# Failure Rate After Superior Capsular Reconstruction With Achilles Tendon–Bone Allograft for Irreparable Rotator Cuff Tears

Erica Kholinne,\*<sup>†</sup> MD, PhD, Yucheng Sun,<sup>‡</sup> MD, PhD, Jae-Man Kwak,<sup>†</sup> MD, Hyojune Kim,<sup>†</sup> MD, Kyoung Hwan Koh,<sup>†</sup> MD, PhD, and In-Ho Jeon,<sup>†</sup><sup>§</sup> MD, PhD

Investigation performed at Asan Medical Center, Seoul, Republic of Korea

**Background:** Superior capsular reconstruction (SCR) is an alternative to reverse shoulder arthroplasty for irreparable rotator cuff tears (IRCTs). The reconstructed capsule acts as a static restraint to prevent superior migration of the humeral head. Traditional SCR uses a fascia lata autograft, which has shown failure at the greater tuberosity. An Achilles tendon–bone allograft has been proposed to improve the failure rate.

Purpose: To evaluate the surgical outcomes of SCR using an Achilles tendon-bone allograft for the treatment of IRCTs.

Study Design: Case series; Level of evidence, 4.

**Methods:** We retrospectively evaluated 6 patients with massive IRCTs who underwent SCR using an Achilles tendon–bone allograft between January 2017 and January 2018. Clinical outcomes were assessed using range of motion, the American Shoulder and Elbow Surgeons score, and the visual analog scale for pain. The acromiohumeral distance and the status of graft integrity were evaluated using serial magnetic resonance imaging. Second-look arthroscopy surgery was performed to evaluate graft integrity at the mean of 7.5 months postoperative.

**Results:** The mean  $\pm$  SD clinical follow-up period was 14.5 months (range, 12-17 months). The American Shoulder and Elbow Surgeons and visual analog scale scores improved from 42.8  $\pm$  11.9 and 4.0  $\pm$  1.2 to 62.1  $\pm$  14.7 and 2.8  $\pm$  1.4, respectively. Forward flexion and external rotation improved from 98°  $\pm$  36° and 58°  $\pm$  4° to 123°  $\pm$  20° and 39°  $\pm$  8°, respectively. The acromiohumeral distance improved from 3.9  $\pm$  0.8 mm to 6.4  $\pm$  2.2 mm at final follow-up. However, second-look arthroscopy at a mean of 7.6 months postoperatively confirmed a graft failure rate of 83.3%.

**Conclusion:** SCR using an Achilles tendon–bone allograft for the treatment of IRCTs had a high graft failure rate among patients in this case series.

Keywords: superior capsular reconstruction; Achilles tendon; Achilles tendon-bone allograft; rotator cuff; rotator cuff tear

Rotator cuff tears represent one of the most common causes of shoulder-related disability.<sup>23</sup> It has been reported that the prevalence of rotator cuff tears is approximately 20% of the general population,<sup>59</sup> which increases to 54% of individuals aged > 60 years.<sup>51</sup> In the Republic of Korea, the ageadjusted rate of rotator cuff repair surgery per 100,000 individuals was 13.15 cases in 2007 and 116.04 cases in 2015.<sup>23</sup> Of irreparable rotator cuff tears (IRCTs), which are mostly associated with massive tear size, 79% are estimated to have recurrent tears after surgical repair.<sup>18</sup> Several nonarthroplasty options have been described for the treatment of IRCTs, including debridement, long-head biceps tenotomy,<sup>57</sup> tuberoplasty,<sup>44</sup> partial repair,<sup>9</sup> tendon transfer,<sup>12</sup> and patch grafts.<sup>1</sup> Reverse shoulder arthroplasty is an alternative option for the treatment of massive IRCTs; however, its longevity is limited in young patients.<sup>49</sup> Mihata et al<sup>39</sup> described reconstruction of the superior capsule of the shoulder using an autograft fascia lata, which provides the passive restraint against the upward migration of the humeral head. Since then, superior capsular reconstruction (SCR) using fascia lata autografts<sup>6,30,32,37,48,60</sup> and human dermal allografts<sup>7,20,45,46</sup> has been used for the treatment of IRCTs.

Graft integrity after SCR is an important independent factor to improve postoperative functional outcomes.<sup>7,35,39</sup> At present, graft failure rates have been variably reported from 0% to 55% and appear to be comparable among various graft types.<sup>||</sup> The majority of these failures have been observed at the fixation point of the graft on the greater tuberosity.<sup>32</sup> Consequently, an Achilles tendon-bone

The Orthopaedic Journal of Sports Medicine, 9(5), 23259671211002280 DOI: 10.1177/23259671211002280 © The Author(s) 2021

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>II</sup>References 6, 7, 20, 30, 32, 37, 45, 46, 48, 60.

