



# Multiple generations of grain aggregation in different environments preceded solar system body formation

Hope A. Ishii<sup>a,1</sup>, John P. Bradley<sup>a</sup>, Hans A. Bechtel<sup>b</sup>, Donald E. Brownlee<sup>c</sup>, Karen C. Bustillo<sup>d</sup>, James Ciston<sup>d</sup>, Jeffrey N. Cuzzi<sup>e</sup>, Christine Floss<sup>f,2</sup>, and David J. Joswiak<sup>c</sup>

<sup>a</sup>Hawai'i Institute of Geophysics and Planetology, University of Hawai'i at Manoa, Honolulu, HI 96822; <sup>b</sup>Advanced Light Source Division, Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, Berkeley, CA 94720; <sup>c</sup>Department of Astronomy, University of Washington, Seattle, WA 98195; <sup>d</sup>National Center for Electron Microscopy, Molecular Foundry, Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, Berkeley, CA 94720; <sup>e</sup>NASA Ames Research Center, Moffett Field, CA 94035; and <sup>f</sup>Laboratory for Space Sciences, Washington University, St. Louis, MO 63130

Edited by Mark H. Thieme, University of California, San Diego, La Jolla, CA, and approved May 15, 2018 (received for review November 18, 2017)

The solar system formed from interstellar dust and gas in a molecular cloud. Astronomical observations show that typical interstellar dust consists of amorphous (*a*-) silicate and organic carbon. Bona fide physical samples for laboratory studies would yield unprecedented insight about solar system formation, but they were largely destroyed. The most likely repositories of surviving presolar dust are the least altered extraterrestrial materials, interplanetary dust particles (IDPs) with probable cometary origins. Cometary IDPs contain abundant submicron *a*-silicate grains called GEMS (glass with embedded metal and sulfides), believed to be carbon-free. Some have detectable isotopically anomalous *a*-silicate components from other stars, proving they are preserved dust inherited from the interstellar medium. However, it is debated whether the majority of GEMS predate the solar system or formed in the solar nebula by condensation of high-temperature (>1,300 K) gas. Here, we map IDP compositions with single nanometer-scale resolution and find that GEMS contain organic carbon. Mapping reveals two generations of grain aggregation, the key process in growth from dust grains to planetesimals, mediated by carbon. GEMS grains, some with *a*-silicate subgrains mantled by organic carbon, comprise the earliest generation of aggregates. These aggregates (and other grains) are encapsulated in lower-density organic carbon matrix, indicating a second generation of aggregation. Since this organic carbon thermally decomposes above ~450 K, GEMS cannot have accreted in the hot solar nebula, and formed, instead, in the cold presolar molecular cloud and/or outer protoplanetary disk. We suggest that GEMS are consistent with surviving interstellar dust, condensed in situ, and cycled through multiple molecular clouds.

dust accretion | solar system origin | interstellar dust | cosmic dust

Knowledge of the dust from which our molecular cloud and, later, the solar system formed is critical to our understanding of chemical and physical processes in star-forming regions, the inventory of organics incorporated in the solar system, and the accretion and subsequent evolution and processing of solar system bodies. Limited insight about the initial dust population has come from laboratory studies of primitive extraterrestrial objects: Some dust grains inherited from the interstellar medium (ISM) are recognizable by their dramatically nonsolar isotopic compositions, and they have survived at the few to several hundred parts-per-million level in samples of primitive extraterrestrial objects. These rare, preserved “stardust grains” are the most refractory dust that formed in circumstellar outflows of other stars or supernovae and retained their isotopic signatures despite residence in the ISM and solar system. However, they are a minor and unrepresentative fraction of the dust observed and modeled by astronomers (1). Most of the mass of interstellar dust (97 to 99%) is completely reprocessed in the ISM and is subjected to shocks, impacts, recondensation, and repeated cycling in and out of dense molecular clouds (2). Typical reprocessed interstellar dust grains should have averaged elemental and isotopic compositions that are similar to the Sun for dust-forming elements. Although laboratory

analytical studies of isotopically anomalous presolar dust have provided key insights into circumstellar environments, they cannot confidently identify most presolar dust because isotopic composition analyses in such small samples do not reliably discriminate between dust formed in the solar nebula and dust formed or accreted in the ISM.

