REVIEW

OPEN ACCESS OPEN ACCESS

Taylor & Francis

Taylor & Francis Group

Persistent low-Level viremia in persons living with HIV undertreatment: An unresolved status

Celia Crespo-Bermejo^a, Eva Ramírez de Arellano^a, Violeta Lara-Aguilar^a, Daniel Valle-Millares^a, M^a Luisa Gómez-Lus^b, Ricardo Madrid^{c,d}, Luz Martín-Carbonero^e, and Verónica Briz^a

^aLaboratory of Reference and Research on Viral Hepatitis, National Center of Microbiology, Institute of Health Carlos Iii, Majadahonda, Madrid, Spain; ^bDepartamento de Medicina- Área de Microbiología. Facultad de Medicina. Universidad Complutense, Madrid, Spain; ^cParque Científico de Madrid, Campus de Cantoblanco, Madrid, Spain; ^dDepartment of Genetics, Physiology and Microbiology. Faculty of Biology, Complutense University of Madrid, Madrid, Spain; ^eUnidad de Vih. Servicio de Medicina Interna. Hospital Universitario La Paz. Instituto de Investigación Sanitaria Hospital de La Paz (Idipaz), Madrid, Spain

ABSTRACT

Antiretroviral therapy (ART) allows suppressed viremia to reach less than 50 copies/mL in most treated persons living with HIV (PLWH). However, the existence of PLWH that show events of persistent low-level viremia (pLLV) between 50 and 1000 copies/mL and with different virological consequences have been observed. PLLV has been associated with higher virological failure (VF), viral genotype resistance, adherence difficulties and AIDS events. Moreover, some reports show that pLLV status can lead to residual immune activation and inflammation, with an increased risk of immunovirological failure and a pro-inflammatory cytokine level which can lead to a higher occurrence of non-AIDS defining events (NADEs) and other adverse clinical outcomes. Until now, however, published data have shown controversial results that hinder understanding of the true cause(s) and origin(s) of this phenomenon. Molecular mechanisms related to viral reservoir size and clonal expansion have been suggested as the possible origin of pLLV. This review aims to assess recent findings to provide a global view of the role of pLLV in PLWH and the impact this status may cause on the clinical progression of these patients.

ARTICLE HISTORY

Received 31 May 2021 Revised 4 November 2021 Accepted 5 November 2021

KEYWORDS

HIV; pLLV; ART adherence; VF; reservoir; clonal expansion; immune activation; mortality; aids events and nades

Introduction

Human Immunodeficiency virus (HIV) viremia is related to increased AIDS events and death [1]. Nonetheless, the use of antiretroviral therapy (ART) reduces morbidity and mortality in persons living with HIV (PLWH) [2,3]. According to international HIV treatment guidelines, the main objective of ART is to achieve and maintain undetectable viral load (VL) over time, decrease HIV transmission, and avoid the emergence of drug resistance [4,5]. The establishment of a cutoff point of VL at which a patient can develop clinical events is thus essential. However, two different thresholds have been identified according to different international guidelines: 200 copies/mL [Department of Health and Human Services' (DHHS, USA)] [4] and 50 copies/ml (European AIDS Clinical Society) [5]. Current treatments enable levels of virologic suppression below the detection sensitivity of many standard assays [6]. Nevertheless, ART does not eradicate the virus and residual viremia (≈1-10 copies/mL) have

been found in a large number of patients after years of highly suppressive therapy [6–9].

Transient episodes of detectable viremia (blips) have been described in around 1/5 of HIV-infected patients undergoing suppressive treatment, whereas 4–10% of PLWH show persistent events of low-level viremia (\approx 50–500 copies/mL) [10–12]. Clinical consequences vary considerably according to the type of incomplete virologic suppression in question. For instance, no association has been found between blips and a greater risk of virologic and immunological failure [12–14], while persistent low-level viremia (pLLV) has been associated with the emergence of drug resistance [11,15–17], virological failure [10,14,18,19] and alteration of immune status [20–22].

Today, the role of pLLV in PLWH remains unclear and a lot of unresolved questions complicate management of these individuals. The aim of this paper is to review the possible causes and origins of pLLV in PLWH and the impact that pLLV may have on the

CONTACT Verónica Briz 🔯 veronica.briz@isciii.es

*The last two authors contributed equally

© 2021 The Author(s). Published by Informa UK Limited, trading as Taylor & Francis Group.

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

clinical progression of these patients according to recent findings.

Persistent low-level viremia: Definition and clinical implications

The scientific community has reached no definition regarding pLLV patients. In general, treated patients with HIV persistently presenting viremia from 50 to 1000 copies/ml have been considered pLLV patients (Table 1). However, clinical implications differ when considering patients with pLLV between 50 and 200 copies/ml [23–25] and patients with higher viremias (up to 400–500 [26–28] or up to 1000 copies/mL [11,29]).

An association between pLLV and a higher risk of virological failure (VF) has been previously observed (Table 1). Patients with pLLV >200 copies/mL experience 3-4 times the risk of developing VF than patients with ≤ 200 copies/ml [27,28,30], and up to 5 times the risk in patients with LLV between 400 and 999 cp/mL [31]. By contrast, the association between a pLLV below 200 cp/ml (50-200 cp/mL) and VF is unclear. While some studies have found an increased risk of VF only in patients with LLV between 201 and 500 cp/mL and not in patients with ≤200 copies/mL compared to undetectable HIV patients [30,32], others, such as the recent study by Joya and colleagues (2019) [25], suggest that patients with lower persistent viremia (≤200 copies/mL) may experience a risk of VF HIV that is 3.46 times higher than that of suppressed patients. Moreover, in a more sensitive analyses, patients with

LLV between 201 and 500 cp/mL showed that the risk of virologic failure may become significant depending on whether patients are ART-naïve or ART-experienced (aHR 1.61 (0.45, 1.11), p > 0.05; aHR 3.50 (1.25, 9.81), p < 0.05; respectively).

Low adherence, usually defined as taking less than 80% of prescribed drugs, and genotypic resistance, by which the HIV genome mutations confer lower sensitivity to one or more drugs, have been associated with the presence of LLV [34-41]. However, there is conflicting data with regards to LLV and the family of ART drugs used, mainly protease inhibitors (PIs), nonanalogue reverse transcriptase inhibitors (NNRTI), integrase inhibitors (INIs). While Konstantopoulus (2015) found an increased risk of LLV in patients taking PIs compared to those taking NNRTI [34], later studies have not confirmed these data, probably because treatment based on PIs or NNRTI is usually prescribed in patients with more advanced disease or with adherence problems [42]. Moreover, high amounts of HIV-RNA in cells have been also observed in pLLV patients [35].

ART scale-up has improved quality of life for many HIV patients, preventing AIDS deaths and reducing new HIV infections. However, many patients develop HIV drug resistance (HIVDR) due to one or more mutations in the genetic structure of HIV that prevents the blocking of virus replication by a specific drug or a combination of drugs [43,44]. The impact of these HIVDR has been also assessed in pLLV patients [11,15,39–41,45,46] (Table 2). Swenson's group (2014) considered that the presence of drug

								ART I	regimen in p	ollv
Year	STUDY	Ν	Follow-up (years)	pLLV patients (n)	pLLV definition (cp/mL)	VF definition (cp/mL)	VF (YES/NO)	NRTIs + PI/r	NRTIs + NNRTI/II	Others
2015	[27]	17,902	2.7	624	VL = 50–199	VL ≥ 200	Yes, between	351	273	-
				482	VL = 200–499		200-499	237	244	-
2015	[24]	2374	11	205	VL = 50–199	VL ≥200	Yes	135	70	-
2015	[23]	2276	1	127	VL ≤ 50	$VL \ge 200$	No	114	108	-
				95	VL = 51–199					-
2017	[32]	1015	20	716	VL < 50	VL ≥ 1000	Yes, between	UNS	UNS	-
				46	VL = 50–199		200-999			
				52	VL = 200–999					
2018	[30]	5986	11	237	VL = 50–199	$VL \ge 500$	Yes, between	100	124	13
				168	VL = 200–499		200-499	82	69	17
2018	[31]	70,930	9	9901	VL = 51 - 199	VL ≥ 1000	Yes	UNS	UNS	-
				3358	VL = 200–399					
				3609	VL = 400 - 999					
2019	[28]	2795	10	152	VL = 51 - 200	$VL \ge 200$	Yes	UNS	UNS	-
				110	VL = 201 - 500					
2019	[25]	2006	21.8	374	iLLV: $VL = 50-199$ on $< 25\%$ of	$VL \ge 200^* \text{ or}$	Yes, in iLLV	UNS	UNS	-
					measurements	> 1000**	patients.			
				152	pLLV: $VL = 50-199$ on $\ge 25\%$ of					-
					measurements					
2020	[33]	508	8	86	VL = 50 - 1000	VL > 1000	Yes	5	81	-

Table 1. Association between persistent low-level viremia in PLWH under ART (current studies).

