

GOPEN ACCESS

Citation: Kenyon CR, Tsoumanis A, Schwartz IS (2015) HIV Prevalence Correlates with High-Risk Sexual Behavior in Ethiopia's Regions. PLoS ONE 10 (10): e0140835. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0140835

Editor: Georgios Pollakis, University of Liverpool, UNITED KINGDOM

Received: May 21, 2015

Accepted: September 29, 2015

Published: October 23, 2015

Copyright: © 2015 Kenyon et al. This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the <u>Creative Commons Attribution License</u>, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

Data Availability Statement: The datasets can be obtained from <u>www.measureDHS.com</u>.

Funding: The authors received no specific funding for this work.

Competing Interests: The authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

RESEARCH ARTICLE

HIV Prevalence Correlates with High-Risk Sexual Behavior in Ethiopia's Regions

Chris R. Kenyon^{1,2}*, Achilleas Tsoumanis¹, Ilan Steven Schwartz^{3,4}

1 HIV/STI Unit, Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp, Belgium, 2 Department of Medicine, University of Cape Town, Cape Town, South Africa, 3 Department of Medical Microbiology, Faculty of Health Sciences, College of Medicine, University of Manitoba, Winnipeg, Canada, 4 Department of Epidemiology and Social Medicine, Faculty of Health Sciences, University of Antwerp, Belgium

* ckenyon@itg.be

Abstract

Background

HIV prevalence varies between 0.9 and 6.5% in Ethiopia's eleven regions. Little has been published examining the reasons for this variation.

Methods

We evaluated the relationship between HIV prevalence by region and a range of risk factors in the 2005 and 2011 Ethiopian Demographic Health Surveys. Pearson's correlation was used to assess the relationship between HIV prevalence and each variable.

Results

There was a strong association between HIV prevalence and three markers of sexual risk: mean lifetime number of partners (men: r = 0.87; P < 0.001; women: r = 0.60; P = 0.05); reporting sex with a non-married, non-cohabiting partner (men: r = 0.92; P < 0.001, women r = 0.93; P < 0.001); and premarital sex. Condom usage and HIV testing were positively associated with HIV prevalence, while the prevalence of circumcision, polygamy, age at sexual debut and male migration were not associated with HIV prevalence.

Conclusion

Variation in sexual behavior may contribute to the large variations in HIV prevalence by region in Ethiopia. Population-level interventions to reduce risky sexual behavior in high HIV incidence regions should be considered.

Introduction

Do differences in sexual behavior play an important role in determining differences in HIV prevalence noted between populations? Surprisingly, there is little consent on this issue. The authors of the "Four Cities Study", for example, argued that differences in prevalence of herpes simplex virus 2 infection and circumcision rates—but not sexual behavior—are responsible for

differences in HIV prevalence [1]. Other studies have found that HIV prevalence tracks closely with high-risk sexual behavior [2-4]. These latter studies have included ecological level studies that assessed the association between HIV prevalence and putative risk factors in ethnic groups within countries. Ecological studies are a valid and necessary approach to study this question as the prevalence of sexually transmitted infections (STIs) is largely determined by the STI transmissibility of the local sex network [5]. Network connectivity (an ecological property) is in turn a critical determinant of STI transmissibility [6]. To be meaningful, however, these ecological studies need to be done in countries where there is considerable heterogeneity in HIV prevalence between different subpopulations and where sexual networks are sufficiently segregated [7].

Ethiopia meets both these criteria. In 2011, there was a seven-fold difference in HIV prevalence between regions [8]. Although there are over 80 different ethnic groups, these have been grouped into 9 ethnically-based regions [8]. Ethiopia is constitutionally formed by these 9 regions and 2 chartered cities–Addis Ababa and Dire Dawa [8]. In this paper we establish that there is a high degree of sexual network segregation along ethnic lines. We then test if there is an association between HIV prevalence and various sexual behaviors by region.

Methodology

Data

We used the 2005 and 2011 Ethiopian Demographic and Health Surveys (EDHS) for this study. These are the only nationally representative surveys that have assessed HIV prevalence in Ethiopia. They received ethical committee clearance for data analyses such as the one performed here. As a result, no specific ethics committee approval was necessary for this study.

The 2005 and 2011 EDHS both utilized a household-based, two-stage stratified sampling approach which, once weighted, provided prevalence estimates that are representative for the countries 11 regions. The first stage selected Enumeration Areas from the 1994 and 2007 National Censuses respectively. In the second stage, representative samples of 14,645 and 17,817 households were selected in 2005 and 2011. In 2005, all women age 15–49 years in these households and all men age 15–59 years in every second household were eligible for interview-ing. Of those eligible, 14,070 women (96%) and 6,033 (89%) men completed the interviews. In 2011, all women age 15–49 years and all men age 15–59 years in all selected households were eligible to be interviewed. Of those eligible, 16,515 women (95%) and 14,110 men (89%) completed the interview. Further details of the surveys are provided in Table 1 and references [8,9].

