1	Target	Journal:	Microbiome

- 2
- 3 High-resolution functional description of vaginal microbiomes in health and disease
- 4
- 5 Johanna B. Holm<sup>1,2</sup>, Michael T. France<sup>1,2</sup>, Pawel Gajer<sup>1</sup>, Bing Ma<sup>1,2</sup>, Rebecca M. Brotman<sup>1,3</sup>, Michelle
- 6 Shardell <sup>1,3</sup>, Larry Forney<sup>4</sup>, and Jacques Ravel<sup>1,2,\*</sup>
- <sup>7</sup> <sup>1</sup>Institute for Genome Sciences, University of Maryland School of Medicine, Baltimore, MD, USA
- 8 <sup>2</sup> Department of Microbiology and Immunology, University of Maryland School of Medicine, Baltimore, MD, USA
- <sup>9</sup> <sup>3</sup> Department of Epidemiology and Public Health, University of Maryland School of Medicine, Baltimore, MD,
- 10 USA
- 11 <sup>4</sup> Department of Biological Sciences, University of Idaho, Moscow, ID
- 12 \*Correspondance:
- 13 Jacques Ravel
- 14 jravel@som.umaryland.edu
- 15
- 16 Keywords (3-10 words):
- 17 vaginal microbiome, genital health, metagenome, sequencing, bacterial vaginosis
- 18

# 19 ABSTRACT

20 Background: A Lactobacillus-dominated vaginal microbiome provides the first line of defense against numerous 21 adverse genital tract health outcomes. However, there is limited understanding of the mechanisms by which the 22 vaginal microbiome modulates protection, as prior work mostly described its composition through morphologic 23 assessment and marker gene sequencing methods that do not capture functional information. To address this 24 limitation, we developed metagenomic community state types (mgCSTs) which uses metagenomic sequences to 25 describe and define vaginal microbiomes based on both composition and function. 26 27 Results: MgCSTs are categories of microbiomes classified using taxonomy and the functional potential encoded in 28 their metagenomes. MgCSTs reflect unique combinations of metagenomic subspecies (mgSs), which are 29 assemblages of bacterial strains of the same species, within a microbiome. We demonstrate that mgCSTs are 30 associated with demographics such as age and race, as well as vaginal pH and Gram stain assessment of vaginal 31 smears. Importantly, these associations varied between mgCSTs predominated by the same bacterial species. A 32 subset of mgCSTs, including three of the six predominated by *Gardnerella* mgSs, as well as a mgSs of *L. iners*, 33 were associated with a greater likelihood of Amsel bacterial vaginosis diagnosis. This L. iners mgSs, among other 34 functional features, encoded enhanced genetic capabilities for epithelial cell attachment that could facilitate 35 cytotoxin-mediated cell lysis. Finally, we report a mgSs and mgCST classifier as an easily applied, standardized 36 method for use by the microbiome research community. 37 38 **Conclusions:** 39 MgCSTs are a novel and easily implemented approach to reducing the dimension of complex metagenomic datasets,

while maintaining their functional uniqueness. MgCSTs enable investigation of multiple strains of the same species
and the functional diversity in that species. Future investigations of functional diversity may be key to unraveling
the pathways by which the vaginal microbiome modulates protection to the genital tract. Importantly, our findings
support the hypothesis that functional differences between vaginal microbiomes, including those that may look
compositionally similar, are critical considerations in vaginal health. Ultimately, mgCSTs may lead to novel
hypotheses concerning the role of the vaginal microbiome in promoting health and disease, and identify targets for
novel prognostic, diagnostic, and therapeutic strategies to improve women's genital health.

47

### 48 BACKGROUND

- 49 The vaginal microbiome plays a vital role in gynecological and reproductive health. *Lactobacillus* predominated
- 50 vaginal microbiota constitute the first line of defense against infection. Protective mechanisms include lactic acid
- 51 production by *Lactobacillus* spp., which acidifies the vaginal microenvironment and elicits anti-inflammatory
- 52 effects [1-4]. This environment wards off non-indigenous organisms, including causative agents of sexually
- 53 transmitted infections (STIs) like HIV and pathogenic bacteria associated with bacterial vaginosis (BV) [5-7].
- 54 However, vaginal *Lactobacillus* spp. are functionally diverse. For example, *L. crispatus*, and *L. gasseri* are capable
- of producing both the D- and L-isomers of lactic acid, L. jensenii produces only the D-isomer, and L. iners only the
- 56 L-isomer [4, 8]. These key features have implications for susceptibilities to pathogens [9, 10].
- 57
- 58 The vaginal microbiota has been previously shown to cluster into community state types (CSTs) that reflect
- 59 differences in bacterial species composition and abundance [1, 11]. Lactobacillus spp. predominate four of the five
- 60 CSTs (CST I: L. crispatus; CST II: L. gasseri; CST III: L. iners, CST V: L. jensenii). In contrast, CST IV
- 61 communities are characterized by a paucity of lactobacilli and the presence of a diverse array of anaerobes such as
- 62 Gardnerella vaginalis and "Ca. Lachnocurva vaginae". CST IV is found, albeit not exclusively, during episodes of
- 63 BV, a condition associated with increased risk to sexually transmitted infections, including HIV, as well as preterm
- birth and other gynecological and obstetric adverse outcomes [12-20]. BV is clinically defined by observing 3 of 4
- 65 Amsel's criteria (Amsel-BV; vaginal pH > 4.5, abnormal discharge, and on wet mount, presence of clue cells and
- 66 fishy odor with 10% KOH) [21]. Patients presenting with symptoms and satisfying the Amsel's criteria
- 67 (symptomatic Amsel-BV) are treated with antibiotics, however, efficacy is poor, and recurrence is common [21-24].
- 68 In research settings, BV is often defined by scoring Gram stained vaginal smears (Nugent-BV) [25] or molecular
- 69 typing of bacterial composition by sequencing marker genes (molecular-BV) [26]. There is no definition of BV that
- 70 relies on both the composition and function of the microbiome.
- 71
- 72 Species-level composition of the vaginal microbiota may not suffice to accurately capture associations between the
- vaginal microbiome and outcomes of interest because functional differences exist between strains of the same
- 74 species. For example, in the skin microbiome, strains of *Staphylococcus aureus* or *Streptococcus pyogenes* elicit

75	different acute immune responses [27]. Similarly, genomic and functional analyses of Lactobacillus rhamnosus
76	strains demonstrate distinct adaptations to specific niches (for example, the gut versus the oral cavity) [28]. While
77	functional differences likely exist between strains of the same species in the vaginal microbiota, metagenomic
78	studies show that combinations of multiple strains co-exist within a single vaginal microbiome [29, 30]. These strain
79	assemblages are known as metagenomic subspecies or mgSs [29], and are important to consider as they potentially
80	impact the functional diversity and resilience of a species in a microbiome. Determining the mechanistic
81	consequences and health outcomes associated with metagenomic subspecies may improve precision of risk estimates
82	and interventions.
83	
84	To integrate the taxonomic composition and functional potential of vaginal microbiomes, we developed
85	metagenomic community state types (mgCSTs). MgCSTs are composed of unique combinations of mgSs. We
86	developed and validated a two-step classifier that assigns metagenomic subspecies and mgCSTs and is designed to
87	work in concert with the vaginal non-redundant gene database, VIRGO [29]. This easy-to-use classifier will
88	facilitate reproducibility and comparisons across studies.
89	
90	RESULTS
91	Metagenomic community state types (mgCST) of the vaginal microbiome
92	We evaluated the within-species bacterial genomic diversity in 1,890 vaginal metagenomes of reproductive-age
93	participants from 1,024 mostly North American women (98.7% of samples) (Table 1 SUBJECT
94	DEMOGRAPHICS). Vaginal metagenomes derived from five cohort studies as well as metagenomes generated to
95	build the vaginal non-redundant gene database (VIRGO, [29]) were used to construct mgCSTs (see Methods). In
96	total, 135 metagenomic subspecies (mgSs) from 28 species were identified by hierarchical clustering of species-
97	specific gene presence/absence profiles (Table S1 Subspecies). Subsequent clustering of samples based on mgSs
98	compositional data produced 27 mgCSTs (Table 2 mgCST). MgCSTs consisted of mgSs from commonly observed
99	vaginal species including L. crispatus (mgCST 1-6, 19% of samples), L. gasseri (mgCST 7-9, 3% of samples), L.
100	iners (mgCST 10-14, 23% of samples), L. jensenii (mgCST 15 and 16, 4.6% of samples), "Ca. Lachnocurva
101	vaginae" (mgCST 17-19, 7.5% of samples), Gardnerella (mgCST 20-25, 36.3% of samples) and Bifidobacterium
102	breve (mgCST 26, 0.74% of samples) (Figure 1 mgCST Heatmap). MgCST 27 (5.5% of samples) contained less-

103	common species such as <i>Streptococcus anginosus</i> or had no predominant taxon. MgCST 2 (n=39 samples from 26
104	women), mgCST 14 (n=34 samples from 25 women), and mgCST 21 (n=37 samples from 21 women), were only
105	comprised of samples from reproductive aged women in Alabama enrolled in the UMB-HMP cohort (Table 2
106	mgCST). Metagenomic CSTs expand amplicon-based CSTs as multiple mgCSTs are predominated by the same
107	species, but a different mgSs of that species (Supplemental Figure 1 Valencia, TABLE 2 mgCST).
100	

108

Table 1. Demographic information for all women included in this study. Some women contributed multiple samples.