This open-access article is published and distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial - No Derivatives License (https://creativecommons.org/ licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/), which permits the noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction of the article in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited. You may not alter, transform, or build upon this article without the permission of the Author(s). For article reuse guidelines, please visit SAGE's website at http://www.sagepub.com/journals-permissions.

allograft has been used in SCR to provide stronger fixation at the greater tuberosity site.  $^{\rm 27}$ 

Results from animal studies have shown that homogeneous tissue healing (bone to bone) is superior to heterogeneous tissue healing (bone to tendon) in terms of healing time and tissue integration with the respect of tensile properties at the healing complex.<sup>31,56</sup> The advantage of an Achilles tendon-bone allograft is an intact native bone-tendon interface that allows homogeneous tissue healing. However, surgical outcomes after SCR using an Achilles tendon-bone allograft have not yet been defined.

The current study evaluated the surgical outcomes of our initial experience performing an SCR using an Achilles tendon-bone allograft for the treatment of IRCTs.

### METHODS

#### Patient Selection

This was a retrospective case series of patients who underwent SCR at a tertiary referral hospital between January 2017 and January 2018; institutional review board approval was acquired for this study. The inclusion criteria were as follows: (1) diagnosis of IRCT Patte stage 3 medial retraction on preoperative magnetic resonance imaging (MRI) according to patients' medical records between January 2017 and January 2018, (2) minimum evidence of significant bony deformity caused by glenohumeral arthritis on standard shoulder anteroposterior radiograph,<sup>17</sup> (3) irreducible rotator cuff tear after arthroscopic reduction trial, (4) intact deltoid muscle at the time of physical examination, (5) SCR performed by a single surgeon (I.-H.J.), and (6) SCR using an Achilles tendon-bone allograft. Exclusion criteria were as follows: (1) severe bone deformity (Hamada grade 5), (2) severe superior migration of the humeral head that could not be corrected using arm traction, (3) irreparable subscapularis tendon, (4) cervical nerve and axillary nerve palsy, (5) revision SCR, and (6) <2 years of minimum follow-up. A total of 6 patients were included in the current case series.

# Surgical Technique

Patients were prepared and draped in the beach-chair position under general anesthesia after an interscalene brachial plexus block.<sup>26</sup> Diagnostic arthroscopy through a lateral portal was performed to confirm the size and configuration of a rotator cuff tear. After the rotator cuff tear was determined to be irreparable without tension, the surgical setting was changed from arthroscopy to an open setting with the following steps.

A 5-cm skin incision was longitudinally made starting from the midpoint of the one-third lateral margin of the acromion to the lateral border of the coracoid process. The deltoid was split longitudinally 3 to 4 cm between the anterior and middle deltoid. A curvilinear incision was made to take down a small portion of the anterior deltoid and the coracoacromial ligament. A routine acromioplasty was performed for all patients. The mediolateral distance from the glenoid to the footprint of the greater tuberosity was measured using a probe for graft sizing. The Achilles tendonbone graft, which had undergone gamma irradiation (25 kGy), was prepared on a table in the operating room. The Achilles tendon-bone graft was thawed in warm saline for 30 minutes before preparation. The calcaneus bone was trimmed using an oscillating saw to fit the greater tuberosity. The width and length of the Achilles tendon was prepared according to the defect size measured. The Achilles tendon was folded twice to achieve a minimum thickness of 6 mm. A running stitch No. 2-0 polyester suture (Ethibond; Johnson & Johnson) was applied at the graft margin. The bursal side of the graft was marked with a surgical marker pen to ease orientation (Figure 1).

The long head of the biceps tendon was tenotomized, if present. The superior margin of the glenoid was debrided, allowing for 2 all-suture anchors for fixation (Suturefix Ultra Anchor, 1.9 mm; Smith & Nephew). Sutures from the glenoid anchors were passed through the medial end of the graft using horizontal mattress configuration before graft delivery. The graft was introduced into the joint using the Kelly clamp and secured to the glenoid (Figure 2).

The greater tuberosity was cleared from degenerated fibrocartilage using a bone curette and rongeur. The greater tuberosity was prepared using the combination of a burr and bone rasp to allow maximum bone-to-bone contact with the bone part of the graft. The bone portion of the graft was fixed to the greater tuberosity using a 3.5-mm self-tapping cortical screw and washer (Depuy Synthes). The graft was repaired side to side using polyester sutures (No. 1 Ethibond; Johnson & Johnson) to the remaining anterior and posterior rotator cuff tissue. When possible, the remaining bursa tissue was repaired to the reconstructed capsule as adapted from previous studies.<sup>4</sup> The deltoid was repaired to the acromion using heavy absorbable suture (No. 1 Vicryl; Ethicon).

After the surgery, all patients used a shoulder abduction brace (in  $30^{\circ}$  to  $45^{\circ}$  abduction) for 6 weeks and began pendulum exercises at 3 weeks. After gaining range of motion

Final revision submitted November 13, 2020; accepted December 14, 2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>§</sup>Address correspondence to In-Ho Jeon, MD, PhD, Department of Orthopedic Surgery, University of Ulsan, Asan Medical Center, 86 Asanbyeongwongil, Songpa-gu, Seoul 138-736, Republic of Korea (email: jeonchoi@gmail.com; ORCID iD: 0000-0002-9289-9193).

