

ultimately included these ethical principles in the Commonwealth's framework to allocate scarce COVID-19 therapeutics during the pandemic (7). ■

**Author disclosures** are available with the text of this letter at [www.atsjournals.org](http://www.atsjournals.org).

Douglas B. White, M.D., M.A.S.\*  
Bernard Lo, M.D.  
University of California San Francisco and The Greenwall Foundation  
San Francisco, California

\*Corresponding author (e-mail: [douglas.white@pitt.edu](mailto:douglas.white@pitt.edu)).

## References

- White DB, Lo B. Mitigating inequities and saving lives with ICU triage during the COVID-19 pandemic. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2021;203:287–295.
- Coates T. The case for reparations. *Atlantic* 2014 June;313–327.
- Pennsylvania Department of Health; Hospital Healthsystem Association of Pennsylvania. Interim Pennsylvania crisis standards of care for pandemic guidelines: April 10, 2020. Version 2. Harrisburg, PA:Pennsylvania Department of Health; 2020 [accessed 2021 May 11]. Available from: <https://www.health.pa.gov/topics/Documents/Diseases%20and%20Conditions/COVID-19%20Interim%20Crisis%20Standards%20of%20Care.pdf>.
- Persad G. Evaluating the legality of age-based criteria in health care: from nondiscrimination and discretion to distributive justice. *Boston Coll Law Rev* 2019;60:889–949.
- Farrell TW, Ferrante LE, Brown T, Francis L, Widera E, Rhodes R, et al. AGS position statement: resource allocation strategies and age-related considerations in the COVID-19 era and beyond. *J Am Geriatr Soc* 2020;68:1136–1142.
- Bixler D, Miller AD, Mattison CP, Taylor B, Komatsu K, Peterson Pompa X, et al.; Pediatric Mortality Investigation Team. SARS-CoV-2-associated deaths among persons aged <21 years: United States, February 12–July 31, 2020. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep* 2020;69:1324–1329.
- Pennsylvania Department of Health. Ethical allocation framework for emerging treatments of COVID-19. Harrisburg, PA:Pennsylvania Department of Health; 2021 [accessed 2021 Mar 21]. Available from: <https://www.health.pa.gov/topics/disease/coronavirus/Pages/Guidance/Ethical-Allocation-Framework.aspx>.

Copyright © 2021 by the American Thoracic Society



## Can Pulse Rate Responses Be a Metric of Cardiovascular Outcome in Patients with Obstructive Sleep Apnea?

To the Editor:

The effect of apnea- and hypopnea-related changes in pulse rate on cardiovascular morbidity and mortality was investigated by

Ⓐ This article is open access and distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial No Derivatives License 4.0 (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>). For commercial usage and reprints, please contact Diane Gern ([dgern@thoracic.org](mailto:dgern@thoracic.org)).

Originally Published in Press as DOI: 10.1164/rccm.202103-0724LE on April 29, 2021

Azarbarzin and colleagues (1) in a secondary analysis of the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis ( $n = 1,395$ ) and the Sleep Heart Health Study ( $n = 4,575$ ). First, I would like to congratulate the team on their study, emphasizing the importance of heart rate as a physiological and prognostic metric beyond the apnea–hypopnea index. In their study, the authors used three distinct types of apnea–hypopnea heart rate (HR)–related changes: “high  $\Delta$ HR (upper quartile), mid- $\Delta$ HR (25th–75th centiles), and low  $\Delta$ HR (lower quartile).” The authors defined  $\Delta$ HR as the difference between the maximum and minimum pulse rate during apneas/hypopneas. They found that the upper quartile of pulse rate changes was associated with increased cardiovascular morbidity and mortality risk. The main findings of the study corroborate our previous work on the WSCS (Wisconsin Sleep Cohort Study) using actual electrocardiogram-derived signal (R-R interval tracing) (2). However, the WSCS secondary analysis excluded individuals on chronotropic medications (e.g., a  $\beta$ -blocker or calcium channel blocker), which dampen the autonomic response to respiratory events and affect the sensitivity of the heart rate metric (3). It is plausible that the lower  $\Delta$ HR quartile represents a group of individuals on chronotropic medications, explaining the U shape relationship between pulse rate and adverse cardiovascular outcome. Azarbarzin and colleagues added the  $\beta$ -blockers’ use to the adjusted model, but perhaps a separate analysis for those on  $\beta$ -blockers versus those not on them could provide additional useful mechanistic information. The mechanism of increased incidence of cardiovascular disease (CVD) and association with heart rate changes can be explained by an increased sympathetic tone and shear forces leading to endothelial dysfunction (4).