	Number of Women	Percentage of Women	Number of Samples	Percentage of Samples	
Metagenomic Data Source	1,017		1,890		
UMB-HMP	124	12.2	515	27.2	
Li et al.	44	35.5	44	8.5	
LSVF	585	1329.5	653	1484.1	
NIH-HMP	76	13.0	174	26.6	
VMRC	40	52.6	162	93.1	
VIRGO	148	370.0	342	211.1	
Age Category	897		1,623		
15-20	283	31.5	410	25.3	
21-25	229	25.5	436	26.9	
26-30	188	21.0	362	22.3	
31-35	102	11.4	223	13.7	
36-40	65	7.2	125	7.7	
41-45	30	3.3	67	4.1	
Race	858		1,441		
Asian	54	6.3	66	4.6	
Black or African American	610	71.1	968	67.2	
Hispanic or Latino	19	2.2	47	3.3	
Other	6	0.7	9	0.6	
White or Caucasian	169	19.7	351	24.4	
Nugent Category	968		1,623		
0-3	469	48.5	931	57.4	
4-6	194	20.0	255	15.7	
7-10	305	31.5	437	26.9	
Vaginal pH Category	874		1,362		
Low(pH<4.5)	273	31.2	491	36.0	
High (pH $\geq$ 4.5)	601	68.8	871	64.0	
Amsel-BV Diagnosis	627		673		
Positive	289	46.1	308	45.8	
Negative	338	53.9	365	54.2	
Symptomatic Amsel-BV	289		308		
Asymptomatic	253	87.5	271	88.0	
Symptomatic	36	12.5	37	12.0	

Vaginal Non-redundant Gene Database (VIRGO, virgo.igs.umaryland.edu) [29], the University of Maryland Baltimore Human Microbiome Project (UMB-HMP, PRJNA208535, PRJNA575586, PRJNA797778), the National Institutes of Health Human Microbiome Project (NIH-HMP, phs000228), Li et al. [60] (PRJEB24147), the Longitudinal Study of Vaginal Flora and Incident STI (LSVF, dbGaP project phs002367).



Figure 1. Vaginal Metagenomic Community State Types (mgCSTs). Using 1,890 metagenomic samples, 27 mgCSTs were identified: mgCSTs 1-16 are predominated by metagenomic subspecies of *Lactobacillus* spp., mgCSTs 17-19 by metagenomic subspecies of "*Ca*. Lachnocurva vaginae", mgCSTs 20-25 by metagenomic subspecies of the genus *Gardnerella*, and mgCST 27 contains samples without a predominant metagenomic subspecies.

		Most Abundant mgSs	Number of Samples	Number of Women	Median	Number of Samples from Metagenomic Data Source					
MgCST	Most Common mgSs				Shannon Index	UMB-HMP	Li et al.	LSVF	HMP	VIRGO	VMRC
	1 Lactobacillus crispatus 1	Lactobacillus crispatus 1	143	79	0.17	20	2	21	63	15	22
	2 Lactobacillus crispatus 2	Lactobacillus crispatus 2	39	26	0.47	39	0	0	0	0	0
	3 Lactobacillus crispatus 3	Lactobacillus crispatus 3	83	51	0.28	9	2	15	14	22	21
	4 Lactobacillus crispatus 4	Lactobacillus crispatus 4	27	12	0.39	1	1	0	0	3	22
	5 Lactobacillus crispatus 5	Lactobacillus crispatus 5	37	27	0.11	1	0	19	16	1	0
	6 Lactobacillus crispatus 6	Lactobacillus crispatus 6	28	13	0.69	12	0	5	2	9	0
	7 Lactobacillus gasseri 1	Lactobacillus gasseri 1	16	8	0.5	0	0	1	8	1	6
	8 Lactobacillus gasseri 2	Lactobacillus gasseri 2	29	17	0.73	15	0	8	0	1	5
	9 Lactobacillus gasseri 3	Lactobacillus gasseri 3	14	5	0.89	6	0	0	2	0	6
1	0 Lactobacillus iners 1	Lactobacillus iners 1	113	76	0.7	24	0	40	2	10	37
1	1 Lactobacillus iners 2	Lactobacillus iners 2	95	79	0.53	11	7	47	0	28	2
1	2 Lactobacillus iners 3	Lactobacillus iners 3	131	92	0.44	9	10	45	19	42	6
1	3 Lactobacillus iners 5	Lactobacillus iners 5	45	41	0.57	1	0	29	1	13	1
1	4 Lactobacillus iners 6	Lactobacillus iners 6	34	25	0.8	34	0	0	0	0	0
1	5 Lactobacillus jensenii 1	Lactobacillus jensenii 1	44	28	0.77	8	1	3	10	18	4
1	6 Lactobacillus jensenii 2	Lactobacillus jensenii 2	67	39	0.71	8	0	15	15	13	16
1	7 "Ca. " Lachnocurva vaginae 1	"Ca. " Lachnocurva vaginae 1	58	57	1.48	3	0	51	1	3	0
1	8 "Ca." Lachnocurva vaginae 1	"Ca. " Lachnocurva vaginae 1	28	27	1.57	0	0	27	0	1	0
1	9 "Ca. " Lachnocurva vaginae 1	"Ca. " Lachnocurva vaginae 1	43	36	1.91	7	0	27	0	9	0
2	0 Gardnerella vaginalis 1	Gardnerella vaginalis 1	250	171	1.62	90	2	98	2	38	20
2	1 Gardnerella vaginalis 1	Gardnerella vaginalis 1	37	21	1.97	37	0	0	0	0	0
2	2 Gardnerella vaginalis 2	Prevotella amnii 4	202	159	1.79	30	0	91	3	67	11
2	3 Gardnerella vaginalis 3	Gardnerella vaginalis 3	53	42	0.88	18	5	15	2	5	8
2	4 Gardnerella vaginalis 4	Gardnerella vaginalis 4	145	106	1.21	44	0	64	6	24	7
2	5 Gardnerella vaginalis 5	Gardnerella vaginalis 5	34	17	0.83	11	1	9	6	2	5
2	6 Bifidobacterium breve	Bifidobacterium breve	16	11	0.9	5	0	1	0	8	2
2	7 Bifidobacterium dentium	Enterococcus faecalis 3	87	76	1.78	23	13	22	2	9	18
UMB-HM	P: University of Maryland Baltin	nore - Human Microbiome Proj	ect; Li et al. [6	2]: PRJEB241	47; LSVF: I	ongitudinal St	udy of the Vag	inal Flora; HN	AP: Human M	Aicrobiome P	roject;

Table 2. Metagenomic Community State Types (mgCSTs) of the vaginal microbiome are dominated by different metagenomic subspecies.

111

112

### 113 Vaginal mgCSTs and Demographics

VIRGO: virgo.igs.umaryland.edu; VMRC: Vaginal Microbiome Research Consoritun

114 *Race and Age*. Race information was available for 1,441 samples from 858 women. Most women identified as

either Black (71%) or White (20%), and the remainder identified as Asian (6.3%), Hispanic (2.2%), or other (<1%)

116 (Table 1 SUBJECT DEMOGRAPHICS). Age was also reported for 1,623 samples from 897 individuals and

117 ranged from 15-45 years old. After adjusting for between-cohort heterogeneity, certain races and age categories

118 were associated with mgCSTs (Figure 2). The vaginal microbiomes of Black women were more likely to be

119 classified as *Gardnerella* mgCST 22 (p = 0.0006) and least likely to be in *L. crispatus* mgCST 1 (p = 0.005) as

120 compared with microbiomes for other races (Table S2 STATS SUMMARY). Microbiomes classified as mgCST 6

121 were more likely to be from White women than other races (p = 0.002). L. iners mgCST 12 was most common

122 among Hispanic women (p=0.0001), and *L. iners* mgCSTs 10 and 14 were absent in Asian women (Figure 2c).

123 MgCSTs predominated by "Ca. Lachnocurva vaginae" (mgCSTs 17-19) were also not observed in Asian women,

124 consistent with previous reports on that species (Figure 2c) [11]. In mgCST 27, women were less likely to be Black

125 (p=0.01) and more likely to be in the oldest age category (41-45, p = 0.04) as compared with other mgCSTs.



Figure 2. The distribution of (a) race (n=1,441 samples) and (b) age (n=1,623 samples) categories across mgCSTs. Within-mgCST distribution is compared to study-wide distribution (\*: p < 0.05, \*\*: p < 0.01, \*\*\*: p < 0.001). (c) The distribution of mgCSTs across race.

