Clinical and epidemiological features of patients with COVID-19 reinfection: a systematic review

C. J. Toro-Huamanchumo¹, M. M. Hilario-Gomez^{2,7}, L. Pinedo-Castillo^{3,7}, C. J. Zumarán-Nuñez^{3,7}, F. Espinoza-Gonzales^{3,7}, J. Caballero-Alvarado^{4,7}, A. J. Rodriguez-Morales^{5,6} and J. J. Barboza⁷

1) Universidad César Vallejo, Trujillo, Peru, 2) Sociedad científica de San Fernando, Universidad Nacional Mayor de San Marcos, Lima, Peru, 3) Asociación Científica de Estudiantes de Medicina de la Universidad Señor de Sipán, Escuela Profesional de Medicina Humana de la Universidad Señor de Sipán, Chiclayo, Peru, 4) Escuela de Medicina, Universidad Privada Antenor Orrego, Peru, 5) Grupo de Investigación Biomedicina, Faculty of Medicine, Fundación Universitaria Autónoma de las Américas, Pereira, Risaralda, Colombia, 6) Universidad Cientifica del Sur, Lima, Peru and 7) Universidad Señor de Sipán, Chiclayo, Peru

Abstract

Recurrent positivity in a patient with COVID-19 may be due to various reasons, not necessarily reinfection. There is concern about the occurrence frequency of reinfection. Five databases and a preprint/preprint repository were searched. All case reports, case series, and observational studies were included. Bias was assessed for each study with the Newcastle-Ottawa Scale tool and reported according to the preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses (PRISMA-2020). After eligibility, 77 studies were included for qualitative synthesis (52 case reports, 21 case series, and four case-controls; 1131 patients included). Of these, 16 studies described a second contact with the SARS-CoV-2 positive case, five studies described healthcare profession-related infection, ten studies described that the source of reinfection was likely to be from the community, one study described travel-related infection, nine studies described vulnerability-related infection due to comorbidity. The mean number of days from discharge or negative test to reinfection ranged from 23.3 to 57.6 days across the different included studies. The risk of bias for all case report/series studies was moderate/high. For observational studies, the risk of bias was low. Reinfection of patients with COVID-19 occurs between the first and second month after the first infection, but beyond, and 90 days have been proposed as a point to begin to consider it. The main factor for reinfection is contact with COVID-19 positive cases.

© 2022 The Author(s). Published by Elsevier Ltd.

Keywords: COVID-19, pandemic, recurrence, reinfection, SARS-CoV-2 Original Submission: 8 June 2022; Revised Submission: 29 July 2022; Accepted: 19 August 2022 Article published online: 28 August 2022

Corresponding author: Juan del Corral, 937. El Bosque, Trujillo, Peru.

E-mail: jbarbozameca@relaped.com

Introduction

Approximately 18 months ago, the world witnessed the beginning of one of the worst pandemics that contemporary humanity has experienced; it is the Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19), which began as an outbreak of atypical pneumonia at the end of December 2019 in the city of Wuhan, China [1].

After a few days, it was confirmed to be a new coronavirus, which was named severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) [2].

A few weeks after the outbreak, cases were reported outside China's borders, which is why the World Health Organization (WHO) declared this new respiratory disease a global health emergency [3]. On March 11, 2020, it officially declared a pandemic [4]. After this declaration, various strategies were implemented in the different countries of the world to stop the spread of the disease, such as closing borders, quarantining regions or entire countries, closing companies, schools, and universities; however, despite all this, cases increased, and mortality was on the rise. Several countries expected to obtain herd immunity due to the increase in cases; however, this was not achieved [5]. In the meantime, different institutions and companies around the world began a race in the development of vaccines as another measure to stop the spread of COVID-19; some were able to successfully pass phase 3 with efficacies above 50% as the cutoff point established by the CDC, and commercialization began [6]. Many countries have started vaccinations, protecting first their health professionals, following with vulnerable populations such as the elderly or people with chronic comorbidities; although in most countries, this is very slow due to accessibility issues.

Regarding the possibility of reinfection with SARS-CoV-2 and developing COVID-19 disease again, there are worrying reports of cases of reinfection, i.e., people who have tested positive again in molecular or antigenic tests for the virus up to seven months after discharge, ranging from mild to severe cases [7]. It should be noted that reinfection or relapse of COVID-19 disease is not a common entity and should be studied in greater depth [8]; these reinfected patients should be followed up for a more extended period, and the clinical, epidemiological profile should be studied, as well as genetic sequencing of the virus to determine the presence of any variant [9,10]. The objective of this systematic review was to evaluate the clinical and epidemiological characteristics in patients with COVID-19 reinfection.

Methods

This systematic review was reported according to the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA 2020, *Supplement table*) [11]. The PROS-PERO registry is CRD42021231573. The study evaluated the clinical and epidemiological features in patients with reinfection of COVID-19.

Data sources

We searched PubMed, Scopus, Web of Science, Ovid-Medline, Embase, and a preprints/preproofs repository ("https:// www.medrxiv.org"). Some studies were also identified through a manual Google search. We performed a search strategy that can be found in the Supplementary table. No restriction was applied to the language. Searches only included documents published from inception to May 19, 2022. Primary search terms were "reinfection", "reinfection drug", "COVID-19".

