



# Article Fungi Dominated the Incorporation of <sup>13</sup>C-CO<sub>2</sub> into Microbial Biomass in Tomato Rhizosphere Soil under Different CO<sub>2</sub> Concentrations

Hehua Wang<sup>1</sup>, Juan Wang<sup>2</sup>, Chaorong Ge<sup>1,\*</sup> and Huaiying Yao<sup>1,2,3,\*</sup>

- <sup>1</sup> Research Center for Environmental Ecology and Engineering, School of Environmental Ecology and Biological Engineering, Wuhan Institute of Technology, Wuhan 430073, China; 15902711089@163.com
- <sup>2</sup> Key Laboratory of Urban Environment and Health, Institute of Urban Environment, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Xiamen 361021, China; jwang@iue.ac.cn
- <sup>3</sup> Ningbo Key Laboratory of Urban Environmental Processes and Pollution Control, Ningbo Urban Environment Observation and Research Station—NUEORS, Institute of Urban Environment, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Ningbo 315800, China
- \* Correspondence: chaorongge@wit.edu.cn (C.G.); hyyao@iue.ac.cn (H.Y.)

Abstract: An elevated  $CO_2$  (eCO<sub>2</sub>) fumigation experiment was carried out to study the influence of various CO2 concentrations on microorganisms involved in the incorporation of root-derived C in greenhouse soil systems. In this study, 400 and 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> fumigation treatments were conducted during tomato planting. Phospholipid fatty acid (PLFA) profiling based on the stable isotope probing (SIP) technique was applied to trace active microorganisms. The absolute total abundance of <sup>13</sup>C-PLFAs was much higher under eCO<sub>2</sub> treatment. Most of the <sup>13</sup>C-CO<sub>2</sub> was incorporated into the <sup>13</sup>C-PLFAs 18:2ω6,9 (fungi), 16:0 (general PLFA), 18:1ω9c (Gram-negative bacteria, G<sup>-</sup>) and i17:0 (Gram-positive bacteria, G<sup>+</sup>) via rhizodeposition from tomato under ambient CO<sub>2</sub> (aCO<sub>2</sub>) and eCO<sub>2</sub> treatments, suggesting similar responses of active microorganisms to different CO<sub>2</sub> treatments. However, the fungi (characterized by the <sup>13</sup>C-PLFA 18:2w6,9) played a much more dominant role in the incorporation of root-derived C under eCO2. Actinomycetes, marked by the  $^{13}$ C-PLFA 10-Me-18:0, occurred only on labeling day 15 under the eCO<sub>2</sub> treatment, indicating that the actinomycetes fed on both soil organic carbon and fresh rhizodeposition. It was indicated that eCO2 significantly affected microbial biomass and microbial community structures involved in the incorporation of <sup>13</sup>C-CO<sub>2</sub> via tomato root secretions, as supported by Adonis analysis and the Mantel test.

Keywords: eCO<sub>2</sub>; PLFA-SIP; fungi; actinomycete; microbial community structures

#### 1. Introduction

Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations have been increasing annually since the Industrial Revolution, reaching 400  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> for the first time in 2013 [1]. eCO<sub>2</sub> could improve the net primary production and quality by accelerating photosynthetic rates and increasing water use efficiency [2–5]. At the same time, plant rhizodeposition, which accounted for 17% of photosynthates [6], was altered quantitatively and qualitatively under eCO<sub>2</sub> treatment [4,7–9]. As a consequence, microbial biomass was generally significantly increased under eCO<sub>2</sub> because of the increased carbon flow in plant root secretions [8,10], and the microbial community structure was affected by eCO<sub>2</sub> to different degrees depending on plant species [11], soil characteristics [11] and experimental designs [12,13]. However, whether the changes in microbial biomass and community structure were derived from increased rhizodeposition or soil organic matter remains largely unknown in most cases [11,14,15], which could ultimately affect the soil's nutrient balance and the sustainable development of ecosystems.



**Citation:** Wang, H.; Wang, J.; Ge, C.; Yao, H. Fungi Dominated the Incorporation of <sup>13</sup>C-CO<sub>2</sub> into Microbial Biomass in Tomato Rhizosphere Soil under Different CO<sub>2</sub> Concentrations. *Microorganisms* **2021**, *9*, 2121. https://doi.org/10.3390/ microorganisms9102121

Academic Editor: Ulrich (Uli) Stingl

Received: 24 August 2021 Accepted: 5 October 2021 Published: 9 October 2021

**Publisher's Note:** MDPI stays neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.



**Copyright:** © 2021 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/ 4.0/).

Under this condition, studies on the microorganisms responsible for the incorporation of root-derived C have received more and more attention and can provide insights into this phenomenon. Fungi (PLFAs 18:1 $\omega$ 9 and 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9) and G<sup>-</sup> (PLFAs 16:1 $\omega$ 7, 18:1 $\omega$ 7 and cy19:0) incorporated most of the  ${}^{13}C$ -CO<sub>2</sub> in a 5 h stable isotope labeling experiment in grassland soils [16]. Similarly, the <sup>13</sup>C-PLFA 18:2w6,9 was shown to significantly incorporate root-derived C, while bacterial PLFAs showed no significant changes in another experiment conducted on young beech trees [17]. For anaerobic incubation with <sup>13</sup>C-labeled urea in wheat-rice rotation soils, the <sup>13</sup>C-PLFA 18:1*w*9c was much more abundant when the wheat season changed into the rice season [18]. Furthermore, microbes involved in the incorporation of root-derived C were found to be significantly different under various  $CO_2$  concentrations with the support of Deoxyribonucleic acid-stable isotope probing (DNA-SIP) [19]. Bacilli, Gammaproteobacteria and Clostridia were dominant under aCO<sub>2</sub> treatment, while Bacilli and Betaproteobacteria were dominant under the eCO<sub>2</sub> treatment. Based on the above discoveries, it was found that fungi ( $18:2\omega6,9$ ) played a dominant role in incorporating root-derived C, and the changes in active microbial community structures were mainly dependent on ecosystems. eCO<sub>2</sub> stimulates the C flow from plant roots to soils and promotes microbial activity. Greater utilization of additional C resources and root secretions [20,21], a significantly higher abundance of genes associated with C and N cycling [22] and increased enzyme activity [23,24] indicate rapid nutrient cycling and the stimulation of microbial activity under eCO<sub>2</sub>. Unfortunately, the isotope pulse-labeling technique used in previous studies was less stable than the steady isotope labeling technique, and little research has focused on the effects of various  $CO_2$  concentrations, especially in greenhouse soil ecosystems.

Soils managed under plastic tunnel greenhouses, which are widely used in fruit and vegetable plantations and characterized by lower pH levels and nutrient-poor conditions under longer planting durations, have rarely been studied under various CO<sub>2</sub> treatments [22,25,26]. The soil microbial community composition in the rhizosphere soils of tomato changed insignificantly under various CO<sub>2</sub> treatments in our previous study [27]. However, the changes in active microbial community structures incorporating root-derived C were largely unknown. The Phospholipid fatty acid-stable isotope probing (PLFA-SIP) technique based on steady <sup>13</sup>CO<sub>2</sub> labeling can be used to reflect the changes in active PLFAs that are characteristic of diverse microbes [28].

