

# Terahertz Spectroscopy and DFT Analysis of Phonon Dynamics of the Layered Van der Waals Semiconductor $Nb_3X_8$ (X = Cl, I)

Jangwon Kim, Youjin Lee, Young Woo Choi, Taek Sun Jung, Suhan Son, Jonghyeon Kim, Hyoung Joon Choi,\* Je-Geun Park,\* and Jae Hoon Kim\*

Cite This: ACS	Omega 2023, 8, 14190–14196	 Read Online	
ACCESS	III Metrics & More	E Article Recommendations	s Supporting Information

**ABSTRACT:** We have conducted a terahertz spectroscopic study and a density functional theory analysis of the phonon dynamics of the layered van der Waals semiconductors  $Nb_3Cl_8$  and  $Nb_3I_8$ . Several infrared-active phonon modes were observed in the terahertz region, and their frequencies were found to be in excellent agreement with our first-principles lattice dynamics calculations. For  $Nb_3Cl_8$ , the observed phonon spectra are consistent with a structural transition at 90 K from the high-temperature  $P\overline{3}m1$  phase to the low-temperature  $R\overline{3}m$  phase. Also, our study confirmed that the structural and magnetic transitions were coupled in  $Nb_3Cl_8$ . For  $Nb_3I_8$ , which is nonmagnetic at and below room temperature, no significant temperature or magnetic field dependence was observed in the phonon spectra. Our study provides an intriguing connection between the structural properties and the paramagnetic—nonmagnetic transitions in  $Nb_3Cl_8$  and  $Nb_3I_8$ .



## INTRODUCTION

The discovery of graphene and its extremely high mobility has paved the way for research on two-dimensional (2D) materials.<sup>1</sup> However, the absence of a band gap in graphene limits its applicability in electronic devices. Various alternative 2D materials with sizeable band gaps have been investigated, including black phosphorus,<sup>2</sup> transition-metal dichalcogenides,<sup>3</sup> and hexagonal boron nitride.<sup>4</sup> The majority of these 2D materials possess atomic layers bonded by van der Waals (vdW) forces and can be exfoliated down to the monolayer, thereby displaying exotic physical properties such as the valley degree of freedom,<sup>5</sup> topological band structure,<sup>6</sup> and pseudospin polarization.<sup>7</sup> Magnetic vdW materials exhibiting 2D magnetism in the monolayer or bilayer limit have recently emerged.<sup>8</sup> Among these,  $CrI_{3,9}^{'9} Cr_2Ge_2Te_{6,10}^{'10}$  and  $Fe_3GeTe_2^{'11}$  were observed to exhibit ferromagnetic order, whereas NiPS<sub>3</sub><sup>'12</sup> and FePS<sub>3</sub><sup>13</sup> exhibit antiferromagnetic order. Many of these novel magnetic materials have attracted much attention owing to their potential applications in quantum memory and spintronic devices.

In contrast to vdW magnetic materials containing magnetic elements, a closely related class of vdW materials without magnetic elements, such as  $Nb_3Cl_8$ ,  $Nb_3Br_8$ , and  $Nb_3I_8$ , have been investigated in connection with possible cluster magnetism.<sup>14</sup> Bulk  $Nb_3Cl_8$  and  $Nb_3Br_8$  were observed to be in a paramagnetic state at high temperatures and in a nonmagnetic singlet state at low temperatures.<sup>15,16</sup> Indeed, these materials have been confirmed to exhibit paramagnetic–nonmagnetic transitions at 92 and 382 K, respectively,<sup>16</sup> whereas  $Nb_3I_8$  is expected to undergo a similar transition at a much higher

temperature. Density functional theory (DFT) calculations based on a mean-field approximation of the classical Heisenberg model predicted that a monolayer in Nb<sub>3</sub>X<sub>8</sub> (where X = Cl, Br, and I) should possess a ferromagnetic ground state with semiconducting properties; however, this is yet to be confirmed experimentally.<sup>17</sup>

Despite these peculiar characteristics, little fundamental experimental research has been conducted on Nb<sub>3</sub>X<sub>8</sub> (where X = Cl, Br, and I) until recently. This class of materials have a common structure of a trimerized kagome lattice with three Nb atoms forming a triangular cluster with a net effective spin  $S_{eff} = 1/2$ .<sup>16</sup> The band gaps of Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> were experimentally reported to be 1.12 and ~1 eV, respectively,<sup>18,19</sup> thereby indicating their potential in device applications. Additionally, Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> have been experimentally confirmed to possess topological flat bands.<sup>18,20</sup>

In this paper, we report on our terahertz spectroscopic study and DFT analysis of the phonon dynamics of Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> in the spectral range of  $5-125 \text{ cm}^{-1}$  (0.6–15.5 meV), in the temperature range of 1.5–300 K, and in the magnetic field range of 0–7 T. Several sharp absorption peaks corresponding to infrared-active optical phonon modes were observed, with their frequency positions in excellent agreement with our DFT

Received:February 15, 2023Accepted:March 28, 2023Published:April 8, 2023







**Figure 1.** (a) Crystal structure ( $P\overline{3}m1$ ) of Nb<sub>3</sub>X<sub>8</sub> (X = Cl, I). Nb (green) atoms form a trimerized kagome lattice. Six X (purple) atoms are bonded to a single Nb atom in a distorted octahedral structure. The rhombus indicates the unit cell. XRD of (b) bulk Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and (c) bulk Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub>.



