# Prevalence and risk factors of hypertension among Hui population in China <br> A systematic review and meta-analysis based on 30,565 study participants 

Yuanyuan Zhang, BS ${ }^{a}$, Xiangping Fan, BS ${ }^{\text {b }}$, Sijun Li, BS ${ }^{a}$, Yutan Wang, BS ${ }^{a}$, Sujie Shi, MS ${ }^{a}$, Huilan Lu, MS², Fanghong Yan, MS ${ }^{\text {a }}$, Yuxia Ma, MS ${ }^{\mathrm{a}, \text {.* }}$


#### Abstract

Background: Hypertension (HTN) has been considered as a health concern in developing countries. And Hui is a minority group with a large population in China. Its genetic background, inadequate access to health services, eating habits, religious belief, ethnic customs, and other factors differ from that of other ethnic groups, which may influence the prevalence of HTN. However, there is no current meta-analysis on the prevalence and risk factors of HTN among Hui population. Thus we conducted a systematic review aiming to estimate the pooled prevalence and risk factors of HTN among Hui population. Methods: PubMed, The Cochrane library, Web of science, CINAHL Complete, Weipu Database (VIP), China Knowledge Resource Integrated Database (CNKI), Wanfang Database, and SinoMed were systematically searched from inception to February 28, 2020 with publication language restricted to English and Chinese. We included cross-sectional, case-control, or cohort studies that focused on prevalence and risk factors of HTN among Hui population. Two investigators independently assessed the risk of bias of the studies included in the review using tools developed by JBI. Meta-analysis was conducted using Stata 12.0 software package. Results: Twenty-three studies were identified with a total of 30,565 study participants. The overall pooled prevalence of HTN was $28 \%$ ( $95 \%$ confidence interval [CI]: $24 \%-32 \%, I^{2}=98.8 \%, P<.001$ ). Stratified by gender, the pooled prevalence of HTN in Hui was $26 \%$ ( $95 \% \mathrm{Cl}: 20 \%-33 \%, I^{2}=97.6 \%, P<.001$ ) for males and $30 \%$ ( $95 \% \mathrm{Cl}: 23 \%-37 \%, I^{2}=98.3 \%, P<.001$ ) for females. Pooled prevalence of HTN in Hui was $2 \%$ ( $95 \% \mathrm{Cl}: 2 \%-6 \%, I^{2}=70.6 \%, P=.065$ ), $10 \%$ ( $95 \% \mathrm{Cl}: 3 \%-17 \%, I^{2}=83.7 \%, P<.001$ ), 22\% (95\% CI: $12 \%-32 \%, I^{2}=87.9 \%, P<.001$ ), $37 \%$ ( $95 \% \mathrm{Cl}: 20 \%-53 \%, I^{2}=94.0 \%, P<.001$ ), 39\% (95\%CI: $24 \%-54 \%, I^{2}=97.7 \%, P<.001$ ) and $42 \%\left(95 \% \mathrm{Cl}: 29 \%-56 \%, l^{2}=95.6 \%, P<.001\right.$ ) for those aged 18 to 29,30 to 39,40 to 49,50 to 59,60 to 69 , and $\geq 70$ years, respectively. Pooled prevalence of HTN in Hui was $22 \%$ ( $95 \% \mathrm{Cl}$ : $14 \%-29 \%, I^{2}=97.9 \%, P<.001$ ) in urban areas and $23 \%(95 \% \mathrm{Cl}$ : $16 \%-30 \%, I^{2}=95.8 \%, P<.001$ ) in rural areas. Daily salt intake (odd ratio [OR] $=3.94,95 \% \mathrm{Cl}: 3.03-5.13, I^{2}=90.2 \%, P<001$ ), family history ( $\mathrm{OR}=3.50,95 \% \mathrm{Cl}: 2.60-4.71, I^{2}=95.3 \%, P<.001$ ), smoking ( $\mathrm{OR}=1.84,95 \% \mathrm{Cl}: 1.61-2.09, I^{2}=59.6 \%, P<.001$ ), drinking (OR=1.74, 95\%CI: $1.26-2.39, I^{2}=95.3 \%, P=.001$ ), weekly meat intake ( $\mathrm{OR}=1.92,95 \% \mathrm{Cl}: 1.04-3.54, I^{2}=96.5 \%, P=.036$ ), body mass index ( $\mathrm{OR}=2.20,95 \% \mathrm{Cl}: 1.81-2.66, I^{2}=91.3 \%, P<.001$ ), and areas ( $\mathrm{OR}=1.29,95 \% \mathrm{Cl}: 1.10-1.51, I^{2}=81.5 \%, P=.001$ ) were risk factors of HTN in Hui, while physical exercise ( $\mathrm{OR}=0.76,95 \% \mathrm{Cl}: 0.66-0.88, I^{2}=62.7 \%, P<.001$ ) was protective factor. Conclusions: The pooled prevalence of HTN among Hui people was $28 \%$, daily salt intake, family history, drinking, smoking, weekly meat intake, body mass index, areas, and physical exercise were all risk factors for HTN among Hui population. Early screening and treatment of HTN among Hui population should be given due attention.


Abbreviations: $\mathrm{BMI}=$ body mass index, $\mathrm{Cl}=$ confidence interval, CNKI = China Knowledge Resource Integrated Database, CVD = Cardiovascular disease, DALYs = disability-adjusted life-years, HTN = hypertension, OR = odd ratio, SBP = systolic blood pressure, VIP $=$ Weipu Database, $\mathrm{WHO}=$ World Health Organization.

