

Acupuncture for "poor ovarian response" of women to controlled ovarian hyperstimulation A protocol for meta-analysis and systematic review

Wei Wei, MD idot , Li-Ying Liu, MD, Ling Chen, MD, Meng-Hua Su, MD, Xiao-Juan Hong, PhD *

Abstract

Background: Poor ovarian response (POR) is a high-incidence disease of women, which cause in vitro fertilization failure. Various treatment options have been proposed for women with POR to improve their ovarian response, but with little effect. In recent years, there is a wide range of applications of acupuncture in the process of in vitro fertilization. The meta-analysis and systematic review are designed to analyze whether acupuncture is effective for patients with POR.

Methods: The following databases will be searched from inception to March 2020: Electronic databases consist of MEDLINE, EMBASE, Allied and Complementary Medicine Database, China National Knowledge Infrastructure, Chinese Biomedical Literature Database, the Chinese Scientific Journal Database, and Wanfang Database. Other literature resources will also be searched including clinical trial registries, key journals, and meeting records. The results of randomized controlled trials of acupuncture therapy on POR, which are published in Chinese or English, will be embedded. The primary outcome is the clinical pregnancy rate. Data identification, data selection, data extraction, and assessment of bias risk will be completed independently by 2 or more reviewers. STATA/IC 16 will be used to perform the meta-analysis. We will use the Grading of Recommendations Assessment, Development, and Evaluation system to evaluate the quality of our evidence. A systematic narrative synthesis will be provided if the quantitative analysis is not available.

Discussion: This study will provide the first meta-analysis and systematic review to evaluate the efficacy of acupuncture in treating POR. This protocol provides details to guide this study.

Conclusions: From this review may benefit POR patients or clinical decision-makers.

PROSPERO registration number: PROSPERO CRD42020169560.

Abbreviations: AMH = anti-Mullerian hormone, COH = controlled ovarian hyperstimulation, CPR = clinical pregnancy rate, IVF = in vitro fertilization, POR = poor ovarian response.

Keywords: acupuncture, meta-analysis, poor ovarian response, protocol, systematic review

WW and L-YL contributed equally to this work.

No ethical approval is needed in this protocol that all involved literature will not contain individual patient data.

This work was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (grant number 81973966 and grant number 81973961) and the Sichuan Province Foundation for Distinguished Young Youths (grant number 2020JDJQ0051).

The authors report no conflicts of interest.

Data sharing not applicable to this article as no datasets were generated or analyzed during the current study.

Acupuncture and Tuina School, Chengdu University of Traditional Chinese Medicine, Chengdu, China.

* Correspondence: Xiao-Juan Hong, Acupuncture and Tuina School, Chengdu University of Traditional Chinese Medicine, No.37 Shierqiao Road, Chengdu, Sichuan Province, China (e-mail: jane841116@163.com).

Copyright © 2020 the Author(s). Published by Wolters Kluwer Health, Inc. This is an open access article distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution License 4.0 (CCBY), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

How to cite this article: Wei W, Liu LY, Chen L, Su MH, Hong XJ. Acupuncture for "poor ovarian response" of women to controlled ovarian hyperstimulation: a protocol for meta-analysis and systematic review. Medicine 2020;99:44(e22868).

Received: 20 September 2020 / Accepted: 24 September 2020 http://dx.doi.org/10.1097/MD.00000000022868

1. Introduction

1.1. Description of the condition

Controlled ovarian hyperstimulation (COH) was proposed for recruiting adequate follicles to boost the success rates of in vitro fertilization (IVF). However, there are still "poor responder" who respond poorly to COH resulting in low success rates with IVF.^[1-4] Despite rapid development in IVF, poor ovarian response (POR) remains one of the most challenging tasks faced by reproductive clinicians. The prevalence of POR varies from 5.6% to 35.1%^[3] and brings the risk of cycle cancellation of 20%.^[5] The pathogen is unclear in half of those patients with POR.^[6] Varieties of interventions exist to improve pregnancy rate for patients with POR, however, no definitive consensus is accepted for the best treatment.^[7–9] In summary, the application of adjuvant therapy to improve IVF results for POR patients should be taken into consideration.