**Figure 2.** Temperature-dependent magnetic susceptibility of bulk single crystals (a) Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and (b) Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub>. Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> has a magnetic transition from a paramagnetic phase to a non-magnetic phase at 90 K, but Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> does not show a magnetic phase transition below 300 K. The samples have been field-cooled (FC) under a small magnetic field of  $\mu_0 H = 50 \text{ mT}$  for Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and 10 mT for Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> along the *ab* plane. The solid red line is a Curie–Weiss fit for the paramagnetic state.

lattice dynamics calculations. Additionally, notable changes in the phonon absorption spectra were observed across the magnetic–structural phase transition at 90 K in Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>. Our results provide new information on the fundamental properties of the layered vdW semiconductors in the Nb<sub>3</sub>X<sub>8</sub> family and are expected to open a new avenue for research on similar materials.

#### EXPERIMENTAL METHODS

**Crystal Growth and Characterization.** Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> single crystals were synthesized by using the chemical vapor transport method. To prepare Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>, Nb powder (Alfa Aesar, 99.99%) and NbCl<sub>5</sub> (Alfa Aesar, 99.95%) were mixed stoichiometrically with NH<sub>4</sub>Cl (Alfa Aesar 99.999%) as the transport agent.<sup>16</sup> For Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub>, Nb powder (Alfa Aesar, 99.99%) and iodine powder (Alfa Aesar, 99.99%) were mixed stoichiometrically with excess iodine. The powder mixtures were sealed in a quartz tube cylinder and placed in a two-zone furnace. The temperature gradients were 840 to 795 °C for Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and 650 to 620 °C for Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub>. This temperature condition was kept for 3 days. To check the sample quality and crystallinity, powder X-ray diffraction (XRD) measurements were performed (Miniflex II, Rigaku).

**Magnetic Susceptibility.** The magnetic susceptibilities of the Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> crystals were measured by using commercial magnetometers (MPMS-3 and MPSM-XL5, Quantum Design). Temperature-dependent magnetic susceptibility data of Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> were measured under a weak external field of H = 50 mT (500 Oe) for Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and 10 mT (100 Oe) for Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> along the *ab* plane.

**Terahertz Time-Domain Spectroscopy.** Terahertz timedomain spectroscopy was performed over the spectral range of 5 to 125 cm<sup>-1</sup> (0.62–15.5 meV) by using a terahertz timedomain spectrometer (TERA K15, Menlo Systems). Prior to the terahertz experiment, Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> crystals were thinned down to approximately 20 and 80  $\mu$ m (as measured by a micrometer), respectively, by using Scotch tape. To observe the temperature and magnetic field dependences, transmission measurements were performed over the temperature range of 1.5–300 K and in the magnetic field range of 0–7 T by using a helium-free magneto-optic cryostat (SpectromagPT, Oxford Instruments). The entire optical path was kept under nitrogen purge to remove water-vapor absorption in the ambient atmosphere.

**DFT Lattice Dynamics Calculations.** We performed firstprinciples DFT lattice dynamics calculations using the Quantum ESPRESSO package.<sup>21</sup> We used the normconserving pseudopotentials from the Pseudo-Dojo library,<sup>22</sup> with the electron wavefunction cutoff of 90 Ry and a  $5 \times 5 \times 5$ and  $8 \times 8 \times 4$  *k*-point grid for the Brillouin zone integration over the unit cells of the  $R\overline{3}m$  and  $P\overline{3}m1$  phases, respectively. The exchange–correlation energy is approximated by the rVV10 functional,<sup>23</sup> which includes the non-local vdW interaction energy. The atomic positions were relaxed until the atomic forces on each atom were below 0.001 eV/Å. The  $\Gamma$ -point phonon frequencies were calculated via density functional perturbation theory (DFPT).<sup>24</sup> Assuming the *ab* 

Article



**Figure 3.** (a) Temperature-dependent *ab*-plane absorbance spectra of single-crystal Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>. The only phonon mode of Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> observed in our terahertz range of measurement has an energy of 107.6 cm<sup>-1</sup> at 1.5 K and 103.5 cm<sup>-1</sup> at 300 K. Absorption spectra at various temperatures are shown in the inset. The magnetic field dependence of this single mode is shown in (b) at 1.5 and 120 K (spectra were systematically shifted vertically for clarity). The atomic displacements of the single mode in Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> are shown at (c) low-temperature (LT,  $R\overline{3}m$ ) and (d) high-temperature (HT,  $P\overline{3}m1$ ) phases. Nb and Cl atoms are represented by green and purple spheres, respectively. As the a and *b* directions (in-plane) are equivalent due to crystal symmetry, both degenerate modes are shown.

