

Compound Biejia-Ruangan tablet as an adjunctive therapy to entecavir for chronic hepatitis *B* **complicated with hepatic fibrosis** A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials

Yong-hong Xu, MM^a, Chuan Xue, MM^{a,*}

Abstract

Background: The compound *Biejia-Ruangan* tablet (CBRT), as an adjunctive therapy to entecavir, is a potential treatment for hepatic fibrosis (HF) in patients with chronic hepatitis B (HBV). However, the present study yielded inconsistent results. In this systematic review and meta-analysis, we comprehensively investigated the efficacy and safety of CBRT as an adjunctive modality to entecavir for the treatment of HBV infection complicated with HF.

Methods: We searched the Cochrane Library, PubMed, Embase, CNKI, VIP, CBM, and Wangfang databases through April 1, 2022, for randomized controlled trials (RCTs) assessing the effect and safety of CBRT as an adjunctive modality to entecavir for HBV complicated with HF. The primary outcomes were biochemical parameters of serum hyaluronic acid, laminin (LN), pretype-III collagen (PC-III), and type IV collagen (IV-C). The secondary outcomes were liver function indices of serum alanine aminotransferase (ALT), aspartate aminotransferase (AST), and total bilirubin (TBiL) levels, total effect rate, and occurrence rate of adverse events. Two researchers independently conducted study selection, data extraction, and quality assessment. Statistical analysis was performed using the RevMan 5.3 software.

Results: Eight RCTs involving 747 patients were included. Compared with entecavir monotherapy, CBRT as an adjunctive therapy to entecavir exerted more encouraging effect in serum levels of hyaluronic acid (mean difference [MD] = -28.15; 95% confidence interval [CI]: -43.82 to -12.47; P < .001), LN (MD = -29.46; 95% CI: -50.69 to -8.23; P < .001), PC-III (MD = -11.83; 95% CI: -19.43 to -4.23; P < .001), and IV-C (MD = -19.62; 95% CI: -29.76 to -9.49; P < .001); levels of serum ALT (MD = -16.83; 95% CI: -26.30 to -7.36; P < .001), AST (MD = -20.52; 95% CI: -33.11 to -7.93; P < .001), and TBiL (MD = -7.54; 95% CI: -11.58 to -3.49; P < .001); and total effect rate (odds ratio = 3.53; 95% CI: 1.71-7.29; P < .001). Meta-analysis results also showed that CBRT as an adjunctive therapy to entecavir had a lower occurrence rate of adverse events (odds ratio = 0.54; 95% CI: 0.22-1.34; P < .001) than entecavir alone.

Conclusion: The results of this study showed that CBRT as an adjunctive modality to entecavir may benefit HBV patients complicated with HF. High-quality RCTs are needed to confirm the current findings in the future.

Abbreviations: ALT = alanine aminotransferase, AST = aspartate aminotransferase, CBRT = Biejia-Ruangan tablet, CI = confidence interval, HA = hyaluronic acid, HBV = chronic hepatitis B, HF = hepatic fibrosis, IV-C = type IV collagen, LN = laminin, MD = Mean difference, OR = odds ratio, PC-III = pretype-III collagen, RCTs = randomized controlled trials, TBiL = total bilirubin.

Key words: chronic hepatitis B, compound Biejia-Ruangan tablet, Entecavir, hepatic fibrosis, meta-analysis, systematic review

1. Introduction

Hepatic fibrosis (HF) is a pathological condition caused by various chronic liver diseases.^[1–3] It is a precursor of cirrhosis in patients with chronic hepatitis B virus (HBV) and affects the physiological function of the liver.^[4,5] It is estimated that approximately 400 million people are chronically infected

The datasets generated during and/or analyzed during the current study are available from the corresponding author on reasonable request.

HBV.^[6] Moreover, patients with HBV often have different degrees of HF, which greatly impacts their quality of life and survival time.^[7–9] Thus, there is an urgent need to explore effective modalities for patients with HBV infection complicated by HF.

Although studies have reported that long-term anti-HBV management can alleviate both replication of HBV virus

http://dx.doi.org/10.1097/MD.000000000030020

All authors stated that they had no competing interests with this study.