Thus, we rely on astronomical observations and experiments to infer the characteristics of average interstellar dust that was incorporated in the solar system (1, 3–6). Astronomical observations indicate that the interstellar dust incorporated in molecular clouds and cold outer nebula environments comprises predominantly two kinds of solids, amorphous (*a*-) silicate and organic carbon (5) (*SI Appendix*). Grain sizes of interstellar dust are typically 5 nm to 500 nm in diameter, and the *a*-silicates are inferred to be Mg-rich, likely with nanometer-scale metallic iron (5–8). Additional data were recently provided by in situ analysis of an ISM dust stream currently entering the solar system: The Cosmic Dust Analyzer (CDA) on board the Cassini spacecraft determined that contemporary interstellar dust grains from the diffuse ISM consist primarily of grains of magnesium-rich silicate composition with approximately solar relative abundances of

## Significance

The initial solids from which the solar system formed consisted almost entirely of amorphous silicate, carbon, and ices. This dust was mostly destroyed and reworked by processes that led to the formation of planets. Surviving samples of presolar dust are most likely to be preserved in comets, small cold bodies that formed in the outer solar nebula. In interplanetary dust particles originating from comets, we observe organic carbon mantles on subgrains within amorphous-silicate-dominated grains called GEMS (glass with embedded metal and sulfides). Our observations constrain GEMS grain formation to cold and radiation-rich environments, making a compelling case that these exotic grains, unique to a relatively obscure class of extraterrestrial material, are surviving dust from (variable) interstellar environments and thus the original building materials of planetary systems.

Author contributions: H.A.I. and J.P.B. designed research; H.A.I., J.P.B., H.A.B., D.E.B., K.C.B., J.C., J.N.C., C.F., and D.J.J. performed research; H.A.I., J.P.B., H.A.B., K.C.B., J.C., C.F., and D.J.J. analyzed data; H.A.I. led writing of the paper with contributions from all coauthors; and J.N.C. provided expertise in accretion and modeling.

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

This article is a PNAS Direct Submission.

This open access article is distributed under [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives License 4.0 \(CC BY-NC-ND\)](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

Data deposition: Data reported in this paper are archived online in University of Hawai'i ScholarSpace repository, <https://scholarspace.manoa.hawaii.edu>.

<sup>1</sup>To whom correspondence should be addressed. Email: hope.ishii@hawaii.edu.

<sup>2</sup>Deceased April 19, 2018.

This article contains supporting information online at [www.pnas.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10.1073/pnas.1720167115/-DCSupplemental](http://www.pnas.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10.1073/pnas.1720167115/-DCSupplemental).

Published online June 11, 2018.







Higher O/C ratios in the mantles on GEMS grains, relative to that in the organic matrix, are consistent with prolonged irradiation of O-bearing ices at low temperatures (20). High levels of O in organics have been previously associated with presolar molecular cloud material in IDPs (32). Third, our observations indicate that GEMS subgrains aggregated in the presence of organic nanoglobules. The organic nanoglobules in U2-17B19 exhibit inorganic, partial mantles of GEMS material on their surfaces, not previously reported (Fig. 1 *E–H*). Nitrogen-rich,  $^{15}\text{N}/^{14}\text{N}$ -enriched nanoglobules have been extensively studied and require cold and radiation-rich formation environments, although not necessarily simultaneously (20, 21, 26). As such, we infer that, like nanoglobules, GEMS grains form in such environments. Finally, the mixed aliphatic and aromatic content and the remarkable diversity of N- and O-bearing moieties and rich molecular heterogeneity that extends down to the nanometer-length scale (Figs. 2 and 3) in the organic carbon is consistent with astronomical observations of rich molecular chemistry in molecular clouds (33, 34).

