Contents lists available at ScienceDirect



# **Biotechnology Reports**

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/btre



]

# AlgalTextile - a new biohybrid material for wastewater treatment

Anna Melnikova<sup>a,\*</sup>, Zorigto Namsaraev<sup>a,e,f</sup>, Anastasia Komova<sup>a</sup>, Isabel Meuser<sup>b</sup>, Marion Roeb<sup>b</sup>, Barbara Ackermann<sup>b,c</sup>, Holger Klose<sup>b,d</sup>, Christina M. Kuchendorf<sup>b,\*\*</sup>

<sup>a</sup> National Research Center 'Kurchatov Institute', Russian Federation, 1, Akademika Kurchatova pl., Moscow, 123182, Russia

<sup>b</sup> Institute of Bio- and Geosciences, IBG-2, Forschungszentrum Jülich GmbH, Wilhelm-Johnen-Str., Jülich, 52428 Germany

<sup>c</sup> Stadt Erftstadt, Holzdamm 10, Erftstadt, 50374 Germany

<sup>d</sup> Institute for Biology I, RWTH Aachen University, Worringer Weg 3, 52074 Aachen, Germany

<sup>e</sup> Tomsk state university, Lenin prosp. 36, Tomsk, 634050 Russia

<sup>f</sup> Moscow Institute of Physics and Technology, Institutskiy per. 9, 141701 Dolgoprudny, Moscow Region, Russia

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: AlgalTextile Microalgae Phosphorus Nitrogen Wastewater treatment

# ABSTRACT

Efficient nutrient extraction from wastewater and reuse as bio-fertilizer is an important task for reducing anthropogenic load toward circular economy. Inspired by microbial mats and biofilms, we developed a new material AlgalTextile (AT) that effectively absorbs nutrients from a medium. AT consists of three fully organic components: microalgae, alginate and textile. AT sequestered up to 99% of phosphorus (P-PO<sub>4</sub>) and 76% of total bound nitrogen from a medium. The uptake rate of phosphorus and nitrogen by AT was highest among all methods using photosynthetic microorganisms, but lower than EBPR and physicochemical methods for phosphorus removal, and anammox and denitrifying bacteria for nitrogen removal. Advantages of AT are its easy production, possibility of seasonal use and utilization as fertilizer. AT as biofertilizer for cress resulted in 35% greater length compared to the control. This outlines a promising technique for seasonal wastewater treatment, improving soil fertility and treatment of polluted surface runoff.

# 1. Introduction

Nowadays it is necessary to develop methods to reuse nitrogen and phosphorus from wastewater, as these elements cause eutrophication of water bodies [1], and phosphorus is an exhaustible resource. The demand of phosphorus as an essential element in agriculture is steadily growing because of a constant increase in food production for the world's growing population [2]. When phosphorous fertilizers are applied to the fields, up to 66% is washed off into ground waters [3] leading to the release into water bodies and the initiation of eutrophication. Given that phosphorus is a non-renewable resource [4], the economic need to recycle it increases as the cost of its mining continues to rise [5]. Cost-effective use of harvested biomass is crucial for the development of a circular economy in wastewater treatment [6].

The cultivation of photosynthetic micro-organisms using wastewater as a nutrient medium is a promising alternative to traditional treatment methods for municipal, industrial or agricultural wastewater [7–9]. Microalgae are able to efficiently accumulate nutrients from water. Their biomass can be a valuable product and used for various purposes [10]: fertilizer, additives in animal feed, biofuel, etc. [11,12].

One of the main problems for the reuse of microalgal biomass as a bio-fertilizer is the low microalgae harvesting efficiency. Various methods are used for harvesting of microalgae (centrifugation, sedimentation with ballast agents, flocculation, flotation, etc. [13,14]). The most cost-effective method up to date is passive cell sedimentation [10]. Nevertheless, microalgal biomass harvesting is still a quite expensive and time-consuming process [15]. There is need for a method that would enable efficient absorption of nutrients, but at the same time allow for convenient collection of biomass and further use in the form of biofertilizer.