Notes: pLLV: Persistent low-level viremia, VF: Virological failure, VL: Viral load, cp/mL: Copies/mL; ART: Antiretroviral treatment; iLLV: Intermittent LLV; UNS: Unspecified. NRTI: Nucleoside reverse transcriptase inhibitors; PI: Protease inhibitors; NNRTI: Non-nucleoside reverse transcriptase inhibitors; II: Integrase inhibitors. * On two consecutive measurements. ** During ART and six months after initiation of ART.

STUDY	YEAR	VL (cp/mL)	N _{failure} /N _{total} (%)	NRTI	NNRTI	PI	II
[46]	2010	< 300	270/449 (60)	M41L	K103N	L90M	NA
		300-999	399/552 (72)	D67N	Y181C	M461	
				K70R	G190A	V82A	
				L210W	V1081	D30N	
				T215F			
				K219Q/E			
				M184 V			
				K65R			
				L74V			
[11]	2011	50-1000	20/54 (37)	M184V	M230L/M	D30D/N	NA
				A62A/V	K103N		
				D67D/N	K101E		
				K70K/P	V106M		
				V75I	V106I		
					Y188C/Y		
					P225H/P		
					V108I		
[15]	2015	50-500	11/48 (23)	M184V/I	L103N	L10F/I	T97A
				K219E		L33F/V	N155H
				L74V		153L	T97A
				D67N		L63P	Y143C
				L210W		147V	G163R
				T215Y		L76V	
						G48V	
						A71V	
						V77I	
						V82T	
						184V	
[39]	2013	50-1999	UNS	M184V	K103N	D30N	NA
					Y188C	L90M	
[45]	2011	50-200	209/396 (52.8)	UNS	UNS	UNS	NA
		201-500	201/287 (70)				
		501-1000	179/242 (74)				
[41]	2020	20-500	11/16 (68.8)	T215L/S	V106I	K43T	G163R/K
				D67DN/DE	E138EA	T74TP	E138K
					K103NS		L33LF
					V179VD		E157Q
					M230MI		G163R

Table 2. Resistance associated mutations (RAM) detected in patients with pLLV.

Notes: pLLV: Persistent low-level Viremia; VL: Viral load; NRTI: Nucleoside reverse transcriptase inhibitors; NNRTI: Non-nucleoside reverse transcriptase inhibitors; PI: Protease inhibitors; II: Integrase inhibitors; UNS: Unspecified; NA: Not applicable. *Patients which LV was below to 500cp/mL was undetectable by sequencing.

resistance mutations could predict VF in pLLV patients [16], and a direct association between HIV drug resistance mutations and ART was identified in viral RNA in pLLV patients [11,15,39,40,45,46]. Moreover, an elevated rate of mutations in the proviral DNA of pLLV patients has been observed [41], with this rate directly proportional to the viral load [46] (Table 2). Mutations in proviral DNA could play an important role in the prognosis of patients, without the need to be present in viruses with replicative capacity. Indeed, switching therapy in patients without a fully susceptible virus has been reported to entail an increased risk of virological rebound [47].

By contrast, other studies have not shown any association between pLLV and viral resistance or inadequate drug concentrations [48,49]. Pereira et al. (2019) found no association between VF and the presence of HIVDR in pLLV patients [38]. While the presence of HIVDR hinders the ability to achieve undetectable viral load (uVL), it does not appear to be responsible for virological rebound events observed after virological suppression [50].

The intensification of ARV is not associated with a reduction in the incidence of pLLV in PWLH. Two studies that intensify ART with Raltegravir in patients with pLLV found no benefit when compared to control patients (without Raltegravir) [51,52].

By contrast, the optimization of ART related with a **switch to a second-line ART** based on PI may improve virological suppression (<50cp/mL) in a high percentage of pLLV (from 55% to 83.3%) [40,53–56] although the switch to Dolutegravir-based therapy has not shown a lower risk of developing LLV compared to other PI-based therapies [57].

Given that most published data belong to the preintegrase inhibitors (INIs) era, the potential role of INIs as a treatment backbone remains unclear in the clinical management of pLLV. According to Taramasso et al. (2020), INI-based therapies could lead to lower pLLV over time and therefore to the achievement of more effective virological control [40]. More studies related to the use of INIs in pLLV patients are needed for more evidence-based data.

Finally, the clinical impact of pLLV on **mortality** and AIDS events also remains uncertain (Table 3). Some results have shown a risk of mortality or AIDS events that is 2–3 times higher [30,58], while others have not confirmed this [27,32,59–61] (Table 3). In Eastburn's study, an association between mortality and RNA-levels was not observed, despite trying to adjust for different confounding variables such as cardiovascular risk factors and inflammation (OR: 0.99, p = 0.90) or duration of treatment (OR: 1.01, p = 0.91) [61].

Inmunological activation and inflammation status in pllv patients

An association between HIV chronicity and increased inflammation and immune system activation has been established previously [62–65], with the maintenance of suppressed viremia thus remaining essential. Although the use of ART serves to remarkably decrease both inflammation and activation in PLWH, complete restoration of the immune system remains elusive due to the presence of residual persistent inflammation [66–69].

Persistent low-level viremia may also affect immune activation and inflammation status. However, discordant results published thus far prevent us from gaining a general overview of its real impact.

Regarding **immune activation** status, a significantly elevated **immune activation**, defined as CD38+ HLA-DR+ in peripheral blood mononuclear cells, has been observed in pLLV individuals when compared to virologically suppressed subjects [14], in line with recent findings that identified specifically higher percentages of CD8+ HLA-DR+ and CD8+ CD38high T cells in pLLV subjects that lead to an excessive immune activation in adolescents and young adults [70].

In relation to **inflammation status**, an elevated risk of immunovirological failure and an increase in proinflammatory cytokine levels is still observed in pLLV subjects, unlike those with uVL [27,30,31,63]. The continuous presence of virus in pLLV patients could complicate the recovery of normal values related to **inflammatory biomarkers** [71] such as Interleukin 6 (IL-6), associated with higher levels in PLWH in contrast to healthy individuals [68,72]. However, the role of IL-6 in pLLV patients and its association with the degree of inflammation remains elusive (Table 3) because, although low IL-6 levels have been associated with pLWH with VL [73], other studies have not observed higher IL-6 levels in pLLV individuals compared to suppressed HIV viral load [61,63,71] (Table 3).

Microbial translocation (MT) entails the movement of commensal microbial products from intestinal lumen into circulation in the absence of bacteremia. In 2006, this mechanism was described for the first time in PWLH [74]. HIV infection causes important and irreversible intestinal damage, regardless of the route of transmission [75]. The presence of microbial products in circulation contributes to immune activation in PWLH [76,77]. MT has also been implicated in the degree of inflammation and immune activation present in pLLV patients [63,71]. Reus et al. (2013) showed less frequent MT (16S ribosomal DNA) in treated PLWH with uVL (20 copies/mL), in contrast to those with pLLV (20-200 copies/mL) [63]. Falasca et al. (2017) considered that MT could be the mechanism which leads to increased inflammation in pLLV patients compared to patients with undetectable VL [71]. The fact they showed a lack of virologic suppression during follow-up seems to be related to elevated levels of sCD14, a biomarker of MT [71] (Table 3).