plane polarized light, the infrared (IR) activity of a phonon mode  $\nu$  is calculated as IR =  $I_{\nu,x}^2 + I_{\nu,y}^2$ , where  $I_{\nu,\alpha} = \sum_{\beta} Z_{\kappa,\alpha\beta}^* u_{\nu,\kappa\beta}, Z_{\kappa\alpha\beta}^*$  is the Born effective charge tensor and  $u_{\nu,\kappa\beta}$  is the  $\alpha$ -th component of the phonon eigenvector for atom  $\kappa$ .

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Figure 1 shows the crystal structure (P3m1) of Nb<sub>3</sub>X<sub>8</sub> (X = Cl, I) at room temperature. The space group of bulk Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> is  $P\overline{3}m1$  at room temperature, but its low-temperature structure, possibly  $R\overline{3}m$ , has not been clearly identified. For Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub>, the space group is  $R\overline{3}m$  at and below room temperature.<sup>25</sup> The unit cell of Nb<sub>3</sub>X<sub>8</sub> (Figure 1a) contains three Nb atoms and

eight halide atoms. In bulk Nb<sub>3</sub>X<sub>8</sub>, 2D layers (the *ab* plane) are stacked along the *c* axis, and individual layers are bonded via weak vdW interactions. The three nearest Nb atoms form a triangular trimer cluster with strong metallic bonds. Overall, there are two types of Nb bondings of different lengths: the intracluster distance is 2.81 Å, and the intercluster distance is 3.93 Å.<sup>15</sup> Thus, each atomic plane of this layered structure constitutes a trimerized (breathing) kagome lattice, as shown in Figure 1a. Each Nb atom is surrounded by six halide atoms, forming a distorted octahedron. The single-crystal Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub>(001) peaks in powder XRD (Figure 1b,c, respectively) are consistent with the reported lattice parameters; *c* = 12.268 Å for Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>,<sup>26</sup> and *c* = 41.715 Å for Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub>.<sup>27</sup> The XRD measurement was performed under the condition of the

Table 1. Calculated Optical Phonon Modes of  $Nb_3Cl_8$  in Our Terahertz Measurement Range<sup>a</sup>

R3 <i>m</i> phase		$P\overline{3}m1$ phase			
Irrep. (degeneracy)	type	frequency (cm <sup>-1</sup> )	Irrep. (degeneracy)	type	
E <sub>g</sub> (2)	R	28.06	E <sub>g</sub> (2)	R	
$A_{1g}(1)$	R	61.31	$A_{1g}(1)$	R	
$E_u(2)$	IR	97.87	$E_g(2)$	R	
$E_g(2)$	R	99.45	$E_u(2)$	IR	
$A_{2g}(1)$	R	107.7	$A_{2g}(1)$	R	
$A_{1u}(1)$	R	112.16	$A_{1u}(1)$	R	
$E_{g}(2)$	R	118.86	$E_{g}(2)$	R	
	$\frac{R\overline{3}m \text{ phase}}{(\text{degeneracy})} \\ \hline \\ E_{g}(2) \\ A_{1g}(1) \\ E_{u}(2) \\ E_{g}(2) \\ A_{2g}(1) \\ A_{1u}(1) \\ E_{g}(2) \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ \end{bmatrix}$	$\begin{tabular}{ c c c c c c } \hline R\overline{bm} & phase \\ \hline Irrep. & type \\ \hline (degeneracy) & type \\ \hline E_g (2) & R \\ A_{1g} (1) & R \\ E_g (2) & R \\ A_{2g} (1) & R \\ A_{1g} (1) & R \\ A_{1u} (1) & R \\ E_g (2) & R \\ \hline \end{tabular}$	$\begin{array}{c c} \hline R\overline{3}m \mbox{ phase } & P \\ \hline \hline Irrep. \\ (degeneracy) \mbox{ type } & frequency \\ \hline Feq (2) & R & 28.06 \\ A_{1g} (1) & R & 61.31 \\ E_u (2) & IR & 97.87 \\ E_g (2) & R & 99.45 \\ A_{2g} (1) & R & 107.7 \\ A_{1u} (1) & R & 112.16 \\ E_g (2) & R & 118.86 \\ \hline \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	

<sup>*a*</sup>IR and R indicate infrared- and Raman-active modes, respectively. Irrep. means irreducible representations. The number within the parentheses indicates degeneracy. For both phases, only twofold degenerate  $E_u$  modes are IR active below 125 cm<sup>-1</sup>.

scattering vector being parallel to (00l). In this restricted condition, only (00l) diffraction peaks were observed, indicating the high quality of our as-grown crystals.

