

LETTER TO THE EDITOR**The Swiss approach to the COVID-19 outbreak**

To the Editor:

Angelico et al described the impact of the novel coronavirus (COVID-19) outbreak on organ transplantation in Italy,¹ where only one center in Milan has limited transplant activity to most urgent cases. The rest of the country continued with the regular allocation policy.¹ In Switzerland, which has more COVID-19 cases per capita than Italy,² we have opted for a stepwise approach³:

1. Stop live donor transplantations;
2. Stop pancreas and islet transplants;
3. Stop deceased donor kidney transplants;
4. A tailored approach to urgent status transplants;
5. Only urgent transplants to be performed;
6. Stop all transplants.

In Geneva, a regional hotspot,² we halted all transplantation activity, except for urgent cases (level 5). Less affected centers have continued their activity at level 4 (Table 1). Overall, the number of transplanted organs in March has decreased to 26 (–38% compared to the monthly average of 2019). Our projections indicate a 26% decrease of the transplantation activity in 2020 (estimated 368 vs 501 organs in 2019). Between February and March 2020, the decrease in transplantations already led to an increase in median waiting time of 21.2% and 40.2% for kidney and liver transplant candidates, respectively.⁴

This development is concerning on two levels. Firstly, the increase in waiting time will likely increase the waitlist mortality after the pandemic. This raises the question whether it is ethical to trade-off immediate COVID-19-related mortality for a projected increase in waitlist mortality. Jeopardizing the survival of patients on the waiting list cannot be an acceptable long-term option but might be inevitable in the short-term. In extreme situations, requiring triage of resources and delaying access to a life-saving organ is also a triage decision. However, a staged resumption of transplantation activity, once the pandemic has reached a plateau, is essential. Secondly, in a setting where transplantation activity is significantly reduced, patients with a Model End Stage Liver Disease (MELD) exception will inevitably gain points merely by waiting. It is crucial to avoid putting patients with a true laboratory MELD at a disadvantage in the post-COVID-19 period.

Regarding testing, we disagree that it should be limited to areas affected by COVID-19.⁵ The past few weeks have shown

how dynamic the epidemiological situation is. We cannot take risks and expose transplanted patients to an unknown hazard. In the current setting, we would prefer to transplant patients who already developed an immunity against SARS CoV2, as they are likely protected against COVID-19 in the short term. We therefore advocate for serological testing of waitlisted patients and wide molecular testing of all patients immediately before transplantation. However, one also needs to consider the limitations of serological testing, of which the specificity (cross-reactivity with other coronaviruses) and sensitivity still have to be determined.

Overall, we suggest the decision to halt transplantation activity must be integrated in a global public health perspective and taken only when absolutely necessary. Furthermore, we advocate for broad testing of donors and recipients, even in regions that are not COVID-19 hotspots.

KEYWORDS

critical care/intensive care management, editorial/personal viewpoint, epidemiology, guidelines, infection and infectious agents – viral, infectious disease, law/legislation, organ procurement and allocation, waitlist management

DISCLOSURE

The authors of this manuscript have no conflicts of interest to disclose as described by the *American Journal of Transplantation*.

Beat Moeckli¹ 

Andrea Peloso¹

Graziano Oldani¹ 

Lorenzo A. Orci¹

Vanessa Banz²

Philipp Dutkowski³

Christian Toso¹

Thierry Berney¹ 

¹Divisions of Transplantation and Visceral Surgery, Department of Surgery, University of Geneva Hospitals and School of Medicine, Geneva, Switzerland

²Department of Visceral Surgery and Medicine, Inselspital, University Hospital Bern, Bern, Switzerland

³Department of Surgery and Transplantation, University Hospital Zurich, Zurich, Switzerland

| | Change of transplantation activity in March 2020 ^a | COVID infection rate ^{1,2b} | Patients in ICU care ^{2c} |
|--------|---|--------------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| Geneva | -100% | 8441 | 94.19 |
| Zurich | -6% | 1905 | 32.83 |
| Bern | -50% | 1290 | 31.88 |
| Italy | -25% | 2307 | 66.16 |

TABLE 1 Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on liver transplantation activity in Switzerland

^aCompared to the average monthly number of liver transplantations in 2019.

^bConfirmed cases/million inhabitants.

^cPatients treated in ICU/million inhabitants.

Correspondence

Andrea Peloso

Email: andrea.peloso@hcuge.ch

Beat Moeckli and Andrea Peloso contributed equally.

ORCID

Beat Moeckli  <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9020-8416>

Graziano Oldani  <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6637-0675>

Thierry Berney  <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4230-9378>

REFERENCES

1. Angelico R, Trapani S, Manzia TM, Lombardini L, Tisone G, Cardillo M. The COVID-19 outbreak in Italy: initial implications for organ transplantation programs [published online ahead of print 2020]. *Am J Transplant*. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ajt.15904>.
2. COVID-19 Information for Switzerland. 2020. <https://www.coronadata.ch/>.
3. Ahn C, Amer H, Anglicheau D, et al. Global transplantation COVID report March 2020 [published online ahead of print 2020]. *Transplantation*. <https://doi.org/10.1097/TP.0000000000003258>.
4. Swisstransplant. Monthly analysis (COVID-19): key figures regarding organ transplantation in Switzerland. <https://www.swisstransplant.org/en/information-material/for-professionals/information-about-the-coronavirus/monthly-reports/>. Published 2020. Accessed April 9, 2020.
5. Guidance on Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) for Transplant Clinicians. <https://tts.org/tid-about/tid-presidents-message/23-tid/tid-news/657-tid-update-and-guidance-on-2019-novel-coronavirus-2019-ncov-for-transplant-id-clinicians>. Accessed April 9, 2020.