127

128 Nugent Scores and Vaginal pH. Of the 968 women for which Nugent scores were available, 48% had low Nugent

- scores (0-3), 20% had intermediate scores (4-6), and 32% had high scores (7-10) (Table 1). Vaginal pH was also
- 130 available for 979 women and of these 31% had low pH < 4.5, and 69% had high  $pH \ge 4.5$  (**Table 1**). Both Nugent
- 131 score and vaginal pH were associated with mgCSTs after adjusting for between-cohort heterogeneity (Figure 3). Of
- 132 all *L. crispatus* mgCSTs, mgCST 2 had the most representation of different Nugent categories, with 61%, 14%, and
- 133 25% of samples having low, intermediate, or high Nugent scores, respectively (Figure 3a). Communities
- predominant in "Ca. Lachnocurva vaginae" mgCSTs 17, 18, and 19 had the highest percentages of high Nugent

- scores (7-10), (94%, 96%, and 87% of samples, respectively); and these mgCSTs were also associated with high
- 136 vaginal pH (p = 6.3 e<sup>-7</sup>, Figure 3b). Notably, intermediate Nugent scores were common among *Gardnerella*
- 137 predominated mgCSTs, especially in mgCSTs 25 (69% of samples).



Figure 3. The distribution of (a) Nugent score (n=968), and (b) vaginal pH (n=979) categories. Within-mgCST distribution is compared to study-wide distribution (\*: p < 0.05, \*\*: p < 0.01, \*\*\*: p < 0.001).

138

139 Amsel-BV and Vaginal Symptoms. Of 627 women, each with a sample associated with clinical examination data

140 (n=607 from LSVF cohort, n=20 from HMP cohort), the proportion of positive Amsel-BV diagnoses (including both

- 141 asymptomatic and symptomatic Amsel-BV) was 46%. Twelve percent of Amsel-BV cases were symptomatic.
- 142 Diagnosis of Amsel-BV was associated with mgCSTs (Figure 4a). There were no Amsel-BV diagnoses in mgCSTs
- 143 predominated by L. crispatus, L. jensenii, or L. gasseri. L. iners predominated mgCSTs 10-13 were negatively
- 144 associated Amsel-BV diagnoses ( $p = 9.6e^{-4}$ ) but contained some positive Amsel-BV diagnoses in mgCSTs 10, 11,
- and 13 (11%, 15%, 18% of women, respectively) (Figure 4a and Table S2 STATS SUMMARY). L. iners mgCST
- 146 12 contained only a single (asymptomatic) positive Amsel-BV diagnosis out of 39 women. Women with "Ca.

- 147 Lachnocurva vaginae" mgCSTs 17-19 were more likely to have been diagnosed with Amsel-BV (87%, 88%, and
- 148 89%, respectively, p = 1.8e<sup>-5</sup>). *Gardnerella* predominated mgCSTs 20, 22, and 24 also had significantly more
- positive Amsel-BV diagnoses than the study-wide proportion (69%, 73%, and 66%, respectively,  $p = 1.5e^{-3}$ ), while
- 150 75% of Gardnerella predominated mgCST 23 samples were Amsel-BV negative (p=0.09). MgCST 24 contained
- significantly more symptomatic cases than expected (26% of 43 individuals, p=0.008, Figure 4b, Table S2 STATS
- 152 SUMMARY). Though not statistically significant, "Ca. Lachnocurva vaginae" mgCST 19 also may have a higher-
- 153 than-expected proportion of symptomatic Amsel-BV cases (17.4%).



Figure 4. Clinically diagnosed Amsel bacterial vaginosis (a) and symptomatic Amsel bacterial vaginosis (b) are associated with mgCSTs (\*: p < 0.05, \*\*: p < 0.01, \*\*\*: p < 0.001).

154

155

#### 156 Functional potential of mgCSTs and metagenomic subspecies

158 L. crispatus mgCSTs differ by species diversity, stability, and the potential to produce D-lactic acid. L. crispatus is 159 known to produce both L- and D-lactic acid, which acidifies the vaginal environment and confers protective 160 properties [4, 10, 31, 32]. VIRGO identified two L- and two D-lactate dehydrogenase genes in L. crispatus. All 161 genes were present in L. crispatus mgCSTs except for mgCST 2. Samples in mgCST 2 were missing a D-lactate 162 dehydrogenase gene (V1806611) that has 96.1% identity to a functionally validated ortholog, P30901.2 (Figure 5a) 163 [33]. The other D-lactate dehydrogenase, V1891370, is found in all L. crispatus mgCSTs but only 82.4% identical to 164 P30901.2. It contains a 55 aa insertion after V101 (position in P30901.2) and a point mutation at position 218 165 (D218Y) located within a NAD binding site domain. The absence of V1806611 may have functional consequences 166 for microbiomes in mgCST 2. Additionally, samples in mgCST 2 have fewer estimated numbers of L. crispatus 167 strains compared to other mgCSTs (Figure 5b). Thus, it is likely that an L. crispatus strain (or strains) containing 168 V180661 is absent from mgCST 2 samples. Interestingly, the median vaginal pH in mgCST 2 was 4.7, while in 169 mgCST 1 it is 4.0 (1<sup>st</sup>-3<sup>rd</sup> quartile: 3.8-4.2, Figure 5c). Correspondingly, mgCST 2 samples contained a higher 170 Shannon's H index than mgCST 1 (Figure 5d). All samples in mgCST 2 contained genes from "Ca. Lachnocurva 171 vaginae", Finegoldia magna, Peptoniphilus harei, P. lacrimalis, Prevotella timonensis, P. disiens, P. buccalis, and 172 Propionibacterium, albeit at low relative abundances (<1%). We hypothesized that the observed heterogeneity in the 173 compositions of mgCST 2 might result in lower microbiome stability than mgCST 1. Using longitudinal data from 174 the UMB-HMP study, Yue-Clayton  $\theta$  of daily bacterial composition data over 10 weeks was calculated as an 175 estimate of community stability. Compared to mgCST 1, mgCST 2 samples were indeed significantly less stable (t =

176 4.073, df = 47.942, p-value < 0.001, **Figure 5e**).



Figure 5. a) D-lactate dehydrogenase orthologs in VIRGO compared to reference P30901.2. b) MgCST 2 contains fewer estimated strains of *L. crispatus*. c) On average, vaginal pH is higher in mgCST 2. d) Shannon's H is higher in mgCST 2 than mgCST 1 or 3. e) Microbiome stability is lower in mgCST 2.

178 L. iners metagenomic subspecies are associated with Amsel-BV diagnoses. The role of L. iners in the vaginal 179 microbiome is not fully understood because it is implicated in both healthy and diseased states [34]. L. iners is 180 represented by six mgSs. Predominance by L. iners mgSs 4 did not define a mgCST (Figure 1). Instead, L. iners mgSs 181 4 was present in relatively lower abundances (median: 1.2%, IQR: 1.9%) in 257 microbiomes from BV-like mgCSTs 182 including "Ca. Lachnocurva vaginae" mgCSTs 16, 17, and 18, and Gardnerella mgCSTs 19 and 24. Seventy percent 183 of samples containing L. iners mgSs 4 were positive Amsel-BV cases which is significantly greater than the proportion 184 of cases harboring any L. iners mgSs (45.8%, p=1.1<sup>e-6</sup>, Figure 6a). Conversely, L. iners mgSs 3 was associated with 185 negative Amsel-BV diagnoses (92% Amsel-BV negative, p=1.6<sup>e-9</sup>).

186

177

187 We next evaluated if *L. iners* genes were associated with Amsel-BV. Most samples in *L. iners* mgSs 4 contained genes

188 from cluster 6 (yellow gene cluster, **Figure 6b**). There were significantly more positive Amsel-BV diagnoses among

189 subjects containing *L. iners* gene cluster 6 (69.4%, p=2.1<sup>e-15</sup>), 7 (53.9%, p=0.004), or 8 (60.2%, p=0.036) compared

190 to samples containing any other L. iners gene cluster (45.8%, Figure 6c). Gene products unique to L. iners gene cluster 191 6 had significant similarity to virulence factors that could contribute to L. iners ability to thrive in dynamic vaginal 192 states. Such factors include serine/threonine-protein kinases (STPKs), SHIRT domains known as "periscope proteins" 193 which regulate bacterial cell surface interactions related to host colonization [35], CRISPR-cas, β-lactamase and 194 multidrug resistance (MATE), and bacterocin exporters (Table S3). Gene products in cluster 7 included ParM, which 195 plays a vital role in plasmid segregation, pre-protein translocation and membrane anchoring (SecA, SecY, sortase), 196 defense mechanism beta-lytic metallopeptidase, and mucin-binding and internalin proteins. In Listeria 197 monocytogenes, internalin A mediates adhesion to epithelial cells and host cell invasion [36]. Phage-like proteins in 198 gene group 8 suggest the presence of mobile elements. The presence of the highly-conserved L. iners pore-forming 199 cytolysin, inerolysin [37], did not differ by mgSs.



Figure 6. a) Clinically diagnosed Amsel-BV is associated with *L. iners* metagenomic subspecies (mgSs). b) Gene clusters present in *L. iners* mgSs. c) *L. iners* gene clusters 6 (yellow), 7 (brown) and 8 (pink) are associated with positive Amsel-BV diagnosis. Gene cluster 2 (dark blue) is associated with negative Amsel-BV diagnoses. (\*: p < 0.05, \*\*: p < 0.01, \*\*\*: p < 0.001).







Figure 7. a) The distribution of *Gardnerella* genomospecies across *Gardnerella* mgSs. b) known pathogenicity genes are differently distributed across *Gardnerella* mgCSTs.