<sup>\*</sup>Faculty of Medicine, Universitas Trisakti, Department of Orthopedic Surgery, St. Carolus Hospital, Jakarta, Indonesia.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>†</sup>Department of Orthopedic Surgery, Asan Medical Center, University of Ulsan, Seoul, Republic of Korea.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>‡</sup>Department of Hand Surgery, Affiliated Hospital of Nantong University, Nantong, Nantong University, Jiangsu, China.

One or more of the authors has declared the following potential conflict of interest or source of funding: This study was supported by the Basic Science Research Program through the Asan Institute for Life Sciences funded by Asan Medical Center (2020IL0044). AOSSM checks author disclosures against the Open Payments Database (OPD). AOSSM has not conducted an independent investigation on the OPD and disclaims any liability or responsibility relating thereto.

Ethical approval for this study was obtained from Asan Medical Center (ref: S2020-0342-0001).



**Figure 1.** Graft preparation using (A) the Achilles tendon–bone allograft thawed using warm normal saline. The graft was fashioned according to the defect size measured. (B-D) A graft at least 6 mm thick was obtained during the final preparation.



**Figure 2.** The greater tuberosity bone bed was prepared after (A) insertion of the glenoid anchors (left shoulder, beach-chair position). (B) The graft was shuttled to the joint, and (C) the bony portion of the graft was fixed using a cortical screw.

(ROM) after surgery, patients were taught strengthening exercises for the periscapular muscles and rotator cuff by a dedicated physical therapist at 3 months postoperatively.

# **Clinical Outcomes Assessment**

Pain was measured using a visual analog scale (VAS). Functional outcome was evaluated using the American Shoulder and Elbow Surgeons (ASES) score with minimal clinically important difference as a reference value.<sup>25</sup> For active shoulder ROM, forward flexion (FF) and external rotation (ER) were measured using a handheld goniometer. The internal rotation was measured as the spinous process level that could be reached by the thumb of the patient in a sitting position. Medical records were reviewed for any surgical complications such as reoperation, wound complications, deep infections, and nerve injury. A fellowship-trained orthopaedic surgeon acting as the independent examiner (Y.S.) who was not involved in the surgery performed all clinical assessments at 3, 6, and 12 months postoperatively.

# Radiological Outcomes Assessment

The preoperative MRI scans were reviewed to evaluate the involved tendons, tear size, and fatty infiltration according to the Goutallier index.<sup>10,14</sup> The graft integrity was evaluated after the index surgery using a 3.0-T MRI (Achieva; Philips Medical System) at postoperative months 3, 6, and 12 and then annually thereafter (Figure 3).<sup>32</sup>

Graft failure was defined as any sign of graft discontinuity observed in every coronal section.<sup>3</sup> The timing of graft tear was categorized as early (within 3 months postoperatively), midterm (at 3-6 months postoperatively), and late (after 6 months postoperatively).<sup>24</sup> The acromiohumeral



**Figure 3.** Magnetic resonance imaging scan of the right shoulder for the evaluation of graft integrity at 6 months after index surgery (yellow arrows indicate intact graft).

distance (AHD) was measured using plain standard shoulder radiographs, which were taken with the radiographic beam tilted 20° caudally in anteroposterior projection.<sup>58</sup> The stage of rotator cuff arthropathy was evaluated using the Hamada classification system.<sup>17</sup> Fatty infiltration of the rotator cuff muscles was rated using the global fatty degeneration index (GFDI).<sup>15</sup> A fellowship-trained shoulder specialist (E.K.) who was blinded to patientidentifying information and clinical outcomes analyzed all imaging studies.

# Second-Look Arthroscopy and Histology Assessment

Arthroscopically assisted implant removal was performed when evidence of greater tuberosity union existed and was confirmed using MRI assessment. The implant removal procedure typically occurred in the 6-month postoperative period. A second-look evaluation of graft integrity was performed during the implant removal procedure (Figures 4 and 5). We considered any sign of graft discontinuity as graft failure and recorded the position of this failure. A biopsy was performed when graft failure was confirmed. Tissue retrieved during biopsies was evaluated using hematoxylin and eosin staining.

As this was a case series with a limited number of patients, we did not perform statistical comparisons.

# RESULTS

# **Clinical Outcomes**

A total of 6 patients (4 men, 2 women) were reported at a mean follow-up of 14.5 months (range, 12-17 months). The dominant extremity was affected in 50% of the patients. Five patients were manual workers. The patients' mean age at the time of surgery was 62.3 years (range, 60-65 years) (Table 1).



**Figure 4.** Second-look arthroscopy (right shoulder, patient 4) at the glenohumeral joint during implant removal procedure revealed an intact graft (asterisks) at 7 months after superior capsular reconstruction. (A and B) Glenohumeral joint, posterior viewing portal. G, glenoid; H, humerus.