1.2. Description of the intervention

Acupuncture, as a unique method in traditional Chinese medicine, involves inserting fine needles and simulating acupoints

in specific parts of the body to regulate the meridian for health recovery. Acupuncture therapy has been shown may have effects on infertility.^[10–13] However, only 1 systematic review^[14] demonstrated that acupuncture might improve clinical pregnancy rate (CPR), anti-Mullerian hormone (AMH), antral follicle count, and the number of retrieved oocytes in POR patients undergoing IVF. In contrast, it is hard to conclude that acupuncture is more effective than traditional therapies for POR. Furthermore, an increasing number of clinical studies showed that acupuncture improves the IVF outcome of POR patients.^[14,15]

1.3. How the intervention might work

There are pathological and physiologic studies on acupuncture in treating infertility. Acupuncture can regulate the function of the hypothalamic-pituitary-ovarian axis by modulating endogenous opioids especially β -endorphin, thereby affecting the release of gonadotropin-releasing hormone.^[16-18] Studies have revealed that acupuncture also affected peripheral gonadotropin levels of women including follicle stimulating hormone, luteinizing hormone, estradiol, and progesterone.^[19,20] Chen^[18] found that electro-acupuncture could normalize the dysfunction of the hypothalamic-pituitary-ovarian axis by altering the expression of some genes in the brain. Studies also revealed that electro-acupuncture could improve uterine and ovarian blood flow of infertile women.^[21,22] Acupuncture can facilitate implantation by inhibiting overactive sympathetic nervous systems.^[23,24] Poor ovarian reserve is a cause of poor response to COH.^[25] Acupuncture showed a benefit of improving the ovarian reserve of patients, while the quality of researches was weak and not representative.^[26-29] Further research is needed.

1.4. Why it is essential to perform this review

Inducing ovulation in patients with POR during IVF is one of the most challenging but frustrating issues in reproductive medicine. Even though improving IVF outcomes for POR women is a major priority, the lack of a unique definition of POR hinders researches in this area.^[30] Despite differences in the definition of POR, the treatment cycle of POR patients often has a meager success rate or is canceled due to presumed adverse clinical outcomes.^[3,4,31] This may bring emotional distress to the couples, and also increase the financial burden on them.^[4,31] The cost of treatment may vary depending on different treatments, though the live birth rates resulted similarly.^[4,7] Normally, follicle donation seems the only option for women with POR. It takes lots of time for couples to wait for the right donor.

Although acupuncture has been used to improve pregnancy rate among women undergoing IVF,^[32–34] there is only 1 systematic review to describe the effectiveness of acupuncture in improving the CPR after IVF.^[14] We will provide clinicians with more precise data on the effectiveness of acupuncture of POR patients during COH in the context of IVF as well as identify areas where further evaluation is necessary.

1.5. Objectives

To compare the effectiveness of different kinds of acupuncture therapies in women with POR during COH in the context of IVF.

2. Methods/ design

2.1. Eligibility criteria

2.1.1. Types of studies. Randomized controlled trials (published and unpublished) of acupuncture intervention will be included in the review. Languages of all alternative literature shall be Chinese and English. Uncontrolled clinical trials and crossover trials with no first phase data will be excluded. We also remove studies without an identifiable definition of POR.

2.1.2. Types of participants. Participants diagnosed with POR will be included. Diagnostic criteria are not limited. All participants undergo IVF with acupuncture intervention during any time of IVF. There is no restriction on age or ethnicity of the enrolled subjects.

2.1.3. Types of interventions. All acupuncture therapies considered in the study are defined as either traditional acupuncture with needle stimulation of acupoints or modern acupuncture technique without needling. COH therapy of any types should be assessed along with acupuncture therapy in both groups.

2.1.4. Types of control/ comparator(s). We will classify comparators as follow:

- 1. Acupuncture plus COH therapy versus COH therapy;
- 2. Acupuncture plus COH therapy versus noninvasive placebo acupuncture/ sham acupuncture plus COH therapy;
- 3. Acupuncture plus COH therapy versus herbs plus COH therapy.

We will exclude studies comparing the effects on different types of acupoints or forms of acupuncture.

