

### Influence of Elevated Atmospheric Carbon Dioxide on Transcriptional Responses of *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* in the Soybean Rhizoplane

MASAYUKI SUGAWARA<sup>1</sup>, and MICHAEL J. SADOWSKY<sup>1,2\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Soil, Water, and Climate, BioTechnology Institute, University of Minnesota, St. Paul, Minnesota 55108 USA; and <sup>2</sup>Microbial and Plant Genomics Institute, University of Minnesota, St. Paul, Minnesota 55108 USA

(Received October 25, 2012—Accepted December 30, 2012—Published online May 11, 2013)

Elevated atmospheric  $CO_2$  can influence the structure and function of rhizoplane and rhizosphere microorganisms by altering root growth and the quality and quantity of compounds released into the rhizoplane and rhizosphere via root exudation. In these studies we investigated the transcriptional responses of *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* cells growing in the rhizoplane of soybean plants exposed to elevated atmospheric  $CO_2$ . The results of microarray analyses indicated that elevated atmospheric  $CO_2$  concentration indirectly influenced the expression of a large number of genes in *Bradyrhizobium* attached to soybean roots. In addition, relative to plants and bacteria grown under ambient  $CO_2$ growth conditions, genes involved in C1 metabolism, denitrification and FixK<sub>2</sub>-associated genes, including those involved in nitrogen fixation, microaerobic respiration, respiratory nitrite reductase, and heme biosynthesis, were significantly up-regulated under conditions of elevated  $CO_2$  in the rhizosphere. The expression profile of genes involved in lipochitooligosaccharide Nod factor biosynthesis and negative transcriptional regulators of nodulation genes, *nolA* and *nodD*<sub>2</sub>, were also influenced by plant growth under conditions of elevated  $CO_2$ . Taken together, the results of these studies indicate that the growth of soybeans under conditions of elevated atmospheric  $CO_2$  influences gene expressions in *B. japonicum* in the soybean rhizoplane, resulting in changes to carbon/nitrogen metabolism, respiration, and nodulation efficiency.

Key words: Bradyrhizobium, elevated atmospheric CO2, microarray, rhizoplane, soybean

The concentration of carbon dioxide  $(CO_2)$  in the atmosphere has increased, mainly due to the burning of fossil fuels and changes in land use. An increase in the concentration of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> can significantly alter the function of terrestrial ecosystems (22, 39) and has been shown to directly increase plant growth and productivity due to the enhancement of  $CO_2$  fixation rates (6, 39). While the concentration of  $CO_2$  in soil is thought to be ~10–50 times higher than that found in the atmosphere, chiefly due to microbial respiration (27), below-ground microbial processes can be indirectly affected by elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> through increased root growth and rhizodeposition rates, and by changes in the quality and quantity of root exudates (41, 46). Numerous studies have shown that elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> leads to changes in microbial processes. Although the results of many of these studies have been contradictory, the processes thus far considered include changes in microbial C and N biomass, microbial number, respiration rates, organic matter decomposition, soil enzyme activity, microbial community composition, and bacteria mediating trace gas emission, such as methane and nitrous oxide (17, 21, 41, 46). Elevated concentrations of atmospheric  $CO_2$  typically stimulate plant carbon uptake through photosynthesis (10), which may bring additional N demands to support plant growth. If N is limiting, however, this may result in decreased plant and soil N concentrations (33, 40). Therefore, the activities of nitrogen fixation, nitrification, and denitrification processes by soil bacteria would be of great importance to

modify the N balance in terrestrial ecosystems. In contrast, legume crops might benefit from increased atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, because their symbiotic nitrogen fixation capacity allows them to counter usual N limitations to growth (42, 55). Thus, legume plants become more dependent on symbiotic N<sub>2</sub>-fixing bacteria for increased below-ground N availability. The biomass of several legumes species, including *Acacia* species, alfalfa (*Medicago sativa*), and mungbean (*Vigna radiata*), have been shown to increase under conditions of elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, and increased plant growth has sometime been correlated with enhanced nodulation and nitrogenase activity (7, 50). Elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> has also been shown to increase nitrogen fixation activity and nodulation of *Bradyrhizobium* in symbiosis with soybean (*Glycine max*) (38) and dry matter production by 50% (2).

The population structure of *Rhizobium* in the rhizosphere has been shown to be altered in response to elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration. Schortemeyer et al. (48) observed a doubling of the population of Rhizobium leguminosarum by. trifolii in the rhizosphere of white clover (Trifolium repens) growing under 600 ppm of CO<sub>2</sub>. In addition, Montealegre et al. (36) reported a shift in the community composition and an increase in the competitive nodulation of R. leguminosarum by. trifolii as a result of plant growth under an increased atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration. These authors postulated that the observed differences in population structure specifically found with the rhizobia might be due to changes in the quality and quantity of root exudates, including flavonoid compounds, which are inducers of the expression of rhizobial nodulation genes. Similarly, we found that the population structure of Bradyrhizobium

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author. E-mail: sadowsky@umn.edu; Tel: (612)–624–2706; Fax: (612)–625–2208.

*japonicum* and *B. elkanii* strains in soybean nodules is altered in response to elevated  $CO_2$ , especially during early soybean growing stages (Sugawara *et al.* unpublished). While elevated atmospheric  $CO_2$  has been shown to alter the structure of below-ground microbial populations, to our knowledge there have been no reports on the effects of this greenhouse gas on the gene expression of rhizobia, living in the plant rhizoplane and rhizosphere.

The oligonucleotide microarrays that we have developed have been used to examine the global transcriptional responses of *B. japonicum* USDA 110 to growth under osmotic and desiccation stress conditions, when cultured in minimal and rich media or in the presence of various inorganic and organic sulfur compounds, under chemoautotrophic conditions, and in the bacteroid state (12, 13, 15, 53). Based on these analyses, several new and well-characterized *Bradyrhizobium* genes have been shown to be specifically involved in tolerances to physiological stresses or to be responsive to growth conditions (12, 13, 15, 53). Thus, it was thought that this microarray platform may be a useful tool to analyze the transcriptional responses of *B. japonicum* cells growing in the soybean rhizoplane under conditions of elevated atmospheric  $CO_2$ .

The aim of this present study was to obtain a comprehensive understanding of the genetic responses of *B. japonicum* cells to growth in the rhizoplane of soybean plants exposed to an elevated concentration of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. Genomewide transcriptional analyses of root-attached *B. japonicum* cells indicated that the expression of several classes of *B. japonicum* genes, especially those involved in carbon/ nitrogen metabolism, microaerobic respiration, and nodulation, were altered in response to plant growth under elevated  $CO_2$  conditions versus their responses on plants grown under ambient  $CO_2$  conditions.

### **Materials and Methods**

### Bacterial strains, media, and growth conditions

The *B. japonicum* strains used in this study, SFJ14-36 (serogroup 38) and SFJ4-24 (serogroup 123), were isolated from root nodules of soybean plants (*Glycine max* cv. 93B15; Pioneer Hi-Bred) grown under conditions of elevated (550 ppm) or ambient CO<sub>2</sub> conditions, respectively (Sugawara *et al.* unpublished), at the Soy-FACE facility located in Champaign, IL (Soy-FACE web site; http://soyface. illinois.edu/index.htm). The *B. japonicum* USDA 110 was obtained from the USDA-ARS *Rhizobium* Germplasm Resource Collection in Beltsville, MD. *B. japonicum* cells were grown at 30°C, with shaking at 200 rpm, in arabinose-gluconate (AG) medium (45).