Eligibility criteria

We included all the case report, case series, and observational studies. Systematic reviews, narrative reviews, conference proceedings, editorials, and letters to the editor without original data were excluded. The population will be patients with mild, moderate or severe COVID-19, independently of the associated comorbidities before the first infection. The main risk factor identified among the studies is reinfection by COVID-19, or recurrence regardless of the time after the first infection.

Outcomes

The outcomes were the severity of the second infection of COVID-19 (reinfection) or recurrence and the number of days until reinfection by COVID-19.

Study selection

According to the inclusion and exclusion criteria, two authors (FE, LP) independently screened search results by title and abstract using the web program rayyan (rayyan-qcri.org). Relevant studies were selected and searched by full text for the next phase of assessment. Discrepancies were consulted with another author (JB), and a consensus was reached. The selection of articles in each stage of the review process was made using Microsoft Excel®.

Data extraction

Two authors (CJ, MH) independently extracted the data using pre-piloted Excel spreadsheets. Again, discrepancies were consulted with another author (JB). The data extracted from each study were: author, year, country, type of research, number of patients, age, gender, type of patients (pre-infection and post-infection comorbidities), risk factors (exposure), the severity of first infection o symptoms during reinfection.

Risk of bias assessment

Two authors evaluated the risk of bias independently. Cohorts and case-control were assessed with the Newcastle–Ottawa scale. We used the modified Newcastle–Ottawa scale (NOS) tool [12]. For case report/series, the studies were evaluated with methodological quality assessment tools and synthesis of case series and case reports [13]. Again, discrepancies were consulted with another author (JB).

Ethical considerations

This is a systematic review of published and available information in which no human subjects participated. Thus, no ethics committee approval was required.

Results

Selection of studies

The search yielded 1400 results. After duplicates were excluded, 869 titles and abstracts were reviewed, of which 730

© 2022 The Author(s). Published by Elsevier Ltd, NMNI, 48, 101021

were excluded, and 139 scientific papers were evaluated in detail. Finally, 77 studies were included for the qualitative synthesis [14-50, 51-91] (Fig. 1).

Characteristics of the studies included

Of the included studies in this systematic review, 52 studies were case report, 21 studies were case series, and four studies were case-control studies. The studies were grouped by risk factor or reason for infection. Of these, 16 studies that described a second contact with SARS-CoV-2 positive case reported a total of 165 reinfected patients with COVID-19 and five patients with recurrence of COVID-19. The mean of days after discharge or test-negative until reinfection was 56.1 (SD 53.5). These studies reported a symptomatic and mild to moderate severity of COVID-19 reinfection. Likewise, five studies that described infection related to the health profession reported a total of 11 reinfected patients with COVID-19 and two with recurrence of COVID-19. The mean of days after

discharge or test negative until reinfection was 57.6 (SD 58.7). These studies reported mild to moderate severity of COVID-19 reinfection.

On the other hand, ten studies described that the source of reinfection was likely from the community and reported 107 reinfected patients with COVID-19 and 103 with recurrence of COVID-19. The mean of days after discharge or test negative until reinfection was 28.7 (SD 27.1). These studies reported mild to severe cases of COVID-19 reinfection.

Likewise, one study described travel-related infection and reported only one reinfected patient with COVID-19. The mean of days after discharge or test negative until reinfection was 102 days.

Finally, nine studies described infection related to the vulnerability due to comorbidity and reported 17 reinfected patients with COVID-19 and 423 with recurrence of COVID-19. The mean of days after discharge or test negative until reinfection was 23.3 (SD 45.8). These studies reported mild to severe cases of COVID-19 reinfection.



FIG. I. Flow-chart of the study selection process.

© 2022 The Author(s). Published by Elsevier Ltd, NMNI, 48, 101021

Finally, 36 studies did not report the risk factor or reason for reinfection and reported 87 reinfected patients with COVID-19 and 598 with recurrence of COVID-19. The mean of days after discharge or test negative until reinfection was 39.8 (SD 63.4). These studies reported asymptomatic, mild to severe cases of COVID-19 reinfection.

Assessment of risk of bias

All the case-control design studies had a low risk of bias with the Newcastle Ottawa Scale assessment. Case report and case series studies were not assessed with the risk of the bias assessment tool.

Discussion

Main findings

Our study found that patients with COVID-19 reinfection were in many risk groups, as a second contact with SARS-Cov-2, related to health profession, reinfection likely from the community, travel-related infection, and vulnerability due to comorbidity.

Reinfection and recurrence of disease by COVID-19

The human body has innate and adaptive immunity. When any viral infection occurs, IgM antibodies usually appear within one to two weeks [92]. These antibodies are then mobilized against the virus and then slowly begin to disappear. A few weeks after the infection has disappeared, IgG antibodies appear. SARS-CoV-2 positive patients begin to have detectable antibodies 10 to 14 days after the onset of symptoms, although antibody levels in patients with mild disease may be low or undetectable [93].

Protective, sustainable, and long-lasting immunity following COVID-19 infection is uncertain, and the possible associated mechanisms are not yet fully understood [94]. The immune response to COVID-19 may be variable and patient-specific regarding antibody development and persistence of antibodies in serum over time [95]. To consider the net protective effect of antibodies against reinfection, the evidence is still inadequate, and further research is warranted to clarify the interplay between the roles of adaptive and innate immunity. Immunosuppressive factors, such as drugs or pathological conditions, may hinder viral clearance and be associated with SARS-CoV-2 reactivation [96].