2.1.5. Types of outcomes

2.1.5.1. Primary outcomes. CPR.

2.1.5.2. Secondary outcomes.

- Other indicators of pregnancy outcome: pregnancy rates, live birth rate, number of oocytes retrieved per woman, number of received high-quality embryos, fertility rate, cancellation rate;
- Index for reproductive endocrinology: the value of follicle stimulating hormone, luteinizing hormone, estradiol, antral follicle count, AMH; dose and duration of Gn used for COH;
- 3. Adverse effects in the process: miscarriage rate, ectopic pregnancy rate.

2.2. Information sources

Following databases will be conducted by 2 qualified reviewers (MHS and LC). The search will be performed from inception to March 2020:

- Electronic databases: MEDLINE (via PubMed), Excerpta Medica Database (EMBASE), Allied and Complementary Medicine Database, Index to Chinese Periodical Literature including China National Knowledge Infrastructure, Chinese Biomedical Literature Database, the Chinese Scientific Journal Database, and Wanfang Database.
- Clinical trial registries: Menstrual Disorders and Subfertility Group Specialized Register, Cochrane Central Register of Controlled Trials, World Health Organization International Clinical Trials Registry Platform, Chinese Clinical Registry, and Clinical Trials.

• Manual searches of crucial journals (Human Reproduction Update, Human Reproduction, Fertility, and Sterility) and meetings of European Society of Human Reproduction and Embryology and American Society for Reproductive Medicine for relevant articles.

2.3. Search strategy

The search strategy uses a combination of subject words and free words. The following searching terms will be searched: "acupunct*," "acupress*," "acupoint*," "electroacupunt*," "electro-acupunt*," "moxibust*," "point injection," "transcutaneous electri* stimulation," "point embedding," "poor ovarian response," "poor ovarian responder," "POR," "controlled ovarian hyperstimulation," "diminished ovarian response," "reduced ovarian response," "ovarian stimulation," "diminished ovarian reserve," "low response," "poor responders," "in vitro fertilization," "in vitro fertilisation." MeSH terms searching be performed using the following terms: "Acupuncture," "Acupuncture Therapy," "Transcutaneous Electric Nerve Stimulation."

The detailed search strategy for PubMed is shown in Table 1. Equivalent translations of above terms will be applied to searching in Chinese databases.

2.4. Study selection and data extraction

2.4.1. Data management. LYL is responsible for the management of all documents. Search results will be downloaded by 1 reviewer (LYL) into Microsoft Excel, including citation abstracts and full texts. Our team will formulate screening questions and forms based on inclusion and exclusion criteria in Microsoft Excel. Before the formal screening process, calibration work will be carried out to refine the screening issues. Only research colleagues and other approved people have access to all data of this review. Besides, we will provide training for members who are not familiar with the Microsoft Excel before the review.

2.4.2. Selection process. Two independent reviewers (MHS and LC) will respectively screen the obtained articles by reading titles and abstracts with eligibility criteria. Any disagreement between 2 reviewers will be arbitrated by the reviewer (WW) other than the 2. Excluded studies will list the reasons for exclusion in the table of Microsoft Excel. The study selection process will be shown in a PRISMA flow diagram (see Fig. 1).

2.4.3. Data collection process. The following items of included trials will be extracted by 2 reviewers independently (MHS and LC) into a predefined data extraction sheet of Microsoft Excel: general information (article ID author list, year of publication, title, journal name), the methodology of included trials (participant demographics, eligibility criteria, interventions, controls, follow-up measurement), outcomes measurement and so on. Checklist of Standards for Reporting Interventions in Clinical Trials of Acupuncture^[35] (STRICTA) is needed to report the details about acupuncture. WW will arbitrate any disagreement existed. The pre-analytical check will be done (MHS and LC) before transfer the data into STATA/IC 16.^[36]

2.4.4. Dealing with missing data. The reviewers (LYL and WW) will contact the author or relevant authors through phone or e-mail to obtain missing data. If missing data is not available, such studies will be excluded. We will analyze only existing data, and address the potential impact of missing data in discussions.^[37]

2.5. Data synthesis

2.5.1. *Meta-analysis.* We will use STATA/IC 16 to perform the meta-analysis. For continuous variables, the statistical post-intervention will use Hedges g as the specified effect size. The exact calculation will be used to calculate the bias-correction factor. And the Hedges and Olkin-corrected standard errors will be performed to calculate the effect size. For categorical variables, the specified effect size uses the log Peto ratio. The meta-analysis will use either random-effects model or fixed-effects model. We will assess the DerSimonian-Laird method to perform the random-effects model, while assessing inverse-variance method to perform the fixed effects model.^[38] The confidence interval for the meta-analysis is 95%.