The magnetic susceptibilities of Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> were measured by using commercial magnetometers (MPMS-3 and MPSM-XL5, Quantum Design). Figure 2a,b shows the temperature dependences of the magnetic susceptibilities of Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> single crystals over the temperature range of 2–300 K, measured under a weak external magnetic field of  $\mu_0$  H = 50 mT for Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and 10 mT for Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> along the *ab* plane. From the Curie–Weiss fitting for Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> (red solid line), the Curie constant and temperature are evaluated as C = 0.206 emu K/mol Oe ( $\mu_{\text{eff}} = 1.28 \ \mu_0$ , where  $\mu_0$  is the Bohr magneton) and  $\theta_{\text{CW}} = 15$  K, respectively. Our measurement results confirm that Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> undergoes a paramagnetic–nonmagnetic transition at  $T_c = 90$  K. The magnetic susceptibility was strongly suppressed below 90 K for Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and over the entire temperature range of 2–300 K for Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub>

(Figure 2). The strongly suppressed and temperatureindependent magnetic susceptibility indicates the nonmagnetic phase at low temperatures, except for the possible presence of magnetic impurities visible in the Curie-like tails at the lowest temperature of our measurement. Therefore, Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> possess a nonmagnetic state below 90 and 300 K, respectively, which is consistent with the singlet state of Nb trimers. Additionally, the value of  $T_c$  for Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> is likely to be even higher than that of Nb<sub>3</sub>Br<sub>8</sub> ( $T_c = 382$  K).<sup>16</sup>

Our terahertz transmission measurements were performed over the frequency range of 5-125 cm<sup>-1</sup> and in the temperature range of 1.5-300 K. Figure 3a shows the absorption spectra of an approximately 30  $\mu$ m thick single crystal of Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> at 1.5 and 300 K. Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> exhibited a single phonon mode with energy at 107.6 cm<sup>-1</sup> at 1.5 K and 103.5 cm<sup>-1</sup> at 300 K. The inset in Figure 3a shows the absorption spectra at several different temperatures. In the low temperature (LT) phase below 90 K, the energy of this phonon mode barely changed from 107.6 cm<sup>-1</sup> at 1.5 K to 107.5 cm<sup>-1</sup> at 90 K. Likewise, in the high temperature (HT) phase above 90 K, the phonon mode barely changed from 104.2  $cm^{-1}$  at 120 K to 103.5 cm<sup>-1</sup> at 300 K. The sudden frequency shift in this phonon mode occurs because Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> undergoes a structural phase transition at 90 K, with its symmetry changing from  $P\overline{3}m1$  at high temperatures to  $R\overline{3}m$  at low temperatures. There is indeed some controversy on the assignment of the latter structure for low temperatures.<sup>14-16</sup> On the other hand, these peaks were not responsive to magnetic fields up to 7 T (Figure 3b). Figure 3c,d indicates the atomic displacements of the lowest infrared (IR) active optical modes (E<sub>u</sub> symmetry) (twofold degenerate) found in our DFT lattice dynamics calculations. In both modes, Nb atoms exhibit relatively small displacements, and the out-of-phase motion of two of the six Cl atoms surrounding each Nb atom dominates the vibration



**Figure 4.** Temperature-dependent *ab*-plane absorbance spectra of single crystal  $Nb_3Cl_8$  around the paramagnetic to the non-magnetic phase transition at 90 K. Spectra were systematically shifted vertically for clarity.  $Nb_3Cl_8$  appears to go through a phase transition at about 80 K as the sample is cooled and at about 110 K as the sample is heated. Color scale bars represent the absorbance intensities.

Photon energy(meV)

10

15 (b)

16

Photon energy(meV)

10



15 300 K 10 5 1.5 K 0 20 40 60 80 100 120 Wavenumber (cm <sup>-1</sup> )	14 10 1.5 K, 7 T 1.5 K, 0 T 0 20 40 60 80 100 120 Wavenumber (cm <sup>-1</sup> )
(c) 54.4 cm <sup>-1</sup>	
(e) 87.1 cm <sup>-1</sup>	
(g) 107.5 cm <sup>-1</sup>	<b>亲亲亲亲</b> 承亲亲亲 承亲亲亲亲
(h) 111.0 cm <sup>-1</sup>	

**Figure 5.** (a) Temperature-dependent *ab*-plane absorption spectra of single-crystal Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub>. Because Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> exhibits no phase transition at or below 300 K, no significant change in the phonon energies was observed. (b) Magnetic field-dependence of the absorption spectrum at 1.5 K in Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub>. The peaks are not responsive to a magnetic field. For (a,b), spectra were systematically shifted vertically for clarity. (c– h) The atomic displacements of twofold degenerate  $E_u$  phonon modes of Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub>.

