

# Quality of Antenatal Care in Public Health Facilities of Dessie Town, Northeastern Ethiopia, 2022

Journal of Patient Experience  
Volume 10: 1-9  
© The Author(s) 2023  
Article reuse guidelines:  
sagepub.com/journals-permissions  
DOI: 10.1177/23743735231213763  
journals.sagepub.com/home/jpx



Muluken Amare Wudu, MSc<sup>1</sup>  and Yemane Eshetu Bekalu, MPH<sup>2</sup>

## Abstract

Antenatal care (ANC) is a critical intervention, and providing high-quality care results in positive maternal and neonatal outcomes. A facility-based cross-sectional study design was used among 4 public health facilities in Dessie Town, and 421 pregnant mothers were selected by a systematic random sampling technique. Data were collected using observation and interview through a pretested questionnaire, then entered and analyzed using EpiData 4.7 and SPSS 26. Finally, predictors of the quality of the ANC service were identified using multivariate logistic regression. Overall, 270 women (64%) were satisfied with ANC services in this study. Only 49 (70%) attributes of structural quality and 32 items (69.56%) of process quality attributes were met, which is inadequate and needs improvement. Mothers aged 20 to 24 (AOR = 3.067; 95% CI = 1.416, 6.641); mothers who took 30 min and more to get to the health facility (AOR = 2.745; 95% CI = 1.475, 5.111); mothers who had a choice of care providers (AOR = 2.829; 95% CI = 1.676, 4.777); merchants (AOR = 2.310; 95% CI = 1.077, 4.955); and farmers (AOR = 2.111; 95% CI = 1.138, 3.8) were positive predictors of women's satisfaction with ANC services. Although ANC client satisfaction was good, structure-quality attributes and process-related quality were inadequate and needed significant improvement. This implies that urgent interventions are needed to improve process and input quality attributes.

## Keywords

Quality of antenatal care, public health facilities, Northeastern Ethiopia

## Introduction

Globally, maternal and perinatal morbidity and mortality continue to be unacceptably high, particularly in developing countries.<sup>1</sup> In 2019, ~ 303 000 women died due to pregnancy-related causes (15% of all global deaths),<sup>2</sup> 1.9 million babies were stillborn, and 2.3 million neonates died in 2021.<sup>3</sup>

Antenatal care (ANC) can be defined as the holistic care provided to pregnant women and adolescent girls by skilled care providers in order to achieve the best health conditions for both the mother and fetus throughout pregnancy.<sup>4</sup> ANC reduces maternal and perinatal morbidity and mortality both directly, by screening and treating pregnancy-related health problems, and indirectly, by identifying women and girls who are at a higher risk of complications during labor and childbirth and ensuring referral to an appropriate care level.<sup>4</sup>

According to the UNICEF 2022 report, 88.3% (urban: 92.3%; rural: 81.99%) and 66.29% (urban: 77.54%; rural: 56.02%) of pregnant women in the world had received

ANC at least once and 4 or more times, respectively. Furthermore, in the Sub-Saharan region, 81.9% of pregnant women had received ANC at least once, and 53.58% had received it 4 times or more.<sup>5</sup> According to the 2019 Ethiopian Demographic Health Survey (EDHS), 74% of Ethiopian pregnant women received ANC at least once, and 43% received it 4 or more times.<sup>6</sup> Despite this, up to half a million pregnant women in Ethiopia may suffer from short-term and long-term illnesses or injuries as a result of pregnancy-related issues each year, and this implies that

<sup>1</sup> Department of Pediatrics and Child Health Nursing, College of Medicine and Health Sciences, Wollo University, Dessie, Amhara region, south Wollo zone, Ethiopia

<sup>2</sup> Department of Public Health Human Nutrition, Alkan College of Health Sciences, Dessie, Ethiopia

## Corresponding Author:

Muluken Amare Wudu, Department of Pediatrics and Child Health Nursing, College of Medicine and Health Sciences, Wollo University, P.O. Box: 1145, Dessie, Amhara region, south Wollo zone, Ethiopia.  
Email: 385mule@gmail.com



both the coverage of service and the quality of ANC need more effort to reach the desired goal.<sup>7</sup>

Quality is a key aspect of achieving any nation's sustainable development goal. The extent to which a service meets the plan to deliver that service while offering services at a fair price and meeting the client's expectations is referred to as "quality." To help deter pregnancy-related issues, the content and quality of ANC must be revised.<sup>8-12</sup>

ANC quality is measured along three dimensions based on the Donabedian model: input, process, and outcome.<sup>13</sup> Physical infrastructure, documentation, skilled staff, medical drugs, vaccinations, equipment, and supplies are all examples of input dimensions. In addition, interpersonal communication, history-taking, clinical examination, counseling, health screening, and preventive measures are all process attributes. Ultimately, the outcome will be measured by client satisfaction.<sup>14-16</sup>

Previous studies found that factors such as client socio-demographics, socioeconomic, and care providers' technical skills; insufficient financial provisions; integration with other health services; and the availability of consumable items, drugs, and basic equipment were associated with the quality of ANC services.<sup>17-22</sup>