#### Soybean seedling growth in hydroponic systems

*B. japonicum* strains USDA 110, SFJ14-36 and SFJ4-24 were grown in 10 ml AG medium until the stationary phase, collected by centrifugation at  $8,000 \times g$  for 10 min, and washed twice with sterilized plant growth medium (16). The resultant cells were resuspended in 10 mL of the same plant growth medium to a final concentration of approximately 10° cells mL<sup>-1</sup>. Seeds of *G. max* cv. Lambert were immersed in 100% ethanol for 5 sec, surface sterilized in 1% sodium hypochlorite for 5 min, and washed 10 times with sterile distilled water. Sterilized seeds were placed on the surface of 1.5% agar in large (245×245 mm) petri dishes (Corning, Corning, NY, USA), and incubated, on a slope, at 27°C in the dark for 3 d. Empty pipette tip boxes (1–200 µL pipette tips, Tip One; USA Scientific, Ocala, FL, USA) were used to grow soybean seedlings for transcriptome analyses. A small hole was made in one side of the cover for insertion of an aeration tube, such that the cover could stay closed. Seedling growth boxes were sterilized by autoclaving, filled with 300 mL plant growth medium and sterilized aeration tubes were connected to an aeration pump that employed a sterile filter. Germinated soybean seedlings (60-70) were each aseptically transferred into holes in the growth boxes, and 3 mL washed bacterial suspension was added through an empty hole to provide approximately 107 cells mL-1 growth medium. Four replicates of seedling growth boxes were used for each CO2 treatment. Seedling boxes were covered with aluminum foil, transferred to a plant growth chamber, and the aeration pump (Luft Pump; Oceanic Systems, Dallas, TX, USA) was immediately started. Each pump supplied aeration to three growth boxes at a rate of 1.33 L min<sup>-1</sup>. Germinated seedlings were incubated for 3 d at 27°C in the dark. The elevated CO<sub>2</sub> concentration (550 ppm) in growth chambers was controlled using an APBA-250E indoor CO2 monitor (HORIBA, Kyoto, Japan). To investigate a direct influence of atmospheric elevated CO2 on the gene expression of Bradyrhizobium cells, 3 mL washed bacterial suspension was added to growth boxes without plant seedlings, and the boxes were incubated under the same conditions as described above.

### Sampling of root-attached Bradyrhizobium cells

All of the roots from the four replicates of hydroponic boxes were gently rinsed several times in sterile fresh plant growth medium to remove loosely adhering or non-attached bradyrhizobia. Rinsed roots were randomly cut with sterilized scissors and placed in 500 mL bottles containing 180 mL ice-cold extraction buffer (0.1% Na-pyrophosphate, pH 7.0, and 0.1% Tween 20) and 20 mL stop solution (5% H<sub>2</sub>O-saturated phenol, pH4.3, in 95% ethanol). Bottles were agitated at approximately 220 strokes per min for 30 min using an Eberbach model 6000 horizontal shaker (Eberbach, Ann Arbor, MI, USA). Extracts were filtered through three layers of Miracloth (Calbiochem. La Jolla, CA, USA) to remove plant cells and debris, and filtrates were centrifuged at  $8,000 \times g$  for 12 min. To investigate the direct influence of CO2 concentration on transcriptional responses, bradyrhizobia were added to growth boxes without soybean seedlings and 180 mL incubated bacterial suspension was immediately added to 20 mL cold stop solution, and centrifuged at  $8,000 \times g$  for 12 min. The resulting cell pellets from all experiments were immediately flash frozen in liquid nitrogen and stored in the freezer at -80°C until RNA extraction.

#### RNA isolation and microarray studies

RNA from frozen cell pellets was extracted using a hot phenol method and digested with DNaseI as previously described (12). RNA was purified MEGAclear kits (Ambion, Austin, TX, USA), and bacterial RNA was separated from the sample using Ambion MicrobeEnrich kits. The cDNA synthesis, Cy-dye labeling, microarray hybridization, and statistical analysis procedures used were as described by Chang *et al.* (12) and Cytryn *et al.* (13). Signal intensities from four microarray slides for each strain of rootattached cells or culture cells grown under elevated and ambient  $CO_2$  conditions were analyzed using Gene-Pix Pro 6.0 software (Molecular Devices, Sunnyvale, CA, USA). All microarray data have been deposited in Gene Expression Omnibus (GEO) and are accessible through the GEO web site (http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/geo/) under accession number GSE23296.

### Quantitative real-time RT-PCR (qRT-PCR)

The qRT-PCR reactions were performed as described by Sugawara *et al.* (52). Gene-specific primers for target and control genes for qRT-PCR analyses are shown in Table 1. Expression values for four biological replicates for each treatment were normalized to the expression level of the *parA* gene, which is a housekeeping control gene (bll0631) in the *B. japonicum* genome (13).

Cono	Sequence	e (5'→3')†	Amplican ciza (hp)
Gene	Forward primer	Reverse primer	- Amplicon size (op)
napE	CAACTGCGTCAAGGGCTACT	GATGTTGTTGGTGCGGAAG	280
nirK	GCGACTATGTCTGGGAGACC	TCGTCGTTCCACTTGCCTTC	205
norC	TGGGAGAAGAACTCCTGCAT	AGATCGTTGAGCTCCTGGTC	218
nosZ	CTGTTCGACGACAAGATCAA	AGCGAGATCAGCCATTTTCC	281
nodY	GAGAAGAGCTCCCAGACGTG	GCGTCTGCCTCTATTCTTCG	197
nodC	GCTAGACGTTATCGGGCAAA	AGATATTGATCGGCGTGTGG	209
$nodD_1$	CTGCTGCACATCCAACTCTC	GTTCATCAGAAAATGGCAGC	181
$nodD_2$	GAGGCTCTGATGCACATTGA	TCTGGCCGGATAACAAAATC	236
nolA	ACCTCACTCACGGACTTGCT	GCGAAGATCATCACGGATTC	249
parA	GGACGCCGATTACACCTATG	GTAGACCTTCTCGCCCATGA	282

Table 1. Quantitative RT-PCR primers used in this study

<sup>†</sup> Nucleotide gene sequences of *B. japonicum* USDA 110 were obtained from GenBank (account number: NC\_004463.1) and oligonucleotide primers were designed using Primer3 (http://frodo.wi.mit.edu/).

### Quantification of total phenolic compounds in root exudates

Root exudates (10 mL) from hydroponic boxes containing soybean seedlings were sampled after 3 d of incubation and evaporated to dryness using a rotary evaporator. Dried exudates were re-suspended in 250  $\mu$ L of 100% methanol and the total phenolic content of root exudates was determined using the colorimetric method described by Haase *et al.* (19). Calibration standards were prepared using gallic acid (Sigma, St. Louis, MO, USA) and the average concentration of phenolic compounds in samples was calculated after subtracting the mean value obtained from four individual control samples without seedlings (blanks).

### Results

# The influence of elevated atmospheric $CO_2$ on the transcriptional responses of Bradyrhizobium japonicum in the soybean rhizoplane

The influence of elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration on the transcriptional responses of B. japonicum USDA 110 strain in the soybean rhizoplane was investigated by inoculating soybean plants with USDA 110 cells in a hydroponic growth box, and incubating plants under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (550 ppm) or ambient CO<sub>2</sub> (370–380 ppm) conditions. To observe any influences in the initial stages of plantmicrobe interactions, young soybean seedlings (3-6 days old) were used. Previous studies have shown that dark CO<sub>2</sub> fixation is quicker than light-induced CO<sub>2</sub> fixation in 3–7 days old soybeans (1). Root-attached Bradyrhizobium cells were obtained from soybean roots after 3 d of incubation, and total RNA was isolated for microarray analyses. The direct influence of elevated CO2 on transcriptional responses in USDA 110 was investigated by incubating Bradyrhizobium cells in the same growth box without seedlings under the same CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations as above. Cells obtained from the box after 3 d of incubation were used for microarray analyses. Signal intensities from four hybridized microarray slides were analyzed and fold-changes of gene expression levels in Bradyrhizobium were calculated from cells grown under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> conditions, relative to those grown under ambient CO<sub>2</sub> conditions. Results of these studies indicated that when Bradyrhizobium was grown in the rhizoplane of plants incubated under conditions of elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, 362 genes in USDA 110 were significantly (q value  $\leq 0.05$ ) up- and 242 genes were down-regulated more than 1.5-fold, relative to



Fig. 1. Venn diagram showing numbers of statistically significant up- and down-regulated genes in microarray analyses of mRNA from *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* strains grown in the rhizoplane of soybean plants exposed to atmospheric elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. Values shown are  $\geq 1.5$ -fold enhanced differential expression in CO<sub>2</sub>-exposed plants relative to those grown under ambient conditions. Numbers shown in parentheses indicate the total number of significantly regulated genes of each strain. Four arrays, representing 8 replicates of each ORF, were analyzed for each strain.

plants grown under ambient CO<sub>2</sub> conditions (Fig. 1). In contrast, only 29 genes were differentially regulated ( $\geq 1.5$ -fold) in USDA 110 cells grown in growth boxes without soybean plants under conditions of elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, relative to the ambient CO<sub>2</sub> concentration (Supplementary Table S1). Taken together, the results of these analyses showed that exposure of soybean plants to an elevated concentration of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> led to the induction of genes in *B. japonicum* through soybean roots.