Given the constraints on GEMS formation environments established by this study, we favor a presolar origin for GEMS subgrains. Nonsolar oxygen isotopic abundances detected in several large GEMS grains in other IDPs show that some GEMS grains contain stardust and supernovae ejecta not completely destroyed in the ISM (14, 15). The observed sizes of GEMS *a*-silicate subgrains are smaller than the lateral resolution in isotope measurements, suggesting that, when carriers of isotope anomalies are individual accreted subgrains, they may be widespread but too small to be detected with current instruments. GEMS grains identified as presolar grains by isotope anomalies are indisputably surviving interstellar dust. Since the vast majority (97% or more) of ISM dust is expected to have formed in situ in dense cloud environments and, thus, be isotopically approximately solar, the vast majority of GEMS grains are also consistent with dust formed in situ in the ISM. [With few exceptions, galactic cosmic ray measurements indicate that the interstellar dust from which they are generated is, on average, isotopically approximately solar (35).]

GEMS grains that contain both *a*-silicate and organic carbon have been considered in astronomical observations, experiments, and modeling. A core–mantle model for interstellar dust was proposed decades ago but lacked confirmation in physical samples until now (36). To better match astronomical observations, more-recent models also incorporate physically realistic composite grains having organic carbon mantles on *a*-silicate cores or aggregates of *a*-silicate and organic carbon, rather than separate populations of *a*-silicate and organic carbon grains (2–6). Other recent observations and models also implicate a role of organic carbon grain mantles in grain aggregation (5). However, in the absence of identified physical samples, there has been ongoing debate among astronomers about the significance of composite grains, either as aggregates or as organic mantles on silicate grains (37, 38). Specific mechanisms and environments for accretion are also far from settled. Our finding of organic carbon mantles on subgrains in GEMS indicates that organics or, more likely, their icy precursors were present during initial grain sticking to form first-generation aggregates. Prior low-resolution analyses have noted organics coating IDP components on size scales consistent with matrix organics that suggest organics or precursors were also present in the second generation of aggregation in the solar nebula (39). Some experiments and modeling find that icy, volatile-rich mantles on grains may act to facilitate grain sticking and growth of aggregates (4, 40). Finally, organic mantles have been proposed to form by UV and cosmic ray irradiation of volatile ices condensed on the surfaces of exposed refractory silicate cores (4, 30, 31, 41). We suggest that our observations can better inform future modeling.

To accommodate our observations, we propose a GEMS formation scenario. We propose that interstellar dust experienced grain shattering (fragmentation), amorphization, and sputtering erosion by supernovae shocks in the diffuse ISM as well as grain

growth (recondensation) by sticking of gas-phase species to form amorphous grains of comminuted material (2, 42–45). In situ formation mechanisms likely account for the overwhelming majority of interstellar *a*-silicate dust (1, 2, 42, 45, 46). Additional cold condensation of refractory elements likely occurred along with volatile condensation in dense molecular clouds (2, 47), where nanoglobules formed, volatile sulfur condensed, and organic-precursor-rich icy mantles grew on grain surfaces. Sticking of grains (coagulation) to form protoaggregates may have occurred if cloud lifetimes were sufficiently long (48). With repeated cycling in and out of cold molecular clouds, mantled dust and any aggregates were repeatedly and progressively partially destroyed and reformed. Cassini mission data suggest the presence of iron metal in contemporary interstellar dust (9). From this and nanoparticulate metal observed in ion-irradiated silicates, we infer that irradiation in the diffuse ISM (by cosmic rays, for example) likely deposited sufficient energy to permit aggregation within the amorphous silicates of handfuls of metal atoms into nanometer-sized grains of FeNi metal. Upon collapse of the presolar molecular cloud and protoplanetary disk formation, the first-generation aggregate GEMS and nanoglobules, inherited from cycles through many prior molecular cloud environments and the presolar molecular cloud, were brought together with crystalline grains, likely transported from hot regions of the inner solar nebula, for the second generation of aggregation to form aggregate particles like IDPs that were incorporated in small, icy, cometary bodies. We suggest the second aggregation occurred in the outer regions of the collapsing cloud or young protoplanetary disk subsequent to silicate condensation at high temperatures. The high abundance of GEMS grains in some cometary IDPs (~100% of nominally inorganic grains, in some cases) indicates that the outermost regions were dominated by *a*-silicate-rich grains. To produce the observed N-bearing complex organics in the organic matrix, ice-mantled grains must have experienced a radiation-rich environment before their incorporation in a larger parent body. Vertical diffusion of dust above the midplane of the protoplanetary disk to warmer layers, even at large heliocentric distances, may have served this role (31). Thus, nanoglobules, GEMS grains, and their high-density mantles are all consistent with products of repeated cycling in and out of cold molecular clouds followed by radiation exposure outside of, or in, optically thin regions near the edge of the solar accretion disk formed from our presolar molecular cloud.