In Ethiopia, the actual experience is that pregnant women attend at least 4 ANC visits. However, the WHO recently issued holistic guidelines on routine ANC for pregnant women, including a minimum of 8 ANC visits. Besides, it puts an emphasis on quality over quantity and what is known as a "positive pregnancy experience," which is a fresh approach and is designed to enhance both neonatal and maternal outcomes.<sup>23</sup> The new holistic ANC guideline has not been implemented in most developing countries, including Ethiopia, due to inadequate access and availability of services, miscommunications, a shortage of resources and drugs, and an insufficiency of trained professionals.<sup>24-26</sup>

Although some studies on the quality of ANC have been done in different parts of Ethiopia, ANC quality studies have mainly focused on the frequency of visits or constituents of focused ANC and used different quality measurement models and tools. In particular, facility inventory and process attributes of ANC quality instruments were not used effectively. Furthermore, it has not been documented yet in the study area. Therefore, the aim of this study was to assess the quality of ANC in public health centers in Dessie, northeastern Ethiopia, and determine the predictors. As a result, it would close an existing information gap and serve as the basis for action to enhance ANC quality.

## Methods

### *Study Design, Area, and Period*

The facility-based cross-sectional study was employed from February 2022 to June 2022 in Dessie town, which is

located 400 km, from Addis Ababa and ~ 500 km from the Amhara region's capital, Bahirdar. It has a total of 6 public health facilities and one comprehensive and specialized hospital and is estimated to provide service for about half a million residents. Moreover, there are also 4 private hospitals, more than 10 higher-level clinics, and a number of medical suppliers and drug stores. The main economic activity is trade.

### *Study Population*

All pregnant women who attended ANC services at public health facilities in Dessie Town are a source of population. However, the actual data was taken from pregnant women who attended ANC services at public health facilities in Dessie Town during the data collection period.

### *Eligibility Criteria*

Pregnant women who attended ANC services during the data collection period and were willing to participate were included in the study.

### *Sampling Size*

A single population proportion formula was used to calculate the sample size. The following assumptions were taken into account: The proportion of mothers in Bahirdar Zuria who were satisfied with the service they received was 52.3%,<sup>27</sup> with a 95% level of confidence and a 5% margin of error. By including a 10% nonresponse rate, the total sample size increased to 421.

### *Sampling Technique*

Among the 6 public health facilities in Dessie Town, 4 of them were selected in a simple random method through the lottery technique, namely: Dessie Health Center, Tita Health Center, Banbuha Health Center, and Segno Health Center. Population allocation to size was performed to obtain study subjects by considering the last 6 months of client flow at each facility. Based on this, the total average number of ANC visits per month was 2000 (600 in Dessie Health Center, 520 in Banbuha Health Center, 390 in Tita Health Center, and 490 in Segno Health Center). Then, in the selected health centers, a commensurate allotment based on size was made. As a result, 126 mothers were involved at Dessie Health Center, 110 at Banbuha Health Center, 82 at Tita Health Center, and 103 at Segno Health Center. Ultimately, a systematic random sampling technique was used to obtain the pregnant mothers for every fifth interval until the required sample size at each public health facility was obtained. The ANC registered list was considered as a sample frame.

## Operational Definition

Input (structural) quality: It includes 70 items to assess infrastructure, statistical data, record-keeping, staff, medical drugs, vaccinations, equipment, and supplies. Each item received a 1 if the answer was yes and a 0 if the answer was no. Each health facility's overall score ranged from 0 to 70. As a result, the following structure qualities of the center were scored: Health facilities with fewer than 35 infrastructure items were deemed to have poor structure quality. Moreover, those health facilities are meeting between 36 and 53 items of infrastructure that were considered to be of inadequate structural quality. Furthermore, those health facilities that meet the above-mentioned 53 items of infrastructure were considered to have good structure quality.<sup>28</sup>

Process quality: From 46 items, a scoring system was developed to calculate 5 dimensions of process attributes: (1) interpersonal communication, (2) history taking, (3) clinical examination, (4) counseling, and (5) health screening and preventive measures. This scoring system determines whether or not an accepted process quality standard has been met.

All activities were taken into account and given a score of "1" if they were observed and performed in accordance with accepted care standards, and a score of "0" if they were not. To determine a score for each dimension of care, the scores of the key items for each individual client-provider interaction observed were added up and averaged. Furthermore, the overall summary score was created by aggregating the mean scores of all care dimensions and was assigned as the process index. The total scores ranged from 0 to 46. As a result, the quality care process was scored as follows: low quality < 23; moderate quality 23 to 37; and high quality  $\geq$  37.<sup>29</sup>

Outcome component of quality: Satisfaction is defined as pregnant women's self-reported level of satisfaction expressed as satisfied or dissatisfied based on exit interviews of the ANC service received from health professionals.<sup>28</sup> The satisfaction tool includes 3 sections: client personal information, perception of pregnant mothers with technical and service management of facilities, and general satisfaction of pregnant women (which comprises 12 items). Accordingly, clients who scored higher than the median were considered to be satisfied with ANC service, and clients who scored lower than the median were classified as dissatisfied with ANC service.<sup>28</sup>

## Data Collection Instruments and Techniques

For each measure of quality, the authors used different data collection tools. The client satisfaction tool and the facility inventory tool were adapted from WHO: An Assessment Tool for the Quality of Outpatient ANC and PNC for women and newborns.<sup>28</sup> Furthermore, the ANC observational checklist tool was modified to assess the following process qualities: maternal and child health integrated

program and maternal and Newborn Quality of Care Survey.<sup>29</sup> The information was gathered through observation and in-person interviews with semistructured questionnaires. The adapted tool was then modified and contextualized to fit the objectives of the study and translated into the local Amharic language, particularly the exit interview.