## Transcriptional changes in B. japonicum isolate strains in response to elevated $CO_2$

The *B. japonicum* strains SFJ14-36 and SFJ4-24 were specifically isolated from root nodules of field-grown soybean plants grown under conditions of elevated (550 ppm) or ambient  $CO_2$ , respectively (Sugawara *et al.* unpublished). In this study, the influence of elevated atmospheric  $CO_2$  on the transcriptional responses of each strain in the soybean rhizoplane was investigated and compared with both strains and/or standard strain USDA 110 grown under ambient  $CO_2$  conditions. Results of transcriptional analyses are shown in Fig. 1. A total of 373 and 102 genes were differentially up-

Logus	Gono	Fold change in expression in strain <sup>†</sup> (Elevated $CO_2/4$ mbient $CO_2$ )			Description
Locus	Gene	USDA110	SFJ14-36	SFJ4-24	
bll1200	hemA	2.7	2.0	1.6	5-Aminolevulinic acid synthase
blr2585	cbbL	1.5	1.6	2.1	Ribulose 1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase large subunit
bll2590	_	2.0	2.4	1.6	Hypothetical protein bll2590
bl12758	_	1.9	2.0	4.5	Two-component response regulator
blr2763	fixN	1.9	1.5	1.8	Cytochrome-c oxidase
bsr2765	fixQ	2.9	1.8	2.8	cbb3 oxidase, subunit IV
blr2767	fixG	2.3	1.7	4.1	Iron-sulfur cluster-binding protein
bsr6521	_	1.8	2.1	2.4	Hypothetical protein bsr6521
blr7089	nirK	2.6	1.8	1.7	Respiratory nitrite reductase
bl17086	hemN	2.9	2.0	2.6	Anaerobic coproporphyrinogen III oxidase
bl17551	_	3.4	2.1	1.9	Hypothetical protein bll7551
blr1067	_	-1.8	-9.8	-2.2	ABC transporter ATP-binding protein

Table 2. Commonly up- and down-regulated genes in *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* strains USDA 110, SFJ14-36, and SFJ4-24 growing in the rhizoplane of soybean plants exposed to elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>

<sup>†</sup> Differentially expressed genes were selected based on a  $\geq 1.5$  (or  $\leq -1.5$ ) -fold induction cutoff with q value  $\leq 0.05$ .



Fig. 2. Functional categories of statistically significant, differentially expressed genes in rhizoplane-grown *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* strains. Genes expressed in *B. japonicum* USDA 110, SFJ14-36 and SFJ4-24. Black and gray bars represent up- and down-regulated genes, respectively.

regulated more than 1.5-fold, relative to ambient CO<sub>2</sub> conditions, when strains SFJ14-36 and SFJ4-24, respectively, were grown in the rhizoplane of plants incubated under conditions of elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. In contrast, 392 genes in strains SFJ14-36 and 44 genes in SFJ4-24 were significantly downregulated (Fig. 1). Thirty-four up- and 13 down-regulated genes were commonly detected in both strains isolated from plants grown under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. In addition, 59 and 26 upregulated genes in SFJ14-36 and SFJ4-24, respectively, were also commonly detected in strain USDA 110. Eleven of the genes listed in Table 2 were up-regulated in all the tested strains in response to elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. The commonly regulated-genes in the three tested strains included those involved in microaerobic respiration for symbiotic nitrogen fixation (fixN, fixQ, fixG), heme biosynthesis (hemA, hemN), CO<sub>2</sub> fixation (cbbL), respiratory nitrite reductase (nirK), and a two-component response regulator gene (bll2758) located between the fixLJ (encoding a low-oxygen responsive two-component regulatory system) and the  $fixK_2$  genes (encoding a transcriptional regulator) involved in symbiotic nitrogen fixation.

The functional classification of the differentially expressed genes is summarized in Fig. 2. The differentially expressed genes belonging to the carbon cycling, nitrogen cycling, and cellular processes categories were generally more upregulated in root-attached *B. japonicum* strains grown under elevated  $CO_2$  conditions than in cells grown under ambient conditions. Included in these categories were genes encoding for  $CO_2$  fixation (*cbb* genes), a glutathione-dependent formaldehyde oxidation pathway (the *fdhDF*, *flhA* and *gfa genes*), the TCA cycle *nuo* genes, genes involved in denitrification (*nap*, *nir* and *nos*), nitrogen fixation (*fix* genes), and heat-shock chaperonin proteins. Moreover, genes involved in symbiosis with the host plant, including nodulation (*nod*, *nol* and *noe* genes), heme biosynthesis (*hem* genes), and EPS formation (*exo* and *ndv* genes) genes were up-

### Soybean Rhizoplane-induced Genes

**Table 3.** Significantly regulated carbon and nitrogen cycling and symbiosis-related genes in *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* strains growing in the<br/>rhizoplane of soybean plants exposed to elevated atmospheric  $CO_2$ 