Measures

HIV Testing and Prevalence. All survey participants were asked to provide dried blood spot samples for anonymous HIV testing. Respondents did not have access to the test results but were referred to counseling and testing services in the local area. Dried blood samples were collected and subsequently tested for HIV using the Vironostika (R) HIV Uni-Form II Plus O (Biomerieux). All positive results were retested with the Murex HIV Ag/Ab Combination test. A third test, the HIV 2.2 western blot (DiaSorin), was used to resolve occasions of discordance between the first and second test results. Overall, 86% of all EDHS respondents who were eligible for testing were interviewed and consented to HIV testing. Response rates were higher in rural (92%) than urban (84%) areas and did differ somewhat by region (Table 1). In this paper we use HIV prevalence by ethnic group in the 2011 EDHS as the outcome variable. HIV prevalence by ethnic group is defined as the percentage of all persons 15–49 years old testing HIV positive.

Table 1. Sel graphic and	ected s Health	survey ch Survey.	aracteris	stics incluc	ling HIV prevalen	ce and response ra	tes in 15–49 year	r old women ar	ıd 15–59 year o	ld men by region	in 201	1 Ethiopia	an Demo-
Region	Nen	N Women	Age Men- years	Age Women- years	Survey Response Rate−Men (%) ^a	Survey Response Rate -Women (%) ª	HIV testing Response Rate (%) ^b	HIV Prevalence	° (%)	% in the Poorest Wealth Quintile ^d	Educat	on Attaine	_e (%) p
								2005% 15–49 years (95% CI)	2011% 15–49 years (95% CI)		None	Primary	Secondary or higher
Tigray	1384	1728	30.7	27.7	90.5	97.2	87.0	2.1 (1.2–3.8)	1.8 (1.2–2.5)	22.5	43.0	42.9	14.1
Affar	1000	1291	30.5	27.7	89.5	96.3	84.7	2.9 (0.9–6.1)	1.8 (1.0–3.1)	48.6	64.8	24.6	10.7
Amhara	1965	2087	30.7	28.0	91.0	95.9	84.9	1.7 (0.9–2.6)	1.6 (1.0–2.5)	20.1	55.6	34.7	9.7
Oromiya	2060	2135	30.1	27.4	94.5	97.1	90.1	1.4 (0.8–2.1)	1.0 (0.6–1.4)	14.2	39.6	48.5	11.9
Somali	715	914	30.9	28.1	82.4	92.6	69.1	0.7 (0.2–2.9)	1.1 (0.6–2.3)	40.0	60.7	29.3	10.0
Benishangul- Gumuz	1139	1259	29.8	27.4	91.2	94.9	86.1	0.5 (0.2–1.9)	1.3 (0.6–2.5)	25.9	47.4	41.5	11.1
SNNP	1699	2034	30.8	28.1	92.7	95.3	87.1	0.2 (0.0–0.6)	0.9 (0.6–1.2)	19.4	35.7	52.3	12.0
Gambela	940	1130	29.4	26.1	86.7	92.0	82.1	6.0 (3.1–10.6)	6.5 (3.7–11.2)	20.8	23.3	54.8	21.9
Harari	972	1101	30.4	27.4	84.6	93.8	71.9	3.5 (2.1–5.6)	2.8 (2.0–4.0)	1.4	25.8	38.5	35.7
Addis Ababa	1318	1741	30.0	26.6	79.9	93.1	69.7	4.7 (3.6–6.5)	5.2 (4.2–6.5)	0.2	10.4	40.4	49.2
Dire Dawa	918	1095	31.2	27.4	84.1	93.4	73.7	3.2 (1.6–6.0)	4.0 (2.9–5.5)	5.2	28.4	37.2	34.4
^a The overall	womer	i's/men's	response) rate is def	ined as the eligible	women's/men's res	sponse rate x the	household rest	oonse rate (see	report for details [8]).		
^b The HIV tes	iting re	sponse ra	te is defir	ned as the	percentage of eligi	ble persons 15-49	years old who par	ticipated in HIV	testing. Non-re	sponders include	d those	who refu	sed
testing, were	abseni	at the tim	the st	survey or th	here were technica	I difficulties with blo	od taking.						
^c HIV prevale	nce is	HIV preva	lence for	r 15–49 yea	ir women and men	. This is the only va	riable in the table	that reports dat	ta from both the	2005 and 2011 E	EDHS.		
^d This variabl	e refer:	s to the p∈	srcent of t	the respon	dents from this reg	ion that were calcula	ated to fall in the p	ooorest 20% (q	uintile) of the na	ttionally derived w	ealth bá	and. The v	vealth
quintiles were	∋ deriv€	∋d from an	n asset in	idex in the 2	2011 EDHS (see n	eference for details	[8]).						