**Figure 5.** Second-look arthroscopy (left shoulder, patient 5) during implant removal showing failure of the graft (asterisks) at the anterior aspect at 7 months after superior capsular reconstruction. (A) Glenohumeral joint, posterior viewing portal, and (B) subacromial joint, lateral viewing portal. G, glenoid; H, humerus.

TABLE 1 Preoperative Patient Characteristics

Patient	Age, y	Sex	Previous Surgery	Job	Dominant Extremity Involved	
1	62	Female	No	Manual worker	No	
2	65	Male	No	Manual worker	Yes	
3	62	Male	Arthroscopic rotator cuff repair (6 y ago)	Manual worker	Yes	
4	62	Female	Arthroscopic rotator cuff repair (9 y ago)	Housewife	Yes	
5	63	Male	Arthroscopic rotator cuff repair (5 y ago)	Manual worker	No	
6	60	Male	No	Manual worker	No	

The mean preoperative ASES and VAS scores were 42.8  $\pm$  11.9 and 4.0  $\pm$  1.2, respectively. The mean postoperative ASES and VAS scores at the final follow-up were 62.1  $\pm$  14.7 and 2.8  $\pm$  1.4, respectively. The mean preoperative ROM of FF and ER were 98°  $\pm$  36° and 58°  $\pm$  4°, respectively. The mean postoperative ROM of FF and ER at the final follow-up were 123°  $\pm$  20° and 39°  $\pm$  8°, respectively (Table 2). As this was a case series with a limited number of patients, we did not perform statistical comparisons.

#### **Radiological Outcomes**

The AHD improved from  $3.9 \pm 0.8$  mm to  $6.4 \pm 2.2$  mm at the final follow-up. GFDI and stage of rotator cuff arthropathy (Hamada stage) did not change from pre- to postoperatively. Graft failure was confirmed in 1 patient (patient 2) on MRI examination at 3 months postoperatively.

# Second-Look Arthroscopy and Histology Assessment

Graft failure at the anterior site was confirmed using second-look arthroscopy for 3 patients and at the posterior site for 2 patients (Table 3). The histology examination of

 $\begin{array}{c} {\rm TABLE~2}\\ {\rm Comparison~of~Pre-~and~Postoperative~Clinical~Outcomes}^a \end{array}$ 

		Patient					
	1	2	3	4	5	6	
VAS for pain							
Preop	6	4	3	5	3	3	
Postop	3	3	3	1	<b>2</b>	5	
ASES score							
Preop	58	52	32	35	30	50	
Postop	67	71	38	75	72	50	
FF, deg							
Preop	130	60	90	80	155	75	
Postop	130	115	120	135	150	90	
ER, deg							
Preop	65	60	45	45	75	60	
Postop	45	10	50	70	30	30	
IR, spinous process							
Preop	L1	T10	L2	L2	L1	T11	
Postop	T12	T11	T12	T10	L1	T12	

<sup>*a*</sup>ASES, American Shoulder and Elbow Surgeons; ER, external rotation; FF, forward flexion; IR, internal rotation; L, lumbar; Postop, postoperative; Preop, preoperative; T, thoracic; VAS, visual analog score.

Comparison of Fre- and Postoperative Radiological Outcomes									
	Patient								
	1	2	3	4	5	6			
GFDI									
Preop	3	3	3	3	3	3.3			
Postop	3	3	3	3	3	3.3			
AHD, mm									
Preop	3.7	4	4.8	4.6	4.1	2.3			
Postop	7.1	4.3	5.1	10.6	5.4	5.9			
Hamada stage									
Preop	2	2	2	2	2	3			
Postop	2	2	2	2	2	3			
Graft integrity									
3-mo MRI	Intact	Failed	Intact	Intact	Intact	Intact			
6-mo MRI	Intact	Not performed	Intact	Intact	Intact	Intact			
Second-look arthroscopy results	Failed (8 mo)	Failed (6 mo)	Failed (8 mo)	Intact (7 mo)	Failed (7 mo)	Failed (9 mo)			
Graft failure site	Posterior aspect	Anterior aspect	Anterior aspect	—	Anterior aspect	Posterior aspect			

TABLE 3 Comparison of Pre- and Postoperative Radiological  $Outcomes^a$ 

<sup>a</sup>Dash indicates no failure. AHD, acromiohumeral distance; GFDI, global fatty degeneration index; MRI, magnetic resonance imaging; Postop, postoperative; Preop, preoperative.



**Figure 6.** Microscopic evaluation of failed graft with hematoxylin and eosin staining: (A)  $20 \times$  magnification and (B)  $40 \times$  magnification insert showing poor cellularity and no viable blood vessels.

the failed graft tissue revealed an arrangement of dense collagen fibers with poor cellularity and blood vessels. We found no significant evidence of inflammation or viable blood vessel formation. There was no living fibroblast observed (Figure 6).