Locus	Gana	Fold change in st	rain <sup>†</sup> (Elevated CO	D <sub>2</sub> /Ambient CC	D <sub>2</sub> ) Description
	Gene	USDA110	SFJ14-36	SFJ4-24	Description
Carbon cycling					
CO <sub>2</sub> fixation			_ ·		
blr2581	cbbF	—	2.1	1.7	D-fructose-1,6-bisphosphatase protein
blr2582	cbbP	—	2.2		Phosphoribulokinase protein
blr2584	cbbA	—	1.7	2.2	Fructose-1,6-bisphosphate aldolase protein
blr2585	cbbL	1.5	1.6	2.1	Ribulose 1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase large subunit
blr2586	cbbS	—	—	2.2	Ribulose 1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase small subunit
blr2587	cbbX	_	2.4	2.0	CbbX protein
C1 and alcohol meta	ıbolism				
blr6213	mxaF'	_	2.7		Methanol dehydrogenase large subunit-like
blr6215	flhA	_	2.2	2.1	Glutathione-dependent formaldehyde dehydrogenase
blr6216	gfa	—	3.4	_	Glutathione-dependent formaldehyde-activating enzyme
bll3135	fdhD	_	1.6	1.8	Formate dehydrogenase
bll3136	fdhF	_	2.0	2.0	Formate dehydrogenase alpha subunit
bl15912	glvA	_	2.6		Serine hydroxymethyltransferase
bll3998*	hcaA	1.8	3.4	_	Vanillin:oxygen oxidoreductase
bl15566		_	2.1	_	Putative sorbitol dehvdrogenase
blr3675		-16	1.6	_	Putative alcohol dehydrogenase
bll4784				15	Aldehyde dehydrogenase
bl15504		_	1.5		Putative polyvinyl-alcohol dehydrogenase
bll5655*		16	2.6		Alcohol dehydrogenase
blr6207	or a 1	2.0	2.0	_	Quinoprotoin athanol dahudraganasa
blr0335	елин		1.5	_	Putative carbon monoxide dehydrogenase small
bl15664	cooxM	—		2.3	Putative carbon monoxide dehydrogenase medium subunit
Dicarboxylic acid					
blr1277	mdcL	_	1.6		Malonate carrier protein
blr1278	mdcM	—	2.0		Malonate transporter
TCA cycle					1
bll0452	sucA	1.5			Alpha-ketoglutarate dehydrogenase
blr2316		—	1.7		Probable NADH-ubiquinone oxidoreductase chain F
blr2524		_	_	1.6	Electrotransfer ubiquinone oxidoreductase
bll3137	nuoF	_	2.1	_	NADH dehvdrogenase I chain F
bl14906	nuoL	_		1.6	NADH ubiquinone oxidoreductase chain L
bl14909	nuol	-18	16		NADH ubiquinone oxidoreductase chain I
bll4917	nuoC		16		NADH ubiquinone oxidoreductase chain C
bll6401	nuoe		1.6		I -lactate dehydrogenase
blr6519	fumC	_	1.6		Eumarase C
blr6707	june	23	1.0		Putative citrate lyace
Nitrogen cycling		2.5			i diative citrate iyase
Denitrification		1.0			Nitanua anida zaduatana
blr0315	nosZ	1.8			Nitrous oxide reductase
blr0316	nosD	1.6			Periplasmic copper-binding precursor
blr2804	nrtB	—	1.5	—	Nitrate ABC transporter permease protein
bl15732	nrtC	2.4			Nitrate ABC transporter ATP-binding protein
bsr7036*	napE	2.6	1.7	_	Periplasmic nitrate reductase protein
blr7037*	napD	2.7	—		Periplasmic nitrate reductase
blr7039*	napB	3.2	—		Periplasmic nitrate reductase small subunit precursor
blr7040*	napC	3.3	—		Cytochrome C-type protein
blr7084	nnrR	2.1			FNR/CRP-type transcriptional regulator
blr7089*	nirK	2.6	1.8	1.7	Respiratory nitrite reductase
blr7090		2.1			Probable periplasmic nitrate reductase
Nitrogen fixation					
blr1769	nifH		1.7		Dinitrogenase reductase protein
blr1883*	$rpoN_1$	1.7	1.6		RNA polymerase sigma-54 subunit
bll2757	$fixK_2$		1.6	7.7	Transcriptional regulator. Crn family
blr2763*	fixN	19	1.5	1.8	Cytochrome-c oxidase
	1		1.0	1.0	- Josefferie - Children

blr2764*	fixO	3.5	_	1.6	Cytochrome-c oxidase
bsr2765*	fixQ	2.9	1.8	2.8	cbb3 oxidase, subunit IV
blr2766*	fixP	4.4	_	2.2	cbb3 oxidase, subunit III
blr2767*	fixG	2.3	1.7	4.1	Iron-sulfur cluster-binding protein
blr2768*	fixH	3.0	_	2.5	FixH protein
blr2769*	fixI	1.7	1.6		E1-E2 type cation ATPase
blr5778	fixG	2.3			Nitrogen fixation protein
bll6061*	$fixK_1$	1.6		2.2	Transcriptional regulator, Crp family
Symbiosis	U U				
Nodulation					
bll1631	noeL	_	1.7		GDP-mannose 4,6-dehydratase
blr1632	nodM	5.9	_	_	Putative glucosamine synthase
bll2016	nolY	_	2.0		Nodulation protein NolY
blr2024	nodY	_	1.6	_	Nodulation protein NodY
blr2025	nodA	_	1.9		Acyl transferase
blr2029	nodU	_	1.8		6-O-carbamoyl transferase
blr2034	nolO	1.6			Nodulation protein NolO
blr2062	noeI	_	1.6		Nodulation protein Noel
blr1815	nolV	-1.7			Nodulation protein NolV
bll2019	nolA	1.7		-2.4	Transcriptional regulator, MerR family
bll2021	$nodD_2$	_		-2.3	Transcriptional regulator, LysR family
blr2027	nodC	_	_	-1.5	Chitin synthase
Heme synthesis					
bll1200	hemA	2.7	2.0	1.6	5-Aminolevulinic acid synthase
bll2007*	$hemN_1$	1.8	1.5		Coproporphyrinogen III dehydrogenase
bll7086*	hemN	2.9	2.0	2.6	Anaerbic coproporphyrinogen III oxidase
Polysaccharide form	nation				
bll2362	exoP	_	_	1.7	Succinoglycan biosynthesis transport protein
bll4612	ndvC	-1.5	1.7		Putative beta (1-6) glucans synthase
bll7574	exoM		1.5		UDP-hexose transferase
blr0562		_	1.8	_	Putative polysaccharide deacetylase

<sup>†</sup> Differentially expressed genes were selected based on a  $\geq 1.5$  (or  $\leq -1.5$ ) -fold induction cutoff with *q* value  $\leq 0.05$ . —; Not significantly regulated. \* FixK<sub>2</sub>-regulated genes identified by Mesa *et al.* (35).

regulated in strain SFJ14-36. In contrast, there was less of an effect of elevated  $CO_2$  on the expression of genes involved in symbiosis in strains SFJ4-24 and USDA 110 (Fig. 2). Genes annotated as encoding hypothetical proteins comprised about 50% of the differentially expressed genes in each data set. Taken together, the results of these analyses showed that exposure of soybean plants to an elevated concentration of atmospheric  $CO_2$  led to the induction of genes that are involved in carbon and nitrogen metabolism, and nodulation of soybean in rhizoplane-associating *Bradyrhizobium* strains. These genes are described in more detail below, and all differentially expressed genes are listed in supplementary Table S2.

## *Induction of* Bradyrhizobium *genes involved in carbon metabolism in response to elevated* CO<sub>2</sub>

Several *B. japonicum* genes involved in carbon cycling were up-regulated in the soybean rhizoplane when plants were grown in the presence of elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. Results in Table 3 show that the up-regulated, differentially expressed genes included those involved in CO<sub>2</sub> fixation (*cbb* genes), the glutathione-dependent formaldehyde oxidation pathway (*fdhDF*, *flhA*, *gfa* genes), and the TCA cycle (*nuo*, *sucA*, *fumC* genes) in strains SFJ14-36 and SFJ4-24. In addition, elevated CO<sub>2</sub> resulted in the up-regulations of alcohol dehydrogenase genes, and a vanillin:oxygen oxidoreductase gene (*hcaB*) involved in the degradation of methoxy phenolic lignin monomers in both SJ14-36 and

USDA 110, and malonate uptake (mdcLM), and carbon monoxide dehydrogenase genes in strain SFJ14-36. These results suggested that atmospheric elevated CO<sub>2</sub> likely led to increased quantities of fixed carbon, including phenolic compounds and alcohol, in root exudates and, in turn, induced the expression of these carbon metabolic genes in *B. japonicum* cells.

### *Induction of genes involved in nitrogen cycling in response to elevated CO*<sub>2</sub>

B. japonicum is thought to be the only Bradyrhizobium species that is a true denitrifier (34). When nitrate serves as the terminal electron acceptor and the sole source of nitrogen, this bacterium reduces  $NO_3^-$  simultaneously to  $N_2$  when cultured microaerobically. Genome sequence analysis of B. japonicum strain USDA 110 indicated that this bacterium has a complete and functional set of genes for denitrifying  $NO_3^-$  to  $N_2$  (25, 47). The microarray analyses performed here indicated that the denitrification gene *nirK* (encoding the respiratory nitrite reductase), nap genes (encoding a periplasmic nitrate reductase), nos genes (encoding a nitrous oxide reductase) and nrt genes (encoding a nitrate ABC transporter) in strain USDA 110 were significantly upregulated in response to atmospheric elevated CO<sub>2</sub> concentration in the soybean rhizoplane. Similarly, up-regulation of nirK was also detected in strains SFJ14-36 and SFJ4-24.