Inspiration by a natural process could help to achieve these goals. Microbial mats and biofilms develop on the surface of the littoral part of lakes and in the water flows of hydrothermal springs. They are highly productive, actively participate in the cycling of nutrients and can reach a thickness of several centimeters [16,17]. Microbial mats are thought to have dominated the Earth's surface during the Precambrian and served as a basis of ancient ecosystems [18]. Modern technologies make it possible to exploit the high microbial activity of microbial mats and

\* Corresponding author.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.btre.2021.e00698

Received 6 November 2021; Received in revised form 16 December 2021; Accepted 28 December 2021 Available online 29 December 2021 2215-017X/© 2022 The Authors. Published by Elsevier B.V. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

<sup>\*\*</sup> Corresponding author.

E-mail addresses: annfairstar@mail.ru (A. Melnikova), c.kuchendorf@fz-juelich.de (C.M. Kuchendorf).

#### A. Melnikova et al.

biofilms and enhance their mechanical properties through the use of modern materials.

In order to increase the efficiency of wastewater treatment using microalgal biomass and its further utilization, we have developed a new nature-inspired biomaterial called AlgalTextile (AT). AT is made from natural materials: microalgae immobilized in alginate gel are attached to organic textile. This approach achieves a high rate of nutrient uptake by microalgae combined with the convenience of simplified biomass collection after use. We also tested the possibility of using the resulting material as a bio-fertilizer for plant growth.

# 2. Methods

# 2.1. Preparation of the inoculum for the experiments

A culture of the microalgae Chlorella sorokiniana IPPAS C-1 kindly provided by IPPAS collection of microalgae and cyanobacteria of Timiryazev Institute of Plant Physiology of the Russian Academy of Sciences was used. Microalgae were grown in 500 ml Erlenmeyer flasks on medium adapted from [19], in the following called "Trebon" medium (g/L): KNO<sub>3</sub> 3.68, MgSO<sub>4×</sub>7H<sub>2</sub>O 0.2, KH<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub> 0.23, CaCl<sub>2</sub> 0.086, H<sub>3</sub>BO<sub>3</sub>  $MnCl_{2}4H_{2}O = 0.003294$ ,  $ZnSO_{4}7H_{2}O$ 0.000833, 0.002678. (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>6</sub>Mo<sub>7</sub>O<sub>24×</sub>4H<sub>2</sub>O 0.000171, NH<sub>4</sub>VO<sub>3</sub> 0.000014, CoSO<sub>4×</sub>7H<sub>2</sub>O 0.000617, CuSO<sub>4×</sub>5H<sub>2</sub>O 0.000945) on ELMI orbital shaker DOS-20 L at 120 rpm at 25 °C and 3200 lux illumination (40µmol\*m<sup>2</sup>\*s<sup>-1</sup>; KingLED plant lamps located at the height of 1 m above the working surface). Biomass of C. sorokiniana C-1 was collected for experiments at the end of exponential growth phase. Besides, 15 ml of C. sorokiniana C-1 suspension with  $\Delta OD_{(680-720)} = 0.045 (2.25 \times 10^{-5} \text{ g of cells/ml of alginate) was$ centrifuged and the pellet was used to make 1 stripe of AT.

# 2.2. Experimental cultivation conditions

The illumination in all experiments was 3200 lux. No additional aeration of the nutrient medium during the experiments was carried out. The temperature was 25 °C. For all experiments the medium described above was used. For the comparison of nitrogen and phosphorus uptake by AT at different medium concentrations, the same modified medium concentrated by a factor of 2, 3 and 5 was used. For all experiments, 300 ml of nutrient medium was used.

# 2.3. AlgalTextile production

To make one AT stripe, 45 ml of a 2% alginate solution in water was used. An inoculum of *C. sorokiniana* C-1 (for concentration see 2.1) was added to the solution and mixed to reach the even distribution. The resulting gel was then applied to a 93  $\times$  450 mm stripe of cotton textile and sprayed with a 2% anhydrous CaCl<sub>2</sub> solution to polymerize. The AT was then placed in a mini-photobioreactor (mini-PBR) and fixed on top with magnets (Fig. 1b, 1d). At the end of each experiment with AT, the nutrient medium was microscopically examined for free microalgae cells.