#### DISCUSSION

This case series describes the limitations of the Achilles tendon-bone allograft used in SCR for the treatment of IRCTs. The literature has shown that graft integrity can positively affect functional outcomes.<sup>7,35-39</sup> To decrease the graft failure rate, a thick graft can enhance stiffness.<sup>36</sup> However, despite the robust Achilles tendon-bone allograft

used, the current study shows a high graft failure rate, which perhaps corresponds to unsatisfactory clinical outcomes. Only 50% of our patients had improvements in their ASES scores that reached the minimal clinically important difference of 21.0 points.<sup>25</sup> The greatest improvement was seen in the patient with an intact graft on second look.

The use of an Achilles tendon-bone allograft for SCR has been previously reported.<sup>27,34</sup> However, these previous reports were technique articles that did not provide clinical or radiographic outcomes. The current study assessed graft integrity serially using MRI scans. Postoperative MRI evaluation at the 3-month follow-up revealed 1 failed graft (16.7%), which was considered a relatively favorable outcome. However, second-look arthroscopy at an average of 7.6 months revealed a greater graft failure rate (5 of 6 grafts; 83.3%), perhaps implying that MRI evaluation overestimates graft integrity.

Basic science studies have emphasized the importance of bone-tendon interface regeneration at the greater tuberosity to reduce failure of rotator cuff repair.<sup>29,33,54,55</sup> These studies have shown that homogeneous tissue healing is superior to heterogeneous tissue healing by comparing bone-to-bone healing and tendon-to-tendon healing with tendon-to-bone healing using different animal models.<sup>31,56</sup> The Achilles tendon-bone allograft with a native bonetendon interface, which allows homogeneous tissue healing at the greater tuberosity, was used in the current study. The graft failure occurs at the tendinous portion (midsubstance of the Achilles tendon-bone allograft) at which a side-to-side repair with the remaining rotator cuff was performed. Furthermore, the graft failures were not observed at the medial (glenoid) or lateral (greater tuberosity) fixation sites. Perhaps medial and lateral healing of the graft was associated with the improvement in ROM and outcome scores in some of our patients, as the shoulder joints were able to force couple and remain functional. It is universally accepted that structural integrity does not always reflect the clinical outcome after rotator cuff repair surgery. Smaller retear compared with the initial tear was reported to be well tolerated by most of the patients after rotator cuff repair surgery.<sup>11</sup> We postulated that a midsubstance tear such as that observed in the present case series of IRCTs can be analogous to those smaller retear cases after rotator cuff repair surgery. Furthermore, it is also possible that the improvements observed in some of our patients were associated with the acromioplasty or resulted from a tuberoplasty effect. The improvement in pain was observed in patients with massive rotator cuff repair after a failed dermal allograft procedure because the tuberosity is covered by the graft to prevent bone-to-bone contact with the acromion.41

SCR is still evolving from a surgical technique standpoint, with a wide variety of procedures being reported.<sup>2,5,16,19,28,42,53</sup> To date, debate exists about whether a side-to-side graft repair to the adjacent remaining rotator cuff is necessary.<sup>20,30,40</sup> The side-to-side graft repair was performed with the premise of having complete restoration of shoulder stability, which was supported by a previous biomechanical study.<sup>40</sup> Our study revealed that the side-to-side repair of the graft to the remnant native tissue had a high failure rate. Lee and  $Min^{30}$  described the side-to-side repair of the graft to the posterior remnant tissue in their retrospective series and showed that remnant tissue is mostly poor quality. Perhaps the cause of side-to-side repair failure of the SCR is associated with the poor quality of the native tissue.

The decision to use an autograft or allograft in SCR is commonly decided by the advantages and disadvantages in individual cases as well as the surgeon's preference, and it depends on the political and regulatory issues that vary among countries. Allograft use has had its own innate limitations in lower biological properties compared with autograft when certain types of sterilization were used.<sup>8,47</sup> However, allografts have historically been used during orthopaedic procedures because of lower donor-site morbidity and shortened surgical times.  $^{47}$  These advantages have resulted in an increased utilization of allografts over the past decade.  $^{13}$ 

All tendon grafts, whether autogenous or allogenous, undergo the same process of tissue integration, with graft necrosis, revascularization, cell repopulation, and remodeling.<sup>21</sup> The literature has shown that the incorporation of an allograft in the knee occurred more slowly and less completely in an animal study.<sup>22</sup> A clinical comparative study assessed the early versus late surgical outcome of patients with anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction using an allograft.<sup>43</sup> The study showed that the functional outcome was favorable and remained consistent at longterm follow-up. The present case series demonstrated limited incorporation of the Achilles tendon-bone allograft, which was reflected in the high failure rate. The histologic analysis of the failed graft demonstrated poor vascular ingrowth, which perhaps led to poor healing potential.<sup>50,52</sup> It is possible that the specific type and dose of sterilization, particularly gamma irradiation, may have contributed to the graft failure. Another consideration is the poor vascularity of the native tissue used for the anterior and posterior repair.