Keywords: Hui population, hypertension, prevalence, risk factors

[^0]
## 1. Introduction

Hypertension (HTN) is the most common disease in primary care. ${ }^{[1]}$ According to the World Health Organization (WHO) 2019 estimate, $\sim 1.13$ billion people worldwide are suffering from HTN. ${ }^{[2]}$ In China, HTN accounts for 160 million people. ${ }^{[3]}$ HTN is the greatest modifiable risk factor for cardiovascular disease (CVD), disability, and deaths worldwide. ${ }^{[4]}$ The WHO estimates that $54 \%$ of strokes and $47 \%$ of ischemic heart disease cases are the direct result of HTN, which is still on the rise. ${ }^{[5,6]}$ Moreover, as the largest contributor to global disability-adjusted life-years (DALYs), HTN accounted for $9.2 \% ~(95 \%$ uncertainty interval 8.3-10.2) of DALYs for men and $7.8 \% ~(6.9-8.7)$ of DALYs for women in 2015. ${ }^{[7]}$ In China, there are 10,667 people who lose their healthy life due to HTN for every 100,000 people, which has caused a heavy burden on families and society. ${ }^{[8]}$ In fact, HTN has been recognized as a "silent killer" due to its high mortality rates and lack of early symptoms. ${ }^{[9]}$

Hui is a minority with a large population in China. According to National Population Census of China in 2010, the Hui people has an estimated population of 10.59 million, which mainly spread in Ningxia, Gansu, Xinjiang, and Qinghai. ${ }^{[10]}$ Hui people's genetic background, living environment, eating habits, religious belief, ethnic customs, and other factors are different from other population of China. And studies have shown that the polymorphism at the $+2836 \mathrm{G}>\mathrm{A}$ site in the $a p o E$ gene is strongly correlated with the susceptibility to essential HTN in Hui people. ${ }^{[11]}$ In addition, Hui people believe in Islam. Due to religious beliefs, they do not eat pork in their diet, mainly beef and mutton. What' s more, the men of Hui nationality are forbidden to smoke or drink alcohol. ${ }^{[12]}$ These factors may cause the prevalence of HTN among Hui population to be different from that of Han nationality and other ethnic groups.

Up-to-date, although there are several original studies that report the prevalence and risk factors of HTN among Hui people, the data are not homogenous between different studies. The prevalence of HTN varies from $8.46 \%{ }^{[13]}$ to $60.7 \% .{ }^{[14]}$ What's more, the risk factors included in the study were also slightly different. And as yet no systematic review has provided pooled prevalence and risk factors of HTN among Hui people in China, the present study aims to fill this gap. We aimed to present a pooled prevalence level and risk factors of HTN among Hui population in China, so as to provide theoretical basis for the prevention and management of HTN.

## 2. Methods and analysis

### 2.1. Literature search strategy

Comprehensive electronic searches of PubMed, The Cochrane library, Web of science, CINAHL Complete, VIP, CNKI, Wanfang, and SinoMed were conducted to identify relevant articles for epidemiologic studies, from inception to February 2020. Articles were identified with following search terms ("hypertension" OR "high blood pressure") AND ("prevalence" OR "epidemiologic studies") AND "Hui population." The relevant reference lists retrieved from databases also was searched to obtain full-scale studies. Two researchers were entrusted to screen the titles and abstracts and reviewed the fulltext of the eligible articles. If there are different opinions, the third researcher makes final decisions. The search languages are English and Chinese.

### 2.2. Inclusion and exclusion criteria

Studies met the following inclusion criteria:

1. Observational studies (cross-sectional, case-control, or cohort studies) that were carried out among Hui people including more than 100 participants and reported prevalence and risk factors of HTN (or the data to calculate it).
2. Males or females of Hui people.
3. HTN has been diagnosed by systolic blood pressure/diastolic blood pressure (SBP/DBP) $\geq 140 / 90$ in studies.
4. Ascertainment of HTN was decided mmHg or kPa measured twice or the self-reported HTN and on antihypertensive medication as described by the seventh Joint National Committee. ${ }^{[15]}$
Studies were excluded if they:
5. were case series, reviews, policy reports, commentaries and editorials, and studies that did not provide data to estimate the prevalence and risk factors of HTN and
6. was non-essential HTN (renal HTN).

### 2.3. Data extraction

Two investigators independently screened the studies collected through the electronic searches for the present review extracted data, using a data extraction sheet prepared for the present study. The data extraction sheet was cross-checked and any disagreement was resolved by discussion for consensus. Information extracted included the followings: author information: first author's name and year of publication; study characteristics: study design (cross sectional, case-control, cohort), setting (urban and/or rural), sampling method (random vs non-random), data collection period, timing of data collection (prospectively vs retrospectively), response rate and methodological quality of the study; participants' characteristics: selection criteria, age, gender, HTN-related data; HTN characteristics: ascertainment of HTN, number of people with HTN, age and gender-specific data, and risk factors encountered.

### 2.4. Quality assessment

The included literature quality was assessed according to the criteria of observational studies recommended by JBI crosssectional quality assessment tool. ${ }^{[16]}$ The two reviewers independently evaluated the risk of bias, and quality disagreements were resolved by a third author.

### 2.5. Data analysis

The raw proportions of participants with HTN extracted from the included studies were recorded to perform pooled analyses. And random-effect model and fixed-effect model were used to calculate the prevalence and proportions. The prevalence from each study was expressed with exact $95 \%$ CI. In order to perform secondary analysis, subgroup analysis was employed. Subgroups were defined as differences in sex, age, and area differences (urban and rural).

In assessing the risk factors for the prevalence of HTN among Hui population, we extracted the OR and $95 \% \mathrm{CI}$ from included studies, then summarized if data were available from two or more studies. We entered the ratio measures of the (adjusted) effect as a $\log$ OR and the standard error of the $\log$ OR using generic inverse-variance weighting method.

Statistical heterogeneity among studies was quantified using $I^{2}$ statistic with a cutoff of $\geq 50 \%$. Besides, publication bias was assessed by testing for funnel plot asymmetry. Significance was set at a $P$ value of $<.1$. All statistical analyses were performed using Excel 2010 and Stata 12.0 software package.