^aDepartment of Gastroenterology, Sunshine Union Hospital, Weifang, China.

^{*} Correspondence: Chuan Xue, MM, Department of Gastroenterology, Sunshine Union Hospital, No. 9000, Yingqian Street, Weifang High-Tech District, Shandong 261000, China (e-mail: seausith5@21cn.com).

Copyright © 2022 the Author(s). Published by Wolters Kluwer Health, Inc. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Non Commercial License 4.0 (CCBY-NC), where it is

permissible to download, share, remix, transform, and buildup the work provided it is properly cited. The work cannot be used commercially without permission from the journal.

How to cite this article: Xu Y-H, Xue C. Compound Biejia-Ruangan tablet as an adjunctive therapy to entecavir for chronic hepatitis B complicated with hepatic fibrosis: A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. Medicine 2022;101:32(e30020).

Received: 19 April 2022 / Received in final form: 24 June 2022 / Accepted: 24 June 2022

and HF process, they still suffer from sufficient efficacy.[10-14] Fortunately, traditional Chinese herbal medicine, such as the compound Biejia-Ruangan tablet (CBRT) as an adjunctive therapy to entecavir is a promising modality for HBV patients complicated with HF.[15-20] It consists of 11 traditional Chinese herbs, and is the first approved Chinese herbal medicine by the China Food and Drug Administration for anti-HF.^[21] Study have reported that it can inhibit the proliferation of fat-storing cells, reduce the synthesis and excessive deposition of collagen.^[22] It exerts positive effects in preventing, blocking, and treating HF and early cirrhosis.^[22] In this prescription, the turtle shell was the chief Chinese herb. A previous study reported that it has a certain anti-HF effect, and its possible action mechanisms include reducing the contents of human type IV and III collagen, inhibiting lipid peroxidation reaction and activity of hepatic stellate cells, affecting the content of cytokines, and improving the degradability of hyaluronic acid (HA).^[23] In addition, other herbs also exert antifibrotic effects in different ways, thereby inhibiting the formation of HF through multiple targets and pathways and exerting synergistic therapeutic effects.^[21]

Previous clinical studies investigated the effect and safety of CBRT as an adjunctive therapy to entecavir for the treatment of HBV patients complicated with HE.^[24–31] However, there is still insufficient data and evidence to support CBRT as an adjunctive therapy to entecavir for the treatment of HBV patients complicated with HF. Therefore, this systematic review and meta-analysis comprehensively explored the effect and safety of CBRT as an adjunctive therapy to entecavir for the HBV patients complicated with HF.

2. Methods

2.1. Ethical statement

This study does not need ethic approval and patient informed consent because we conduct this study based on the secondary patient data, and no individual data are involved.

2.2. Literature search

A comprehensive search of the Cochrane Library, PubMed, Embase, CNKI, VIP, CBM, and Wangfang was performed on

Number	Search terms
1	Hepatitis B virus
2	Chronic hepatitis B
3	Liver cirrhosis
4	Hepatic cirrhosis
ō	Hepatic fibrosis
3	Liver fibrosis
7	Congenital hepatic fibrosis
3	Or 1–7
9	Compound <i>Biejia-Ruangan</i> table
10	Biejia-Ruangan power
11	Biejia-Ruangan San
12	Herbal medicine
13	Chinese compound prescription
14	Or 9–13
15	Entecavir
16	Baraclude
17	Or 15–16
18	Case-control study
19	Observational study
20	Clinical trial
21	Randomized controlled trial
22	Or 18–21
23	8 AND 14 AND 17 AND 22

April 1, 2022 for randomized controlled trials (RCTs) investigating the efficacy and safety of CBRT as an adjunctive therapy to entecavir HBV complicated with HF. In addition, we searched other literature sources, such as the reference lists of the associated reviews. The following keywords were used to perform literature sources search, including "hepatitis B virus," "chronic hepatitis B," "liver cirrhosis," "hepatic fibrosis," "compound *Biejia-Ruangan* tablet," "*Biejia-Ruangan* power," "*Biejiaruangan San*," "herbal medicine," "Chinese compound prescription," and "entecavir." The detailed search strategy is presented in Table 1.