Non-aids defining events (nades) and PLLV

While AIDS events are no longer the principal problem in treated PLWH, new complications called Non-AIDs-Defining Events (NADEs) have become the main cause of morbi-mortality [78-84]. NADEs are determined by multiple factors such as age [85-89], immune status [90,91], treatment toxicity [92,93] and even lifestyle [86,89,94], which would explain the relationship between NADEs and increased morbi-mortality. ART allows patients to live longer but does not completely restore their immune system, leading to the appearance of cardiovascular diseases and cancer, among others diseases [95-98]. Moreover, as a consequence of the chronification of the disease, long-term exposure to these drugs appears to be implicated in metabolic and organ damage [99-106]. However, the new ART families are increasingly safe and tolerable, with metabolic damage most likely caused by the HIV itself rather than by the drug's toxicity [107]. The occurrence of NADES are closely associated with inflammation and immune activation [61,62,68] and it has been suggested that LLV phenomena which lead to residual immune activation and inflammation states may influence the morbidity and mortality of NADEs [32,73,108,109].

The main studies on NADEs have been related to cardiovascular diseases, where increases in C-reactive protein (CRP) and D-dimer biomarkers have been found in PLWH compared to healthy controls

Norm Norm </th <th>۔ ۲</th> <th>ומווסווכמ סוממוכז וכי</th> <th>קיו טיווא</th> <th></th> <th>table 3. rubinisted studies regarding different cinincal consequences in prev vs. norr/prev partents.</th> <th></th> <th>-LV V3. IIUII-PLLV P</th> <th>מוובוורס.</th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th>	۔ ۲	ומווסווכמ סוממוכז וכי	קיו טיווא		table 3. rubinisted studies regarding different cinincal consequences in prev vs. norr/prev partents.		-LV V3. IIUII-PLLV P	מוובוורס.							
WMC Fold WMC MORNA MOR										NADE	S	N	1MUNE A	CTIVATION	
Tenter Unit Unit Unit State is constrained of an end of a constrained of a constrain		NH		Follow	VF		MORTALITY	AIDS EVENTS	GLOBAL		D-DIMER MARKER	11-6		MICROBIA TRANSLOCAT	L ION
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	q			up (years)	aHR 95% (Cl)	ď			aHR 95% (IC)			Statistics 95% (CI)	٩	Statistics 95% (Cl)	đ
μLV (50-10) 33 11 0.8 15 0.8 15 0.8 15 0.8 16 LU (20-10) 23 11 11 21 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20	—	No pLLV (<50)	4177	7.5	NA		1 <0.05 (Reference)	NA	1 (Reference)		NA	NA		NA	
UPUX (05-90) 38 1 MA 21 (0.6-4.7) MA 21 (0.6-4.7) MA 230.0 300.0 MA 144 (1.2) <td></td> <td>pLLV (50–199)</td> <td>339</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>2.2 (1.3–3.8)</td> <td></td> <td>0.86 (0.50-</td> <td>NS</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>		pLLV (50–199)	339				2.2 (1.3–3.8)		0.86 (0.50-	NS					
μци (30-36) 34 цци (13-2)		pLLV (200–999) no pLLV (<50)	258 34	-	NA		2.1 (0.96–4.7) NA	NA		0.05				t-test = 1.30	0.62
No bLV (5-10) 333 10 1 Reference No N<		pLLV (50–999)	34								3020) 1114 (125– 9917)			(0.59-2.84) t-test = 1.23 (0.56-2.70)	
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	[28]	No pLLV (<50) n11V (51–200)	2533 556	10	1 (Reference) 1 83 (1.10–3.04)	-0.05	NA	NA	NA		NA	NA		2./U) NA	
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	ç	pLLV (201-500) No. p11V (<50)	110	218	4.26 (2.65–6.86) 1 (Reference)	<0.05	NA	NA	NA		NA	NA		NA	
	7	iLLV (50–199) bLLV (50–199) bLV (700–1000)	374 150 302	2	0.33 (0.21–0.52) 3.46 (2.42–4.93) 2.29 (1.78–2.96)	<0.0001 <0.0001 <0.0001	5		5		5				
pLIV (50-19) 237 142 (007-158) centsection Instruction 031 (0.37-159) 1.75) NA	0	No pLLV (<50)	5581	11	(Deference)	<0.001	Analized with AIDS			0.81	NA	NA		NA	
pLIL 1200-490 16 325 (1.77-5.99) 2.89 (1.41) 0.83 (0.34) No pLLV (550) 716 20 1 (Reference) - 5.37) 2.99 (1.41) 0.83 (0.34) PLLV (50-999) 52 3.14 (1.17-7.03) -001 2.39 (1.41) 0.83 (0.34) NA NA NA NA PLLV (50-999) 52 3.14 (1.17-7.03) -001 2.29 (0.990-0.09) 5.32) 0.83 (0.34) NA NA <td></td> <td>pLLV (50–199)</td> <td>237</td> <td></td> <td>(nereferice) 1.42 (0.70–2.58)</td> <td></td> <td>evenus.</td> <td>(nererence) 1.44 (0.69– 3.03)</td> <td>0.81 (0.37-</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>		pLLV (50–199)	237		(nereferice) 1.42 (0.70–2.58)		evenus.	(nererence) 1.44 (0.69– 3.03)	0.81 (0.37-						
No pLIV (550) 716 20 1 (Reference) - 1 (Reference) - N		pLLL (200–499)	168		3.25 (1.77–5.99)			2.89 (1.41– 2.89 (1.41–	0.83 (0.34- 0.87 (0.34-						
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	2]	No pLLV (<50) pLLV (50–199)	716 46	20	1 (Reference) 1.01 (0.23–4.31)	- 0.99	1 (Reference) - 2.19 (0.90– 0.09	NA	NA		NA	NA		NA	
No pLIV (50) 113 4 NA NA OR = 0.95 0.386 OR = 1.66 (1.32-2.08) PLIV (50-100) 95 11 1 (Reference) 0.001 NA NA OR = 0.99 0.386 OR = 1.66 No pLIV (50-190) 2169 11 1 (Reference) <0.001		pLLV (200–999)	52		3.14 (1.17–7.03)	<0.01	5.37) 2.29 (0.98- 0.05 5.23								
No pLLV (<50) 2169 11 1 (Reference) <0.001 Na	Ξ	No pLLV (<50) pLLV (50–200)	113 95	4	NA		NA NA	NA	NA		NA	OR = 0.99 (0.96–	0.386	OR = 1.66 (1.32–2.08)	<0.001
DLV (20-19) 200 (624 1.38 (0.96-2.00) Analized with AIDS 1 (Reference) NA NA <td>4</td> <td>No pLLV (<50)</td> <td>2169 205</td> <td>11</td> <td>1 (Reference)</td> <td><0.001</td> <td>NA</td> <td>NA</td> <td>NA</td> <td></td> <td>NA</td> <td>NA</td> <td></td> <td>NA</td> <td></td>	4	No pLLV (<50)	2169 205	11	1 (Reference)	<0.001	NA	NA	NA		NA	NA		NA	
pLLV (200-499) 482 3.97 (3.05-5.17) 1.11 (0.72- 1.71) No pLLV (<20)	7	pllv (50–199) No plLV (<50) pLLV (50–199)	cuz 16,796 624	2.7	2.30 (1.00–3.20) 1 (Reference) 1.38 (0.96–2.00)	<0.001	Analized with AIDS events.				NA	NA		NA	
No pLLV (<20) 39 UNS NA NA NA MED = 79 <0.05 MED = 4.1 pLLV (20-200) 13 (61-105) (2.8-6.1) (2.8-6.1) pLLV (20-200) 13 MED = 90 MED = 90 MED = 90 MED = 6.1 Healthy 15 UNS NA NA NA (81-154) (2.8-9.3) PLLV (1-500) 122 NA NA NA NA Rho = 0.217 0.017 Rho = -0.015		pLLV (200–499)	482		3.97 (3.05–5.17)			1.82) 1.11 (0.72– 1.71)							
pLLV (20–200) 13 MED = 90 MED = 6.1 (2.8–9.3) Healthy 15 UNS NA NA NA NA Rho = 0.217 0.017 Rho = -0.015 pLLV (1–500) 122	3]	No pLLV (<20)	39	UNS	NA		NA	NA	NA		NA	MED = 79	<0.05	MED = 4.1	NS
Healthy 15 UNS NA NA NA NA NA NA NA 15 UNS Tho = -0.015 PLLV (1–500) 122		pLLV (20–200)	13									MED = 90 (81–154)		MED = 6.1 (2.8–9.3)	
	<u></u>	Healthy pLLV (1–500)	15 122	UNS	NA		NA	NA	NA		NA	Rho = 0.217	0.017	Rho = -0.015	0.870

Table 3. Published studies regarding different clinical consequences in pLLV vs. non-pLLV patients.