^e Highest education level attained: Primary and Secondary refer to any primary or secondary schooling attained respectively.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0140835.t001

Homophily. The Women's Questionnaire in the EDHS 2011 collected information about the ethnicity of husbands or live-in partners as well as the region of residence. All men lived in the same region as the women, but were not always from the same ethnic group. The degree of ethnic-homophily per ethnic group was defined as the percentage of married women whose husbands or live-in partners were from the same ethnic group. These calculations were limited to ethnic groups that constituted more than 1% of the 6745 individuals in the couple sample. This comprised 5841 individuals.

Independent variables

Each of following predictor variables were calculated separately for men and women and were limited to those between the ages of 15–49 years for women and 15–59 years for men.

High-risk Sex (Sex with a non-married, non-cohabiting partner). The percentage of respondents who reported sex with a non-marital, non-cohabiting partner in the past 12 months, amongst all respondents who reported sex in the past 12 months. This was calculated separately for those aged 15–24 and 15–59 years.

Lifetime sex partners. The mean number of reported lifetime sex partners amongst all 15–49 year old women or 15–59 year old men.

Age at first sex. The mean age of reported first sexual intercourse among those who reported ever having had sex.

Pre-marital sex. The percentage of all never-married 15–24 year olds respondents who reported having had sex.

Condom use at last sex. The percentage of respondents who reported using a condom at last sex, amongst those who have had sex in the past 12 months.

Male circumcision. The percentage of men 15–59 years old who reported being circumcised.

Polygamy. The percentage of married women who report that their husband has more than one wife or partner at the time of the survey.

Migration. The percentage of all men who reported spending more than one month away from home in the past year.

Statistical analysis

All analyses are ecological in nature and conducted with HIV prevalence by region in EDHS in 2005 or 2011 as the outcome variable. The analyses were conducted using STATA 13.0 (College Station, TX) and were all adjusted to account for the complex sampling strategies of the surveys using the survey (SVY) command. The analyses were stratified by gender. Pearson's correlation was used to assess the relationship between HIV prevalence and each variable. Histograms were used to depict the distribution of the number of lifetime sexual partners by gender and region. We compared the mean number of lifetime partners in the highest (Gambela) and lowest (SNNP) HIV prevalence regions. To assess if the difference in lifetime partners was driven solely by a difference in those reporting 10 or more partners, we repeated the analyses excluding these individuals. Non-overlap in 95% Confidence Intervals (CI) was interpreted as representing a statistically significant difference between the two samples.

Results

An overview of the numbers, mean ages and other demographic characteristics of men and women by ethnic group that participated in each of the surveys is provided in <u>Table 1</u>. The average age of respondents in the regions ranged from 29.4 to 31.2 years in men and 26.1 to 28.1 years in women. In three of the regions the majority of the population lived in an urban





doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0140835.g001

setting and in the remaining 8 regions, 58 to 85% lived in a rural setting. The HIV prevalence by region in 2011 varied between 0.9% (95% CI, 0.6–1.2%) in Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples (SNNP) and 6.5% (95% CI, 3.7–11.2%; <u>Table 1</u>) in Gambela. The HIV prevalence estimates produced by the 2005 and 2011 surveys were very similar (<u>Table 1</u>; <u>Fig 1</u>). In 2011, HIV prevalences were 1.6% or below for five regions: Amhara, Benishangul-Gumuz, Oromiya, Somali, SNNP, referred to as the low HIV prevalence regions. HIV prevalences were high (4– 6.5%) in three regions: Addis Ababa, Dire Dawa, Gambela; and intermediate (1.8–2.8%) in three regions: Affar, Harari, Tigray. Ethiopia's two chartered cities (where greater proportions of the populations report higher education outcomes and wealth levels) constituted two of the three high prevalence regions (<u>Table 1</u>). The third high prevalence region, Gambela, is a rural region with high rates of poverty and poor educational attainment.

Homophiliy

There was a strong tendency for married/cohabiting couples to be from the same ethnic group (see <u>Table 2</u>). The median ethnic-homophily rate for married couples was 92.8% (IQR 89.4–98.3). When restricting the analysis to Addis Ababa the extent of homophilous partnering was reduced (median 70.9% [IQR 67.0–71.2]).