### 2.6. Ethical approval

This systematic review does not require ethical assessment because only indirect literature will be included and evaluated.


Figure 1. Flow diagram of the study selection process.

Table 1
The quality of included studies.

| Study | Whether the sampling framework is suitable for the target population | Whether to take appropriate methods to extract research objects | Whether the sample size sufficient | Whether the object of study and the place of study are described in detail | Whether there is adequate coverage of the subjects for data analysis | Whether effective methods are used to identify disease or health problems | Whether to use standard and reliable methods to measure the subjects | Whether the data analysis method is appropriate | Whether the response rate is sufficient, if the response rate is low, whether to take appropriate treatment |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Y Zhang(2005) | Yes | Unclear | Yes | No | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes |
| J Y He(2010) | Yes | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes |
| H Liu(2010) | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes |
| L Ma(2010) | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Y Z Xiao(2010) | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes |
| L B Yu(2010) | Yes | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Y Zhao(2010) | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| J Gong(2011) | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| L Ma(2011) | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Y Zhang(2011) | Yes | Unclear | Unclear | No | No | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes |
| J Gong(2012) | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes |
| H Y Liu(2012) | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| L Zhang(2012) | Yes | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes |
| YP Zhang(2012) | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes |
| J X Liu(2013) | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| H GU(2015) | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| L H Fang(2015) | Yes | Unclear | Yes | No | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| G Q Zhao(2015) | Yes | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes |
| W Liang(2017) | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes |
| F F Zhao(2017) | Yes | No | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes |
| XWZhang(2018) | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| M Wang(2019) | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes |
| Q Zhang(2019) | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |

## 3. Results

### 3.1. Literature selection and methodological quality

The search of literature initially identified 386 potentially relevant references. The references included 131 English articles and 255 Chinese articles. According to inclusion and exclusion criteria, 23 studies ( $\mathrm{n}=30565$ ) fulfilled the criteria for inclusion in a quantitative synthesis (meta-analysis) ${ }^{[13,14,17-37]}$ (Fig. 1). The quality of the studies was evaluated by JBI cross-sectional quality assessment tool (Table 1).

### 3.2. Characteristics of the included studies

Of the remaining 23 articles we identified, included studies were published between May 2005 and April 2019. Descriptive data for the studies included in our analysis were summarized in Table 2. A total of 12 studies used random sampling methods, ${ }^{[14,19,21,22,27,28,31,32,34,35,36,37]} 1$ used stratified sampling methods, ${ }^{[32]} 5$ used cluster sampling methods ${ }^{[18,20,23,24,25,29]}$ and the other studies didn't mentioned the sampling methods. ${ }^{[13,17,26,30]}$ The sample size of included studies ranged from 102 to 4470 . All the studies were conducted among participants over 12 years of age. And all the included studies made diagnosis of HTN by the 7th Joint National Committee criteria (SBP/DBP $\geq 140 / 90 \mathrm{~mm} \mathrm{Hg}$ ). ${ }^{[15]}$

### 3.3. Meta-analysis

3.3.1. Prevalence of HTN. Overall prevalence of HTN from all 23 studies varies from $8.46 \%{ }^{[13]}$ to $60.7 \% .^{[14]}$ The pooled
prevalence of HTN among Hui people was $28 \%$ ( $95 \%$ CI: $24 \%-$ $\left.32 \%, I^{2}: 98.8 \%\right)$ (Fig. 2).
3.3.2. Gender-specific prevalence of HTN. Of all studies included in the current meta-analysis, 13 studies reported genderspecific data on prevalence of HTN among Hui people. As to male, the pooled prevalence was $26 \%$ ( $95 \%$ CI: $20 \%-33 \%, I^{2}$ : $97.6 \%)$. The pooled prevalence of HTN in female was $30 \%$ ( $95 \% \mathrm{CI}: 23 \%-37 \%, I^{2}: 98.3 \%$ ) (Fig. 3).
3.3.3. Age group-specific prevalence of HTN. Five studies provided data for the age group of 18 to 29 years, 30 to 39 years, 40 to 49 years, 50 to 59 years, 60 to 69 years, and $\geqq 70$ years. The overall prevalence of HTN in 18 to 29 years group was $2 \%$ ( $95 \%$ CI: $2 \%-6 \%, I^{2}: 70.6 \%$ ), 30 to 39 years group was $10 \% ~(95 \%$ CI: $3 \%-17 \%, I^{2}: 83.7 \%$ ), 40 to 49 years group was $22 \% ~(95 \% \mathrm{CI}$ : $12 \%-32 \%, I^{2}: 87.9 \%$ ), 50 to 59 years group was $37 \%$ ( $95 \%$ CI: $20 \%-53 \%, I^{2}: 94.0 \%$ ), 60 to 69 years group was $39 \%$ ( $95 \%$ CI: $\left.24 \%-54 \%, I^{2}: 97.7 \%\right)$, $\geqq 70$ years group was $42 \% ~(95 \%$ CI:29\%-56\%, $\left.I^{2}: 95.6 \%\right)($ Fig. 4).
3.3.4. Area-specific prevalence of HTN. Five studies reported area-specific prevalence of HTN in urban areas. ${ }^{[25,27-29,32]}$ The pooled prevalence of HTN in the urban setting was $22 \% ~(95 \%$ CI: $14 \%-29 \%, I^{2}: 97.9 \%$ ). Another five studies in the rural settings, ${ }^{[15,20-22,24]}$ whose summary prevalence of HTN was $23 \% ~\left(95 \% \mathrm{CI}: 16 \%-30 \%, I^{2}: 95.8 \%\right.$ ) (Fig. 5).
3.3.5. Risk factors. Risk factors pooling analysis suggests daily salt intake (OR $=3.94,95 \% \mathrm{CI}: 3.03-5.13, I^{2}=90.2 \%, P<.001$ ),