Inadequate immune response coupled with an inflammatory process could explain the recurrence of clinical symptoms. However, in some patients, viral RNA has been detected during the second episode, which allows us to understand the theory of reinfection or rebound virus replication [97]. Recurrences of COVID-19 must be differentiated from the persistence of viral RNA remnants that can be detected in respiratory samples up to 6 weeks after symptom onset in clinically cured patients [58].

The SARS-CoV-2 reinfection was first confirmed in August 2020 in Hong Kong by genetic sequencing of two samples collected by nasal swab from the same patient with a time difference of 142 days [92]. It was evident that the viral genomes belong to different lineages, one of which was more incident between March and April 2020, while the other is close to the strains found today [17]. Several causes have now been described for SARS-CoV-2 testing in COVID-19 patients to become positive again during the recovery period, including false RT-PCR results, intermittent viral shedding, viral reactivation or reinfection with another strain of SARS-CoV-2, or exposure to a contaminated environmental surface after discharge [98]. However, there is some possibility of false-negative RT-PCR results before patients are discharged.

In the recurrence of SARS-CoV-2, the transmission capacity depends on the cause of the re-positivity test. In addition, the replication capacity of the virus decreases when the amount of viral genetic material in the epithelial cell is low. Theoretically, if the patient is reinfected or if the virus reactivates, these patients are a potential source of transmission [49]. However, results of re-positivity testing among discharged patients have only been performed by PCR on different specimens. The RT-PCR test cannot distinguish between live and dead virus. To date, no cases of infection have been reported among persons who were in contact with repositive patients.

It is currently unclear whether the reappearance of SARS-CoV-2 RNA among COVID-19 patients after discharge could be contagious. Genetic traces of the virus detected by RT-PCR do not correlate with the transmission. However, if repositive patients are indeed carriers of live virus, they could become a potential new source of infection for others. Therefore, it is necessary to monitor the patient after discharge to prevent the spread of the pandemic. Since no treatment against SARS-CoV-2 has yet been approved and no specific vaccine is available, quarantine and prevention of infection in the community are crucial to controlling its spread [99].

Risk factors to reinfection and recurrence of disease by COVID-19

Regarding the second contact with SARS-CoV-2, the risk, in general, has been estimated to be of low risk. Likewise, related to the health profession, currently under high coverage for vaccination will be of low risk. Nevertheless, in the past, and among the first case reports, healthcare workers presented reinfection (e.g. India). In the same way, reinfection likely

occurs from community transmission. Another risk factor is the travel-related infection, which currently, with regional variants circulation may pose a different risky exposure. Finally, related to the vulnerability due to comorbidities, some studies show that uncomplete vaccine schedules at those patients may pose a risk for infection but is less clear for reinfection.

Regarding to the time between reinfection, the study of Sootodeh et al. [100], referred that there are two times for epidemiological and clinical assessment of suspected reinfection cases [1]: persons with at least one detection of SARS- Cov-2 RNA test, more than 90 days after the first detection of SARS- Cov-2 RNA, whether or not symptoms were present, and [2] persons with COVID-19-like symptoms and detection of SARS-Cov-2 RNA between 45 and 89 days since first SARS-Cov-2 infection, with evidence of close-contacts with a confirmed case and without evidence of another cause of infections. This systematic review included only 25 studies and only 15 studies found reinfection.

Limitations

Still, the number of observational studies is limited. Most of the reports of reinfection consist of case series and case reports, then is still challenging to meta-analyze the prevalence of reinfection from observational studies.

Conclusions

Reinfection of patients with COVID-19 occurs between the first and second month after the first infection. The main factor for reinfection is contact with COVID-19 positive cases. However, some guidelines have provided a point of 90 days and beyond to suspect reinfection, whilst before as possible persistent infection. Further studies are required.

Funding disclosure

Financial support will not have been received for the study.

Conflicts of interest disclosure

No author has a conflict of interest.

Statement of financial support

This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

Disclosure statement

Authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

Patient consent

No patient consent was required for the conduct of this study.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data to this article can be found online at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nmni.2022.101021.

References

- [1] Cook G, John Ashcroft A, Pratt G, Popat R, Ramasamy K, Kaiser M, et al. Real-world assessment of the clinical impact of symptomatic infection with severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus (COVID-19 disease) in patients with multiple myeloma receiving systemic anti-cancer therapy. Br J Haematol 2020;190(2):e83-6. https://doi.org/10.1111/bjh.16874.
- [2] Elberry MH, Ahmed H. Occult SARS-CoV-2 infection; a possible hypothesis for viral relapse. Med Hypotheses 2020;144:109980. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mehy.2020.109980.
- [3] Biswas A, Bhattacharjee U, Chakrabarti AK, Tewari DN, Banu H, Dutta S. Emergence of Novel Coronavirus and COVID-19: whether to stay or die out? Crit Rev Microbiol 2020;46(2):182–93. https://doi. org/10.1080/1040841x.2020.1739001.
- [4] Hamed MA. An overview on COVID-19: reality and expectation. Bull Natl Res Cent 2020;44(1):86. https://doi.org/10.1186/s42269-020-00341-9.
- [5] Shamim S, Khan M, Kharaba ZJ, Ijaz M, Murtaza G. Potential strategies for combating COVID-19. Arch Virol 2020. https://doi.org/10.1007/ s00705-020-04768-3.
- [6] Willis VC, Arriaga Y, Weeraratne D, Reyes F, Jackson GP. A narrative review of emerging therapeutics for COVID-19. Mayo Clinic Proceedings: Innovations, Quality and Outcomes 2020;4(6):745–58. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mayocpiqo.2020.07.004.
- [7] Dao TL, Hoang VT, Gautret P. Recurrence of SARS-CoV-2 viral RNA in recovered COVID-19 patients: a narrative review. European journal of clinical microbiology & infectious diseases. Official Publication of the European Society of Clinical Microbiology 2020. https:// doi.org/10.1007/s10096-020-04088-z.
- [8] Alizargar J. Risk of reactivation or reinfection of novel coronavirus (COVID-19). Journal of the Formosan Medical Association 2020;119(6):1123. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfma.2020.04.013.
- [9] Alvarez-Moreno CA, Rodriguez-Morales AJ. Testing Dilemmas: post negative, positive SARS-CoV-2 RT-PCR - is it a reinfection? Travel Med Infect Dis 2020;35:101743. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmaid.2020. 101743.
- [10] Rodriguez-Morales AJ, Cardona-Ospina JA, Villamil-Gómez WE. Should we concern about reinfection in COVID-19? Infectio 2020;25(2):77–8. https://doi.org/10.22354/in.v25i2.922.
- [11] Page MJ, McKenzie JE, Bossuyt PM, Boutron I, Hoffmann TC, Mulrow CD, et al. The PRISMA 2020 statement: an updated guideline