This proposed scenario addresses additional observations about GEMS. All GEMS grains, including those that are isotopically anomalous, show nanometer-scale elemental composition heterogeneity (17, 18), and it is often only collectively that GEMS grains are approximately solar in elemental composition. Elemental heterogeneity is expected if the population of initial, nanometer-scale grains, from which GEMS grains subsequently aggregated, comprised ISM-condensed grains and partially destroyed stellar grain fragments that acted as substrates for ISM condensation, physically separated by icy/organic mantles. We note that other researchers have proposed near-solar elemental compositions (e.g.,  $\pm 20\%$ ) as a means of identifying interstellar dust that does not display detectable isotopic anomalies (18, 49); however, incomplete ISM processing of the subcomponents in a dust grain, combined with chemical affinities, may produce objects that retain sufficient elemental compositional heterogeneity to be nonsolar but without sufficient isotopic compositional heterogeneity to be detectable by lower spatial resolution isotope analyses.

## Conclusion

This analytical study provides constraints on the formation conditions and aggregation processes resulting in GEMS grains in cometary IDPs by demonstrating that they are comprised of organic-mantled, *a*-silicate subgrains. These observations restrict GEMS formation by aggregation to cold environments and strengthen links to presolar interstellar dust. We favor a scenario involving cycling between dense molecular cloud and diffuse ISM environments to form *a*-silicate subgrains and suggest that

GEMS aggregates may have formed in the presolar molecular cloud. Then, final aggregation of GEMS together with other IDP components may have occurred in the collapsing cloud or outer regions of the protoplanetary disk. In this scenario, GEMS acted as the original bricks and mortar of the solar system, carrying rock-forming elements and organic carbon with diverse molecular chemistry from the cold ISM into the solar nebula, where remnants are preserved in small icy bodies that have avoided significant thermal and aqueous processing. There is more work to be done to fully illuminate the earliest stages of solar system body formation, and the results of this study may serve to motivate additional analyses, observations, and modeling.

## Methods

IDP samples were prepared by ultramicrotomy and analyzed by transmission electron microscopy using imaging to study petrography, energy dispersive X-ray spectroscopy for elemental compositions and mapping, and EELS for

organic composition and bonding analyses. SIMS using NanoSIMS provided C, N, and O isotopic composition mapping. FTIR spectra were acquired using a synchrotron source over entire samples. The multiple methods used in this study are identified in *Results* and described in more detail in *SI Appendix*.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.** We acknowledge the life-long passion, talent, dedication, care, and thoughtfulness of C.F., who unfortunately passed away prior to publication of this work. We thank E. Dobrica, F. Ciesla, G. Flynn, D. Glavin, S. Sandford, S. Wirick, A. Westphal, and H. Yubata for useful discussions. We also thank the anonymous reviewers of this manuscript and of an earlier version of this manuscript. Portions of this work were performed at the Molecular Foundry and the Advanced Light Source at Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, which are supported by the Office of Science, Basic Energy Sciences, US Department of Energy under Contract DE-AC02-05CH11231. H.A.I. acknowledges funding by NASA's Laboratory Analysis of Returned Samples and Emerging Worlds Programs (Grants NNX14AH86G and NNX16AK41G). J.P.B. acknowledges funding by NASA's Cosmochemistry Program (Grant NNX14AI39G). C.F. acknowledges funding by NASA's Cosmochemistry Program (Grant NNX14AG25G).