HIV risk factors

The analyses of the correlation between HIV prevalence and various risk factors in both 2005 and 2011 are presented in <u>Table 3</u>. The scatter plots of these relationships for 2011 for each



Table 2. Homophily by ethnicity. The self-defined ethnicity of married husbands and wives in the 2011 Ethiopian Demographic and Health Survey (Row percentages).

	Husbar	nds Ethnici	ty												
Wife's Ethnicity	Affar	Amhara	Berta	Gumuz	Guragie	Hadiya	Kefficho	Nuwer	Oromo	Sidama	Silte	Somalie	Tigrie	Welaita	Total
Affar	344 (99.4)	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	346
Amhara	8	1,408 (87.4)	0	1	22	6	4	0	119	1	2	1	30	9	1,611
Berta	0	0	129 (99.2)	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	130
Gumuz	0	0	1	120 (98.4)	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	122
Guragie	0	24	0	0	149 (71.0)	7	0	0	15	0	12	0	3	0	210
Hadiya	0	1	0	0	1	47 (75.8)	0	0	6	0	0	0	0	7	62
Kefficho	0	3	0	0	0	0	92(92.0)	0	4	0	0	0	0	1	100
Nuwer	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	102 (100)	0	0	0	0	0	0	102
Oromo	2	88	5	2	10	0	3	0	1,579 (90.2)	3	2	52	4	1	1,751
Sidama	0	1	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	202 (97.6)	0	1	0	2	207
Silte	0	1	0	0	2	0	0	0	4	0	59 (89.4)	0	0	0	66
Somalie	0	1	0	0	1	0	0	0	24	1	0	341 (92.7)	0	0	368
Tigrie	3	22	0	0	1	0	0	0	3	0	1	2	615 (94.9)	1	648
Welaita	0	2	0	0	1	3	0	0	2	1	0	0	0	119 (93.0)	128
Total	357	1,553	135	123	188	63	99	102	1,757	209	76	397	652	140	5,851

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0140835.t002

gender are depicted in Fig 2. In the following we describe the results for the correlation analyses conducted on EDHS 2011.

Sexual behavior

Age at first sex. Although there was considerable heterogeneity in the reported mean age at first sex for both men and women, there was no association with HIV prevalence. This remained the case when analyses were restricted to those aged 15–24 years.

Premarital sex. There was a strong correlation between HIV prevalence and premarital sex for both women and men (r = 0.89; P < 0.001 and r = 0.90; P < 0.001, respectively).

Lifetime sex partners. There was significant association between HIV prevalence and mean number of lifetime sexual partners for men (r = 0.87; P < 0.001) but not women (r = 0.60; P = 0.05). In the case of men, visual comparison of the histograms from the highest (Gambela) and lowest (SNNP) HIV prevalence regions suggested that the difference in mean number of lifetime partners was not solely driven by a difference in the number with 10 or more partners (Fig 3). There was a significant difference between the mean lifetime partners in men in these two regions (Gambela 4.7, 95% CI 3.7–5.8; SNNP 1.8, 95% CI 1.4–2.2). This difference remained after we excluded those with 10 or more partners (Gambela 2.0, 95% CI 1.8–2.2; SNNP 1.2, 95% CI 1.1–1.3).

Table 3. Pearson's correlation coefficients for the association between HIV prevalence and various risk factors by region in Ethiopia in 2005 and 2011.

	20)11	200	05
	Men	Women	Men	Women
Age at first sex				
15-24 years old	0.28	0.23	0.02	0.01
15–59 years old ^a	0.18	0.33	-0.78 **	0.13
Pre marital sex (15–24 years old)	0.89 ***	0.90 ***	0.85 **	0.91 ***
Mean no. of lifetime sex partners	0.87 **	0.60	0.89 ***	0.43
Sex with non-married, non-cohabiting partner				
15-24 years	0.81 **	0.96 ***	0.76 *	0.57 *
15–59 years ^a	0.92 ***	0.93 ***	0.90 ***	0.65 *
Polygamy	NA	-0.24	NA	-0.05
Circumcision	-0.26	NA	-0.46	NA
Condom usage	0.92 ***	0.94 ***	0.78 0.005	0.46
Ever tested for HIV	0.71 *	0.63 *	0.53	0.47
Migration	0.03	NA	0.31	NA

^a 15–59 year age category refers to men aged 15–59 years and women aged 15–49 years.

NA-Not Applicable

* <0.05

** <0.005

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0140835.t003

PLOS ONE

High-risk sex (Sex with a non-married, non-cohabiting partner). In both the women and the men, high-risk sex was associated with HIV prevalence (men: r = 0.92; P < 0.001); women r = 0.93; P < 0.001). This relationship remained significant when restricted to those aged 15–24 years (men: r = 0.81; P = 0.003); women: r = 0.96; P < 0.0001).