Results of quantitative RT-PCR analyses (Table 4), which were used to quantify gene expression of the denitrification

**Table 4.** Gene expression levels of denitrification and nodulation genes in *Bradyrhizobium* strains grown in the rhizoplane of soybean plants under conditions of elevated atmospheric  $CO_2$ 

Cono	Relative expression in strain <sup>†</sup>					
Gene	USDA110	SFJ14-36	SFJ4-24			
Denitrification						
napE	4.3*	1.2	0.9			
nirK	3.3*	2.3*	8.3*			
norC	1.2	0.9	1.0			
nosZ	3.3*	ND	ND			
Nodulation						
nodY	1.1	3.9*	0.9			
nodC	1.5	3.5*	0.8			
$nodD_1$	0.9	1.3	0.8			
$nodD_2$	1.0	1.2	0.7*			
nolA	1.0	1.2	0.6*			

<sup>†</sup> Values determined by quantitative RT-PCR. The ratio of absolute gene expression value in *B. japonicum* cells in the soybean rhizoplane exposed to elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, relative to that of ambient CO<sub>2</sub> condition. Absolute gene expression values were normalized to the housekeeping gene *parA*. Asterisks indicate a significant difference between elevated CO<sub>2</sub> condition and ambient condition by ANOVA (*p*<0.05) of four biological replicates. ND: not detected.</p>

genes, indicated that the nirK gene was significantly upregulated in the rhizoplane in response to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> in all of the tested B. japonicum strains. While norC, encoding a nitric oxide reductase subunit, was not significantly upregulated in all tested strains, the expressions of napE (encoding a periplasmic nitrate reductase) and *nosZ* (encoding nitrous oxide reductase) significantly changed in strain USDA 110 in response to plant growth under an elevated atmospheric concentration when the strain was grown in the rhizoplane of plants incubated under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. These results were similar to those found using microarray analyses (Table 3). In contrast, amplification of nosZ was not detected in strains SFJ14-36 and SFJ4-24 when using RT-PCR with cDNA as templates (Table 4) or by conventional PCR using genomic DNAs from the same strains (data not shown). This suggests that either strains SFJ14-36 and SFJ4-24 do not possess a nosZ gene reacting with the tested primers or they lack this gene in their genomes.

In contrast, the  $fixK_2$  gene, which is a transcriptional regulatory gene involved in symbiotic nitrogen fixation, was induced in B. japonicum strains SFJ14-36 and SFJ4-24 in the rhizoplane of soybean plants exposed to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (Table 3). Mesa et al. (35) identified 51 FixK2-associated promoter regions in B. japonicum USDA 110 by global transcription and promoter analyses. Interestingly, 53, 23, and 14 of the up-regulated genes in USDA 110, SFJ14-36 and SFJ4-24, respectively, were well correlated with the transcriptionally active FixK<sub>2</sub>-associated genes reported by Mesa et al. (35) (Supplementary Table S3). These included genes involved in microaerobic respiration (fixNOQP and fixGHI), heme biosynthesis (hemA and hemN), denitrification (*nirK* and *nap* genes),  $fixK_1$  ( $fixK_2$  homolog gene), and  $rpoN_1$ (encoding the RNA polymerase  $\sigma^{54}$  subunit). These results suggested that either enhancement of fixed carbon or other metabolic products could be involved in the activation of FixK<sub>2</sub> and FixK<sub>2</sub>-regulated genes, and that these genes might play an important role in the adaptation of *B. japonicum* to microaerobic respiration on soybean roots grown under elevated  $CO_2$ .

### Changes in expression of symbiosis-related genes

One of our initial hypotheses was that the expression of genes involved in symbiosis with the host plant might be enhanced by alteration of the quality and quantity of *nod* gene-inducing compounds (i.e. flavonoids) exuded in the rhizoplane and rhizosphere of plants grown under elevated atmospheric  $CO_2$ . As shown in Table 3, six nodulation genes (nodY, nodA, nodU, noeL, noeI, nolY) in strain SFJ14-36 were up-regulated >1.5-fold in the soybean rhizoplane of CO<sub>2</sub>-grown plants, relative to that seen in bradyrhizobia recovered from plants grown under ambient CO<sub>2</sub> conditions. In contrast, nolA and nodD<sub>2</sub>, which are negative transcriptional regulators of nodulation gene induction, and nodC, which is involved in the synthesis of lipochitooligosaccharide Nod factors, were down-regulated in strain SFJ4-24 in response to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> conditions. The significant downregulation of the negative transcriptional regulator genes (nolA and  $nodD_2$ ) was verified by qRT-PCR analyses and only occurred in strain SFJ4-24 (Table 4). In contrast, qRT-PCR analyses indicated that both *nodY* and *nodC*, which are both essential for Nod factor biosynthesis in B. japonicum (4, 37), were up-regulated in SFJ14-36, but not changed in SFJ4-24 and USDA 110 (Table 4). These results indicated that the induction and repression of nodulation gene expression in response to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> in the soybean rhizoplane and rhizosphere likely occurs in a strain-specific manner and that more nodulation genes were up-regulated in the strain isolated from soybean nodules grown under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> conditions than in strains isolated from plants grown under ambient CO<sub>2</sub> conditions.

Exopolysaccharides (EPS) and cyclic beta-glucans have been shown to provide important functions for N<sub>2</sub>-fixing symbioses (8, 28). Results of the microarray analyses reported here indicated that ndvC (encoding a beta glucan synthase), exoM (UDP-hexose transferase), blr0562 (encoding a putative polysaccharide deacetylase) in *B. japonicum* strain SFJ14-36, and exoP (encoding succinoglycan biosynthesis transporter) in strain SFJ4-24 were up-regulated more than 1.5fold in response to growth in the rhizoplane of soybean plants exposed to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, relative to that seen under ambient conditions. These results suggest that *B. japonicum* may be induced to produce polysaccharides in the rhizoplane in response to elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, which may be ultimately related to biofilm formation and nodulation functions (18).

### Phenolic content of root exudates

Another of our initial hypotheses was that the quality and quantity of flavonoid (phenolics) root exudates in the rhizoplane and rhizosphere are altered in response to elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> (46). This hypothesis appears to be likely correct in the case of common beans (19). Results of analyses performed here indicated that total phenolic compounds, as measured using a colorimetric assay, were significantly greater (p<0.05) in root exudates from soybean plants grown under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (0.50 µmol g root DW<sup>-1</sup>) than under

ambient (0.43  $\mu$ mol g root DW<sup>-1</sup>) conditions. These results suggest that the production of total phenolic compounds in the soybean rhizoplane and rhizosphere, which include flavonoids and lignins, increase in response to elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, and this may lead to the induction of bacterial gene expression in the soybean rhizosphere.

### Discussion

Elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> is thought to indirectly affect microbial composition and function by altering root growth and the quality and quantity of fixed carbon released via root exudation (19, 41, 46). Although alteration of the carbon supply due to enhanced  $\mathrm{CO}_2$  fixation rates has been postulated to directly influence nitrogen cycling in soils (21), the influence of this greenhouse gas on the nitrogen-fixing symbiosis between B. japonicum and soybean is poorly understood. Recently, however, Prévost et al. (38) reported that elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> increased soybean nodule number and mass, and increased shoot dry weight, and C and N uptake compared to ambient CO<sub>2</sub>. The reasons, however, for the reported CO<sub>2</sub>-induced enhancement of the symbiosis are currently unknown. It was hypothesized that enhancement of the symbiotic interaction between bradyrhizobia and soybeans was likely due to enhanced plant root growth, water use efficiency, and root exudation, which secondarily influence the growth, colonization, and nodulation of bradyrhizobia growing in the soybean rhizoplane and rhizosphere. In the study reported here, we used transcriptome analyses in order to examine how gene expression in *B. japonicum* cells changed in response to atmospherically elevated CO<sub>2</sub> in the soybean rhizoplane.

