel "asymptomatic" herpes approach based on protective immune mechanisms in seropositive asymptomatic individuals who are "naturally" protected from recurrent herpetic diseases. We previously reported that phenotypically and functionally distinct HSV-specific memory CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell subsets in asymptomatic and symptomatic HSV-infected individuals. Moreover, a better protection induced following a prime/pull vaccine approach that consists of first priming anti-viral effector memory T cells systemically and then pulling them to the sites of virus reactivation (e.g., sensory ganglia) and replication (e.g., eyes and vaginal mucosa), following mucosal administration of vectors expressing T cell-attracting chemokines. In addition, we reported that a combination of prime/pull vaccine approach with approaches to reverse T cell exhaustion led to even better protection against herpes infection and disease. Blocking PD-1, LAG-3, TIGIT and/or TIM-3 immune checkpoint pathways helped in restoring the function of antiviral HSV-specific CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells in latently infected ganglia and increased efficacy and longevity of the prime/pull herpes vaccine. We discussed that a prime/pull vaccine strategy that use of asymptomatic epitopes, combined with immune checkpoint blockade would prove to be a successful herpes vaccine approach.

Keywords: herpes simplex virus, clinical trials, vaccines, asymptomatic, immune checkpoint blockade

# INTRODUCTION

According to the World Health Organization (WHO), over twothirds of the worldwide population in infected with HSV-1 (commonly known to cause oral herpes or cold sores) and HSV-2 (commonly known to cause genital herpes) (1, 2). The prevalence of HSV-1 and HSV-2 is 47.8% and 11.9%, respectively, for individuals aged 14 to 49 years according to a 2018 February data brief published by the US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention's National Center for Health Statistics (1, 2). In the United States alone, every year, there are 500,000 HSV-1 oral herpes cases; 300,000 HSV-1 and HSV-2 genital herpes cases; 20,000 HSV-1 ocular herpes cases and 1,500 cases of herpes encephalitis (3, 4). Apart from being the most prevalent sexually transmitted disease, HSV-1 is the leading cause of infectious blindness in Western countries (5). HSV-1 and HSV-2 are neurotropic viruses that infect the anogenital, oral mucosal lining and the skin and the eyes (6) The immune response to HSV typically controls the acute mucosal infection; however, the virus remains latent in the ganglia, and there is a life-long sporadic low-grade shedding of virus from sensory neurons into the mucosa (6). Thus, while HSV hides for a lifetime in the trigeminal, autonomic, or dorsal root ganglia, it reactivates and sheds asymptomatically making the transmission high. In addition to causing painful blisters, HSV-2 can cause encephalitis and death in newborns from vertical transmission and increases the risk for HIV infection two-three-fold times (7). Antiviral drugs are the only current treatment approved by the Food and Drug Administration (FDA) for treatment of herpetic diseases. Due to the cost, virus resistances and limited effectiveness of antiviral drugs, preventive or therapeutic vaccines are highly desirable to control herpes infection and/or diseases (8). The development of a vaccine that proves effective against one type of the HSV would be helpful for the other type due to the genetic similarity between HSV-1 and HSV-2. However, due to virus latency and HSV immune evasion, immunotherapy and vaccine development against the virus have become a real challenge. As of 2018, a number of different HSV vaccine candidates were at different stages of clinical trials (9, 10) (Table 1).

One common denominator in these vaccines is the use of the whole virus or whole virus proteins, which contain both protective "asymptomatic" epitopes and pathogenic "symptomatic" epitopes. Our developed "asymptomatic" herpes vaccine approach which is based on understanding the immune mechanisms by which seropositive asymptomatic individuals are "naturally" protected from recurrent herpes disease throughout their lives. Clinical and pre-clinical studies have proved that the T cell-based immune system in the mucosa lining of the genital tract plays a crucial role in the prevention of HSV acquisition. A better mucosal vaccine approach to boost effector memory T cell responses will serve instrumental in developing an effective HSV vaccine (45). Our latest approach of using adenoviral vectors delivering chemokines and asymptomatic dominant epitopes to induce and pull antiviral CD4<sup>+</sup> and CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells to the site of reactivation (i.e., ganglia) and replication (i.e., epithelia) would be an effective

combinatorial herpes simplex vaccine strategy. Moreover, another combinatorial herpes simplex vaccine strategy that consists of reversing T cell exhaustion by immune checkpoint blockade would be a successful strategy to clear herpes infection (46). In this review, we highlight the current clinical trials in herpes vaccine development and emphasize the significance of using the asymptomatic epitope approach in a combinatorial vaccine strategy.

# HSV VACCINES: FROM PAST TO PRESENT

The success of vaccines against other alpha herpes, like the chicken-pox and shingles vaccine, has given hope for the development of a vaccine against HSV (47) (**Table 1**). Four main vaccine approaches have been designed and tested in the past four decades to fight off herpes simplex virus type 1 (HSV-1) and type 2 (HSV-2) infections and diseases (48): (1) Inactivated "killed" HSV vaccines; (2) Live-attenuated HSV vaccines; (3) Replication-defective HSV vaccines; and (4) Subunit HSV vaccines (9, 49–54). Each of these types of vaccine approaches has its pros and cons when it comes to safety, immunogenicity, and protective efficacy.

## Inactivated "Killed" HSV Vaccines

HSV is a highly successful neurotropic virus that resides in the nervous system and therefore presents the risk of developing neuro-pathogenesis and life-threatening Herpes Simplex Encephalitis (HSE). Thus, back in the 70s and 80s, the first whole inactivated HSV vaccine approach used "kill" the whole virus after exposure to heat, UV-light (55) or chemicals (56, 57). These whole inactivated HSV vaccines induced antibodies, but not T cells, and as such have not been successful in the protection against recurrent HSV-1 or HSV-2 infections and diseases (58–60). Therefore, the live-attenuated HSV vaccines (61–66) and replication-defective HSV vaccines were introduced (51, 58–60, 67–71).

## **Live-Attenuated HSV Vaccines**

Live-attenuated HSV vaccines contrast inactivated HSV vaccines produced by "killing" the virus and reducing the neurovirulence of HSV-1 or HSV-2, while keeping them viable. In the past 24 years, many live-attenuated HSV vaccines have been introduced and tested in both the mouse and guinea pig models mainly in a prophylactic setting (instead of a therapeutic setting). However, due mostly to safety concerns, only a few of these live vaccines have progressed into clinical trials (63). Live-attenuated HSV vaccines include: (1) The HSV-2 TK<sup>(-)</sup> mutant reported back in 1995 by Milligan and Bernstein and then by Kiyono in 2014 (72); (2) the RAV 9395 live attenuated recombinant virus; evaluated in guinea pigs and reported by Spaete back in 1998 (70); (3) AD472, a live attenuated recombinant HSV-2 vaccine evaluated in guinea pigs was reported back in 2005 (51); (4) The most studied HSV-1 and HSV-2 ICP0 <sup>(-)</sup> live-attenuated mutant vaccines, lacking the

#### TABLE 1 | Herpes Vaccine Strategies.

Type of Vaccine	Vaccine Construct	Administration Route	Phase ofTrial	Virus Subtype	Results	Limitations	Ref.
Inactivated vaccine	HSV-1 gH deletion (SC16∆gH)	Subcutaneous in human	Clinical trial	HSV-2	Unable to show protection against acute or recurrent genital herpes infection	Vaccine did not achieve clinical usefulness	(11) Akhrameyeva NV, Zhang P, Sugiyama N, Behar SM, Yao F. Development of a glycoprotein D- expressing dominant- negative
					<ul> <li>Does not show improvement in recurrences and disease severity.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Alternative approaches could be proposed</li> </ul>	and replication- defective herpes simplex virus 2 (HSV-2) recombinant viral vaccine against
					Does not affect on viral shedding		HSV-2 infection in mice. <i>J Virol</i> , 85(10), 5036- 5047 (2011).
		Subcutaneous and intravaginal in	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	<ul> <li>Provides complete protection against primary and recurrent HSV infection</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Missing reproducibility on correlation between antibody titers and recurrent</li> </ul>	(12) Reszka NJ, Dudek T, Knipe DM. Construction, and properties of a herpes
		guinea pig			<ul> <li>Induces high neutralizing antibody titers</li> </ul>	infection pattern	simplex virus 2 dl5-29 vaccine candidate strain encoding an HSV-1 virion host shutoff protein
					<ul> <li>Induces long- lasting immune responses i.e., over 6 months</li> </ul>	The immune mechanisms involved in the control of recurrent infection need	Vaccine, 28(15), 2754-2762 (2010)
					Develops high potency for complete HSV protection	to be elucidated	
		Intraepithelial and	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	Reduces HSV symptoms	High risk of genetic recombination	(13) Belshe PB, Leone PA, Bernstein DI <i>et al.</i>
		intravaginal in quinea pig			Gives quicker symptomatic episodes	Unable to block the virus reactivation to	Efficacy Results of a Trial of a Herpes Simplex Vaccine. The New England journal of
		3 p3			<ul> <li>Prevents local HSV-2 replication</li> </ul>	prevent disease recurrences	medicine, 366, 34-43 (2012).
					<ul> <li>offers Improved protection against HSV severity via Intravaginal route</li> </ul>	This study needs more animal experiment for statistical significance	
		Scarification via ear	Preclinical trial	HSV-1	Establishes self-limiting HSV infection	May reactivate latent HSV	(14) Bernard MC, Barban V, Pradezynski F et
		pinna route in mice			Induces DTH response	Viral latency and reactivation should be	non-replicative status of the HSV-2 vaccine
					<ul> <li>Provides protection against acute HSV infection</li> </ul>	studied in more suitable animal model	candidate HSV529 in mice and guinea pigs. PLoS One, 10(4), e0121518 (2015).
	HSV-2 ICP8 replication	Subcutaneous in	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	<ul> <li>Increases IFN-g-producing T- cells</li> </ul>	The protective immunity mediated by	(15, 16) Ohashi M, Bertke AS, Patel A, Krausa PR, Spread of hornos simplex virus to
	stimulation	mice			<ul> <li>Decreases HSV replication in genital mucosa</li> </ul>	antibody and T- cells	the spinal cord is independent of spread to dorsal root ganglia, <i>J Virol</i> , 85(6), 3030-3032
					<ul> <li>Lowers HSV related genital and neurological disease</li> </ul>		(2011). Dasgupta G, Chentoufi AA, Kalantari M et al. Immunodominant "asymptomatic"
					Reduces mortality		herpes simplex virus 1 and 2 protein antigens identified by probing whole-ORFome microarrays with serum antibodies from seropositive asymptomatic versus symptomatic individuals. <i>J Virol</i> , 86(8), 4358- 4369 (2012).
	Multiple genes Deletion	Subcutaneous in	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	Reduces viral titer and viral shedding	• The genetic basis underlying the	(17) Dasgupta G, Nesburn AB, Wechsler SL,
	of HSV-2	mice			Suppreses viral replication and latency	latency defect should be elucidated	mucosal herpes vaccine: the present and the
					Theorotically provides protection against double- mutant virus even in immune compare mixed in dividuals		future. Future Microbiol, 5(1), 1-4 (2010).
	HSV-2 ICP10∆PK	Subcutaneous in	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	Infinunocompro mised individuais	Doos not readily begin latency	(18) Chentoufi AA, BenMohamed L. Future
	deletion	mice			strong T-helper type 1 (Th1) immune	Must show the frequency and duration	viral vectors for the delivery of asymptomatic
					response	of	vaccines. <i>Future virology</i> , 5(5), 525-528
					<ul> <li>Increases IL-12 secretion by DCs</li> </ul>	memory T-cells	(2010).
						<ul> <li>Assess the ability to activate p38MAPK in</li> </ul>	
						T- cells	
	HSV-2 UL5 & UL29 genes deletion	Intramuscular in humans	Clinical trial	Multiple mutated HSV-1 and HSV-2 combina tions	Safe and well tolerated	More reactions than placebo on the injection site	(19) Schiffer JT, Abu-Raddad L, Mark KE et al. Mucosal host immune response predicts the severity and duration of herpes simplex

(Continued)

Type of Vaccine	Vaccine Construct	Administration Route	Phase ofTrial	Virus Subtype	Results	Limitations	Ref.
					<ul> <li>Produces neutralizing antibody along with CD4+ and CD8+ T-cell responses in HSV seronegative individuals</li> </ul>	Should modify vaccine by increasing the expression of certain viral proteins	virus-2 genital tract shedding episodes. Proc Natl Acad Sci U. S. A., 107(44), 18973-18978 (2010).
					Produces only CD4+ T-cell responses in HSV seropositive individuals	<ul> <li>Should inhibits the expression of viral immune evasion genes, or adding an adjuvant</li> </ul>	
		Subcutaneous, and intramuscular in mice	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	Decreases genital infection and viral shedding	<ul> <li>Should study the role and type of DC involved in priming immunity against the intramuscular vaccine.</li> </ul>	(20) Chentoufi AA, Binder NR, Berka N et al. Asymptomatic human CD4+ cytotoxic T-cell epitopes identified from herpes simplex virus
					<ul> <li>Produces strong immune response</li> <li>Gives protection against many HSV-2 viral strains</li> </ul>		glycoprotein B. <i>J Virol</i> , 82(23), 11792-11802 (2008).
					Shows better protection via     intramuscular route		
	HSV-2 gD (∆gD-2)	Intramuscular in	Preclinical trial	HSV-2 and superin-	Induces IgG2 response	voir in the	(21) Dervillez X, Qureshi H, Chentoufi AA et al.
		mice			Fully protects HSV-2 spreading to the sacral ganglia and mortality	Should use guinea pigs as an animal model to study recurrent diseases	Epitopes from Herpes Simplex Virus Glycoprotein B Preferentially Recall
					Shows almost no signs of disease	Should incorporate murine superinfection model in preclinical evaluation of HSV- vaccine candidates	Polyfunctional CD8+ T Cells from Seropositive Asymptomatic Individuals and Protect HLA Transgenic Mice Against Ocular Herpes. J Immunol, (2013).
Live attenuated	R7017 Deletion of HSV-1 thymidine kinase	Intracerebral in mice, vaginal,	Preclinical trial	HSV-1 and HSV-2	Protects against severe HSV infections	<ul> <li>It establishes low frequency of latent infections in all bosts (B7020)</li> </ul>	(22) Dervillez X, Gottimukkala C, Kabbara KW et al. Future of an "Asymptomatic" T-cell
vaccine	-	intradermal, and intramuscular in guinea pigs and scarification of			<ul> <li>HSV lesions are localized, superficial and heals more rapidly</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>It also establishes latent infection in rabbits (R7017)</li> </ul>	Epitope-Based Therapeutic Herpes Simplex Vaccine. Future virology, 7(4), 371-378 (2012).
	RAV9395 (Deletion of HSV-2 γ134.5 gene, UL55 and UL56 ORF)	Intramuscular	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	Decreases lesion development and HSV infection severity	N/A	(23) Pope C, Kim SK, Marzo A et al. Organ- specific regulation of the CD8 T cell response to Listeria monocytogenes infection. <i>Journal of</i>
	,				<ul> <li>Decreases frequency of HSV reactivation from explanted DRG</li> </ul>		immunology, 166(5), 3402-3409 (2001).
	VC2 (mutations in gK and UL20)	Intramuscular	Preclinical trial	HSV-1 and HSV-2	Fully protects against lethal intravaginal HSV challenge	N/A	(24) Gebhardt T, Whitney PG, Zaid A et al. Different patterns of peripheral migration by memory CD4+ and CD8+ T cells. <i>Nature</i> 477
					Presents cross-protective humoral and cellular immunity		(7363), 216-219 (2011).
					<ul> <li>Absence of viral DNA in ganglionic tissues</li> </ul>		
		Intramuscular	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	<ul> <li>Decreases acute viral replication in vagina, amount of virus in neural tissue, subsequent recurrent disease, and viral shedding</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Applying the criteria used for human trials</li> </ul>	(25) Nelson MH, Bird MD, Chu CF et al. Rapid clearance of herpes simplex virus type 2 by CD8+ T cells requires high level expression of effector T cell functions. J Reprod Immunol, 89(1):10-17 (2011)
		Eastand injection	Proclinical trial		Delivers protection after 6 months	N/A	(26) Bottko AS, Botol A, Imai V, Apakupakul
	1134-2 IGF0-214L3)	r ootpau injection	r recinical tha	1104-2	Significantly reduces viral shedding in vagina		K, Margolis TP, Krause PR. Latency- associated transcript (LAT) exon 1 controls
					No detectable intection		herpes simplex virus species-specific phenotypes: reactivation in the guinea pig genital model and neuron subtype-specific latent expression of LAT. <i>J Virol</i> , 83(19), 10007-10015 (2009).
	HSV-2 gE deletion	Intramuscular, intravaginal, and	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	<ul> <li>No disease mortality</li> <li>Absence of infectious virus in DRG and</li> </ul>	Provides incomplete protection	(27) Schiffer JT, Corey L. Rapid host immune response and viral dynamics in herpes simplex
		II II AVENUUS			recurrent HSV shedding in vagina		(2013).
					Decreases recurrent genital HSV lesions     Gives better officiary through		
					intramuscular route than subcutaneous route		