2.3. Study selection

Two researchers independently selected studies based on the inclusion criteria. This process consists of 3 steps. First, all duplicates were removed after literature search. Second, titles and abstracts of the remaining studies were reviewed to eliminate



Figure 1. Flow diagram of study selection.

irrelevant studies. Third, the full texts of the potential articles were carefully read, and eligible trials were included. Any conflicts between the 2 researchers were resolved through discussions with an experienced researcher.

2.4. Eligibility criteria

2.4.1. Inclusion criteria. The inclusion criteria were as follows: (1) This study only included RCTs of CBRT as an adjunctive therapy to entecavir for HBV patients complicated with HF. (2) All patients were diagnosed with HBV infection complicated by HF. (3) Patients in the experimental group received CBRT plus entecavir, while those in the control group received entecavir alone.

2.4.2. Exclusion criteria. We excluded studies if they met the following criteria: (1) all irrelevant studies, such as duplicates, reviews, case studies, animal studies, retrospective studies, uncontrolled studies, and quasi-RCTs (defined as using inadequately or no concealed method for different interventions, which is not truly random); (2) studies not related to CBRT plus entecavir, HBV complicated with HF; and (3) studies with insufficient data and information.

2.5. Outcome measurements

The primary outcomes included biochemical parameters of serum HA, laminin (LN), pretype-III collagen (PC-III), and type IV collagen (IV-C). The secondary outcomes included liver function indices of serum alanine aminotransferase (ALT), aspartate aminotransferase (AST), total bilirubin (TBiL), total effect rate, and the occurrence rate of adverse events.

2.6. Data collection

Two researchers independently collected data from each trial based on eligibility criteria. Information on title, first author, year of publication, details of study design, intervention, control, primary and secondary outcomes, adverse events, and follow-up. Any differences were resolved through a discussion with a third expert.

2.7. Risk of bias assessment

The Cochrane risk of bias tool was used by 2 independent researchers to assess the methodological quality of all included

Table 2

General characteristics of included studies.

studies in 7 fields, and each was rated as low, unclear, or high risk of bias. Any divergence was resolved through a discussion with a third experienced expert.

2.8. Statistical Analysis

RevMan 5.3 software was used to perform all statistical analysis. The mean difference (MD) with 95% confidence interval (CI) was used to calculate continuous data, and odds ratio (OR) with 95% CI was utilized to present dichotomous data. Heterogeneity of the pooled data was analyzed using the I^2 test. A fixed-effects model was used if the value of I^2 was < 50% and a random-effects model was used if the value of I^2 was $\geq 50\%$.

3. Results

3.1. Search results

After a comprehensive literature search, a total of 526 studies were found, 208 of which remained after duplicates were eliminated. After the titles and abstracts were screened, 178 irrelevant studies were removed and 30 potential articles were entered into the next step. After carefully reading the full text, 22 quasi-RCTs were excluded, and 8 eligible RCTs underwent qualitative and quantitative analysis^[24–31] (Fig. 1).

3.2. Study characteristics

This study reviewed 8 eligible RCTs involving 747 patients with HF and HBV. All of these studies focused on the comparative outcomes between CBRT plus entecavir and entecavir monotherapy. The general characteristics of the patients with HF and HBV are summarized in Table 2, including the first author, year of publication, age, intervention, control, outcomes, and follow-up.

3.3. Quality assessment

We used the Cochrane Risk of Bias tool to assess the methodological quality of all 8 included RCTs^[24-31] (Fig. 2). All trials sufficiently reported random sequence generation, incomplete outcome data, selective reporting, and other bias.[24-31] However, they did not clearly provide details of allocation concealment, blinding of participants, investigators, and outcome assessors.[24-31]