A study demonstrated that the ideal concentration of CO<sub>2</sub> for the production of vegetables in greenhouses is 800–1000  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> [29]. It has been shown that eCO<sub>2</sub> can significantly improve crop photosynthesis, including that in tomatoes [30,31]. According to reports by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC, 2014) [1], atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> has been reached 400  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> in 2013, and it will increase at the rate of 1.9  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup>·y<sup>-1</sup>, reaching 550  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> in 2050. In previous studies about eCO<sub>2</sub> fumigation, higher CO<sub>2</sub> concentration was usually set as 550 [24], 700 [32] or 800  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> [26,33,34] and so on, and the ambient atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration was usually regarded as 400  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup>. In order to clearly reveal the stimulation of plant biomass under eCO<sub>2</sub> condition, 800  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> was also chosen in our study. As higher plant dry biomass usually means more root secretions, so only one higher eCO<sub>2</sub> concentration was chosen to induce significant changes of microbes.

In this study, a 2%  $^{13}$ C-CO<sub>2</sub> steady-state labeling experiment with the support of the PLFA-SIP technique was conducted in both tomato planted and unplanted soils, in which 400 or 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> fumigation was performed for 15 days because of the rapid metabolism of PLFAs. Based on our previous study that fungal biomass was significantly increased under eCO<sub>2</sub>, we hypothesized that fungi would play a dominant role in the incorporation of root-derived C under eCO<sub>2</sub> treatment. The aim was to reveal the differences in the compositions of active microbial communities that assimilate plant-derived carbon under various CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations.

#### 2. Materials and Methods

# 2.1. Study Site

In August 2020, the plow layer of the soil was sampled from a 10-year-old tomato greenhouse located in Wuhan city ( $30^{\circ}17'44''$  N,  $114^{\circ}16'34''$  E). The field holding capacity of the soil was 24.36%, and the moisture content of the air-dried soil was 2.86%. The soil pH was 5.31 (soil:water = 1:2.5). The total carbon and total nitrogen contents were 10.3 and 1.6 g·kg<sup>-1</sup> dry soil, respectively, and the C:N ratio was 6.49. The dissolved organic carbon (DOC) and dissolved organic nitrogen (DON) contents were 395.75 and 122.88 mg·kg<sup>-1</sup> dry soil, respectively. The soil NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N contents were 2.11 and 37.16 mg·kg<sup>-1</sup> dry soil, respectively. The soil was defined as loamy because sand, silt and clay accounted for 47.7%, 42.6% and 8.2% of its contents, respectively.

#### 2.2. Experimental Set-Up

In this study, each pot was filled with the equivalent of 200 g of soil (dry weight). The soils in each pot were passed through a 5.0 mm sieve, the water content was adjusted to 65% of the field holding capacity, and 0.2 g NPK fertilizer was mixed before the transplantation of the tomato plants.

The seeds of the tomato plants (*Solanum lycopersicum* L., Jinguan 28) were soaked in tap water (37 °C, 10 h) and then germinated at room temperature (25 °C) according to the planting instructions. Tomato seedlings were placed into larger pots ( $15 \times 12 \times 14$  cm) for seedling cultivation. After 13 days, three plants of similar sizes (5 cm length with 4 leaves) were transplanted into each small pot ( $9 \times 6 \times 9.5$  cm). All the pots were transferred to a controlled environment room (day 22–26 °C/night 15–19 °C; photoperiod, 12 h light; watered every two days with deionized water; CO<sub>2</sub> concentration, 400 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup>, controlled with a volumetric flow meter and a control panel).

All pots were divided into two parts: pots for plant growth and pots for soil incubation. In each part, two variants (CO<sub>2</sub> concentration and labeling days) were set. In total, 28 pots for plant growth (2 CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations (400 and 800  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub>) × 3 labeling days (labeling days 5, 10 and 15) × 4 replicates + 4 pots sampled on the day before labeling); 12 pots for soil incubation (2 CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations (400 and 800  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub>) × 1 labeling days (labeling days 15) × 4 replicates + 4 pots sampled on the day before labeling).

One week after transplantation (day 21), the pots were separated equally into two different CO<sub>2</sub> concentration treatment groups (400 or 800  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub>), and 2% <sup>13</sup>C-CO<sub>2</sub> steady-state labeling was performed. The two growth chambers were placed in the above-mentioned controlled-environment room, so the growth conditions were the same as those in the plant growth period. The steady-state labeling of <sup>13</sup>CO<sub>2</sub> was accomplished by mixing compressed air without CO<sub>2</sub>, natural <sup>12</sup>CO<sub>2</sub> and <sup>13</sup>CO<sub>2</sub> at fixed rates controlled by mass-flow controllers, which were described previously [30]. Briefly, the flow rates of <sup>13</sup>CO<sub>2</sub>, <sup>12</sup>CO<sub>2</sub> and air without CO<sub>2</sub> were set as 0.072 mL·min<sup>-1</sup>, 7.128 mL·min<sup>-1</sup> and 18 L·min<sup>-1</sup>, respectively, in the 400  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> chamber, while they were 0.144 mL·min<sup>-1</sup>, 14.256 mL·min<sup>-1</sup> and 18 L·min<sup>-1</sup>, respectively, in the 800  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> chamber.

In the pots used for plant growth, destructive sampling of tomato plants and rhizosphere soils was performed on days 21 (the day before labeling), 26, 31 and 36 (every 5 days after labeling). From the pots used for soil cultivation, soils were collected only on day 21 (the day before labeling) and day 36 (the end of the labeling experiment). Rhizosphere soils were harvested by collecting the soils adhering to the root after shaking and then freeze-dried for PLFA analysis. Plant shoots and roots were separated and dried (105 °C for 45 min and 60 °C for 48 h) for further analysis.

#### 2.3. Analysis of Biochemical Properties

To reflect the changes in the biochemical properties of the soils, the soil pH, moisture, DOC, DON,  $NO_3^{-}$ -N and  $NH_4^{+}$ -N were measured. The measurement details are available in a previous study [27]. In brief, the total C and total N levels in the soils were measured by

an elemental analyzer (Elementar Vario MACRO cube, Langenselbold, Germany) according to the operating instructions. The  $NO_3^-$ -N and  $NH_4^+$ -N in the soil were extracted with 2 M KCl at a 1:5 fresh soil to KCl ratio, and the extract was analyzed with a continuous flow analyzer (SKALAR, Delft, The Netherlands). The DOC and DON in the soil were extracted with 0.5 M K<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> at a 1:5 fresh soil to K<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> ratio and analyzed with a Multi N/C 2100S TOC/TN b analyzer (Analytik Jena, Jena, Germany). The % C and 13C/12C ratio of the soils and tomato roots and shoots were analyzed with a Flash EA 2000 Series Elemental Analyzer connected via a Conflo IV to a Delta V Advantage isotope ratio mass spectrometer (all Thermo Scientific, Germany) [35]. The isotope ratios were calculated according to a previous study [36].

#### 2.4. PLFA Analysis

PLFA extraction and analyses were performed according to the modified Bligh and Dyer method [37], the details of which were provided in a previous study [27]. The concentration and <sup>13</sup>C labeling of fatty acid methyl esters (FAMEs) were analyzed by using a Trace GC 1310 system with a combustion column attached via a GC IsoLink II system to a Delta V Advantage isotope ratio mass spectrometer (all Thermo Scientific, Germany) [36]. Other details were the same as those described in previous studies [36,38].