|  | Study | Years | Study area | Type of study | Sampling method | Sample size ( n ) |  |  | Age | Prevalence of HTN (\%) | Risk factors |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | Total | Male | Female |  |  |  |
| 1 | Y Zhang | 2004.11 | Xiji County | Cross-sectional | - | 306 | 148 | 158 | $\geq 12$ | 20.92 | - |
| 2 | JY He | 2007.04-2007.09 | Midong district of urumai | Cross-sectional | Stratified cluster | 845 | 412 | 433 | $\geq 18$ | 31.95 | Age, Obesity, Daily salt intake, HTN Family history |
| 3 | H Liu | 2008.08-2009.07 | Guyuan, Zhongwei, Shizushan, Yinchuan and Wuzhong City | Cross-sectional | Stratified cluster random | 4470 | - | - | $\geq 18$ | 18.5 | Age, Daily salt intake, Family history of vascular disease, Gender, Marital status, Education, Labor intensity, Smoking, drinking, Weekly meat intake, BMI and waist-to-hip ratio |
| 4 | L Ma | 2009.03-2010.02 | Yinchuan city | Cross-sectional | Stratified cluster | 1902 | 1047 | 855 | $\geq 18$ | 19.4 | Age, Obesity, Daily salt intake, Family history, Education, Smoking, drinking, Weekly meat intake, BMI, Exercise, high-oil diet |
| 5 | YZ Xiao | 2007 | Yunnan Province | Cross-sectional | Random | 172 | 74 | 98 | 15-69 | 34.3 | - E |
| 6 | LB Yu | 2008.05-2008.07 | Wulumuqi County | Cross-sectional | Stratified cluster random | 128 | 48 | 80 | $\geq 35$ | 28.1 | - |
| 7 | Y Zhao | 2008.05-2009.01 | Guyuan and Wuzhong city | Cross-sectional | Stratified cluster | 488 | 204 | 284 | 25-74 | 29.2 | - |
| 8 | $J$ Gong | 2008-2009 | Ningxia Rural | Cross-sectiona1 | Cluster | 2783 | - | - | $\geq 18$ | 16.6 | Gender, Age, Smoking, coronary heart disease, diabetes, family history |
| 9 | L Ma | - | Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region | Cross-sectiona1 | Stratified cluster | 1360 | 730 | 630 | $\geq 60$ | 46 | Age, Obesity, Daily salt intake, Family history, Education, drinking, Weekly meat intake, BMI, Exercise, high-oil diet, region |
| 10 | Y Zhang | 2008.11 | Xiji County | Xiji County | - | 306 | - | - | $\geq 18$ | 20.92 | - Ex |
| 11 | $J$ Gong | 2009.12-2010.10 | Guyuan, Zhongwei, Shizushan, Yinchuan and Wuzhong City | Cross-sectiona1 | Cross-sectiona1 | 1689 | - | - | $\geq 18$ | 21.91 | Age, HTN family history, diabetes, Education, Drinking, Smoking, BMI |
| 12 | HY Liu | 2008.08-2009.07 | Wuzhong City | Cross-sectiona1 | Cluster random | 3136 | 1384 | 1752 | $\geq 18$ | 20.7 | - |
| 13 | L Zhang | 2009.06-2009.07 | Yinchuan City | Cross-sectiona1 | Cluster | 102 | - | - | $\geq 60$ | 55.9 | Marital status, Education, Drinking, BMI and Exercise |
| 14 | YP Zhang | - | Haiyuan County in Ningxia | Cross-sectiona1 | - | 1818 | - | - | $\geq 35$ | 13.97 | - |
| 15 | JX Liu | 2009.10-2011.06 | Guyuan, Zhongwei, Shizushan, Yinchuan and Wuzhong City | Cross-sectiona1 | Stratified random | 1396 | 760 | 636 | $\geq 35$ | 8.46 | - |
| 16 | H Gu | 2005-2007 | Qinghai, Xinjiang and Inner Mongolia Yunnan | Cross-sectiona1 | Random | 1151 | 432 | 719 | 35-70 | 48 | - |
| 17 | LH Fang | - | Guyuan city | Cross-sectiona1 | Random | 2200 | 1200 | 1000 | 35-78 | 15.18 | - |
| 18 | GQ Zhao | - | Lanzhou city | Cross-sectiona1 | Stratified | 141 | 62 | 79 | $\geq 45$ | 16.31 | Gender, Age, Drinking, Smoking, Daily salt intake, Weekly meat intake, Exercise, Obesity, overweight, more vegetables, life pressure |
| 19 | W Liang | - | Gansu | Cross-sectiona1 | Stratified cluster random | 2790 | 1381 | 1409 | $\geq 45$ | 37.31 | Obesity, Daily salt intake, family history, Education, Drinking, Smoking, BMI, diabetes, Exercise, employment situation, high-oil diet |
| 20 | FF Zhao | 2010-2015 | Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region | Cross-sectiona1 | - | 145 | 0 | 145 | $60 \pm 8$ | 60.7 | - |
| 21 | XW Zhang | 2013.01-2014.03 | Gansu | Cross-sectiona1 | Stratified Random | 390 | - | - | >15 | 26.9 | Age, Gender, Marital status, Education, employment situation, region |
| 22 | M Wang | 2019.07-2019.09 | Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region | Cross-sectiona1 | Stratified Random | 208 | 132 | 76 | $\geq 20$ | 45.19 | - |
| 23 | Q Zhang | 2013.09-2014.12 | Gansu | Cross-sectiona1 | Stratified cluster random | 1458 | - | - | 20-74 | 22.63 | Age, Obesity, family history, Gender, Education, Drinking, BMI, diabetes, region |

BMI $=$ body mass index, $\mathrm{HTN}=$ hypertension.