frequency (cm <sup>-1</sup> )	Irrep. (degeneracy)	type	intensity
21.95	$E_g(2)$	R	
45.13	$A_{1g}(1)$	R	
54.75	$E_u(2)$	IR	0.131
55.84	$E_g(2)$	R	
63.47	$E_{g}(2)$	R	
68.70	$A_{2g}(1)$	R	
71.89	$E_u(2)$	IR	0.070
73.70	$A_{1u}(1)$	R	
84.21	$E_g(2)$	R	
87.31	$E_{u}(2)$	IR	0.002
88.49	$A_{2u}(1)$	IR	
90.23	$A_{1g}(1)$	R	
92.39	$E_u(2)$	IR	0.440
92.41	$E_g(2)$	R	
94.00	$A_{1g}(1)$	R	
94.44	$A_{2g}(1)$	R	
96.29	$A_{1u}(1)$	R	
97.43	$A_{2u}(1)$	IR	
106.38	$A_{1g}(1)$	R	
106.81	$A_{2u}(1)$	IR	
107.02	$E_g(2)$	R	
107.54	$E_u(2)$	IR	0.126
111.18	$E_u(2)$	IR	0.017
111.26	$E_g(2)$	R	
122.89	$A_{2u}(1)$	IR	
125.50	$A_{1g}(1)$	R	

<sup>*a*</sup>The labels are the same as in Table 1. The  $A_{2u}$  and  $E_u$  modes are outof-plane and in-plane vibrations, respectively. Intensity refers to the oscillator strength of the in-plane IR-active modes.

pattern. Also, the motion of the corresponding mode in the HT phase is qualitatively very similar to that in the LT phase.

Table 1 shows the calculated optical phonon modes of  $Nb_3Cl_8$  in  $R\overline{3}m$  and  $P\overline{3}m1$  phases, respectively. We find that only a twofold degenerate  $E_u$  mode is infrared (IR)-active below 125 cm<sup>-1</sup> for both phases. The atomic displacements of this  $E_u$  mode consist mostly of in-plane vibrations of Cl atoms (Figure 3c,d). Since this  $E_u$  mode is the only IR active mode in our terahertz measurement range, we believe that the  $E_u$  mode of the  $R\overline{3}m$  ( $P\overline{3}m1$ ) phase accounts for the experimental IR peak of the low (high) temperature phase at 107.6 cm<sup>-1</sup> (103.5 cm<sup>-1</sup>). Although the calculated frequencies are slightly underestimated due to a systematic error in DFT, we find excellent agreement between experiment and theory for the difference in IR active phonon frequencies in the two phases.

Additionally, our experiment shows that the structural and magnetic phase transitions can be tracked by observing a shift in the phonon vibrational energy in Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>. To determine an accurate structural phase transition temperature, the temperature dependence in the terahertz absorption spectra was studied in more detail. Figure 4 shows the absorbance spectra around the structural phase transition temperature. A rather sudden jump in the frequency position has been spotted at approximately 80 K during cooling and at 110 K during warming. Compared to magnetic susceptibility (Figure 2), we conclude that the structural and magnetic phase transitions occur simultaneously (Figure S1). Indeed, these results pinpoint a subtle connection between the structural phase transition in Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>.

The absorbance spectra of Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> in Figure 5a show phonon absorption peaks at 57.7, 73.3, 95.3, 98.7, 114.3, and 119.7 cm<sup>-1</sup> at 1.5 K (Figure 5a). The atomic displacements are presented in Figure 5c-h. For these six modes, we find good agreement between experiment and theory. Unlike in Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>, abrupt phonon energy shifts were not observed in Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> owing to the absence of a structural or magnetic phase transition below 300 K. The absorption peaks were unresponsive to magnetic field up to 7 T (Figure 5b), and their energies were consistent with the calculated energies of E<sub>u</sub> phonon modes (Table 2) within our terahertz measurement range.

Table 2 shows the calculated optical phonon modes of  $Nb_3I_8$ in  $R\overline{3}m$  phase. The total number of IR active phonon modes is the same for two materials. However, in our experimental measurement range, which is below 125 cm<sup>-1</sup>, the phonon modes of Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> are dominantly from Cl and I atomic vibrations, respectively. Since heavier atoms result in lower phonon frequencies, Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub> has more IR-active phonon modes that fall into our experimental measurement range, while Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> has only one IR-active mode in that range. The  $A_{2u}$  and  $E_u$  modes are out-of-plane and in-plane vibrations, respectively. In addition, our DFPT calculations show that the  $E_u$  mode at 87.31 cm<sup>-1</sup> has negligible IR activity. The frequencies of the remaining 5 E<sub>u</sub> modes are in good agreement with the peak positions measured in our terahertz spectroscopy experiments. Figure 5c-h shows the calculated atomic displacements of E<sub>u</sub> modes that have non-negligible inplane IR activity.