Study	No. of patients (T/C)	Age (yrs, T/C)	Intervention	Control	Outcomes	Follow-up (mo)
Jiao and Zhang ^[24]	37/37	T: 45.5±2.0 C: 46.5±1.5	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d plus CBRT 12tablets/d	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d	123459	12
Jin ^[25]	50/50	T: 42.5±8.4 C: 43.2±8.5	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d plus CBRT 6 g/d	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d	123457	12
Liu et al ^[26]	65/64	T: 44.7 ± 2.8 C: 43.9 ± 2.8	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d plus CBRT 6 g/d	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d	125679	12
Mo and Huang ^[27]	51/51	T: 39.2 ± 5.3 C: 39.0 ± 5.2	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d plus CBRT 6 g/d	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d	1234568	6
Sun and Zhu ^[28]	38/38	T: 42.2 ± 2.6 C: 42.3 ± 2.6	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d plus CBRT 6 q/d	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d	123489	12
Wang and Li ^[29]	48/48	T: 44.9±15.2 C: 45.5±15.6	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d plus CBRT 6 g/d	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d	567	12
Zhang et al ^[30]	45/45	T: 42.3±2.7 C: 42.9±2.5	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d plus CBRT 12 tablets/d	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d	123478	12
Zhang ^[31]	40/40	T: 45.6±15.7 C: 45.8±16.1	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d plus CBRT 6 g/d	Entecavir 0.5 mg/d	1245678	6

T, treatment group; C, control group; CBRT, Biejia-Ruangan tablet; 🛈 serum HA level; 🕲 serum LN level; 🕲 serum PC-III level; 🕘 serum IV-C level; 🕲 serum ALT level; 🔞 serum AST level; 💮 serum AST level; 💮 serum TBiL level; (3) total effect ratio; (3) adverse events.

K. K.

	Zhang 2018	Zhang 2015	Wang 2017	Sun 2017	Mo 2018	Liu 2019	Jin 2019	Jiao 2015	
	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	Random sequence generation (selection bias)
	••	••	••	••	••	••	••	••	Allocation concealment (selection bias)
	••	••	••	••	••	••	••	••	Blinding of participants and personnel (performance bias)
	••	••	••	••	••	••	••	••	Blinding of outcome assessment (detection bias)
	٠	•	•	•	•	•	٠	٠	Incomplete outcome data (attrition bias)
	٠	٠	•	•	•	٠	٠	٠	Selective reporting (reporting bias)
	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	Other bias
Figure 2. Risk of bias	summ	iary.							-

3.4. Pooled analysis of primary outcomes

Six trials with 577 patients investigated serum levels of HA and LN. Four studies with 368 patients explored the serum levels of PC-III, and 5 studies with 448 patients analyzed the serum levels of IV-C. There were statistically significant difference in the biochemical parameters of serum levels of HA (MD = -28.15; 95% CI: -43.82 to -12.47; P < .001; $I^2 = 98\%$; Fig. 3), LN (MD = -29.46; 95% CI: -50.69 to -8.23; P < .001; $I^2 = 99\%$; Fig. 4), PC-III (MD = -11.83; 95% CI: -19.43 to -4.23; P < .001; $I^2 = 98\%$; Fig. 5), and IV-C (MD = -19.62; 95% CI: -29.76 to -9.49; P < .001; $I^2 = 96\%$; Fig. 6).

3.5. Pooled analysis of secondary outcomes

Seven studies (671 subjects), 5 studies (497 participants), and 4 trials (405 patients) examined the levels of serum ALT, AST, and TBiL, respectively. Statistically significant differences were observed between the 2 modalities for serum ALT levels (MD = -16.83; 95% CI: -26.30 to -7.36; P < .001; $I^2 = 98\%$; Fig. 7), AST (MD = -20.52; 95% CI: -33.11 to -7.93; P < .001; $I^2 = 99\%$; Fig. 8), TBiL (MD = -7.54; 95% CI: -11.58 to -3.49; P < .001; $I^2 = 98\%$; Fig. 9); and the total effect rate (OR = 3.53; 95% CI: 1.71-7.29; P < .001; $I^2 = 0\%$; Fig. 10). We also found that CBRT plus entecavir treatment was significantly lower for entecavir monotherapy than for the occurrence rate of adverse events (OR = 0.54; 95% CI: 0.22-1.34; P < .001; $I^2 = 0\%$; Fig. 11).

4. Discussion

Chronic HBV infection is one of the most common causes of liver-associated diseases such as HF, cirrhosis, and even liver

cancer. Thus, proper and timely management of patients with HBV-complicated HF is necessary to prevent them from developing serious conditions of cirrhosis and liver cancer. Entecavir is the first-line drug that effectively blocks HBV replication. However, its efficacy remains unsatisfactory.