2.5.2. Assessment of heterogeneity. $I^2 \text{ test}^{[39]}$ will be assessed for quantifying between-study heterogeneity. If the I^2 index is less than 50%, the fixed effects model will be performed for analysis. If there is considerable heterogeneity ($I^2 \text{ index} > 50\%$), subgroup analysis and meta-regression will be performed by the random-effects model.^[38]

2.5.3. Subgroup analysis. Subgroup analysis will be conducted to interpret the heterogeneity as well. If the number of studies is sufficient, we will conduct subgroup analysis based on the quality of the study, region, age, gender, diagnostic

Table	1
Search strategy of PubMed.	
No.	Search items
#1	"Acupuncture"[MeSH] OR "Acupuncture Therapy"[MeSH]
#2	"Transcutaneous Electric Nerve Stimulation"[MeSH]
#3	(acupunct [*] [ti/ab] OR acupress [*] [ti/ab] OR acupoint [*] [ti/ab] OR electroacupunt [*] [ti/ab] OR electro-acupunt [*] [ti/ab] OR moxibust [*] [ti/ab] OR point injection[ti/ab] OR transcutaneous electri [*] stimulation [ti/ab]OR point embedding[ti/ab])
#4	(poor ovarian response[ti/ab] OR poor ovarian responder[ti/ab] OR POR[ti/ab] OR controlled ovarian hyperstimulation[ti/ab] OR reduced ovarian response[ti/ab] OR diminished ovarian response[ti/ab] OR ovarian stimulation[ti/ab] OR diminished ovarian reserve[ti/ab])
#5	(low response[ti/ab] OR poor responders[ti/ab]) and (in vitro fertilization[ti/ab] OR in vitro fertilisation[ti/ab])
#6	"Randomized Controlled Trials as Topic"[MeSH]
#7	"Randomized Controlled Trial"[pt]
#8	(randomized[ti/ab] OR radomised[ti/ab])
#9	trial[ti]
#10	(#1 OR #2 OR #3) AND (#4 OR #5) AND (#6 OR #7 OR #8 OR #9)



criteria, different types of acupuncture technique, different control interventions.

2.5.4. Sensitivity analysis. We plan to conduct sensitivity analysis if possible after subgroup analysis. Low quality studies will be excluded, then the meta-analysis will be repeated. Decision nodes such as sample size, methodological defects, missing data based on STRITA, and so on.

2.5.5. Systematic synthesis. A systematic narrative synthesis will be provided to summarize and interpret features and results of included studies. A narrative synthesis will explore the relationship and findings within and between studies.

2.5.6. *Meta-regression.* Meta-regression will be conducted if there is significant heterogeneity. Reviewers will use meta-regression to explore the relationship between acupuncture therapy and the CPR. The following factors will be used as covariates.

References characteristics:

- Year of publication
- Language of citation

Intervention characteristics:

- Duration of acupuncture therapy
- Dose of gonadotropin used for COH

Participant characteristics:

- Mean age
- Ovarian reserve: Value of AMH and AFC

2.6. Assessment of risk of bias

The risk of bias will be analyzed using the Grading of Recommendations Assessment, Development, and Evaluation^[40] by 2 independent reviewers (LYL and WW). The quality of evidence is classified as "high," "moderate," "low" or "very low."

3. Discussion

Acupuncture is recommended to be an effective therapy for infertility in traditional Chinese medicine. This study has potentials to provide evidence to identify whether acupuncture is effective for treating POR in patients undergoing IVF. Based on the previous research,^[14] we will improve our study by discussing the improvement of AMH in acupuncture treatment for POR patients, increase the number of search databases. If heterogeneity deems it possible, we will provide detailed subgroup analysis and meta-regression analysis. Conclusions from this review may benefit POR patients or clinical decision-makers. We will update the protocol if necessary, as well as explaining changes and providing the date of each modification as supplements.

Author contributions

Writing – original draft: Wei Wei, Li-Ying Liu, Ling Chen, Meng-Hua Su.