Figure 2. Forest plot of prevalence of hypertension.
family history $\left(\mathrm{OR}=3.50,95 \% \mathrm{CI}: 2.60-4.71, I^{2}=95.3 \%\right.$, $P<.001)$, smoking $\left(\mathrm{OR}=1.84, \quad 95 \% \mathrm{CI}: 1.61-2.09, \quad I^{2}=\right.$ $59.6 \%, P<.001$ ), drinking ( $\mathrm{OR}=1.74,95 \% \mathrm{CI}: 1.26-2.39$, $I^{2}=95.3 \%, P=.001$ ), weekly meat intake ( $\mathrm{OR}=1.92,95 \% \mathrm{CI}$ : 1.04-3.54, $\left.I^{2}=96.5 \%, P=.036\right)$, body mass index (BMI) (OR $=$ $2.20,95 \% \mathrm{CI}: 1.81-2.66, I^{2}=91.3 \%, P<.001$ ) and areas ( $\mathrm{OR}=$ $1.29,95 \%$ CI: $1.10-1.51, I^{2}=81.5 \%, P=.001$ ) were risk factors for HTN, while physical exercise ( $\mathrm{OR}=0.76,95 \% \mathrm{CI}: 0.66-0.88$, $\left.I^{2}=62.7 \%, P<.001\right)$ was associated with a decreased risk of prevalence of HTN (Table 3).

### 3.4. Publication bias

Funnel plot and Begg's rank correlation were used to test the publication bias of the included literature. The results of funnel plot are shown in Figure 6, Begg's test, $Z=1.93, P=.054$. The results showed no publication bias.

## 4. Discussion

Based on 23 studies included in the current meta-analysis, which involved a total of 30,565 patients, the estimated prevalence rate
of HTN among Hui people was $28 \%$. The assessment of potential risk factors associated with HTN indicated statistically significant correlation with eight factors: daily salt intake, family history, smoking, drinking, weekly meat intake, BMI, areas, and physical exercise.
The pooled prevalence of HTN among Hui people documented in the current meta-analysis appeared to be lower than Tibetan $(40.68 \%)$ in China. ${ }^{[3]}$ However, this rate was higher than that of National HTN ( $23.2 \%$ ), ${ }^{[3]}$ and it is also significantly higher than other ethnic minorities, such as Manchu ( $23.1 \%$ ), Tujia (11.1\%) and Miao ( $9.2 \%$ ). ${ }^{[38]}$ Tibetans usually live at higher altitudes than Hui. Studies have shown that increased sympathetic activity in high-altitude residents may lead to HTN. ${ }^{[39]}$ In addition, hemoglobin, hematocrit, and white blood cells generally increased in plateau residents, which are related to the process of atherosclerosis and the occurrence and development of HTN. ${ }^{[40]}$ It may be one of the reasons that the prevalence rate of HTN of Hui nationality is lower than that of Tibetan nationality. Different eating habits and genetic background may contribute to the higher prevalence of HTN among Hui people. Hui people believe in Islam, therefore pork is forbidden to eat in


Figure 3. Forest plot of tratified prevalence of hypertension according to gender.

Hui diet, and they especially like to eat beef and mutton, which have high cholesterol and fat content. Our meta-analysis results also showed that BMI and weekly meat intake were risk factors for Hui nationality. Study have shown that the relative risk of HTN in people with BMI $\geq 24$ was $2.93 .{ }^{[41]}$ And eating meat more than 5 times a week can affect blood lipid levels, which can affect blood pressure levels. ${ }^{[25]}$ Foreign studies also have shown that obesity is highly correlated with chronic diseases such as HTN and CVD, especially the excessive distribution of visceral fat, which can change the levels of hormones, inflammation and endothelial cells. These variations cause changes in the sympathetic nervous system, renal function, and microvascular levels, which contribute to HTN. ${ }^{[42,43]}$ Therefore, it is necessary to advocate early weight control, and guide overweight and obese people to reduce weight. What's more, genome-based study
showed that the Hui and Han ethnic groups showed significant genetic heterogeneity in the size, number and size range of alleles. ${ }^{[44]}$ And Islamic laws forbid Hui people from marrying non-Muslim people, gradually forming a genetic "segregation group." Therefore, genetic heterogeneity between Han and ethnic minorities may also lead to variability in prevalence.

The present meta-analysis has demonstrated that prevalence of HTN differs between genders. Previous studies have shown that the incidence of HTN is higher in females than in males, which is different from the results of ordinary research. ${ }^{[45,46]}$ On one hand, it may be because some of the women in the study went through menopause. Study has shown that estrogen has a protective effect on the cardiovascular system in women, and premenopausal women have a lower cardiovascular risk than men, but estrogen levels drop significantly after menopause, the


Figure 4. Forest plot of tratified prevalence of hypertension according to age.
incidence of HTN and CVDs, such as coronary heart disease and stroke, increase significantly in women. ${ }^{[47]}$ On the other hand, most Hui women married early and often had many children in the traditional concept of Hui nationality. Their main duty was to take care of their husbands and children at home. And compared with the Han nationality, Hui women are under the bondage of dual culture. Life-style and pressure are associated with HTN. ${ }^{[48,49]}$ While the results of this study also show that the prevalence of HTN in rural areas is higher than that in urban areas, which may be due to the relatively insufficient publicity and education of HTN prevention and control to cause poor medical care delivery and poor behavior in seeking medical care in rural areas. ${ }^{[31,37]}$ But Some studies have pointed out that with the acceleration of urbanization in China, the difference between
urban and rural HTN prevalence rates in developed areas will narrow. ${ }^{[50]}$ Therefore, it is necessary to further study the regional differences in the prevalence of HTN among Hui people in the future.