In total, 38 PLFAs were detected across all the treatments. Taking into account the concentration of <sup>13</sup>C among these 38 PLFAs, 19 PLFAs accounting for 90% of the total amount of PLFAs were considered valid and were finally retained for further analyses. These PLFAs were divided into the following categories according to previous reports [39]: general PLFAs (14:0, 15:0, 16:0, 17:0, 18:0 and 20:0), PLFAs from G<sup>-</sup> (16:1 $\omega$ 7c, cy17:0, 18:1 $\omega$ 9c and cy19:0), PLFAs from G<sup>+</sup> (i15:0, a15:0, i16:0, i17:0 and a17:0), actinomycetes (10-Me-16:0 and 10-Me-18:0), fungi (18:2 $\omega$ 6,9) and arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi (AMF) (16:1 $\omega$ 5c) [40].

The proportion (Pi) of <sup>13</sup>C in each PLFA was determined according to the mass balance equation below [36].

$$P_{i} = (AT\%^{13}C_{t} - AT\%^{13}C_{0})/(AT\%^{13}C_{g} - AT\%^{13}C_{0})$$
(1)

where AT% means the ratio of an isotope atom to the total atomic number of an element, AT%  $^{13}C_t$  and AT%  $^{13}C_0$  are the AT%  $^{13}C/^{12}C$  enrichment (%) of each PLFA in the rhizosphere soil at the end and beginning of labeling, respectively, and AT%  $^{13}C_g$  is the AT%  $^{13}C/^{12}C$  enrichment (%) of labeled CO<sub>2</sub> (%). The absolute amount of labeled  $^{13}C$  in each PLFA was defined as the product of Pi and the absolute concentration of carbon in each PLFA (the number of carbons multiplied by the absolute abundance of each PLFA).

#### 2.5. Statistical Analysis

Basic data processing, including the calculation of means and standard deviations (SDs), was performed with Microsoft Excel 2010. Tests of significant variation in the effects of CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations and labeling days on biochemical properties and plant biomass were conducted with the Scheirer–Ray–Hare test in R 3.6.3 with the rcompanion package [41]. Analyses of the effects of CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations and labeling days on microbial community structure (PLFAs) were conducted via Adonis analysis with 999 permutations in R 3.6.3. The assessment of whether the mol% of PLFAs or <sup>13</sup>C was correlated with environmental factors was carried out with Mantel tests. The principal component analysis (PCA) of 19 PLFAs was conducted with the help of IBM SPSS Statistics 22. Other figures were plotted by using Origin 2018.

# 3. Results

# 3.1. Effect of CO<sub>2</sub> Concentration on the Tomato Biomass and AT% $^{13}C/^{12}C$

The eCO<sub>2</sub> concentration significantly (p < 0.001) increased the shoot and root dry weights of tomato at the end of the labeling experiment (Figure 1a). However, both the labeling days and CO<sub>2</sub> concentration: labeling days had no effect on plant biomass during the whole labeling period (p > 0.05).



**Figure 1.** Changes in plant dry weights (**a**) and AT%  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  values of shoots and roots (**b**) during the 15 labeling days. 400:400 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment; 800:800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment. Bars represent the standard errors of the means (n = 4).

The natural AT%  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  values of the tomato shoots and roots were 1.06 before labeling. The AT%  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  values of the shoots and roots were significantly (p < 0.001) higher under the eCO<sub>2</sub> treatment, while the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration:labeling days produced no significant (p > 0.05) effects on these induces during the labeling period (Figure 1b). Specifically, the AT%  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  values of both tomato shoots and roots increased significantly (p < 0.05) with the labeling days under both the 400 and 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatments. Moreover, the AT%  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  values of the shoots and roots were greater than 2 (the AT%  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  value of the shoots and roots were greater than 2 (the AT%  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  value of CO<sub>2</sub> used in this experiment) on labeling days 10 and 15 under the 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment (Figure 1b), indicating that most of the carbon in the tomato shoots and roots was derived from photosynthesate after labeling day 10 under eCO<sub>2</sub>.

# 3.2. Effect of CO<sub>2</sub> Concentration on the Biochemical Properties of the Soils

The changes in the biochemical properties of the soils during the labeling period were analyzed. In the planted treatment groups, the soil pH was nonsignificantly influenced (p > 0.05) by the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration but decreased significantly (p < 0.001) with labeling days (Figure 2a). The soil moisture decreased significantly (p < 0.05) under the eCO<sub>2</sub> treatment

(Figure 2b). The CO<sub>2</sub> concentration significantly (p < 0.05) increased the soil DOC, while labeling days significantly (p < 0.05) decreased it, and CO<sub>2</sub> concentration:labeling days had no effect (p > 0.05) during the whole labeling period (Figure 2c). In particular, the soil DOC increased significantly (p < 0.05) with the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration but decreased significantly (p < 0.001) with labeling days. The soil DON was not influenced by the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration (p > 0.05) but decreased significantly (p < 0.001) with labeling days over the entire incubation period (Figure 2d). Similar to the soil DON, both the soil NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N decreased significantly (p < 0.001) with labeling days and were much lower (p < 0.05) under the eCO<sub>2</sub> treatments on labeling days 10 and 15 (Figure 2e,f). In the soil cultivation treatments, the soil DOC increased significantly (p < 0.05), while the soil NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N and soil NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N decreased significantly (p < 0.05), under the eCO<sub>2</sub> treatment (Table S1). The AT% <sup>13</sup>C/<sup>12</sup>C values of the soils remained at 1.082 before labeling day 5 in both the aCO<sub>2</sub> and eCO<sub>2</sub> treatments, while they increased significantly (p < 0.05) on labeling days 10 and 15 under the eCO<sub>2</sub> treatment.

#### 3.3. Effect of CO<sub>2</sub> Concentration on the Soil Microbial Community

In the tomato-planted treatment groups, the absolute abundance of total PLFAs was significantly (p < 0.05) higher under the eCO<sub>2</sub> treatments ( $30.8 \pm 0.6$  vs.  $38.5 \pm 3.6$  nmol·g<sup>-1</sup> soil) at the end of labeling. However, the total PLFA contents of soils from the unplanted treatment groups were not significantly (p > 0.05) affected by the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration, as the values in the 400 and 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment groups were 19.3 ± 0.4 and 20.1 ± 0.2 nmol·g<sup>-1</sup> soil, respectively.

Based on the distributions of 19 PLFAs on each sampling day, general bacteria (PLFA 16:0), G<sup>-</sup> (PLFAs cy19:0 and 18:1 $\omega$ 9c) and fungi (PLFA 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9c) were considered to be most abundant in both the planted and unplanted treatment groups (Figure S1). However, minor differences in the relative abundance of the abovementioned PLFAs existed between the planted and unplanted treatment groups. For example, the abundance of the fungal PLFA marker 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9 was much higher (p < 0.05) in the planted treatment groups than in the unplanted treatment group. For the significantly (p < 0.05) changed microbial PLFAs under various CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations, both the PLFA species and numbers (6, 3 and 5) changed with labeling days in the planted treatment groups. Specifically, the relative abundance of the PLFA 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9 (fungi) was not significantly affected by eCO<sub>2</sub> in the earlier labeling period (day 5) but was affected by eCO<sub>2</sub> on labeling days 10 and 15, finally accounting for more than 20% of the total PLFAs at the end of labeling (Figure S1).