(Continued)

Combinatorial HSV Vaccine Strategies

V22 (ptC31-68 deletion of HSV-1)         Intramuscular         Predince Intel HSV-2         HSV-2         Intramuscular         Predince Intel HSV-2         Intramuscular         Predince Intel HSV-2         Intramuscular         Predince Intel HSV-1         Intramuscular         Predince Intel HSV-2         Intramuscular         Intramuscular         Predince Intel HSV-2         Intramuscular         Intramuscular         Predince Intel HSV-2         Intramuscular         Predince Intel HSV-2         Intramuscular         Predince Intel HSV-2         Intramuscular         Intramuscular         Predince Intel HSV-2         Intramuscular         Intramuscular         Intrel HSV-2         Intramuscular         Intrel HS	Vaccine Construct	Administration Route	Phase ofTrial	Virus Subtype	Results	Limitations	Ref.
<ul> <li>Naked DNA</li> <li>Nove groups is only observed and resument HSV-1 increases influences in the V-1 increases</li></ul>	VC2 (gKD31-68 deletion Ir of HSV-1)	Intramuscular	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	Shows poor HSV replication at the immunization site	Not effective as a therapeutic vaccin	e (28) Tang VA, Rosenthal KL. Intravaginal infection with herpes simplex virus type-2
<ul> <li>Naked DNA</li> <li>pSVL - HSV-1 [GPDAILS]</li> <li>pSVL - HSV-1 [GPDAILS]</li> <li>pRoduced pHSVL, Pacing and particle phases and phas</li></ul>					Rarely infects neural tissue		(HSV-2) generates a functional effector memory T cell population that persists in the
Naked DNA     PSVL HSV 1 gD, pFU     Internuscular     Predincial trial     HSV-1     HSV-1     Predincial trial     HSV-1     Predincial trial<					<ul> <li>Lack of any genital disease</li> </ul>		murine genital tract. J Reprod Immunol, 87(1-
<ul> <li>Naked DN</li> <li>Syl-1 HSV-1 GPOANLS</li> <li>Syl-2 HSV-1 HSV-1 GPOANLS</li> <li>Syl-2 HSV-</li></ul>					<ul> <li>Reduces severity of acute and recurrent HSV-2 shedding in vagina and quantity of virus in DRG</li> </ul>		2), 39-44 (2010).
Naked DMA     pSVL- HSV-1 gD, pR/-/ gD2     Intramuscular     Predinical trial     HSV-1     - Cover predical prediction opages HSV-1     NA     B3     B4     <					Better selection as a prophylactic vaccine		
<ul> <li>Provides covery from initial conjunctivities</li> <li>Provides covery from initial conjunctivities</li> <li>Increases ancharding antibody thers and conpart of vice after statuse of vice after status of vice after statuse of vice after status of vice after status of vice after statuse of</li></ul>	lr	Intramuscular	Preclinical trial	HSV-1	Gives protection against HSV-1- induced ocular pathogenesis	N/A	(29) van Lint A, Ayers M, Brooks AG, Coles RM, Heath WR, Carbone FR. Herpes simplex virus specific CD8+ T cells can clear
<ul> <li>Increases neutralizing artibody tites and givin CC3A, CO4+ and CC8+ T- calls and givin CC3A, CO4+ and CC8+ T- call and givin CC3A, CO4+ T- C4A, CC3A, CE1+ CC4A, CC3A, CE1+ CC4A, CC4</li></ul>					Provides complete recovery from initial conjunctivitis		established lytic infections from skin and nerves and can partially limit the early spread
<ul> <li>Naked DNA pSVL- HSV-1 gD, pRe/ Marcular gDD and constrained mSV-1 (PODANLS)</li> <li>Naked DNA encoding HSV-2 Intramuscular gDD As encoding HSV-2 Subcutaneous and preside time intravegnal intra</li></ul>					<ul> <li>Increases neutralizing antibody titers along with CD3+, CD4+ and CD8+ T- cells</li> </ul>		of virus after cutaneous inoculation. <i>J</i> Immunol, 172(1), 392-397 (2004).
<ul> <li>Naked DNA pSVL- HSV-1 gD, pRc/</li> <li>Intranuscular</li> <li>Preclinical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>Preclinical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>Portical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>Portical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>Portical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>Portical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>Portical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>Portical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV</li></ul>	P2 (HCV 1 mutation in the	latromusou lor	Dradinical trial		Decreases infiltration of lba1+ macrophages	NI/A	(20) Dott I. S. Brielin M.I. Andrew DD. Borg
<ul> <li>Naked DNA</li> <li>pSVL HSV-1 gD, pRe/ gD2</li> <li>Intranuscular</li> <li>Precinical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>Precinical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>Simulates an impressing peripherative of a gD suburi and neutralizing antibody matibody encoding HSV-2</li> <li>pDNA encoding HSV-2</li> <li>pPCA encodi</li></ul>	region 2 of pUL37) ir	intradermal, and	Precimical trial	H3V-2	Increases neutralizing antibodies	N/A	EL, Butcher EC. A fundamental subdivision of
Naked DNA vaccine       pSVL-HSV-1 gD, pRc/ CMV+HSV-1 gD       Intramuscular       Preclinical trial       HSV-1       HSV-1       - Rarely infects neural tissue       - T-cell response is only observed at a single time point       (31) Mebius ER, Str motor         Naked DNA vaccine       pSVL-HSV-1 gD, pRc/ CMV+HSV-1 gD       Intramuscular       Preclinical trial       HSV-1       - Shows less infectious vius during acute - Shows less infectious rule during free - Gless precetoring the gB-elicited interferon (IFM)- recaling by reducing ocular heroascularization and suppressing peripheral nerve virus replication gDENA encoding HSV-2 gD2       - Intramuscular       Preclinical trial       HSV-1       - Provides side and well tolerated with no decreasing LAG-3, PD-1, and TIM-3       - Provides low protection against coular recovaccularization and suppressing peripheral nerve virus replication gDELSA responses       - Provides low protection against coular recovaccularization and suppressing peripheral nerve virus replication gDELSA responses       - Provides low protection against coular recovaccularization and suppressing peripheral nerve virus replication gDELSA responses       - Provides side nerve virus replication vaccine       - Provides side nerve virus replication vaccine         Naked DNA vaccine       pBNA encoding HSV-2 gD2       Intramuscular       Clinicaltrial       HSV-1/HSV-2- HSV-1/HSV-2- HSV-1/HSV-2- HSV-1/HSV-2-       - Provides side nerve virus replication recovacularization antibuoty and metarizing antibody reprodues and new tolerated with no recovacularization and suppressing and metarizing antibody reprodues and newel tolerated with no recovacularization and weli tolera	ir	intravaginal			<ul> <li>Decreases acute and recurrent HSV latent virus detection in DRG and recurrent shedding</li> </ul>		circulating lymphocytes defined by adhesion to mucosal addressin cell adhesion molecule 1. Comparison with vascular cell adhesion
<ul> <li>Shows more effectivity via intradermal route</li> <li>Shows less infectious virus during acute infection in TG and brainstem</li> <li>Shows less infectious virus during acute infection (IRN)-ry, granzyme B and CD107a; and decreasing LAG-3, PD-1, and TM-3</li> <li>Gives protection against coular HSV-1</li> <li>Gives protection against coular HSV-1 gD pRe/</li> <li>Intramuscular</li> <li>Preclinical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>Reduces serum anti-gD antibody, and relation antibody ifters</li> <li>Provides low protection against HSV-1</li> <li>Gives non-specific changes in ELISA</li> <li>Provides adverse events that are graperation antibody ifters</li> <li>Intramuscular</li> <li>Provides adverse events that are mostly local site reactions</li> <li>Intramuscular HSV-1/HSV-2;</li> <li>Provides adverse events that are mostly local site reactions</li> <li>Intramuscular HSV-1/HSV-2;</li> <li>Provides adverse events that are mostly local site reactions</li> <li>Intreas</li></ul>					Rarely infects neural tissue		molecule-1 and correlation with beta 7
Naked DNA vaccinePSVL - HSV-1 gD, pRc/ DNA encoding HSV-2IntramuscularPreclinical trial intramuscularHSV-1HSV-1· Show less inflectious virus during acute inflection in TG and brainstem · Stimulates an immune response by increasing the gB-elicited infereron (IRN- r, granzyme B and CD107a; and challenge by reducing ocular neovascularization and suppressing peripheral nerve virus replication· T-cell response is only observed at a single time point(31) Mebius RE, Stimulates an immune response by increasing LAG-3, PD-1, and TIM-3Naked DNA vaccinepSVL- HSV-1 gD, pRc/ CMV- HSV-1 gDIntramuscularPreclinical trial HSV-1HSV-1· Show less inflectious virus during acute inflection in TG and brainstem · granzyme B and CD107a; and challenge by reducing ocular neovascularization and suppressing peripheral nerve virus replication· Provides low protection against HSV-1 Not a useful atternative of a D subunit vaccine(31) Mebius RE, Stimulates proce Nati Acad Sci / 100000000000000000000000000000000000					Shows more effectivity via intradermal		integrins and memory differentiation. J Immunol. 156(10). 3727-3736 (1996).
<ul> <li>Naked DNA vaccine</li> <li>pSVL- HSV-1 gD, pRc/ Uramuscular</li> <li>Preclinical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>Preclinical trial</li> <li>HSV-2</li> <li>Provides fully protection against tethal intravaginal HSV-2 virtor. specific</li> <li>Provides fully protection against tet</li></ul>	HSV-1 ICP0∆NLS S ir	Subcutaneous and intramuscular	Preclinical trial	HSV-1	<ul> <li>Shows less infectious virus during acute infection in TG and brainstem</li> </ul>	T-cell response is only observed at a single time point	(31) Mebius RE, Streeter PR, Michie S, Butcher EC, Weissman IL. A developmental
<ul> <li>Naked DNA vaccine</li> <li>pSVL- HSV-1 gD, pRc/ CMV- HSV-1 gD</li> <li>Intramuscular</li> <li>Preclinical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>Preclinical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>Preclinical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>Preclinical trial</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>HSV-1</li> <li>Preclinical trial</li> <li>HSV-2</li> <li>Preclinical trial</li> <li>HSV-</li></ul>					<ul> <li>Stimulates an immune response by increasing the gB-elicited interferon (IFN)- γ, granzyme B and CD107a; and decreasing LAG-3, PD-1, and TIM-3</li> </ul>		switch in high locyte norming receiver and endothelial vascular addressin expression regulates lymphocyte homing and permits CD4+ CD3- cells to colonize lymph nodes.
Naked DNA vaccine       pSVL- HSV-1 gD, pRc/ CMV- HSV-1 gD       Intramuscular       Preclinical trial       HSV-1       Reduces serum anti-gD antibody, anti-HSV1 neutralizing antibody and anti-gD ELISA responses       Provides low protection against HSV-1       Not a useful alternative of a gD subunit vaccine       (32) Mackay CR, Au Ringler DJ, Butcher migration properties tissue homing T cellingt be migration properties tissue homing T cellingt be migration properties.         pDNA encoding HSV-2 gD2       Intramuscular       Clinicaltrial       HSV-1-/HSV-2-, HSV-1-/HSV-2-, HSV-1-/HSV-2-       Provides safe and well tolerated with no dose-limiting toxicities       Provides safe and well tolerated with no dose-limiting toxicities       Provides safe and well tolerated with no dose-limiting toxicities       Provides safe and well tolerated with no dose-limiting toxicities       Provides safe and well tolerated with no dose-limiting toxicities       Provides safe and well tolerated with no dose-limiting toxicities       Provides safe and well tolerated with no dose-limiting toxicities       Provides fully protection against lefthal intravaginal HSV-2 infection       Provides strong HSV-2 virion- specific gand neutralizing antibody responses       Provides fully protection against lefthal intravaginal HSV-2 infection       Provides fully protection against lefthal intravaginal HSV-2 infection       Provides fully protection against lefthal intravaginal HSV-2 infection       Provides strong					<ul> <li>Gives protection against ocular HSV-1 challenge by reducing ocular neovascularization and suppressing perioheral nerve virus reolication</li> </ul>		11024 (1996).
pDNA encoding HSV-2 gD2       Intramuscular       Clinicaltrial       HSV-1-/HSV-2-, HSV-1+/HSV-2-       • Gives non- specific changes in ELISA and neutralization antibody titers       • Produces adverse events that are mostly local site reactions       (33) Abitorabi MA, N Osorio O, Butcher E events on formin recirculating lympho- peripheral, and lung 3111-317 (1996).         pDNAs encoding HSV-2 gD2       Subcutaneous       Preclinical trial       HSV-2       • Provides fully protection against lethal intravaginal HSV-2 infection       • Should be studied in a greater number of       (34) won Andrian Uhr (2000).	pSVL- HSV-1 gD, pRc/ Ir CMV- HSV-1 gD	Intramuscular	Preclinical trial	HSV-1	<ul> <li>Reduces serum anti-gD antibody, anti-HSV1 neutralizing antibody and anti- gD FLISA responses</li> </ul>	<ul><li>Provides low protection against HSV</li><li>Not a useful alternative of a gD subu</li></ul>	<ul> <li>(32) Mackay CR, Andrew DP, Briskin M, Ringler DJ, Butcher EC. Phenotype, and migration properties of three major subsets of</li> </ul>
pDNA encoding HSV-2 gD2       Intramuscular       Clinicaltrial       HSV-1-/HSV-2-, HSV-1+/HSV-2-       •       Provides safe and well tolerated with no dose-limiting toxicities       •       Produces adverse events that are mostly local site reactions       (33) Abitorabi MA, I Osorio O, Butcher E         pDNAs encoding HSV-2 gD2       Subcutaneous       Preclinical trial       HSV-2       •       Provides safe and well tolerated with no dose-limiting toxicities       •       Produces adverse events that are mostly local site reactions       (33) Abitorabi MA, I Osorio O, Butcher E         pDNAs encoding HSV-2 gD2       Subcutaneous       Preclinical trial       HSV-2       •       Provides safe and well tolerated with no dose-limiting toxicities       •       Produces adverse events that are mostly local site reactions       (33) Abitorabi MA, I Osorio O, Butcher E         pDNAs encoding HSV-2 gD2       Subcutaneous       Preclinical trial       HSV-2       •       Provides fully protection against lethal intravaginal HSV-2 infection       •       Should be studied in a greater number of       (34) von Andrian UH (2000).					<ul> <li>Gives non- specific changes in ELISA and neutralization antibody titers</li> </ul>	vaccine	tissue homing T cells in sheep. <i>Eur J Immuno</i> . 26(10), 2433-2439 (1996).
<ul> <li>Increases D2-specific cytotoxic T- cell and lymphoproliferati on immune responses</li> <li>Provides fully protection against lethal intravaginal HSV-2 infection</li> <li>Should be studied in a greater number of</li> <li>Should be studied i</li></ul>	pDNA encoding HSV-2 Ir gD2	Intramuscular	Clinicaltrial	HSV-1-/HSV-2-, HSV-1+/HSV-2-	Provides safe and well tolerated with no dose-limiting toxicities	Produces adverse events that     mostly local site reactions	are (33) Abitorabi MA, Mackay CR, Jerome EH, Osorio O, Butcher EC, Erle DJ. Differential expression of homing molecules on
pDNAs encoding HSV-2       Subcutaneous       Preclinical trial       HSV-2       Provides fully protection against lethal intravaginal HSV-2 infection       Should be studied in a greater number of subcutaneous       (34) you Andriau UP         gD2       Provides fully protection against lethal intravaginal HSV-2 infection       Should be studied in a greater number of subcutaneous       (34) you Andriau UP         (34) you Andriau UP       Produces strong HSV-2 virion- specific IgG and neutralizing antibody responses       guinea pigs       (30) you Andriau UP					<ul> <li>Increases D2-specific cytotoxic T- cell and lymphoproliferati on immune responses</li> </ul>		recirculating lymphocytes from sheep gut, peripheral, and lung lymph. <i>J Immunol</i> , 156(9)
Produces strong HSV-2 virion- specific guinea pigs coin. <i>N Engl J Med</i> , IgG and neutralizing antibody responses (2000).	pDNAs encoding HSV-2 ୁ gD2	Subcutaneous	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	<ul> <li>Provides fully protection against lethal intravaginal HSV-2 infection</li> </ul>	Should be studied in a greater num     of	(34) von Andrian UH, Mackay CR. T-cell function and migration. Two sides of the same
					<ul> <li>Produces strong HSV-2 virion- specific IgG and neutralizing antibody responses</li> </ul>	guinea pigs	coin. <i>N Engl J Med</i> , 343(14), 1020-1034 (2000).
Reduces all levels of recurrent HSV-2     significantly					Reduces all levels of recurrent HSV-2 significantly		
Reduces acute and recurrent disease,     recurrent lesion days and latent HSV-2     load					<ul> <li>Reduces acute and recurrent disease, recurrent lesion days and latent HSV-2 load</li> </ul>		
pDNA encoding HSV-2 Intramuscular Preclinical trial HSV-2 • Increases IgG antibody titers • Limited sensitivity for IgG assay Maintenance of T ce chronic antigen stim	pDNA encoding HSV-2 Ir gD2 coupled with Vaxfectin <sup>®</sup>	Intramuscular	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	Increases IgG antibody titers	Limited sensitivity for IgG assay	(35) Mackay LK, Wakim L, van Vliet CJ <i>et al.</i> Maintenance of T cell function in the face of chronic antigen stimulation and repeated