The age-stratified analysis indicated that the prevalence of HTN in Hui nationality increased with age. The prevalence of HTN increased with age was found in the current meta-analysis as well as in other studies for general population in China. ${ }^{[9]}$ China's 2018 HTN guidelines point out that age is one of the risk factors for HTN, and the prevalence of HTN in China is still on the rise. ${ }^{[51]}$ Older patients with HTN have a higher risk of CVD and stroke than younger patients with HTN. What's more, HTN is the leading cause of death and disability in the elderly. This may be related to changes in cardiovascular function with age. It has


Figure 5. Forest plot of tratified prevalence of hypertension according to area.
been proved that, in the prime of life, the diastolic function of resistance vessels first decreases, which reduces the body's ability to regulate blood pressure, and eventually leads to the occurrence of HTN. ${ }^{[35]}$

Our findings also suggest that daily salt intake, physical exercise, smoking and drinking are fairly important factors of

HTN among Hui people. Hui people put salt in rice and porridge, and they also like to eat pickles and fried food. ${ }^{[18]}$ This leads to high salt intake in the hui population. Research shows that high salt diet is an important cause of HTN, taking salt intake $\geq 6 \mathrm{~g} /$ day was 4.604 times that of taking salt intake $<6 \mathrm{~g} /$ day about the risk of HTN. ${ }^{[18]}$ And this study also noted that physical exercise are

## Table 3

Risk factors of hypertension among Hui people.

| Risk factors | OR | 95\%CI | ${ }^{2}$ (\%) | $P$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Family history | 3.5 | 2.60-4.71 | 95.30 | <. 001 |
| Smoking | 1.84 | 1.61-2.09 | 59.60 | <. 001 |
| Drinking | 1.74 | 1.26-2.39 | 95.30 | . 001 |
| Weekly meat intake ( $<5$ times vs $\geqq 5$ times) | 1.92 | 1.04-3.54 | 96.50 | . 036 |
| Gender | 1.02 | 0.84-1.25 | 92.80 | . 827 |
| Areas (rural vs urban) | 1.29 | 1.10-1.51 | 81.50 | . 001 |
| Physical exercise | 0.76 | 0.66-0.88 | 62.70 | <. 001 |
| Employment situation | 1.88 | 0.71-5.00 | 96.90 | . 203 |
| BMI ( $\leqq 24$ vs $\geqq 24$ ) | 2.2 | 1.81-2.66 | 91.30 | <. 001 |
| Daily salt intake ( $<15 \mathrm{~g}$ vs $\geqq 15 \mathrm{~g}$ ) | 3.94 | 3.03-5.13 | 90.20 | $<.001$ |

[^1]

Figure 6. Results of publication bias funnel plot analysis.
protective factors for HTN. Long-term physical exercise can reduce blood pressure, prevention and treatment of CVD has been widely recognized. ${ }^{[25]}$ In addition, there is an interesting result that drinking alcohol and smoking are risk factors of HTN among Hui population. As is well known, Hui Muslims believe in Islam. And Quran rules that Hui people are forbidden to drink alcohol and smoking. The reason is that the study population included in our study are located in non-Hui cluster areas. Therefore, whether drinking alcohol and smoking are risk factors for HTN in Hui population should be further discussed in future studies. To this end, while respecting religious beliefs, knowledge popularization is carried out to encourage them to develop healthy lifestyle and dietary habits, so as to truly achieve primary prevention. At the same time, necessary intervention and health education should be carried out for high-risk groups to reduce the risk of HTN.

## 5. Strengths and limitations

A principal strength of the current is the employment of robust methodology. The comprehensive literature search was conducted in 8 electronic databases. To the best of our knowledge, the present study is the first to provide an assessment of the prevalence of HTN and related risk factors among Hui people in China. However, the potential limitations of the present study should be noted. First, all the included literatures are crosssectional studies, which may have some limitations due to the influence of research design. Secondly, the languages of the included studies were limited to English and Chinese, excluded studies in other languages, which limited the comprehensiveness
of the included literature. Future studies will be needed to overcome this limitation and interrogate the risk factors of HTN in a more comprehensive manner.

## 6. Conclusion

In conclusion, this systematic review found that the pooled prevalence of HTN among Hui population was $28 \%$. Daily salt intake, family history, smoking, drinking, weekly meat intake, BMI and areas were risk factors for HTN, while physical exercise was associated with a decreased risk of prevalence of HTN. These evidence-based data will facilitate further research in this area and contribute to better prevention and treatment HTN among Hui population. What's more, it is of great significance for the national government and medical institutions to formulate corresponding policies and measures as well as capital and personnel allocation. Therefore, it is suggested that the medical and health departments at all levels strengthen publicity, active prevention, early diagnosis and treatment, so as to reduce the related medical expenses and save the limited health resources.

## Author contributions

Conceptualization: Fanghong Yan, Yuxia Ma. Data curation: Xiangping Fan.
Formal analysis: Yuanyuan Zhang, Yutan Wang.
Methodology: Yuanyuan Zhang, Sijun Li, Huilan Lu.
Software: Sijun Li, Sujie Shi, Fanghong Yan.
Visualization: Yutan Wang.
Writing - original draft: Yuanyuan Zhang, Xiangping Fan.