## Data Quality Management and Analysis

The tool has been translated into the local Amharic language. For 2 days, 8 data collectors (with a BSC in midwifery and ANC training) and 2 supervisors (with an MSC in public health) were trained, and a pretest of 5% of the sample size was conducted at Haik Health Center ( $\alpha=0.831$ ). The data was cleaned, encoded, and entered into Epi-Data software Version 4.7 before being exported to SPSS Version 26 for analysis. The proportion of each of the 3 quality attributes was calculated and assessed using descriptive statistics. A bivariable logistic regression analysis was performed to select variables for multivariable analysis. Besides, those variables that had a  $P$ -value < .2 during the bivariate analysis are transferred and analyzed in multivariable logistic regression. Then, after doing a multivariable analysis, a variable was deemed statistically significant if its  $P$ -value was < .05. The adjusted odds ratio with its 95% confidence interval was used to demonstrate the strength of association between each explanatory variable and the outcome variable. The variance inflation factor was used to test for multicollinearity. In factor analysis, all outcomes were compared to a reference point using Nagelkerke chi-squares and the Hosmer and Lemeshow test for model fit.

## Results

### Sociodemographic Characteristics of the Respondents

This study included 421 pregnant mothers, 421 of whom finished the interview successfully, resulting in a response rate of 100%. The mother's mean age was 29.56 years ( $SD \pm 6.012$  years), and the preponderance of these women, 109 (24.9%), were between the ages of 25 and 29. Moreover, about 241 (57.2%) of respondents had 4 to 6 family sizes. Of the total respondents, 347 (82.4%) were married, 349 (82.9%) had 1 to 3 children, 201 (47.7%) were housewives by occupation, and 143 (34%) had primary education status (Table 1).

### Healthcare Availability and Utilization-Related Characteristics

The majority of respondents (296, 70.3%) drove 5 km to the health facility, and it took 312 (74.1%) mothers 30 min or more to get there; 252 (59.9%) had no one accompany them on their ANC visit; 152 (36.1%) were returning to the ANC for the second time; and their current gestational age was 16 to 24 weeks (35.2%). Further, the majority of

**Table 1.** Sociodemographic Characteristics of Antenatal Care (ANC) Attendant Women at Public Health Facilities in Dessie Town, Northeast Ethiopia, 2022.

| Variables                  | Frequency | Percent (%) |
|----------------------------|-----------|-------------|
| <b>Age of mothers</b>      |           |             |
| 15 to 19                   | 11        | 2.6         |
| 20 to 24 years             | 87        | 20.7        |
| 25 to 29 years             | 109       | 25.9        |
| 30 to 34 years             | 107       | 25.4        |
| 35 to 49 years             | 107       | 25.4        |
| <b>Marital status</b>      |           |             |
| Single                     | 45        | 10.7        |
| Married                    | 347       | 82.4        |
| Divorced                   | 20        | 4.8         |
| Widowed                    | 9         | 2.1         |
| <b>Educational status</b>  |           |             |
| Unable to read and write   | 78        | 18.5        |
| Able to read and write     | 36        | 8.6         |
| Primary education          | 143       | 34.0        |
| Secondary education        | 96        | 22.8        |
| Tertiary education         | 68        | 16.2        |
| <b>Occupational status</b> |           |             |
| Housewife                  | 201       | 47.7        |
| Farmer                     | 91        | 21.6        |
| Merchant                   | 62        | 14.7        |
| Civil servant              | 67        | 15.9        |
| Housewife                  | 201       | 47.7        |
| <b>Income</b>              |           |             |
| < 500 birr/month           | 164       | 39.0        |
| 500 to 1000 birr/month     | 81        | 19.2        |
| 1001 to 1500 birr/month    | 51        | 12.1        |
| > 1500 birr/month          | 125       | 29.7        |
| <b>Family size</b>         |           |             |
| 3 and less                 | 159       | 37.8        |
| 4 to 6                     | 241       | 57.2        |
| 7 and above                | 21        | 5.0         |
| <b>Number of children</b>  |           |             |
| 1 to 3                     | 349       | 82.9        |
| 4 and above                | 72        | 17.1        |

respondents (299, 71%) began their ANC visit more than 12 weeks ago; 238 (56.5%) had the opportunity to choose their care providers (Table 2).

### Structural Quality Attributes

Overall, the facility inventory survey mean summary scores indicated inadequate structural quality (49 items, or 70%). Regrettably, all health facilities require immediate interventions to ensure the availability of infrastructure such as adequate waiting rooms, examination rooms, hand washing facilities, and adequate and clean toilets. This infrastructure was particularly deficient (59%). Besides, essential ANC drugs such as magnesium sulfate, injectable antibiotics, and antihypertensive drugs were inadequately available during the time of the survey, and in particular, folic acid supplementation was totally unavailable in all health facilities and needed immediate intervention (Table 3).

