

3. The authors report a tracheostomy rate of 21.2%. This figure far exceeds ARDS tracheostomy rates in a global sample (13%) (9) and in the supine group of the PROSEVA trial (5.2%), study populations that are both characterized by greater ARDS severity than the cohort of Ziehr and colleagues. Tracheostomy has been shown to improve short-term but not long-term survival in patients with ARDS (9).
4. The authors registered an ICU discharge rate of 75.8%, a result that is discordant with other reports (2) and enthusiasm about which warrants caution. A common frontline observation is that patients with COVID-19 are highly susceptible to complicated hospital courses following initial ICU discharge, punctuated by returns to the ICU and a remarkable propensity for sudden death. Data about this aspect of critical illness in COVID-19 are lacking, but the ICU discharge rate reported by Ziehr and colleagues risks conveying a prematurely optimistic message.

The arguments presented herein are a call for care in adopting the results of the study by Ziehr and colleagues as demonstration that SARS-CoV-2 lung disease fully conforms to the ARDS paradigm and as the latest benchmark for ICU outcomes in this condition. Frontline experience suggests that reality lies somewhere between published extremes. ■

**Author disclosures** are available with the text of this letter at [www.atsjournals.org](http://www.atsjournals.org).

Oleg Epelbaum, M.D., A.T.S.F.\*  
Westchester Medical Center  
Valhalla, New York

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-6920-0540 (O.E.).

\*Corresponding author (e-mail: [oleg.epelbaum@wmchealth.org](mailto:oleg.epelbaum@wmchealth.org)).

## References

1. Ziehr DR, Alladina J, Petri CR, Maley JH, Moskowitz A, Medoff BD, *et al*. Respiratory pathophysiology of mechanically ventilated patients with COVID-19: a cohort study. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2020;201:1560–1564.
2. Grasselli G, Zangrillo A, Zanella A, Antonelli M, Cabrini L, Castelli A, *et al*.; COVID-19 Lombardy ICU Network. Baseline characteristics and outcomes of 1591 patients infected with SARS-CoV-2 admitted to ICUs of the Lombardy region, Italy. *JAMA* 2020;323:1574–1581.
3. Wu C, Chen X, Cai Y, Xia J, Zhou X, Xu S, *et al*. Risk factors associated with acute respiratory distress syndrome and death in patients with coronavirus disease 2019 pneumonia in Wuhan, China. *JAMA Intern Med* [online ahead of print] 13 Mar 2020; DOI: 10.1001/jamainternmed.2020.0994.
4. Richardson S, Hirsch JS, Narasimhan M, Crawford JM, McGinn T, Davidson KW, *et al*.; and the Northwell COVID-19 Research Consortium. Presenting characteristics, comorbidities, and outcomes among 5700 patients hospitalized with COVID-19 in the New York City Area. *JAMA* 2020;323:2052–2059.
5. Tuomisto TT, Lumivuori H, Kansanen E, Häkkinen SK, Turunen MP, van Thienen JV, *et al*. Simvastatin has an anti-inflammatory effect on macrophages via upregulation of an atheroprotective transcription factor, Kruppel-like factor 2. *Cardiovasc Res* 2008;78:175–184.
6. McAuley DF, Laffey JG, O’Kane CM, Perkins GD, Mullan B, Trinder TJ, *et al*.; HARP-2 Investigators; Irish Critical Care Trials Group. Simvastatin in the acute respiratory distress syndrome. *N Engl J Med* 2014;371:1695–1703.
7. Truitt JD, Bernard GR, Steingrub J, Matthay MA, Liu KD, Albertson TE, *et al*.; National Heart, Lung, and Blood Institute ARDS Clinical Trials Network. Rosuvastatin for sepsis-associated acute respiratory distress syndrome. *N Engl J Med* 2014;370:2191–2200.
8. Guérin C, Reignier J, Richard JC, Beuret P, Gacouin A, Boulain T, *et al*.; PROSEVA Study Group. Prone positioning in severe acute respiratory distress syndrome. *N Engl J Med* 2013;368:2159–2168.
9. Abe T, Madotto F, Pham T, Nagata I, Uchida M, Tamiya N, *et al*.; LUNG-SAFE Investigators and the ESICM Trials Group. Epidemiology and patterns of tracheostomy practice in patients with acute respiratory distress syndrome in ICUs across 50 countries. *Crit Care* 2018;22:195.

