## Commentary

# Impact of Smoking Status on Disease Severity and Mortality of Hospitalized Patients With COVID-19 Infection: A Systematic Review and Meta-analysis

## Antonios Karanasos MD, PhD<sup>o</sup>, Konstantinos Aznaouridis MD, PhD<sup>o</sup>, George Latsios MD, PhD, Andreas Synetos MD, PhD, Stella Plitaria MSc, Dimitrios Tousoulis MD, PhD, Konstantinos Toutouzas MD, PhD

First Department of Cardiology, University of Athens, Hippokration Hospital, Athens, Greece

Corresponding Author: Konstantinos P. Toutouzas, MD, PhD, First Department of Cardiology, University of Athens, Hippokration Hospital, 26 Karaoli and Dimitriou Str. 15562, Cholargos, Athens, Greece. Telephone: 30-2132088026; Fax: 30-2132088676; E-mail: ktoutouz@gmail.com

The recent COVID-19 pandemic has raised concern regarding risk factors associated with disease severity and case fatality. In this context, the association of smoking with severity and mortality of COVID-19 infection remains controversial.<sup>1</sup> We conducted this systematic review and meta-analysis to summarize relevant studies and quantify the impact of smoking on disease severity and mortality of hospitalized COVID-19 patients.

The primary outcome was a composite for disease severity including severe disease (including critical cases), ICU admission or invasive ventilation, and adverse disease progression or refractory disease. The secondary outcome was death. Inclusion criteria were as follows: (1) full-length original research publications in peer-reviewed journals in English; (2) inclusion of hospitalized adult patients with COVID-19 infection; (3) reported incidence of smoking stratified by a component of the primary outcome or mortality status; and (4) sample size > 20 patients. Details of literature search, data extraction, and statistical analysis are available in online Supplementary Material. Briefly, a systematic review of literature from September 1, 2019 to May 4, 2020 was performed, and additional data sources were identified through manually searching references. Two independent reviewers (A.K. and K.A.) recorded the incidence of smoking per group and performed an assessment of study quality using seven indicators (see online Supplementary Material for details).

The initial search identified 652 results. After screening titles and/ or abstracts, 166 articles remained for full-text assessment from which 146 were subsequently excluded. Two additional studies were identified by searching references. Overall, 22 studies met our inclusion criteria, 17 reporting on severity,<sup>2-18</sup> 4 on mortality,<sup>19-22</sup> and 1 on both<sup>23</sup> (Supplementary Table). Study quality was generally low (Figure 1; online Supplementary Material). For the primary outcome of disease severity, 18 studies were included with 6310 patients.<sup>2,4–19,21</sup> Smoking modestly increased the risk for the combined end point of disease severity (odds ratio [OR] = 1.34, 95% confidence intervals [CI] = 1.07–1.67,  $I^2 = 45\%$ ) (Figure 1A). Sensitivity analyses were consistent (online Supplementary Material). After restricting the analysis in studies explicitly reporting current smoking, the association of smoking with disease severity was not statistically significant (10 studies with 4152 patients; OR = 1.12, 95% CI = 0.84–1.50,  $I^2 = 38\%$ ).

There was a difference (p = .03) between Chinese studies (16 studies—4423 patients; OR = 1.48, 95% CI = 1.17–1.87;  $I^2 = 40\%$ )<sup>2,4,6–12,14–19,21</sup> and US studies (2 studies—1887 patients; OR = 0.65, 95% CI = 0.33–1.29;  $I^2 = 0\%$ ).<sup>5,13</sup> Visual inspection of the funnel plot did not reveal publication bias.

Meta-regression analyses are reported in online Supplementary Material. Age (Z = -0.91, p = .05) and diabetes (Z = -2.81, p = .005) had significant negative associations with log-OR of smoking for disease severity (Supplementary Figure). In studies with low (<15%) prevalence of diabetes, smoking increased the risk for severe disease (OR = 1.66, 95% CI = 1.26–2.18,  $I^2 = 34\%$ ), whereas in studies with high ( $\geq 15\%$ ) prevalence of diabetes, there was a trend for a negative association (OR = 0.70, 95% CI = 0.46–1.08,  $I^2 = 0\%$ ) ( $\chi^2$  for subgroup differences = 10.82, p = 0.001) (Supplementary Figure).