Combinatorial HSV Vaccine Strategies

Type of Vaccine	Vaccine Construct	Administration Route	Phase of Trial	Virus Subtype	Results	Limitations	Ref.
					Provides protection against lethal HSV-2 challenge		reactivation for a latent virus infection. J Immunol, 188(5), 2173-2178 (2012).
					<ul> <li>Reduces vaginal HSV load and viral latency in DRG</li> </ul>		
	pDNA encoding HSV-2 gD2 and UL46 and UL47 genes coupled with	Intramuscular	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	<ul> <li>Reduces viral replication and shedding in genital tract, latent HSV-2 DNA in DRG, and frequency of recurrent disease</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Includes additional controls including irrelevant plasmids coupled with Vaxfectin®</li> </ul>	(35) Mackay LK, Wakim L, van Vliet CJ <i>et al.</i> Maintenance of T Cell Function in the Face of Chronic Antigen Stimulation and Repeated
	Vaxfectin C				<ul> <li>Completely protects from both primary and recurrent genital disease</li> </ul>		Reactivation for a Latent Virus Infection. J Immunol, (2012).
	Codon-modified polynucleo-tide vaccine	Intradermal in forearm	Clinical trial	HSV-2	<ul> <li>Provides safe and well tolerated protection with no moderate or serious adverse effects</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Minimal antibodies increase with overall no statistical significance</li> <li>Insufficient number of subjects to</li> </ul>	(36) Mackay LK, Stock AT, Ma JZ et al. Long- lived epithelial immunity by tissue-resident memory T (TRM) cells in the absence of percention local action presentation. <i>Proc Natl</i>
					Increases immune cellular activity	determine a significant placebo effect	Acad Sci U S A, 109(18), 7037-7042 (2012)
	COR-1: (1) Full-length HSV-2 envelope gD2 and (2) truncated				<ul> <li>Presence of CD45<sup>+</sup>, CD4<sup>+</sup>, CD68<sup>+</sup> macrophages and polymorphonucle ar neutrophils at site of immunization</li> </ul>		
	a ubiquitin sequence				<ul> <li>Decreases mean number of outbreaks and viral shedding</li> </ul>		
	SLV-20: (1) pGX27 with tissue plasmino- gen	Intramuscular	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	<ul> <li>Inhibits pathological progression after viral infection</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Does not show any significant differences in immunoglobulin IgA, IgM,</li> </ul>	(37) Masopust D, Picker LJ. Hidden memories: frontline memory T cells and early
	activator (tpa), Flt3L and HSV-2 gB and UL39, (2)				Increases survival rate	IgG1 and IgG3 levels	pathogen interception. J Immunol, 188(12), 5811-5817 (2012)
	pGX27 with gD2, ICP0				Reduces virus titer and viral shedding		
	and ICP4 and (3) pGX27 with IL-12- IL-21 and MIP-1α				<ul> <li>Increases IFN- γ, CD4+, CD8+ and CD44hiCD62Lhi central memory T-cells expression</li> </ul>		
Protein-	HSV-2 gD2t with 3-O-	Intramuscular	Preclinical trial	HSV-1	Reduces latent viral load significantly	Not as effective as replication- defective	(38) Suni MA, Ghanekar SA, Houck DW <i>et al.</i>
based subunit vaccine	deacylated mono- phosphoryl				Provides protection against acute and recurrent HSV-2 infection	dl5-29	enhanced cytokine expression, proliferation, and cytotoxic activity in response to HCMV and HIV-1 antigens. <i>Eur J Immunol</i> , 31(8), 2512-2520 (2001).
	lipid A (MPL)- aluminum hydroxide (alum)	Subcutaneous	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	<ul> <li>Provides protection against acute and recurrent HSV infection and acute viral shedding</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Does not show significant reduction in the mean number of days with recurrent diseases</li> </ul>	(34) von Andrian UH, Mackay CR. T-cell function and migration. Two sides of the same coin. <i>N Engl J Med</i> , 343(14), 1020-1034 (2000)
					Reduces recurrent lesion days; sufficient to prevent most recurrent lesion	<ul> <li>Not sufficient to suppress early stages of</li> </ul>	(2000).
					episodes significantly	viral reactivation	
						<ul> <li>Produces low levels of HSV-2 virion-specific antibodies</li> </ul>	
	HSV-2 gD with MPL- alum	Intramuscular	Clinical trial	HSV-1-/HSV-2-, HSV-1 <sup>±</sup> /HSV-2 <sup>±</sup>	Presents a protective effect in those women who were HSV-1 and HSV-2 seronegative	<ul> <li>Ineffective in women who are seropositive for HSV-1 but seronegative for HSV-2</li> </ul>	(39) Jiang X, Chentoufi AA, Hsiang C <i>et al.</i> The herpes simplex virus type 1 latency associated transcript (LAT) can protect
						<ul> <li>Ineffective in men regardless of serologic status</li> </ul>	from Granzyme B induced apoptosis and CD8 T-cell killing, <i>J Virol</i> , (2010),
		Subcutaneous	Preclinical trial	HSV- 1 and HSV- 2	Gives almost complete protection against primary infection	Does not prevent mucosal infection	(40)
					Presents better protection against latent infection		
	HSV-2 gD and gB adjuvanted with a novel	Intramuscular	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	Increases HSV-2 antigen-specific CD8+ T- cell responses	N/A	(41) Jameson SC, Masopust D. Diversity in T cell memory: an embarrassment of riches.
	I - cell antigen and tegument protein UL40				Stimulates high titers of neutralizing     antibodies		immunity, 31(6), 859-871 (2009).
					Reduces HSV shedding in vagina, lesion scores and latent infection		
							Continued

(Continued)

Combinatorial HSV Vaccine Strategies

Type of accine	Vaccine Construct	Administration Route	Phase of Trial	Virus Subtype		Results	Limitations	Ref.
	HSV-2 gD2 and gB2 formulated in a nano- emulsion adjuvant (NE01- gD2/gB2)	Intranasal and intramuscular	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	•••	Increases neutralizing antibodies levels - Reduces acute and recurrent disease scores and shedding of virus Reduces detection of latent virus in DRG	Less efficiently induces neutralizing artibodies than inframuscular IgD2 wi MPL- alum vaccine	(42) Khan AA, Srivastava R, Spencer D et al. Phenotypic and Eurotonal Characterization of Herpes Simplex Virus Glycoportein B Epitope- specific Effector and Memory ODB-T T Cells from Ocular Herpes Symptomatic and Asymptomatic Individuals. <i>Journal of virology</i> ,
	Trivalent (gC2, gD2, gE2) subunit vaccine mixed with CpG and alum	Intramuscular	Preclinical trial	HSV-2	•	Produces antibodies that binds to gC2 • and blocks its ability to bind C3b for immune evasion	gC2 are not immunogenic Without adjuvant dumg natural HSV-2 infectio in humans or HSV-2 infected guinea	(2015). (43) Shin H, Iwasaki A. A vaccine strategy that protects against genital herpes by establishing local memory T cells. <i>Nature</i> , 491 (7424), 463-467 (2012).
		Intramuscular	Preclinical trial	HSV-1 and HSV-2	•	Increases HSV glycoprotein- specific antibodies which neutralizes HSV-1 and HSV-2	AV AV	(44) Khan AA, Srivastava R, Chentoufi AA <i>et al</i> . <i>al</i> . Bolstering the Number and Function of HSV-1-Specific CD8(+) Effector Memory T
					•	Provides remarkable durability of vaccine response (continues up to 21 months post- immunization)		Cells and Issue-Hesident Mermoy I Cells in Latently Infected Trigeminal Ganglia Reduces Recurrent Ocular Herpes Infection and Disease. J <i>Immunol</i> , 199(1), 156-203 (2017).
					•	Exhibits little to no viral replication		
					•	Absence of viral DNA in brains or trigeminal ganglia		
					•	Provides protection against nHSV (maternal immunization promotes transfer of neutralizing antibodies and protects		
					_	offspring trom disseminated disease, weight loss, anxiety-like behaviour, and mortality)		

nuclear localization signal (NLS) on the *ICP0* gene (0DeltaNLS), developed in 2010 by Halford and tested in mice and guinea pigs (69, 73–76); (5) The HSV2-gD27 mutant vaccine reported by Cohen in 2012 (77); (6) The HSV-2 gE2-del mutant vaccine reported by Friedman in 2012 (78); (7) The HSV-2 UL24 mutant tested in mice and guinea pigs reported by Visalli in 2014 (67); and (8) The HSV-1 VC2 mutant reported by Kousoulas in 2014 (79).

#### **Replication-Defective HSV Vaccines**

Replication-defective virus vaccines, also called DISC (Disabled Infectious Single Cycle) virus vaccines, are defective for one or more genes that are essential for viral genome replication or synthesis and assembly of viral particles. In normal cells, they express viral gene products but do not replicate to form progeny virions. Replication-defective HSV vaccines can stimulate immune responses but produce no progeny viral particles. However, because they do not replicate and spread in the host, replication-defective virus vaccines may be less immunogenic, specifically less T cell stimulators because they have a relatively limited capacity to solicit professional antigen presenting cells (i.e., B, macrophage, and dendritic cells), a prerequisite for the induction of CD4<sup>+</sup> and CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell responses.