© 2022 The Author(s). Published by Elsevier Ltd, NMNI, 48, 101021

for reporting systematic reviews. BMJ 2021;372:n71. https://doi.org/ 10.1136/bmj.n71.

- [12] Modesti PA, Reboldi G, Cappuccio FP, Agyemang C, Remuzzi G, Rapi S, et al. Panethnic differences in blood pressure in Europe: a systematic review and meta-analysis. PLoS ONE 2016;11(1): e0147601. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0147601.
- [13] Murad MH, Sultan S, Haffar S, Bazerbachi F. Methodological quality and synthesis of case series and case reports. BMJ Evidence-Based Medicine 2018;23(2):60. https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjebm-2017-110853.
- [14] AlFehaidi A, Ahmad SA, Hamed E. SARS-CoV-2 re-infection: a case report from Qatar. Journal of Infection 2020. https://doi.org/10.1016/ j.jinf.2020.10.019.
- [15] Bongiovanni M. COVID-19 re-infection in an healthcare worker. Journal of Medical Virology 2020. https://doi.org/10.1002/jmv.26565.
- [16] Bongiovanni M, Basile F. Re-infection by COVID-19: a real threat for the future management of pandemia? Infectious Diseases (London, England) 2020;52(8):581–2. https://doi.org/10.1080/23744235.2020. 1769177.
- [17] Bonifacio LP, Pereira APS, Araujo DCdAE, Balbao VdMP, Fonseca BALd, Passos ADC, et al. Are SARS-CoV-2 reinfection and Covid-19 recurrence possible? a case report from Brazil. Revista da Sociedade Brasileira de Medicina Tropical 2020;53:e20200619. https://doi.org/10.1590/0037-8682-0619-2020.
- [18] Cao H, Ruan L, Liu J, Liao W. The clinical characteristic of eight patients of COVID-19 with positive RT-PCR test after discharge. Journal of Medical Virology 2020;92(10):2159-64. https://doi.org/10. 1002/jmv.26017.
- [19] Chan PKS, Lui G, Hachim A, Ko RLW, Boon SS, Li T, et al. Serologic responses in healthy adult with SARS-CoV-2 reinfection, Hong Kong. Emerging Infectious Diseases 2020;26(12):3076-8. https://doi.org/10. 3201/eid2612.203833. August 2020.
- [20] Chen J, Xu X, Hu J, Chen Q, Xu F, Liang H, et al. Clinical course and risk factors for recurrence of positive SARS-CoV-2 RNA: a retrospective cohort study from Wuhan, China. Aging 2020;12(17): 16675-89. https://doi.org/10.18632/aging.103795.
- [21] Chen LZ, Lin ZH, Chen J, Liu SS, Shi T, Xin YN. Can elevated concentrations of ALT and AST predict the risk of 'recurrence' of COVID-19? Epidemiol Infect 2020;148:e218. https://doi.org/10.1017/ s0950268820002186.
- [22] Chen Y, Bai WZ, Liu B, Huang J, Laurent I, Chen F, et al. Re-evaluation of retested nucleic acid-positive cases in recovered COVID-19 patients: report from a designated transfer hospital in Chongqing, China. Journal of Infection and Public Health 2020;13(7):932-4. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jiph.2020.06.008.
- [23] Colson P, Finaud M, Levy N, Lagier JC, Raoult D. Evidence of SARS-CoV-2 re-infection with a different genotype. Journal of Infection 2020. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jinf.2020.11.011.
- [24] Coppola A, Annunziata A, Carannante N, Di Spirito V, Fiorentino G. Late reactivation of SARS-CoV-2: a case report. Front Med (Lausanne) 2020;7:531. https://doi.org/10.3389/fmed.2020.00531.
- [25] Dou CY, Xie X, Peng ZT, Tang HB, Jiang Z, Zhong ZF, et al. A case presentation for positive SARS-CoV-2 RNA recurrence in a patient with a history of type 2 diabetes that had recovered from severe COVID-19. Diabetes Research and Clinical Practice 2020;166. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.diabres.2020.108300.
- [26] Du HW, Chen JN, Pan XB, Chen XL, Yixian Z, Fang SF, et al. Prevalence and outcomes of re-positive nucleic acid tests in discharged COVID-19 patients. Eur J Clin Microbiol Infect Dis 2020: 1–5. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10096-020-04024-1.
- [27] Duggan NM, Ludy SM, Shannon BC, Reisner AT, Wilcox SR. Is novel coronavirus 2019 reinfection possible? Interpreting dynamic SARS-CoV-2 test results through a case report. Am J Emerg Med 2020. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ajem.2020.06.079.