### 213 Automated Classification of mgCSTs using Random Forest Models

- 214 Random forest models were built for each of the 135 mgSs identified and used to perform mgSs assignments (see
- 215 Methods). The misclassification error for mgSs assignment ranged from 0-30% (Supplemental Figure 2 mgSs
- 216 Misclassification Error). The error estimates for most major vaginal taxa were near or less than 10%, with L.
- 217 gasseri having the lowest (2.2%). L. iners consistently provided higher misclassification error estimates (20%)
- 218 regardless of attempts to fine-tune the model and was likely the result of high genetic heterogeneity within *L. iners*
- 219 mgSs. Following assignment of mgSs, mgCSTs were assigned using the nearest centroid classification method, as
- 220 previously used for vaginal taxonomy-based community state type assignments [11]. The mean classification error
- 221 was 9.6%, with some mgCSTs classified more accurately than others (Supplemental Figure 3 mgCST
- 222 Misclassification Error). The mgCST classifier is packaged into an R script, is available at
- 223 <u>https://github.com/ravel-lab/mgCST-classifier</u> and uses direct outputs from VIRGO.

# 224 **DISCUSSION**

- 225 Recent findings that motivated development of mgCST classification are that multiple strains of the same species
- are commonly observed in the vaginal microbiome [29], and that samples can be clustered into metagenomic
- subspecies defined by unique strain combinations represented by species-specific gene sets, and thus unique sets of
- 228 functions. These critical observations led us to conceptualize a vaginal microbiomes classification based on their
- 229 mgSs compositions and abundance, and thus defined by both species' composition and functions, *i.e.*, metagenomic
- 230 community state types. MgCSTs describe vaginal microbiomes through a new lens, one that includes both
- 231 compositional and functional dimensions.

232



vaginosis (BV) [39, 40]. Longitudinal observational prospective studies support this conclusion and present several

critical findings: 1) *L. iners* is often detected at low to medium abundances during episodes of BV, and *L. iners* 

- 236 commonly dominate the vaginal microbiota after metronidazole treatment for BV and, 2) L. iners predominated
- vaginal microbiota are more prevalent prior to incidence of BV [41, 42]. We observed the frequency of L. iners
- predominated vaginal microbiota was high in Black and Hispanic women (31.4% and 36.1%, respectively), both of
- whom experience a disproportionate prevalence of BV in the US, with reported rates of 33.2% and 30.7%,
- respectively (compared to 22.7% and 11.1% in White and Asian women) [43]. Interestingly, L. iners predominated

241 vaginal microbiota were even more frequent in North American Asian women in this study, as was shown 242 previously by Ravel et al. [1], yet these L. iners predominated vaginal microbiota are not associated with higher 243 risk of BV in these women [1]. MgCST classification provides insight into this contradiction to prevailing dogma 244 regarding L. iners and increased risk of BV. We noted the absence of L. iners mgSs 4 in Asian women, and that L. 245 iners mgSs 4 is associated with Amsel-BV, while L. iners mgSs 3 (predominates mgCST 12) was significantly 246 negatively related to BV and was most frequently observed in Asian women. This is the first evidence of 247 genetically distinct combinations of L. iners strains (mgSs) in healthy versus BV-associated states of the vaginal 248 microbiome. This critical finding points to the possibility of beneficial properties associated with some L. iners-249 dominated microbiomes that had not been evidenced previously. Our analyses also identified a specific set of L. 250 iners genes associated with positive Amsel-BV diagnoses. Macklaim et al. 2018 reported marked differences in L. 251 iners gene expression between two control patients versus two diagnosed with BV, including increased CRISPR-252 associated proteins gene expression in BV samples [44]. However, our mgSs analysis of L. iners indicates that it is 253 not simply alterations in gene expression of a common gene pool that differentiates BV from non-BV microbiomes, 254 but L. iners mgSs that also differ. Microbiomes from women with positive BV diagnoses were enriched for host 255 immune response evasion and host-colonization functions. For example, serine/threonine-protein kinases (STPKs) 256 contribute to resistance from phagocytosis by macrophage, invasion of host cells including epithelia and 257 keratinocytes, antibiotic resistance, disruption of the NF- $\kappa$ B signaling pathway, and mucin binding [45]. Bacterial 258 attachment to host cells (clue cells) is a hallmark of high Nugent scores (a bacterial morphology-based definition of 259 bacterial vaginosis) and a criterion in Amsel-BV diagnoses [21, 25]. Attachment of L. iners to epithelial cells may 260 look like clue cells and this could lead to morphological misdiagnosis of BV. These features may make L. iners 261 mgSs 4 more difficult to displace in the vaginal environment and could contribute to the common observation of L. 262 iners following antibiotic treatment [46]. Interestingly, just like L. iners mgSs 4, mgSs of "Ca. Lachnocurva 263 vaginae" were strongly associated with Amsel-BV and were also not found in the vaginal microbiomes of Asian 264 women in this study. Together, these observations may be evidence of selective pressures by the host environment 265 or niche specialization by vaginal bacteria. Sources of selective pressure could relate to host-provided nutrient 266 availability (e.g., mucus glycan composition), the host innate and adaptive immune system, the circulation of other 267 species' mgSs in a population, or any such combination.

269 Several distinct mgCSTs associate strongly with Amsel-BV. Critically, these data support the need for an improved 270 definition of BV and the importance of a personalized approach to treatment. "Ca. Lachnocurva vaginae" 271 predominated mgCSTs were strongly associated with asymptomatic Amsel-BV and contained more high Nugent 272 scores than other mgCSTs. Conversely, intermediate Nugent scores were most prevalent in Gardnerella 273 predominated mgCSTs, and only three of these six mgCSTs were associated with Amsel-BV, which suggests that 274 not all Gardnerella-dominated microbiomes are related to Amsel-BV. Gardnerella contains vast genomic diversity, 275 supporting a split into different genomospecies [38, 47, 48]. Because different genomospecies can co-exist, it is 276 likely that Gardnerella predominated mgSs represent unique combinations of genomospecies and strains of these 277 genomospecies. Greater Gardnerella genomospecies diversity is associated with positive Amsel-BV diagnoses in 278 studies using qPCR or transcriptomic data to define Gardnerella species [47, 49-51]. Our data corroborate these 279 reports and further indicate in mgCSTs with higher numbers of Gardnerella genomospecies that there are more 280 gene variants coding for virulence factors like cholesterol-dependent pore-forming cytotoxin vaginolysin and 281 neuraminidase sialidase present, thus expanding functional diversity and potentially explaining the association with 282 positive Amsel-BV diagnoses [52-54]. Enumeration of Gardnerella genomospecies may prove to be an important 283 diagnostic of certain "types" of Amsel-BV and could inform treatment options. For example, it is possible that 284 harboring more Gardnerella genomospecies may predict BV recurrence following metronidazole treatment, 285 suggesting the need for a different approach to treatment. Alternatively, some Gardnerella genomospecies may be 286 important and novel targets of therapy.

287

288 In the clinic, antibiotic treatment is recommended for BV diagnosis (generally a point-of-care test) only when the 289 patient reports symptoms, which is estimated to occur in fewer than half of women with BV [24, 55, 56]. In 290 research settings, both symptomatic and asymptomatic Amsel-BV can be evaluated. Indeed, in the observational 291 research studies included in this analysis where Amsel criteria were evaluated along with whether participants 292 reported symptoms or not, symptomatic Amsel-BV accounted for only 12% of Amsel-BV cases and 30% of these 293 were in mgCST 24 (dominated primarily by *Gardnerella swidsinkii* and *G. vaginalis*). We hypothesize that the 294 inadequacy of currently recommended BV treatment may be due to the heterogeneity in the genetic make-up of the 295 microbiota associated with BV as revealed by mgCSTs. MgCSTs reduce this heterogeneity resulting in more

precise estimates of risk. Furthermore, these findings highlight the potential importance of developing specialized
 treatments that target "types" of BV.

298

299	The mgCST framework can also be used to identify vaginal microbiomes that are associated with positive health
300	outcomes. For example, mgCSTs predominated by different L. crispatus mgSs varied in their association with low
301	Nugent scores, the number of L. crispatus strains present, and the longitudinal stability of communities. The vaginal
302	microbiome can be dynamic [57-59]. Shifts from Lactobacillus to non-Lactobacillus predominated microbiota can
303	increase the risk of infection following exposure to a pathogen. Our study identified L. crispatus mgCSTs with
304	variable stability, suggesting that not all L. crispatus predominated microbiomes are functionally similar and may
305	be differently permissive to infection. Those found to be associated with higher stability may reduce the window of
306	opportunity for pathogens to invade. Microbiome stability may be related to both the diversity of other non-
307	Lactobacillus members of the microbiome and/or the number of L. crispatus strains present. In any case, our study
308	shows that there is a range of protective abilities even among L. crispatus predominated communities. This
309	information could be critical in selecting and assembling strains of L. crispatus to design novel live biotherapeutics
310	products aimed to restore an optimal vaginal microenvironment.
311	
312	It is unclear what factors contribute to vaginal strain assemblages and what rules define their biology and ecology.
313	However, such assemblages can now be detected and further characterized using the concepts of mgSs and
314	mgCSTs presented here. The use of metagenomic sequencing and mgSs and mgCSTs will contribute to a much-
315	needed functional understanding of the role of the vaginal microbiome in reproductive health outcomes. Our
316	findings support the hypothesis that genetic and functional differences between vaginal microbiomes, including
317	those that may look compositionally similar, are critical considerations in vaginal health [7]. To aid in further

318 exploration, we also provide a validated classifier for both mgSs and mgCSTs at https://github.com/ravel-

319 lab/mgCST-classifier/blob/main/README.md.