- Hoppe P, Leitner J, Kodolányi J (2017) The stardust abundance in the local interstellar cloud at the birth of the solar system. *Nature Astron* 1:617–620.
- Zhukovska S, Gail H-P, Trieloff M (2008) Evolution of interstellar dust and dust in the solar neighborhood. *Astron Astrophys* 479:453–480.
- Jones AP, Köhler M, Ysard N, Bocchio M, Verstraete L (2017) The global dust modeling framework THEMIS12. Gail H-P and Hoppe P (2010) the origins of protoplanetary dust and the formation of accretion disks. *Protoplanetary Dust*, eds Apai D, Lauretta DS (Cambridge Univ Press, New York), pp 27–65.
- Ysard N, et al. (2016) Mantle formation, coagulation, and the origin of cloud/core shine. II. Comparison with observations. (2016). *Astron Astrophys* 588:A44.
- Jones A (2014) The physical and compositional properties of dust: What do we really know? *Proceedings of the Life Cycle of Dust in the Universe: Observations, Theory, and Laboratory Experiments—LCDU 18-22 November 2013* (Proceedings Sci, Taipei, Taiwan), 20 p.
- Dwek E (2016) Iron: A key element for understanding the origin and evolution of interstellar dust. *Astrophys J* 825:136–142.
- Nuth JA, Rietmeijer FJM, Hill HGM (2002) Condensation processes in astrophysical environments: The composition and structure of cometary grains. *Meteorit Planet Sci* 37:1579–1590.
- Goodman AA, Whittet DCB (1995) A point in favor of the superparamagnetic grain hypothesis. *Astrophys J* 455:L181–L184.
- Altabelli N, et al. (2016) Flux and composition of interstellar dust at Saturn from Cassini's cosmic dust analyzer. *Science* 352:312–318.
- Fray N, et al. (2004) Experimental study of the degradation of polymers: Application to the origin of extended sources in cometary atmospheres. *Meteorit Planet Sci* 39: 581–587.
- Gail H-P, Hoppe P (2010) The origins of protoplanetary dust and the formation of accretion disks. *Protoplanetary Dust*, eds Apai D, Lauretta DS (Cambridge Univ Press, New York), pp 27–65.
- Sandford SA, Engrand C, Rotundi A (2016) Organic matter in cosmic dust. *Elements (Que)* 12:185–189.
- Bradley JP (2014) Early solar nebula grains—Interplanetary dust particles. *Treatise of Geochemistry*, eds Holland H, Turekian K (Elsevier-Pergamon, Oxford), 2nd Ed, pp 297–308.
- Messenger S, Keller LP, Stadermann FJ, Walker RM, Zinner E (2003) Samples of stars beyond the solar system: Silicate grains in interplanetary dust. *Science* 300:105–108.
- Floss C, et al. (2006) Identification of isotopically primitive interplanetary dust particles: A nanoSIMS isotopic imaging study. *Geochim Cosmochim Acta* 70:2371–2399.
- Dobrica E, Engrand C, Leroux H, Rouzaud J-N, Duprat J (2012) Transmission electron microscopy of CONCORDIA ultraCarbonaceous Antarctic micrometeorites (UCAMMs): Mineralogical properties. *Geochim Cosmochim Acta* 76:68–82.
- Bradley JP (1994) Chemically anomalous, preaccretionally irradiated grains in interplanetary dust from comets. *Science* 265:925–929.
- Keller LP, Messenger S (2011) On the origin of GEMS grains. *Geochim Cosmochim Acta* 75:5336–5365.
- Bradley JP, et al. (1999) An infrared spectral match between GEMS and interstellar grains. *Science* 285:1716–1718.
- Alexander CMO'D, Cody GD, De Gregorio BT, Nittler LR, Stroud RM (2017) The nature, origin and modification of insoluble organic matter in chondrites, the major source of Earth's C and N. *Chem Erde* 77:227–256.
- Nakamura-Messenger K, Messenger S, Keller LP, Clemett SJ, Zolensky ME (2006) Organic globules in the Tagish lake meteorite: Remnants of the protosolar disk. *Science* 314:1439–1442.
- Sandford SA, Walker RM (1985) Laboratory infrared transmission spectra of individual interplanetary dust particles from 2.5 to 25 microns. *Astrophys J* 291:838–851.
- Bradley JP, Humecki HJ, Germani MS (1992) Combined infrared and analytical electron microscope studies of interplanetary dust particles. *Astrophys J* 394:643–651.