The replication-defective HSV vaccines developed during the last 24 years include: (1) DISC HSV-1 vaccine tested in guinea pigs by McLean, back in 1996 (80); (2) This was followed by another DISC HSV-2 vaccines which consisted of gH-deleted HSV-2 mutant tested in guinea pigs for recurrent genital herpes and reported by McLean in 1997 (81); (3) The HSV-2 mutant engineered by Dr. Knipe back in 1997, by replacing the ICP8 gene of HSV-2 strain 186 with an ICP8-lacZ fusion gene from the HSV-1 HD-2 mutant strain. The resulting HSV-2 5BlacZ mutant was later tested in guinea pigs by the same group as reported in 2001 (61, 62), (4) The most studied replication-defective virus HSV-2 dl5-29 vaccine, was developed by Knipe in 2008 and tested in mice and guinea pigs by Cohen in 2010 (12, 59, 63, 82) and by Londono-Hayes in 2015 (14) and shown to be have a protective effect. Eventually, this vaccine progressed to human trials only to show unsuccessful results in a Phase 1 clinical trial conducted recently by Sanofi Pasteur; (5) The HSV-2 ACAM529 mutant tested in a mouse model of genital herpes challenge and reported by Knipe and others in 2010 and 2012 (12, 83, 84); (6) The HSV-1  $\Delta$  gK mutant tested in mouse model of herpes challenge and reported in 2013 by Kousoulas (85); (7) The HSV-1 CJ2-gD2 vaccine, a glycoprotein D-expressing replication-defective and dominant-negative HSV-1 recombinant viral vaccine, tested in mice guinea pigs and reported in 2011 (11) and 2014 by Yao (86); (8) The latest replication defective HSV vaccine is the HSV-2  $\Delta gD$  (gD1<sup>-/+</sup>) reported in 2015 by Herold and Jacobs group as being protective in a mouse model of genital herpes challenge (87). The efficacy of the HSV-2  $\Delta$ gD vaccine in prophylactic and therapeutic settings has yet to be evaluated in the guinea pig model of primary and recurrent genital herpes. Compared to clinical trials using adjuvanted subunit vaccines (e.g., the adjuvanted gD/gB

**FABLE 1** | Continued

vaccine trials), many live attenuated/replication defective vaccines-based Phase 1 trial trials, were either terminated or did not progress to Phase II, because of: (i) A lack of immunogenicity; and/or (ii) Concerns related to safety of using a live virus as vaccine, as detailed above.

#### **Subunit HSV Vaccines**

A variety of subunit HSV vaccine approaches have been developed including proteins, DNA and peptide epitope-based vaccines (88, 89). Traditional protein-based vaccines are safe compared to live-attenuated and replication-defective HSV vaccines. Recombinant soluble HSV-2 glycoprotein D (gD) has been the most promising subunit vaccine that went into extensive clinical evaluation. Over the past 25 years, there has been one Phase II therapeutic genital herpes vaccine and three Phase III clinical trials of prophylactic subunit vaccines, all using the HSV-2 gD (or mixed with gB in one trial) (90-95). Back in 1994, the first therapeutic vaccine trial delivered the gD with aluminum salt (i.e. Alum) adjuvant in 98 symptomatic genital herpes patients who reported 4 to 14 recurrences per year (96). Unfortunately, this vaccine reduced the frequency of recurrences by only 24% despite that the vaccine boosted neutralizing antibodies to HSV-2 four-fold over baseline levels (96). These disappointing results from the first therapeutic gD/Alum vaccine trial suggested that for therapeutic protection; a vaccine must: (1) Induce CD4<sup>+</sup> and CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell responses, in addition to neutralizing antibodies, (2) Incorporate HSV-2 antigens other than gD; and (3) Must test different adjuvants, other than Alum. Three years later in 1997, the Chiron vaccine trial used a combination of gD and gB delivered together with the MF59 Novartis' adjuvant, an oil-in-water emulsion of squalene oil, using the same target population of genital herpes patients as in the 1994 trial. This gB/gD/MF59 vaccine did not elicit T cell responses, produced high levels of neutralizing antibody to HSV-2, yet had only a 9% efficacy (94). This trial suggested that: (1) besides neutralizing antibodies, a protective vaccine must induce antiviral CD4<sup>+</sup> and CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell responses; (2) a therapeutic vaccine must incorporate HSV-2 antigens other than gB and gD; and (3) must test different adjuvants, other than Alum and MF59. Later, two GlaxoSmithKline (GSK) vaccine trials (one reported in 2004 and the other in 2012), used the gD protein delivered together with a different adjuvant, the 3-0-deacylated monophosphoryl lipid A (MPL), a TLR4 agonist (93) together with Alum (gD/MPL/Alum vaccine). The first trial enrolled discordant couples, who have regular partners with genital herpes, while the second trial enrolled HSV seronegative women who have multiple and random partners (93). The first trial, reported in 2004, showed a 74% efficacy against genital herpes disease caused by HSV-2 (93). Unfortunately, later, results using the same gD/MPL/Alum vaccine reported in 2012, showed only 58% efficacy against genital HSV-2 disease (13). The apparent contradictions in efficacy against genital HSV-2 disease, of the two GSK trials that used the same gD/ MPL/Alum vaccine, is puzzling. The difference in efficacy in the two clinical trials attributed to different populations enrolled in each trial (i.e. discordant couples vs. random seropositive women

with multiple partners) (13). In the first clinical trial, the distinguishing feature of discordant couples was that they were a highly selected group in which the uninfected partner is potentially repeatedly exposed to HSV by the infected partner. This likely increased risk of infection and disease, hence lowering the threshold of seeing a significant effect of the therapeutic vaccine. In other words, the attack rates of HSV-2 genital disease were high among discordant couples making easy to see a significant reduction following therapeutic vaccination. In contrast, the second clinical trial that enrolled random seropositive women, with multiple lifetime sexual partners, in which the attack rate and the risk of infection and disease was much lower and hence likely raised the threshold of seeing a significant effect of the therapeutic vaccine. Regardless of the targeted population, the first GSK vaccine trial that produced 74% protective efficacy also stimulated both T cells and neutralizing antibodies (13). In 2016-2018, a Genocea vaccine trial (designated as Gen-003) used a combination of ICP4 and gD2 truncated proteins with a novel adjuvant, named Matrix M-2 (MM-2) (89). Matrix M is a saponin-based adjuvant that has a balanced B and T cell immuno-stimulatory profile. This trial reported a significant reduction of recurrent herpes lesions and genital viral shedding (90-92). This protection appeared to correlate with blood-derived antiviral CD4<sup>+</sup> and CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell responses (90-92). Due to ethical and practical limitations, none of the vaccine clinical trials have investigated the local tissue resident CD4<sup>+</sup> and CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells in dorsal root ganglia (DRG) and vaginal mucosal tissues.

## MODIFIED RNA (MRNA) VACCINE PLATFORMS AGAINST HSV-1 AND HSV-2

RNA vaccines, during the current pandemic, have emerged as a versatile approach against emerging viral infections to overcome the challenges confronted with the conventional vaccine strategies <sup>1-7</sup>. mRNA is the carrier of the genetic information necessary for the endogenous proteins synthesis, it does not integrate into the genome and safely metabolized and eliminated by the cells <sup>8-10</sup>. RNA-based vaccines have been shown safe in animal models and in human clinical trials and trigger a strong innate immune response. Many strategies have been used to increase the delivery and immunogenicity of mRNA while diminishing innate immune sensing<sup>11</sup>. Free and protaminecomplexed mRNA were among the first approaches to provide robust antigen expression and immune-stimulation <sup>12-14</sup>. This vaccine set-up showed the ability to induce strong immunity and protective efficacy against lethal influenza or rabies viral infections in many animal models 4,15. The first ever prophylactic mRNA-based vaccine (CV7201) in healthy human volunteers was made against rabies. This vaccine was generally safe and led to the induction of neutralizing antibody that waned one year after the first vaccination <sup>8</sup>. The success of mRNA vaccines has greatly benefited from the development of lipid- and polymer-based nanoparticles that protect RNA from degradation, enhanced cell uptake and improve delivery to the

translational machinery. Currently, lipid nanoparticles (LNPs) are the most frequently used and effective agents for in vivo delivery of mRNA vaccines <sup>9,16,17</sup>. Recently, the Food and Drug Administration (FDA) issued an Emergency Use Authorization (EUA) for the Pfizer-BioNTech COVID-19 (BNT162b2) vaccine (Pfizer, Inc; Philadelphia, Pennsylvania), nucleoside-modified mRNA vaccine formulated lipid nanoparticle- encoding the spike glycoprotein of SARS-CoV-2, the virus that causes coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19)<sup>7</sup>. This technology has encouraged other groups working on vaccines against cancer and viral pathogens to use the NLP-formulated mRNA platform. Recently, the Friedman group<sup>18</sup> showed that nucleosidemodified mRNA in lipid nanoparticle vaccine encoding for glycoproteins gC, gD, and gE induced strong and protective immunity against acute and latent herpes simplex virus type 2 infection in mice. Indeed, and in a side-by-side experiment they compared two vaccine platforms: (1) Trivalent gC2/gD2/gE purified glycoproteins were given with adjuvants (CpG and Alum) <sup>19</sup>and (2) modified mRNA encoding the 3 glycoproteins formulated in lipid nanoparticles (LNP)<sup>20</sup>. The RNA was modified to increase the cellular uptake and prevent the innate immunity sensors from inhibiting the translation machinery <sup>21</sup>. The mRNA-LPN vaccine demonstrated to induce effective Tfollicular helper and germinal center B cell responses translated into high titers and durable antibodies responses <sup>22</sup> that outperform the glycoproteins-based vaccine in preventing HSV-1 and HSV-2 genital infection and in protecting mice and guinea pigs against intravaginal HSV-2 infection <sup>20</sup>.

# LESSONS LEARNED FROM PAST HSV VACCINE CLINICAL TRIALS

The vaccine clinical trials produced valuable lessons that should help improve future herpes subunit vaccines. Specifically, these trials emphasize four major gaps in our current knowledge: (1) The need to incorporate protective herpes protein Ags, other than gB and gD, in the development of a future herpes therapeutic vaccine (3); (2) The need to design a vaccine strategy that induces anti-viral CD4<sup>+</sup> and CD8<sup>+</sup> T cellmediated immunity (in addition to HSV-specific neutralizing antibodies) for a better protection against recurrent herpes (3). This includes exploring new adjuvants and antigen delivery systems, and (3) The need to develop a mucosal vaccine strategy that would induce strong tissue resident CD4<sup>+</sup> and CD8<sup>+</sup> T<sub>RM</sub> cells (beside mucosal antibodies such as IgA) that would reduce virus reactivation from latently infected dorsal root ganglia (DRG) and subsequent virus shedding in the genital tract and recurrent herpetic disease. This is because of the failure of past parenteral subunit vaccines that elicit systemic immune responses against HSV-2. Although most of these vaccine research trials have not been promising, we have gained a better understanding of the correlates of protective immunity for a therapeutic HSV vaccine, forming the platform for novel combinatorial vaccine strategies against HSV.

## Phenotypic and Functionally Differential HSV-Specific Memory CD8<sup>+</sup> T Cell Subsets in Asymptomatic and Symptomatic HSV Infected Individuals

Understanding the immune mechanisms by which seropositive asymptomatic individuals are protected from recurrent herpes disease is significantly important as exploiting it can elicit a T cellbased immune response in the mucosa lining the genital tract to prevent HSV acquisition. Recurrent genital herpes disease occurs following periodic reactivation of the virus that travels the axons of DRG neurons to re-infect the genital tract (GT), where lytic replication leads to herpetic lesions and transmission (15). In asymptomatic individuals (ASYMP) HSV reactivation never causes recurrent disease (16-18, 20). In symptomatic individuals (SYMP), HSV reactivation often causes painful recurrent genital disease (17, 19, 21, 22). Reports on HSV therapeutic vaccine trials have shown that both innate and adaptive immunity play an equal role in directing the right immune response to prevent disease by causing a low to noshedding of the virus. Our research group has explored the differential immune scenarios present in asymptomatic protected individuals that gives them the natural immunity to contain recurrence of herpes. The asymptomatic and symptomatic individuals are strikingly different in their HSVspecific CD8 T memory cell immune-profile. After resolution of primary genital herpes infection, a heterogeneous pool (in terms of anatomic distribution, phenotype and fu) of HSV-specific memory CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells develops (23) and can be divided into three major subsets: (1) effector memory  $CD8^+$  T cells (T<sub>EM</sub>) (2) central memory  $CD8^+$  T cells (T<sub>CM</sub>) (24) and (3) tissue-resident memory CD8<sup>+</sup> T (T<sub>RM</sub>) cells. The different CD8 memory T cell subsets in HSV infection is illustrated in Figure 1. Regarding anatomic distribution, effector memory CD8<sup>+</sup> T<sub>EM</sub> cells and central memory CD8<sup>+</sup> T<sub>CM</sub> cells circulate between lymphoid and non-lymphoid tissues, such as the DRG and GT (24). The third subset does not enter circulation, but is instead selectively retained in infected tissues, such as DRG (25-27) and GT (25, 28), as a tissue-resident memory CD8<sup>+</sup> T<sub>RM</sub> cells. These CD8<sup>+</sup> T<sub>RM</sub> cells are poised for immediate response to reactivation from DRG (25, 29) and inhibit virus replication at GT (25).  $T_{RM}$  cells have altered T cell trafficking patterns due to the down-regulation of T cell homing molecules CD62L and CCR7 (30-34). The phenotypic profile of T<sub>CM</sub> cells is CD8CD103<sup>low</sup>CD62L<sup>high</sup> CCR7<sup>high</sup>.  $T_{EM}$  cells are CD8<sup>+</sup>CD103<sup>low</sup>CD62L<sup>low</sup>CCR7<sup>low</sup>.  $T_{RM}$  cells are CD8<sup>+</sup>CD103<sup>high</sup>CD62L<sup>low</sup>CCR7<sup>low</sup>CD11a<sup>high</sup>CD69<sup>high</sup> (24, 35, 36).  $T_{\rm CM}$  and  $T_{\rm EM}$  cells, but not  $T_{\rm RM}$  cells, express CD103. T<sub>CM</sub> cells must proliferate and undergo differentiation for effector function (37–40). In contrast,  $T_{EM}$  and  $T_{RM}$  cells are already differentiated and poised for immediate effector function (41). We recently discovered that most HSV-specific CD8 T cells from ASYMP individuals expressed low levels of lymphoid homing markers (CD62L<sup>low</sup>CCR7<sup>low</sup>), suggesting that these T cells are predominantly of a  $\text{CD8}^+$  T<sub>EM</sub> cell subset. In contrast, most HSV-specific CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells from SYMP individuals are predominantly of  $T_{CM}$  cell subset (42). Moreover, a decline in the



reducing recurrent genital herpes disease. \*, represent virus.

number and function of memory CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells positively correlated with severe recurrent genital disease in SYMP individuals.

The critical role of antigen-specific CD8 T cells has been demonstrated in studies using various animal models (43, 44). We are now beginning to appreciate the differences observed in CD8 T cell memory population in symptomatic and asymptomatic HSV infected individuals, and understand the importance of stimulating tissue-resident memory T cells for prevention of HSV infection in the mouse model (44). T cellbased immunotherapeutic strategies to treat recurrent herpes infection and disease are emerging for HSV, and our laboratory has contributed significantly towards developing human asymptomatic CD8 T cell epitopes for HSV immunotherapy (20, 44, 97, 98). In the last fifteen years of vaccine development, we have succeeded in identifying new HLA-A2\*01 restricted "asymptomatic" human CD4<sup>+</sup> and CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell epitopes from HSV-1 gB and gD glycoproteins and from HSV-1 VP11/12 and VP13/14 tegument proteins. Ocular herpes models using HLA-A2\*01 restricted transgenic mouse and rabbits have shown that these asymptomatic human epitopes stimulated protective CD8 T cell responses (21, 99, 100). Presently, we are making significant headway with novel combinatorial approaches to

use these epitopes as a SAPN (self-assembling protein nanoparticle) with built-in flagellin domains as a therapeutic HSV vaccine.