## CONCLUSIONS

We investigated the phonon dynamics of the layered vdW semiconductors  $Nb_3Cl_8$  and  $Nb_3I_8$  by performing terahertz time-domain spectroscopy and analyzing the frequency, temperature, and magnetic field dependences based on DFT calculations. No remarkable changes in the phonon spectra were found in the case of  $Nb_3I_8$ , which does not exhibit a paramagnetic—nonmagnetic transition below room temperature. In the case of  $Nb_3Cl_8$ , a substantial change in an  $E_u$  infrared-active phonon mode was found in accordance with the paramagnetic—nonmagnetic transition at 90 K, which supports the assignment of the  $R\overline{3}m$  space group for the low-temperature phase of  $Nb_3Cl_8$ . Our results elucidate a detailed connection between the lattice dynamics and the paramagnetic—nonmagnetic transition in this important family of layered vdW semiconductors.

## ASSOCIATED CONTENT

#### Data Availability Statement

The data that support the findings of this study are available from the corresponding author upon reasonable request.

#### Supporting Information

The Supporting Information is available free of charge at https://pubs.acs.org/doi/10.1021/acsomega.3c01019.

Temperature-dependent intensity of the low- and hightemperature phonon modes of Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> (PDF)

## AUTHOR INFORMATION

## **Corresponding Authors**

Hyoung Joon Choi – Department of Physics, Yonsei University, Seoul 03722, Republic of Korea; o orcid.org/ 0000-0001-8565-8597; Email: h.j.choi@yonsei.ac.kr

- Je-Geun Park Center for Quantum Materials and Department of Physics and Astronomy & Institute of Applied Physics, Seoul National University, Seoul 08826, Republic of Korea; Orcid.org/0000-0002-3930-4226; Email: jgpark10@snu.ac.kr
- Jae Hoon Kim Department of Physics, Yonsei University, Seoul 03722, Republic of Korea; orcid.org/0000-0002-7840-3630; Email: super@yonsei.ac.kr

## Authors

- Jangwon Kim Department of Physics, Yonsei University, Seoul 03722, Republic of Korea
- Youjin Lee Center for Quantum Materials and Department of Physics and Astronomy & Institute of Applied Physics, Seoul National University, Seoul 08826, Republic of Korea
- Young Woo Choi Department of Physics, Yonsei University, Seoul 03722, Republic of Korea; Present Address: Department of Physics, University of California, Berkeley, California 94720, USA; orcid.org/0000-0003-4725-1299
- Taek Sun Jung Department of Physics, Yonsei University, Seoul 03722, Republic of Korea; Occid.org/0000-0002-0847-6746
- Suhan Son Center for Quantum Materials and Department of Physics and Astronomy & Institute of Applied Physics, Seoul National University, Seoul 08826, Republic of Korea; Present Address: Department of Physics, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI 48109, USA.
- Jonghyeon Kim Department of Physics, Yonsei University, Seoul 03722, Republic of Korea

Complete contact information is available at: https://pubs.acs.org/10.1021/acsomega.3c01019

## Author Contributions

J.K., Y.L., and Y.W.C. contributed equally to this work. J.H.K., J.-G.P., and H.J.C. supervised the project. The samples were synthesized and characterized by Y.L. and S.S. Time-domain terahertz spectroscopy was performed by J.K., T.S.J., J.K., and J.H.K. discussed the terahertz experiments. The theoretical calculations were performed by Y.W.C. All authors participated in writing the manuscript.

#### Notes

The authors declare no competing financial interest.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Work at Yonsei University was supported by National Research Foundation (NRF) grants funded by the Korean Government (MSIT; grant 2021R1A2C3004989, 2020R1A2C3013673) and the SRC program (vdWMRC; grant 2017R1A5A1014862). Computational resources were provided by the KISTI Supercomputing Center (project no. KSC-2022-CRE-0266). Work at Seoul National University was supported by the Leading Researcher Program (grant 2020R1A3B2079375) of the NRF of Korea.

## ABBREVIATIONS

vdW, van der Waals; DFT, density-functional theory; IR, infrared

## ACS Omega

#### REFERENCES

(1) Novoselov, K. S.; Geim, A. K.; Morozov, S. V.; Jiang, D.; Zhang, Y.; Dubonos, S. V.; Grigorieva, I. V.; Firsov, A. A. Electric field effect in atomically thin carbon films. *Science* **2004**, *306*, 666–669.

(2) Li, L. K.; Yu, Y. J.; Ye, G. J.; Ge, Q. Q.; Ou, X. D.; Wu, H.; Feng, D. L.; Chen, X. H.; Zhang, Y. B. Black phosphorus field-effect transistors. *Nat. Nanotechnol.* **2014**, *9*, 372–377.

(3) Wang, Q. H.; Kalantar-Zadeh, K.; Kis, A.; Coleman, J. N.; Strano, M. S. Electronics and optoelectronics of two-dimensional transition metal dichalcogenides. *Nat. Nanotechnol.* **2012**, *7*, 699–712.

(4) Watanabe, K.; Taniguchi, T.; Kanda, H. Direct-bandgap properties and evidence for ultraviolet lasing of hexagonal boron nitride single crystal. *Nat. Mater.* **2004**, *3*, 404–409.