Principal component analysis (PCA) based on the relative abundance of 19 PLFAs was conducted to reveal the effects of tomato plants and CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations on the microbial community composition (Figure 3). The microbial community compositions in the planted and soil cultivation treatment groups were separated on the first principal component axis (PC1), explaining 63.41% of the total variation, indicating the important role of tomato plants in shaping the microbial community structure. Analyses of the loading scores of PLFAs on the PC1 axis suggested that significant (p < 0.05) increases in i16:0 (score 0.081) and decreases in 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9 (score -0.082) and i17:0 (score -0.068) occurred in the soils without tomato (Figure S2), which was the same as the distribution of the mol% of PLFAs (Figure S1). Though the microbial community structures of soils from the 400-plant and 800-plant treatment groups were nicely clustered by direct visual observation (Figure 3), the *p* value of the Adonis analysis was above 0.05, which indicated that the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration had no significant effects on microbial community structure in soils from the planted treatments during the 15 days of CO<sub>2</sub> fumigation.



**Figure 2.** Changes in pH (**a**), moisture (**b**), DOC (**c**), DON (**d**), NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N (**e**) and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N (**f**) during the 15 labeling days under both the 400 and 800 treatments. 400:400  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment; 800:800  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment. Bars represent the standard errors of the means (*n* = 4). \*: *p* < 0.05; \*\*\*: *p* < 0.001.





# 3.4. Variation in Soil Microbial Composition Incorporating $^{13}$ C-Rhizodeposition under Different CO<sub>2</sub> Concentrations

In the tomato planted treatment groups, the total <sup>13</sup>C incorporation into PLFAs was significantly stimulated by the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration (p < 0.05) and labeling days (p < 0.001), reaching 188.71 ± 16.14 and 456.76 ± 67.91 nmol·g<sup>-1</sup> soil in the 400-day 15 and 800-day 15 treatment groups, respectively (Table 1). The average enrichment rate of <sup>13</sup>C under the eCO<sub>2</sub> treatment was almost twice as high as that under the aCO<sub>2</sub> treatment (69% vs. 36%) (Table 1). However, in the soil incubation treatment groups, the average enrichment rate of <sup>13</sup>C was less than 2%, and <sup>13</sup>C labeling was not affected by the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration (p > 0.05) (Table 1). Based on the distribution of <sup>13</sup>C among fungal, general, G<sup>-</sup>, G<sup>+</sup> and actinomycete PLFAs, fungi and general bacteria were dominant in the planted treatments, while general bacteria and G<sup>-</sup> were dominant in the unplanted treatments (Figure S3).

Labeled Days	CO <sub>2</sub> Concentration (µmol·mol <sup>−1</sup> )	Labeled Amount (nmol·g $^{-1}$ ) Average $\pm$ STD	Enrichment Rate (%) Average $\pm$ STD
5	400 <sup>1</sup>	24.43 $\pm$ 4.39 ab $^2$	$7.43 \pm 1.35$ b
	800	$60.05\pm11.37~\mathrm{b}$	$15.13\pm1.45~\mathrm{c}$
10	400	$49.66\pm9.6~\mathrm{ab}$	$12.65\pm1.95~\mathrm{c}$
	800	$150.46 \pm 45.25 \text{ c}$	$34.27 \pm 6.29 \text{ d}$
15	400	$188.71 \pm 16.14 \text{ c}$	$35.82 \pm 2.33 \text{ d}$
	800	$456.76 \pm 67.91 \text{ d}$	$68.89\pm4.25~\mathrm{e}$
$CO_2$ concentrations	*		
Labeling days	***		
CO <sub>2</sub> concentration:Labeling days	ns		
Unplanted soil	400	$3.52\pm0.45~\mathrm{a}$	$1.08\pm0.14$ a
-	800	$5.61\pm0.79$ a	$1.65\pm0.22$ a

<sup>1</sup> 400:400  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatments; 800:800  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatments. <sup>2</sup> Values are means  $\pm$  standard deviation (n = 4). Values with different lowercase letters within a column and same stage are statistically significantly different at *p* < 0.05. \* *p* < 0.05; \*\*\* *p* < 0.001.

The percentage distribution of <sup>13</sup>C in the PLFAs revealed the composition of microorganisms that incorporated root-derived <sup>13</sup>C (Figure 4). In the unplanted soils, the <sup>13</sup>C in a general PLFA (16:0) and G<sup>-</sup> (16:1 $\omega$ 7c and 18:1 $\omega$ 9c) accounted for 60% of the total <sup>13</sup>C (Figure 4a), which was in accordance with previous results (Figure S3). In contrast, 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9 (fungi), 16:0 (general PLFA), 18:1 $\omega$ 9c (G<sup>-</sup>) and i17:0 (G<sup>+</sup>) were the most abundant <sup>13</sup>C-PLFAs under both 400 and 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> in the planted treatment groups, accounting for more than 85% of the total <sup>13</sup>C-PLFAs (Figure 4b–d).

The differences in the soil microbial community structure in terms of <sup>13</sup>C incorporation between the 400 and 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment groups was dependent on the labeling days, as indicated by both PCA and Adonis analyses (Figure 5, Table S2). Adonis analyses demonstrated that significant (p < 0.05) differences in the microbial community structure between the 400 and 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment groups occurred on labeling days 10 and 15 (Table S2). PCA further revealed that the 400-day 10 and 800-day 10 treatment groups were separated by PC1, while the 400-day 15 and 800-day 15 treatment groups were separated by PC2. In detail, the plant-derived <sup>13</sup>C contents of the PLFAs 16:0 (a general PLFA), 18:1 $\omega$ 9c (G<sup>-</sup>) and 16:1 $\omega$ 7c (G<sup>-</sup>) were much higher (p < 0.05) under the 400  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment, while the plant-derived <sup>13</sup>C contents of the PLFAs 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9 (fungi), 20:0 (general PLFA) and 10-Me-18:0 (actinomycetes) were much higher (p < 0.05) under the 800  $\mu$ mol mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment at the end of labeling period (Figure 4d). In terms of the AT%  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  values of PLFAs, 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9 and 18:1 $\omega$ 9c were the top two of the 19 discussed <sup>13</sup>C-PLFAs (Figure S4). Moreover, the AT%  $^{13}C/^{12}C$  values of 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9 exceeded 2 (the AT%  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  value of CO<sub>2</sub> used in this experiment) on labeling days 10 and 15 under in 800  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment group (Figure S4). In addition, the incorporation of  ${}^{13}$ C from CO2 into the PLFAs 10-Me-18:0 and 20:0 occurred only in the 800-day 15 treatment group (Figure 4b–d), although the difference in the mol% of the PLFAs 10-Me-18:0 and 20:0 between the 400-day 15 and 800-day 15 treatment groups was not significant (p > 0.05), suggesting that microorganisms containing the PLFAs 10-Me-18:0 and 20:0 were dependent mainly on the original soil carbon source (such as organic matter) in the 400  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup>  $CO_2$  treatment group and in the earlier period of  $eCO_2$  treatment (up to labeling day 10).