## PRIME AND PULL VACCINES USING ADENOVIRAL VECTORS DELIVERING EPITOPES TOGETHER WITH T-CELL CHEMOKINES INTO HSV INFECTED TISSUES

Chemokines are naturally produced by our immune system and could serve as safer and reliable adjuvants (101). Memory CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells specific for HSV play an important role in inhibiting HSV-1 reactivation from TG and subsequent viral shedding in tears that trigger the recurrent corneal herpetic disease. The CXC chemokine ligand 10 (CXCL10)/CXC chemokine receptor 3 (CXCR3) pathways are critical in promoting T cell immunity against many viral infections (102). In a "prime and pull" strategy, a topical chemokine was applied to the genital mucosa after subcutaneous vaccination to pull HSV-specific CD8 T cells and was shown to be associated with decreased disease upon challenge with HSV-2 (103). The CXCL10/CXCR3 pathway also affects TG- and cornea-resident CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell responses to recurrent ocular herpes virus infection and disease (104). Chemokines can also be co-delivered in a DNA vaccine for immunomodulation. Adenovirus-CCL21 transduced class I peptide-pulsed DC, and autologous DC-adenovirus CCL21 vaccines are currently in Phase I clinical trials for the treatment of malignant melanoma and stage IIIB-IV or recurrent non-small lung cancer respectively while XCL1 along with the IL-2 gene (CHESAT tumor vaccine) is in a clinical trial for neuroblastoma (101). Pre-clinical studies in HSV have shown immuno-potentiation of DNA vaccines by co-delivery of chemokines such as CCR7 ligands and IL-8, RANTES delivered to the mucosa (105, 106). We are in the advent of testing multi-epitope vaccine that co-delivers chemokines using adenovirus vectors. A "Prime-Pull-Keep" Therapeutic Vaccine (PPK Vaccine) is being designed to boost Neutralizing IgG/IgA antibodies and boost the number and function of antiviral CD4<sup>+</sup> and CD8<sup>+</sup> T<sub>RM</sub> cells within the cervico genital muco-cutaneous (CGMC) and DRG tissues. The PPK vaccine is expected to help STOP the virus reactivation from latently infected DRG, virus shedding and virus replication in CGMC, thus curing or reducing recurrent genital herpes disease (Figure 1).

## Laser Adjuvants

As an alternative to currently used conventional adjuvants, the chemical- and biological-free laser-adjuvant offers a welltolerated, simple to produce method to enhance mass vaccination for widespread viral infections (107). Studies from our laboratory have reported that skin exposure of B6 mice with the FDA approved non-ablative fractional diode laser (PaloVia Laser), followed by an intradermal delivery of a HSV peptide vaccine, safely induced potent and sustained HSV-specific CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells, detected in both the draining lymph nodes (DLN) and in the vaginal mucosa (VM) (108). In the vaginal mucosa of lasertreated and peptide vaccinated mice, we observed more HSVspecific effector memory CD8 T cells. Following an intravaginal HSV-2 challenge, we found decreased genital herpes lesions and increased DC infiltrates around the laser-treated skin area. These findings have important implications for the development of efficient vaccine immunization strategies against HSV-1 and HSV-2.

# IMMUNE CHECKPOINT BLOCKADE COMBINED WITH THERAPEUTIC HERPES VACCINE

Total or partial loss of T cell function (dysfunction) occurs following repetitive HSV latent/reactivation cycles (109–111) and exposure to antigens is termed exhaustion (112) and is usually linked with expression of T cell co-inhibitory receptors: PD-1, TIM-3, LAG3 (CD223), TIGIT, PSGL-1, 2B4 (CD244), GITR, CTLA-4 (CD152), CD160, and BTLA (CD272) (113, 114). T cell dysfunction requires two signals: (1) T cell receptor (TCR) engaged by MHC presenting an HSV epitope (113); and a (2) T cell co-inhibitory receptor (e.g., PD-1) engaged by ligand (i.e., PDL-1). In humans, latent HSV in sensory ganglia is accompanied by chronic CD8 T cell infiltrates (115). A portion of viral reactivation in sensory ganglia appears to be controlled by CD8 T cell-mediated mechanisms (111, 116, 117). Recently, we compared the expression levels of eight known T cell coinhibitory receptors on blood-derived HSV-specific CD8 T cells from symptomatic and asymptomatic HSV infected individuals and discovered that, HSV-specific CD8 T cells from symptomatic individuals expressed significantly higher levels of T cell co-inhibitory receptors like PD-1, LAG-3, TIM-3 and TIGIT (Figure 1). This phenotype correlated with functional exhaustion of HSV-specific CD8 T cells in symptomatic individuals with increased virus titers and severe disease. In mice, like humans, HSV-1 latently infected sensory ganglia have chronic CD8 T cell infiltrates (118). HSV-specific CD8 T cells producing IFN- $\gamma$  and Granzyme B appear to suppress (or abort) induced viral reactivation in explanted mouse sensory ganglia (118, 119) and may similarly reduce detectable HSV-1 and HSV-2 reactivation in vivo (120-123). During acute (11 days) and latent (30 days) post-infection HSV-1infection of mice, most effector CD8 T cells from sensory ganglia simultaneously express high levels of 2 to 3 immune checkpoint receptors (e.g. PD-1 and LAG-3) (39, 111, 116, 117). This phenotype correlated with functional exhaustion of sensory ganglia-derived CD8 T cells and increased virus reactivation from infected sensory ganglia explants (39, 111, 116, 117).

Pembrolizumab and nivolumab are the first of the anti-PD-1 pathway family of checkpoint inhibitors to obtain FDA approval for the treatment of melanoma. The FDA has also granted approval of nivolumab for squamous cell lung cancer and Hodgkin lymphoma (HL), and MPDL-3280A, for bladder cancer and non-small cell lung cancer (124). From 2014-2017, the FDA approved several different anti-PD-1 mAbs opening the field of next vogues of so-called "immune checkpoint therapy mAbs" (125-127). Blocking the PD-1/PD-L1 (128-135) pathway in animal models demonstrated an improvement in CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell effector function against persistent viral infections (136). Recent reports show that the natural constitutive PD-L1 expression on corneal cells impacts the HSV-1 infection of corneas. Genetic deficiency in PD-L1 using B7-H12/2 mice and the use of anti-PD-L1 blocking Ab significantly enhanced HSV-1 clearance from corneas of C57BL/6 mice mediated mainly by monocytes/macrophages (137). Based on our preliminary data of PD-L1 and GAL-9 blockade, we hypothesized that blocking PD-1, LAG-3, TIGIT and/or TIM-3 immune checkpoint pathways will help in restoring the function of HSV-specific CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells in latently infected DRG and increasing efficacy and longevity of a therapeutic herpes vaccine.

# HERPES VACCINE- SAFETY EVALUATION

Safety concerns for vaccines include: (i) the potential inherent toxicities of the antigen and the adjuvants, as well as potential toxicities due to interactions of the components present in the final formulation; and (ii) the possibility that the vaccine induces inflammatory responses that may lead to undesired toxic side effects. Some adjuvants may elicit elevated levels of

proinflammatory cytokines and other mediators of toxicity, irrespective of the immune response against the antigen. Preclinical standard repeated-dose toxicology studies performed in animals will identify whether intrinsic toxicity and immunotoxicity are: (i) confined primarily to the sites of injection; (ii) caused by the delivery method (i.e., the side effects are seen in both control and vaccinated animals) or (iii) caused by the intended immune responses to the vaccine (i.e., side effects occur with greater frequency and severity in vaccinated animals compared to controls). (1) Parameters for monitoring of systemic toxicity: Toxicity studies, repeated-dose toxicity studies, address the potential for systemic toxicity including, but not limited to, the systemic effects on the immune system. A broad spectrum of information should be obtained from the toxicity study, and both in-life and postmortem data should be collected. This routinely includes careful monitoring of body weight and food consumption, body temperature, histopathology, clinical chemistry, hematology, coagulation parameters and acute phase reactants. (2) Parameters for monitoring of local reactogenicity: Local toxicity studies of intramuscularly administered vaccines should preferably be conducted in animals with sufficient muscle mass, (such as rabbits) to test the full human dose of the final vaccine formulation.

# CONCLUSIONS

Since most of the current HSV vaccine candidates were not promising individually in clinical trials, combinatorial vaccine approach seems to be the most appropriate in the present scenario to further advance HSV vaccine trials. Combinatorial application practically poses many problems and hence requires optimization in animal models. For example, one such approach optimized in the guinea pig model in our laboratory, is illustrated in **Figure 1**.

Results from clinical trials of the HSV vaccine indicate that it is essential to explore combinatorial approaches in the discovery of an effective therapeutic vaccine. Our long-term goal is to develop a long-lasting immunotherapeutic vaccine against genital herpes. HSV-specific CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells are critical in preventing HSV reactivations from neurons of DRG and in limiting the severity of GT inflammatory lesions by reducing HSV replication (138– 142). By harnessing the immune mechanisms active in seropositive asymptomatic individuals that make them "naturally" protected from recurrent herpes disease, we came up with a multiple-asymptomatic/protective epitope-based vaccine strategy, a promising HSV vaccine candidate when combined with other T cell-based immunotherapies like immune-checkpoint blockade or immunomodulation using various chemokines.

## **EXPERT REVIEW**

• The latest failures of most of the clinical herpes vaccines indicate that immunotherapeutic vaccine against HSV should be efficient in eliciting antigen-specific immune responses that contain reactivation of the virus, to control both

recurrent lesions and viral shedding. Our vaccine research approach is based on the understanding and harnessing of immune strategies that make the seropositive asymptomatic individuals "naturally" protected from recurrent herpes disease throughout their life. We realized that the best strategy for an effective HSV vaccine would be to elicit a T cell-based immune response that boosts HSV specific effector memory T cell functionalities in the mucosal lining to prevent HSV-1/HSV-2 acquisition/reactivation.

- Much remains unknown about the protective immune effector of herpes, however, improved knowledge of HSV immunoepidemiology, and immunopathology should help guide new vaccine strategies for HSV. In the last fifteen years of vaccine development, we have succeeded in identifying many protective "asymptomatic" human CD4<sup>+</sup> and CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell epitopes from HSV-1 gB and gD glycoproteins and from HSV-1 VP11/12 and VP13/14 tegument proteins. We are currently progressing with novel combinatorial approaches to use these epitopes as a SAPN with built-in flagellin domains as therapeutic HSV vaccine. A Prime-Pull-Keep Therapeutic Vaccine (PPK Vaccine) is designed to boost Neutralizing IgG/ IgA antibodies (Abs) and boost the number and function of antiviral CD4<sup>+</sup> and CD8<sup>+</sup>  $T_{RM}$  cells within the cervico genital muco-cutaneous (CGMC) and dorsal root ganglia (DRG) tissues. PPK vaccine is expected to help STOP the virus reactivation from latently infected DRG, virus shedding and virus replication in CGMC, thus curing or reducing recurrent genital herpes disease.
- Since most of the current HSV vaccine candidates were not promising individually in clinical trials, a combinatorial vaccine approach seems to be the most appropriate in the present scenario to further advance HSV vaccine trials. Combinatorial application practically poses many problems and hence requires optimization. We are currently optimizing these combinatorial approaches in animal models. We came up with multiple-asymptomatic/protective epitope-based vaccine strategy which will be a promising HSV vaccine candidate when combined with other T cell-based immunotherapy-like immune-checkpoint blockade or immunomodulation using various chemokines.

## AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

AC, ND, RS, SP, P-GC, and LB: conceived and designed the experiments, performed the experiments, contributed reagents, materials, and analysis tools. AC, ND, RS, SP, P-GC, LZ, HV, HC, KH-C, and LB wrote the paper. All authors contributed to the article and approved the submitted version.

#### FUNDING

This work is supported by Public Health Service Research R01 Grants EY026103, EY019896 and EY024618 from National Eye Institute (NEI) and R21 Grant AI158060, AI150091, AI143348, AI147499, AI143326, AI138764, AI124911 and AI110902 from National Institutes of allergy and Infectious Diseases (NIAID) (to LB), and in part by The Discovery Center for Eye Research (DCER) and the Research to Prevent Blindness (RPB) grant.

## REFERENCES

- Looker KJ, Magaret AS, May MT, Turner KM, Vickerman P, Gottlieb SL, et al. Global and Regional Estimates of Prevalent and Incident Herpes Simplex Virus Type 1 Infections in 2012. *PloS One* (2015) 10:e0140765. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0140765
- McQuillan G, Kruszon-Moran D, Flagg EW, Paulose-Ram R. Prevalence of Herpes Simplex Virus Type 1 and Type 2 in Persons Aged 14-49: United States, 2015-2016. NCHS Data Brief (2018) (304):1–8.
- Knipe DM, Corey L, Cohen JI, Deal CD. Summary and Recommendations From a National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases (NIAID) Workshop on "Next Generation Herpes Simplex Virus Vaccines". *Vaccine* (2014) 32:1561–2. doi: 10.1016/j.vaccine.2014.01.052
- Awasthi S, Friedman HM. Status of Prophylactic and Therapeutic Genital Herpes Vaccines. *Curr Opin Virol* (2014) 6C:6–12. doi: 10.1016/ j.coviro.2014.02.006
- Wald A, Link K. Risk of Human Immunodeficiency Virus Infection in Herpes Simplex Virus Type 2-Seropositive Persons: A Meta-Analysis. J Infect Dis (2002) 185:45–52. doi: 10.1086/338231
- Cunningham AL, Diefenbach RJ, Miranda-Saksena M, Bosnjak L, Kim M, Jones C, et al. The Cycle of Human Herpes Simplex Virus Infection: Virus Transport and Immune Control. *J Infect Dis* (2006) 194 Suppl 1:S11–8. doi: 10.1086/505359
- Samandary S, Kridane-Miledi H, Sandoval JS, Choudhury Z, Langa-Vives F, Chentoufi AA, et al. Associations of HLA-A, HLA-B and HLA-C Alleles Frequency With Prevalence of Herpes Simplex Virus Infections and Diseases Across Global Populations: Implication for the Development of an Universal CD8+ T-Cell Epitope-Based Vaccine. *Hum Immunol* (2014) 75 (8):7157–29. doi: 10.1016/j.humimm.2014.04.016
- Schiffer JT, Swan DA, Corey L, Wald A. Rapid Viral Expansion and Short Drug Half-Life Explain the Incomplete Effectiveness of Current Herpes Simplex Virus 2-Directed Antiviral Agents. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* (2013) 57:5820–9. doi: 10.1128/AAC.01114-13
- Sandgren KJ, Bertram K, Cunningham AL. Understanding Natural Herpes Simplex Virus Immunity to Inform Next-Generation Vaccine Design. *Clin Transl Immunol* (2016) 5:e94. doi: 10.1038/cti.2016.44
- Johnston C, Gottlieb SL, Wald A. Status of Vaccine Research and Development of Vaccines for Herpes Simplex Virus. *Vaccine* (2016) 34:2948–52. doi: 10.1016/j.vaccine.2015.12.076
- Akhrameyeva NV, Zhang P, Sugiyama N, Behar SM, Yao F. Development of a Glycoprotein D-Expressing Dominant-Negative and Replication-Defective Herpes Simplex Virus 2 (HSV-2) Recombinant Viral Vaccine Against HSV-2 Infection in Mice. J Virol (2011) 85:5036–47. doi: 10.1128/JVI.02548-10
- Reszka NJ, Dudek T, Knipe DM. Construction and Properties of a Herpes Simplex Virus 2 DI5-29 Vaccine Candidate Strain Encoding an HSV-1 Virion Host Shutoff Protein. *Vaccine* (2010) 28:2754–62. doi: 10.1016/ j.vaccine.2010.01.030
- Belshe PB, Leone PA, Bernstein DI, Wald A, Levin MJ, Stapleton JT, et al. Efficacy Results of a Trial of a Herpes Simplex Vaccine. N Engl J Med (2012) 366:34–43. doi: 10.1056/NEJMoa1103151
- Bernard MC, Barban V, Pradezynski F, de Montfort A, Ryall R, Caillet C, et al. Immunogenicity, Protective Efficacy, and Non-Replicative Status of the HSV-2 Vaccine Candidate HSV529 in Mice and Guinea Pigs. *PloS One* (2015) 10:e0121518. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0121518
- Ohashi M, Bertke AS, Patel A, Krause PR. Spread of Herpes Simplex Virus to the Spinal Cord is Independent of Spread to Dorsal Root Ganglia. J Virol (2011) 85:3030–2. doi: 10.1128/JVI.02426-10
- 16. Dasgupta G, Chentoufi AA, Kalantari M, Falatoonzadeh P, Chun S, Lim CH, et al. Immunodominant "Asymptomatic" Herpes Simplex Virus 1 and 2

# ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work is dedicated to the memory of late Professor Steven L. Wechsler "Steve" (1948-2016), whose numerous pioneering works on herpes infection and immunity laid the foundation to this line of research.

Protein Antigens Identified by Probing Whole-ORFome Microarrays With Serum Antibodies From Seropositive Asymptomatic Versus Symptomatic Individuals. J Virol (2012) 86:4358–69. doi: 10.1128/JVI.07107-11

- Dasgupta G, Nesburn AB, Wechsler SL, BenMohamed L. Developing an Asymptomatic Mucosal Herpes Vaccine: The Present and the Future. *Future Microbiol* (2010) 5:1–4. doi: 10.2217/fmb.09.101
- Chentoufi AA, BenMohamed L. Future Viral Vectors for the Delivery of Asymptomatic Herpes Epitope-Based Immunotherapeutic Vaccines. *Future Virol* (2010) 5:525–8. doi: 10.2217/fvl.10.44
- Schiffer JT, Abu-Raddad L, Mark KE, Zhu J, Selke S, Koelle DM, et al. Mucosal Host Immune Response Predicts the Severity and Duration of Herpes Simplex Virus-2 Genital Tract Shedding Episodes. *Proc Natl Acad Sci* U S A (2010) 107:18973–8. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1006614107
- Chentoufi AA, Binder NR, Berka N, Durand G, Nguyen A, Bettahi I, et al. Asymptomatic Human CD4+ Cytotoxic T-Cell Epitopes Identified From Herpes Simplex Virus Glycoprotein B. J Virol (2008) 82:11792–802. doi: 10.1128/JVI.00692-08
- Dervillez X, Qureshi H, Chentoufi AA, Khan AA, Kritzer K, Yu DC, et al. "Asymptomatic" HLA-A\*02:01-Restricted Epitopes From Herpes Simplex Virus Glycoprotein B Preferentially Recall Polyfunctional CD8+ T Cells From Seropositive Asymptomatic Individuals and Protect HLA Transgenic Mice Against Ocular Herpes. J Immunol (2013) 191:5124–38. doi: 10.4049/ jimmunol.1301415
- Dervillez X, Gottimukkala C, Kabbara KW, Nguyen C, Badakhshan T, Kim SM, et al. Future of an "Asymptomatic" T-Cell Epitope-Based Therapeutic Herpes Simplex Vaccine. *Future Virol* (2012) 7:371–8. doi: 10.2217/fvl.12.22
- Pope C, Kim SK, Marzo A, Masopust D, Williams K, Jiang J, et al. Organ-Specific Regulation of the CD8 T Cell Response to Listeria Monocytogenes Infection. J Immunol (2001) 166:3402-9. doi: 10.4049/ jimmunol.166.5.3402
- Gebhardt T, Whitney PG, Zaid A, Mackay LK, Brooks AG, Heath WR, et al. Different Patterns of Peripheral Migration by Memory CD4+ and CD8+ T Cells. *Nature* (2011) 477:216–9. doi: 10.1038/nature10339
- Nelson MH, Bird MD, Chu CF, Johnson AJ, Friedrich BM, Allman WR, et al. Rapid Clearance of Herpes Simplex Virus Type 2 by CD8+ T Cells Requires High Level Expression of Effector T Cell Functions. J Reprod Immunol (2011) 89:10–7. doi: 10.1016/j.jri.2011.01.013
- Bertke AS, Patel A, Imai Y, Apakupakul K, Margolis TP, Krause PR. Latency-Associated Transcript (LAT) Exon 1 Controls Herpes Simplex Virus Species-Specific Phenotypes: Reactivation in the Guinea Pig Genital Model and Neuron Subtype-Specific Latent Expression of LAT. J Virol (2009) 83:10007–15. doi: 10.1128/JVI.00559-09
- Schiffer JT, Corey L. Rapid Host Immune Response and Viral Dynamics in Herpes Simplex Virus-2 Infection. *Nat Med* (2013) 19:280–90. doi: 10.1038/ nm.3103
- Tang VA, Rosenthal KL. Intravaginal Infection With Herpes Simplex Virus Type-2 (HSV-2) Generates a Functional Effector Memory T Cell Population That Persists in the Murine Genital Tract. *J Reprod Immunol* (2010) 87:39– 44. doi: 10.1016/j.jri.2010.06.155
- van Lint A, Ayers M, Brooks AG, Coles RM, Heath WR, Carbone FR. Herpes Simplex Virus-Specific CD8+ T Cells can Clear Established Lytic Infections From Skin and Nerves and can Partially Limit the Early Spread of Virus After Cutaneous Inoculation. J Immunol (2004) 172:392–7. doi: 10.4049/ jimmunol.172.1.392
- 30. Rott LS, Briskin MJ, Andrew DP, Berg EL, Butcher EC. A Fundamental Subdivision of Circulating Lymphocytes Defined by Adhesion to Mucosal Addressin Cell Adhesion Molecule-1. Comparison With Vascular Cell Adhesion Molecule-1 and Correlation With Beta 7 Integrins and Memory Differentiation. J Immunol (1996) 156:3727–36.

- Mebius RE, Streeter PR, Michie S, Butcher EC, Weissman IL. A Developmental Switch in Lymphocyte Homing Receptor and Endothelial Vascular Addressin Expression Regulates Lymphocyte Homing and Permits CD4+ CD3- Cells to Colonize Lymph Nodes. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* (1996) 93:11019–24. doi: 10.1073/pnas.93.20.11019
- Mackay CR, Andrew DP, Briskin M, Ringler DJ, Butcher EC. Phenotype, and Migration Properties of Three Major Subsets of Tissue Homing T Cells in Sheep. Eur J Immunol (1996) 26:2433–9. doi: 10.1002/eji.1830261025
- Abitorabi MA, Mackay CR, Jerome EH, Osorio O, Butcher EC, Erle DJ. Differential Expression of Homing Molecules on Recirculating Lymphocytes From Sheep Gut, Peripheral, and Lung Lymph. J Immunol (1996) 156:3111–7.
- 34. von Andrian UH, Mackay CR. T-Cell Function and Migration. Two Sides of the Same Coin. N Engl J Med (2000) 343:1020–34. doi: 10.1056/ NEJM200010053431407
- Mackay LK, Wakim L, van Vliet CJ, Jones CM, Mueller SN, Bannard O, et al. Maintenance of T Cell Function in the Face of Chronic Antigen Stimulation and Repeated Reactivation for a Latent Virus Infection. *J Immunol* (2012) 188:2173–8. doi: 10.4049/jimmunol.1102719
- Mackay LK, Stock AT, Ma JZ, Jones CM, Kent SJ, Mueller SN, et al. Long-Lived Epithelial Immunity by Tissue-Resident Memory T (TRM) Cells in the Absence of Persisting Local Antigen Presentation. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* (2012) 109:7037–42. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1202288109
- Masopust D, Picker LJ. Hidden Memories: Frontline Memory T Cells and Early Pathogen Interception. J Immunol (2012) 188:5811–7. doi: 10.4049/ jimmunol.1102695
- Suni MA, Ghanekar SA, Houck DW, Maecker HT, Wormsley SB, Picker LJ, et al. CD4(+)CD8(dim) T Lymphocytes Exhibit Enhanced Cytokine Expression, Proliferation and Cytotoxic Activity in Response to HCMV and HIV-1 Antigens. *Eur J Immunol* (2001) 31:2512–20. doi: 10.1002/1521-4141(200108)31:8<2512::AID-IMMU2512>3.0.CO;2-M
- 39. Jiang X, Chentoufi AA, Hsiang C, Carpenter D, Osorio N, Benmohamed L, et al. The Herpes Simplex Virus Type 1 Latency Associated Transcript (LAT) can Protect Neuronal Derived C1300 and Neuro2A Cells From Granzyme B Induced Apoptosis and CD8 T-Cell Killing. J Virol (2010) 91(Pt 4):858-66. doi: 10.1128/JVI.01791-10
- Harari A, Enders FB, Cellerai C, Bart PA, Pantaleo G. Distinct Profiles of Cytotoxic Granules in Memory CD8 T Cells Correlate With Function, Differentiation Stage, and Antigen Exposure. J Virol (2009) 83:2862–71. doi: 10.1128/JVI.02528-08
- Jameson SC, Masopust D. Diversity in T Cell Memory: An Embarrassment of Riches. *Immunity* (2009) 31:859–71. doi: 10.1016/j.immuni.2009.11.007
- 42. Khan AA, Srivastava R, Spencer D, Garg S, Fremgen D, Vahed H, et al. Phenotypic and Functional Characterization of Herpes Simplex Virus Glycoprotein B Epitope-Specific Effector and Memory CD8+ T Cells From Ocular Herpes Symptomatic and Asymptomatic Individuals. *J Virol* (2015) 89(7):3776–92. doi: 10.1128/JVI.03419-14
- Shin H, Iwasaki A. A Vaccine Strategy That Protects Against Genital Herpes by Establishing Local Memory T Cells. Nat (2012) 491:463–7. doi: 10.1038/ nature11522
- 44. Khan AA, Srivastava R, Chentoufi AA, Kritzer E, Chilukuri S, Garg S, et al. Bolstering the Number and Function of HSV-1-Specific CD8(+) Effector Memory T Cells and Tissue-Resident Memory T Cells in Latently Infected Trigeminal Ganglia Reduces Recurrent Ocular Herpes Infection and Disease. *J Immunol* (2017) 199:186–203. doi: 10.4049/jimmunol.1700145
- 45. Khan AA, Srivastava R, Lopes PP, Wang C, Pham TT, Cochrane J, et al. Asymptomatic Memory CD8 T Cells: From Development and Regulation to Consideration for Human Vaccines and Immunotherapeutics. *Hum Vaccin Immunother* (2014) 10(4):845–63. 10. doi: 10.4161/hv.27762
- 46. Hashimoto M, Kamphorst AO, Im SJ, Kissick HT, Pillai RN, Ramalingam SS, et al. CD8 T Cell Exhaustion in Chronic Infection and Cancer: Opportunities for Interventions. *Annu Rev Med* (2018) 69:301–18. doi: 10.1146/annurev-med-012017-043208
- Lal H, Cunningham AL, Godeaux O, Chlibek R, Diez-Domingo J, Hwang SJ, et al. Efficacy of an Adjuvanted Herpes Zoster Subunit Vaccine in Older Adults. N Engl J Med (2015) 372:2087–96. doi: 10.1056/NEJMoa1501184
- Us D. [Herpes Simplex Virus Vaccine Studies: From Past to Present]. Mikrobiyol Bul (2006) 40:413–33.