For premarital sex, high-risk sex and lifetime sex partners (men only) the five low HIV prevalence regions clustered tightly at the lower risk end of scatter plots and the three high HIV prevalence regions clustered together at the high risk end (Fig 2). For each of these three variables, the absolute difference in the value of the risk factor in the high and low prevalence regions was high. For example in 15–59 year old men, the median prevalence of high-risk sex in the five low HIV prevalence regions was 6.0% (95% CI 4.6–7.8%) compared to 31.7% (95% CI 25.9–38.3%) in the three high HIV prevalence regions.

Polygamy. There was no statistically significant correlation between the prevalence of polygamy and HIV prevalence (r = -0.24; P = 0.06).

Condom usage. Reported condom usage at last sex was low in all ethnic groups but there was a positive association with HIV prevalence (men: r = 0.92; P < 0.001, women: r = 0.94; P < 0.001).

Male Circumcision. More than 75% of men in all regions reported having been circumcised. There was no association between circumcision and HIV prevalence (r = -0.26; P = 0.3).

Ever tested. Ethnic groups with higher HIV prevalence tended to have a higher percentage of members who reported prior testing for HIV (men: r = 0.71, P = 0.01; women r = 0.63, P = 0.04).

Migration. There was no association between migration and HIV prevalence (r = 0.03; P = 0.9).

P-value

^{*** &}lt;0.0005.



PLOS ONE

Fig 2. Association between adult HIV prevalence (15–49 years) and various HIV risk factors in 15–59 year old men (left) and 15–49 year old women (right) in the 2011 Ethiopian Demographic and Health Survey. Age of first sex (A), percent reporting pre-marital sex (15–24 year olds; B), mean number of lifetime sexual partners (C), percent reporting sex with a non-married, non-cohabiting partner in prior 12 months (15–59 years; D), the percent of men who reported being circumcised (E), polygamy—percent of married women who report that their husband has other wives (F), condom usage—the percentage who reported using a condom at last sex (G), percent ever tested for HIV (H) and migration—the percent of all men who reported spending more than one month away from home in the past year (I).

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0140835.g002

2005 EDHS results

Repeating the analyses using the 2005 EDHS produced very similar results (see Table 3).

Discussion

HIV has been present in Ethiopia since at least 1984 [10]. Its spread has, however, been far from even in Ethiopia's 11 regions. A number of studies have examined individual level risk factors for HIV in specific sites in Ethiopia [11–15], or compared changes over time in the whole country [8,9] but there has been little published comparing risk factors across different regions [16]. One exception is a study that evaluated factors associated with HIV infection in 72 000 army recruits from all over the country. The study collected no information on sexual behavior and its major findings were that HIV was associated with urban residence, and in rural areas with a higher level of education and being Orthodox Christian as opposed to Muslim [17].





doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0140835.g003

We found no evidence that risk factors unrelated to sexual behavior were associated with HIV prevalence. Circumcision rates were high throughout Ethiopia and were not associated with HIV prevalence. Condom usage and HIV testing were both positively associated with HIV prevalence, possibly suggesting a greater uptake of these interventions in response to HIV in these areas, as has been found in other countries [4,18]. There was no association between migration and HIV prevalence. Differences in these four risk factors are thus less likely explanations for the observed variations in HIV prevalence.

Our findings are compatible with the thesis that higher risk sexual behaviors play a role in determining the differential spread of HIV in Ethiopia. Three risk factors measuring sexual behavior were associated with HIV: pre-marital sex, number of lifetime sex partners and highrisk sex. These same three risk factors have previously been found to be associated with HIV prevalence by ethnic group in Kenya [2], South Africa [4] and elsewhere [19,20]. Previous reports from DHS data found that at an individual level there was a stepwise increase in HIV prevalence with increasing lifetime sex partners in all 15 countries with available data. This was true for both men and women in all cases [3,8]. This association was also present in the EDHS 2005 and 2011 [8,9]. That this association was present at both individual and population levels increases the likelihood that the association between lifetime sex partners and HIV prevalence is real [21,22]. In our study, although the association was positive for both men and women, it was only statistically significant for the men.