#### 3.5. Relationship between PLFAs and Environmental Factors

To reveal the associations between microbial compositions and soil and plant characteristics, Mantel test analyses were conducted based on the mol% of PLFAs or <sup>13</sup>C and three key factors (CO<sub>2</sub> concentration, DOC and total dry weight (TDW)). The whole PLFA profile was significantly (p < 0.05) related to DOC and TDW, while the whole <sup>13</sup>C-PLFA profile was significantly (p < 0.05) correlated with CO<sub>2</sub>, DOC and TDW (Table 2). However, when TDW or DOC was set as a covariate, the influence of DOC or TDW on the whole PLFA profile was not significant (p > 0.05), indicating that the soil DOC and plant TDW interacted with each other. When TDW or DOC was set as a covariate, the effect of CO<sub>2</sub> on the whole <sup>13</sup>C-PLFA profile was not significant (p > 0.05), indicating that CO<sub>2</sub> made an influence on <sup>13</sup>C-PLFA profile by stimulating the TDW and DOC. Furthermore, when DOC was set as a covariate, the effect of TDW on the whole <sup>13</sup>C-PLFA profile was significant (p < 0.05), suggesting that TDW could directly influence microbial community structures.

When specific PLFAs were considered alone, the results showed that CO<sub>2</sub> produced a significant (p > 0.05) influence on <sup>13</sup>C-18:1 $\omega$ 9c by increasing the tomato biomass, while it had a direct influence on 18:1 $\omega$ 9c (p < 0.05) (Table S3). In addition, both 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9 and <sup>13</sup>C-18:2 $\omega$ 6,9 were significantly (p < 0.05) related to TDW. However, CO<sub>2</sub> and TDW were significantly (p < 0.05) correlated with only the labeled <sup>13</sup>C-10-Me-18:0 and <sup>13</sup>C-20:0 (Table S3). The above results indicated that specific <sup>13</sup>C- PLFAs were correlated with environmental factors in various manners.



**Figure 4.** Differences in <sup>13</sup>C-PLFA composition (mol%) between the 400 and 800  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment groups in unplanted (**a**) and planted (**b**–**d**) soils on each sampling day. Labels shown in the figure represent significant <sup>13</sup>C-PLFA biomarkers (p < 0.05). 400:400  $\mu$ mol mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment; 800:800  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment. Bars represent the standard errors of the means (n = 4). \*: p < 0.05.



**Figure 5.** Principal component analysis of the <sup>13</sup>C–PLFA composition (mol%) of soil samples under various  $CO_2$  treatments during the 15-day labeling experiment. Values in parentheses on the axis labels indicate the percentage variation accounted for by each axis. 400:400 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup>  $CO_2$  treatment; 800:800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup>  $CO_2$  treatment.

**Table 2.** Mantel tests between PLFA or <sup>13</sup>C-PLFA and environmental factors under 400 and 800  $\mu$ mol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatments.

Factors –	PLFA Composition		<sup>13</sup> C-PLFA Composition		
	Mantel Statistic r	Significance	Mantel Statistic r	Significance	
CO <sub>2</sub>	0.3887	0.0562	0.4556	0.0289 *	-
DOC <sup>1</sup>	0.3636	0.0489 *	0.4281	0.0256 *	
TDW	0.4905	0.0204 *	0.7088	0.0008 ***	
CO <sub>2</sub> _DOC	0.1648	0.1881	0.1958	0.1594	
CO <sub>2</sub> _TDW	-0.0714	0.6301	-0.4199	0.9494	
DOC_TDW	-0.02641	0.5555	-0.2638	0.846	
TDW_DOC	0.3543	0.0685	0.6581	0.0035 **	

<sup>1</sup> Abbreviations: DOC, dissolved organic carbon; TDW, total dry weight; CO<sub>2</sub>\_DOC, the DOC was set as a covariate; CO<sub>2</sub>\_TDW, the TDW was set as a covariate; DOC\_TDW, the TDW was set as a covariate; TDW\_DOC, the DOC was set as a covariate. \*, p < 0.05; \*\*, p < 0.01; \*\*\*, p < 0.001.

# 4. Discussion

Similar responses of soil microorganisms to root-derived C under aCO<sub>2</sub> have been shown in previous studies [16,17]. The <sup>13</sup>C-PLFA 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9 was shown to significantly (p < 0.05) incorporate root-derived C, while bacterial PLFAs showed no significant changes in an experiment conducted on young beech trees [17]. In our results, the significantly higher abundance of <sup>13</sup>C among fungal and actinomycete PLFAs under eCO<sub>2</sub> treatment partially supports our hypothesis and is consistent with previous findings.

# 4.1. Effect of CO<sub>2</sub> Concentration on <sup>13</sup>C-Plant Biomass

The AT%  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  values of tomato shoots and roots were significantly (p < 0.05) increased in the 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment group (Figure 1b), in accordance with the general theory that eCO<sub>2</sub> is beneficial for plant photosynthesis [30,31]. In addition, the greater tomato root biomass and AT%  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  values of tomato roots (exceeding 2, the AT%  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  of CO<sub>2</sub> value used in this experiment) (Figure 1) might indicate that the quantity of  ${}^{13}C$ -root secretions increased in the 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment group, as rhizodeposition accounted for approximately 17% of the photosynthates [6] and an increase in fine roots usually indicates increased root secretion. The significant (p < 0.05) increases

in soil DOC (Figure 2c) and  ${}^{13}$ C among the PLFAs (Table 1) observed under eCO<sub>2</sub> further supported the above hypothesis.

#### 4.2. Effect of CO<sub>2</sub> Concentration on Microbial Community Structure

During the 15 days of CO<sub>2</sub> fumigation, the absolute abundance of the total PLFAs was significantly (p < 0.05) stimulated by eCO<sub>2</sub> treatment, while the overall microbial community structure (the PLFA profile) was not influenced by CO<sub>2</sub> concentration (Figure 3), as confirmed by Adonis analysis and Mantel tests (p > 0.05). The above results were similar to those of previous studies in which short-term eCO<sub>2</sub> fumigation usually led to increases in root rhizodeposition and microbial biomass [42] but had little influence on microbial community structure [27,43,44]. In fact, because of the differences in plant species, soil characteristics and experimental designs, the observed response of the microbial community structure to eCO<sub>2</sub> is not always the same [27]. A study conducted in a grassland revealed that even a longer period of eCO<sub>2</sub> fumigation produced no effect on the microbial community structure [45], which might be attributed to the specific ecosystem involved and the large pool of soil carbon underground. Therefore, a focus on the changes in microbes involved in the incorporation of root-derived C is essential for understanding the effect of eCO<sub>2</sub>.

# 4.3. Effect of CO<sub>2</sub> Concentration on <sup>13</sup>C-Microbial Community Structure

In this study, the <sup>13</sup>C-PLFAs 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9, 16:0, 18:1 $\omega$ 9c and i17:0 showed the highest activity in terms of the incorporation of rhizodeposited <sup>13</sup>C compared with other PLFAs under both 400 and 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub>, accounting for 85% of the total <sup>13</sup>C (Figure 4d), which was in accordance with previous studies conducted in forests or other nonflooded ecosystems [16,17]. Moreover, both the absolute abundance of total <sup>13</sup>C (Table 1) and the distribution of <sup>13</sup>C-PLFAs (Figure 5) changed significantly (*p* < 0.05) under eCO<sub>2</sub> at the end of the labeling period.