Copyright © 2020 by the American Thoracic Society



## Reply to Epelbaum



*From the Authors:*

We thank Dr. Epelbaum for the opportunity to further discuss our data. Dr. Epelbaum raises several important points for discussion.

Massachusetts General Hospital and Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center are tertiary care hospitals at the epicenter of the coronavirus disease (COVID-19) response in Boston, Massachusetts. As of May 16, 2020, the hospitals have cared for more than 700 critically ill patients with COVID-19. Our motivation to publish our frontline systematic observations stemmed from concern that anecdotal reports, susceptible to cognitive biases (1), were gaining significant attention and impacting practice patterns for respiratory failure (2).

As of May 16, 2020, our cohort of 66 patients had a median follow-up of 53 days (range, 48–67 d) with 14 total deaths (21.2%) (3). Fifty-one patients (75.8%) had left the ICU, and 46 patients (70.0%) were discharged alive from the hospital. Six patients (9.1%) remained hospitalized. Fifteen of 66 patients (21.2%) received a tracheostomy; 8 patients (53%) were decannulated. We agree that further studies are needed about the timing and use of tracheostomy in COVID-19 respiratory failure. Dr. Epelbaum states that reports from New York and Italy are discordant with the mortality in our cohort; however, the mortality rates are in fact quite similar. The cited article from New York has been formally corrected to reflect a mortality of 24.5% among mechanically ventilated patients. In the cited manuscript from Italy, mortality at the time of censoring was 26% for ICU patients (4). All early reports should be interpreted in the context of limited follow-up and absence of risk adjustment. However, our original report described a follow-up period which, to our knowledge, was longer than any published series outside China. We would also emphasize that the 70% hospital discharge rate in our cohort does not support Dr. Epelbaum’s statement of “remarkable propensity for sudden death” following initial ICU discharge.

Dr. Epelbaum reports that the comparison of our cohort to the PROSEVA (Prone Positioning in Severe ARDS) (5) trial reveals “unARDS-like” clinical behavior.” First, we caution against direct comparison of our entire cohort to PROSEVA. PROSEVA enrolled

†This article is open access and distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial No Derivatives License 4.0 (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>). For commercial usage and reprints, please contact Diane Gern ([dgern@thoracic.org](mailto:dgern@thoracic.org)).

Originally Published in Press as DOI: 10.1164/rccm.202005-1944LE on June 8, 2020

patients with severe acute respiratory distress syndrome (ARDS), whereas our cohort included all patients intubated for respiratory failure. If we examine comparable patients from our cohort—those with moderate to severe ARDS who were treated with prone positioning—we see similar physiologic responses. Patients in PROSEVA (Figure S2 from Reference 5) had a mean PaO<sub>2</sub>:FiO<sub>2</sub> ratio of approximately 110 when supine, prior to first proning session, with improvement to 190 at the end of the first prone session (difference, +80). Patients in our cohort improved from a median PaO<sub>2</sub>:FiO<sub>2</sub> ratio of 150 when supine to 232 during the first prone session (difference, +82).

Finally, we share Dr. Epelbaum's concern about the use of off-label therapies for ARDS, including statins. Preclinical and observational data published prior to COVID-19 suggested a role for statins for the treatment of viral infections, including severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus (SARS-CoV), 2009 influenza A (H1N1), and Middle East respiratory syndrome (6, 7). Therefore, at the time of our study, hospital guidelines recommended initiating statins for accepted secondary indications frequently present in patients with COVID-19 and not for ARDS *per se*. We agree that statin therapy has not shown benefit in unselected patients with ARDS and requires further study. We also agree that off-label therapies should ideally be used in the context of clinical trials.