### Study Limitations

The limitations of the current study follow. First, the study was a retrospective case series with a small sample number; patients were few because the Achilles tendon-bone allograft was not used after the negative results of 6 consecutive patients. Statistical analysis was not performed because of the small sample size. Second, surgical outcomes were based on an early result. Surgical outcomes are reported at a short-term follow-up because of the end point of the study (ie, failed graft). Third, performance bias was possible, as the outcomes represented the experience of a single surgeon who specializes in shoulder surgery. Despite the limitations, surgeons may benefit from the current study in terms of weighting their decision to choose a particular SCR graft type.

# CONCLUSION

SCR using an Achilles tendon-bone allograft for the treatment of IRCTs has limitations that show a considerable graft failure rate.

# ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The authors thank Jong-Hwee Park, CNS, for her assistance in medical data collection.

#### ORCID ID

In-Ho Jeon, MD, PhD D https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9289-9193

#### REFERENCES

- Bond JL, Dopirak RM, Higgins J, Burns J, Snyder SJ. Arthroscopic replacement of massive, irreparable rotator cuff tears using a Graft-Jacket allograft: technique and preliminary results. *Arthroscopy*. 2008;24(4):403-409, e401.
- Boutsiadis A, Chen S, Jiang C, et al. Long head of the biceps as a suitable available local tissue autograft for superior capsular reconstruction: "the Chinese way," *Arthrosc Tech*. 2017;6(5):e1559-e1566.
- Burkhart SS, Hartzler RU. Superior capsular reconstruction reverses profound pseudoparalysis in patients with irreparable rotator cuff tears and minimal or no glenohumeral arthritis. *Arthroscopy*. 2019; 35(1):22-28.
- Cabarcas BC, Garcia GH, Gowd AK, Liu JN, Romeo AA. Arthroscopic superior capsular reconstruction and over-the-top rotator cuff repair incorporation for treatment of massive rotator cuff tears. *Arthrosc Tech.* 2018;7(8):e829-e837.
- Chillemi C, Mantovani M, Gigante A. Superior capsular reconstruction of the shoulder: the ABC (Arthroscopic Biceps Chillemi) technique. *Eur J Orthop Surg Traumatol.* 2018;28(6):1215-1223.
- de Campos Azevedo CI, Angelo A, Vinga S. Arthroscopic superior capsular reconstruction with a minimally invasive harvested fascia lata autograft produces good clinical results. Orthop J Sports Med. 2018;6(11):2325967118808242.
- Denard PJ, Brady PC, Adams CR, Tokish JM, Burkhart SS. Preliminary results of arthroscopic superior capsule reconstruction with dermal allograft. *Arthroscopy*. 2018;34(1):93-99.
- Diniz P, Pacheco J, Flora M, et al. Clinical applications of allografts in foot and ankle surgery. *Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc.* 2019; 27(6):1847-1872.
- 9. Duralde XA, Bair B. Massive rotator cuff tears: the result of partial rotator cuff repair. *J Shoulder Elbow Surg*. 2005;14(2):121-127.
- Fuchs B, Weishaupt D, Zanetti M, Hodler J, Gerber C. Fatty degeneration of the muscles of the rotator cuff: assessment by computed tomography versus magnetic resonance imaging. *J Shoulder Elbow Surg.* 1999;8(6):599-605.
- 11. Galanopoulos I, Ilias A, Karliaftis K, Papadopoulos D, Ashwood N. The impact of re-tear on the clinical outcome after rotator cuff repair using open or arthroscopic techniques—a systematic review. *Open Orthop J.* 2017;11:95-107.
- 12. Gerber C. Latissimus dorsi transfer for the treatment of irreparable tears of the rotator cuff. *Clin Orthop Relat Res.* 1992;275:152-160.
- Gitelis S, Cole BJ. The use of allografts in orthopaedic surgery. Instr Course Lect. 2002;51:507-520.
- Goutallier D, Postel JM, Bernageau J, Lavau L, Voisin MC. Fatty muscle degeneration in cuff ruptures: pre- and postoperative evaluation by CT scan. *Clin Orthop Relat Res.* 1994;304:78-83.
- Goutallier D, Postel JM, Gleyze P, Leguilloux P, Van Driessche S. Influence of cuff muscle fatty degeneration on anatomic and functional outcomes after simple suture of full-thickness tears. *J Shoulder Elbow Surg.* 2003;12(6):550-554.
- Greenspoon JA, Petri M, Millett PJ. Arthroscopic knotless, doublerow, extended linked repair for massive rotator cuff tears. *Arthrosc Tech*. 2016;5(1):e127-e132.
- Hamada K, Fukuda H, Mikasa M, Kobayashi Y. Roentgenographic findings in massive rotator cuff tears: a long-term observation. *Clin Orthop Relat Res.* 1990;254:92-96.
- Henry P, Wasserstein D, Park S, et al. Arthroscopic repair for chronic massive rotator cuff tears: a systematic review. *Arthroscopy*. 2015; 31(12):2472-2480.
- Hirahara AM, Adams CR. Arthroscopic superior capsular reconstruction for treatment of massive irreparable rotator cuff tears. *Arthrosc Tech*. 2015;4(6):e637-e641.
- Hirahara AM, Andersen WJ, Panero AJ. Superior capsular reconstruction: clinical outcomes after minimum 2-year follow-up. *Am J Orthop* (*Belle Mead NJ*). 2017;46(6):266-278.
- Jackson DW, Corsetti J, Simon TM. Biologic incorporation of allograft anterior cruciate ligament replacements. *Clin Orthop Relat Res.* 1996; 324:126-133.