320

# 321 CONCLUSION

MgCSTs reveal differences between vaginal microbiome both compositionally and functionally, and thus more
 finely describe the vaginal microbiome. Associations between mgCSTs and bacterial vaginosis highlight the multi-

- 324 faceted aspects of the condition and call for new and expanded definitions. Further, we provide tools for the
- 325 classification of mgSs and mgCST that have potential for use and harmonization of analytical strategies in future
- 326 studies.
- 327

### 328 DATA AVAILABILITY

- 329 The classifiers are available to accompany VIRGO output at <a href="https://github.com/ravel-lab/mgCST-classifier">https://github.com/ravel-lab/mgCST-classifier</a>.
- 330

### 331 COMPETING INTERESTS STATEMENT

332 JR is co-founder of LUCA Biologics, a biotechnology company focusing on translating microbiome research into

- 333 live biotherapeutics drugs for women's health. JR is Editor-in-Chief at Microbiome. All other authors declare that
- they have no competing interests.
- 335

### 336 FUNDING

- 337 Research reported in this publication was supported in part by the National Institute for Allergy and Infectious
- 338 Diseases of the National Institutes of Health under award numbers F32-AI136400 (JH), K01-AI163413 (JH),
- 339 U19AI084044 (JR), UH2AI083264 (JR), R01-AI116799 (RB), and the National Institute for Nursing Research of
- 340 the National Institutes of Health under award number R01NR015495 (JR). The funders had no role in study design,
- 341 data collection and interpretation, or the decision to submit the work for publication.

342

#### 343 METHODS

344 Study cohorts. Raw metagenomic data from 1,890 vaginal samples were used in this study (Supplemental File 6).

345 This included publicly available metagenomes including those used in the construction of the vaginal non-redundant

- 346 gene database, VIRGO (virgo.igs.umaryland.edu, n=342) [29], the University of Maryland Baltimore Human
- 347 Microbiome Project (UMB-HMP, n=677, PRJNA208535, PRJNA575586, PRJNA797778)[41], the National
- 348 Institutes of Health Human Microbiome Project (NIH HMP, n=174, phs000228) [60], metagenomes from Li et al.
- 349 [61] (n=44, PRJEB24147), the Longitudinal Study of Vaginal Flora and Incident STI (LSVF, n=653, dbGaP project
- 350 phs002367) [24]. All samples in LSVF (n=653) and some in UMB-HMP (n=20) had clinical diagnosis information
- about Amsel-BV. Amsel-BV was diagnosed based on the presence of 3 out of 4 Amsel's criteria [21] and

352 symptomatic Amsel-BV was diagnosed when a woman reported symptoms upon questioning [56]. At the time of 353 these studies, gender identity information was not collected. We know all women responded to recruiting materials 354 which included "women" or "woman". In addition, individuals are referred to as women in previous publications, 355 thus we refer here to individuals as "woman" or "women" to maintain consistency.

356

357 Sequence Processing and Bioinformatics. Host reads were removed from all metagenomic sequencing data using 358 BMTagger and the GRCh38 reference genome, and reads were quality filtered using trimmomatic (v0.38, sliding 359 window size 4bp, Q15, minimum read length:75bp) [62]. Metagenomic sequence reads were mapped to VIRGO 360 using bowtie (v1; parameters: -p 16 -l 25 --fullref --chunkmbs 512 --best --strata -m 20 --suppress 2,4,5,6,7,8), 361 producing a taxonomic and gene annotation for each read. Samples with fewer than 100,000 mapped reads were 362 removed from the analysis (n=59). The number of reads mapped to a gene was multiplied by the read length (150 363 bp) and divided by the gene length to produce a coverage value for each gene. Conserved domain and motif searches 364 were performed with CD-SEARCH and the Conserved Domain Database (CDD), using an e-value threshold of 10<sup>-4</sup>. 365 The taxonomic composition table generated using VIRGO were run through the vaginal CST classifier VALENCIA 366 [11].

367

368 Metagenomic Subspecies. For each species, a presence/absence matrix was constructed from a metagenome which 369 included all genes with at least 0.5X coverage after normalizing for gene length. Metagenomic subspecies were 370 generated for species present (>75% estimated median number of genes encoded in reference genomes from the 371 Genome Taxonomy Database [63], see Table S4 GENOME SIZES) in >20 samples using binary gene counts and 372 hierarchical clustering with Ward linkage of sample Jaccard distances calculated using the vegdist function from the 373 vegan package (v2.5-5) [64] in R (v. 3.5.2). Clusters were defined using the dynamic hybrid tree cut method (v.1.62-374 1) and minClusterSize = 2 [65]. Clusters were tested for associations with low species coverage using logistic 375 regression in which the mgSs was the binary outcome, the log<sub>10</sub>-transformed coverage of the species was the 376 predictor, and subject ID was used as a nested random effect which accounted for multiple samples from the same 377 subject and variations due to different source studies. Heatmaps of gene presence/absence were constructed for each 378 species using the gplots package heatmap.2 function [66] (Supplemental File 4).

380 **Metagenomic CSTs.** Using gene abundance information (normalized by gene length and sequencing depth), we 381 estimated the proportion of vaginal species in each sample. For species that were sub-divided into mgSs, the mgSs 382 proportion in a sample was equal to the proportion of the species in that sample. When a species was present in a 383 sample but with too few genes present to constitute a mgSs (<75% estimated median number of genes encoded in 384 reference genomes), it was labeled as "mgSs 0". Samples in the resulting compositional table were hierarchically 385 clustered using Jensen-Shannon distances. Clusters were defined using the dynamic hybrid tree cut method (v.1.62-386 1) [65]. A heatmap for metagenomic CSTs was produced using the gplots package heatmap.2 function (Figure 1) 387 [66]. For participants in the HMP cohort who contributed longitudinal samples, the Yue-Clayton theta was measured 388 to define microbiota stability for each subject [67]. Average per-subject stability thetas were plotted for each 389 mgCST. 390 391 Estimating the number of L. crispatus strains. The number of L. crispatus strains in a mgSs was estimated using a 392 pangenome accumulation curve which was generated by mapping the gene contents of publicly available isolate

393 genome sequences (Supplemental File 5) to VIRGO (blastn, threshold: 90% identity, 70% coverage). Bootstrap

394 (n=100) combinations of N (N=1 to 61) isolates were selected and the number of unique L. crispatus Vaginal

395 Orthologous Groups [VOGs; provided in the VIRGO output[29] encoded in their genomes was determined. An

396 exponential curve relating the number of isolates to the number of VOGs detected was then fit to the resulting data

397 and produced the equation:  $Y=2057N^{0.14}$  where Y is the number of L. crispatus VOGs detected, and N is the

398 estimated number of strains. This equation was then used to estimate the number of *L. crispatus* strain's detected in a

399 metagenome based on the observed number of *L. crispatus* VOGs in each metagenome.

400

401 Statistical analysis of the association between mgCST and age, race, Nugent score, vaginal pH, and BV. For

402 those samples with race, age category, Nugent score category, vaginal pH category, or Amsel-BV diagnoses

403 information (TABLE), the Cochran-Mantel-Haenszel Chi-Squared Test (CMH test, "mantelhaen.test" from the

404 samplesizeCMH R package, v 0.0.0, github.com/pegeler/samplesizeCMH) was used to determine associations with

- 405 mgCSTs while accounting for source study (the confounding variable). The CMH test evaluates associations
- 406 between two binary variables (*i.e.*, "mgCST X or not" and "high Nugent score or not"). Tests were done at the

- 407 subject level; if a subject had more than one sample and both samples were the same mgCST, only one sample was
- 408 used, but if the mgCSTs differed, the samples were included in each.
- 409

### 410 Construction of the random forests for mgSs classification

We constructed random forests for classification of mgSs using the R package randomForestSRC v2.12.1R [68]. For mgSs, a random forest was built for each species (n=28) where the training data contained presence/absence values of genes. Gene presence was defined as above for mgSs. We implemented random forest classification analysis with all predictors included in a single model. For each mgSs random forest, predictors were all genes in a species. Tenfold cross-validation (90% of data as training, 10% as testing) was performed wherein each training set was used to build and tune a random forest model using tune "tune.rfsrc". A random forest model using optimal parameters was

417 then used to predict mgSs classifications for the test set and out-of-bag error estimates (misclassification error) are

418 reported. The overall misclassification error is the average misclassification error from each fold and the "correct"

419 assignment is based on original hierarchical clustering assignment. The final models included all data and the

420 optimal tuning parameters determined for that species.

421

## 422 Construction of the a nearest centroid classifier for mgCSTs

Using mgCSTs as defined above, reference centroids were produced using the mean relative abundances of each
 mgSs in a mgCST. For classification, the similarity of a sample to the reference centroids is determined using Yue-

425 Clayton's  $\theta$  [67]. Ten-fold cross validation was applied wherein each training set was used to build "reference"

426 centroids and each test set was used for assignment. The misclassification error was determined by subtracting the

427 number of correct assignments (based on original hierarchical clustering assignment) divided by the total number of

428 assignments from 1. The overall misclassification error is the average of misclassification error from each fold.