- Bradley J, et al. (2005) An astronomical 2175 angstrom feature in interplanetary dust particles. *Science* 307:244–247.
- Keller JW, Coplan MA, Goruganthu R (1992) Electron energy loss spectra of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons. *Astrophys J* 391:872–875.
- De Gregorio B, et al. (2013) Isotopic and chemical variation of organic nanoglobules in primitive meteorites. *Meteorit Planet Sci* 28:904–928.
- Flynn GJ, Keller LP, Feser M, Wirick S, Jacobsen C (2003) The origin of organic matter in the solar system: Evidence from interplanetary dust particles. *Geochim Cosmochim Acta* 67:4791–4806.
- He A, Smith MA (2014) Solubility and stability investigation of titan aerosol analogs: New insight from NMR analysis. *Icarus* 232:54–59.
- Dartois E, et al. (2013) UltraCarbonaceous Antarctic micrometeorites, probing the solar system beyond the nitrogen snow-line. *Icarus* 224:243–252.
- Jones AP, et al. (2013) The evolution of amorphous hydrocarbons in the ISM: Dust modelling from a new vantage point. *Astron Astrophys* 558:A62.
- Ciesla FJ, Sandford SA (2012) Organic synthesis via irradiation and warming of ice grains in the solar nebula. *Science* 336:452–454.
- Vollmer C, et al. (2014) Fluid-induced organic synthesis in the solar nebula recorded in extraterrestrial dust from meteorites. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 111:15338–15343.
- Dartois E, et al. (2007) IRAS 08572+3915: Constraining the aromatic versus aliphatic content of interstellar HAcS. *Astron Astrophys* 463:635–640.
- Ehrenfreund P, Charnley SB (2000) Organic molecules in the interstellar medium, comets, and meteorites: A voyage from dark clouds to the early Earth. *Annu Rev Astron Astrophys* 38:427–483.
- Wiedenbeck ME (1984) The isotopic composition of cosmic rays. *Adv Space Res* 4: 15–24.
- Greenberg JM, Li A (1996) The core-mantle interstellar dust model. *The Cosmic Dust Connection*, ed Greenberg JM (Kluwer Acad, Dordrecht, The Netherlands), pp 43–70.
- Jones A (2015) Interstellar dust modelling: Interfacing laboratory, theoretical and observational studies (The THEMIS model). *Proc Int Astron Union* 11:313–316.
- Li Q, Liang SL, Li A (2014) Spectropolarimetric constraints on the nature of interstellar grains. *Mon Not R Astron Soc Lett* 440:L56–L60.
- Flynn GJ, Wirick S, Keller LP (2013) Organic grain coatings in interplanetary dust particles: Implications for grain sticking in the solar nebula. *Earth Planets Space* 65: 1159–1166.
- Supulver KD, Bridges FG, Tiscareno S, Lievove H, Lin DNC (1997) The sticking properties of water frost produced under various ambient conditions. *Icarus* 129:539–554.
- Kimura H, Wada K, Senshu H, Kobayashi H (2015) Cohesion of amorphous silica spheres: Toward a better understanding of the coagulation of silicate dust aggregates. *Astrophys J* 812:67.
- Jones AP, Tielens AGGM, Hollenbach DJ, McKee CF (1994) Grain destruction in shocks in the interstellar medium. *Astrophys J* 433:797–810.
- Draine BT (2003) Interstellar dust grains. *Annu Rev Astron Astrophys* 41:241–289.
- Kemper F, Briend WJ, Tielens AGGM (2004) The absence of crystalline silicates in the diffuse interstellar medium. *Astrophys J* 609:826–837.
- Zhukovska S, Dobbs C, Jenkins EB, Klessen RS (2016) Modeling dust evolution in galaxies with a multiphase, inhomogeneous ISM. *Astrophys J* 831:147.
- Mathis JS, Rumpl W, Nordsieck KH (1977) The size distribution of interstellar grains. *Astrophys J* 217:425–433.
- Rouillé G, Jäger C, Krasnokutski SA, Krebsz M, Henning T (2014) Cold condensation of dust in the ISM. *Faraday Discuss* 168:449–460.
- Ormel CVW, Paszun D, Dominik C, Tielens AGGM (2009) Dust coagulation and fragmentation in molecular clouds. I. How collisions between dust aggregates alter the dust size distribution. *Astron Astrophys* 502:845–869.
- Alexander CMO'D, Nittler LR, Davidson J, Ciesla FJ (2017) Measuring the level of interstellar inheritance in the solar protoplanetary disk. *Meteorit Planet Sci* 52: 1797–1821.