**Table 2.** Obstetrics and Health Service-Related Characteristics of Pregnant Women who Attended Antenatal Care (ANC) Visit at Public Health Facilities in Dessie Town, Northeast Ethiopia, 2022.

| Variables  | Frequency | Percent (%) |
|--|-----------|-------------|
| <b>Distance to a health facility</b>                     |           |             |
| < 5 km   | 296       | 70.3        |
| ≥ 5 km   | 125       | 29.7        |
| <b>Time takes to get to the facility</b>                 |           |             |
| < 30 min   | 109       | 25.9        |
| ≥ 30 min   | 312       | 74.1        |
| <b>Someone who accompanied you on your ANC visit</b>     |           |             |
| Yes  | 169       | 40.1        |
| No   | 252       | 59.9        |
| <b>ANC visit</b>   |           |             |
| First  | 114       | 27.1        |
| Second   | 152       | 36.1        |
| Third  | 120       | 28.5        |
| 4 and more   | 35        | 8.3         |
| <b>Gestational age</b>                                   |           |             |
| < 16 weeks   | 94        | 22.3        |
| 16 to 24 weeks   | 148       | 35.2        |
| 25 to 32 weeks   | 117       | 27.8        |
| 33 to 37 weeks   | 62        | 14.7        |
| <b>Timely initiation of ANC</b>                          |           |             |
| Yes (< 12 weeks)   | 122       | 29.0        |
| No (> 12 weeks)  | 299       | 71.0        |
| <b>Had an opportunity to selection of care providers</b> |           |             |
| Yes  | 183       | 43.5        |
| No   | 238       | 56.5        |
| <b>Had gone to a private clinic</b>                      |           |             |
| Yes  | 140       | 33.3        |
| No   | 281       | 66.7        |

### Process Attributes Quality

Interpersonal communication performance was almost compromised (only 3 activities were met out of 6) and needs immediate intervention in all health facilities, like greeting and compassionate and respectful care. However, verification criteria in history-taking and clinical examination skills were relatively classified as good quality. Accordingly, the obstetrics and medical histories of the majority of study subjects (90.7%) were obtained, including parity, gravidity, last menstrual period, and health problems encountered during previous pregnancies. Besides, 380 (90.3%) of clients' blood pressure, weight, and heights of the uterus were examined at least once during the ANC, and vaginal examinations were done among 361 (85.7%) study subjects at least once. Further, care providers partially met the verification criteria for both providing counseling and health screening through laboratory examinations, and preventive measures were deemed inadequate and in need of immediate improvement. As a result, only 117 (27.8%) study subjects had hepatitis B and VDRL tests, and 280 (66.5%) had blood and urine protein tests. Furthermore, only 266 (63.2%) of the study

**Table 3.** Results of Structural and Process Quality Components of Antenatal Care (ANC) in Selected Public Health Facilities of Dessie Town, Northeast Ethiopia, 2022.

| ANC quality elements                              | Subactivities                                   | Number of expected items | Mean observed items quality score |     |
|---|---|--------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----|
| Structural element<br>(health facility inventory) | Minimum: 0.00-Max: 70                           |                          |                                   |     |
|   | Record keeping and statistical data             | 6                        | 4                                 |     |
|   | Availability of infrastructure                  | 12                       | 7                                 |     |
|   | Availability of essential equipment             | 17                       | 13                                |     |
|   | Availability of staff, guidelines, and job aids | 7                        | 5                                 |     |
|   | Availability of drugs and vaccines              | 15                       | 10                                |     |
|   | Availability of diagnostic tests/lab supplies   | 13                       | 10                                |     |
|   | Total structural score                          | 70                       | 49                                |     |
|   | Process attributes (observational studies)      | Minimum: 0.00-Max: 46    |                                   |     |
|   |   | Number of observations   |                                   | 421 |
| Interpersonal communication performance           |   | 6                        | 3                                 |     |
| History taking                                    |   | 12                       | 10                                |     |
| Clinical examination                              |   | 9                        | 8                                 |     |
| Counseling  |   | 10                       | 6                                 |     |
| Laboratory examinations and preventive measures   |   | 9                        | 5                                 |     |
| Total process score                               |   | 46                       | 32                                |     |

participants received free vitamins and medicine, and none received any folic acid at all. Overall, the process-related quality summary score was 32 items (69.56%), all of which were classified as inadequate and in need of improvement (Table 3).

### Women's Satisfaction With the ANC Service

The highest score on the satisfaction component was ANC cost fairness (98.3%), followed by 98.1% of the women being enthusiastic about inviting relatives or friends to utilize the ANC services in the health facilities. On the other hand, the most common dissatisfaction components, 87 (20.7%), were less clean latrines and inadequate water supplies, followed by 52 (12.4%) waiting times that were unfair. Overall, 270 women (64.1%) were satisfied with ANC service, while 151 women (35.9%) were dissatisfied with the service.

