



Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.



Commentary

Super-spreading events and contribution to transmission of MERS, SARS, and SARS-CoV-2 (COVID-19)

J.A. Al-Tawfiq^{a,b,c,*}, A.J. Rodriguez-Morales^{d,e}

^a Infectious Disease Unit, Specialty Internal Medicine, Johns Hopkins Aramco Healthcare, Dhahran, Saudi Arabia

^b Department of Medicine, Indiana University School of Medicine, Indianapolis, IN, USA

^c Department of Medicine, Johns Hopkins University School of Medicine, Baltimore, MD, USA

^d Public Health and Infection Research Group, Faculty of Health Sciences, Universidad Tecnológica de Pereira, Pereira, Risaralda, Colombia

^e Grupo de Investigación Biomedicina, Faculty of Medicine, Fundación Universitaria Autónoma de Las Américas, Pereira, Risaralda, Colombia

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received 22 March 2020

Accepted 2 April 2020

Available online 8 April 2020



Introduction

There is no clear definition for the term ‘super-spreader’ or ‘super-spreading event’. The World Health Organization refers to a super-spreader as a patient (or an event) that may transmit infection to a larger number of individuals than is usual by one individual (or event). In the severe acute respiratory syndrome (SARS) situation, a super-spreading event was defined as the transmission of SARS to at ≥ 8 contacts, and other authors defined this as individuals infecting an unusually large number

of secondary cases [1,2]. A super-spreading event could merely be defined as an event in which one patient infects far more people than an average patient does, which is estimated by the basic reproduction number (R0).

Super-spreading events during SARS, MERS, and COVID

A super-spreading event was recognized during the SARS outbreak when a flight attendant infected more than 100 patients in Singapore [3]. In the situation of Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus (MERS-CoV), one patient infected 82 individuals during his course of illness during an outbreak in South Korea [4]. This index case in the Republic of Korea resulted in 27 secondary cases; one of these cases infected an additional 24 tertiary cases, and a third patient caused 73 tertiary cases [5].

In the current coronavirus disease (COVID-19) pandemic, the third British man contracted SARS-CoV-2 at a conference in Singapore and then travelled to France and stayed with a family in a ski chalet (Alpine resort). Five of his contacts tested positive [6]. In South Korea, 37 cases were linked to the religious sect, the Shincheonji Church of Jesus.

What explains a super-spreading event?

There are multiple explanations for the occurrence of super-spreading events, including immune suppression, increased disease severity and viral load, asymptomatic individuals, and extensive social interactions [7].

* Corresponding author. Address: P.O. Box 76, Room A-428-2, Building 61, Dhahran Health Center, Johns Hopkins Aramco Healthcare, Dhahran 31311, Saudi Arabia. Tel.: +966 13 870 3524; fax: +966 13 870 3790.

E-mail addresses: jaffar.tawfiq@jhah.com, jaltawfi@yahoo.com (J. A. Al-Tawfiq).

Individuals with immune suppression may shed virus at a higher level and for a longer duration and may have atypical presentation [8]. Patients with severe disease may have higher viral loads and thus are more likely to shed higher infectious doses. In one study of MERS-CoV, critically ill patients had a longer duration of transmission and shedding of the virus [9].

Another explanation is that super-spreading events may occur because individuals with no or mild symptoms may go unrecognized, and no measures are implemented. Such cases would then lead to widespread dissemination of the virus before recognition and application of infection control measures. The contribution of asymptomatic individuals to the spread of coronavirus is not well understood. Serologic testing in the case of SARS-CoV showed a positive rate of 13% in asymptomatic individuals compared with 82% in severe disease and 4% in those with mild symptoms [10]. One study indicated that an asymptomatic patient with COVID-19 transmitted the SARS-CoV-2 to another patient in Germany [11].

Another possibility is that super-spreading may be the result of increased interaction between the index case and other people, so an individual who has multiple and extensive social life is more likely to infect a greater number of individuals than the person who has limited social interaction. Thus, it is imperative to practice social distancing to flatten the curve during an epidemic.

Children may be at higher rate of being asymptomatic and thus may shed the virus and cause infection in other people. However, previous studies of SARS and MERS did not reveal a high rate of childhood infection; one study of 1250 patients showed that paediatric cases constituted 3.3% (in those aged <10 years) and that serologic assay was positive in 0.1% of children compared to 0.7% overall [12].