On the one hand,  ${}^{13}C$ -18:2 $\omega$ 6,9 (fungi) showed a significantly (p < 0.05) higher relative abundance under eCO<sub>2</sub> (56.9% vs. 50.8%) (Figure 4d). The dominant role of fungi (18:2 $\omega$ 6,9) in incorporating root-derived carbon has also been observed in previous studies [16,17,46]. The significantly increased relative abundance of the  ${}^{13}$ C-PLFA 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9 under eCO<sub>2</sub>, in accordance with experiments conducted in young beech trees [17], could be attributed to the characteristics of fungi. First, the suitable pH range for fungi is acidic; in the present study, it was 4.8 on average and decreased under eCO<sub>2</sub> (Figure 2a) [47]. Second, fungi can efficiently absorb nutrients through their long hyphal network to overcome the significant decrease in the soil N status, especially in the later stages of  $eCO_2$  fumigation (Figure 2d–f) [48]. Third, mutualism occurs between AMF and plant roots, and  $eCO_2$ further stimulates the growth of AMF and plants by increasing plant rhizodeposition secretion into rhizosphere soils [49,50]. Finally, fungi contain phenol oxidase, and this enzyme can mediate the absorption of sufficient N resources from recalcitrant C forms (such as lignin) with increased levels under  $eCO_2$  [51,52]. Therefore, the increase in fungi might be a general trend for  $eCO_2$  treatments in most studies. In addition, Mantel tests suggested that  ${}^{13}$ C-18:2 $\omega$ 6,9 was significantly (p < 0.05) related to TDW (Table S3), which means that fungi were affected mainly by the plant biomass or root secretions in this study. Therefore, the above results were consistent with the hypothesis that fungi played a much more dominant role in the incorporation of root-derived carbon under the eCO<sub>2</sub> treatment.

On the other hand, 20:0 (general PLFA) and 10-Me-18:0 (actinomycete) were involved in the incorporation of <sup>13</sup>C-CO<sub>2</sub> later in the eCO<sub>2</sub> treatment (such as 15 days) (Figure 4d). However, no significant (p > 0.05) variations in the mol% of 20:0 or 10-Me-18:0 existed between the 400 and 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment groups (Figure S1d). This result suggested that C among these two PLFAs was mainly derived from original soil carbon sources under aCO<sub>2</sub> treatment, but root-derived carbon (rhizodeposition) could also be utilized under the eCO<sub>2</sub> treatment, which was in accordance with the wide range of substrates utilized by actinomycetes [53]. Mantel tests demonstrated that <sup>13</sup>C-20:0 and <sup>13</sup>C-10-Me-18:0 were significantly (p < 0.05) correlated with the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration, TDW and CO<sub>2</sub> \_TDW (Table S3). Therefore, both general bacteria and actinomycetes also play an important role in the incorporation of root-derived carbon under long-term eCO<sub>2</sub> fumigation [19].

The PLFA 18:1 $\omega$ 9c is usually regarded as a biomarker of G<sup>-</sup> and fungi in agroecosystems and forest ecosystems, respectively [40]. In this study, <sup>13</sup>C-18:1 $\omega$ 9c (G<sup>-</sup>) was much more abundant (p < 0.05) under aCO<sub>2</sub> than under eCO<sub>2</sub> (8.8% vs. 6.3%) on labeling day 15 (Figure 4d). The Mantel test results further indicated that the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration affected <sup>13</sup>C-18:1 $\omega$ 9c by increasing the TDW (Table S3). A recent study of the anammox reaction of urea revealed that the relative abundance of <sup>13</sup>C-PLFA 18:1 $\omega$ 9c increased significantly (p < 0.05) during crop rotation from wheat to rice [18]. This might explain why <sup>13</sup>C-18:1 $\omega$ 9c was much more abundant under aCO<sub>2</sub>, and it could be attributed to the higher water status under aCO<sub>2</sub> (Figure 2b).

In addition, the whole <sup>13</sup>C-PLFA profile was also identified to be significantly related to CO<sub>2</sub> concentration (Mantel test, p < 0.05) (Table 2). The increase in plant biomass was considered to be the main mechanism underlying the above responses.

# 5. Conclusions

In this study, we focused on the changes in the overall microbial community structure and the subset of microbes involved in <sup>13</sup>C-CO<sub>2</sub> incorporation during 15 days of CO<sub>2</sub> fumigation at different levels. We demonstrated that the overall microbial community structure was not changed, while the microbes involved in <sup>13</sup>C-CO<sub>2</sub> incorporation significantly (p < 0.05) differed between the 400 and 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment groups from labeling day 10 onward. The Mantel test further revealed that the <sup>13</sup>C-PLFA profile was significantly related to the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration. In addition, the mol% of <sup>13</sup>C in the PLFAs 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9 (fungi), 20:0 (general PLFA) and 10-Me-18:0 (actinomycetes) were higher (p < 0.05) in the 800 µmol mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment group, while those of 18:1 $\omega$ 9c (G<sup>-</sup>) and 16:1 $\omega$ 7c (G<sup>-</sup>) were much higher (p < 0.05) in the 400 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment group. In summary, this study successfully revealed the important role of 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9, 10-Me-18:0 and 18:1 $\omega$ 9c in incorporating rhizodeposits under eCO<sub>2</sub>. The structures of <sup>13</sup>C rhizodeposits need to be analyzed to completely understand the mechanism of the effects of eCO<sub>2</sub> on soil microbes in future work.

**Supplementary Materials:** The following are available online at https://www.mdpi.com/article/10 .3390/microorganisms9102121/s1. Figure S1: Differences in PLFA composition (mol%) between the 400 and 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment groups in unplanted and planted soils on each sampling day. Figure S2: Loading scores of 19 PLFAs in the principal component analysis (PCA) at the end of the 15-day labeling experiment. Figure S3: <sup>13</sup>C-PLFA compositions (mol%) of fungi, general PLFAs,  $G^-$ ,  $G^+$  and actinomycetes in planted and unplanted soils during the 15-day labeling experiment. Figure S4: Changes in AT% <sup>13</sup>C/<sup>12</sup>C values of 18:2 $\omega$ 6,9 and 18:1 $\omega$ 9c under various CO<sub>2</sub> treatments during the 15-day labeling experiment. Table S1: Biochemical properties of the unplanted soils under various CO<sub>2</sub> treatments. Table S2: Adonis analysis based on mol% of <sup>13</sup>C-PLFAs between the 400 and 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment groups during the whole labeling period. Table S3: Mantel tests between special PLFAs or <sup>13</sup>C-PLFAs and environmental factors at the end of labeling in the 400 and 800 µmol·mol<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> treatment groups (*p*).

**Author Contributions:** Conceptualization, H.Y.; data curation, H.W.; funding acquisition, C.G. and H.Y.; investigation, H.W.; methodology, C.G. and H.Y.; writing—original draft, H.W.; writing—review and editing, J.W. and C.G. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

**Funding:** This research was funded by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (Grant Numbers 41976151 and 42077036).

Institutional Review Board Statement: Not applicable.

Informed Consent Statement: Not applicable.

**Data Availability Statement:** The data presented in this study are available in this article and Supplementary Materials.