### Factors Associated With ANC Service Satisfaction

The following variables were found to be predictors of women's ANC service satisfaction after performing a multivariate logistic regression analysis: mothers who found between 20 and 24 years old; time taking 30 min or more to get to the facility; mothers who had an opportunity to a selection of care providers; merchants and farmers by occupation; and had received advice about the birth plan and did not go to a private clinic for ANC service.

In the current study, the odds of satisfaction among mothers who were between 20 and 24 years old were

almost 3 times higher (AOR=3.067; 95% CI=1.416, 6.641) compared to mothers in the age group between 35 and 49 years old. Similarly, those mothers who did not go to a private clinic for ANC service were 3 times more likely (AOR=3.33; 95% CI=1.876, 5.923) to be satisfied than their counterparts. Merchants and farmers mothers by occupation had roughly 2 times (AOR=2.310; 95% CI=1.077, 4.955) and 2 times (AOR=2.111; 95% CI=1.138, 3.915) higher odds of ANC service satisfaction than housewife mothers. Besides, those mothers who had received advice about the birth plan were 7 times more likely (AOR=7.122; 95% CI=2.024, 25.054) to be satisfied with ANC service than their counterparts. Furthermore, those mothers who had the opportunity to select their care providers during ANC visits were nearly 3 times more likely (AOR=2.829; 95% CI=1.676, 4.777) to be satisfied than their counterparts. Finally, the odds of a mother taking 30 min or more to get to the facility were nearly 3 times (AOR=2.745; 95% CI=1.475, 5.111) more likely to have ANC service satisfaction than their counterparts (Table 4).

### Discussion

ANC is a chance to encourage the use of qualified birth attendants and positive lifestyles such as breastfeeding, early post-natal care, and birth planning. Several of these chances remain to be missed, despite the fact that more than two-thirds of pregnant women receive at least one ANC visit. Therefore, a quality ANC service should be provided, and the structural, process, and outcome attributes of the quality of the ANC need to be improved simultaneously. As a

**Table 4.** Factors Associated With Antenatal Care (ANC) Service Satisfaction Among Pregnant Women Attended at Public Health Facilities in Dessie Town, Northeast Ethiopia, 2022.

| Variables  | ANC satisfaction  |                      | COR (CI; 95%)                      | AOR (CI; 95%)                      | P value |
|--|-------------------|----------------------|------------------------------------|------------------------------------|---------|
|  | Satisfied (n) (%) | Dissatisfied (n) (%) |                                    |                                    |         |
| Age of mothers                                   |                   |                      |                                    |                                    |         |
| 15 to 19 years                                   | 6 (2.2%)          | 5 (3.3%)             | 0.816 (0.467, 1.428)               | 1.128 (0.575, 2.216)               | .67     |
| 20 to 24 years                                   | 66 (24.4%)        | 21 (13.9%)           | 1.267 (0.736, 2.180)               | 3.067 (1.416, 6.641) <sup>b</sup>  | .015    |
| 25 to 29 years                                   | 61 (22.6%)        | 48 (31.8%)           | 0.512 (0.274, .959) <sup>a</sup>   | 1.427 (0.556, 3.664)               | .88     |
| 30 to 34 years                                   | 71 (26.3%)        | 36 (23.8%)           | 1.341 (0.385, 4.678)               | 4.53 (0.796, 25.915)               | 1.45    |
| 35 to 49 years                                   | 66 (24.4%)        | 41 (27.2%)           |                                    |                                    |         |
| Occupational status                              |                   |                      |                                    |                                    |         |
| Housewife  | 130 (48.1%)       | 71 (47.0%)           |                                    |                                    |         |
| Farmer   | 52 (19.3%)        | 39 (25.8%)           | 1.373 (0.828, 2.278)               | 2.111 (1.138, 3.915) <sup>b</sup>  | .023    |
| Merchant   | 31 (11.5%)        | 31 (20.5%)           | 1.831 (1.030, 3.256) <sup>a</sup>  | 2.310 (1.077, 4.955) <sup>b</sup>  | .012    |
| Civil servant                                    | 57 (21.1%)        | 10 (6.6%)            | 0.321 (0.155, 0.668)               | 0.582 (0.141, 2.403)               | 1.24    |
| Time taken to the health facility                |                   |                      |                                    |                                    |         |
| < 30 min   | 83 (30.7%)        | 26 (17.2%)           |                                    |                                    |         |
| ≥ 30 min   | 187 (69.3%)       | 125 (82.8%)          | 2.134 (1.571, 3.502) <sup>a</sup>  | 2.745 (1.475, 5.111) <sup>b</sup>  | .000    |
| Had an opportunity to selection of care provider |                   |                      |                                    |                                    |         |
| Yes  | 97 (35.9%)        | 86 (57.0%)           | 2.360 (1.571, 3.545) <sup>a</sup>  | 2.829 (1.676, 4.777) <sup>b</sup>  | .001    |
| No   | 173 (64.1%)       | 65 (43.0%)           |                                    |                                    |         |
| Discussed about birth plan                       |                   |                      |                                    |                                    |         |
| Yes  | 244 (90.4%)       | 147 (97.4%)          | 3.916 (1.340, 11.444) <sup>a</sup> | 7.122 (2.024, 25.054) <sup>b</sup> | .035    |
| No   | 26 (9.6%)         | 4 (2.6%)             |                                    |                                    |         |
| Went to a private clinic for ANC                 |                   |                      |                                    |                                    |         |
| Yes  | 106 (39.3%)       | 34 (22.5%)           |                                    |                                    |         |
| No   | 164 (60.7%)       | 117 (77.5%)          | 2.224 (1.414, 3.500) <sup>a</sup>  | 3.33 (1.876, 5.923) <sup>b</sup>   | .000    |

<sup>a</sup>Stands for bivariate analysis.