# 2.4. AlgalTextile drying

The stripes of AT were prepared in the same way as in 1.3 and then left on the laboratory table under ambient conditions for 28 days to dry. At the beginning of the experiment with dried AT, the dried stripes were placed in the mini-PBR without any further modification.

# 2.5. Preparation of alginate beads

Alginate beads were used as control to immobilize the cells of *C. sorokiniana* C-1. To prepare alginate beads, 45 ml of a 2% solution of alginate in water was used [20]. A pellet of inoculum was added to the alginate and the microorganisms were mixed into the gel. The gel with



**Fig. 1.** – AT and alginate beads at the start and in the end of the experiment. 1a - alginate beads at day 0; 1b - AT at day 0; 1c - alginate beads at day 10; 1d - AT at day 10.

microorganisms was then placed in a syringe with a silicone tube. The gel droplets were released into a container with a 2% CaCl<sub>2</sub> water solution where the droplets were polymerized to form beads about 4 mm in diameter. The beads were collected and placed in 9 cm Petri dishes with 3 mm holes melted on the side of the dishes to allow the nutrient medium to pass freely. The dishes were then placed in a mini-PBR and fixed with a synthetic rubber Terostat IX (Fig. 1a, 1c).

# 2.6. Preparation of suspension

To prepare an experiment with a *C. sorokiniana* C-1 suspension, an inoculum pellet was distributed in 350 ml of modified "Trebon" medium and added to the mini-PBR for free circulation at a speed of 200 L/h.

#### 2.7. Mini-photobioreactor for model wastewater treatment

For experiments under conditions simulating wastewater treatment we developed an open-type horizontal photobioreactor. Sheets of 5 mm thick clear polymethyl methacrylate (PMMA) were laser-cut and glued together with plastic adhesive. The flat working surface was inclined at an angle of  $15^{\circ}$  The nutrient medium flowed from the top to the bottom of the working surface into the medium collecting tank, from where it was pumped through silicon tubes to the top of the working surface at a speed of 200 L/h. Worktop length was 50 cm and width 9.5 cm. The volume of the collection tank was 500 ml, and 350 ml of nutrient medium was used for convenience. All experiments were performed in triplicate. One photobioreactor comprises three lines of working surfaces for easy experimentation in three replicates.

# 2.8. Nitrogen and phosphorus measurement in the nutrient medium

Samples were taken daily from each replicate to determine the amount of total nitrogen bound  $(TN_b)$  and phosphate phosphorus (P-PO<sub>4</sub>) in the nutrient medium. The measurements were made using LCK349 and LCK138 cuvette tests (Hach Lange GmbH, Germany) in accordance with the manufacturer's instructions [21].

# 2.9. Measuring the chlorophyll content of AlgalTextile

To measure the amount of chlorophyll *a* contained in AT, the samples of the gel part of AT of  $2 \times 10^{-8}$  m<sup>3</sup> were frozen at -80 °C for 15 min. 200 µl acetone with 0.004 g 4MgCO<sub>3</sub>•Mg(OH)<sub>2 ×</sub> 5H<sub>2</sub>O was added to each sample. Then samples were placed in a homogenizer TissueLyser II from QIAGEN with 5 mm metal ball for 1.5 min at 30/s frequency. The total volume of each sample was added to 6 ml acetone and centrifuged for 5 min at 4500 rpm at 4 °C, the OD of the supernatant was measured at 645, 662 and 710 nm. The calculation of the amount of chlorophyll *a* in the samples was performed according to [22].