These pathophysiological factors are greatly influenced by demographics variables, particularly age and sex. However, this study did not provide information about the sex and age effect on cardiovascular morbidity and mortality. In WSCS, we found that increased heart rate changes were significantly associated with new-onset CVD event(s) in men but not in women.

On the basis of the findings from three different cohorts, it is essential to start considering heart rate response frequency during a sleep study as an important physiological metric and predictor of cardiovascular outcome in patients with obstructive sleep apnea. Therefore, future prospective studies are greatly needed to avoid any potential bias and to confirm these novel findings that could have a paradigm shift in the field. ■

**Author disclosures** are available with the text of this letter at [www.atsjournals.org](http://www.atsjournals.org).

Abdulghani Sankari, M.D., Ph.D.\*  
Wayne State University  
Detroit, Michigan

John D. Dingell VA Medical Center  
Detroit, Michigan

and

Ascension Providence Hospital  
Southfield, Michigan

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-2400-3375 (A.S.).

\*Corresponding author (e-mail: [asankari@wayne.edu](mailto:asankari@wayne.edu)).

## References

1. Azarbarzin A, Sands SA, Younes M, Taranto-Montemurro L, Sofer T, Vena D, *et al*. The sleep apnea-specific pulse rate response predicts cardiovascular morbidity and mortality. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2021; 203:1546–1555.
2. Sankari A, Ravelo LA, Maresh S, Aljundi N, Alsabri B, Fawaz S, *et al*. Longitudinal effect of nocturnal R-R intervals changes on cardiovascular outcome in a community-based cohort. *BMJ Open* 2019;9:e030559.
3. Sankari APS, Pranathiageswaran S, Maresh S, Hosni AM, Badr MS. Characteristics and consequences of non-apneic respiratory events during sleep. *Sleep* 2017;40:zsw024.
4. Fisher AB, Chien S, Barakat AI, Nerem RM. Endothelial cellular response to altered shear stress. *Am J Physiol Lung Cell Mol Physiol* 2001;281: L529–L533.

Copyright © 2021 by the American Thoracic Society



## Ⓔ Sleep Apnea, Pulse Rate Response, and Cardiovascular Events with Special Reference to Biomarkers

To the Editor:

Azarbarzin and colleagues evaluated the association between the pulse rate response to apneas/hypopneas ( $\Delta$ HR) and cardiovascular disease (CVD) morbidity/mortality (1). The authors used three subclinical CVD biomarkers, namely, coronary artery calcium, N-terminal probrain natriuretic peptide (NT-proBNP), and Framingham risk score, to assess their associations with  $\Delta$ HR, and U-shaped relationships were exclusively observed. In addition, individuals with obstructive sleep apnea with elevated  $\Delta$ HR had increased risks of CVD morbidity/mortality. They concluded that the three biomarkers for obstructive sleep apnea were effective for risk stratification of CVD morbidity/mortality. However, I have a query regarding some discrepancies for the risk of CVD morbidity/mortality in patients with low and high  $\Delta$ HR.