Acknowledgments: We thank Yongxiang Yu, Jiantao Xue, Haoxin Fan, Xing Li and Ming Yuan for technical assistance.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

#### References

- IPCC. IPCC, 2013: Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change; Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, UK; New York, NY, USA, 2014; 1535p. Available online: trove.nla.gov.au/work/190076309 (accessed on 24 August 2021).
- Procter, A.C.; Gill, R.A.; Fay, P.A.; Polley, H.W.; Jackson, R.B. Soil carbon responses to past and future CO<sub>2</sub> in three Texas prairie soils. Soil Biol. Biochem. 2015, 83, 66–75. [CrossRef]
- Van der Kooi, C.J.; Reich, M.; Löw, M.; De Kok, L.J.; Tausz, M. Growth and yield stimulation under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and drought: A meta-analysis on crops. *Environ. Exp. Bot.* 2016, 122, 150–157. [CrossRef]
- 4. Calvo, O.C.; Franzaring, J.; Schmid, I.; Fangmeier, A. Root exudation of carbohydrates and cations from barley in response to drought and elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. *Plant Soil* **2019**, *438*, 127–142. [CrossRef]
- 5. Saha, S.; Sehgal, V.K.; Chakraborty, D.; Pal, M. Atmospheric carbon dioxide enrichment induced modifications in canopy radiation utilization, growth and yield of chickpea (Cicer arietinum L.). *Agric. For. Meteorol.* **2015**, 202, 102–111. [CrossRef]
- 6. Nguyen, C. Rhizodeposition of organic C by plants: Mechanisms and controls. In *Sustainable Agriculture*; Springer: Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 2003; pp. 97–123. [CrossRef]
- Bertin, C.; Yang, X.; Weston, L.A. The role of root exudates and allelochemicals in the rhizosphere. *Plant Soil* 2003, 256, 67–83. [CrossRef]
- Li, X.; Dong, J.; Chu, W.; Chen, Y.; Duan, Z. The relationship between root exudation properties and root morphological traits of cucumber grown under different nitrogen supplies and atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations. *Plant Soil* 2018, 425, 415–432. [CrossRef]
- 9. Badri, D.V.; Vivanco, J.M. Regulation and function of root exudates. *Plant Cell Environ.* **2010**, *32*, 666–681. [CrossRef]
- Wu, Q.; Congzhi, Z.; Zhenghong, Y.; Jiabao, Z.; Chunwu, Z.; Zhanhui, Z.; Jiananran, X.; Jinlin, C. Effects of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and nitrogen addition on organic carbon and aggregates in soil planted with different rice cultivars. *Plant Soil* 2018, 432, 245–258. [CrossRef]
- Yu, Z.; Li, Y.; Wang, G.; Liu, J.; Liu, J.; Liu, X.; Herbert, S.J.; Jin, J. Effectiveness of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> mediating bacterial communities in the soybean rhizosphere depends on genotypes. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* 2016, 231, 229–232. [CrossRef]
- 12. Runion, G.B.; Curl, E.A.; Rogers, H.H.; Backman, P.A.; Rodríguez-Kábana, R.; Helms, B.E. Effects of free-air CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment on microbial populations in the rhizosphere and phyllosphere of cotton. *Agric. For. Meteorol.* **1994**, *70*, 117–130. [CrossRef]
- 13. Wang, P.; Marsh, E.L.; Ainsworth, E.A.; Leakey, A.D.B.; Sheflin, A.M.; Schachtman, D.P. Shifts in microbial communities in soil, rhizosphere and roots of two major crop systems under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub>. *Sci. Rep.* **2017**, *7*, 15019. [CrossRef]
- 14. Blagodatskaya, E.; Blagodatsky, S.; Dorodnikov, M.; Kuzyakov, Y. Elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> increases microbial growth rates in soil: Results of three CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment experiments. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **2010**, *16*, 836–848. [CrossRef]
- Qiu, Y.; Jiang, Y.; Guo, L.; Zhang, L.; Hu, S. Shifts in the Composition and Activities of Denitrifiers Dominate CO<sub>2</sub> Stimulation of N<sub>2</sub>O Emissions. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2019, 53, 11204–11213. [CrossRef]
- 16. Treonis, A.M.; Ostle, N.J.; Stott, A.W.; Primrose, R.; Grayston, S.J.; Ineson, P. Identification of groups of metabolically-active rhizosphere microorganisms by stable isotope probing of PLFAs. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* **2004**, *36*, 533–537. [CrossRef]
- Esperschütz, J.; Gattinger, A.; Buegger, F.; Lang, H.; Munch, J.C.; Winkler, M.S.B. A continuous labelling approach to recover photosynthetically fixed carbon in plant tissue and rhizosphere organisms of young beech trees (Fagus sylvatica L.) using <sup>13</sup>C depleted CO2. *Plant Soil* 2009, 323, 21–29. [CrossRef]
- Zhang, Q.; Jin, H.; Zhou, H.; Cai, M.; Li, Y.; Zhang, G.; Di, H. Variation of soil anaerobic microorganisms connected with anammox processes by <sup>13</sup>C-phospholipid fatty acid analysis among long-term fertilization regimes in a crop rotation system. *Appl. Soil Ecol.* 2018, 133, 34–43. [CrossRef]
- Da Costa, D.P.; Dias, A.C.F.; Cotta, S.R.; Vilela, D.; de Andrade, P.A.M.; Pellizari, V.H.; Andreote, F.D. Changes of bacterial communities in the rhizosphere of sugarcane under elevated concentration of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. *GCB Bioenergy* 2018, 10, 137–145. [CrossRef]
- Mayr, C.; Miller, M.; Insam, H. Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> alters community-level physiological profiles and enzyme activities in alpine grassland. *J. Microbiol. Methods* 1999, 36, 35–43. [CrossRef]
- 21. Grayston, S.J.; Campbell, C.D.; Lutze, J.L.; Gifford, R.M. Impact of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> on the metabolic diversity of microbial communities in N-limited grass swards. *Plant Soil* **1998**, 203, 289–300. [CrossRef]
- 22. Diao, T.; Peng, Z.; Niu, X.; Yang, R.; Ma, F.; Guo, L. Changes of Soil Microbes Related with Carbon and Nitrogen Cycling after Long-Term CO<sub>2</sub> Enrichment in a Typical Chinese Maize Field. *Sustainability* **2020**, *12*, 1250. [CrossRef]
- Fang, H.; Cheng, S.; Lin, E.; Yu, G.; Niu, S.; Wang, Y.; Xu, M.; Dang, X.; Li, L.; Wang, L. Elevated atmospheric carbon dioxide concentration stimulates soil microbial activity and impacts water-extractable organic carbon in an agricultural soil. *Biogeochemistry* 2015, 122, 253–267. [CrossRef]