That our findings differed by gender may be due to the fact that DHS-type surveys are particularly prone to underreporting of risky sexual behavior in general and women in particular [23]. A study from Southern Africa found that using Audio Computer Assisted Self-Interviewing compared to standard DHS surveys reduced the male to female ratio of reported lifetime sexual partners from between 2.1 and 4.9 to 1.2 [23]. Other face-to-face interviewing techniques have also been shown to produce more accurate estimates of sexual behavior. A study that compared the estimates of sexual behavior from four African countries derived from DHS versus Population Services International survey methodology found that the DHS surveys produced considerably lower estimates of sensitive sexual behavior such as the prevalence of concurrency [24]. These differences may be related to differences in the length of the surveys, attention paid to conducting the interview in private and the framing of questions [24].

Certain self-reported sexual behaviors are likely to be more accurately captured by the DHS methodology than others [23]. Although this requires further study, sex with partners outside of marriage or cohabitation may be in this category. Reporting on cohabitation with sex partners in the past year is less likely to be susceptible to a response bias than more sensitive information, such as the existence of multiple concurrent partners. The high-risk variable—sex with partners outside of marriage or cohabitation—was constructed based on the insight that relationships with non-cohabiting partners do not offer the same opportunities to monitor sexual exclusivity as cohabiting relationships. As a result of this and other factors, non-cohabiting partnerships may be a marker of increased sexual network connectivity and hence HIV transmission [25]. A large review of individual level data from DHS surveys found that in 15 of the 19 countries with available data, reporting high-risk sex in the past year was strongly associated with HIV infection [3]. At an ecological level, the prevalence of high-risk sex from DHS in Kenya was also found to be associated with HIV prevalence by ethnic group [2]. Further studies are required to test if this relationship obtains in other countries.

This study has a number of limitations. The study is ecological in nature and thus inferences cannot be drawn to an individual level. As already noted, DHS surveys are suboptimal to determine sensitive sexual information. Furthermore, although the response rates for participation in the survey and HIV testing were high, this varied considerably between regions (see <u>Table 1</u>). The data is thus susceptible to a large number of biases such as social desirability,

recall and nonresponse biases. In particular, other work has found evidence of culture-specific heterogeneity in answering questionnaires [26,27]. We cannot exclude the possibility that respondents from regions where lower risk sexual behavior was reported were subject to a greater social desirability bias, which could invalidate our findings. The available evidence, however, suggests that only minor differences in sexual behavior exist between those who do and do not answer sexual behavior questionnaires [28]. In addition, the fact that the analyses using the 2005 and 2011 surveys produced such similar results makes the findings more robust. Our analyses are also weakened by the sparse representation of both outcomes (HIV positive/ negative) in some of the subsets under investigation. The analyses are all bivariate and thus do not control for the influence of other variables. Finally, we cannot exclude the possibility that the relationships between sexual behavior, region and HIV prevalence are confounded by other unmeasured variables.

Conclusion

The central finding of this study is of an association between markers of sexual risk and HIV prevalence by region in Ethiopia at both time points for which data is available. We cannot however conclude from this type of study if any particular aspect of sexual behavior plays a dominant role in determining differences in HIV prevalence. Evidence from other sources provides important insights into this question. Studies of high-HIV-prevalence-populations that have managed to reduce HIV incidence–including Uganda, Zimbabwe, Kenya, Thailand and the United States–have all pointed to the importance of reductions in forms of multiple partnering, including partnerships on the side [15,29–31]. Increasing condom usage and newer interventions such as antiretrovirals for treatment-as-prevention [32] and pre-exposure prophylaxis [33] are other important prevention strategies.

This study provides further evidence that differences in sexual behavior play a role in determining the differential spread of HIV. The patterning of behavioural differences suggests that HIV prevention efforts could be enhanced by moving beyond a focus on high-risk individuals to include community-level interventions. The comparison of the distribution of lifetime partners in Gambela and SNNP suggests that the difference between these regions is not just that Gambela has a higher proportion of high-risk individuals but that Gambela's histogram has been right shifted-in other words, an increase in high-risk behaviour has occurred across the population. Although this requires more research, this finding is suggestive of a difference in norms underpinning this behavior [21,22,34]. Populations with high HIV prevalence in South Africa have been found to have more tolerant norms to the sexual behaviors that underpin HIV spread [34]. If the right-shift in lifetime partners and other variables representing highrisk sexual behaviours in Gambela are similarly driven by populations norms, then HIV prevention efforts that focus only on high-risk individuals would have little effect on the underlying high-risk sexual network. Community lead population level interventions that promote behavior change through social networks may have a more profound effect [15]. The success of these types of interventions in countries such as Uganda has already been noted [15]. A recent randomized controlled trial has further demonstrated the efficacy of this approach [35]. More research is required to better ascertain the constellation of risk factors underpinning the differential HIV prevalence by region in Ethiopia and how these may be addressed.

Acknowledgments

We would like to thank Measure DHS for generously sharing the data.