Writing - review & editing: Xiao-Juan Hong.

References

- Hendriks DJ, te Velde ER, Looman CW, et al. Expected poor ovarian response in predicting cumulative pregnancy rates: a powerful tool. Reprod Biomed Online 2008;17:727–36.
- [2] Zhen XM, Qiao J, Li R, et al. The clinical analysis of poor ovarian response in in-vitro-fertilization embryo-transfer among Chinese couples. J Assist Reprod Genet 2008;25:17–22.
- [3] Oudendijk JF, Yarde F, Eijkemans MJ, et al. The poor responder in IVF: is the prognosis always poor?: a systematic review. Hum Reprod Update 2012;18:1–1.
- [4] Busnelli A, Papaleo E, Del Prato D, et al. A retrospective evaluation of prognosis and cost-effectiveness of IVF in poor responders according to the Bologna criteria. Hum Reprod 2015;30:315–22.
- [5] Giovanale V, Pulcinelli FM, Ralli E, et al. Poor responders in IVF: an update in therapy. Gynecol Endocrinol 2015;31:253–7.
- [6] Blumenfeld Z. Fertility treatment in women with premature ovarian failure. Expert Rev Obstet Gynecol 2011;6:321–30.
- [7] Pandian Z, McTavish AR, Aucott L, et al. Interventions for 'poor responders' to controlled ovarian hyper stimulation (COH) in in-vitro fertilisation (IVF). Cochrane Database Syst Rev 2010;1:CD004379.
- [8] Orvieto R, Kruchkovich J, Rabinson J, et al. Ultrashort gonadotropinreleasing hormone agonist combined with flexible multidose gonadotropin-releasing hormone antagonist for poor responders in in vitro fertilization/embryo transfer programs. Fertil Steril 2008;90:228–30.
- [9] Polyzos NP, Tzioras S, Badawy AM, et al. Aromatase inhibitors for female infertility: a systematic review of the literature. Reprod Biomed Online 2009;19:456–71.
- [10] Zheng CH, Zhang J, Wu J, et al. The effect of transcutaneous electrical acupoint stimulation on pregnancy rates in women undergoing in vitro fertilization: a study protocol for a randomized controlled trial. Trials 2014;15:162.
- [11] Sniezek DP, Siddiqui IJ. Acupuncture for treating anxiety and depression in women: a clinical systematic review. Med Acupunct 2013;25:164–72.