The results of microarray analyses reported here showed that 604 genes in B. japonicum USDA 110 were differentially regulated, more than 1.5-fold, relative to ambient CO<sub>2</sub> conditions, when the bacterium was grown in the rhizoplane of plants incubated under conditions of elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. However, when the USDA 110 cells were grown in plant growth boxes without soybeans, only 29 genes were differentially-regulated (≥1.5-fold) in response to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. The direct effects of elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration on transcription might be included in the 604 differentially regulated genes since the control USDA 110 cells grown in carbon-free plant nutrient solution (without soybeans) are likely starved, with down-regulated transcription of some metabolic genes. However, the number of differentially regulated genes and transcriptional profiles that were observed in bacteria recovered from plants grown under conditions of elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> and control conditions were also totally different. Thus, these results suggest that the expression of bradyrhizobial genes is influenced by elevated atmospherically elevated CO<sub>2</sub> concentration in the soybean rhizoplane and this is likely caused by indirect effects mediated via plant roots.

In strain SFJ14-36, a large number of differentiallyregulated genes were detected (765 genes) in response to elevated  $CO_2$  concentration, relative to those seen in strain SFJ4-24 (146 genes). Results from these analyses suggested that strain SFJ14-36, which was originally isolated from nodules of soybean plants exposed to elevated  $CO_2$ , may be more transcriptionally responsive to the effect of increased carbon dioxide than strain SFJ4-24, which was isolated from soybean nodules of plants exposed to ambient CO<sub>2</sub>; however, the genome structure of either of these *Bradyrhizobium* isolates is likely different from USDA 110, due in large part to the existence of many genomic islands, including the large symbiotic island (25), which are horizontally acquired (14). Itakura *et al.* (23) also showed that some of the genomic islands in strain USDA 110 were missing in the genome of other *B. japonicum* strains. Based on these results, we cannot rule out the possibility that the decrease in the number of differentially expressed genes in strain USDA 110.

### Carbon metabolism

Microarray analyses indicated that carbon metabolism genes in Bradyrhizobium that are involved in CO<sub>2</sub> fixation, the TCA cycle, and a glutathione-dependent formaldehyde oxidation pathway (C1 metabolism) were up-regulated due to plant growth under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> conditions. While the  $CO_2$  concentration in soil is ~10-50 times higher than that found in the atmosphere (27), the experiments conducted in this present study were performed under gnotobiotic conditions using a hydroponic system. Thus, CO<sub>2</sub> was likely limiting for adequate uptake by bradyrhizobia, and induction of CO<sub>2</sub> fixation genes (Bradyrhizobium can grow as an autotroph) may be directly affected by an increased atmospheric (and dissolved) CO<sub>2</sub> concentration. However, the induction of CO<sub>2</sub> fixation genes was not detected in USDA 110 cells in response to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> when the cells incubated in nutrient solution without soybean plants (Supplementary Table S1); therefore, an elevated concentration of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> likely does not directly influence the expression of CO<sub>2</sub> fixation genes in Bradyrhizobium.

The glutathione-dependent formaldehyde oxidation pathway is involved in C1 metabolism and methanol oxidation in B. japonicum. Recently, Sudtachat et al. (51) reported that B. japonicum USDA 110 oxidized methanol, whereas a mxaF' mutant did not. Since mxaF' (encoding a methanol dehydrogenase) was also up-regulated in strain SFJ14-36, our results suggest that the activity of methanol oxidation to formaldehyde was also likely increased in response to elevated  $CO_2$ . Interestingly mxaF' is located upstream of blr6214 (encoding a cytochrome c), flhA, and gfa in B. japonicum, and these four genes form a transcriptional unit (25, 51). Thus, the gene cluster likely functions in methanol oxidation via a glutathione-dependent formaldehyde oxidation pathway. In addition, up-regulation of other alcohol dehydrogenase genes (bll5655, blr3675) in SFJ14-36 was observed following exposure to elevated  $CO_2$  (Table 3). Rhizobia have previously been shown to grow using ethanol as the sole C source (43), and elevated atmospheric  $CO_2$  has been shown to increase alcohol production in plants (11). Taken together, these results suggested that the induction of a glutathione-dependent formaldehyde oxidation pathway and alcohol dehydrogenase genes might be caused by an increase in alcohol exudation from soybean roots in response to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. However, it should be noted that these glutathione-dependent formaldehyde oxidation genes have also been shown to be induced when B. japonicum was grown

with methoxy phenolic lignin monomers, such as vanillin and vanillate, as sole carbon sources (24, 51). Increased lignin content in wheat was also observed under elevated  $CO_2$  (9), and Ainsworth *et al.* (3) reported that the expression of soybean lignin biosynthetic genes was up-regulated by elevated  $CO_2$ .

In the study reported here, we observed that the total concentration of phenolic compounds in soybean root exudates, which included lignin monomers, was significantly increased by the growth of plants under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. This result is consistent with what was previously reported for *Phaseolus vulgaris*, the host plant of *Rhizobium leguminosarum* bv. *phaseoli* (19). Thus, these results suggest that a plausible alternate hypothesis is that the up-regulation of glutathionedependent formaldehyde oxidation genes might also be due to increased phenolic-lignin content in the root exudates of soybean plants grown under an elevated atmospheric concentration of CO<sub>2</sub>.

### Denitrification and FixK2-associated genes

Hartwig et al. (20) proposed that increased microbial biomass due to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> might incorporate more available soil N, result in higher denitrification rates, and thus cause a shortage of available N for plant growth. While some studies have shown that elevated CO<sub>2</sub> generally results in decreased denitrification rates in soil, contradictory effects have also been reported (5). For example, Barnard *et al.* (5) suggested that CO<sub>2</sub>-induced reduction in denitrification rates was likely a secondary result of a decrease in soil nitrate, which likely results in the reduced availability of electron acceptors for denitrification. B. japonicum is thought to be the only Bradyrhizobium strain that is a true denitrifier (34), and when nitrate serves as the terminal electron acceptor and the sole source of nitrogen, this bacterium reduces NO3simultaneously to N2 when cultured microaerobically. Denitrification in B. japonicum USDA 110 depends on the napEDABC, nirK, norCBQD and nosRZDFYLX gene clusters, encoding nitrate-, nitrite-, nitric oxide- and nitrous oxide-reductases, respectively (34). The results of transcriptional analyses reported here showed that the expressions of napE, nirK and nosZ genes were induced in strain USDA 110 grown under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> concentration in the rhizoplane, suggesting that the denitrification rate by B. japonicum strain USDA 110 should be enhanced under high CO<sub>2</sub> concentration; however, this phenomenon might not be true for all bradyrhizobia as the nos gene cluster, which encodes N<sub>2</sub>O reductase, was not found in the genomes of other *Bradyrhizobium* strains (23, 47).

The *nirK* gene has also been shown to be involved in respiration and a Cu-containing nitrite reductase in *B. japonicum* has been described (54). Since the transcriptome data showed that *nirK* was significantly induced under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> conditions in all the tested *Bradyrhizobium* strains, our results suggest that NirK might be enhanced in soybean rhizoplane-localized *B. japonicum* cells in plants exposed to elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. The expression of *nirK* is also known to be dependent on FixK<sub>2</sub>, a transcriptional activator of a large group of genes involved in anaerobic and microaerobic metabolism. This allows for bacteroid respiration inside root nodules to support nitrogen fixation activity

(35). Results of transcriptome analyses also showed that some FixK<sub>2</sub>-regulated genes, such as those used for microaerobic respiration (*fixNOQP*, *fixGHI*) and heme biosynthesis (*hemN*), were induced in all of the tested strains in response to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (Supplementary Table S3). Taken together, these results indicate that enhancement of fixed carbon, or one of its other metabolic products, may be involved in activation of the FixK<sub>2</sub> regulon, and FixK<sub>2</sub> might play an important role in the adaptation of *Bradyrhizobium* to conditions conducive to microaerobic respiration that are likely found on soybean roots grown under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>.

### Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> alters the expression of nodulation genes

The B. japonicum nodulation genes (nod, nol, and noe) are positively regulated by NodD<sub>1</sub>, and negatively regulated by NolA and NodD<sub>2</sub> (32). The nolA gene (44), which is induced by chitin and bradyoxetin (29, 31) induces  $nodD_2$ expression, which in turn represses the expression of other nodulation genes (30). The microarray and qRT-PCR analyses reported here indicated that elevated CO<sub>2</sub> resulted in the enhanced expression of nodulation genes in some, but not all, Bradyrhizobium strains growing in the soybean rhizosphere. For example, nodY and nodC, which are essential for the biosynthesis of Nod factor (4, 37), were significantly up-regulated in strain SFJ14-36, or not changed in strain USDA 110 and SFJ4-24. In contrast, elevated atmospheric  $CO_2$  resulted in the down-regulation of *nodD*<sub>2</sub> and *nolA* only in strain SFJ4-24. Since strain SFJ14-36 was isolated from nodules of plants grown under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> conditions, and Bradyrhizobium is reported to have enhanced nodulation on CO<sub>2</sub>-grown plants (38), our data suggest that these growth conditions likely lead to an alteration of the expression of nod genes that subsequently results in enhanced nodulation of soybean due to an increase in Nod-factor biosynthesis. This may be due to an indirect effect of a CO2-induced enhanced production of nod gene inducers (genistein and daidzein) in root exudates in the soybean rhizosphere, which has been shown to occur in both Glycine max and Phaseolus vulgaris (19, 26). In addition, we show here that total phenolic compounds were increased by growth under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> conditions.

### Conclusions

Below-ground microbial processes are likely indirectly affected by elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> through increased root growth, increases in rhizodeposition rates, enhanced water use efficiency, and changes in the quality and quantity of root exudates released into the rhizosphere. These factors likely strongly influence the physiology and metabolism of microorganisms living in the rhizoplane (and rhizosphere) of plants. The transcriptomic data presented here highlight the physiological and metabolic changes in B. japonicum that occur in the soybean rhizoplane in response to plants grown under elevated atmospheric CO2 conditions. Overall, our results indicate that elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> resulted in changes in the expression of genes involved in carbon/ nitrogen metabolism, microaerobic respiration, and nodulation genes in rhizoplane-attached B. japonicum cells. While changes in the expression of nodulation genes only occurred in a strain-specific manner, this may be due to variations in the perception and response of individual *B. japonicum* genotypes to plant-released nodulation gene inducers from legume roots. It is our hope that the transcriptome data presented here provide a foundation for future work in studying the genetic and functional responses of microorganisms in the rhizosphere and their response to anthropogenic changes.

### Acknowledgements

We thank Dr. Eddie Cytryn and Mr. Philipp Christen for technical assistance with the hydroponic plant growth system. This study was supported, in part, by grant 0543238 from The National Science Foundation, and by funding from the University of Minnesota Agricultural Experiment Station.

### References

- 1. Abrahamsen, M., and A.M. Mayer. 1967. Photosynthetic and dark fixation of  $^{14}\rm{CO}_2$  in detached soybean cotyledons. Physiol. Plant. 20:1–5.
- Ainsworth, E.A., P.A. Davey, C.J. Bernacchi, *et al.* 2002. A metaanalysis of elevated [CO<sub>2</sub>] effects on soybean (*Glycine max*) physiology, growth and yield. Global Change Biology 8:695–709.
- Ainsworth, E.A., A. Rogers, L.O. Vodkin, A. Walter, and U. Schurr. 2006. The effects of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> concentration on soybean gene expression. An analysis of growing and mature leaves. Plant Physiol. 142:135–147.
- Banfalvi, Z., A. Nieuwkoop, M. Schell, L. Besl, and G. Stacey. 1988. Regulation of *nod* gene expression in *Bradyrhizobium japonicum*. Mol. Gen. Genet. 214:420–424.
- Barnard, R., P.W. Leadley, and B.A. Hungate. 2005. Global change, nitrification, and denitrification: A review. Global Biogeochem. Cycles 19:GB1007.
- Bazzaz, F.A. 1990. The response of natural ecosystems to the rising global CO<sub>2</sub> levels. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst. 21:167–196.
- Bertrand, A., D. Prevost, F.J. Bigras, R. Lalande, G.F. Tremblay, Y. Castonguay, and G. Belanger. 2007. Alfalfa response to elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> varies with the symbiotic rhizobial strain. Plant Soil 301:173–187.
- Breedveld, M.W., and K.J. Miller. 1994. Cyclic β-glucans of members of the family *Rhizobiaceae*. Microbiol. Rev. 58:145–161.
- 9. Bubenheim, D. 1990. Blue light and elevated CO<sub>2</sub> induce lignin synthesis in wheat. HortScience 25:1078.
- Canadell, J.G., L.F. Pitelka, and J.S.I. Ingram. 1996. The effects of elevated [CO<sub>2</sub>] on plant-soil carbon below-ground: A summary and synthesis. Plant Soil 187:391–400.
- Chang, L.A., L.K. Hammett, and D.M. Pharr. 1983. Carbon-dioxide effects on ethanol-production, pyruvate decarboxylase, and alcoholdehydrogenase activities in anaerobic sweet-potato roots. Plant Physiol. 71:59–62.
- Chang, W.S., W.L. Franck, E. Cytryn, S. Jeong, T. Joshi, D.W. Emerich, M.J. Sadowsky, D. Xu, and G. Stacey. 2007. An oligonucleotide microarray resource for transcriptional profiling of *Bradyrhizobium japonicum*. Mol. Plant-Microbe. Interact. 20:1298– 1307.
- Cytryn, E.J., D.P. Sangurdekar, J.G. Streeter, et al. 2007. Transcriptional and physiological responses of *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* to desiccation-induced stress. J. Bacteriol. 189:6751–6762.
- Dobrindt, U., F. Agerer, K. Michaelis, *et al.* 2003. Analysis of genome plasticity in pathogenic and commensal *Escherichia coli* isolates by use of DNA arrays. J. Bacteriol. 185:1831–1840.
- Franck, W.L., W.S. Chang, J. Qiu, M. Sugawara, M.J. Sadowsky, S.A. Smith, and G. Stacey. 2008. Whole-genome transcriptional profiling of *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* during chemoautotrophic growth. J. Bacteriol. 190:6697–6705.
- Franco, A.A., and D.N. Munns. 1982. Acidity and AI restraints on nodulation, nitrogen fixation and growth of *Phaseolus vulgaris* in solution culture. Soil. Sci. Soc. Am. J. 46:296–301.