- [28] Fehdi MA, Erragh A, Zerhouni A, Aissaoui O, Nsiri A, Alharrar R. Case report: a covid-19 reactivation case. Pan African Medical Journal 2020;35(2):1–2. https://doi.org/10.11604/pamj.2020.35.2.23326.
- [29] Fernandes Valente Takeda C, Moura de Almeida M, Goncalves de Aguiar Gomes R, Cisne Souza T, Alves de Lima Mota M, Pamplona de Goes Cavalcanti L, et al. Case report: recurrent clinical symptoms of COVID-19 in healthcare professionals: a series of cases from Brazil. Am J Trop Med Hyg 2020;103(5):1993–6. https://doi.org/10.4269/ ajtmh.20-0893.
- [30] Gao G, Zhu Z, Fan L, Ye S, Huang Z, Shi Q, et al. Absent immune response to SARS-CoV-2 in a 3-month recurrence of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) case. Infection 2020:1–5. https://doi.org/ 10.1007/s15010-020-01485-6.
- [31] Geling T, Huaizheng G, Ying C, Hua H. Recurrent positive nucleic acid detection in a recovered COVID-19 patient: a case report and literature review. Respir Med Case Rep 2020;31:101152. https://doi. org/10.1016/j.rmcr.2020.101152.
- [32] Goldman JD, Wang K, Roltgen K, Nielsen SCA, Roach JC, Naccache SN, et al. Reinfection with SARS-CoV-2 and failure of humoral immunity: a case report. medRxiv : The Preprint Server for Health Sciences 2020. https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.09.22.20192443.
- [33] Gousseff M, Penot P, Gallay L, Batisse D, Benech N, Bouiller K, et al. Clinical recurrences of COVID-19 symptoms after recovery: viral relapse, reinfection or inflammatory rebound? Journal of Infection 2020;81(5):816-46. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jinf.2020.06.073.
- [34] Gupta V, Bhoyar RC, Jain A, Srivastava S, Upadhayay R, Imran M, et al. Asymptomatic reinfection in two healthcare workers from India with genetically distinct SARS-CoV-2. Clinical Infectious Diseases: An Official Publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America 2020. https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/ciaa1451.
- [35] Habadi MI, Balla Abdalla TH, Hamza N, Al-Gedeei A. COVID-19 reinfection. Cureus 2020;13(1). https://doi.org/10.7759/cureus.12730.
- [36] Hanif M, Haider MA, Ali MJ, Naz S, Sundas FNU. Reinfection of COVID-19 in Pakistan: a first case report. Cureus 2020;12(10). https://doi.org/10.7759/cureus.11176.
- [37] He F, Luo Q, Lei M, Fan L, Shao X, Hu K, et al. Successful recovery of recurrence of positive SARS-CoV-2 RNA in COVID-19 patient with systemic lupus erythematosus: a case report and review. Clinical Rheumatology 2020;39(9):2803–10. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10067-020-05230-0.
- [38] He SB, Tian JX, Li XD, Zhou YN, Xiao MZ, Zhang Y, et al. Positive RT-PCR test results in 420 patients recovered from COVID-19 in Wuhan: an observational study. Frontiers in Pharmacology 2020;11. https://doi.org/10.3389/fphar.2020.549117.
- [39] Hu R, Jiang Z, Gao H, Huang D, Jiang D, Chen F, et al. Recurrent positive reverse transcriptase-polymerase chain reaction results for coronavirus disease 2019 in patients discharged from a hospital in China. JAMA Netw Open 2020;3(5):e2010475. https://doi.org/10. 1001/jamanetworkopen.2020.10475.
- [40] Huang J, Zheng L, Li Z, Hao S, Ye F, Chen J, et al. Recurrence of SARS-CoV-2 PCR positivity in COVID-19 patients: a single center experience and potential implications. medRxiv 2020. https://doi.org/ 10.1101/2020.05.06.20089573. 2020.05.06.20089573.
- [41] Jiang M, Li Y, Han M, Wang Z, Zhang Y, Du X. Recurrent PCR positivity after hospital discharge of people with coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19). J Infect 2020;81(1):147-78. https://doi.org/10. 1016/j.jinf.2020.03.024.
- [42] Lafaie L, Celarier T, Goethals L, Pozzetto B, Grange S, Ojardias E, et al. Recurrence or relapse of COVID-19 in older patients: a description of three cases. Journal of the American Geriatrics Society 2020;68(10):2179-83. https://doi.org/10.1111/jgs.16728.
- [43] Lan L, Xu D, Ye G, Xia C, Wang S, Li Y, et al. Positive RT-PCR test results in patients recovered from COVID-19. JAMA 2020;323(15): 1502-3. https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.2020.2783.