429

## 430 Running the mgCST classifier

431 The required inputs are direct outputs from VIRGO [29] and include the taxonomic abundance table

- 432 ("summary.Abundance.txt") and gene abundance table ("summary.NR.abundance.txt"). It is *imperative* that
- 433 taxonomic and gene column headings match those output by VIRGO. The expected output is a count table with
- 434 samples as rows, taxa as columns, and counts normalized by gene length as values. Additional columns indicate the

- 435 sample mgCST classification and the Yue-Clayton similarity score for all 26 mgCSTs. A heatmap is also produced
- 436 showing taxon relative abundances in samples, where samples are labeled with assigned mgCSTs Substantial
- 437 differences may indicate either an incongruence in taxonomic or gene names or the need for an additional mgCST.
- 438 The classifier is contained in an R script, which is available at https://github.com/ravel-lab/mgCST-classifier.
- 439
- 440 All bioinformatic and statistical analyses are available in R Markdown notebooks (Supplemental File 7
- 441 mgCST\_paper\_bioinformatics.Rmd and Supplemental File 8 mgCST\_paper\_stats.Rmd)
- 442

### 443 **REFERENCES**

- 4441.Ravel J, Gajer P, Abdo Z, Schneider GM, Koenig SSK, McCulle SL, et al.: Vaginal microbiome of445reproductive-age women. In: Proc Natl Acad Sci USA. vol. 108 Suppl 1; 2011: 4680-7.
- 446
  447
  O'Hanlon DE, Come RA, Moench TR. Vaginal pH measured in vivo: lactobacilli determine pH and lactic acid concentration. Bmc Microbiol. 2019;19(1):13; doi: 10.1186/s12866-019-1388-8.
- Gong Z, Luna Y, Yu P, Fan H. Lactobacilli inactivate Chlamydia trachomatis through lactic acid but not H2O2. PLoS One. 2014;9(9):e107758; doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0107758.
- 450
  4. Witkin SS, Mendes-Soares H, Linhares IM, Jayaram A, Ledger WJ, Forney LJ. Influence of vaginal bacteria and D- and L-lactic acid isomers on vaginal extracellular matrix metalloproteinase inducer: implications for protection against upper genital tract infections. mBio. 2013;4(4); doi: 10.1128/mBio.00460-13.
- 4545.Ravel J, Brotman RM. Translating the vaginal microbiome: gaps and challenges. Genome Med.4552016;8(1):35; doi: 10.1186/s13073-016-0291-2.
- 456
  6. Amabebe E, Anumba DOC. The Vaginal Microenvironment: The Physiologic Role of Lactobacilli. Front Med (Lausanne). 2018;5:181; doi: 10.3389/fmed.2018.00181.
- 458
  459
  7. Ma B, Forney LJ, Ravel J. Vaginal microbiome: rethinking health and disease. Annu Rev Microbiol. 2012;66:371-89; doi: 10.1146/annurev-micro-092611-150157.
- 8. Boskey ER, Cone RA, Whaley KJ, Moench TR: Origins of vaginal acidity: high D/L lactate ratio is
  consistent with bacteria being the primary source. In: Hum Reprod. vol. 16: Oxford University Press; 2001: 1809-13.
- 9. Nunn KL, Wang YY, Harit D, Humphrys MS, Ma B, Cone R, et al. Enhanced Trapping of HIV-1 by
  Human Cervicovaginal Mucus Is Associated with Lactobacillus crispatus-Dominant Microbiota. mBio.
  2015;6(5):e01084-15; doi: 10.1128/mBio.01084-15.
- 466 10. Edwards VL, Smith SB, McComb EJ, Tamarelle J, Ma B, Humphrys MS, et al. The Cervicovaginal
  467 Microbiota-Host Interaction Modulates Chlamydia trachomatis Infection. mBio. 2019;10(4); doi:
  468 10.1128/mBio.01548-19.
- 469 11. France MT, Ma B, Gajer P, Brown S, Humphrys MS, Holm JB, et al. VALENCIA: a nearest centroid classification method for vaginal microbial communities based on composition. Microbiome.
  471 2020;8(1):166; doi: 10.1186/s40168-020-00934-6.
- 472 12. Brotman RM, Bradford LL, Conrad M, Gajer P, Ault K, Peralta L, et al. Association between Trichomonas vaginalis and vaginal bacterial community composition among reproductive-age women. Sexually transmitted diseases. 2012;39(10):807-12; doi: 10.1097/OLQ.0b013e3182631c79.
- 475 13. Mehta SD, Donovan B, Weber KM, Cohen M, Ravel J, Gajer P, et al. The vaginal microbiota over an 8- to
  476 10-year period in a cohort of HIV-infected and HIV-uninfected women. PLoS One. 2015;10(2):e0116894;
  477 doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0116894.
- 478 14. Dunlop AL, Satten GA, Hu YJ, Knight AK, Hill CC, Wright ML, et al. Vaginal Microbiome Composition 479 in Early Pregnancy and Risk of Spontaneous Preterm and Early Term Birth Among African American 480 Women. Front Cell Infect Microbiol. 2021;11:641005; doi: 10.3389/fcimb.2021.641005.
- 481 15. Price JT, Vwalika B, Hobbs M, Nelson JAE, Stringer EM, Zou F, et al. Highly diverse anaerobe482 predominant vaginal microbiota among HIV-infected pregnant women in Zambia. PLoS One.
  483 2019;14(10):e0223128; doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0223128.
- 484 16. Gosmann C, Anahtar MN, Handley SA, Farcasanu M, Abu-Ali G, Bowman BA, et al. Lactobacillus485 Deficient Cervicovaginal Bacterial Communities Are Associated with Increased HIV Acquisition in Young
  486 South African Women. Immunity. 2017;46(1):29-37; doi: 10.1016/j.immuni.2016.12.013.
- 48717.Atashili J, Poole C, Ndumbe PM, Adimora AA, Smith JS. Bacterial vaginosis and HIV acquisition: a meta-<br/>analysis of published studies. AIDS. 2008;22(12):1493-501; doi: 10.1097/QAD.0b013e3283021a37.
- 18. Elovitz MA, Gajer P, Riis V, Brown AG, Humphrys MS, Holm JB, et al. Cervicovaginal microbiota and
  local immune response modulate the risk of spontaneous preterm delivery. Nat Commun. 2019;10(1):1305;
  doi: 10.1038/s41467-019-09285-9.
- 492
  493
  493
  494
  19. Borgdorff H, Tsivtsivadze E, Verhelst R, Marzorati M, Jurriaans S, Ndayisaba GF, et al. Lactobacillusdominated cervicovaginal microbiota associated with reduced HIV/STI prevalence and genital HIV viral load in African women. ISME J. 2014;8(9):1781-93; doi: 10.1038/ismej.2014.26.
- 495 20. Tamarelle J, Thiebaut ACM, de Barbeyrac B, Bebear C, Ravel J, Delarocque-Astagneau E. The vaginal
  496 microbiota and its association with human papillomavirus, Chlamydia trachomatis, Neisseria gonorrhoeae