Traditional Chinese compound prescriptions, such as CBRT, are widely used for the treatment of patients with HVB and HF. Although various clinical trials regarding entecavir plus CBRT for the treatment of HBV complicated with HF have been conducted, the findings are inconsistent. In this systematic review and meta-analysis, we comprehensively assessed the efficacy and safety of CBRT as an adjunctive therapy to entecavir for the treatment of patients with HBV and HF.

There were statistically significant differences between entecavir plus CBRT and entecavir alone in the biochemical parameters of serum levels of HA, LN, PC-III, and IV-C; liver function indices of levels of serum ALT, AST, and TBiL; total effect rate; and occurrence rate of adverse events. The findings of these pooled data suggest that CBRT as an adjunctive therapy to entecavir is superior to entecavir monotherapy, with fewer adverse events.

This systematic review and meta-analysis had several limitations. First, a limited number of eligible RCTs were included, which may have affected the study findings. Second, none of the trials clearly reported the blinding details of patients, researchers, and outcome assessors, which may have affected the risk of selection, performance, and detection bias in this study. Third, none of the included studies reported drop-off details, which may have affected the reporting bias in this study. Finally, none of the studies reported short-term effects. Therefore, more high-quality multicenter large-sample RCTs are needed to confirm the current findings in the future.

	Expe	erimen	tal	C	ontrol			Mean Difference	Mean Difference
Study or Subgroup	Mean	SD	Total	Mean	SD	Total	Weight	IV, Random, 95% CI	IV, Random, 95% Cl
Jin 2019	28.6	5.5	50	37.4	6.4	50	17.6%	-8.80 [-11.14, -6.46]	•
Liu 2019	98.9	10.9	65	130.2	12.9	64	17.4%	-31.30 [-35.42, -27.18]	+
Mo 2018	101.2	12	51	135.9	15.6	51	17.3%	-34.70 [-40.10, -29.30]	
Sun 2017	198.1	14.2	38	190.2	13.1	38	17.2%	7.90 [1.76, 14.04]	
Zhang 2015	108.4	42.5	45	155.2	44.8	45	14.3%	-46.80 [-64.84, -28.76]	
Zhang 2018	98.4	20.6	40	158.7	27.7	40	16.3%	-60.30 [-71.00, -49.60]	
Total (95% CI)			289			288	100.0%	-28.15 [-43.82, -12.47]	•
Heterogeneity: Tau ² =	= 362.64;	Chi ² =	270.4	6. df = 5	(P < 0	.00001); I ² = 989	6 -	
Test for overall effect				-	с -		,,		-50 -25 0 25 50 Favours (experimental) Favours (control)

Figure 3. Comparison of serum HA level.



Figure 4. Comparison of serum LN level.

	Expe	erimen	tal	C	ontrol			Mean Difference	Mean Difference	
Study or Subgroup	Mean	SD	Total	Mean	SD	Total	Weight	IV, Random, 95% Cl	IV, Random, 95% Cl	
Jin 2019	9.3	3.5	50	15.3	5.2	50	29.9%	-6.00 [-7.74, -4.26]	•	
Mo 2018	96.2	10.4	51	121.5	13.8	51	27.2%	-25.30 [-30.04, -20.56]	+	
Sun 2017	8.2	0.6	38	8.9	0.3	38	30.4%	-0.70 [-0.91, -0.49]	•	
Zhang 2015	118.4	42	45	142	38	45	12.5%	-23.60 [-40.15, -7.05]	_ - _	
Total (95% CI)			184			184	100.0%	-11.83 [-19.43, -4.23]	◆	
Heterogeneity: Tau ²	= 49.46; 0	Chi² = '	144.98	df = 3 (P < 0.0	00001);	l² = 98%			4.00
Test for overall effec									-100 -50 0 50 Favours (experimental) Favours (control)	100

Figure 5. Comparison of serum PC-III level.