^{© 2022} The Author(s). Published by Elsevier Ltd, NMNI, 48, 101021

This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

- [44] Lechien JR, Chiesa-Estomba CM, Vaira LA, Saussez S, Hans S. COVID-19 reinfection and second episodes of olfactory and gustatory dysfunctions: report of first cases. Ear, Nose and Throat Journal 2020. https://doi.org/10.1177/0145561320970105.
- [45] Lee J-S, Kim SY, Kim TS, Hong KH, Ryoo N-H, Lee J, et al. Evidence of severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 reinfection after recovery from mild coronavirus disease 2019. Clinical Infectious Diseases: An Official Publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America 2020. https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/ciaa1421.
- [46] Liu F, Cai ZB, Huang JS, Niu HY, Yu WY, Zhang Y, et al. Repeated COVID-19 relapse during post-discharge surveillance with viral shedding lasting for 67 days in a recovered patient infected with SARS-CoV-2. J Microbiol Immunol Infect 2020. https://doi.org/10. 1016/j.jmii.2020.07.017.
- [47] Liu F, Cai ZB, Huang JS, Yu WY, Niu HY, Zhang Y, et al. Positive SARS-CoV-2 RNA recurs repeatedly in a case recovered from COVID-19: dynamic results from 108 days of follow-up. Pathog Dis 2020;78(4). https://doi.org/10.1093/femspd/ftaa031.
- [48] Loconsole D, Passerini F, Palmieri VO, Centrone F, Sallustio A, Pugliese S, et al. Recurrence of COVID-19 after recovery: a case report from Italy. Infection 2020;48(6):965-7. https://doi.org/10. 1007/s15010-020-01444-1.
- [49] Lu J, Peng J, Xiong Q, Liu Z, Lin H, Tan X, et al. Clinical, immunological and virological characterization of COVID-19 patients that test re-positive for SARS-CoV-2 by RT-PCR. EBioMedicine 2020;59: 102960. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ebiom.2020.102960.
- [50] Luo A. Positive SARS-Cov-2 test in a woman with COVID-19 at 22 days after hospital discharge: a case report. Journal of Traditional Chinese Medical Sciences 2020. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jtcms.2020. 04.001.
- [51] Marchev S, Hadzhimineva N, Simidchiev A. Clinical case: SARS-CoV-2 reactivation after a heavy Workout. Sciendo 2020;47(3):38–40. https://doi.org/10.2478/amb-2020-0033.
- [52] Mardani M, Nadji SA, Sarhangipor KA, Sharifi-Razavi A, Baziboroun M. COVID-19 infection recurrence presenting with meningoencephalitis. New Microbes New Infect 2020;37:100732. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nmni.2020.100732.
- [53] Munoz Mendoza J, Alcaide ML. COVID-19 in a patient with end-stage renal disease on chronic in-center hemodialysis after evidence of SARS-CoV-2 IgG antibodies. Reinfection or inaccuracy of antibody testing. IDCases 2020;22:e00943. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.idcr.2020. e00943.
- [54] Nachmias V, Fusman R, Mann S, Koren G. The first case of documented Covid-19 reinfection in Israel. IDCases 2020;22:e00970. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.idcr.2020.e00970.
- [55] Ozaras R, Ozdogru I, Yilmaz AA. Coronavirus disease 2019 reinfection: first report from Turkey. New Microbes New Infect 2020;38:100774. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nmni.2020.100774.
- [56] Peng D, Zhang J, Ji Y, Pan D. Risk factors for redetectable positivity in recovered COVID-19 children. Pediatr Pulmonol 2020;55(12): 3602-9. https://doi.org/10.1002/ppul.25116.
- [57] Prado-Vivar B, Becerra-Wong M, Guadalupe JJ, Márquez S, Gutierrez B, Rojas-Silva P, et al. A case of SARS-CoV-2 reinfection in Ecuador. The Lancet Infectious Diseases 2020. https://doi.org/10. 1016/S1473-3099(20)30910-5.
- [58] Selvaraj V, Herman K, Dapaah-Afriyie K. Severe, symptomatic reinfection in a patient with COVID-19. Rhode Island Medical Journal 2020;103(10):24-6. 2013.
- [59] Sharma R, Sardar S, Mohammad Arshad A, Ata F, Zara S, Munir W. A patient with asymptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infection who presented 86 Days later with COVID-19 pneumonia possibly due to reinfection with SARS-CoV-2. Am J Case Rep 2020;21:e927154. https://doi.org/ 10.12659/ajcr.927154.
- [60] Shui TJ, Li C, Liu HB, Chen X, Zhang BK. Characteristics of recovered COVID-19 patients with recurrent positive RT-PCR findings in

Wuhan, China: a retrospective study. BMC Infect Dis 2020;20(1):749. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12879-020-05463-z.