Author Contributions

Conceived and designed the experiments: CK TS ISS. Performed the experiments: CK AT ISS. Analyzed the data: CK AT ISS. Contributed reagents/materials/analysis tools: CK AT ISS. Wrote the paper: CK AT ISS.

References

- Auvert B, Buve A, Ferry B, Carael M, Morison L, Lagarde E, et al. (2001) Ecological and individual level analysis of risk factors for HIV infection in four urban populations in sub-Saharan Africa with different levels of HIV infection. AIDS 15 Suppl 4: S15–30. PMID: <u>11686462</u>
- Kenyon C, Menten J, Vu L, Maughan Brown B (2014) Male circumcision and sexual risk behaviors may contribute to considerable ethnic disparities in HIV prevalence in Kenya: an ecological analysis. PloS One 9: e106230. doi: <u>10.1371/journal.pone.0106230</u> PMID: <u>25171060</u>
- 3. Mishra V, Medley A, Hong R, Gu Y, Robey B (2009) Levels and spread of HIV seroprevalence and associated factors: evidence from national household surveys. Levels and spread of HIV seroprevalence and associated factors: evidence from national household surveys.
- Kenyon C, Buyze J, Colebunders R (2013) HIV prevalence by race co-varies closely with concurrency and number of sex partners in South Africa. PLoS One 8: e64080. doi: <u>10.1371/journal.pone.0064080</u> PMID: <u>23704973</u>
- Aral SO, Holmes KK, Padian NS, Cates W Jr. (1996) Overview: individual and population approaches to the epidemiology and prevention of sexually transmitted diseases and human immunodeficiency virus infection. J Infect Dis 174 Suppl 2: S127–133. PMID: 8843242
- Morris M, Goodreau S, Moody J (2008) Sexual networks, concurrency and STD/HIV. In: Holmes KK, editor. Sexually transmitted diseases. 4th ed. New York: McGraw-Hill Medical. pp. xxv, 2166 p.
- 7. Kenyon C, Colebunders R (2013) Birds of a feather: homophily and sexual network structure in sub-Saharan Africa. Int J STD AIDS 24: 211–215. doi: <u>10.1177/0956462412472455</u> PMID: <u>23535354</u>
- Central Statistical Agency [Ethiopia] and ICF International (2012) Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey 2011. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia and Calverton, Maryland, USA: Central Statistical Agency and ICF International.
- Central Statistical Agency [Ethiopia] and ORC Macro (2005) Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey 2005. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia and Calverton, Maryland, USA: Central Statistical Agency and ORC Macro,.
- Tsega E, Mengesha B, Nordenfelt E, Hansson BG, Lindberg J (1988) Serological survey of human immunodeficiency virus infection in Ethiopia. Ethiop Med J 26: 179–184. PMID: <u>3215178</u>
- Hailù K, Bekura D, Buttò S, Verani P, Titti F, Sernicola L, et al. (1989) Serological survey of human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) in Ethiopia. Journal of medical virology 28: 21–24. PMID: <u>2786052</u>
- Tessema B, Yismaw G, Kassu A, Amsalu A, Mulu A, Emmrich F, et al. (2010) Seroprevalence of HIV, HBV, HCV and syphilis infections among blood donors at Gondar University Teaching Hospital, Northwest Ethiopia: declining trends over a period of five years. BMC Infect Dis 10: 111. doi: <u>10.1186/1471-</u> <u>2334-10-111</u> PMID: <u>20459703</u>
- Fontanet AL, Messele T, Dejene A, Enquselassie F, Abebe A, Cutts FT, et al. (1998) Age- and sex-specific HIV-1 prevalence in the urban community setting of Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. AIDS 12: 315–322. PMID: <u>9517995</u>
- Endris M, Deressa T, Belyhun Y, Moges F (2015) Seroprevalence of syphilis and human immunodeficiency virus infections among pregnant women who attend the University of Gondar teaching hospital, Northwest Ethiopia: a cross sectional study. BMC Infect Dis 15: 111. doi: <u>10.1186/s12879-015-0848-5</u> PMID: <u>25887081</u>
- Low-Beer D, Stoneburner RL (2003) Behaviour and communication change in reducing HIV: is Uganda unique? Afr J AIDS Res 2: 9–21. doi: <u>10.2989/16085906.2003.9626555</u> PMID: <u>25871935</u>
- 16. Kloos H, Mariam DH (2000) HIV/AIDS in Ethiopia: An overview. Northeast African Studies 7: 13–40.
- Abebe Y, Schaap A, Mamo G, Negussie A, Darimo B, Wolday D, et al. (2003) HIV prevalence in 72 000 urban and rural male army recruits, Ethiopia. AIDS 17: 1835–1840. PMID: <u>12891070</u>
- Shisana O, Rehle T, Simbayi LC, Zuma K, Jooste S, Zungu N, Labadarios D, Onoya D (2014) South African National HIV Prevalence, Incidence and Behaviour Survey, 2012. Cape Town: HSRC Press.
- Kenyon C, Osbak K, Buyze J (2014) The prevalence of HIV by ethnic group is correlated with HSV-2 and syphilis prevalence in Kenya, South Africa, the United Kingdom and the United States. Interdisciplinary Perspectives on Infectious Diseases: Article ID 284317.