	Expe	rimen	tal	C	ontrol			Mean Difference	Mean Difference	
Study or Subgroup	Mean	SD	Total	Mean	SD	Total	Weight	IV, Random, 95% Cl	IV, Random, 95% Cl	
Jin 2019	19.3	4.9	50	26.3	4.1	50	23.3%	-7.00 [-8.77, -5.23]	-	
Mo 2018	52.4	6.1	51	75.3	8.8	51	23.0%	-22.90 [-25.84, -19.96]	+	
Sun 2017	115.3	10.1	38	122.2	11.6	38	22.2%	-6.90 [-11.79, -2.01]	-	
Zhang 2015	98	44	45	126.8	38.3	45	14.1%	-28.80 [-45.84, -11.76]	_ -	
Zhang 2018	62.6	18.3	40	103.6	35.4	40	17.4%	-41.00 [-53.35, -28.65]		
Total (95% CI)			224			224	100.0%	-19.62 [-29.76, -9.49]	•	
Heterogeneity: Tau ²	= 114.05	Chi²=	111.8	7. df = 4	(P < 0	.00001); I ² = 969	6		
Test for overall effec	t: Z = 3.79	(P = 0).0001)						-100 -50 0 Favours [experimental] Favours	50 100 [control]

Figure 6. Comparison of serum IV-C level.

	Expe	rimen	ital	C	ontrol			Mean Difference	Mean Difference
Study or Subgroup	Mean	SD	Total	Mean	SD	Total	Weight	IV, Random, 95% Cl	IV, Random, 95% Cl
Jiao 2015	51.4	29.8	37	68	31.3	37	11.5%	-16.60 [-30.53, -2.67]	
Jin 2019	28.6	6.2	50	39.1	11.2	50	15.0%	-10.50 [-14.05, -6.95]	+
Liu 2019	28.3	2.4	65	31.2	2.1	64	15.3%	-2.90 [-3.68, -2.12]	-
Mo 2018	81.8	8.8	51	89.5	9.7	51	15.0%	-7.70 [-11.29, -4.11]	+
Wang 2017	31.9	20	48	40.6	20.7	48	13.8%	-8.70 [-16.84, -0.56]	
Zhang 2015	30.6	5.2	45	48	8	45	15.1%	-17.40 [-20.19, -14.61]	-
Zhang 2018	32	9.6	40	87.4	18.6	40	14.3%	-55.40 [-61.89, -48.91]	-
Total (95% CI)			336			335	100.0%	-16.83 [-26.30, -7.36]	◆
Heterogeneity: Tau ² =	= 152.30;	Chi²=	= 350.7	5, df = 6	(P < 0	.00001); I ² = 989	%	
Test for overall effect				•					-100 -50 0 50 100 Favours (experimental) Favours (control)

Figure 7. Comparison of serum ALT level.

	Expe	rimen	tal	C	ontrol			Mean Difference	Mean Difference
Study or Subgroup	Mean	SD	Total	Mean	SD	Total	Weight	IV, Random, 95% Cl	IV, Random, 95% Cl
Liu 2019	29.4	3.5	65	34.7	3.2	64	20.6%	-5.30 [-6.46, -4.14]	
Mo 2018	61.9	6.8	51	67	7.5	51	20.4%	-5.10 [-7.88, -2.32]	-
Wang 2017	36.7	17.6	48	46.4	22.3	48	19.0%	-9.70 [-17.74, -1.66]	
Zhang 2015	28.4	5.8	45	45.2	5.8	45	20.4%	-16.80 [-19.20, -14.40]	•
Zhang 2018	31.8	12.4	40	98.7	15.9	40	19.6%	-66.90 [-73.15, -60.65]	-
Total (95% CI)			249			248	100.0%	-20.52 [-33.11, -7.93]	◆
Heterogeneity: Tau ² :	= 200.23;	Chi²=	416.7	9, df = 4	(P < 0	.00001); I ² = 999	6	
Test for overall effect	: Z = 3.20	(P = 0	0.001)		-				-100 -50 0 50 10 Favours [experimental] Favours [control]

Figure 8. Comparison of serum AST level.



Figure 9. Comparison of serum TBiL level.



Figure 10. Comparison of total effect rate.