There is an agreement that obesity has an inverse relationship with NT-proBNP (2); however, the progression of apnea/hypopnea cancels the inverse relationship between body mass index (BMI) and NT-proBNP (3). Azarbarzin and colleagues included individuals with mild-to-moderate sleep apnea, and the average BMI was less than 29 (1). I speculate that there is an inverse relationship between BMI and NT-proBNP in this population and that BMI may become a confounding factor in the relationship between  $\Delta$ HR and CVD morbidity/mortality. Thus, I recommend an additional setting of low  $\Delta$ HR as a control to compare the risk of CVD morbidity/mortality between patients with low and high  $\Delta$ HR. ■

**Author disclosures** are available with the text of this letter at [www.atsjournals.org](http://www.atsjournals.org).

Ⓔ This article is open access and distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial No Derivatives License 4.0 (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>). For commercial usage and reprints, please contact Diane Gern ([dgern@thoracic.org](mailto:dgern@thoracic.org)).

Originally Published in Press as DOI: 10.1164/rccm.202102-0512LE on April 29, 2021

Tomoyuki Kawada, M.D., Ph.D.\*  
Nippon Medical School  
Tokyo, Japan

\*Corresponding author (e-mail: [kawada@nms.ac.jp](mailto:kawada@nms.ac.jp)).

## References

1. Azarbarzin A, Sands SA, Younes M, Taranto-Montemurro L, Sofer T, Vena D, *et al*. The sleep apnea-specific pulse rate response predicts cardiovascular morbidity and mortality. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2021; 203:1546–1555.
2. Madamanchi C, Alhosaini H, Sumida A, Runge MS. Obesity and natriuretic peptides, BNP and NT-proBNP: mechanisms and diagnostic implications for heart failure. *Int J Cardiol* 2014;176:611–617.
3. Xu L, Keenan BT, Maislin D, Gislason T, Benediktsdóttir B, Gudmundsdóttir S, *et al*. Effect of obstructive sleep apnea and positive airway pressure therapy on cardiac remodeling as assessed by cardiac biomarker and magnetic resonance imaging in nonobese and obese adults. *Hypertension* 2021;77:980–992.

Copyright © 2021 by the American Thoracic Society



## Reply to Sankari and to Kawada

From the Authors:

We thank Dr. Abdulghani Sankari and Dr. Tomoyuki Kawada for their interest in our work published recently in the *Journal* (1). In our recent study (1), we found a U-shaped relationship between the pulse rate response to sleep apnea ( $\Delta$ HR) and subclinical cardiovascular biomarkers as well as nonfatal and fatal cardiovascular events. That is, a low  $\Delta$ HR and a high  $\Delta$ HR appear to be deleterious. In addition, in our previous studies, we have shown that the  $\Delta$ HR reflected the severity of preceding respiratory events (2) and the intensity of cortical arousal (3) and was reproducible (4) and heritable (5). Here, we clarify questions raised by Dr. Sankari and Dr. Kawada.

Dr. Sankari wrote to suggest that adjustment for  $\beta$ -blocker use may not adequately deal with a confounding effect of  $\beta$ -blockers on the association between the  $\Delta$ HR and cardiovascular disease (CVD) outcomes. Indeed, in addition to adding  $\beta$ -blocker use in the main models, we conducted a sensitivity analysis and excluded individuals receiving  $\beta$ -blockers, those with the presence of atrial fibrillation, or those with cardiac pacemakers. The results remained very similar (1). In addition, Dr. Sankari asked about age- and sex-specific associations. The sex-specific associations were included in our study (1) and showed that the associations between a high  $\Delta$ HR and nonfatal CVD or fatal CVD appeared to be stronger in women than in men (but interactions were not statistically significant). In new, age-specific analyses (age  $\geq 65$  vs.  $< 65$  yr), associations also appeared to be

Ⓔ This article is open access and distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial No Derivatives License 4.0 (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>). For commercial usage and reprints, please contact Diane Gern ([dgern@thoracic.org](mailto:dgern@thoracic.org)).

Originally Published in Press as DOI: 10.1164/rccm.202103-0690LE on April 29, 2021