- Kirungi WL, Musinguzi J, Madraa E, Mulumba N, Callejja T, Ghys P, et al. (2006) Trends in antenatal HIV prevalence in urban Uganda associated with uptake of preventive sexual behaviour. Sex Transm Infect 82 Suppl 1: i36–41. PMID: <u>16581758</u>
- 21. Rose G (1993) The strategy of preventive medicine. Oxford England; New York: Oxford University Press. xii, 138 p p.
- 22. Rose G, Day S (1990) The population mean predicts the number of deviant individuals. BMJ 301: 1031–1034. PMID: 2249053
- Beauclair R, Meng F, Deprez N, Temmerman M, Welte A, Hens N, et al. (2013) Evaluating audio computer assisted self-interviews in urban south African communities: evidence for good suitability and reduced social desirability bias of a cross-sectional survey on sexual behaviour. BMC medical research methodology 13: 11. doi: <u>10.1186/1471-2288-13-11</u> PMID: <u>23368888</u>
- Morris M, Vu L, Leslie-Cook A, Akom E, Stephen A, Sherard D (2013) Comparing Estimates of Multiple and Concurrent Partnerships Across Population Based Surveys: Implications for Combination HIV Prevention. AIDS Behav. PMID: 24077973
- Berhan Y, Berhan A (2015) A Meta-Analysis of Risky Sexual Behaviour among Male Youth in Developing Countries. AIDS Res Treat 2015: 580961. doi: <u>10.1155/2015/580961</u> PMID: <u>25709840</u>
- Lee S, Smith J (2015) Methodological Aspects of Subjective Life Expectancy: Effects of Culture-Specific Reporting Heterogeneity Among Older Adults in the United States. J Gerontol B Psychol Sci Soc Sci.
- 27. Hui CH, Triandis HC (1989) Effects of culture and response format on extreme response style. Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology 20: 296–309.
- Fenton KA, Mercer CH, McManus S, Erens B, Wellings K, Macdowall W, et al. (2005) Ethnic variations in sexual behaviour in Great Britain and risk of sexually transmitted infections: a probability survey. Lancet 365: 1246–1255. PMID: <u>15811458</u>
- Stoneburner RL, Low-Beer D (2004) Population-level HIV declines and behavioral risk avoidance in Uganda. Science 304: 714–718. PMID: <u>15118157</u>
- Halperin D, Mugurungi O, Hallett T, Muchini B, Campbell B, Magure T, et al. (2011) A surprising prevention success: why did the HIV epidemic decline in Zimbabwe? PLoS Med 8: e1000414. doi: <u>10.1371/journal.pmed.1000414</u> PMID: <u>21346807</u>
- **31.** Kirby D (2008) Changes in sexual behaviour leading to the decline in the prevalence of HIV in Uganda: confirmation from multiple sources of evidence. Sex Transm Dis 84: ii35–ii41.
- Cohen MS, Chen YQ, McCauley M, Gamble T, Hosseinipour MC, Kumarasamy N, et al. (2011) Prevention of HIV-1 infection with early antiretroviral therapy. N Engl J Med 365: 493–505. doi: <u>10.1056/</u> NEJMoa1105243 PMID: 21767103
- Baeten JM, Celum C (2013) Antiretroviral preexposure prophylaxis for HIV prevention. N Engl J Med 368: 83–84. PMID: <u>23293791</u>
- Kenyon C, Osbak K, Buyze J, Van Lankveld J (2014) Variations of sexual scripts relating to concurrency by race, class and gender in South Africa. Journal of Sex Research Oct 28: 1–9.
- **35.** Abramsky T, Devries K, Kiss L, Nakuti J, Kyegombe N, Starmann E, et al. (2014) Findings from the SASA! Study: a cluster randomized controlled trial to assess the impact of a community mobilization intervention to prevent violence against women and reduce HIV risk in Kampala, Uganda. BMC Med 12: 122. doi: <u>10.1186/s12916-014-0122-5</u> PMID: <u>25248996</u>