497		and Mycoplasma genitalium infections: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Clin Microbiol Infect.
498		2019;25(1):35-47; doi: 10.1016/j.cmi.2018.04.019.
499	21.	Amsel R, Totten PA, Spiegel CA, Chen KC, Eschenbach D, Holmes KK. Nonspecific vaginitis: diagnostic
500		criteria and microbial and epidemiologic associations. The American journal of medicine. 1983;74(1):14-
501		22.
502	22.	Scharbo-Dehaan M, Anderson DG. The CDC 2002 guidelines for the treatment of sexually transmitted
503		diseases: implications for women's health care. J Midwifery Womens Health. 2003;48(2):96-104; doi:
504		10.1016/s1526-9523(02)00416-6.
505	23.	Bilardi JE, Walker S, Temple-Smith M, McNair R, Mooney-Somers J, Bellhouse C, et al. The burden of
506		bacterial vaginosis: women's experience of the physical, emotional, sexual and social impact of living with
507		recurrent bacterial vaginosis. PLoS One. 2013;8(9):e74378; doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0074378.
508	24.	Klebanoff MA, Schwebke JR, Zhang J, Nansel TR, Yu KF, Andrews WW. Vulvovaginal symptoms in
509		women with bacterial vaginosis. Obstet Gynecol. 2004;104(2):267-72; doi:
510		10.1097/01.AOG.0000134783.98382.b0.
511	25.	Nugent RP, Krohn MA, Hillier SL. Reliability of diagnosing bacterial vaginosis is improved by a
512		standardized method of gram stain interpretation. Journal of clinical microbiology. 1991;29(2):297-301.
513	26.	McKinnon LR, Achilles SL, Bradshaw CS, Burgener A, Crucitti T, Fredricks DN, et al. The Evolving
514		Facets of Bacterial Vaginosis: Implications for HIV Transmission. AIDS Res Hum Retroviruses.
515		2019;35(3):219-28; doi: 10.1089/AID.2018.0304.
516	27.	Sela U, Euler CW, Correa da Rosa J, Fischetti VA. Strains of bacterial species induce a greatly varied acute
517		adaptive immune response: The contribution of the accessory genome. PLoS Pathog. 2018;14(1):e1006726;
518		doi: 10.1371/journal.ppat.1006726.
519	28.	Douillard FP, Ribbera A, Kant R, Pietila TE, Jarvinen HM, Messing M, et al. Comparative genomic and
520	-	functional analysis of 100 Lactobacillus rhamnosus strains and their comparison with strain GG. PLoS
521		Genet. 2013:9(8):e1003683: doi: 10.1371/journal.pgen.1003683.
522	29.	Ma B. France MT. Crabtree J. Holm JB. Humphrys MS. Brotman RM. et al. A comprehensive non-
523		redundant gene catalog reveals extensive within-community intraspecies diversity in the human vagina. Nat
524		Commun. 2020:11(1):940: doi: 10.1038/s41467-020-14677-3.
525	30.	Tortelli BA, Lewis AL, Fay JC. The structure and diversity of strain-level variation in vaginal bacteria.
526		Microb Genom. 2021;7(3); doi: 10.1099/mgen.0.000543.
527	31.	O'Hanlon DE, Moench TR, Cone RA, Vaginal pH and microbicidal lactic acid when lactobacilli dominate
528		the microbiota, PLoS One, 2013;8(11);e80074; doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0080074.
529	32.	Tachedijan G. Aldunate M. Bradshaw CS. Cone RA. The role of lactic acid production by probiotic
530	-	Lactobacillus species in vaginal health. Res Microbiol. 2017;168(9-10):782-92; doi:
531		10.1016/i.resmic.2017.04.001.
532	33.	Kochhar S. Hottinger H. Chuard N. Taylor PG. Atkinson T. Scawen MD. et al. Cloning and overexpression
533		of Lactobacillus helveticus D-lactate dehvdrogenase gene in Escherichia coli. Eur J Biochem.
534		1992:208(3):799-805: doi: 10.1111/i.1432-1033.1992.tb17250.x.
535	34	Petrova MI Reid G Vaneechoutte M Lebeer S Lactobacillus iners: Friend or Foe? Trends Microbiol
536	6	2017:25(3):182-91: doi: 10.1016/i tim 2016.11.007
537	35	Whelan F Lafita A Gilburt I Deput C Griffiths SC Jenkins HT et al Periscope Proteins are variable-
538		length regulators of bacterial cell surface interactions. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2021:118(23): doi:
539		10 1073/nnas 2101349118
540	36	Gaillard IL, Berche P, Frehel C, Gouin E, Cossart P, Entry of L, monocytogenes into cells is mediated by
541	50.	internalin a repeat protein reminiscent of surface antigens from gram-positive cocci Cell
542		1991.65(7).1127-41: doi: 10.1016/0092-8674(91)90009-n
543	37	Ramnersaud R Planet PI Randis TM Kulkarni R Aquilar II. Lehrer RI et al Inerolysin a cholesterol-
544	57.	dependent cytolysin produced by Lactobacillus iners. I Bacteriol. 2011:193(5):1034-41: doi:
545		10 1128/IB 00694-10
546	38	Vaneechoutte M. Guschin A. Van Simaev I., Gansemans Y. Van Nieuwerburgh F. Cools P. Emended
547	50.	description of Gardnerella vaginalis and description of Gardnerella leonoldii sp. nov. Gardnerella piotii sp.
548		nov and Gardnerella swidsinskii sp. nov. with delineation of 13 genomic species within the genus
549		Gardnerella Int I Syst Evol Microbiol 2019:69(3):679-87: doi: 10.1090/iisem 0.003200
550	39	Muzny CA Blanchard F. Taylor CM. Aaron KI. Talluri R. Griswold MF. et al. Identification of Key
551	57.	Bacteria Involved in the Induction of Incident Bacterial Vaginosis: A Prospective Study I Infect Dis
552		2018:218(6):966-78: doi: 10.1093/infdis/iiv243.
		(),,,,,

553	40.	Verstraelen H, Verhelst R, Claeys G, De Backer E, Temmerman M, Vaneechoutte M. Longitudinal
554		analysis of the vaginal microflora in pregnancy suggests that L. crispatus promotes the stability of the
222		normal vaginal microflora and that L. gasseri and/or L. iners are more conducive to the occurrence of
556		abnormal vaginal microflora. BMC Microbiol. 2009;9:116; doi: 10.1186/14/1-2180-9-116.
))/ 559	41.	Ravel J, Brotman RM, Gajer P, Ma B, Nandy M, Fadrosh DW, et al.: Daily temporal dynamics of vaginal
550 550		microbiota before, during and after episodes of bacterial vaginosis. In: Microbiome. vol. 1: BioMed
560	12	Ferris MI Norori I Zozava-Hinchliffe M Martin DH: Cultivation-Independent Analysis of Changes in
561	72.	Bacterial Vaginosis Flora Following Metronidazole Treatment In: Journal of Clinical Microbiology vol
562		45. 2007. 1016-8
563	43	Peebles K Velloza I Balkus IF McClelland RS Barnabas RV High Global Burden and Costs of Bacterial
564	15.	Vaginosis: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis Sex Transm Dis 2019:46(5):304-11: doi:
565		10 1097/OLO 00000000000972
566	44.	Macklaim JM, Fernandes AD, Di Bella JM, Hammond J-A, Reid G, Gloor GB: Comparative meta-RNA-
567		seq of the vaginal microbiota and differential expression by Lactobacillus iners in health and dysbiosis. In:
568		Microbiome vol 1: 2013: 12
569	45.	Canova MJ. Molle V. Bacterial serine/threonine protein kinases in host-pathogen interactions. J Biol Chem.
570		2014:289(14):9473-9; doi: 10.1074/jbc.R113.529917.
571	46.	Tamarelle J, Ma B, Gajer P, Humphrys MS, Terplan M, Mark KS, et al. Nonoptimal Vaginal Microbiota
572		After Azithromycin Treatment for Chlamydia trachomatis Infection. J Infect Dis. 2020;221(4):627-35; doi:
573		10.1093/infdis/jiz499.
574	47.	Potter RF, Burnham CD, Dantas G. In Silico Analysis of Gardnerella Genomospecies Detected in the
575		Setting of Bacterial Vaginosis. Clin Chem. 2019;65(11):1375-87; doi: 10.1373/clinchem.2019.305474.
576	48.	Ksiezarek M, Ugarcina-Perovic S, Rocha J, Grosso F, Peixe L. Long-term stability of the urogenital
577		microbiota of asymptomatic European women. Bmc Microbiol. 2021;21(1):64; doi: 10.1186/s12866-021-
578		02123-3.
579	49.	Turner E, Sobel JD, Akins RA. Prognosis of recurrent bacterial vaginosis based on longitudinal changes in
580		abundance of Lactobacillus and specific species of Gardnerella. PLoS One. 2021;16(8):e0256445; doi:
581		10.1371/journal.pone.0256445.
582	50.	Zozaya-Hinchliffe M, Lillis R, Martin DH, Ferris MJ: Quantitative PCR Assessments of Bacterial Species
583		in Women with and without Bacterial Vaginosis. In: Journal of Clinical Microbiology. vol. 48; 2010: 1812-
584		9.
585	51.	Janulaitiene M, Paliulyte V, Grinceviciene S, Zakareviciene J, Vladisauskiene A, Marcinkute A, et al.
386		Prevalence and distribution of Gardnerella vaginalis subgroups in women with and without bacterial
587		vaginosis. BMC Infect Dis. 2017;17(1):394; doi: 10.1186/s12879-017-2501-y.
288	52.	Gelber SE, Aguilar JL, Lewis KL, Ratner AJ. Functional and phylogenetic characterization of Vaginolysin,
500		the human-specific cytolysin from Gardnerella vaginalis. J Bacteriol. 2008;190(11):3896-903; doi:
590 501	50	10.1128/JB.01965-0/.
502	33.	Condensative M, Janualitene M, Lasickiene K, Zvirbliene A. Genetic and biochemical diversity of
592		Migrabiol 2012:65(1):60 77: doi: 10.1111/j.1574.605Y.2012.00040 x
594	54	Vectorial CL Vildirim S. Thomas SM. Durkin AS. Torralba M. Sutton G. et al. Comparative genomics of
595	54.	Gardnerella vaginalis strains reveals substantial differences in metabolic and virulence potential PLoS
596		One 2010:5(8):e12411: doi: 10.1371/journal.none.0012411
597	55	Koumans EH Sternberg M Bruce C. McOuillan G. Kendrick I. Sutton M. et al. The prevalence of
598	55.	bacterial vaginosis in the United States, 2001-2004: associations with symptoms, sexual behaviors, and
599		reproductive health. Sex Transm Dis. 2007:34(11):864-9: doi: 10.1097/OLO.0b013e318074e565.
600	56.	Workowski KA, Bachmann LH, Chan PA, Johnston CM, Muzny CA, Park I, et al. Sexually Transmitted
601		Infections Treatment Guidelines, 2021, MMWR Recomm Rep. 2021;70(4):1-187: doi:
602		10.15585/mmwr.rr7004a1.
603	57.	Brotman RM, Ravel J, Cone RA, Zenilman JM. Rapid fluctuation of the vaginal microbiota measured by
604		Gram stain analysis. Sex Transm Infect. 2010;86(4):297-302; doi: 10.1136/sti.2009.040592.
605	58.	Gajer P, Brotman RM, Bai G, Sakamoto J, Schütte UME, Zhong X, et al.: Temporal Dynamics of the
606		Human Vaginal Microbiota. In: Sci Transl Med. vol. 4: American Association for the Advancement of
607		Science; 2012: 132ra52-ra52.