## Writing - review \& editing: Yuxia Ma.

Appendix 1.docx, http://links.lww.com/MD2/A56

## References

[1] Naing C, Aung K. Prevalence and risk factors of hypertension in Myanmar: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Medicine (Baltimore) 2014;93:e100.
[2] World Health Organization. Hypertension. (2019-9-13) [2020-04-07]. Available at: https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/hyper tension. Accessed April 2020.
[3] Wang Z, Chen Z, Zhang L, et al. Status of hypertension in China: results from the China Hypertension Survey, 2012-2015. Circulation 2018;137:2344-56.
[4] Noubiap JJ, Essouma M, Bigna JJ, et al. Prevalence of elevated blood pressure in children and adolescents in Africa: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Lancet Public Health 2017;2: e375-86.
[5] Jordan J, Kurschat C, Reuter H. Arterial hypertension: diagnosis and treatment. Dtsch Arztebl Int 2018;115:557-68.
[6] Yang XH, Zhang WX, Shuai W, et al. The clinical diagnosis rate of hypertension in the subjects with newly-diagnosed hypertention identified by epidemiological. Chin J Hypertens 2018;26:1026-9.
[7] GBD 2015 Risk Factors CollaboratorsGlobal, regional, and national comparative risk assessment of 79 behavioural, environmental and occupational, and metabolic risks or clusters of risks, 1990-2015: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2015. Lancet 2016;388:1659-724.
[8] Wang Y, Peng X, Nie X, et al. Burden of hypertension in China over the past decades: systematic analysis of prevalence, treatment and control of hypertension. Eur J Prev Cardiol 2016;23:792-800.
[9] Ma YQ, Mei WH, Yin P, et al. Prevalence of hypertension in Chinese cities: a meta-analysis of published studies. PLoS One 2013;8: e58302DOI: 10.1371/journal.pone. 0058302 .
[10] Ma JW, Ma LJ. The change in population distribution of Hui people from 1982 to 2010. Northwest Populat J 2016;3:47-50.
[11] Yang Y, Xu JR, Liu XM, et al. Polymorphisms of +2836 G $>$ A in the apoE gene are strongly associated with the susceptibility to essential hypertension in the Chinese Hui population. Genet Mol Res 2014;13:1212-9.
[12] Zhao J, Song XC. On the origin and inheritance of Hui food taboos. Mod Women 2014;07:350.
[13] Liu JX, Li JS, Niu Y, et al. A comparative study of stroke risk factors between Hui and Han populations in Ningxia community. Lishizhen Med Mater Med Res 2013;24:2963-5.
[14] Zhao FF, Qu LG, Wu J, et al. analysis of risk factors of CHD and comparison of coronary artery disease between Han and Hui women in Ningxia region. J China Prescription Drug 2017;15:141-2.
[15] Chobanian AV, Bakris GL, Black HR, et al. The seventh report of the Joint National Committee on prevention, detection, evaluation, and treatment of high blood pressure: the JNC 7 report. JAMA 2003;289:2560-72.
[16] Munn Z, Moola S, Lisy K, et al. Methodological guidance for systematic reviews of observation alepidemiological studies reporting prevalence and cumulative incidence data. Int J Evid Based Healthc 2015;13:147-53.
[17] Zhang Y, Zhang JH, Chen ZF, et al. Investigation report on the prevalence of hypertension and related risk factors in poor rural areas. Chin Prim Healthc 2005;5:88-90.
[18] He JY, Xu XJ, Li XL, et al. Hypertensive epidemiological survey and its correlation factors analysis among village people of Hui nationality in Midong district of Urumqi. Chin J Cardiovasc Rehabil Med 2010;19:399-402.
[19] Liu H, Jia $\mathrm{SB}, \mathrm{Xu} \mathrm{QB}$, et al. The prevalence and risk factors of hypertension in Ningxia residents. J Ningxia Med Univ 2010; 32:388-92.
[20] Ma L, Jia SB, Gong J, et al. Epidemiological survey of hypertension among people in Yinchuan, Ningxia province. Guangdong Med J 2010;31:3118-21.
[21] Xiao YZ, Chen Y, Xu W, et al. Analysis on prevalence of hypertension and level of blood pressure in different ethnic minorities in Yunnan. Cardiocerebrovasc Dis Prev Treatment 2010;10: 26-27+51+89.
[22] Yu LB, Ji HM, Ma L, et al. Analysis of the prevalence rate of hypertension among rural population in Urumqi county. J Xinjiang Med Univ 2010;33:848-50.
[23] Zhao Y, Liu XY, Liu Y, et al. Prevalence, awareness, treatment and control of hypertension among rural adult residents in Ningxia. J Hyg Res 2010;39:726-30.
[24] Gong J, Jia SB, Ma L. Prevalence of hypertension and its risk factors among rural residents in Ningxia. Chin Prev Med 2011;12:227-9.
[25] Ma L, Ma XL, Gong J, et al. Epidemiological survey and correlation factor analysis in an elderly hypertensive population in Ningxia. Chin Heart J 2011;23:231-4.
[26] Zhang Y, Liu WX, Shi ZY, et al. Status and influencing factors of hypertension in rural Hui and Han residents in Xinying township, Xiji County, Ningxia. Ningxia Med J 2011;33:1222-3.
[27] Gong J, Jia SB, Ma XP, et al. Prevalence and influential factors of hypertension among urban residents in Ningxia. Chin J Public Health 2012;28:590-2.
[28] Liu HY, Ma P, Xiu QB, et al. Investigation and analysis of the prevalence rate, awareness rate, treatment rate and control rate of hypertension in Wuzhong City of Ningxia. J Pract Med 2012;28:313-6.
[29] Zhang L, Ning YH, Xia LJ, et al. Investigating the prevalence of hypertension and critical hypertension in community of Yinchuan City and analysis of risk factors. J Hyg Res 2012;41:680-2.
[30] Zhang YP, Ma M. The influence of living customs of Hui people on hypertension and its risk factors. Chin Community Doctors 2012;14:381.
[31] Gu H, Li W, Yang J, et al. Hypertension prevalence, awareness, treatment and control among Han and four ethnic minorities (Uygur, Hui, Mongolian and Dai) in China. J Hum Hypertens 2015;29:555-60.
[32] Fang LH, Hu SQ, Zhang JG, et al. Hypertension prevalence rate and blood pressure control of Hui people over 35 years old in Guyuan city. For All Health 2015;9:33.
[33] Zhao GQ, Zhang YX, Zhou Y, et al. Chronic disease risk factors and hypertension in the elderly of different ethnic groups. Chin J Gerontol 2015;35:6548-50.
[34] Liang W, Zhang XW, Wang QY, et al. Epidemiological investigation of hypertension in middle-aged and elderly residents in Gansu Province. Chin J Gerontol 2017;37:4103-5.
[35] Zhang XW, Ren HH, Yu J, et al. The demographic characteristics and risk factors of hypertension in Gansu province. Chin J Hypertens 2018;26:164-8.
[36] Wang M, Qiu YY, Ma PC, et al. Analysis of hypertension and related factors among Hui residents in Linxia Hui autonomous prefecture. World Latest Med Inform 2019;19: 31-32+37.
[37] Zhang Q, Wang DD, Liu YD, et al. Prevalence and influencing factors of hypertension among adults in Gansu. Chin Gen Pract 2019;22:1197202.
[38] Hu YS, Yao CH, Wang WZ, et al. Prevalence of hypertension in some ethnic groups in China in 2002. J Hyg Res 2006;35:537-75.
[39] Seravalle G, Mancia G, Grassi G. Role of the sympathetic nervous system in hypertensionand hypertensionrelated cardiovascular disease. High Blood Press Cardiovasc Prev 2014;21:89-105.
[40] Strand A, Gudmundsdottir H, Høieggen A, et al. Increased hematocrit before blood pressure in men who develop hypertension over 20 years. J Am Soc Hypertens 2007;1:400-6.
[41] Liao HJ, Jin SG, Jiang H. Meta-analysis on the relationship between body mass index (BMI) and hypertension in China. Chin J Prev Control Chronic Dis 2004;04:151-3.
[42] Safiri S, Kolahi AA, Hoy D, et al. Global, regional and national burden of rheumatoid arthritis 1990-2017: a systematic analysis of the Global Burden of Disease study 2017. Ann Rheum Dis 2019;78:1463-71.
[43] Shahabi A, Shafrin J, Zhao L, et al. The economic burden of switching targeted disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs among rheumatoid arthritis patients. J Med Econ 2019;22:350-8.
[44] Black ML, Wang W, Bittles AH. A genome-based study of the Muslim Hui community and the Han population of Liaoning Province, PR China. Hum Biol 2001;73:801-13.
[45] Wu Y, Huxley R, Li L, et al. Prevalence awareness treatment and control of hypertension in China: data from the China National Nutrition and Health Survey 2002. Circulation 2008;118:2679-86.
[46] Wang J, Zhang L, Wang F, et al. Prevalence, awareness, treatment, and control of hypertension in China: results from a national survey. Am J Hypertens 2014;27:1355-61.
[47] Zhao X, Yu J. Research progress of hypertension in postmenopausal women. Chin Gen Pract 2016;19:3243-7.
[48] Bosu WK, Aheto JMK, Zucchelli E, et al. Prevalence, awareness, and associated risk factors of hypertension in older adults in Africa: a systematic review and meta-analysis protocol. Syst Rev 2017;6:192.
[49] Tian T, Cai R, Peng JB, et al. Meta-analysis of the influence of occupational stress on hypertension. Chin J Gerontol 2018;38:1054-7.
[50] Wu YF, Ma GS, Hu YH, et al. The current prevalence status of body overweight and obesity in China: data from the China National Nutrition and health survey. Chin J Prev Med 2005;39:316.
[51] Writing Group of 2018 Chinese Guidelines for the Management of hypertension, Chinese Hypertension League, Chinese Medical Doctor Association Hypertension Committee, Hypertension Branch of China International Exchange and Promotive Association for Medical and Health Care, Hypertension Branch of Chinese Geriatric Medical AssociationGuidelines for the prevention and treatment of hypertension in China (revised in 2018). Chin J Cardiovasc Med 2019;24: 24-56.