- Jackson DW, Grood ES, Goldstein JD, et al. A comparison of patellar tendon autograft and allograft used for anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction in the goat model. *Am J Sports Med.* 1993;21(2): 176-185.
- Jo YH, Lee KH, Kim SJ, Kim J, Lee BG. National trends in surgery for rotator cuff disease in Korea. J Korean Med Sci. 2017;32(2):357-364.
- Kholinne E, Kwak J-M, Kim H, Koh KH, Jeon I-H. Arthroscopic superior capsular reconstruction with mesh augmentation for the treatment of irreparable rotator cuff tears: a comparative study of surgical outcomes. *Am J Sports Med.* 2020;48(13):3328-3338
- Kim DM, Kim TH, Kholinne E, et al. Minimal clinically important difference, substantial clinical benefit, and patient acceptable symptomatic state after arthroscopic rotator cuff repair. *Am J Sports Med*. 2020;48(11):2650-2659.
- Kim JH, Koh HJ, Kim DK, et al. Interscalene brachial plexus bolus block versus patient-controlled interscalene indwelling catheter analgesia for the first 48 hours after arthroscopic rotator cuff repair. *J Shoulder Elbow Surg.* 2018;27(7):1243-1250.
- Kim JW, Nam DJ. Arthroscopic superior capsular reconstruction by the mini-open modified keyhole technique using an Achilles tendonbone allograft. Arthrosc Tech. 2020;9(2):e275-e281.
- Kim YS, Lee HJ, Park I, et al. Arthroscopic in situ superior capsular reconstruction using the long head of the biceps tendon. *Arthrosc Tech*. 2018;7(2):e97-e103.
- Koike Y, Trudel G, Uhthoff HK. Formation of a new enthesis after attachment of the supraspinatus tendon: a quantitative histologic study in rabbits. *J Orthop Res.* 2005;23(6):1433-1440.
- Lee SJ, Min YK. Can inadequate acromiohumeral distance improvement and poor posterior remnant tissue be the predictive factors of re-tear? Preliminary outcomes of arthroscopic superior capsular reconstruction. *Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc.* 2018;26(7): 2205-2213.
- Leung KS, Chong WS, Chow DH, et al. A comparative study on the biomechanical and histological properties of bone-to-bone, bone-to-tendon, and tendon-to-tendon healing: an Achilles tendon-calcaneus model in goats. *Am J Sports Med*. 2015;43(6): 1413-1421.
- Lim S, AlRamadhan H, Kwak JM, Hong H, Jeon IH. Graft tears after arthroscopic superior capsule reconstruction (ASCR): pattern of failure and its correlation with clinical outcome. *Arch Orthop Trauma Surg.* 2019;139(2):231-239.
- Mall NA, Tanaka MJ, Choi LS, Paletta GA Jr. Factors affecting rotator cuff healing. J Bone Joint Surg Am. 2014;96(9):778-788.
- Mease SJ, Moontasri NJ, Kurowicki J, et al. Superior capsular reconstruction with Achilles tendon allograft. *Arthrosc Tech*. 2020;9(4): e527-e533.
- 35. Mihata T. Editorial commentary: superior capsule reconstruction. Graft healing for success. *Arthroscopy*. 2018;34(1):100-101.
- Mihata T. Editorial commentary: superior capsule reconstruction. Grafts for superior capsular reconstruction must be thick and stiff. *Arthroscopy*. 2019;35(8):2535-2536.
- Mihata T, Lee TQ, Fukunishi K, et al. Return to sports and physical work after arthroscopic superior capsule reconstruction among patients with irreparable rotator cuff tears. *Am J Sports Med.* 2018; 46(5):1077-1083.
- Mihata T, Lee TQ, Hasegawa A, et al. Five-year follow-up of arthroscopic superior capsule reconstruction for irreparable rotator cuff tears. J Bone Joint Surg Am. 2019;101(21):1921-1930.
- Mihata T, Lee TQ, Watanabe C, et al. Clinical results of arthroscopic superior capsule reconstruction for irreparable rotator cuff tears. *Arthroscopy*. 2013;29(3):459-470.
- Mihata T, McGarry MH, Kahn T, et al. Biomechanical role of capsular continuity in superior capsule reconstruction for irreparable tears of the supraspinatus tendon. *Am J Sports Med.* 2016;44(6): 1423-1430.
- Mirzayan R, Stone MA, Batech M, Acevedo DC, Singh A. Failed dermal allograft procedures for irreparable rotator cuff tears can still improve pain and function: the "biologic tuberoplasty effect." *Orthop J Sports Med.* 2019;7(8):2325967119863432.