# 2.10. Cress growing with biomass-loaded AlgalTextile fertilizer

The seeds of cress Lepidium sativum were obtained from "Frankonia Samen" (Philipp Klein GmbH, Miltenberg, Germany). The experiment was repeated thrice, using 10 seeds for each variant. Each experiment was carried out in a separate tray lined with paper towels as an additional water storage underlay. All variants were placed on a  $93 \times 115$ mm underlay area. In the experiment with biomass-loaded AT as a fertilizer (AT), a piece of AlgalTextile was placed on paper, a piece of cotton wool was placed on top and the seeds were placed on top of the cotton wool. As control #1 (C1), polymerized algae-free alginate gel on a substrate of cotton fabric was placed under the cotton wool instead of AT. For control #2 (C2), a piece of cotton fabric was placed under the cotton wool. In control #3 (C3) there was only cotton wool between the seeds and the paper (Fig. 2). After placing the seeds, the paper and cotton wool were moistened with 20 ml of distilled water. In the experiment with distilled water only, it was added to the plants once a day until the end of the experiment. In the experiment with tap water, starting from 5th day, 0.25 ml of tap water was poured over each seed once a day. The chemical composition of the tap water is presented in the Table 1. The growth of cress in each variant was evaluated by measuring the sprout length in mm at day 14 [23]. Accuracy of measurements was calculated with a confidence interval of 0.95. Averaged values were used for comparisons.

#### Table 1

- Composition of tap water in Juelich, Germany (according to Eurofins Hygiene Institut Berg GmbH, test period 02.06.2020 - 17.06.2020).

Parameter	mg/L
Calcium (Ca)	57
Potassium (K)	2,7
Magnesium (Mg)	15.4
Sodium (Na)	14.2
Sulfate (SO <sub>4</sub> )	63
Nitrate (NO <sub>3</sub> )	36

#### 3. Results

# 3.1. Nitrogen and phosphorus uptake by phototrophic microorganisms in a horizontal flow-through photobioreactor

AT sequestered nitrogen and phosphorus faster than two control cultivation methods. After the first day of incubation, AT sequestered 0.267 mM P-PO<sub>4</sub>; that is 20 times more than the amount sequestered by alginate beads and 7 times more than by the suspension of *C. sorokiniana* (Fig. 3a). By the end of the experiment, AT and the alginate beads had sequestered phosphorus almost completely (up to 99%), while the suspension sequestered only 20% of the P-PO<sub>4</sub> during the same time. Uptake of nitrogen by AT rapidly increased during the experiment and was significantly higher than that in other conditions (Fig. 3b). At the end of the experiment, AT had sequestered up to 76% of the TNb contained in the medium, 4 times the amount of nitrogen sequestered by the microalgae suspension.

In order to test the ability of AT to absorb nitrogen and phosphorus at different concentrations, we cultivated AT on standard "Trebon" medium ("Trebon x1") and medium concentrated by 2 ("Trebon x2"), 3 ("Trebon x3"), and 5 times ("Trebon x5"). The highest phosphorus uptake was observed "Trebon x5" medium. On this type of medium AT sequestered 82% of P-PO<sub>4</sub> by day 10 of the experiment. AT showed the best TNb uptake rates on "Trebon x3" medium: by the end of the experiment 53.36 mM TNb was sequestered (29% of total content), which is 1.7–2.4 times the TNb sequestered by AT from other media



Fig. 2. – Scheme of cress cultivation experiment using textiles treated in different ways. "AT" - AlgalTextile as a fertilizer; "C1" – alginate gel on cotton fabric as a fertilizer; "C2" – cotton fabric as fertilizer; "C3" – no use of fertilizer. Paper and cotton wool were moistened with 20 ml of distilled water.