For mortality, five studies with 838 patients were included.<sup>3,9,20,22,23</sup> Smoking was not significantly associated with increased mortality (OR = 1.45, 95% CI = 0.78–2.72,  $I^2$  = 18%) (Figure 1B). Results were similar for studies explicitly reporting current smoking (2 studies—465 patients; OR = 1.57, 95% CI = 0.75–2.31,  $I^2$  = 0%).

Our main findings were (1) that smoking modestly increases the risk of severe disease in hospitalized COVID-19 patients, whereas

OXFORD

Α									
	Smoki	ng	No smo	king		Odds Ratio	Odds Ratio		Risk of Bias
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H, Fixed, 95% Cl	M-H, Fixed, 95% Cl		ABCDEFG
China									
Chen Q 2020	3	15	40	130	5.0%	0.56 [0.15, 2.10]			<b>000000</b>
Feng Y 2020	17	44	104	410	9.4%	1.85 [0.97, 3.54]			
Guan WJ 2020	29	137	143	948	21.7%	1.51 [0.97, 2.36]			<b>0000</b> 00
Hu L 2020	26	38	146	285	8.3%	2.06 [1.00, 4.25]			<b>0000000</b>
Huang C 2020	0	3	13	38	1.7%	0.27 [0.01, 5.62]			
Ji D 2020	6	19	34	189	3.2%	2.10 [0.75, 5.93]	+		
Li X 2020	18	41	247	503	15.9%	0.81 [0.43, 1.54]			
Li YK 2020	5	7	4	18	0.5%	8.75 [1.21, 63.43]			
Liu J 2020	2	5	11	35	1.3%	1.45 [0.21, 9.98]			
Liu W 2020	3	5	8	73	0.3%	12.19 [1.76, 84.31]	<u> </u>		$\bullet$ $\bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet$
Mo P 2020	4	6	81	149	1.6%	1.68 [0.30, 9.45]			
Qin C 2020	3	7	283	445	3.8%	0.43 [0.09, 1.94]			000000
Shi Y 2020	6	40	43	433	4.7%	1.60 [0.64, 4.03]			
Wan S 2020	1	9	39	126	3.5%	0.28 [0.03, 2.31]			
Wang R 2020	7	16	18	109	2.0%	3.93 [1.30, 11.93]			
Zhang JJ 2020	2	2	56	138		7.30 [0.34, 154.96]		<b></b>	
Subtotal (95% CI)	2	394	00	4029	83.1%	1.48 [1.17, 1.87]	•		
Total events	132		1270				, T		
Heterogeneity: Chi <sup>z</sup> = Test for overall effect:				²= 40%	þ				
USA									
Chow N 2020	5	27	452	1467	10.1%	0.51 [0.19, 1.36]			
Goyal P 2020 Subtotal (95% Cl)	6	20 <b>47</b>	124	373 <b>1840</b>	6.7% <b>16.9</b> %	0.86 [0.32, 2.29] 0.65 [0.33, 1.29]	•		
Total events	11		576						<u>Risk of bias legend</u>
Heterogeneity: Chi <sup>2</sup> =	0.55, df =	1 (P =	0.46); I <sup>2</sup> =	0%					(A) Dedicated study
Test for overall effect:	Z=1.23 (	P = 0.2	2)						(B) Systematic query
									(C) Definition of smoking
Total (95% CI)		441		5869	100.0%	1.34 [1.07, 1.67]	•		(D) Current smoking reported
Total events	143		1846						(E) Quantification
Heterogeneity: Chi <sup>2</sup> =	30.74, df:	= 17 (P	= 0.02);1	<sup>2</sup> = 45%	5			- 100	(F) Adjustment for confounde
Test for overall effect:		•					0.01 0.1 10	100	(G) Missing data
Test for subgroup diff			•	1 (P = 0	.03), I <sup>z</sup> = 1	79.7%	No smoking Smoking		(2)
B	Smoki		No smo	•		Odds Ratio	Odds Ratio		Risk of Bias
Study or Subgroup		•	Events		Weight	M-H, Fixed, 95% Cl	M-H, Fixed, 95% Cl		ABCDEFG
Chen T 2020	<u></u> 9	19	104	255	48.5%	1.31 [0.51, 3.33]			
Li YK 2020	9	19	104	255 18					
	3 1	12			4.1% 8.5%	6.00 [0.74, 48.90]			
Wang K 2020	1 0	. –		284		1.34 [0.16, 10.99]			
Yang X 2020 Zhou E 2020	U 5	2		50		0.11 [0.01, 2.50]	,		
Zhou F 2020	5	11	49	180	19.7%	2.23 [0.65, 7.63]			
Total (95% CI)		51		707	100.0%	1.45 [0.78, 2.72]			
	40	51	205	101	100.0%	1.45 [U.70, Z.7Z]			
Total events	18		205	4.000					
Heterogeneity: Chi² = Test for overall effect:	•		<i></i>	:18%			0.01 0.1 1 10 No smoking Smoking	100	