- Corey L, Langenberg AG, Ashley R, Sekulovich RE, Izu AE, Douglas JM Jr, et al. Recombinant Glycoprotein Vaccine for the Prevention of Genital HSV-2 Infection: Two Randomized Controlled Trials. Chiron HSV Vaccine Study Group. Jama (1999) 282:331–40. doi: 10.1001/jama.282.4.331
- Bourne N, Bravo FJ, Francotte M, Bernstein DI, Myers MG, Slaoui M, et al. Herpes Simplex Virus (HSV) Type 2 Glycoprotein D Subunit Vaccines and Protection Against Genital HSV-1 or HSV-2 Disease in Guinea Pigs. J Infect Dis (2003) 187:542–9. doi: 10.1086/374002
- Prichard MN, Kaiwar R, Jackman WT, Quenelle DC, Collins DJ, Kern ER, et al. Evaluation of AD472, a Live Attenuated Recombinant Herpes Simplex Virus Type 2 Vaccine in Guinea Pigs. *Vaccine* (2005) 23:5424–31. doi: 10.1016/j.vaccine.2005.02.028
- Dutton JL, Li B, Woo WP, Marshak JO, Xu Y, Huang ML, et al. A Novel DNA Vaccine Technology Conveying Protection Against a Lethal Herpes Simplex Viral Challenge in Mice. *PloS One* (2013) 8:e76407. doi: 10.1371/ journal.pone.0076407
- 53. Wang K, Goodman KN, Li DY, Raffeld M, Chavez M, Cohen JI. A Herpes Simplex Virus 2 (HSV-2) gD Mutant Impaired for Neural Tropism Is Superior to an HSV-2 gD Subunit Vaccine To Protect Animals From Challenge With HSV-2. J Virol (2016) 90:562–74. doi: 10.1128/JVI.01845-15
- 54. Gilbert PB, Excler JL, Tomaras GD, Carpp LN, Haynes BF, Liao HX, et al. Antibody to HSV gD Peptide Induced by Vaccination Does Not Protect Against HSV-2 Infection in HSV-2 Seronegative Women. *PloS One* (2017) 12:e0176428. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0176428
- 55. Cappel R. Comparison of the Humoral and Cellular Immune Response After Immunization With Live, UV Inactivated Herpes Simplex Virus and a Subunit Vaccine and Efficacy of These Immunizations. *Arch Virol* (1976) 52:29–35. doi: 10.1007/BF01317862
- Metcalf JF. Protection From Experimental Ocular Herpetic Keratitis by a Heat-Killed Virus Vaccine. Arch Ophthalmol (1980) 98:893–6. doi: 10.1001/ archopht.1980.01020030887017
- Rajcáni J, Kutinová L, Vonka V. Restriction of Latent Herpes Virus Infection in Rabbits Immunized With Subviral Herpes Simplex Virus Vaccine. *Acta Virol* (1980) 24:183–93.
- Dudek T, Knipe DM. Replication-Defective Viruses as Vaccines and Vaccine Vectors. Virol (2006) 344:230–9. doi: 10.1016/j.virol.2005.09.020
- Hoshino Y, Pesnicak L, Dowdell KC, Lacayo J, Dudek T, Knipe DM, et al. Comparison of Immunogenicity and Protective Efficacy of Genital Herpes Vaccine Candidates Herpes Simplex Virus 2 DI5-29 and DI5-29-41L in Mice and Guinea Pigs. Vaccine (2008) 26:4034–40. doi: 10.1016/j.vaccine.2008.05.022
- Liu X, Broberg E, Watanabe D, Dudek T, Deluca N, Knipe DM. Genetic Engineering of a Modified Herpes Simplex Virus 1 Vaccine Vector. *Vaccine* (2009) 27:2760–7. doi: 10.1016/j.vaccine.2009.03.003
- 61. Da Costa XJ, Bourne N, Stanberry LR, Knipe DM. Construction and Characterization of a Replication-Defective Herpes Simplex Virus 2 ICP8 Mutant Strain and its Use in Immunization Studies in a Guinea Pig Model of Genital Disease. *Virol* (1997) 232:1–12. doi: 10.1006/viro.1997.8564
- Da Costa XJ, Morrison LA, Knipe DM. Comparison of Different Forms of Herpes Simplex Replication-Defective Mutant Viruses as Vaccines in a Mouse Model of HSV-2 Genital Infection. *Virol* (2001) 288:256–63. doi: 10.1006/viro.2001.1094
- 63. Diaz F, Gregory S, Nakashima H, Viapiano MS, Knipe DM. Intramuscular Delivery of Replication-Defective Herpes Simplex Virus Gives Antigen Expression in Muscle Syncytia and Improved Protection Against Pathogenic HSV-2 Strains. *Virol* (2018) 513:129–35. doi: 10.1016/ j.virol.2017.10.011
- 64. Hoshino Y, Pesnicak L, Dowdell KC, Burbelo PD, Knipe DM, Straus SE, et al. Protection From Herpes Simplex Virus (HSV)-2 Infection With Replication-Defective HSV-2 or Glycoprotein D2 Vaccines in HSV-1-Seropositive and HSV-1-Seronegative Guinea Pigs. J Infect Dis (2009) 200:1088–95. doi: 10.1086/605645
- Morrison LA. Replication-Defective Virus Vaccine-Induced Protection of Mice From Genital Herpes Simplex Virus 2 Requires CD4 T Cells. Virol (2008) 376:205–10. doi: 10.1016/j.virol.2008.03.010
- 66. Vagvala SP, Thebeau LG, Wilson SR, Morrison LA. Virus-Encoded B7-2 Costimulation Molecules Enhance the Protective Capacity of a Replication-Defective Herpes Simplex Virus Type 2 Vaccine in Immunocompetent Mice. *J Virol* (2009) 83:953–60. doi: 10.1128/JVI.02022-08

- 67. Awasthi S, Zumbrun EE, Si H, Wang F, Shaw CE, Cai M, et al. Live Attenuated Herpes Simplex Virus 2 Glycoprotein E Deletion Mutant as a Vaccine Candidate Defective in Neuronal Spread. J Virol (2012) 86:4586–98. doi: 10.1128/JVI.07203-11
- Brittle EE, Wang F, Lubinski JM, Bunte RM, Friedman HM. A Replication-Competent, Neuronal Spread-Defective, Live Attenuated Herpes Simplex Virus Type 1 Vaccine. J Virol (2008) 82:8431–41. doi: 10.1128/JVI.00551-08
- Royer DJ, Carr MM, Chucair-Elliott AJ, Halford WP, Carr DJ. Impact of Type I Interferon on the Safety and Immunogenicity of an Experimental Live-Attenuated Herpes Simplex Virus 1 Vaccine in Mice. J Virol (2017) 91 (7). doi: 10.1128/JVI.02342-16
- Spector FC, Kern ER, Palmer J, Kaiwar R, Cha TA, Brown P, et al. Evaluation of a Live Attenuated Recombinant Virus RAV 9395 as a Herpes Simplex Virus Type 2 Vaccine in Guinea Pigs. J Infect Dis (1998) 177:1143–54. doi: 10.1086/515278
- Stanfield BA, Rider PJF, Caskey J, Del Piero F, Kousoulas KG. Intramuscular Vaccination of Guinea Pigs With the Live-Attenuated Human Herpes Simplex Vaccine VC2 Stimulates a Transcriptional Profile of Vaginal Th17 and Regulatory Tr1 Responses. *Vaccine* (2018) 36:2842–9. doi: 10.1016/j.vaccine.2018.03.075
- 72. Sato A, Suwanto A, Okabe M, Sato S, Nochi T, Imai T, et al. Vaginal Memory T Cells Induced by Intranasal Vaccination are Critical for Protective T Cell Recruitment and Prevention of Genital HSV-2 Disease. J Virol (2014) 88:13699–708. doi: 10.1128/JVI.02279-14
- 73. Halford WP, Puschel R, Gershburg E, Wilber A, Gershburg S, Rakowski B. A Live-Attenuated HSV-2 ICP0 Virus Elicits 10 to 100 Times Greater Protection Against Genital Herpes Than A Glycoprotein D Subunit Vaccine. *PloS One* (2011) 6:e17748. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0017748
- Halford WP, Puschel R, Rakowski B. Herpes Simplex Virus 2 ICP0 Mutant Viruses are Avirulent and Immunogenic: Implications for a Genital Herpes Vaccine. *PloS One* (2010) 5:e12251. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0012251
- Geltz JJ, Gershburg E, Halford WP. Herpes Simplex Virus 2 (HSV-2) Infected Cell Proteins are Among the Most Dominant Antigens of a Live-Attenuated HSV-2 Vaccine. *PloS One* (2015) 10:e0116091. doi: 10.1371/ journal.pone.0116091
- Halford WP, Geltz J, Gershburg E. Pan-HSV-2 IgG Antibody in Vaccinated Mice and Guinea Pigs Correlates With Protection Against Herpes Simplex Virus 2. *PloS One* (2013) 8:e65523. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0065523
- 77. Wang K, Kappel JD, Canders C, Davila WF, Sayre D, Chavez M, et al. A Herpes Simplex Virus 2 Glycoprotein D Mutant Generated by Bacterial Artificial Chromosome Mutagenesis is Severely Impaired for Infecting Neuronal Cells and Infects Only Vero Cells Expressing Exogenous HVEM. J Virol (2012) 86:12891–902. doi: 10.1128/JVI.01055-12
- 78. Visalli RJ, Natuk RJ, Kowalski J, Guo M, Blakeney S, Gangolli S, et al. Vaccination With a HSV-2 UL24 Mutant Induces a Protective Immune Response in Murine and Guinea Pig Vaginal Infection Models. *Vaccine* (2014) 32:1398–406. doi: 10.1016/j.vaccine.2013.10.079
- 79. Stanfield BA, Stahl J, Chouljenko VN, Subramanian R, Charles AS, Saied AA, et al. A Single Intramuscular Vaccination of Mice With the HSV-1 VC2 Virus With Mutations in the Glycoprotein K and the Membrane Protein UL20 Confers Full Protection Against Lethal Intravaginal Challenge With Virulent HSV-1 and HSV-2 Strains. *PloS One* (2014) 9:e109890. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0109890
- McLean CS, Ni Challanain D, Duncan I, Boursnell ME, Jennings R, Inglis SC. Induction of a Protective Immune Response by Mucosal Vaccination With a DISC HSV-1 Vaccine. *Vaccine* (1996) 14:987–92. doi: 10.1016/0264-410X(95)00259-4
- Boursnell ME, Entwisle C, Blakeley D, Roberts C, Duncan IA, Chisholm SE, et al. A Genetically Inactivated Herpes Simplex Virus Type 2 (HSV-2) Vaccine Provides Effective Protection Against Primary and Recurrent HSV-2 Disease. J Infect Dis (1997) 175:16–25. doi: 10.1093/infdis/175.1.16
- Dudek T, Mathews LC, Knipe DM. Disruption of the U(L)41 Gene in the Herpes Simplex Virus 2 DI5-29 Mutant Increases its Immunogenicity and Protective Capacity in a Murine Model of Genital Herpes. *Virol* (2008) 372:165–75. doi: 10.1016/j.virol.2007.10.014
- Belagrave S, Hernandez H, Zhou C, Hamberger JF, Mundle ST, Catalan J, et al. Immunogenicity and Efficacy of Intramuscular Replication-Defective and

Subunit Vaccines Against Herpes Simplex Virus Type 2 in the Mouse Genital Model. *PloS One* (2012) 7:e46714. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0046714

- Mundle ST, Hernandez H, Hamberger J, Catalan J, Zhou C, Stegalkina S, et al. High-Purity Preparation of HSV-2 Vaccine Candidate ACAM529 is Immunogenic and Efficacious *In Vivo. PloS One* (2013) 8:e57224. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0057224
- Iyer AV, Pahar B, Chouljenko VN, Walker JD, Stanfield B, Kousoulas KG. Single Dose of Glycoprotein K (Gk)-Deleted HSV-1 Live-Attenuated Virus Protects Mice Against Lethal Vaginal Challenge With HSV-1 and HSV-2 and Induces Lasting T Cell Memory Immune Responses. *Virol J* (2013) 10:317. doi: 10.1186/1743-422X-10-317
- Zhang P, Xie L, Balliet JW, Casimiro DR, Yao F. A Herpes Simplex Virus 2 (HSV-2) Glycoprotein D-Expressing Nonreplicating Dominant-Negative HSV-2 Virus Vaccine is Superior to a Gd2 Subunit Vaccine Against HSV-2 Genital Infection in Guinea Pigs. *PloS One* (2014) 9:e101373. doi: 10.1371/ journal.pone.0101373
- Petro C, González PA, Cheshenko N, Jandl T, Khajoueinejad N, Bénard A, et al. Herpes Simplex Type 2 Virus Deleted in Glycoprotein D Protects Against Vaginal, Skin and Neural Disease. *Elife* (2015) 4:e06054. doi: 10.7554/eLife.06054
- Veselenak RL, Shlapobersky M, Pyles RB, Wei Q, Sullivan SM, Bourne N. A Vaxfectin((R))-Adjuvanted HSV-2 Plasmid DNA Vaccine is Effective for Prophylactic and Therapeutic Use in the Guinea Pig Model of Genital Herpes. *Vaccine* (2012) 30:7046–51. doi: 10.1016/j.vaccine.2012.09.057
- Skoberne M, Cardin R, Lee A, Kazimirova A, Zielinski V, Garvie D, et al. An Adjuvanted Herpes Simplex Virus 2 Subunit Vaccine Elicits a T Cell Response in Mice and is an Effective Therapeutic Vaccine in Guinea Pigs. *J Virol* (2013) 87:3930–42. doi: 10.1128/JVI.02745-12
- 90. Van Wagoner N, Fife K, Leone PA, Bernstein DI, Warren T, Panther L, et al. Effects of Different Doses of GEN-003, A Therapeutic Vaccine for Genital Herpes Simplex Virus-2, on Viral Shedding and Lesions: Results of a Randomized Placebo-Controlled Trial. J Infect Dis (2018) 218:1890–9. doi: 10.1093/infdis/jiy415
- Flechtner JB, Long D, Larson S, Clemens V, Baccari A, Kien L, et al. Immune Responses Elicited by the GEN-003 Candidate HSV-2 Therapeutic Vaccine in a Randomized Controlled Dose-Ranging Phase 1/2a Trial. *Vaccine* (2016) 34:5314–20. doi: 10.1016/j.vaccine.2016.09.001
- 92. Bernstein DI, Wald A, Warren T, Fife K, Tyring S, Lee P, et al. Therapeutic Vaccine for Genital Herpes Simplex Virus-2 Infection: Findings From a Randomized Trial. *J Infect Dis* (2017) 215:856–64. doi: 10.1093/infdis/jix004
- Stanberry LR. Clinical Trials of Prophylactic and Therapeutic Herpes Simplex Virus Vaccines. *Herpes* (2004) 11 Suppl 3:161A–9A.
- 94. Straus SE, Wald A, Kost RG, McKenzie R, Langenberg AG, Hohman P, et al. Immunotherapy of Recurrent Genital Herpes With Recombinant Herpes Simplex Virus Type 2 Glycoproteins D and B: Results of a Placebo-Controlled Vaccine Trial. J Infect Dis (1997) 176:1129–34. doi: 10.1086/ 514103
- Langenberg AG, Burke RL, Adair SF, Sekulovich R, Tigges M, Dekker CL, et al. A Recombinant Glycoprotein Vaccine for Herpes Simplex Virus Type 2: Safety and Immunogenicity [Corrected]. *Ann Intern Med* (1995) 122:889– 98. doi: 10.7326/0003-4819-122-12-199506150-00001
- 96. Straus SE, Corey L, Burke RL, Savarese B, Barnum G, Krause PR, et al. Placebo-Controlled Trial of Vaccination With Recombinant Glycoprotein D of Herpes Simplex Virus Type 2 for Immunotherapy of Genital Herpes. *Lancet* (1994) 343:1460–3. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(94)92581-X
- Chentoufi AA, Zhang X, Lamberth K, Dasgupta G, Bettahi I, Nguyen A, et al. HLA-A\*0201-Restricted CD8+ Cytotoxic T Lymphocyte Epitopes Identified From Herpes Simplex Virus Glycoprotein D. *J Immunol* (2008) 180:426–37. doi: 10.4049/jimmunol.180.1.426
- Kuo T, Wang C, Badakhshan T, Chilukuri S, BenMohamed L. The Challenges and Opportunities for the Development of a T-Cell Epitope-Based Herpes Simplex Vaccine. *Vaccine* (2014) 32:6733–45. doi: 10.1016/ j.vaccine.2014.10.002
- 99. Srivastava R, Khan AA, Garg S, Syed SA, Furness JN, Vahed H, et al. Human Asymptomatic Epitopes Identified From the Herpes Simplex Virus Tegument Protein VP13/14 (UL47) Preferentially Recall Polyfunctional Effector Memory CD44high CD62Llow CD8+ TEM Cells and Protect

Humanized HLA-A\*02:01 Transgenic Mice Against Ocular Herpesvirus Infection. J Virol (2017) 91:e01796-16. doi: 10.1128/JVI.01793-16