**Fig. 3.** – Phosphorus and total nitrogen uptake. 3a – Phosphorus uptake by microalgae in different cultivation methods. 3b – Nitrogen uptake by microalgae in different cultivation methods. 3c – Phosphorus uptake by AT at different concentrations of "Trebon" medium (red dots show the day when the P-PO<sub>4</sub> uptake reached 90% of the initial concentration in the medium). 3d - Nitrogen uptake by AT at different concentrations of "Trebon" medium.

concentrations (Fig. 3d). In the case of "Trebon x5", the growth decrease probably was the result of exceeding the optimum amount of nutrients in the medium for *C. sorokiniana* C-1 culture. Besides, with increase of the amount of nutrients in the medium, the content of chlorophyll *a* in gel fraction of AT drastically increased: 377  $\mu$ g/ml<sup>-1</sup> with "Trebon x1"; 395  $\mu$ g/ml<sup>-1</sup> with "Trebon x2"; 457  $\mu$ g/ml<sup>-1</sup> with "Trebon x3" and 497  $\mu$ g/ml<sup>-1</sup> with "Trebon x5", while the initial concentration was 0.0075  $\mu$ g/ml<sup>-1</sup>.

# 3.2. The usability of dried AlgalTextile

We tested the viability of long-term storage and transportation of the

new material in the form of fully prepared dried AT stripes. Its efficiency after 28 days of storage compared to freshly prepared AT was tested. The amount and rate of uptake of  $P-PO_4$  and TNb by dried AT were at the same level as that of freshly prepared AT (Fig. 4a, 4b). Thus, the method of AT stripes drying on the table at room temperature is appropriate for storing fully prepared lines without loss of their efficiency.

# 3.3. Use of biomass-loaded AlgalTextile as a fertilizer for cultivated plants

Use of AT as a fertilizer has a stimulating effect on the growth of plants. When tap water was used, all plants survived up to day 14 of the experiment. Cress with AT as fertilizer grew faster (Fig. 5, 6). By day 14,



Fig. 4. Phosphorus (4a) and nitrogen (4b) uptake by fresh and dried AlgalTextile.



**Fig. 5.** – A control cress plant grown with an Alginate-on-cotton fertilizer (left) and a cress plant grown with a biomass-loaded AT fertilizer (right) on day 14 (scale value - 1 cm).

their height was 50 mm, an average of 35% higher than the height of all three controls. In the variant with distilled water only, by the 11th day, growth continued only in the AT variant, while all the plants in the controls died. The experiment with the cress growth on AT ended on day 14 of cultivation with the final plant height of 40 mm.

# 4. Discussion

Microbial mats that form in extreme ecosystems, such as salt lakes and hot springs, are among the most productive ecosystems [7]. This is achieved by the dense organization of photosynthetic microorganisms in the form of biofilms developing on the bottom surface [24]. We used a nature-inspired approach based on the principles of microbial mat and biofilm organization to create an artificial system that could efficiently absorb nitrogen and phosphorus from wastewater. The AlgalTextile material contains a high number of photosynthetic microorganism cells embedded in a biodegradable polymer matrix that gives a high initial density of microorganisms, while the textile backing gives the material physical strength and the ability to quickly unfold it on the desired surface. AT can be modified in order to achieve the necessary properties: size, type of textile, type of microorganisms, type of gel and its density, etc. At the end of wastewater treatment, AT is easy to roll up for further processing. To determine the potential range of applications of AT, we have carried out a comparative assessment of the developed method with other methods of nutrient removal from wastewater.

AT absorbs phosphorus from the medium much faster than other types of photosynthetic bioreactors, including microalgae in suspension and in alginate beads, biofilm membrane photobioreactor with microalgae, twin-layer wastewater treatment system with microalgae, tube photobioreactor with purple non-sulfur bacteria and sequencing batch membrane-aerated biofilm reactor with activated sludge (Table 2). Nevertheless, AT is about one order of magnitude less effective than enhanced biological phosphorus removal (EBPR) systems and 1–3 orders of magnitude less effective than physicochemical methods of phosphorus removal. To remove the amount of phosphorus AlgalTextile consumes in 4 days, it is enough to use 0.5 g of "Ligand based composite" adsorbent in water for 1,5 h [25]. Due to high porosity and ion-exchange properties, some adsorbents have a high ability to fix phosphorus from solutions.