- [61] To KK-W, Hung IF-N, Ip JD, Chu AW-H, Chan W-M, Tam AR, et al. COVID-19 re-infection by a phylogenetically distinct SARScoronavirus-2 strain confirmed by whole genome sequencing. Clinical Infectious Diseases : An Official Publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America 2020. https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/ ciaa1275.
- [62] Torres DdA, Ribeiro LdCB, Riello APdFL, Horovitz DDG, Pinto LFR, Croda J. Reinfection of COVID-19 after 3 months with a distinct and more aggressive clinical presentation: case report. Journal of Medical Virology 2020. https://doi.org/10.1002/jmv.26637.
- [63] Van Elslande J, Vermeersch P, Vandervoort K, Wawina-Bokalanga T, Vanmechelen B, Wollants E, et al. Symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 reinfection by a phylogenetically distinct strain. Clinical Infectious Diseases: An Official Publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America 2020. https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/ciaa1330.
- [64] Wu J, Cheng J, Shi X, Liu J, Huang B, Zhao X, et al. Recurrence of SARS-CoV-2 nucleic acid positive test in patients with COVID-19: a report of two cases. BMC Pulmonary Medicine 2020;20(1):308. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12890-020-01348-8.
- [65] Xing Y, Mo P, Xiao Y, Zhao O, Zhang Y, Wang F. Post-discharge surveillance and positive virus detection in two medical staff recovered from coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19), China, January to February 2020. Euro Surveill 2020;25(10). https://doi.org/10.2807/ 1560-7917.ES.2020.25.10.2000191.
- [66] Yang C, Jiang M, Wang X, Tang X, Fang S, Li H, et al. Viral RNA level, serum antibody responses, and transmission risk in recovered COVID-19 patients with recurrent positive SARS-CoV-2 RNA test results: a population-based observational cohort study. Emerg Microbes Infect 2020;9(1):2368-78. https://doi.org/10.1080/22221751. 2020.1837018.
- [67] Ye GM, Pan ZY, Pan YB, Deng QL, Chen LJ, Li J, et al. Clinical characteristics of severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 reactivation. Journal of Infection 2020;80(5):E14–7. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.jinf.2020.03.001.
- [68] Yoo SY, Lee Y, Lee GH, Kim DH. Reactivation of SARS-CoV-2 after recovery. Pediatrics International 2020;62(7):879–81. https://doi.org/ 10.1111/ped.14312.
- [69] Yuan B, Liu H-Q, Yang Z-R, Chen Y-X, Liu Z-Y, Zhang K, et al. Recurrence of positive SARS-CoV-2 viral RNA in recovered COVID-19 patients during medical isolation observation. Scientific Reports 2020;10(1):11887. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-68782-w.
- [70] Yuan J, Kou S, Liang Y, Zeng J, Pan Y, Liu L. Polymerase chain reaction assays reverted to positive in 25 discharged patients with COVID-19. Clinical Infectious Diseases 2020;71(16):2230-2. https://doi.org/10. 1093/cid/ciaa398.
- [71] Zhang J-F, Yan K, Ye H-H, Lin J, Zheng J-J, Cai T. SARS-CoV-2 turned positive in a discharged patient with COVID-19 arouses concern regarding the present standards for discharge. Int J Infect Dis 2020;97: 212-4. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijid.2020.03.007.
- [72] Zhang R-Z, Deng W, He J, Song Y-Y, Qian C-F, Yu Q, et al. Case report: recurrence of positive SARS-CoV-2 results in patients recovered from COVID-19. Frontiers in Medicine 2020;7:585485. https://doi.org/10.3389/fmed.2020.585485.
- [73] Zhao WP, Wang Y, Tang YF, Zhao W, Fan Y, Liu G, et al. Characteristics of children with reactivation of SARS-CoV-2 infection after hospital discharge. Clinical Pediatrics 2020;59(9–10):929–32. https:// doi.org/10.1177/0009922820928057.
- [74] Zheng J, Zhou R, Chen F, Tang G, Wu K, Li F, et al. Incidence, clinical course and risk factor for recurrent PCR positivity in discharged COVID-19 patients in Guangzhou, China: a prospective cohort study. PLoS Neglected Tropical Diseases 2020;14(8):e0008648. https://doi. org/10.1371/journal.pntd.0008648.

© 2022 The Author(s). Published by Elsevier Ltd, NMNI, 48, 101021

- [75] Zhu H, Fu LY, Jin YH, Shao JL, Zhang S, Zheng NH, et al. Clinical features of COVID-19 convalescent patients with re-positive nucleic acid detection. Journal of Clinical Laboratory Analysis 2020;34(7). https://doi.org/10.1002/jcla.23392.
- [76] Zou Y, Wang B-R, Sun L, Xu S, Kong Y-G, Shen L-J, et al. The issue of recurrently positive patients who recovered from COVID-19 according to the current discharge criteria: investigation of patients from multiple medical institutions in Wuhan, China. The Journal of Infectious Diseases 2020;222(11):1784–8. https://doi.org/10.1093/ infdis/jiaa301.
- [77] de Brito CAA, Lima PMA, de Brito MCM, de Oliveira DB. Second episode of COVID-19 in health professionals: report of two cases. Int Med Case Rep J 2020;13:471–5. https://doi.org/10.2147/imcrj. S277882.
- [78] Adrielle Dos Santos L, Filho PGdG, Silva AMF, Santos JVG, Santos DS, Aquino MM, et al. Recurrent COVID-19 including evidence of reinfection and enhanced severity in thirty Brazilian healthcare workers. J Infect 2021;82(3):399-406. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jinf.2021.01. 020.
- [79] Alonso FOM, Sabino BD, Guimarães MAAM, Varella RB. Recurrence of SARS-CoV-2 infection with a more severe case after mild COVID-19, reversion of RT-qPCR for positive and late antibody response: case report. Journal of Medical Virology 2021;93(2):655-6. https:// doi.org/10.1002/jmv.26432.
- [80] Arteaga-Livias K, Panduro-Correa V, Pinzas-Acosta K, Perez-Abad L, Pecho-Silva S, Espinoza-Sánchez F, et al. COVID-19 reinfection? A suspected case in a Peruvian patient. Travel Medicine and Infectious Disease 2021;39:101947. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmaid.2020. 101947.
- [81] Bellesso M, Bruniera FR, Trunkel AT, Nicodemo IP. Second COVID-19 infection in a patient with multiple myeloma in Brazil - reinfection or reactivation? Hematology, Transfusion and Cell Therapy 2021;43(1):109-11. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.htct.2020.12.002.
- [82] Caralis P. Case reports of COVID 19 recurrence. Journal of Primary Care & Community Health 2021;12:2150132720982752. https://doi. org/10.1177/2150132720982752.
- [83] Harrington D, Kele B, Pereira S, Couto-Parada X, Riddell A, Forbes S, et al. Confirmed reinfection with SARS-CoV-2 variant VOC-202012/ 01. Clinical Infectious Diseases: An Official Publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America 2021. https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/ ciab014.
- [84] Liu F, Cai Z-B, Huang J-S, Niu H-Y, Yu W-Y, Zhang Y, et al. Repeated COVID-19 relapse during post-discharge surveillance with viral shedding lasting for 67 days in a recovered patient infected with SARS-CoV-2. Journal of Microbiology, Immunology, and Infection = Wei Mian Yu Gan Ran Za Zhi. 2021;54(1):101-4. https://doi.org/10. 1016/j.jmii.2020.07.017.
- [85] Novoa W, Miller H, Mattar S, Faccini-Martínez ÁA, Rivero R, Serrano-Coll H. A first probable case of SARS-CoV-2 reinfection in Colombia. Ann Clin Microbiol Antimicrob 2021;20(1):7. https://doi. org/10.1186/s12941-020-00413-8.
- [86] Sicsic I, Chacon AR, Zaw M, Ascher K, Abreu A, Chediak A. A case of SARS-CoV-2 reinfection in a patient with obstructive sleep apnea managed with telemedicine. BMJ Case Reports 2021;14(2). https:// doi.org/10.1136/bcr-2020-240496.