<sup>b</sup>Stands for multivariate analysis statistical significance.

result, pregnancy-related mortality and neonatal mortality will decrease significantly.

In this study, the structural quality of the ANC clinic was regrettably inadequate. This is in line with studies in the Bele Gasgar District in southeastern Ethiopia,<sup>20</sup> Kellem Wollega, West Ethiopia,<sup>22</sup> and Hossaina Town, Southern Ethiopia.<sup>26</sup> The similarity could be attributed to a lack of decent infrastructure, a shortage of qualified personnel, an immature healthcare finance system, and an integrated pharmaceutical and supply-chain system.

Furthermore, in the current study, the quality of the process attributes of the ANC was insufficient and needed to be improved. This is similar to findings in Nigeria,<sup>18</sup> Kellem Wollega, West Ethiopia,<sup>22</sup> Hossaina Town, Southern Ethiopia,<sup>26</sup> and Wolaita, Southern Ethiopia.<sup>30</sup> This might be explained by a lack of skilled professionals in quantity as well as quality, a high client burden that shortens the interaction time between care providers and clients and makes it likely to have missed an opportunity, a lack of screening equipment such as laboratory machines and reagents, and a lack of essential drug and supplement supplies.

The overall level of pregnant women's satisfaction with the ANC service at selected public health centers of the Dessie city administration was 64%. This finding was comparable with studies on Jimma Zone (60.4%),<sup>31</sup> Debre Tabor Town (59.7%),<sup>19</sup> and Bele Gasgar (55%).<sup>20</sup>

However, the rate was lower than those found in other studies conducted in West Ethiopia (79.7%),<sup>22</sup> Gamo-Gofa, Ethiopia (79%),<sup>32</sup> Nigeria (90%),<sup>18</sup> and Sweden (82%).<sup>17</sup> Several studies conducted in Ethiopia found lower rates of client satisfaction than those found in this study: 21.5% in the Gamo Gofa zone, 33% in the Bursa district, and 30.4% in Mizan-Aman.<sup>33–35</sup> The variations could be attributed to differences in the pregnant women's subjective nature, the satisfaction indexes used, and the absence of uniform tools for precise classification. Furthermore, the degree of satisfaction may be influenced by the mindset of the clients' expectations prior to the service and the service they received.

In the current study, the odds of ANC service satisfaction among mothers who found themselves between 20 and 24 years old were almost 3 times higher compared to mothers in the age group between 35 and 49 years old. This is in line with a study in Debre Tabor Town, where mothers aged 18 to 24 years old were satisfied with ANC service.<sup>19</sup>

In this study, merchants' and farmers' mothers by occupation had 2 times higher odds of ANC service satisfaction than housewife mothers. However, this finding is contradicted by a study done in west Guji, southeastern Ethiopia, where housewives in occupation were more satisfied.<sup>36</sup> The difference might be due to population characteristics and the study area's setting.

According to the findings of this study, those mothers who had received advice about the birth plan were 7 times more likely to be satisfied with ANC service than their counterparts. This is comparable to the Gamo Gofa, southern Ethiopia, study.<sup>33</sup> This implies that providing adequate birth plan counseling during ANC visits makes clients satisfied with the service and improves the habit of institutional delivery, which in turn leads to meeting the target of a good neonatal outcome as well.

In the current study, mothers who took 30 min or more to get to the facility were nearly 3 times more likely to be satisfied with ANC services than their counterparts. This finding is contradicted by studies in Gamo Gofa and Bele Gasgar District.<sup>33,20</sup> The possible explanation might be that the distance to a health center or the time required to reach the facility may not be of concern to the client, but rather the compassionate care and general service provided by the care providers. As a result, clients who have traveled a long distance may wish to visit the ANC service in order to have their expectations met. Thus, this implies that health service accessibility is not a guarantee of quality of service.

### Limitations

The authors raised the burning issue of the quality of ANC and used the switchboard and the vast survey tool. The local stakeholders can understand which component of the quality of the ANC needs immediate improvement. However, due to the nature of the cross-sectional study design, the authors were unable to establish a causal relationship. Besides, the numerical measurement and data presentation might not sufficiently express the patient experience of the quality of ANC. Therefore, qualitative and follow-up studies will address the current study's limitations.