However, the physicochemical methods have certain drawbacks [26]. Chemically induced precipitation of phosphorus and nitrogen from wastewater is cost-effective, but produces a significant amount of sediment leading to secondary pollution. The phosphorus removal after adsorption can thus be hampered. Alkalis are used to elute the adsorbed phosphorus, and acids prepare the adsorbent for further use. To reclaim the phosphorus eluted from the iron-containing sludge as a fertilizer, biochar is pyrolyzed at 400  $^{\circ}$ C in an N<sub>2</sub> atmosphere for 2 h [27]. Membrane separation also shows high efficiency in wastewater treatment, but it is an energy consuming method [26]. Compared with these methods, the phosphorus in AT and EBPR systems is bioavailable and can be used as a biofertilizer. Currently, the EBPR method is the most efficient microbiological method of phosphorus removal from the



Fig. 6. – Cress growth with biomass-loaded AlgalTextile as a fertilizer and tap water. "AT" - AlgalTextile as a fertilizer; "C1" – alginate gel on cotton fabric; "C2" – cotton fabric; "C3" – no fertilizer.

Table 2	
---------	--

- Nitrogen removal methods.

Treatment design	Removing agent	TN content at the beginning (mg/L)	Removal (mg/L)	Removal (%)	Treatment period (day)	Removal (average mg/L per day)	Reference
Microorganisms Inclined biofilm photobioreactor with cells immobilized in alginate gel (AlgalTextile)	Microalgae ( <i>Chlorella</i> sp.)	1480	519.5	35.1	7	74.2	This article
Biofilm membrane photobioreactor	Microalgae (Chlorella sp.) Microalgae (Scenedesmus dimorphus, Scenedesmus quadricauda)	15 64.3	12.4 51.3	82.5 75.1–79.8	6 9	2.1 5.7	[32] [33]
Suspension in a flask with barbotage	Microalgae (Dunaliella sp., Nannochloropsis, and Tetraselmis sp.) Microalgae (Chloralla pulagris)	65-90	88.2	94.1-98.1	13-18	5.9	[34]
Cylindrical photobioreactors with pine bark as a substrate for immobilization	Groups of different cyanobacteria and microalgae	80	40.3 64.8	81	42	4.7 1.5	[36]
Tube photobioreactor containing cellulose beads with immobilized bacteria	Purple non-sulfur bacterium (Rhodobacter capsulatus)	19.8	14.4	72.6	0.86	16.4	[37]
Enhanced biological phosphorus removal and recovery	Community of the polyphosphate accumulating organisms (PAOs) and denitrifying PAOs	10		64	6-hour cycles (4 h aerobic/2 h anoxic)	18.72	[28]
Sequencing batch membrane- aerated biofilm reactor	Activated sludge (aerobic and anaerobic bacteria)	65–75	67.5	90	long-term running	50	[38]
Flat-panel air-cathode microbial fuel cells	Microbial community	28	26.3	94	0.1	263	[39]
Sequencing batch reactor	Anammox and denitrifying bacteria	80 (ammonium) 160 (nitrite)	77.6 149.9	97 93.7	0.125	620.8 1280	[29]
Chemical removal	Catalytic reactions of hydroxyl and chlorine radicals	50	50	100	0.06	833	[40]

wastewater, but it requires stable flow of wastewater, long time to achieve maximum productivity, the organization of alternating aerobic and anaerobic cycles, as well as complex technical equipment [28].

AT method allows to remove 1.5–49 times more nitrogen than previously described photosynthetic methods and sequencing batch

membrane-aerated biofilm reactor with activated sludge (Table 3), but it is significantly less efficient than batch reactor with anammox and denitrifying bacteria. Anammox and denitrifying bacteria consume dozens of times more nitrogen [29] but this technological process requires stable inflow of contaminated water and complex technical