VIRULENCE 😔 2923

(Continued)

(Continued).	
, wi	
Table	

									NADES	ES	Ň	1MUNE	IMMUNE ACTIVATION	
	NIH		Follow	VF		MORTALITY	AIDS EVENTS	GLOBAL		D-DIMER MARKER	IL-6		MICROBIAL TRANSLOCATION	NO
YEAR STUDY	Patients (cp/mL)	Ę	up (years)	aHR 95% (CI)	٩	aHR 95% (Cl) p	aHR 95% (Cl) p aHR 95% (Cl) P aHR 95% (IC) p	aHR 95% (IC)	٩	t-test 95% (Cl) p	Statistics 95% (CI)	٩	Statistics 95% (CI)	٩
2011 [61]	No pLLV (0)	210	5	NA		OR:0.99* 0.90	NA	NA		NA	1 (Reference)	' 0 0	NA	
	plev (1–19)	137									$(-26 \ 35 \ 5)$	66.0		
	pLLV	236				OR: 1.01** 0.91					LLM = 0.7	0.96		
	(20–399)										(-23.5,			
											32.6)			
	pLLV (400–1000)	237									LLM = -2.5	0.93		
											(-45.6,			
											74.8)			

[81,110]. However, the potential role of pLLV in the emergence of NADES remains unclear. PLLV patients presented levels of D-dimer that are 1.5 times higher than persistent virologic suppressed individuals [P = 0.038], which may increase the risk of developing cardiovascular diseases [62]. This stands in contrast with the lack of association observed between CRP levels and low-level viremia [61]. Yet other results have shown no association [30,58,61]. In the Spanish AIDS Research Network cohort (CoRIS), pLLV (between 200 and 499 copies/mL) was associated with virological failure and AIDS events/mortality, but not with NADEs [30]. The Swedish Nationwide Observational Study also showed that pLLV between 50 and 999 copies/mL was related to mortality, but not with a higher risk of severe NADEs or AIDS [58] (Table 3). However, a subanalysis of this study with pLLV between 200 and 999 copies/mL demonstrated a twofold increase in the probability of suffering severe NADES [58] (Table 3).

Overall, no consensus has been reached as to the clinical consequences of pLLV. While some studies claim that persistent LLV increases the risk of future virological failure, others have not even found a significant impact on AIDS events and mortality. While the worst impacts may be associated with VL above 200 cp/ml, it is less clear if there is any negative impact on virological failure and morbi-mortality when LLV is between 50 and 200 copies. Different methodologies and a lack of standardization in the number and characteristics of populations studied make it difficult to compare results (Table 3). Further studies are needed to find new evidence for the wellbeing of patients and to identify long-term outcomes in LLV individuals.

Origin of pLLV: THE relationship with viral reservoir and clonal expansion

Most studies published suggest that factors such as ART adherence difficulties and viral genotype resistance could be the main cause of pLLV in HIV patients, as we have previously reviewed [34,36–38,40,50]. However, although pLLV status does not seem to be a random biological phenomenon [54], the origin of this phenomenon remains unclear and the source(s) and mechanism(s) continue to be largely undescribed. Viral reservoir size [20,111–114] and clonal expansion [115–117] could be also linked to their origin.

The HIV viral reservoir is the main barrier to curing HIV infection [118–120]. HIV reservoirs are formed very early at the onset of infection and ART currently remains unavailable [119,121–124]. Although HIV reservoirs tend to decline slowly over time [125], the influence of persistent immune pressure on the evolution of reservoir size during ART should be considered [126]. Indeed, the decrease observed in proviral DNA sequences linked to this HIV reservoir decline is variable and difficult to determine in patients with a weakened immune system [127–129].

Despite the unknown origins of low-level viremia, in 2015, Samarti et al. [130] proposed two possible hypotheses related on the correlation of pLLV and HIV reservoir: the filling of reservoirs as a consequence of ongoing HIV viral replication; and the emptying of reservoirs during effective ART. No conclusions were reached due to a lack of studies and limited data, however.

More recently, Jacobs et al. (2019) reviewed the issue and found a generally direct association between HIV-DNA levels and persistent viremia, despite the differences observed regarding techniques used and findings [131]. This could explain why viral reservoir size and the emergence of pLLV were not correlated by Widera et al. (2017) [132]. Moreover, from the studies reviewed, Jacobs et al. were unable to identify a cellular or titular reservoir contributing to persistent viremia and thus proposed proviral replication as the main cause of the continuous presence of the virus [133].

Clonal expansion also complicates HIV clearance and contributes to the maintenance of reservoirs [126], probably through viral splicing, integration into oncogenes, and contributing to the expansion of proviral HIV clones

Table 4. Summary of the role of pLLV.

[24,25,27,28,30–33]
[34–37]
[11,15,16,39–41,46]
[38,48–50]
[51,52]
[40,53–56]
[57]
[30,58]
[27,32,59–61]
STATUS
[14,70]
[73]
[61,63,71]
[63,71]
[32,73,108,109]
[58,62]
[30,61]
[130,131,133]
[126,140–142]

Notes: pLLV: Persistent low-level patients, VF: Virological failure; ART: Antiretroviral treatment; AIDS: Acquired immunodeficiency syndrome; MT: Microbiotal translocation; NADES: Non-AIDS-defining events. [134-137]. This relationship has been demonstrated by several studies [136,138,139] and we hypothesize as to the possibility that both mechanisms may be associated with the emergence of pLLV in PLWH [140]. This hypothesis has been demonstrated by Pinzone et al. (2019), who observed that one of their patients who had maintained an LLV status for 9 years had intact HIV clone sequences [126]. This would be supported by studies carried out in HIV patients where the proliferation of cells with proviruses was also suggested as a mechanism of viral persistence [141,142]. According to this result, other studies have found a large viral reservoir size quantified through HIV-DNA levels in patients receiving effective ART treatment with residual viremia associated with blips [143,144]. Indeed, LLV and blips have been closely associated with a slow elimination of the viral reservoir [145].

Determining the role of the viral reservoir and the mechanism of clonal expansion in PLWH with pLLV remains crucial for the design of therapies that achieve HIV elimination (54).

Concluding remarks

Further knowledge of the continuous presence of the virus in treated PLWH is needed to design treatments that achieve a cure for HIV infection. Reported data regarding the possible causes and origins of pLLV and its impact on clinical progression are rather discordant. While some studies point to a higher risk of developing virological failure and different AIDS/mortality events related to pLLV status, others have not made such findings. Moreover, the emergence of viral resistance in pLLV patients and its direct association with ART adherence have been only partially observed (Table 4).

On the other hand, patients with pLLV seem to have an elevated risk of immunovirological failure and increased levels of proinflammatory cytokines, and there seems to be a general consensus as to the association of pLLV with persistent immune system activation. Indeed, it has been speculated that the phenomenon of pLLV, which leads to residual immune activation and inflammation, may influence the morbidity and mortality of NADEs.

Related to the origin of this phenomenon, the clonal expansion in HIV-infected cells and its impact on the maintenance of the viral reservoir have been previously described and may be related to the appearance of pLLV in treated HIV patients (Table 4). A lack of studies and standardization make further studies necessary to clarify the origins and causes and in which a uniform definition of pLLV status should be established.

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author(s).

Funding

This work was supported by the Instituto de Salud Carlos III [PI18/00020] and Comunidad Autónoma de Madrid [IND2020/BMD-17373].

Data availability statement

The data of this study are available from the corresponding author [VB].