[^0]:    Editor: Jose L. Flores-Guerrero.
    National Nature Science Foundation of China (grant: 71704071). The Fundamental Research Funds for the Central Universities (Izujbky-2020-10). The National Social Science Fund of China (grant: 20CGL053) and Nature Science Foundation of Gansu Province (20JR10RA603).
    The authors have no conflicts of interests to disclose.
    Supplemental digital content is available for this article.
    All data generated or analyzed during this study are included in this published article [and its supplementary information files].
    ${ }^{a}$ Evidence-Based Nursing Center, School of Nursing, Lanzhou University, ${ }^{b}$ Department of Nursing, the Third People's Hospital of Lanzhou, Lanzhou, China. * Correspondence: Yuxia Ma, Evidence-Based Nursing Center, School of Nursing of Lanzhou University, Lanzhou, 730000, China (e-mail: yuxiama@lzu.edu.cn). Copyright © 2021 the Author(s). Published by Wolters Kluwer Health, Inc.
    This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Non Commercial License 4.0 (CCBY-NC), where it is permissible to download, share, remix, transform, and buildup the work provided it is properly cited. The work cannot be used commercially without permission from the journal.
    How to cite this article: Zhang Y, Fan X, Li S, Wang Y, Shi S, Lu H, Yan F, Ma Y. Prevalence and risk factors of hypertension among Hui population in China: A systematic review and meta-analysis based on 30,565 study participants. Medicine 2021;100:18(e25192).
    Received: 30 July 2020 / Received in final form: 15 January 2021 / Accepted: 15 February 2021
    http://dx.doi.org/10.1097/MD.0000000000025192

[^1]:    $\mathrm{BMI}=$ body mass index, $\mathrm{Cl}=$ confidence interval, $\mathrm{OR}=$ odd ratio.