# Table 3

# - Phosphorus removal methods.

Treatment design	Removing agent	P-PO4 content at the beginning (mg/L)	Removal (mg/L)	Removal (%)	Treatment period (day)	Removal (average mg/L per dav)	Reference
Microorganisms Inclined biofilm photobioreactor with cells immobilized in alginate gel (AlgalTextile)	Microalgae (Chlorella sp.)	91.8 mg L-1	83.9	91.4	4	21	This article
Suspension in a flask on shaker	Effective Microorganism (EM- 1)	2.3 mg L-1	2.1	86.1–91.3	8–10	0.2	[41]
	Microalgae ( <i>Chlorella</i> sp.) Effective microorganism (EM- 1)		1.1 2.3	27.3–49.7 85.9–99.9	6 6–10	0.2 0.3	
Immobilization in alginate beads	and microalgae ( <i>Chioreila</i> sp.) Microalgae ( <i>Chioreila</i> sp.) Microalgae ( <i>Chioreila</i> sp.) and non-immobilized activated sludge	10 mg 1-1	5 10	50 100	2 2	2.5 5	[42]
Biofilm membrane	Microalgae (Chlorella sp.)	0.8	0.7	85.9	6	0.1	[43]
Twin-layer wastewater	Microalgae (Chlorella vulgaris)	3	2.7	90	2	1.35	[44]
Tube photobioreactor containing cellulose beads with immobilized bacteria	Purple non-sulfur bacterium (Rhodobacter capsulatus)	10.1	1.3	12.4	0.86	1.5	[37]
Sequencing batch membrane-	Activated sludge (aerobic and anaerobic bacteria)	9–13 (total	11.1	85	long-term running	8	[45]
Enhanced biological phosphorus removal	Community of the polyphosphate accumulating organisms (PAOs) and denitrifying PAOs	8		83	6-hour cycles (4 h aerobic/ 2 h anoxic)	29.4	[28]
Enhanced biological phosphorus removal	Community of the polyphosphate accumulating organisms	88.2	86.2	97.8	8-hour cycle on the 44th day of operation (2 h anaerobic/4 h aerobic/1 h settling/1 h idle)	344.8	[28]
Physico-chemical methods							
Filtration systems	Mineral-based filter material Polonite	1.5-6	1.29–6	86–100	long-term running	0.7	[46]
Adsorbents	Red mud, a waste residue of alumina refinery	0.8 mg P-PO4 / g a	adsorbent		0.25	Depending on the amount of	[47]
	Ligand based composite	159.13 mg P / g ad	lsorbent		0.06	adsorbent	[26]
Chemical removal	Electric arc furnace steel slags	0.13 - 0.28 mg P /	g slag		7	Depending on	[48]
	Basic oxygen furnace steel slags	1.14–2.49 mg P / g	g slag		7	the amount of adsorbent	
	Bittern for crystallization of struvite (MgNH4PO4 • 6H2O)	100 (TP)	100	100	0.35	285	[49]

equipment. Moreover, as a result of the activity of denitrifying bacteria, gaseous nitrogen forms and escapes into the atmosphere. Thus, nitrogen cannot be recycled as fertilizer, in contrast to AT.

Given the comparative advantages and disadvantages of AT in comparison with other methods of nutrient removal, the area of its potential application can be determined. The most relevant method of AT application is the treatment of wastewater with an uneven inflow of pollutants during the year; for example, at recreational areas with a small amount of pollution during the year, but an increase during the summer tourist season. A stable supply of a large amount of polluted water throughout the year is required for the effective functioning of sewage treatment systems with anammox and denitrifying bacteria or EBPR whereas in the case of seasonal wastewater treatment the use of AT would be more feasible.

Another possible application of AT is the treatment of polluted surface runoff. This method will not only reduce the content of nutrients in runoff, but could also help prevent local erosion of soil; although the AT's potential for erosion control needs further validation, e.g. plantings on the material on a test slope to evaluate facilitation of substrate stabilization during plant growth and subsequent material degradation. We have shown that AT keeps its activity after a long drying period, allowing it to be conveniently stored and transported to the place of use. Cotton textile was chosen for use in AT because of its low cost and biodegradability. Under natural conditions, in direct contact with soil, cotton textiles decompose in 3 weeks to 6 months [30]. Other types of natural fibers (flax, jute, hemp, coconut etc.) and biodegradable polymers (polylactide, polyhydroxyalkanoates et c.) can also be potentially used to create AT.