Figure 1. Forest plot and risk of bias tables examining in hospitalized COVID-19 patients the association of smoking with (A) the composite end point of disease severity in China and in US regions and (B) mortality. Boxes represent odds ratio (OR) and lines represent the 95% confidence interval [CI] for individual studies. Diamonds and their width represent pooled ORs and the 95% CI, respectively.

mortality data suggest a similar effect size but are currently inconclusive due to a low sample size and (2) that this increased risk for disease severity is more prominent in younger patients without diabetes.

Although smoking may enhance lung inflammation, increase epithelial cell permeability, and cause mucus overproduction and impaired mucociliary clearance,<sup>24</sup> its specific impact on COVID-19 disease is controversial. Hypotheses support both a potentially hazardous impact via overexpression of the ACE2 receptor gene<sup>24</sup> and a potentially protective effect via attenuation of the commonly observed in critically ill patients with COVID-19 infection excessive immune response.<sup>1</sup> Our findings demonstrate an adverse impact for smoking on disease severity of hospitalized COVID-19 patients, which was more pronounced in younger patients without

diabetes. Thus, our study provides evidence supporting the utilization of smoking cessation programs, especially in younger populations, as part of a strategy to minimize the adverse consequences of COVID-19 pandemic. Although smoking increased the risk of severe disease in hospitalized COVID-19 patients, it is not clear whether this hazard derives from nicotine itself or from other toxic components of tobacco smoke; therefore, a positive or neutral impact of nicotine alone on disease severity cannot be excluded based on the present study.

Although most patients were from China, a considerable number of US patients were included, notably with evidence of regional differences. This difference may be explained by the higher age and diabetes ratio of the non-Chinese population, which we showed to be important risk moderators, or could be due to further differences in comorbidities and care. Therefore, updated studies more representative of the global population are urgently needed.

Our study had several limitations. This meta-analysis is prone to bias attributed to the included retrospective studies, which relied on poor-quality data and did not specifically investigate the impact of smoking. However, due to the nature of the analysis and the need to quickly gain insights into COVID-19 infection mechanisms, it is unlikely that prospective, high-quality studies will be available soon. Moreover, study heterogeneity was low-to-moderate and sensitivity analyses were consistent. The number of included studies and patients for the end point of mortality is small and more data are required to properly examine this association. Finally, despite screening included studies for duplicate patients, we cannot exclude the possibility that some patients, especially in nationwide registries, were reported twice.

In summary, current data suggest a possible adverse impact of smoking on disease severity and mortality of hospitalized COVID-19 patients, which is more pronounced in younger patients without diabetes. Further data more representative of the global population are required to corroborate these preliminary findings.

#### **Supplementary Material**

A Contributorship Form detailing each author's specific involvement with this content, as well as any supplementary data, is available online at https://aca-demic.oup.com/ntr.

### **Declaration of Interests**

None declared.

#### References

- Changeux J-P, Amoura Z, Rey F, Miyara M. A nicotinic hypothesis for Covid-19 with preventive and therapeutic implications. *Qeios.* 2020. doi:10.32388/FXGQSB.2.
- Chen Q, Zheng Z, Zhang C, et al. Clinical characteristics of 145 patients with corona virus disease 2019 (COVID-19) in Taizhou, Zhejiang, China. *Infection*. 2020. doi:10.1007/s15010-020-01432-5.
- Feng Y, Ling Y, Bai T, et al. COVID-19 with different severities: a multi-center study of clinical features. Am J Respir Crit Care Med. 2020;201(11):1380–1388.
- Guan WJ, Ni ZY, Hu Y, et al. Clinical characteristics of coronavirus disease 2019 in China. N Engl J Med. 2020;382(18):1708–1720.
- Huang C, Wang Y, Li X, et al. Clinical features of patients infected with 2019 novel coronavirus in Wuhan, China. *Lancet*. 2020;395(10223):497–506.
- Li X, Xu S, Yu M, et al. Risk factors for severity and mortality in adult COVID-19 inpatients in Wuhan. J Allergy Clin Immunol. 2020;146(1):110–118.