	Experim	ental	Contr	ol		Odds Ratio	Odds Ratio
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H, Fixed, 95% Cl	M-H, Fixed, 95% Cl
Jiao 2015	2	37	7	37	50.1%	0.24 [0.05, 1.27]	
Liu 2019	3	65	4	64	29.1%	0.73 [0.16, 3.38]	
Sun 2017	3	38	3	38	20.9%	1.00 [0.19, 5.30]	
Total (95% CI)		140		139	100.0%	0.54 [0.22, 1.34]	-
Total events	8		14				
Heterogeneity: Chi ² =	1.55, df = 3	2 (P = 0	.46); I ² = ()%			
Test for overall effect:	Z=1.33 (F	P = 0.18)				0.01 0.1 1 10 100 Favours [experimental] Favours [control]

Figure 11. Comparison of occurrence rate of adverse events.

5. Conclusion

This study showed that CBRT, as an adjunctive modality to entecavir, had positive efficacy in patients with HBV and HF. Future studies involving high-quality RCTs are required to validate the present findings.

Author contributions

Conceptualization: Chuan Xue. Data curation: Yong-hong Xu. Formal analysis: Yong-hong Xu. Investigation: Chuan Xue. Methodology: Yong-hong Xu. Supervision: Chuan Xue. Validation: Chuan Xue. Writing–original draft: Yong-hong Xu. Writing–review & editing: Chuan Xue.

References

- [1] Friedman SL. Hepatic fibrosis-overview. Toxicology. 2008;254:120-9.
- [2] Jiao J, Friedman SL, Aloman C. Hepatic fibrosis. Curr Opin Gastroenterol. 2009;25:223–9.
- [3] Trautwein C, Friedman SL, Schuppan D, et al. Hepatic fibrosis: concept to treatment. J Hepatol. 2015;62(suppl 1):S15–24.
- [4] Liang P, Zu J, Yin J, et al. The independent impact of newborn hepatitis B vaccination on reducing HBV prevalence in China, 1992-2006: a mathematical model analysis. J Theor Biol. 2015;386:115–21.

- [5] Wu JF, Chang MH. Natural history of chronic hepatitis B virus infection from infancy to adult life-the mechanism of inflammation triggering and long-term impacts. J Biomed Sci. 2015;22:92.
- [6] Schiff ER. Prevention of mortality from hepatitis B and hepatitis C. Lancet. 2006;368:896–7.
- [7] Zhang L, Chang Y. Experimental study on effect of dahuang zhechong wan combined with adefovir dipivoxil in preventing hepatic fibrosis in patients with chronic hepatitis B. Chin J Chin Materia Medica. 2012;37:862–4.
- [8] Wang H, Zhao YL, Xu KC. Clinical and pathological study on effects of Qianggan Capsule combined lamivudine on hepatic fibrosis in patients with chronic hepatitis B. Chin J Chin Materia Medica. 2006;26:978–80.
- [9] Schiff E, Simsek H, Lee WM, et al. Efficacy and safety of entecavir in patients with chronic hepatitis B and advanced hepatic fibrosis or cirrhosis. Am J Gastroenterol. 2008;103:2776–83.
- [10] Pokora-Rodak A, Krzowska-Firych J, Tomasiewicz K. Concentration of LDLR, degree of hepatic fibrosis and hepatic steatosis in patients with chronic hepatitis B infection treated with tenofovir disoproxil fumarate. Ann Agric Environ Med. 2021;28:458–62.
- [11] Yang JM, Chen LP, Wang YJ, et al. Entecavir add-on Peg-interferon therapy plays a positive role in reversing hepatic fibrosis in treatment-naïve chronic hepatitis B patients: a prospective and randomized controlled trial. Chin Med J (Engl). 2020;133:1639–48.
- [12] Kim JK, Ma DW, Lee KS, et al. Assessment of hepatic fibrosis regression by transient elastography in patients with chronic hepatitis B treated with oral antiviral agents. J Korean Med Sci. 2014;29:570–5.
- [13] Zhang L, Chang Y. Effect of decoction of turtle shell for anti-fibrosis combined with stronger neo-minophagen C on indices of hepatic fibrosis in chronic hepatitis B. Chin J Chin Materia Medica. 2012;37:258–61.