- 100. Khan AA, Srivastava R, Chentoufi AA, Geertsema R, Thai NT, Dasgupta G, et al. Therapeutic Immunization With a Mixture of Herpes Simplex Virus 1 Glycoprotein D-Derived "Asymptomatic" Human CD8+ T-Cell Epitopes Decreases Spontaneous Ocular Shedding in Latently Infected HLA Transgenic Rabbits: Association With Low Frequency of Local PD-1+ TIM-3+ CD8+ Exhausted T Cells. J Virol (2015) 89:6619–32. doi: 10.1128/ JVI.00788-15
- Mohan T, Zhu W, Wang Y, Wang BZ. Applications of Chemokines as Adjuvants for Vaccine Immunotherapy. *Immunobiology* (2018) 223:477–85. doi: 10.1016/j.imbio.2017.12.001
- Liu C, Luo D, Reynolds BA, Meher G, Katritzky AR, Lu B, et al. Chemokine Receptor CXCR3 Promotes Growth of Glioma. *Carcinogenesis* (2011) 32:129–37. doi: 10.1093/carcin/bgq224
- 103. Khan AA, Srivastava R, Vahed H, Roy S, Walia SS, Kim GJ, et al. Human Asymptomatic Epitope Peptide/CXCL10-Based Prime/Pull Vaccine Induces Herpes Simplex Virus-Specific Gamma Interferon-Positive CD107(+) CD8 (+) T Cells That Infiltrate the Corneas and Trigeminal Ganglia of Humanized HLA Transgenic Rabbits and Protect Against Ocular Herpes Challenge. J Virol (2018) 92. doi: 10.1128/JVI.00535-18
- 104. Srivastava R, Khan AA, Chilukuri S, Syed SA, Tran TT, Furness J, et al. CXCL10/CXCR3-Dependent Mobilization of Herpes Simplex Virus-Specific CD8(+) TEM and CD8(+) TRM Cells Within Infected Tissues Allows Efficient Protection Against Recurrent Herpesvirus Infection and Disease. J Virol (2017) 91:e00278-17. doi: 10.1128/JVI.00278-17
- 105. Sin J, Kim JJ, Pachuk C, Satishchandran C, Weiner DB. DNA Vaccines Encoding Interleukin-8 and RANTES Enhance Antigen-Specific Th1-Type CD4(+) T-Cell-Mediated Protective Immunity Against Herpes Simplex Virus Type 2 In Vivo. J Virol (2000) 74:11173–80. doi: 10.1128/ JVI.74.23.11173-11180.2000
- 106. Eo SK, Kumaraguru U, Rouse BT. Plasmid DNA Encoding CCR7 Ligands Compensate for Dysfunctional CD8+ T Cell Responses by Effects on Dendritic Cells. J Immunol (2001) 167:3592–9. doi: 10.4049/ jimmunol.167.7.3592
- 107. Kashiwagi S, Brauns T, Gelfand J, Poznansky MC. Laser Vaccine Adjuvants. History, Progress, and Potential. *Hum Vaccin Immunother* (2014) 10:1892– 907. doi: 10.4161/hv.28840
- 108. Lopes PP, Todorov G, Pham TT, Nesburn AB, Bahraoui E, BenMohamed L. Laser Adjuvant-Assisted Peptide Vaccine Promotes Skin Mobilization of Dendritic Cells and Enhances Protective CD8(+) TEM and TRM Cell Responses Against Herpesvirus Infection and Disease. J Virol (2018) 92. doi: 10.1128/JVI.02156-17
- 109. Frank GM, Lepisto AJ, Freeman ML, Sheridan BS, Cherpes TL, Hendricks RL. Early CD4(+) T Cell Help Prevents Partial CD8(+) T Cell Exhaustion and Promotes Maintenance of Herpes Simplex Virus 1 Latency. *J Immunol* (2010) 184:277–86. doi: 10.4049/jimmunol.0902373
- 110. Allen SJ, Mott KR, Zandian M, Ghiasi H. Immunization With Different Viral Antigens Alters the Pattern of T Cell Exhaustion and Latency in Herpes Simplex Virus Type 1-Infected Mice. J Virol (2010) 84:12315–24. doi: 10.1128/JVI.01600-10
- 111. Chentoufi AA, Dervillez X, Dasgupta G, Nguyen C, Kabbara KW, Jiang X, et al. The Herpes Simplex Virus Type 1 Latency-Associated Transcript Inhibits Phenotypic and Functional Maturation of Dendritic Cells. Viral Immunol (2012) 25(3):204–15. in press. doi: 10.1089/vim.2011.0091
- Wherry EJ. T Cell Exhaustion. Nat Immunol (2011) 12:492–9. doi: 10.1038/ ni.2035
- 113. Day CL, Kaufmann DE, Kiepiela P, Brown JA, Moodley ES, Reddy S, et al. PD-1 Expression on HIV-Specific T Cells is Associated With T-Cell Exhaustion and Disease Progression. *Nat* (2006) 443:350–4. doi: 10.1038/ nature05115
- 114. Anderson AC, Joller N, Kuchroo VK. Lag-3, Tim-3, and TIGIT: Co-Inhibitory Receptors With Specialized Functions in Immune Regulation. *Immunity* (2016) 44:989–1004. doi: 10.1016/j.immuni.2016.05.001
- 115. Held K, Eiglmeier I, Himmelein S, Sinicina I, Brandt T, Theil D, et al. Clonal Expansions of CD8(+) T Cells in Latently HSV-1-Infected Human Trigeminal Ganglia. J Neurovirol (2012) 18:62–8. doi: 10.1007/s13365-011-0067-9

- 116. Chentoufi AA, Kritzer E, Tran MV, Dasgupta G, Lim CH, Yu DC, et al. The Herpes Simplex Virus 1 Latency-Associated Transcript Promotes Functional Exhaustion of Virus-Specific CD8+ T Cells in Latently Infected Trigeminal Ganglia: A Novel Immune Evasion Mechanism. J Virol (2011) 85:9127–38. doi: 10.1128/JVI.00587-11
- 117. Allen SJ, Hamrah P, Gate D, Mott KR, Mantopoulos D, Zheng L, et al. The Role of LAT in Increased CD8+ T Cell Exhaustion in Trigeminal Ganglia of Mice Latently Infected With Herpes Simplex Virus 1. J Virol (2011) 85:4184– 97. doi: 10.1128/JVI.02290-10
- 118. Sheridan BS, Cherpes TL, Urban J, Kalinski P, Hendricks RL. Reevaluating the CD8 T-Cell Response to Herpes Simplex Virus Type 1: Involvement of CD8 T Cells Reactive to Subdominant Epitopes. J Virol (2009) 83:2237–45. doi: 10.1128/JVI.01699-08
- 119. Liu T, Khanna KM, Chen X, Fink DJ, Hendricks RL. CD8(+) T Cells can Block Herpes Simplex Virus Type 1 (HSV-1) Reactivation From Latency in Sensory Neurons. J Exp Med (2000) 191:1459–66. doi: 10.1084/ jem.191.9.1459
- 120. Liu T, Khanna KM, Carriere BN, Hendricks RL. Gamma Interferon can Prevent Herpes Simplex Virus Type 1 Reactivation From Latency in Sensory Neurons. J Virol (2001) 75:11178–84. doi: 10.1128/JVI.75.22.11178-11184.2001
- 121. Divito S, Cherpes TL, Hendricks RL. A Triple Entente: Virus, Neurons, and CD8+ T Cells Maintain HSV-1 Latency. *Immunol Res* (2006) 36:119–26. doi: 10.1385/IR:36:1:119
- Khanna KM, Lepisto AJ, Hendricks RL. Immunity to Latent Viral Infection: Many Skirmishes But Few Fatalities. *Trends Immunol* (2004) 25:230–4. doi: 10.1016/j.it.2004.02.010
- 123. Knickelbein JE, Khanna KM, Yee MB, Baty CJ, Kinchington PR, Hendricks RL. Noncytotoxic Lytic Granule-Mediated CD8+ T Cell Inhibition of HSV-1 Reactivation From Neuronal Latency. *Science* (2008) 322:268–71. doi: 10.1126/science.1164164
- 124. Mahoney KM, Rennert PD, Freeman GJ. Combination Cancer Immunotherapy and New Immunomodulatory Targets. Nat Rev Drug Discov (2015) 14:561–84. doi: 10.1038/nrd4591
- 125. Garon EB, Rizvi NA, Hui R, Leighl N, Balmanoukian AS, Eder JP, et al. Pembrolizumab for the Treatment of Non-Small-Cell Lung Cancer. N Engl J Med (2015) 372:2018–28. doi: 10.1056/NEJMoa1501824
- 126. Rizvi NA, Hellmann MD, Snyder A, Kvistborg P, Makarov V, Havel JJ, et al. Cancer Immunology. Mutational Landscape Determines Sensitivity to PD-1 Blockade in Non-Small Cell Lung Cancer. *Science* (2015) 348:124–8. doi: 10.1126/science.aaa1348
- 127. Rizvi NA, Mazieres J, Planchard D, Stinchcombe TE, Dy GK, Antonia SJ, et al. Activity and Safety of Nivolumab, an Anti-PD-1 Immune Checkpoint Inhibitor, for Patients With Advanced, Refractory Squamous Non-Small-Cell Lung Cancer (CheckMate 063): A Phase 2, Single-Arm Trial. Lancet Oncol (2015) 16:257–65. doi: 10.1016/S1470-2045(15)70054-9
- 128. Ishida M, Iwai Y, Tanaka Y, Okazaki T, Freeman GJ, Minato N, et al. Differential Expression of PD-L1 and PD-L2, Ligands for an Inhibitory Receptor PD-1, in the Cells of Lymphohematopoietic Tissues. *Immunol Lett* (2002) 84:57–62. doi: 10.1016/S0165-2478(02)00142-6
- 129. Iwai Y, Ishida M, Tanaka Y, Okazaki T, Honjo T, Minato N. Involvement of PD-L1 on Tumor Cells in the Escape From Host Immune System and Tumor Immunotherapy by PD-L1 Blockade. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U.S.A* (2002) 99:12293–7. doi: 10.1073/pnas.192461099
- 130. Agata Y, Kawasaki A, Nishimura H, Ishida Y, Tsubata T, Yagita H, et al. Expression of the PD-1 Antigen on the Surface of Stimulated Mouse T and B Lymphocytes. *Int Immunol* (1996) 8:765–72. doi: 10.1093/intimm/ 8.5.765
- 131. Kasagi S, Kawano S, Okazaki T, Honjo T, Morinobu A, Hatachi S, et al. Anti-Programmed Cell Death 1 Antibody Reduces CD4+PD-1+ T Cells and Relieves the Lupus-Like Nephritis of NZB/W F1 Mice. J Immunol (2010) 184:2337–47. doi: 10.4049/jimmunol.0901652
- Boenisch O, D'Addio F, Watanabe T, Elyaman W, Magee CN, Yeung MY, et al. TIM-3: A Novel Regulatory Molecule of Alloimmune Activation. *J Immunol* (2010) 185:5806–19. doi: 10.4049/jimmunol.0903435
- 133. Sehrawat S, Reddy PB, Rajasagi N, Suryawanshi A, Hirashima M, Rouse BT. Galectin-9/TIM-3 Interaction Regulates Virus-Specific Primary and Memory CD8 T Cell Response. *PloS Pathog* (2010) 6:e1000882. doi: 10.1371/ journal.ppat.1000882

- 134. Sehrawat S, Suryawanshi A, Hirashima M, Rouse BT. Role of Tim-3/ Galectin-9 Inhibitory Interaction in Viral-Induced Immunopathology: Shifting the Balance Toward Regulators. J Immunol (2009) 182:3191–201. doi: 10.4049/jimmunol.0803673
- 135. Dai SY, Nakagawa R, Itoh A, Murakami H, Kashio Y, Abe H, et al. Galectin-9 Induces Maturation of Human Monocyte-Derived Dendritic Cells. *J Immunol* (2005) 175:2974–81. doi: 10.4049/jimmunol.175.5.2974
- 136. Sakuishi K, Apetoh L, Sullivan JM, Blazar BR, Kuchroo VK, Anderson AC. Targeting Tim-3 and PD-1 Pathways to Reverse T Cell Exhaustion and Restore Anti-Tumor Immunity. J Exp Med (2010) 207:2187–94. doi: 10.1084/jem.20100643
- 137. Jeon S, Rowe AM, Carroll KL, Harvey SAK, Hendricks RL. PD-L1/B7-H1 Inhibits Viral Clearance by Macrophages in HSV-1-Infected Corneas. *J Immunol* (2018) 200:3711–9. doi: 10.4049/jimmunol.1700417
- Banerjee K, Biswas PS, Rouse BT. Elucidating the Protective and Pathologic T Cell Species in the Virus-Induced Corneal Immunoinflammatory Condition Herpetic Stromal Keratitis. J Leukoc Biol (2005) 77:24–32. doi: 10.1189/jlb.0904486
- 139. Zhang X, Dervillez X, Chentoufi AA, Badakhshan T, Bettahi I, Benmohamed L. Targeting the Genital Tract Mucosa With a Lipopeptide/Recombinant Adenovirus Prime/Boost Vaccine Induces Potent and Long-Lasting CD8+ T Cell Immunity Against Herpes: Importance of Myd88. J Immunol (2012) 189:4496–509. doi: 10.4049/jimmunol.1201121
- 140. Laing KJ, Magaret AS, Mueller DE, Zhao L, Johnston C, De Rosa SC, et al. Diversity in CD8(+) T Cell Function and Epitope Breadth Among Persons With Genital Herpes. J Clin Immunol (2010) 30:703–22. doi: 10.1007/ s10875-010-9441-2
- 141. Zhang X, Chentoufi AA, Dasgupta G, Nesburn AB, Wu M, Zhu X, et al. A Genital Tract Peptide Epitope Vaccine Targeting TLR-2 Efficiently Induces Local

and Systemic CD8+ T Cells and Protects Against Herpes Simplex Virus Type 2 Challenge. *Mucosal Immunol* (2009) 2:129–43. doi: 10.1038/mi.2008.81

 Russell MW. Immunization for Protection of the Reproductive Tract: A Review. Am J Reprod Immunol (2002) 47:265–8. doi: 10.1034/j.1600-0897.2002.01099.x

**Disclaimer:** The authors alone are responsible for the views expressed in this review article, and they do not necessarily represent the decisions, policy, or views of the institutions, with which they are affiliated.

Conflict of Interest: Author HV was employed by TechImmune, LLC.

The remaining authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

**Publisher's Note:** All claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated organizations, or those of the publisher, the editors and the reviewers. Any product that may be evaluated in this article, or claim that may be made by its manufacturer, is not guaranteed or endorsed by the publisher.

Copyright © 2022 Chentoufi, Dhanushkodi, Srivastava, Prakash, Coulon, Zayou, Vahed, Chentoufi, Hormi-Carver and BenMohamed. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.