Another possible contributing factor is variability in viral shedding. Super-spreading events have been linked to extensive and prolonged viral shedding, and situations with sub-optimal infection control [13].

Additional factors that might also contribute to a super-spreading event include prolonged duration of exposure, the practice of seeking care at multiple healthcare facilities, frequent inter-hospital transfer, and large numbers of contacts [14]. A higher viral load, more environmental contacts, and more interpersonal contacts, and a complex network of interactions made by individuals may also play further roles in super-spreading events.

In conclusion, the occurrence of super-spreading events has contributed to the transmission of SARS, MERS-CoV, and SARS-CoV-2. There are multiple factors contributing to this event, including: immune suppression, increased disease severity and viral load, asymptomatic individuals, and extensive social interactions.

Conflict of interest statement

None declared.

Funding sources

None.

References

- [1] Shen Z, Ning F, Zhou W, He X, Lin C, Chin DP, et al. Super spreading SARS events, Beijing, 2003. *Emerg Infect Dis* 2004;10:256–60. <https://doi.org/10.3201/eid1002.030732>.
- [2] James A, Pitchford JW, Plank MJ. An event-based model of superspreading in epidemics. *Proc Biol Sci* 2007;274:741–7. <https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2006.0219>.
- [3] Gopinath S, Lichtman JS, Bouley DM, Elias JE, Monack DM. Role of disease-associated tolerance in infectious superspreaders. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 2014;111:15780–5. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1409968111>.
- [4] Kim Y, Lee S, Chu C, Choe S, Hong S, Shin Y. The characteristics of Middle Eastern respiratory syndrome coronavirus transmission dynamics in South Korea. *Osong Public Heal Res Perspect* 2016;7:49–55. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.phrp.2016.01.001>.
- [5] Cowling BJ, Park M, Fang VJ, Wu P, Leung GM, Wu JT. Preliminary epidemiological assessment of MERS-CoV outbreak in South Korea, May to June 2015. *Euro Surveill* 2015;20:7–13. doi:20(25):pii=21163.
- [6] Hodcroft EB. Preliminary case report on the SARS-CoV-2 cluster in the UK, France, and Spain. *Swiss Med Wkly* 2020;150:w20212.
- [7] Park Y-S, Lee C, Kim KM, Kim SW, Lee K-J, Ahn J, et al. The first case of the 2015 Korean Middle East respiratory syndrome outbreak. *Epidemiol Health* 2015;37:e2015049. <https://doi.org/10.4178/epih/e2015049>.
- [8] Kim S-H, Ko J-H, Park GE, Cho SY, Ha YE, Kang J-M, et al. Atypical presentations of MERS-CoV infection in immunocompromised hosts. *J Infect Chemother* 2017;23:769–73. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jiac.2017.04.004>.
- [9] Feikin DR, Alraddadi B, Qutub M, Shabouni O, Curns A, Oboho IK, et al. Association of higher MERS-CoV virus load with severe disease and death, Saudi Arabia, 2014. *Emerg Infect Dis* 2015;21:2029–35. <https://doi.org/10.3201/eid2111.150764>.
- [10] Wilder-Smith A, Telesman MD, Heng BH, Earnest A, Ling AE, Leo YS. Asymptomatic SARS coronavirus infection among health-care workers, Singapore. *Emerg Infect Dis* 2005;11:1142–5. <https://doi.org/10.3201/eid1107.041165>.
- [11] Rothe C, Schunk M, Sothmann P, Bretzel G, Froeschl G, Wallrauch C, et al. Transmission of 2019-nCoV infection from an asymptomatic contact in Germany. *N Engl J Med* 2020;382:970–1. <https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMc2001468>.
- [12] Alfaraj SH, Al-Tawfiq JA, Altuwaijri TA, Memish ZA. Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus in pediatrics: a report of seven cases from Saudi Arabia. *Front Med* 2019;13:126–30. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11684-017-0603-y>.
- [13] Al-Tawfiq JA, Perl TM. Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus in healthcare settings. *Curr Opin Infect Dis* 2015;28:392–6. <https://doi.org/10.1097/QCO.0000000000000178>.
- [14] Korea Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus outbreak in the Republic of Korea, 2015. *Osong Public Health Res Perspect* 2015;6:269–78. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.phrp.2015.08.006>.