- [14] Schiff E, Simsek H, Lee WM, et al. Efficacy and safety of entecavir in patients with chronic hepatitis B and advanced hepatic fibrosis or cirrhosis. Am J Gastroenterol. 2008;103:2776–83.
- [15] Cheng M, Feng X, Wang L, et al. Nucleoside analogs assisted with Chinese compound prescription in treating hepatic fibrosis of chronic hepatitis B patients: a protocol of systematic review and meta-analysis. Medicine (Baltim). 2020;99:e21032.
- [16] Huang C, Shen D, Sun S, et al. Effect of Fufang Biejia Ruangan Tablet on lowering biochemical and virological parameters of hepatic fibrosis in patients with chronic hepatitis B: protocol for a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials and cohort studies. Medicine (Baltim). 2019;98:e15297.
- [17] Qu J, Yu Z, Li Q, et al. Blocking and reversing hepatic fibrosis in patients with chronic hepatitis B treated by traditional Chinese medicine (tablets of biejia ruangan or RGT): study protocol for a randomized controlled trial. Trials. 2014;15:438.
- [18] Zhang L, Chang Y. Effect of decoction of turtle shell for anti-fibrosis combined with stronger neo-minophagen C on indices of hepatic fibrosis in chronic hepatitis B. Chin J Chin Materia Medica. 2012;37:258–61.
- [19] Chen JM, Yang YP, Chen DY, et al. Efficacy and safety of Fufang Biejia Ruangan tablet in patients with chronic hepatitis B complicated with hepatic fibrosis. Chin J Exp Clin Virol. 2007;21:358–60.
- [20] Hu YY, Liu P, Liu C. Investigation on indication of fuzheng huayu capsule against hepatic fibrosis and its non-invasive efficacy evaluation parameters: data analysis of liver biopsy of 50 patients with chronic hepatitis B before and after treatment. Chin J Integr Med. 2006;26:18–22.
- [21] Huang LY, Shi WQ, Meng QY. The present situation and prospect of compound BIEJIA Ruangan tablet in the treatment of hepatic fibrosis. Jiangxi Univ Tradit Chin Med. 2015;27:97–9.

- [22] Wang H, Bi QL. The mechanism and application of compound BIEJIA ruangan tablet in anti-hepatic fibrosis. Guangzhou Med 2014;4:56–7.
- [23] Yan D, Su J, Feng QS. Research progress on prevention and treatment of hepatic fibrosis with Turtle Shell. World Latest Med Inform. 2018;18:115–6.
- [24] Jiao NY, Zhang HJ. Efficacy and safety of compound Biejia Ruangan tablet combined with entecine in the treatment of posthepatitic cirrhosis. Liver (Chin). 2015;5:396–9.
- [25] Jin YJ. Clinical observation of entecine combined with compound Biejia Ruangan tablet in the treatment of chronic hepatitis fibrosis. Chin J Pharm Econ (Chin). 2019;2:69–73.
- [26] Liu ZX, Tian Y, Zhu F, et al. Long-term efficacy of compound Biejia Ruangan tablet combined with entecine in the treatment of chronic hepatitis B fibrosis. Pharm Today (Chin). 2019;6:427–30.
- [27] Mo JR, Huang SY. Clinical effect of compound Biejia Ruangan tablet combined with entecine in the treatment of chronic hepatitis B fibrosis. Chin Foreign Med Res (Chin). 2018;17:11–3.
- [28] Sun YY, Zhu ZX. Clinical efficacy of entecine combined with compound Biejia Ruangan tablet in the treatment of chronic hepatitis B with liver fibrosis. J Clin Ration Drug Use. 2017;33:67–8.
- [29] Wang YQ, Li XF. Effects of compound Biejia Ruangan tablet combined with entecine on liver function and quality of life in patients with chronic hepatitis B with liver fibrosis. Henan Med Res (Chin). 2017;21:3903–4.
- [30] Zhang Y, Dong CF, Li HY. Evaluation of the therapeutic effect of Cave and compound Biejia Ruangan tablet on hepatic fibrosis by acoustic radiation force pulse imaging. Anhui Med (Chin). 2015;19:2413–5.
- [31] Zhang XM. Effect of compound Biejia Ruangan tablet combined with entecine on liver fibrosis in patients with chronic hepatitis B and its influence on liver function. Liver (Chin). 2018;5:424–6.