### Conclusion

In this study, although the women's satisfaction with ANC service was reasonably good, the process-related quality and structural quality were inadequate and needed urgent improvement. Furthermore, being young mothers (20 and 24 years old), time taking 30 min or more to get to the facility, having the opportunity to choose care providers, being merchants or farmers by occupation, having received birth plan advice, and not going to a private clinic for ANC services were associated with women's satisfaction with ANC services. A participatory intervention-based plan for ANC service satisfaction shall be developed, with a focus on dissatisfied groups such as older and housewife mothers. The public health facilities shall be kept as the centers of selection for their clients in ANC service by giving them the opportunity to choose their care providers during an ANC visit. Besides, enhancing process-related quality is possible, such as by providing counseling and preventive measures in compliance with guidelines.

### Abbreviations

|        |  |
|--------|--|
| AOR    | adjusted odds ratio                    |
| ANC    | antenatal care                         |
| BSc    | Bachelor of science                    |
| CI     | confidence interval                    |
| COR    | crude odds ratio                       |
| EDHS   | Ethiopian Demographic Health Survey    |
| PNC    | postnatal care                         |
| SD     | standard deviation                     |
| SPSS   | Statistical Package for Social Science |
| UNICEF | United Nations Children's Fund         |
| VDRL   | Venereal Disease Research Laboratory   |
| WHO    | World Health Organization              |

### Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank Wollo University, the Department of Pediatrics, and the Child Health Nursing for providing the necessary conditions. Following that, we'd like to thank Dessie City's 4 public health center managers and staff for their assistance. We thank the study participants, as well as the supervisors and data collectors, for their assistance with data collection.

### Authors Contributions

The authors made substantial contributions to the conception and design, acquisition of data, or analysis and interpretation of data; took part in drafting the article or revising it critically for important intellectual content; agreed to submit it to the current journal; gave final approval of the version to be published; and agree to be accountable for all aspects of the work.

### Data Availability

All data generated or analyzed during this study are included in the manuscript and are also available from the corresponding author upon request.

### Declaration of Conflicting Interests

The author(s) declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

### Ethical Considerations

The study protocol was evaluated and approved by Wollo University College of Medicine and Health Science No (CMHS/367/2022) and Ethical clearance was obtained. Permission letters were also obtained from Dessie City's respected public health facilities. Moreover, this study was conducted in compliance with the Declaration of Helsinki. As a result, informed consent was obtained from the study participants prior to study commencement. Anonymous data was taken and the confidentiality of participants' information was secured.

### Funding

The author(s) received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

### ORCID iD

Muluken Amare Wudu  <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0292-6029>