(5) Mak, K. F.; He, K. L.; Shan, J.; Heinz, T. F. Control of valley polarization in monolayer  $MoS_2$  by optical helicity. *Nat. Nanotechnol.* **2012**, *7*, 494–498.

(6) Tang, S. J.; Zhang, C. F.; Wong, D.; Pedramrazi, Z.; Tsai, H. Z.; Jia, C. J.; Moritz, B.; Claassen, M.; Ryu, H.; Kahn, S.; Jiang, J.; Yan, H.; Hashimoto, M.; Lu, D. H.; Moore, R. G.; Hwang, C. C.; Hwang, C.; Hussain, Z.; Chen, Y. L.; Ugeda, M. M.; Liu, Z.; Xie, X. M.; Devereaux, T. P.; Crommie, M. F.; Mo, S. K.; Shen, Z. X. Quantum spin Hall state in monolayer 1T'-WTe<sub>2</sub>. *Nat. Phys.* **2017**, *13*, 683–687.

(7) Georgi, A.; Nemes-Incze, P.; Carrillo-Bastos, R.; Faria, D.; Viola Kusminskiy, S.; Zhai, D. W.; Schneider, M.; Subramaniam, D.; Mashoff, T.; Freitag, N. M.; Liebmann, M.; Pratzer, M.; Wirtz, L.; Woods, C. R.; Gorbachev, R. V.; Cao, Y.; Novoselov, K. S.; Sandler, N.; Morgenstern, M. Tuning the Pseudospin Polarization of Graphene by a Pseudomagnetic Field. *Nano Lett.* **2017**, *17*, 2240–2245.

(8) Bonilla, M.; Kolekar, S.; Ma, Y. J.; Diaz, H. C.; Kalappattil, V.; Das, R.; Eggers, T.; Gutierrez, H. R.; Phan, M. H.; Batzill, M. Strong room-temperature ferromagnetism in VSe<sub>2</sub> monolayers on van der Waals substrates. *Nat. Nanotechnol.* **2018**, *13*, 289–293.

(9) Huang, B.; Clark, G.; Klein, D. R.; MacNeill, D.; Navarro-Moratalla, E.; Seyler, K. L.; Wilson, N.; McGuire, M. A.; Cobden, D. H.; Xiao, D.; Yao, W.; Jarillo-Herrero, P.; Xu, X. D. Electrical control of 2D magnetism in bilayer CrI<sub>3</sub>. *Nat. Nanotechnol.* **2018**, *13*, 544– 548.

(10) Gong, C.; Li, L.; Li, Z. L.; Ji, H. W.; Stern, A.; Xia, Y.; Cao, T.; Bao, W.; Wang, C. Z.; Wang, Y. A.; Qiu, Z. Q.; Cava, R. J.; Louie, S. G.; Xia, J.; Zhang, X. Discovery of intrinsic ferromagnetism in twodimensional van der Waals crystals. *Nature* **2017**, *546*, 265–269.

(11) Fei, Z. Y.; Huang, B.; Malinowski, P.; Wang, W. B.; Song, T. C.; Sanchez, J.; Yao, W.; Xiao, D.; Zhu, X. Y.; May, A. F.; Wu, W. D.; Cobden, D. H.; Chu, J. H.; Xu, X. D. Two-dimensional itinerant ferromagnetism in atomically thin  $Fe_3GeTe_2$ . *Nat. Mater.* **2018**, *17*, 778–782.

(12) Kang, S.; Kim, K.; Kim, B. H.; Kim, J.; Sim, K. I.; Lee, J. U.; Lee, S.; Park, K.; Yun, S.; Kim, T.; Nag, A.; Walters, A.; Garcia-Fernandez, M.; Li, J.; Chapon, L.; Zhou, K. J.; Son, Y. W.; Kim, J. H.; Cheong, H.; Park, J. G. Coherent many-body exciton in van der Waals antiferromagnet NiPS<sub>3</sub>. *Nature* **2020**, *583*, 785–789.

(13) Lee, J. U.; Lee, S.; Ryoo, J. H.; Kang, S.; Kim, T. Y.; Kim, P.; Park, C. H.; Park, J. G.; Cheong, H. Ising-Type Magnetic Ordering in Atomically Thin FePS<sub>3</sub>. *Nano Lett.* **2016**, *16*, 7433–7438.

(14) Haraguchi, Y.; Michioka, C.; Ishikawa, M.; Nakano, Y.; Yamochi, H.; Ueda, H.; Yoshimura, K. Magnetic Nonmagnetic Phase Transition with Interlayer Charge Disproportionation of Nb-3 Trimers in the Cluster Compound  $Nb_3CI_8$ . *Inorg. Chem.* **2017**, *56*, 3483–3488.