- [87] Tuan J, Spichler-Moffarah A, Ogbuagu O. A new positive SARS-CoV-2 test months after severe COVID-19 illness: reinfection or intermittent viral shedding? BMJ Case Reports 2021;14(2). https://doi.org/10. 1136/bcr-2020-240531.
- [88] Wang P. Recurrent presence of SARS-CoV-2 RNA in a 33-year-old man. Journal of Medical Virology 2021;93(2):592-4. https://doi.org/ 10.1002/jmv.26334.
- [89] West J, Everden S, Nikitas N. A case of COVID-19 reinfection in the UK. Clinical Medicine (London, England) 2021;21(1):e52–3. https:// doi.org/10.7861/clinmed.2020-0912.
- [90] Yeleti R, Guglin M, Saleem K, Adigopula SV, Sinha A, Upadhyay S, et al. Fulminant myocarditis: COVID or not COVID? Reinfection or co-infection? Future Cardiology 2021. https://doi.org/10.2217/fca-2020-0237.
- [91] Zucman N, Uhel F, Descamps D, Roux D, Ricard J-D. Severe reinfection with South African SARS-CoV-2 variant 501Y.V2: a case report. Clinical Infectious Diseases: An Official Publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America 2021. https://doi.org/10.1093/ cid/ciab129.
- [92] To KKW, Hung IFN, Ip JD, Chu AWH, Chan WM, Tam AR, et al. COVID-19 re-infection by a phylogenetically distinct SARScoronavirus-2 strain confirmed by whole genome sequencing. Clinical Infectious Diseases : An Official Publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America 2020. https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/ ciaa1275.
- [93] Garcia-Beltran WF, Lam EC, Astudillo MG, Yang D, Miller TE, Feldman J, et al. COVID-19 neutralizing antibodies predict disease severity and survival. medRxiv : The Preprint Server for Health Sciences 2020. https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.10.15.20213512.
- [94] Hoang VT, Dao TL, Gautret P. Recurrence of positive SARS-CoV-2 in patients recovered from COVID-19. J Med Virol 2020;92(11): 2366-7. https://doi.org/10.1002/jmv.26056.
- [95] Elrashdy F, Aljaddawi AA, Redwan EM, Uversky VN. On the potential role of exosomes in the COVID-19 reinfection/reactivation opportunity. Journal of Biomolecular Structure and Dynamics 2020:1–12. https://doi.org/10.1080/07391102.2020.1790426.
- [96] Ota M. Will we see protection or reinfection in COVID-19? Nature Reviews Immunology 2020;20(6):351. https://doi.org/10.1038/ s41577-020-0316-3.
- [97] Falahi S, Kenarkoohi A. COVID-19 reinfection: prolonged shedding or true reinfection? New Microbes and New Infections 2020;38: 100812. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nmni.2020.100812.
- [98] To KK-W, Hung IF-N, Chan K-H, Yuan S, To W-K, Tsang DN-C, et al. Serum antibody profile of a patient with COVID-19 reinfection. Clinical Infectious Diseases : An Official Publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America 2020. https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/ciaa1368.
- [99] Dao TL, Hoang VT, Gautret P. Recurrence of SARS-CoV-2 viral RNA in recovered COVID-19 patients: a narrative review. Eur J Clin Microbiol Infect Dis 2020. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10096-020-04088-z.
- [100] Sotoodeh Ghorbani S, Taherpour N, Bayat S, Ghajari H, Mohseni P, Hashemi Nazari SS. Epidemiologic characteristics of cases with reinfection, recurrence, and hospital readmission due to COVID-19: a systematic review and meta-analysis. J Med Virol 2022;94(1):44–53. https://doi.org/10.1002/jmv.27281.