- Li YK, Peng S, Li LQ, et al. Clinical and transmission characteristics of Covid-19 – a retrospective study of 25 cases from a single thoracic surgery department. *Curr Med Sci.* 2020;40(2):295–300.
- Mo P, Xing Y, Xiao Y, et al. Clinical characteristics of refractory COVID-19 pneumonia in Wuhan, China. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2020. doi:10.1093/cid/ ciaa270.
- Qin C, Zhou L, Hu Z, et al. Dysregulation of immune response in patients with COVID-19 in Wuhan, China. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2020. doi:10.1093/cid/ ciaa248.
- Wan S, Xiang Y, Fang W, et al. Clinical features and treatment of COVID-19 patients in northeast Chongqing. J Med Virol. 2020;92(7):797–806.
- Wang R, Pan M, Zhang X, et al. Epidemiological and clinical features of 125 hospitalized patients with COVID-19 in Fuyang, Anhui, China. Int J Infect Dis. 2020;95:421–428.
- Yang X, Yu Y, Xu J, et al. Clinical course and outcomes of critically ill patients with SARS-CoV-2 pneumonia in Wuhan, China: a single-centered, retrospective, observational study. *Lancet Respir Med.* 2020;8:475–81.
- Zhang JJ, Dong X, Cao YY, et al. Clinical characteristics of 140 patients infected with SARS-CoV-2 in Wuhan, China. Allergy. 2020;75(7):1730–1741.
- Chow N, Fleming-Dutra K, Gierke R, et al.; CDC Covid-Response Team. Preliminary estimates of the prevalence of selected underlying health conditions among patients with coronavirus disease 2019 – United States, February 12–March 28, 2020. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep. 2020;69(13):382–386.
- Hu L, Chen S, Fu Y, et al. Risk factors associated with clinical outcomes in 323 COVID-19 hospitalized patients in Wuhan, China. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2020. doi:10.1093/cid/ciaa539.
- Liu J, Li S, Liu J, et al. Longitudinal characteristics of lymphocyte responses and cytokine profiles in the peripheral blood of SARS-CoV-2 infected patients. *EBioMedicine*. 2020;55:102763.
- 17. Ji D, Zhang D, Xu J, et al. Prediction for progression risk in patients with COVID-19 pneumonia: The CALL score. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2020. doi:10.1093/cid/ciaa414.
- Shi Y, Yu X, Zhao H, Wang H, Zhao R, Sheng J. Host susceptibility to severe COVID-19 and establishment of a host risk score: Findings of 487 cases outside Wuhan. *Crit Care.* 2020;24(1):108.
- Chen T, Wu D, Chen H, et al. Clinical characteristics of 113 deceased patients with coronavirus disease 2019: retrospective study. *BMJ*. 2020;368:m1091.
- Zhou F, Yu T, Du R, et al. Clinical course and risk factors for mortality of adult inpatients with COVID-19 in Wuhan, China: a retrospective cohort study. *Lancet*. 2020;395(10229):1054–1062.
- Goyal P, Choi JJ, Pinheiro LC, et al. Clinical characteristics of Covid-19 in New York City. N Engl J Med. 2020;382(24):2372–2374.
- Wang K, Zuo P, Liu Y, et al. Clinical and laboratory predictors of in-hospital mortality in patients with COVID-19: a cohort study in Wuhan, China. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2020. doi:10.1093/cid/ciaa538.
- Liu W, Tao ZW, Lei W, et al. Analysis of factors associated with disease outcomes in hospitalized patients with 2019 novel coronavirus disease. *Chin Med J (Engl)*. 2020;133(9):1032–1038.
- 24. Berlin I, Thomas D, Le Faou AL, Cornuz J. COVID-19 and smoking. *Nicotine Tob Res.* 2020;22(9):1650–1652.