References

- Thiébaut R, Morlat P, Jacqmin-Gadda H, et al. Clinical progression of HIV-1 infection according to the viral response during the first year of antiretroviral treatment. Groupe d'Epidémiologie du SIDA en Aquitaine (GECSA). AIDS. 2000;14(8):971–978.
- [2] Palella FJ, Delaney KM, Moorman AC, et al. Declining morbidity and mortality among patients with advanced human immunodeficiency virus infection. HIV Outpatient Study Investigators. N Engl J Med. 1998;338(13):853–860.
- [3] Lundgren JD, Babiker AG, Gordin F, et al. Initiation of antiretroviral therapy in early asymptomatic HIV infection. N Engl J Med. 2015;373(9):795–807.
- [4] Guidelines for the use of antiretroviral agents in adults and adolescent living with HIV. https://aidsinfo-nih. gov/contentfiles/vguidelines/adultandadolescentgl.pdf. Accessed 2020 Jan 14
- [5] EACS. European AIDS clinical society. European guidelines for treatment of HIV infected adults in Europe. Versión 10.0 2019 https://eacsociety.org/files/2019_guide lines-10.0_final.pdf. Accessed 2020 Jan 14
- [6] Palmer S, Wiegand AP, Maldarelli F, et al. New real-time reverse transcriptase-initiated PCR assay with single-copy sensitivity for human immunodeficiency virus type 1 RNA in plasma. J Clin Microbiol. 2003;41(10):4531–4536.
- [7] Maldarelli F, Palmer S, King MS, et al. ART suppresses plasma HIV-1 RNA to a stable set point predicted by pretherapy viremia. PLoS Pathog. 2007;3(4):e46.
- [8] Palmer S, Maldarelli F, Wiegand A, et al. Low-level viremia persists for at least 7 years in patients on suppressive antiretroviral therapy. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2008;105(10):3879–3884.
- [9] Havlir DV, Strain M, Clerici M, et al. Productive infection maintains a dynamic steady state of residual viremia in human immunodeficiency virus type 1-infected persons treated with suppressive antiretroviral therapy for five years. J Virol. 2003;77 (20):11212–11219.
- [10] Greub G, Cozzi-Lepri A, Ledergerber B, et al. Intermittent and sustained low-level HIV viral rebound in patients receiving potent antiretroviral therapy. AIDS. 2002;16(14):1967–1969.

- [11] Taiwo B, Gallien S, Aga E, et al. Antiretroviral drug resistance in HIV-1-infected patients experiencing persistent low-level viremia during first-line therapy. J Infect Dis. 2011;204(4):515–520.
- [12] García-Gascó P, Maida I, Blanco F, et al. Episodes of low-level viral rebound in HIV-infected patients on antiretroviral therapy: frequency, predictors and outcome. J Antimicrob Chemother. 2008;61(3):699–704.
- [13] Havlir DV, Bassett R, Levitan D, et al. Prevalence and predictive value of intermittent viremia with combination hiv therapy. JAMA. 2001;286(2):171–179.
- [14] Karlsson AC, Younger SR, Martin JN, et al. Immunologic and virologic evolution during periods of intermittent and persistent low-level viremia. AIDS. 2004;18(7):981–989.
- [15] Delaugerre C, Gallien S, Flandre P, et al. Impact of low-level-viremia on HIV-1 drug-resistance evolution among antiretroviral treated-patients. PLoS One. 2012;7(5):e36673.
- [16] Swenson LC, Min JE, Woods CK, et al. HIV drug resistance detected during low-level viraemia is associated with subsequent virologic failure. AIDS. 2014;28 (8):1125–1134.
- [17] Gonzalez-Serna A, Min JE, Woods C, et al. Performance of HIV-1 drug resistance testing at low-level viremia and its ability to predict future virologic outcomes and viral evolution in treatment-naive individuals. Clin Infect Dis. 2014;58(8):1165–1173.
- [18] Geretti AM, Smith C, Haberl A, et al. Determinants of virological failure after successful viral load suppression in first-line highly active antiretroviral therapy. Antivir Ther. 2008;13(7):927–936.
- [19] Sungkanuparph S, Groger RK, Overton ET, et al. Persistent low-level viraemia and virological failure in HIV-1-infected patients treated with highly active antiretroviral therapy. HIV Med. 2006;7(7):437–441.
- [20] Ostrowski SR, Katzenstein T, Thim P, et al. Low-level viremia and proviral DNA impede immune reconstitution in HIV-1-infected patients receiving highly active antiretroviral therapy. J Infect Dis. 2005;191 (3):348–357.
- [21] Ostrowski SR, Katzenstein TL, Pedersen BK, et al. Residual viraemia in HIV-1-infected patients with plasma viral load or=20 copies/ml is associated with increased blood levels of soluble immune activation markers. Scand J Immunol. 2008;68(6):652–660.
- [22] Mavigner M, Delobel P, Cazabat M, et al. HIV-1 residual viremia correlates with persistent T-cell activation in poor immunological responders to combination antiretroviral therapy. PLoS One. 2009;4(10):e7658.
- [23] Leierer G, Grabmeier-Pfistershammer K, Steuer A, et al. Factors associated with low-level viraemia and virological failure: results from the Austrian HIV cohort study. PLoS One. 2015;10(11):e0142923.
- [24] Vandenhende M-A, Perrier A, Bonnet F, et al. Risk of virological failure in HIV-1-infected patients experiencing low-level viraemia under active antiretroviral therapy (ANRS C03 cohort study). Antivir Ther. 2015;20 (6):655–660.
- [25] Joya C, Hyun won S, Schofield C, et al. Persistent low-level viremia while on antiretroviral therapy is an

independent risk factor for virologic failure. Clin Infect Dis. 2019;69(12):2145–2152.

- [26] Boillat-Blanco N, Darling K, Schoni-Affolter F, et al. Virological outcome and management of persistent low-level viraemia in HIV-1-infected patients: 11 years of the Swiss HIV cohort study. Antivir Ther. 2015;20(2):165–175.
- [27] Vandenhende MA, Ingle S, May M, et al. Impact of low-level viremia on clinical and virological outcomes in treated HIV-1-infected patients. AIDS. 2015;29 (3):373–383.
- [28] Fleming J, Mathews WC, Rutstein RM, et al. Low-level viremia and virologic failure in persons with HIV infection treated with antiretroviral therapy. AIDS. 2019;33(13):2005–2012.
- [29] Laprise C, de Pokomandy A, Baril J-G, et al. Virologic failure following persistent low-level viremia in a cohort of HIV-positive patients: results from 12 years of observation. Clin Infect Dis. 2013;57 (10):1489–1496.
- [30] Bernal E, Gómez JM, Jarrín I, et al. Low-Level viremia is associated with clinical progression in HIV-Infected patients receiving antiretroviral treatment. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr. 2018;78(3):329–337.
- [31] Hermans LE, et al. Effect of HIV-1 low-level viraemia during antiretroviral therapy on treatment outcomes in WHO-guided South African treatment programmes: a multicentre cohort study. Lancet Infect Dis. 2018;18 (2):188–197.
- [32] Elvstam O, Medstrand P, Yilmaz A, et al. Virological failure and all-cause mortality in HIV-positive adults with low-level viremia during antiretroviral treatment. PLoS One. 2017;12(7):e0180761.
- [33] Sudjaritruk T, Teeraananchai S, Kariminia A, et al. Impact of low-level viraemia on virological failure among Asian children with perinatally acquired HIV on first-line combination antiretroviral treatment: a multicentre, retrospective cohort study. J Int AIDS Soc. 2020;23(7):e25550.
- [34] Konstantopoulos C, Ribaudo H, Ragland K, et al. Antiretroviral regimen and suboptimal medication adherence are associated with low-level human immunodeficiency virus viremia. Open Forum Infect Dis. 2015;2(1):ofu119.
- [35] Pasternak AO, Bruin M, Bakker M, et al. Modest nonadherence to antiretroviral therapy promotes residual HIV-1 replication in the absence of virological rebound in plasma. J Infect Dis. 2012;206(9):1443–1452.
- [36] Li JZ, Gallien S, Ribaudo H, et al. Incomplete adherence to antiretroviral therapy is associated with higher levels of residual HIV-1 viremia. AIDS. 2014;28 (2):181–186.
- [37] Maggiolo F, Di Filippo E, Comi L, et al. Reduced adherence to antiretroviral therapy is associated with residual low-level viremia. Pragmat Obs Res. 2017;8: 91–97.
- [38] Pereira R, Ludwig DA, Mathew S, et al. Predicting viral failure in human immunodeficiency virus perinatally infected youth with persistent low-level viremia on highly active antiretroviral therapy. J Pediatric Infect Dis Soc. 2019;8(4):303–309.