- 17. Freeman, C., S.Y. Kim, S.H. Lee, and H. Kang. 2004. Effects of
- elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations on soil microorganisms. J. Microbiol. 42:267–277.
  18. Fujishige, N.A., N.N. Kapadia, P.L. DeHoff, and A.M. Hirsch. 2006.
- Investigations of *Rhizobium* biofilm formation. FEMS Microbiol. Ecol. 56:195–206.
- Haase, S., G. Neumann, A. Kania, Y. Kuzyakov, V. Romheld, and E. Kandeler. 2007. Elevation of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> and N-nutritional status modify nodulation, nodule-carbon supply, and root exudation of *Phaseolus vulgaris* L. Soil Biol. Biochem. 39:2208–2221.
- Hartwig, U., S. Zanetti, T. Hebeisen, *et al.* 1996. Symbiotic nitrogen fixation: one key to understand the response of temperate grassland ecosystems to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>? p. 253–264. *In* C. Köner, and F.A. Bazzaz (eds.), Carbon Dioxide, Pupulations and Communities. Academic Press, San Diego.
- He, Z., M. Xu, Y. Deng, *et al.* 2010. Metagenomic analysis reveals a marked divergence in the structure of belowground microbial communities at elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. Ecol. Lett. 13:564–575.
- Intergovermental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC). 2007. Climate change 2007. URL: http://www.ipcc-wg1.unibe.ch/publications/wg1ar4/wg1-ar4.html.
- Itakura, M., K. Saeki, H. Omori, *et al.* 2009. Genomic comparison of *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* strains with different symbiotic nitrogenfixing capabilities and other Bradyrhizobiaceae members. ISME J. 3:326–339.
- Ito, N., M. Itakura, S. Eda, *et al.* 2006. Global gene expression in *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* cultured with vanillin, vanillate, 4hydroxybenzoate and protocatechuate. Microbes Environ. 21:240– 250.
- Kaneko, T., Y. Nakamura, S. Sato, *et al.* 2002. Complete genomic sequence of nitrogen-fixing symbiotic bacterium *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* USDA110. DNA Res. 9:189–197.
- 26. Kretzschmar, F.D., M.P.M. Aidar, I. Salgado, and M.R. Braga. 2009. Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> atmosphere enhances production of defense-related flavonoids in soybean elicited by NO and a fungal elicitor. Environ. Exp. Bot. 65:319–329.
- Lamborg, M., R. Hardy, and E. Paul. 1983. The response of plants to rising levels of atmospheric carbon dioxide, p. 131–176. *In* E.R. Lemon (ed.), CO<sub>2</sub> and Plants, AAAS Selected Symposium 84. Westview Press, Boulder, CO.
- Leigh, J.A., and D.L. Coplin. 1992. Exopolysaccharides in plantbacterial interactions. Annu. Rev. Microbiol. 46:307–346.
- Loh, J.T., and G. Stacey. 2001. Feedback regulation of the Bradyrhizobium japonicum nodulation genes. Mol. Microbiol. 41:1357–1364.
- Loh, J.T., J.P. Yuen-Tsai, M.G. Stacey, D. Lohar, A. Welborn, and G. Stacey. 2001. Population density-dependent regulation of the *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* nodulation genes. Mol. Microbiol. 42:37–46.
- Loh, J., W.S. Carlson, W.S. York, and G. Stacey. 2002. Bradyoxetin, a unique chemical signal involved in symbiotic gene regulation. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 99:14446–14451.
- Loh, J., and G. Stacey. 2003. Nodulation gene regulation in Bradyrhizobium japonicum: a unique integration of global regulatory circuits. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 69:10–17.
- Mcguire, A.D., J.M. Melillo, and L.A. Joyce. 1995. The role of nitrogen in the response of forest net primary production to elevated atmospheric carbon-dioxide. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst. 26:473–503.
- 34. Mesa, S., M. Gottfert, and E.J. Bedmar. 2001. The *nir*, *nor*, and *nos* denitrification genes are dispersed over the *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* chromosome. Arch. Microbiol. 176:136–142.
- 35. Mesa, S., F. Hauser, M. Friberg, E. Malaguti, H.M. Fischer, and H. Hennecke. 2008. Comprehensive assessment of the regulons controlled by the FixLJ-FixK<sub>2</sub>-FixK<sub>1</sub> cascade in *Bradyrhizobium japonicum*. J. Bacteriol. 190:6568–6579.
- Montealegre, C.M., C. van Kessel, J.M. Blumenthal, H.G. Hur, U.A. Hartwig, and M.J. Sadowsky. 2000. Elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> alters microbial population structure in a pasture ecosystem. Global Change Biology. 6:475–482.
- Nieuwkoop, A.J., Z. Banfalvi, N. Deshmane, D. Gerhold, M.G. Schell, K.M. Sirotkin, and G. Stacey. 1987. A locus encoding host range is linked to the common nodulation genes of *Bradyrhizobium japonicum*. J. Bacteriol. 169:2631–2638.

- Prévost, D., A. Bertrand, C. Juge, and F.P. Chalifour. 2010. Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> induces differences in nodulation of soybean depending on bradyrhizobial strain and method of inoculation. Plant Soil 331:115– 127.
- Reich, P.B., B.A. Hungate, and Y. Luo. 2006. Carbon-nitrogen interactions in terrestrial ecosystems in response to rising atmospheric carbon dioxide. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst. 37:611–636.
- Rice, C.W., F.O. Garcia, C.O. Hampton, and C.E. Owensby. 1994. Soil microbial response in tallgrass prairie to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. Plant Soil 165:67–74.
- Rogers, H.H., G.B. Runion, and S.V. Krupa. 1994. Plant responses to atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment with emphasis on roots and the rhizosphere. Environ. Pollut. 83:155–189.
- Rogers, A., Y. Gibon, M. Stitt, P.B. Morgan, C.J. Bernacchi, D.R. Ort, and S.P. Long. 2006. Increased C availability at elevated carbon dioxide concentration improves N assimilation in a legume. Plant, Cell Environ. 29:1651–1658.
- Sadowsky, M.J., and B.B. Bohlool. 1986. Growth of fast- and slowgrowing rhizobia on ethanol. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 52:951–953.
- 44. Sadowsky, M.J., P.B. Cregan, M. Gottfert, A. Sharma, D. Gerhold, F. Rodriguez-Quinones, H.H. Keyser, H. Hennecke, and G. Stacey. 1991. The *Bradyrhizobium japonicum nolA* gene and its involvement in the genotype-specific nodulation of soybeans. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 88:637–641.
- 45. Sadowsky, M.J., R.E. Tully, P.B. Cregan, and H.H. Keyser. 1987. Genetic diversity in *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* serogroup 123 and its relation to genotype-specific nodulation of soybean. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 53:2624–2630.
- Sadowsky, M.J., and M. Schortemeyer. 1997. Soil microbial responses to increased concentrations of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. Global Change Biology. 3:217–224.
- Sameshima-Saito, R., K. Chiba, and K. Minamisawa. 2006. Correlation of denitrifying capability with the existence of *nap*, *nir*, *nor* and *nos* genes in diverse strains of soybean bradyrhizobia. Microbes Environ. 21:174–184.

- Schortemeyer, M., U.A. Hartwig, G.R. Hendrey, and M.J. Sadowsky. 1996. Microbial community changes in the rhizospheres of white clover and perennial ryegrass exposed to free air carbon dioxide enrichment (FACE). Soil Biol. Biochem. 28:1717–1724.
- Schortemeyer, M., O.K. Atkin, N. McFarlane, and J.R. Evans. 2002. N<sub>2</sub> fixation by Acacia species increases under elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. Plant, Cell Environ. 25:567–579.
- Srivastava, A.C., M. Pal, and U.K. Sengupta. 2002. Changes in nitrogen metabolism of *Vigna radiata* in response to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. Biol. Plant. 45:395–399.
- Sudtachat, N., N. Ito, M. Itakura, S. Masuda, S. Eda, H. Mitsui, Y. Kawaharada, and K. Minamisawa. 2009. Aerobic vanillate degradation and C-1 compound metabolism in *Bradyrhizobium japonicum*. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 75:5012–5017.
- Sugawara, M., E.J. Cytryn, and M.J. Sadowsky. 2010. Functional role of *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* trehalose biosynthesis and metabolism genes during physiological stress and nodulation. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 76:1071–1081.
- 53. Sugawara, M., G.R. Shah, M.J. Sadowsky, O. Paliy, J. Speck, A.W. Vail, and P. Gyaneshwar. 2011. Expression and functional roles of *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* genes involved in the utilization of inorganic and organic sulfur compounds in free-living and symbiotic conditions. Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact. 24:451–457.
- Velasco, L., S. Mesa, M.J. Delgado, and E.J. Bedmar. 2001. Characterization of the *nirK* gene encoding the respiratory, Cu-containing nitrite reductase of *Bradyrhizobium japonicum*. Biochim. Biophys. Acta. 1521:130–134.
- West, J.B., J. HilleRisLambers, T.D. Lee, S.E. Hobbie, and P.B. Reich. 2005. Legume species identity and soil nitrogen supply determine symbiotic nitrogen-fixation responses to elevated atmospheric [CO<sub>2</sub>]. New Phytol. 167:523–530.