- [12] Isoyama D, Cordts EB, de Souza van Niewegen AM, et al. Effect of acupuncture on symptoms of anxiety in women undergoing in vitro fertilisation: a prospective randomised controlled study. Acupunct Med 2012;30:85–8.
- [13] Smith C, Coyle M, Norman RJ. Influence of acupuncture stimulation on pregnancy rates for women undergoing embryo transfer. Fertil Steril 2006;85:1352–8.
- [14] Jang S, Kim KH, Jun JH, et al. Acupuncture for in vitro fertilization in women with poor ovarian response: a systematic review. Integr Med Res 2020;9:100395.
- [15] Chen J, Liu LL, Cui W, et al. Effects of electroacupuncture on in vitro fertilization-embryo transfer (IVF-ET) of patients with poor ovarian response. Zhongguo Zhen Jiu = Chin Acupunct Moxibust 2009;29:775–9.
- [16] Anderson BJ, Haimovici F, Ginsburg ES, et al. In vitro fertilization and acupuncture: clinical efficacy and mechanistic basis. Altern Ther Health Med 2007;13:38–48.
- [17] Chang R, Chung PH, Rosenwaks Z. Role of acupuncture in the treatment of female infertility. Fertil Steril 2002;78:1149–53.
- [18] Chen BY. Acupuncture normalizes dysfunction of hypothalamicpituitary-ovarian axis. Acupunct Electrother Res 1997;22:97–108.
- [19] Yang SP, Yu J, He L. Release of gonadotropin-releasing hormone (GnRH) from the medio-basal hypothalamus induced by electroacupuncture in conscious female rabbits. Acupunct Electrother Res 1994;19:19–27.
- [20] Aso T, Motohashi T, Murata M, et al. The influence of acupuncture stimulation on plasma levels of LH, FSH, progesterone and estradiol in normally ovulating women. Am J Chin Med (Gard City N Y) 1976;4:391–401.
- [21] Stener-Victorin E, Waldenstrom U, Andersson SA, et al. Reduction of blood flow impedance in the uterine arteries of infertile women with electro-acupuncture. Hum Reprod 1996;11:1314–7.
- [22] Ho M, Huang LC, Chang YY, et al. Electroacupuncture reduces uterine artery blood flow impedance in infertile women. Taiwan J Obstet Gynecol 2009;48:148–51.
- [23] Manni L, Lundeberg T, Holmang A, et al. Effect of electro-acupuncture on ovarian expression of alpha (1)- and beta (2)-adrenoceptors, and p75 neurotrophin receptors in rats with steroid-induced polycystic ovaries. Reprod Biol Endocrinol 2005;3:21.
- [24] Stener-Victorin E, Lundeberg T, Waldenstrom U, et al. Effects of electroacupuncture on nerve growth factor and ovarian morphology in rats with experimentally induced polycystic ovaries. Biol Reprod 2000;63: 1497–503.
- [25] Grisendi V, Mastellari E, La Marca A. Ovarian reserve markers to identify poor responders in the context of poseidon classification. Front Endocrinol 2019;10:281.
- [26] Wang Y, Li Y, Chen R, et al. Electroacupuncture for reproductive hormone levels in patients with diminished ovarian reserve: a prospective observational study. Acupunct Med 2016;34:386–91.
- [27] Tang WL, Hu YH, He XH. Acupuncture stimulation of acupoints of multiple meridians for patients with diminished ovarian reserve of both Yin and Yang deficiency. Zhen Ci Yan Jiu = Acupunct Res 2015;40:479–83.
- [28] Li X, Xu H, Fang Y, et al. Acupuncture with regulating menstruation to promote pregnancy for diminished ovarian reverse: a prospective case series study. Zhongguo Zhen Jiu = Chin Acupunct Moxibust 2017;37:1061–5.
- [29] Stener-Victorin E, Jedel E, Manneras L. Acupuncture in polycystic ovary syndrome: current experimental and clinical evidence. J Neuroendocrinol 2008;20:290–8.
- [30] Busnelli A, Somigliana E. Prognosis and cost-effectiveness of IVF in poor responders according to the Bologna Criteria. Minerva Ginecol 2018;70:89–98.
- [31] Lensen SF, Wilkinson J, Leijdekkers JA, et al. Individualised gonadotropin dose selection using markers of ovarian reserve for women undergoing in vitro fertilisation plus intracytoplasmic sperm injection (IVF/ICSI). Cochrane Database Syst Rev 2018;2:CD012693.
- [32] Xie ZY, Peng ZH, Yao B, et al. The effects of acupuncture on pregnancy outcomes of in vitro fertilization: a systematic review and meta-analysis. BMC Complement Altern Med 2019;19:131.
- [33] Qian Y, Xia XR, Ochin H, et al. Therapeutic effect of acupuncture on the outcomes of in vitro fertilization: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Arch Gynecol Obstet 2017;295:543–58.
- [34] Qu F, Zhou J, Ren RX. Effects of acupuncture on the outcomes of in vitro fertilization: a systematic review and meta-analysis. J Alternat Complement Med 2012;18:429–39.

- [35] MacPherson H, Altman DG, Hammerschlag R, et al. Revised STandards for Reporting Interventions in Clinical Trials of Acupuncture (STRICTA): extending the CONSORT statement. PLoS Med 2010;7: e1000261.
- [36] STATA 16 Download and Installion. Available at: https://www.stata. com/new-in-stata/. Accessed June 5, 2020.
- [37] Porta N, Bonet C, Cobo E. Discordance between reported intention-totreat and per protocol analyses. J Clin Epidemiol 2007;60:663–9.
- [38] Higgins JP, Thompson SG, Deeks JJ, et al. Measuring inconsistency in meta-analyses. BMJ 2003;327:557–60.
- [39] Higgins JP, Thompson SG. Quantifying heterogeneity in a meta-analysis. Stat Med 2002;21:1539–58.
- [40] Cumpston M, Li T, Page MJ, et al. Updated guidance for trusted systematic reviews: a new edition of the Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews of Interventions. Cochrane Database Syst Rev 2019;10:ED000142.