- [39] Jordan MR, Winsset, Tiro A, et al. HIV Drug Resistance Profiles and Clinical Outcomes in Patients with Viremia Maintained at Very Low Levels. World J AIDS. 2013;3(2):71–78.
- [40] Taramasso L, Magnasco L, Bruzzone B, et al. How relevant is the HIV low level viremia and how is its management changing in the era of modern ART? A large cohort analysis. J Clin Virol. 2020;123:104255.
- [41] Villalobos C, Ceballos ME, Ferrés M, et al. Drug resistance mutations in proviral DNA of HIV-infected patients with low level of viremia. J Clin Virol. 2020;132:104657.
- [42] Grennan JT, Loutfy MR, Su D, et al. Magnitude of virologic blips is associated with a higher risk for virologic rebound in HIV-infected individuals: a recurrent events analysis. J Infect Dis. 2012;205 (8):1230-1238.
- [43] World Health Organization (WHO). HIV DRUG RESISTANCE REPORT. 2017. Accessed 2021 Sept 10 https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/ 255896/9789241512831-eng.pdf
- [44] World Health Organization (WHO). GLOBAL ACTION PLAN ON HIV DRUG RESISTANCE 2017-2021. https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/978-92-4-151284-8. Accessed 2021 Sept 10
- [45] Santoro MM, Fabeni L, Armenia D, et al. Reliability and clinical relevance of the HIV-1 drug resistance test in patients with low viremia levels. Clin Infect Dis. 2014;58(8):1156–1164.
- [46] Mackie NE, Phillips A-N, Kaye S, et al. Antiretroviral drug resistance in HIV-1-infected patients with low-level viremia. J Infect Dis. 2010;201(9):1303–1307.
- [47] Armenia D, Zaccarelli M, Borghi V, et al. Resistance detected in PBMCs predicts virological rebound in HIV-1 suppressed patients switching treatment. J Clin Virol. 2018;104:61–64.
- [48] Palich R, Wirden M, Peytavin G, et al. Persistent low-level viraemia in antiretroviral treatment-experienced patients is not linked to viral resistance or inadequate drug concentrations. J Antimicrob Chemother. 2020;75(10):2981–2985.
- [49] Vancoillie L, et al. Drug resistance is rarely the cause or consequence of long-term persistent low-level viraemia in HIV-1-infected patients on ART. Antivir Ther. 2015;20(8):789–794.
- [50] Inzaule SC, Bertagnolio S, Kityo CM, et al. The relative contributions of HIV drug resistance, nonadherence and low-level viremia to viremic episodes on antiretroviral therapy in sub-Saharan Africa. AIDS. 2020;34 (10):1559–1566.
- [51] Gandhi RT, Zheng L, Bosch R-J, et al. The effect of raltegravir intensification on low-level residual viremia in HIV-infected patients on antiretroviral therapy: a randomized controlled trial. PLoS Med. 2010;7(8): e1000321.
- [52] McMahon D, Jones J, Wiegand A, et al. Short-course raltegravir intensification does not reduce persistent low-level viremia in patients with HIV-1 suppression during receipt of combination antiretroviral therapy. Clin Infect Dis. 2010;50(6):912–919.
- [53] Cheng CY, Luo Y-Z, Wu P-Y, et al. Antiretroviral therapy (ART) management of low-level viremia in

taiwan (ALLEVIATE). J Int AIDS Soc. 2014;17(4 Suppl 3):19785.

- [54] Paton NI, Kityo C, Thompson J, et al. Nucleoside reverse-transcriptase inhibitor cross-resistance and outcomes from second-line antiretroviral therapy in the public health approach: an observational analysis within the randomised, open-label, EARNEST trial. Lancet HIV. 2017e341-e348; 41: 10.1016/S2352-3018(17)30065-6
- [55] Amstutz A, Nsakala BL, Vanobberghen F, et al. Switch to second-line versus continued first-line antiretroviral therapy for patients with low-level HIV-1 viremia: an open-label randomized controlled trial in Lesotho. PLoS Med. 2020;17(9):e1003325.
- [56] Brown JA, Amstutz A, Nsakala B-L, et al. Extensive drug resistance during low-level HIV viraemia while taking NNRTI-based ART supports lowering the viral load threshold for regimen switch in resource-limited settings: a pre-planned analysis from the SESOTHO trial. J Antimicrob Chemother; 2021.
- [57] Chen G-J, Sun H-Y, Chang S-Y, et al. Incidence and impact of low-level viremia among people living with HIV who received protease inhibitor- or dolutegravir-based antiretroviral therapy. Int J Infect Dis. 2021;105:147–151.
- [58] Elvstam O, et al. All-cause mortality and serious non-AIDS events in adults with low-level hiv viremia during combination antiretroviral therapy: results from a Swedish nationwide observational study. Clin Infect Dis. 2020;72:2079–2086.
- [59] Zhang S, van Sighem A, Gras L, et al. Clinical significance of transient HIV type-1 viraemia and treatment interruptions during suppressive antiretroviral treatment. Antivir Ther. 2010;15(4):555-562.
- [60] Quiros-Roldan E, Raffetti E, Castelli F, et al. Low-level viraemia, measured as viraemia copy-years, as a prognostic factor for medium-long-term all-cause mortality: a MASTER cohort study. J Antimicrob Chemother. 2016;71(12):3519–3527.
- [61] Eastburn A, Scherzer R, Zolopa AR, et al. Association of low level viremia with inflammation and mortality in HIV-infected adults. PLoS One. 2011;6(11):e26320.
- [62] Elvstam O, Medstrand P, Jansson M, et al. Is low-level HIV1 viraemia associated with elevated levels of markers of immune activation, coagulation and cardiovascular disease? HIV Med. 2019;20(9):571–580.
- [63] Reus S, Portilla J, Sánchez-Payá J, et al. Low-level HIV viremia is associated with microbial translocation and inflammation. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr. 2013;62 (2):129–134.
- [64] Poizot-Martin I, Faucher O, Obry-Roguet V, et al. Lack of correlation between the size of HIV proviral DNA reservoir and the level of immune activation in HIV-infected patients with a sustained undetectable HIV viral load for 10 years. J Clin Virol. 2013;57 (4):351–355.
- [65] Schuler PJ, Macatangay BJC, Saze Z, et al. CD4*CD73* T cells are associated with lower T-cell activation and C reactive protein levels and are depleted in HIV-1 infection regardless of viral suppression. AIDS. 2013;27(10):1545–1555.