## References

1. Trends in maternal mortality: 2000 to 2017: Estimates by WHO, UNICEF, UNFPA, World Bank Group and the United Nations Population Division. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2019 (<https://www.who.int/reproductivehealth/publications/maternal-mortality-2000-2017/en/>).
2. Global Health Estimates 2019: Global Health Estimates: Life expectancy and leading causes of death and disability. Geneva, World Health Organization; 2020 (<https://www.who.int/data/gho/data/themes/mortality-and-global-health-estimates>).
3. Levels and trends in child mortality: Report 2022. Estimates developed by the United Nations Inter-Agency Group for Child Mortality Estimation. New York: United Nations Children's Fund; 2022 (<https://www.unicef.org/reports/levels-and-trendschild-mortality-report-2022>).
4. Carroli G, Rooney C, Villar J. How effective is antenatal care in preventing maternal mortality and serious morbidity? An overview of the evidence. *Paediatr Perinat Epidemiol*. 2001 Jan;15:1-42. doi:10.1046/j.1365-3016.2001.0150s1001.x
5. UNICEF Data: Monitoring the situation of children and women fact sheet, December 2022.
6. Ethiopian Public Health Institute (EPHI) [Ethiopia] and ICF. *Ethiopia Mini Demographic and Health Survey 2019: key indicators*. EPHI and ICF; 2019.
7. Federal Ministry of Health Safe Motherhood Program, Ethiopia. 2010.
8. Akachi Y, Kruk ME. Quality of care: measuring a neglected driver of improved health. *Bull WHO*. 2017 Jun 1;95(6):465. doi:10.2471/BLT.16.180190
9. Mainz J. Defining and classifying clinical indicators for quality improvement. *Int J Qual Health Care*. 2003 Dec 1;15(6):523-530. doi:10.1093/intqhc/mzg081
10. Nylenna M, Bjertnaes ØA, Saunes IS, Lindahl AK. What is good quality of health care? *Prof Professionalism*. 2015 Mar 18;5(1). doi:10.7577/pp.909
11. Yeoh PL, Hornetz K, Dahlui M. Antenatal care utilisation and content between low-risk and high-risk pregnant women. *PLoS One*. 2016 Mar 24;11(3):e0152167. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0152167
12. Beeckman K, Louckx F, Masuy-Stroobant G, Downe S, Putman K. The development and application of a new tool to assess the adequacy of the content and timing of antenatal care. *BMC Health Serv Res*. 2011 Dec;11(1):1-0. doi:10.1186/1472-6963-11-213
13. Donabedian A. Evaluating the quality of medical care. *Milbank Q*. 2005 Dec;83(4):691. doi:10.1111/j.1468-0009.2005.00397.x
14. World Health Organization (WHO). *Maternal health and safe motherhood programme, division of family health: mother-baby package*. WHO; 1996.
15. Sharan M, Ahmed S, Ghebrehiwet M, Rogo K. The quality of the maternal health system in Eritrea. *Int J Gynaecol Obstet*. 2011 Dec 1;115(3):244-50. doi:10.1016/j.ijgo.2011.07.025
16. Mozlan Janet Turan and OrtayliNuriye, Social since Research initiative on quality of care. An evaluation of the quality of Maternity care in three Istanbul Updated January 2000.
17. Hildingsson I. Swedish women's satisfaction with medical and emotional aspects of antenatal care. *J Adv Nurs*. 2018;52:239-49. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2648.2005.03584.x
18. Onyeajam DJ, Xirasagar S, Khan MM, Hardin JW, Odutolu O. Antenatal care satisfaction in a developing country: a cross-sectional study from Nigeria. *BMC Public Health*. 2018 Dec;18(1):1-9. doi:10.1186/s12889-018-5285-0
19. Ayalew MM, Nebeb GT, Bizuneh MM, Dagne AH. Women's satisfaction and its associated factors with antenatal care services at public health facilities: a cross-sectional study. *Int J Womens Health*. 2021;13:279. doi:10.2147/IJWH.S293725
20. Hussen MA, Worku BT. Quality of antenatal care service and factors associated with client satisfaction at public health facilities of Bele Gasgar District. *J Patient Exper*. 2022 Mar;9:23743735221083163. doi:10.1177/23743735221083163
21. Hailu GA, Weret ZS, Adasho ZA, Eshete BM. Quality of antenatal care and associated factors in public health centers in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, a cross-sectional study. *PLoS One*. 2022 Jun 10;17(6):e0269710. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0269710
22. Nemomsa A, Wirtu D, Getachew M, et al. Quality of antenatal care in selected public health facilities of West Ethiopia. *Contracep Reprod Med*. 2022 Dec;7(1):1-9. doi:10.1186/s40834-022-00186-9
23. World Health Organization. *WHO Recommendations on antenatal care for a positive pregnancy experience*. WHO; 2016.
24. Islam MM, Masud MS. Determinants of frequency and contents of antenatal care visits in Bangladesh: assessing the extent of compliance with the WHO recommendations. *PLoS One*. 2018 Sep 27;13(9):e0204752. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0204752
25. Dansereau E, McNellan CR, Gagnier MC, et al. Coverage and timing of antenatal care among poor women in 6 Mesoamerican countries. *BMC Pregnancy Childbirth*. 2016 Dec;16(1):1-1. doi:10.1186/s12884-016-1018-5
26. Tadesse Berehe T, Modibia LM. Assessment of quality of antenatal care services and its determinant factors in public health facilities of Hossana town, Hadiya zone, Southern Ethiopia: a longitudinal study. *Adv Public Health*. 2020 Aug 17;2020. doi:10.1155/2020/5436324
27. Tadesse j, et al. Quality of antenatal care services in Bahirdar zuria special Zone, Northwest Ethiopia. *Health Serv Res*. 2013;13:443. doi:10.1186/1472-6963-13-443
28. WHO Assessment tool for the quality of outpatient ANC and PNC for women and Newborns, 2013.
29. USAID maternal and child health integrated program; Maternal and Newborn Quality of Care Survey, 2012.
30. Niguse M, Takele T, Mary C, et al. Process quality of antenatal care among clients of antenatal care service users and service providers in Public Hospitals of Woliata Zone, Southern Ethiopia. *J Gynecol Women's Health*. 2021;20(4):556041.
31. Chemir F, Alemseged F, Workneh D. Satisfaction with focused antenatal care service and associated factors among pregnant women attending focused antenatal care at health centers in Jimma town, Jimma zone, South West Ethiopia; a facility based cross-sectional study triangulated with qualitative study. *BMC Res Notes*. 2014 Dec;7(1):1-8.



32. Tesfaye R, Worku A, Godana W, Lindtjorn B. Client satisfaction with delivery care service and associated factors in the public health facilities of Gamo Gofa zone, Southwest Ethiopia: in a resource limited setting. *Obstet Gynecol Int*. 2016 Jun 20;2016. doi:10.1155/2016/5798068
33. Mekonnen N, Berheto TM, Ololo S, Tafese F. Quality of antenatal care services in Demba gofa woreda, Gamo Gofa zone, rural Ethiopia. *Health Sci J*. 2017;11(3):0. doi:10.21767/1791-809X.1000502
34. Tesfaye T, Mekonnen H, Negesa L. Maternal antenatal care service satisfaction and factors associated with rural health centers, Bursa District, Sidama Zone, Southern Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. *J Womens Health Care*. 2017;6(363):4-20.
35. Yarinbab TE, Ambo WA, Regea T, Mariam A. Level of maternal satisfaction and its determinants at health facilities in Mizan-Aman town, Ethiopia: cross sectional study. *Int J Womens Health Wellness*. 2019;5(1):88.
36. Melkamu BS, Yimar HD, Damene DA. Determinants of focused antenatal care service satisfaction in public health facilities in Ethiopia 2018: a mixed study design. *J Public Health Epidemiol*. 2019 Sep 30;11(8):158-69.