- 24. Zheng, J.-Q.; Han, S.-J.; Zhou, Y.-M.; Ren, F.-R.; Xin, L.-H.; Zhang, Y. Microbial Activity in a Temperate Forest Soil as Affected by Elevated Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. *Pedosphere* **2010**, *20*, 427–435. [CrossRef]
- 25. Cheng, L.; Booker, F.L.; Burkey, K.O.; Tu, C.; Shew, H.D.; Rufty, T.W.; Fiscus, E.L.; Deforest, J.L.; Hu, S. Soil microbial responses to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> in a nitrogen-aggrading agroecosystem. *PLoS ONE* **2011**, *6*, e21377. [CrossRef]
- 26. Haase, S.; Philippot, L.; Neumann, G.; Marhan, S.; Kandeler, E. Local response of bacterial densities and enzyme activities to elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> and different N supply in the rhizosphere of Phaseolus vulgaris L. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* **2008**, 40, 1225–1234. [CrossRef]
- 27. Wang, H.; Fan, H.; Yao, H. Effects of Elevated CO2 on Tomato (Lycopersicon esculentum Mill.) Growth and Rhizosphere Soil Microbial Community Structure and Functionality. *Agronomy* **2020**, *10*, 1752. [CrossRef]
- Wu, W.X.; Liu, W.; Lu, H.H.; Chen, Y.X.; Devare, M.; Thies, J. Use of <sup>13</sup>C labeling to assess carbon partitioning in transgenic and nontransgenic (parental) rice and their rhizosphere soil microbial communities. *FEMS Microbiol. Ecol.* 2009, 67, 93–102. [CrossRef]
- 29. Schonhof, I.; Kläring, H.P.; Krumbein, A.; Schreiner, M. Interaction Between Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> and Glucosinolates in Broccoli. *J. Chem. Ecol.* **2007**, *33*, 105–114. [CrossRef]
- Long, S.P.; Ainsworth, E.; Rogers, A.; Ort, D.R. Rising atmospheric carbon dioxide: Plants FACE the future. *Annu. Rev. Plant Biol.* 2004, 55, 591–628. [CrossRef]
- Korres, N.E.; Norsworthy, J.K.; Tehranchian, P.; Gitsopoulos, T.K.; Loka, D.A.; Oosterhuis, D.M.; Gealy, D.R.; Moss, S.R.; Burgos, N.R.; Miller, M.R. Cultivars to face climate change effects on crops and weeds: A review. *Agron. Sustain. Dev.* 2016, 36, 12. [CrossRef]
- 32. Butterly, C.R.; Wang, X.; Armstrong, R.D.; Chen, D.; Tang, C. Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> induced rhizosphere effects on the decomposition and N recovery from crop residues. *Plant Soil* **2016**, 408, 55–71. [CrossRef]
- Xu, Q.; O'Sullivan, J.B.; Wang, X.; Tang, C. Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> alters the rhizosphere effect on crop residue decomposition. *Plant Soil* 2019, 436, 413–426. [CrossRef]
- 34. Ferrocino, I.; Chitarra, W.; Pugliese, M.; Gilardi, G.; Gullino, M.L.; Garibaldi, A. Effect of elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> and temperature on disease severity of Fusarium oxysporum f.sp. lactucae on lettuce plants. *Appl. Soil Ecol.* **2013**, *72*, 1–6. [CrossRef]
- Martinsen, V.; Austrheim, G.; Mysterud, A.; Mulder, J. Effects of herbivory on N-cycling and distribution of added <sup>15</sup>NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> in N-limited low-alpine grasslands. *Plant Soil* 2011, 347, 279–292. [CrossRef]
- Yao, H.; Thornton, B.; Paterson, E. Incorporation of <sup>13</sup>C-labelled rice rhizodeposition carbon into soil microbial communities under different water status. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 2012, 53, 72–77. [CrossRef]
- 37. Bligh, E.G.; Dyer, W.J. A rapid method of total lipid extraction and purification. *Can. J. Biochem. Physiol.* **1959**, *37*, 911–917. [CrossRef]
- Thornton, B.; Zhang, Z.; Mayes, R.W.; Hogberg, M.N.; Midwood, A.J. Can gas chromatography combustion isotope ratio mass spectrometry be used to quantify organic compound abundance? *Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom.* 2011, 25, 2433–2438. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Zhang, H.; Ding, W.; Yu, H.; He, X. Carbon uptake by a microbial community during 30-day treatment with <sup>13</sup>C-glucose of a sandy loam soil fertilized for 20 years with NPK or compost as determined by a GC–C–IRMS analysis of phospholipid fatty acids. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 2013, 57, 228–236. [CrossRef]
- 40. Frostegård, Å.; Tunlid, A.; Bååthb, E. Use and misuse of PLFA measurements in soils. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* **2011**, 43, 1621–1625. [CrossRef]
- 41. Lai, J. Quantitative Ecology: Applications of the R Language; Higher Education Press: Beijing, China, 2014.
- 42. Canarini, A.; Wanek, W.; Merchant, A.; Richter, A.; Kaiser, C. Root exudation of primary metabolites: Mechanisms and their roles in plant responses to environmental stimuli. *Front. Plant Sci.* **2019**, *10*, 157. [CrossRef]
- Hodge, A.; Paterson, E.; Grayston, S.J.; Campbell, C.; Ord, B.G.; Killham, K. Characterization and microbial utilization of exudate material from the rhizosphere of Lolium perenne grown under CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* **1998**, *583*, 1033–1043. [CrossRef]
- 44. Zak, D.R.; Pregitzer, K.S.; Curtis, P.S.; Holmes, W.E. Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> and the composition and function of soil microbial communities. *Ecol. Appl.* **2000**, *10*, 47–59. [CrossRef]
- Guenet, B.; Lenhart, K.; Leloup, J.; Giusti-Miller, S.; Pouteau, V.; Mora, P.; Nunan, N.; Abbadie, L. The impact of long-term CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment and moisture levels on soil microbial community structure and enzyme activities. *Geoderma* 2012, 170, 331–336. [CrossRef]
- 46. Hayden, H.L.; Mele, P.M.; Bougoure, D.S.; Allan, C.Y.; Norng, S.; Piceno, Y.M.; Brodie, E.L.; DeSantis, T.Z.; Andersen, G.L.; Williams, A.L. Changes in the microbial community structure of bacteria, archaea and fungi in response to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and warming in an Australian native grassland soil. *Environ. Microbiol.* 2012, *14*, 3081–3096. [CrossRef]
- 47. Long, X.E.; Yao, H.; Huang, Y.; Wei, W.; Zhu, Y.G. Phosphate levels influence the utilization of rice rhizodeposition carbon and the phosphate-solubilising microbial community in a paddy soil. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* **2018**, *118*, 103–114. [CrossRef]
- Klamer, M.; Bååthb, E. Estimation of conversion factors for fungal biomass determination in compost using ergosterol and PLFA 18:2w6,9. Soil Biol. Biochem. 2004, 36, 57–65. [CrossRef]
- 49. Cheng, L.; Booker, F.L.; Tu, C.; Burkey, K.O.; Zhou, L.; Shew, H.D.; Rufty, T.W.; Hu, S. Arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi increase organic carbon decomposition under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. *Science* **2012**, *337*, 1084–1087. [CrossRef]

- 50. Lesaulnier, C.; Papamichail, D.; McCorkle, S.; Ollivier, B.; Skiena, S.; Taghavi, S.; Zak, D.; Van Der Lelie, D. Elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> affects soil microbial diversity associated with trembling aspen. *Environ. Microbiol.* **2008**, *10*, 926–941. [CrossRef]
- 51. Gill, R.A.; Polley, H.W.; Johnson, H.B.; Anderson, L.J.; Maherali, H.; Jackson, R.B. Nonlinear grassland responses to past and future atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. *Nature* **2002**, *417*, 279–282. [CrossRef]
- 52. Hu, S.; Chapin, F.S.; Firestone, M.; Field, C.; Chiariello, N. Nitrogen limitation of microbial decomposition in a grassland under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. *Nature* **2001**, *409*, 188–191. [CrossRef]
- 53. Ho, A.; Di Lonardo, D.P.; Bodelier, P.L.E. Revisiting life strategy concepts in environmental microbial ecology. *FEMS Microbiol. Ecol.* **2017**, *93*, fix006. [CrossRef]