Frontline experience remains critical to inform real-time patient care and shape future research. We urge the continued rigorous study of these observations to accurately inform the management of critically ill patients with COVID-19. ■

**Author disclosures** are available with the text of this letter at [www.atsjournals.org](http://www.atsjournals.org).

David R. Ziehr, M.D.  
Massachusetts General Hospital  
Boston, Massachusetts  
and  
Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center  
Boston, Massachusetts

Jehan Alladina, M.D.\*  
Massachusetts General Hospital  
Boston, Massachusetts

Camille R. Petri, M.D.  
Jason H. Maley, M.D.  
Massachusetts General Hospital  
Boston, Massachusetts  
and  
Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center  
Boston, Massachusetts

Ari Moskowitz, M.D.  
Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center  
Boston, Massachusetts

Benjamin D. Medoff, M.D.  
Kathryn A. Hibbert, M.D.  
B. Taylor Thompson, M.D.  
C. Corey Hardin, M.D., Ph.D.  
Massachusetts General Hospital  
Boston, Massachusetts

ORCID IDs: 0000-0002-8029-7259 (D.R.Z.); 0000-0003-0136-6859 (J.A.); 0000-0003-4120-3069 (C.R.P.).

\*Corresponding author (e-mail: [jalladina@mgh.harvard.edu](mailto:jalladina@mgh.harvard.edu)).

## References

- Zagury-Orly I, Schwartzstein RM. Covid-19 - a reminder to reason. *N Engl J Med* [online ahead of print] 28 Apr 2020; DOI: 10.1056/NEJMp2009405.
- Gattinoni L, Chiumello D, Caironi P, Busana M, Romitti F, Brazzi L, *et al*. COVID-19 pneumonia: different respiratory treatments for different phenotypes? *Intensive Care Med* [online ahead of print] 14 Apr 2020; DOI: 10.1007/s00134-020-06033-2.
- Ziehr DR, Alladina J, Petri CR, Maley JH, Moskowitz A, Medoff BD, *et al*. Respiratory pathophysiology of mechanically ventilated patients with COVID-19: a cohort study. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2020;201:1560–1564.
- Grasselli G, Zangrillo A, Zanella A, Antonelli M, Cabrini L, Castelli A, *et al*.; COVID-19 Lombardy ICU Network. Baseline characteristics and outcomes of 1591 patients infected with SARS-CoV-2 admitted to ICUs of the Lombardy Region, Italy. *JAMA* 2020;323:1574–1581.
- Guérin C, Reignier J, Richard J-C, Beuret P, Gacouin A, Boulain T, *et al*.; PROSEVA Study Group. Prone positioning in severe acute respiratory distress syndrome. *N Engl J Med* 2013;368:2159–2168.
- Vandermeer ML, Thomas AR, Kamimoto L, Reingold A, Gershman K, Meek J, *et al*. Association between use of statins and mortality among patients hospitalized with laboratory-confirmed influenza virus infections: a multistate study. *J Infect Dis* 2012;205:13–19.
- Brett SJ, Myles P, Lim WS, Enstone JE, Bannister B, Semple MG, *et al*.; Influenza Clinical Information Network (FLU-CIN). Pre-admission statin use and in-hospital severity of 2009 pandemic influenza A(H1N1) disease. *PLoS One* 2011;6:e18120.

Copyright © 2020 by the American Thoracic Society



## Cigarette Smoking and COVID-19: A Complex Interaction



To the Editor:

The novel severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2), causing coronavirus disease (COVID-19), has expanded from Wuhan throughout China and is being exported to a growing number of countries worldwide. Despite the fact that the main complications of COVID-19 affect the lung, the prevalence of current smokers among hospitalized patients with COVID-19 has been reported consistently lower than the prevalence of smokers among the general population for that specific geographical area (1), even if one might have anticipated the opposite. Thus, the epidemiological data seem to question the role of coexisting active smoking as a risk factor for COVID-19 pneumonia.

The data from Cai and colleagues, recently published in the *Journal* (2), report upregulation of pulmonary ACE2 (angiotensin-converting enzyme 2) gene expression in ever-

†This article is open access and distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial No Derivatives License 4.0 (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>). For commercial usage and reprints, please contact Diane Gern ([dgern@thoracic.org](mailto:dgern@thoracic.org)).

Originally Published in Press as DOI: 10.1164/rccm.202005-1646LE on June 12, 2020