- 59. Munoz A, Hayward MR, Bloom SM, Rocafort M, Ngcapu S, Mafunda NA, et al. Modeling the temporal dynamics of cervicovaginal microbiota identifies targets that may promote reproductive health.
  610 Microbiome. 2021;9(1):163; doi: 10.1186/s40168-021-01096-9.
- 611 60. Gevers D, Knight R, Petrosino JF, Huang K, McGuire AL, Birren BW, et al. The Human Microbiome 612 Project: a community resource for the healthy human microbiome. 2012.
- 613 61. Li F, Chen C, Wei W, Wang Z, Dai J, Hao L, et al. The metagenome of the female upper reproductive tract. 614 Gigascience. 2018;7(10); doi: 10.1093/gigascience/giy107.
- 615 62. Bolger AM, Lohse M, Usadel B. Trimmomatic: a flexible trimmer for Illumina sequence data. 616 Bioinformatics. 2014;30(15):2114-20; doi: 10.1093/bioinformatics/btu170.
- 617 63. Parks DH, Chuvochina M, Waite DW, Rinke C, Skarshewski A, Chaumeil PA, et al. A standardized
  618 bacterial taxonomy based on genome phylogeny substantially revises the tree of life. Nat Biotechnol.
  619 2018;36(10):996-1004; doi: 10.1038/nbt.4229.
- 620 64. Oksanen J, Kindt R, Legendre P, O'Hara B, Stevens MHH, Oksanen MJ, et al. The vegan package. 621 Community ecology package. 2007;10:631-7.
- 622 65. Langfelder P, Zhang B, Horvath S. Defining clusters from a hierarchical cluster tree: the Dynamic Tree Cut package for R. Bioinformatics. 2008;24(5):719-20; doi: 10.1093/bioinformatics/btm563.
- 624 66. Warnes MGR, Bolker B, Bonebakker L, Gentleman R. Package 'gplots'. Various R Programming Tools for 625 Plotting Data. 2016.
- 626 67. Yue JC, Clayton MK. A similarity measure based on species proportions. Communications in Statistics 627 theory and Methods. 2005;34(11):2123-31.
- 628 68. U.B. IHaK. Fast Unified Random Forests for Survival, Regression, and Classification (RF-SRC), R
   629 package. 2021.
- 631 SUPPLEMENTAL FIGURE LEGENDS



### 632

- 633 Supplemental Figure 1. Metagenomic CSTs correspond to marker gene-based CSTs primarily through predominant
- taxon. Dominance by mgSs is not captured through marker-based CSTs.



636

637 Supplemental Figure 2. Random forest misclassification error estimates from 10-fold cross-validation for each of the

638 species that contained metagenomic subspecies.



- 653 Supplemental\_File\_7\_mgCST\_paper\_bioinformatics.Rmd. Rmarkdown notebook with code used to build
- 654 metagenomic subspecies and metagenomic community state types.

- 656 Supplemental\_File\_8\_mgCST\_paper\_stats.Rmd. Rmarkdown notebook with code for performing all analyses and
- 657 generating all figures in this manuscript.
- 658

















0	Number of Women	Percentage of Women	Number of Samples	Percentage of Samples
Metagenomic Data Source	1.017		1,890	
UMB-HMP	124	12.2	515	27.2
Li et el.	44	35.5	44	8.5
LSVF	585	1329.5	653	1484.1
NIH-HMP	76	13.0	174	26.6
VMRC	40	52.6	162	93.1
VIRGO	148	370.0	342	211.1
Age Category	897		1,623	
15-20	283	31.5	410	25.3
21-25	229	25.5	436	26.9
26-30	185	21.0	362	22.3
31-35	102	11.4	223	13.7
36-40	65	7.2	125	7.7
41-45	30	3.3	67	4.1
Race	855		1,441	
Arian	54	6.3	66	4.6
Black or Africas American	610	71.1	968	67.2
Hispanic or Latino	19	2.2	47	3.3
Other	6	0.7	9	0.6
White or Caucasian	169	19.7	351	24.4
Nagent Calegory	965		1.623	
0-3	469	48.5	931	57.4
4-6	194	20.0	255	15.7
7-10	505	31.5	437	26.9
Vaginal pH Category	874		1,362	
Low (pH < 4.5)	273	31.2	491	36.0
High (pH ≥ 4.5)	601	68.8	871	61.0
Amei-BV Diagnosis	627		673	
Positive	289	46.1	208	45.8
Nepativo	338	53.9	265	54.2
Symptomatic Amed-2V	289		348	
Asymptomatic	253	87.5	271	88.0
Symptomatic	36	12.5	37	12.0

Vaginal Neu redundant Gene Daubane (V1000, vignigacamaryland edu) (291, die University of Maryland Belimzer Human Microbione Project (OOB 1000, PROMADBISS, PROMADBISS, 1999), 2019;77(8), die National Jacatimo of Bealth Jaman Microbione Project (OBI 1000, ph060128), Lieral, 10(6) (1990) (17), die Learningina Baist of Vignia Flore and Learnine of Dealth Linear Microbione Project (OBI 1000, ph060128), Lieral, 10(6) (1990) (17), die Learningina Baist of Vignia Flore and Learnine of Dealth Flore (CHAR) (18), ph060128),

		Number of	Number of	Median	Number of Samples from Metagenomic Data Source					
MgCST Most Common mgSs	Most Abundant mgSs	Samples	Women	Shannon Index	UMB-HMP	Li et al.	LSVF	HMP	VIRGO	VMRC
1 Lactobacillus crispatus 1	Lactobacillus crispatus 1	143	79	0.17	20	2	21	63	15	22
2 Lactobacillus crispatus 2	Lactobacillus crispatus 2	39	26	0.47	39	0	0	0	0	0
3 Lactobacillus crispatus 3	Lactobacillus crispatus 3	83	51	0.28	9	2	15	14	22	21
4 Lactobacillus crispatus 4	Lactobacillus crispatus 4	27	12	0.35	1	1	0	0	3	22
5 Lactobacillus crispatus 5	Lactobacillus crispatus 5	37	27	0.11	1	0	19	16	1	0
6 Lactobacillus crispatus 6	Lactobacillus crispatus 6	28	13	0.65	12	0	5	2	9	0
7 Lactobacillus gasseri 1	Lactobacillus gasseri I	16	8	0.5	0	0	1	8	1	6
8 Lactobacillus gasseri 2	Lactobacillus gasseri 2	29	17	0.73	15	0	8	0	1	5
9 Lactobacillus gasseri 3	Lactobacillus gasseri 3	14	5	0.85	6	0	0	2	0	6
10 Lactobacillus iners 1	Lactobacillus iners 1	113	76	0.7	24	0	40	2	10	37
11 Lactobacillus iners 2	Lactobacillus iners 2	95	79	0.53	11	7	47	0	28	2
12 Lactobacillus iners 3	Lactobacillus iners 3	131	92	0.44	9	10	45	19	42	6
13 Lactobacillus iners 5	Lactobacillus iners 5	45	41	0.57	1	0	29	1	13	1
14 Lactobacillus iners 6	Lactobacillus iners 6	34	25	0.8	34	0	0	0	0	0
15 Lactobacillus jensenii I	Lactobacillus jensenii 1	44	28	0.77	8	1	3	10	18	4
16 Lactobacillus jensenii 2	Lactobacillus jensenii 2	67	39	0.71	8	0	15	15	13	16
17 *Ca. * Lachnocurva vaginas	1 "Ca." Lachnocurva vaginae 1	58	57	1.48	3	0	51	1	3	0
18 "Ca." Lachnocurva vagina	1 "Ca." Lachnoeurva vaginae 1	28	27	1.57	0	0	27	0	1	0
19 "Ca." Lachnocurva vaginas	1 "Ca." Lachnocurva vaginae 1	43	36	1.91	7	0	27	0	9	0
20 Gardnerella vaginalis 1	Gardnerella vaginalis 1	250	171	1.62	90	2	98	2	38	20
21 Gardnerella voginalis 1	Gardnerella vaginalis 1	37	21	1.97	37	0	0	0	0	0
22 Gardnerella vaginalis 2	Prevotella amnii 4	202	159	1.75	30	0	91	3	67	11
23 Gardnerella vaginalis 3	Gardnerella vaginalis 3	53	42	0.88	18	5	15	2	5	8
24 Gardnerella vaginalis 4	Gardnerella vaginalis 4	145	106	1.21	-44	0	64	6	24	7
25 Gardnerella vaginalis 5	Gardnerella vaginalis 5	34	17	0.83	11	1	9	6	2	5
26 Bifidobacterium breve	Bifidobacterium breve	16	11	0.5	5	0	1	0	8	2
27 Bifidobacterium dentium	Enterococcus faecalis 3	87	76	1.78	23	13	22	2	9	18

UMB-HMP: University of Maryland Baltimore - Human Microbiome Project; Li et al. [62]: PRUEB24147; LSVF: Lengitudinal Study of the Vaginal Flora; HMP: Human Microbiome Project; VIRGO: virgo igs unaryland.edu; VMRC: Vaginal Microbiome Research Consortium