- [66] Giorgi JV, Hultin L, McKeating J, et al. Shorter survival in advanced human immunodeficiency virus type 1 infection is more closely associated with T lymphocyte activation than with plasma virus burden or virus chemokine coreceptor usage. J Infect Dis. 1999;179(4):859–870.
- [67] Leng Q, Borkow G, Weisman Z, et al. Immune activation correlates better than HIV plasma viral load with CD4 T-cell decline during HIV infection. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr. 2001;27(4):389–397.
- [68] Kuller LH, Tracy R, Belloso W, et al. Inflammatory and coagulation biomarkers and mortality in patients with HIV infection. PLoS Med. 2008;5(10):e203.
- [69] Tien PC, Choi AI, Zolopa AR, et al. Inflammation and mortality in HIV-infected adults: analysis of the FRAM study cohort. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr. 2010;55 (3):316–322.
- [70] Han J, Mu W, Zhao H, et al. HIV-1 low-level viremia affects T cell activation rather than T cell development in school-age children, adolescents, and young adults during antiretroviral therapy. Int J Infect Dis. 2020;91:210–217.
- [71] Falasca F, Di Carlo D, De Vito C, et al. Evaluation of HIV-DNA and inflammatory markers in HIV-infected individuals with different viral load patterns. BMC Infect Dis. 2017;17(1):581.
- [72] Lu J, Ma -S-S, Zhang W-Y, et al. Changes in peripheral blood inflammatory factors (TNF-α and IL-6) and intestinal flora in AIDS and HIV-positive individuals. J Zhejiang Univ Sci B. 2019;20(10):793–802.
- [73] Bastard J-P, Soulié C, Fellahi S, et al. Circulating interleukin-6 levels correlate with residual HIV viraemia and markers of immune dysfunction in treatment-controlled HIV-infected patients. Antivir Ther. 2012;17(5):915–919.
- [74] Brenchley JM, Price DA, Schacker TW, et al. Microbial translocation is a cause of systemic immune activation in chronic HIV infection. Nat Med. 2006;12 (12):1365–1371.
- [75] Ciccone EJ, Read SW, Mannon PJ, et al. Cycling of gut mucosal CD4+ T cells decreases after prolonged anti-retroviral therapy and is associated with plasma LPS levels. Mucosal Immunol. 2010;3(2):172–181.
- [76] Cassol E, Malfeld S, Mahasha P, et al. Persistent microbial translocation and immune activation in HIV-1-infected South Africans receiving combination antiretroviral therapy. J Infect Dis. 2010;202 (5):723–733.
- [77] Jiang W, Lederman M, Hunt P, et al. Plasma levels of bacterial DNA correlate with immune activation and the magnitude of immune restoration in persons with antiretroviral-treated HIV infection. J Infect Dis. 2009;199(8):1177–1185.
- [78] Deeks SG, Lewin SR, Havlir DV. The end of AIDS: HIV infection as a chronic disease. Lancet. 2013;382 (9903):1525–1533.
- [79] Louie JK, Hsu L, Osmond D, et al. Trends in causes of death among persons with acquired immunodeficiency syndrome in the era of highly active antiretroviral therapy, San Francisco, 1994-1998. J Infect Dis. 2002;186(7):1023-1027.

- [80] Lewden C, Salmon D, Morlat P, et al. Causes of death among human immunodeficiency virus (HIV)-infected adults in the era of potent antiretroviral therapy: emerging role of hepatitis and cancers, persistent role of AIDS. Int J Epidemiol. 2005;34(1):121–130.
- [81] Neuhaus J, Angus B, Kowalska JD, et al. Risk of all-cause mortality associated with nonfatal AIDS and serious non-AIDS events among adults infected with HIV. AIDS. 2010;24(5):697–706.
- [82] Ingle SM, May MT, Gill MJ, et al. Impact of risk factors for specific causes of death in the first and subsequent years of antiretroviral therapy among HIV-infected patients. Clin Infect Dis. 2014;59(2):287–297.
- [83] Smith CJ, Ryom L, Weber R, et al. Trends in underlying causes of death in people with HIV from 1999 to 2011 (D:A:D): a multicohort collaboration. Lancet. 2014;384(9939):241–248.
- [84] Wong C, Gange SJ, Moore RD, et al. Multimorbidity among persons living with human immunodeficiency virus in the united states. Clin Infect Dis. 2018;66 (8):1230–1238.
- [85] Crum-Cianflone N, Hullsiek KH, Marconi V, et al. Trends in the incidence of cancers among HIV-infected persons and the impact of antiretroviral therapy: a 20-year cohort study. AIDS. 2009;23 (1):41-50.
- [86] Mocroft A, Reiss P, Gasiorowski J, et al. Serious fatal and nonfatal non-AIDS-defining illnesses in Europe. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr. 2010;55(2):262–270.
- [87] Hasse B, Ledergerber B, Furrer H, et al. Morbidity and aging in HIV-infected persons: the Swiss HIV cohort study. Clin Infect Dis. 2011;53(11):1130–1139.
- [88] Marin B, Thiébaut R, Bucher HC, et al. Non-AIDSdefining deaths and immunodeficiency in the era of combination antiretroviral therapy. AIDS. 2009;23 (13):1743–1753.
- [89] Moore RD, Gebo K, Lucas G, et al. Rate of comorbidities not related to HIV infection or AIDS among HIV-infected patients, by CD4 cell count and HAART use status. Clin Infect Dis. 2008;47 (8):1102-1104.
- [90] Monforte A, Abrams D, Pradier C, et al. HIV-induced immunodeficiency and mortality from AIDS-defining and non-AIDS-defining malignancies. AIDS. 2008;22 (16):2143–2153.
- [91] Weber R, Sabin C, Friis-Møller N, et al. Liver-related deaths in persons infected with the human immunodeficiency virus: the D:A:D study. Arch Intern Med. 2006;166(15):1632–1641.
- [92] Friis-Møller N, Reiss P, Sabin C, et al. Class of antiretroviral drugs and the risk of myocardial infarction. N Engl J Med. 2007;356(17):1723–1735.
- [93] Obel N, Thomsen HF, Kronborg G, et al. Ischemic heart disease in HIV-infected and HIV-uninfected individuals: a population-based cohort study. Clin Infect Dis. 2007;44(12):1625–1631.
- [94] Krishnan S, Schouten JT, Jacobson DL, et al. Incidence of non-AIDS-defining cancer in antiretroviral treatment-naïve subjects after antiretroviral treatment initiation: an ACTG longitudinal linked randomized trials analysis. Oncology. 2011;80(1-2):42-49.

- [95] van Lelyveld SFL, Gras L, Kesselring A, et al. Longterm complications in patients with poor immunological recovery despite virological successful HAART in Dutch ATHENA cohort. AIDS. 2012;26(4):465-474.
- [96] Engsig FN, Zangerle R, Katsarou O, et al. Long-term mortality in HIV-Positive individuals virally suppressed for >3 years with incomplete CD4 recovery. Clin Infect Dis. 2014;58(9):1312–1321.
- [97] Baker JV, Peng G, Rapkin J, et al. Poor initial CD4+ recovery with antiretroviral therapy prolongs immune depletion and increases risk for AIDS and non-AIDS diseases. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr. 2008;48 (5):541–546.
- [98] Pacheco YM, Jarrin I, Rosado I, et al. Increased risk of non-AIDS-related events in HIV subjects with persistent low CD4 counts despite cART in the CoRIS cohort. Antiviral Res. 2015;117:69–74.
- [99] Ma Q, Vaida F, Wong J, et al. Long-term efavirenz use is associated with worse neurocognitive functioning in HIV-infected patients. J Neurovirol. 2016;22 (2):170–178.
- [100] Samuels R, Bayerri CR, Sayer JA, et al. Tenofovir disoproxil fumarate-associated renal tubular dysfunction: noninvasive assessment of mitochondrial injury. AIDS. 2017;31(9):1297–1301.
- [101] Martin AM, Hammond E, Nolan D, et al. Accumulation of mitochondrial DNA mutations in human immunodeficiency virus-infected patients treated with nucleoside-analogue reverse-transcriptase inhibitors. Am J Hum Genet. 2003;72(3):549–560.
- [102] Zhang Y, Song F, Gao Z, et al. Long-term exposure of mice to nucleoside analogues disrupts mitochondrial DNA maintenance in cortical neurons. PLoS One. 2014;9(1):e85637.
- [103] Côté HCF, Brumme ZL, Craib KJP, et al. Changes in mitochondrial DNA as a marker of nucleoside toxicity in HIV-infected patients. N Engl J Med. 2002;346 (11):811–820.
- [104] Soontornniyomkij V, Umlauf A, Chung SA, et al. HIV protease inhibitor exposure predicts cerebral small vessel disease. AIDS. 2014;28(9):1297–1306.
- [105] Sulkowski MS, Mehta SH, Chaisson RE, et al. Hepatotoxicity associated with protease inhibitor-based antiretroviral regimens with or without concurrent ritonavir. AIDS. 2004;18(17):2277–2284.
- [106] Dauchy F-A, Lawson-Ayayi S, de La Faille R, et al. Increased risk of abnormal proximal renal tubular function with HIV infection and antiretroviral therapy. Kidney Int. 2011;80(3):302–309.
- [107] Roca-Bayerri C, Robertson F, Pyle A, et al. Mitochondrial DNA damage and brain aging in human immunodeficiency virus. Clin Infect Dis. 2021;73(2):e466-e473. doi:10.1093/cid/ciaa984.
- [108] D' Ettorre G, Ceccarelli G, Pavone P, et al. What happens to cardiovascular system behind the undetectable level of HIV viremia? AIDS Res Ther. 2016;13 (1):21.
- [109] Zhang S, van Sighem A, Kesselring A, et al. Episodes of HIV viremia and the risk of non-AIDS diseases in patients on suppressive antiretroviral therapy. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr. 2012;60(3):265–272.