- Narvani AA, Consigliere P, Polyzois I, et al. The "pull-over" technique for arthroscopic superior capsular reconstruction. *Arthrosc Tech*. 2016;5(6):e1441-e1447.
- Noyes FR, Barber-Westin SD. Reconstruction of the anterior cruciate ligament with human allograft: comparison of early and later results. J Bone Joint Surg Am. 1996;78(4):524-537.
- 44. Park JG, Cho NS, Song JH, Baek JH, Rhee YG. Long-term outcome of tuberoplasty for irreparable massive rotator cuff tears: is tuberoplasty really applicable? J Shoulder Elbow Surg. 2016;25(2): 224-231.
- 45. Pennington WT, Bartz BA, Pauli JM, Walker CE, Schmidt W. Arthroscopic superior capsular reconstruction with acellular dermal allograft for the treatment of massive irreparable rotator cuff tears: short-term clinical outcomes and the radiographic parameter of superior capsular distance. *Arthroscopy*. 2018;34(6):1764-1773.
- Pogorzelski J, Horan MP, Fritz EM, et al. Arthroscopic superior capsule reconstruction (ASCR) vs latissimus dorsi transfer (LDT): a comparison of early clinical outcomes. *Orthop J Sports Med.* 2017;5(7): 2325967117S00372.
- Robertson A, Nutton RW, Keating JF. Current trends in the use of tendon allografts in orthopaedic surgery. *J Bone Joint Surg Br*. 2006;88(8):988-992.
- Rosales-Varo AP, Zafra M, Garcia-Espona MA, Flores-Ruiz MA, Roda O. Superior capsular reconstruction of irreparable rotator cuff tear using autologous hamstring graft. *Rev Esp Cir Ortop Traumatol*. 2019;63(1):1-6.
- Sershon RA, Van Thiel GS, Lin EC, et al. Clinical outcomes of reverse total shoulder arthroplasty in patients aged younger than 60 years. *J Shoulder Elbow Surg.* 2014;23(3):395-400.
- Shah AA, McCulloch PC, Lowe WR. Failure rate of Achilles tendon allograft in primary anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction. *Arthroscopy*. 2010;26(5):667-674.

- Sher JS, Uribe JW, Posada A, Murphy BJ, Zlatkin MB. Abnormal findings on magnetic resonance images of asymptomatic shoulders. *J Bone Joint Surg Am.* 1995;77(1):10-15.
- Shino K, Inoue M, Horibe S, Nagano J, Ono K.Maturation of allograft tendons transplanted into the knee: an arthroscopic and histological study. J Bone Joint Surg Br. 1988;70(4):556-560.
- Stone MA, Namdari S, Omid R. Superior capsule reconstruction for irreparable rotator cuff tears: a novel technique using mulberry knots. *Tech Orthop.* 2018;33(3):e9-e12.
- Sun Y, Kwak JM, Kholinne E, et al. Subacromial bursal preservation can enhance rotator cuff tendon regeneration: a comparative rat supraspinatus tendon defect model study. *J Shoulder Elbow Surg*. 2021;30(2):401-407.
- Sun Y, Kwak JM, Qi C, et al. Remnant tendon preservation enhances rotator cuff healing: remnant preserving versus removal in a rabbit model. *Arthroscopy*. 2020;36(7):1834-1842.
- Urch E, Taylor SA, Ramkumar PN, et al. Biceps tenodesis: a comparison of tendon-to-bone and tendon-to-tendon healing in a rat model. *Am J Orthop (Belle Mead NJ)*. 2017;46(6):e388-e395.
- Walch G, Edwards TB, Boulahia A, et al. Arthroscopic tenotomy of the long head of the biceps in the treatment of rotator cuff tears: clinical and radiographic results of 307 cases. *J Shoulder Elbow Surg.* 2005; 14(3):238-246.
- Werner CM, Conrad SJ, Meyer DC, et al. Intermethod agreement and interobserver correlation of radiologic acromiohumeral distance measurements. J Shoulder Elbow Surg. 2008;17(2):237-240.
- 59. Yamamoto A, Takagishi K, Osawa T, et al. Prevalence and risk factors of a rotator cuff tear in the general population. *J Shoulder Elbow Surg.* 2010;19(1):116-120.
- Yoon JY, Kim PS, Jo CH. Clinical and radiological results after arthroscopic superior capsular reconstruction in patients with massive irreparable rotator cuff tears. *Clin Shoulder Elb*. 2018;21(2): 59-66.