(15) Sheckelton, J. P.; Plumb, K. W.; Trump, B. A.; Broholm, C. L.; McQueen, T. M. Rearrangement of van der Waals stacking and formation of a singlet state at T=90 K in a cluster magnet. *Inorg. Chem. Front.* **2017**, *4*, 481–490.

(16) Pasco, C. M.; El Baggari, I.; Bianco, E.; Kourkoutis, L. F.; McQueen, T. M. Tunable Magnetic Transition to a Singlet Ground State in a 2D van der Waals Layered Trimerized Kagome Magnet. *ACS Nano* **2019**, *13*, 9457–9463. (17) Jiang, J. K.; Liang, Q. H.; Meng, R. S.; Yang, Q.; Tan, C. J.; Sun, X.; Chen, X. P. Exploration of new ferromagnetic, semiconducting and biocompatible  $Nb_3X_8$  (X = Cl, Br or I) monolayers with considerable visible and infrared light absorption. *Nanoscale* **2017**, *9*, 2992–3001.

(18) Sun, Z. Y.; Zhou, H.; Wang, C. X.; Kumar, S.; Geng, D. Y.; Yue, S. S.; Han, X.; Haraguchi, Y.; Shimada, K.; Cheng, P.; Chen, L.; Shi, Y. G.; Wu, K. H.; Meng, S.; Feng, B. J. Observation of Topological Flat Bands in the Kagome Semiconductor Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>. *Nano Lett.* **2022**, *22*, 4596–4602.

(19) Oh, S.; Choi, K. H.; Chae, S.; Kim, B. J.; Jeong, B. J.; Lee, S. H.; Jeon, J.; Kim, Y.; Nanda, S. S.; Shi, L.; Yi, D. K.; Lee, J. H.; Yu, H. K.; Choi, J. Y. Large-area synthesis of van der Waals two-dimensional material  $Nb_3I_8$  and its infrared detection applications. *J. Alloys Compd.* **2020**, *831*, 154877.

(20) Regmi, S.; Fernando, T. W.; Zhao, Y.; Sakhya, A. P.; Dhakal, G.; Elius, I. B.; Vazquez, H.; Denlinger, J. D.; Yang, J.; Chu, J.-H., Spectroscopic evidence of flat bands in breathing kagome semiconductor Nb<sub>3</sub>I<sub>8</sub>. **2022**, arXiv:2203.10547. arXiv preprint.

(21) Giannozzi, P.; Baroni, S.; Bonini, N.; Calandra, M.; Car, R.; Cavazzoni, C.; Ceresoli, D.; Chiarotti, G. L.; Cococcioni, M.; Dabo, I.; Dal Corso, A.; de Gironcoli, S.; Fabris, S.; Fratesi, G.; Gebauer, R.; Gerstmann, U.; Gougoussis, C.; Kokalj, A.; Lazzeri, M.; Martin-Samos, L.; Marzari, N.; Mauri, F.; Mazzarello, R.; Paolini, S.; Pasquarello, A.; Paulatto, L.; Sbraccia, C.; Scandolo, S.; Sclauzero, G.; Seitsonen, A. P.; Smogunov, A.; Umari, P.; Wentzcovitch, R. M. QUANTUM ESPRESSO: a modular and open-source software project for quantum simulations of materials. *J. Phys.: Condens. Matter* **2009**, *21*, 395502.

(22) van Setten, M. J.; Giantomassi, M.; Bousquet, E.; Verstraete, M. J.; Hamann, D. R.; Gonze, X.; Rignanese, G. M. The PSEUDODOJO: Training and grading a 85 element optimized norm-conserving pseudopotential table. *Comput. Phys. Commun.* **2018**, *226*, 39–54.

(23) Sabatini, R.; Gorni, T.; de Gironcoli, S. Nonlocal van der Waals density functional made simple and efficient. *Phys. Rev. B: Condens. Matter Mater. Phys.* **2013**, *87*, 041108.

(24) Baroni, S.; de Gironcoli, S.; Dal Corso, A.; Giannozzi, P. Phonons and related crystal properties from density-functional perturbation theory. *Rev. Mod. Phys.* **2001**, *73*, 515–562.

(25) Hulliger, F. Structural Chemistry of Layer-Type Phases; Springer Science & Business Media, 1976.

(26) Magonov, S. N.; Zoennchen, P.; Rotter, H.; Cantow, H. J.; Thiele, G.; Ren, J.; Whangbo, M. H. Scanning tunneling and atomic force microscopy study of layered transition-metal halides  $Nb_3X_8$  (X = Cl, Br, I). J. Am. Chem. Soc. **1993**, 115, 2495–2503.

(27) Simon, A.; Von Schnering, H. G.  $\beta$ -Nb<sub>3</sub>Br<sub>8</sub> und  $\beta$ -Nb<sub>3</sub>J<sub>8</sub> darstellung, eigenschaften und struktur. J. Less-Common Met. **1966**, 11, 31–46.