- [110] Hsue PY, Scherzer R, Hunt P-H, et al. Carotid intima-media thickness progression in HIV-infected adults occurs preferentially at the carotid bifurcation and is predicted by inflammation. J Am Heart Assoc. 2012;1(2):e000422.
- [111] Ramratnam B, Mittler JE, Zhang L, et al. The decay of the latent reservoir of replication-competent HIV-1 is inversely correlated with the extent of residual viral replication during prolonged anti-retroviral therapy. Nat Med. 2000;6(1):82–85.
- [112] Fourati S, Flandre P, Calin R, et al. Factors associated with a low HIV reservoir in patients with prolonged suppressive antiretroviral therapy. J Antimicrob Chemother. 2014;69(3):753–756.
- [113] Parisi SG, Andreis S, Mengoli C, et al. Baseline cellular HIV DNA load predicts HIV DNA decline and residual HIV plasma levels during effective antiretroviral therapy. J Clin Microbiol. 2012;50(2):258–263.
- [114] Chun T-W, Justement JS, Murray D, et al. Rebound of plasma viremia following cessation of antiretroviral therapy despite profoundly low levels of HIV reservoir: implications for eradication. AIDS. 2010;24 (18):2803–2808.
- [115] Simonetti FR, Sobolewski MD, Fyne E, et al. Clonally expanded CD4 + T cells can produce infectious HIV-1 in vivo. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2016;113 (7):1883–1888.
- [116] Bui JK, Sobolewski MD, Keele BF, et al. Proviruses with identical sequences comprise a large fraction of the replication-competent HIV reservoir. PLoS Pathog. 2017;13(3):e1006283.
- [117] Hosmane NN, Kwon KJ, Bruner KM, et al. Proliferation of latently infected CD4. J Exp Med. 2017;214(4):959–972.
- [118] Finzi D, Blankson J, Siliciano JD, et al. Latent infection of CD4+ T cells provides a mechanism for lifelong persistence of HIV-1, even in patients on effective combination therapy. Nat Med. 1999;5(5):512-517.
- [119] Finzi D, Hermankova M, Pierson T, et al. Identification of a reservoir for HIV-1 in patients on highly active antiretroviral therapy. Science. 1997;278 (5341):1295–1300.
- [120] Chun TW, Moir S, Fauci AS. HIV reservoirs as obstacles and opportunities for an HIV cure. Nat Immunol. 2015;16(6):584–589.
- [121] Chun T-W, Nickle D, Justement J, et al. Persistence of HIV in gut-associated lymphoid tissue despite long-term antiretroviral therapy. J Infect Dis. 2008;197(5):714–720.
- [122] Chun T-W, Stuyver L, Mizell SB, et al. Presence of an inducible HIV-1 latent reservoir during highly active antiretroviral therapy. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 1997;94(24):13193–13197.
- [123] Wong JK, Hezareh M, Günthard HF, et al. Recovery of replication-competent HIV despite prolonged suppression of plasma viremia. Science. 1997;278 (5341):1291–1295.
- [124] Chun TW, Nickle D, Justement J-S, et al. HIV-infected individuals receiving effective antiviral therapy for extended periods of time continually replenish their viral reservoir. J Clin Invest. 2005;115(11):3250–3255.

- [125] Crooks AM, Bateson R, Cope AB, et al. Precise quantitation of the latent HIV-1 reservoir: implications for eradication strategies. J Infect Dis. 2015;212 (9):1361–1365.
- [126] Pinzone MR, VanBelzen DJ, Weissman S, et al. Longitudinal HIV sequencing reveals reservoir expression leading to decay which is obscured by clonal expansion. Nat Commun. 2019;10(1):728.
- [127] Pinzone MR, Graf E, Lynch L, et al. Monitoring integration over time supports a role for cytotoxic T lymphocytes and ongoing replication as determinants of reservoir size. J Virol. 2016;90 (23):10436-10445.
- [128] Murray JM, McBride K, Boesecke C, et al. Integrated HIV DNA accumulates prior to treatment while episomal HIV DNA records ongoing transmission afterwards. AIDS. 2012;26(5):543–550.
- [129] Yukl SA, Gianella S, Sinclair E, et al. Differences in HIV burden and immune activation within the gut of HIV-positive patients receiving suppressive antiretroviral therapy. J Infect Dis. 2010;202(10):1553–1561.
- [130] Sarmati L, D'Ettorre G, Parisi S, et al. HIV replication at low copy number and its correlation with the HIV reservoir: a clinical perspective. Curr HIV Res. 2015;13 (3):250–257.
- [131] Jacobs JL, Halvas EK, Tosiano MA, et al. Persistent HIV-1 viremia on antiretroviral therapy: measurement and mechanisms. Front Microbiol. 2019;10:2383.
- [132] Widera M, Dirks M, Bleekmann B, et al. HIV-1 persistent viremia is frequently followed by episodes of low-level viremia. Med Microbiol Immunol. 2017;206(3):203–215.
- [133] Jacobs JL, Tosiano MA, Koontz DL, et al. Automated, multi-replicate quantification of persistent HIV-1 viremia in individuals on antiretroviral therapy. J Clin Microbiol. 2020;58. DOI:10.1128/JCM.01442-20.
- [134] Wagner TA, McLaughlin S, Garg K, et al. HIV latency. Proliferation of cells with HIV integrated into cancer genes contributes to persistent infection. Science. 2014;345(6196):570–573.
- [135] Cesana D, Santoni de Sio FR, Rudilosso L, et al. HIV-1-mediated insertional activation of STAT5B and BACH2 trigger viral reservoir in T regulatory cells. Nat Commun. 2017;8(1):498.

- [136] Maldarelli F, Wu X, Su L, et al. HIV latency. Specific HIV integration sites are linked to clonal expansion and persistence of infected cells. Science. 2014;345(6193):179–183.
- [137] Ikeda T, Shibata J, Yoshimura K, et al. Recurrent HIV-1 Integration at the BACH2 locus in resting CD4 + T cell populations during effective highly active antiretroviral therapy. J Infect Dis. 2007;195(5):716–725.
- [138] McManus WR, Bale MJ, Spindler J, et al. HIV-1 in lymph nodes is maintained by cellular proliferation during antiretroviral therapy. J Clin Invest. 2019;130:4629–4642.
- [139] Reeves DB, Duke ER, Wagner TA, et al. A majority of HIV persistence during antiretroviral therapy is due to infected cell proliferation. Nat Commun. 2018;9 (1):4811.
- [140] Charpentier C, Landman R, Laouenan C, et al. Persistent low-level HIV-1 RNA between 20 and 50 copies/mL in antiretroviral-treated patients: associated factors and virological outcome. J Antimicrob Chemother. 2012;67(9):2231–2235.
- [141] Bailey JR, Sedaghat AR, Kieffer T, et al. Residual human immunodeficiency virus type 1 viremia in some patients on antiretroviral therapy is dominated by a small number of invariant clones rarely found in circulating CD4 + T Cells. J Virol. 2006;80(13):6441–6457.
- [142] Wagner TA, McKernan JL, Tobin NH, et al. An increasing proportion of monotypic HIV-1 DNA sequences during antiretroviral treatment suggests proliferation of HIV-infected cells. J Virol. 2013;87 (3):1770–1778.
- [143] Chun T-W, Murray D, Justement JS, et al. Relationship between residual plasma viremia and the size of HIV proviral DNA reservoirs in infected individuals receiving effective antiretroviral therapy. J Infect Dis. 2011;204(1):135–138.
- [144] Avettand-Fènoël V, Hocqueloux L, Ghosn J, et al. Total HIV-1 DNA, a marker of viral reservoir dynamics with clinical implications. Clin Microbiol Rev. 2016;29(4):859–880.
- [145] Bachmann N, Von Siebenthal C, Vongrad V, et al. Determinants of HIV-1 reservoir size and long-term dynamics during suppressive ART. Nat Commun. 2019;10(1):3193.