We have shown that the used AT have a stimulating effect when growing plants. Adding AT allowed plants to develop significantly faster in comparison with control plants grown only on the substrate and various AT constituents without microalgae. On the 14th day of cultivation, the height of cress grown with AT was 35% higher than the control plants. Due to the various controls used, we show that the stimulating effect of AT is obtained because of the concentrated biomass inside the material. Control #1 included an alginate gel on the fabric with no added microalgae. Since this material had no stimulating effect on the plant growth, we demonstrate that AT did not stimulate cress growth only due to water retention.

The separation of biomass from the gel is problematic, so AT further use is reasonable for applications where the final production of pure biomass is not necessary. Used AT can potentially be used as biofertilizer, anti-errosion and anti-desertification agent, and biofuel feedstock (Fig. 7) [31]. Further research is needed on biofuel production, AT



Fig. 7. - Potential application and utilization of AlgalTextile.

biodegradation, and use in growing crops.

# 5. Conclusion

A new material AlgalTextile based on microalgae immobilized in alginate gel with cotton textile was developed. Due to high density of the microalgae and high permeability it consumed large amounts of nutrients from the medium. During one day AT piece of  $0.043 \text{ m}^2$  area sequestered 18.21 mM TNb and  $0.82 \text{ mM P-PO}_4$  from 1 liter of "Trebon 3x" nutrient medium. After three days the amount of sequestered nutrients reached 30 mM TNb and 1.48 mM P-PO<sub>4</sub>. The uptake rate of phosphorus and nitrogen by AT was the highest among all methods using photosynthetic microorganisms but lower than EBPR and physicochemical methods for phosphorus removal, and anammox and denitrifying bacteria for nitrogen removal. Using AlgalTextile for the cultivation of cress showed a 35% higher growth in length than in the control.

# 6. Author contributions

**A. Melnikova:** Conceptualization, Methodology, Investigation, Data curation, Writing - Original draft preparation; **A. Komova:** Writing - Original draft preparation, **Z. Namsaraev**: Conceptualization, Writing - Original draft preparation, Supervision, Reviewing and Editing; **I.** 

Meuser: Methodology, Analytics, Investigation; M. Roeb: Methodology, Analytics, Investigation; B. Ackermann: Methodology, Analytics, Investigation; H. Klose: Resources, Writing - Reviewing and Editing; C. Kuchendorf: Conceptualization, Methodology, Investigation, Resources, Supervision, Writing- Reviewing and Editing

# **Declaration of Competing Interest**

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

# Acknowledgments

This work was made with financial support of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of Russian Federation grant for Kurchatov Center of Genome Research (Agreement № 075–15–2019–1659). Experiments were also supported by the Bioeconomy International (BMBF) Project Algnutrient-UrBioSol, FKZ: 031B0453A. Anna Melnikova would like to thank DAAD for funding the internship in Germany and the opportunity to realize the AlgalTextile development project (funding within the program no. 57442045). The authors would like to thank designer Ekaterina Dmitrieva for creating some of the drawings.

#### A. Melnikova et al.

#### References

- Z. Namsaraev, A. Melnikova, A. Komova, V. Ivanov, A. Rudenko, E. Ivanov, Algal bloom occurrence and effects in Russia, Water (Switzerland) 12 (2020), https:// doi.org/10.3390/w12010285.
- [2] H.P. Weikard, D. Seyhan, Distribution of phosphorus resources between rich and poor countries: the effect of recycling, Ecol. Econ. 68 (2009) 1749–1755, 10.1016/ j.ecolecon.2008.11.006.
- [3] D. Cordell, S. White, Life's bottleneck: sustaining the world's phosphorus for a food secure future, Annu. Rev. Environ. Resour. 39 (2014) 161–188, https://doi.org/ 10.1146/annurev-environ-010213-113300.
- [4] D. Cordell, J.O. Drangert, S. White, The story of phosphorus: global food security and food for thought, Glob. Environ. Chang. 19 (2009) 292–305, https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2008.10.009.
- [5] M.C. Mew, Phosphate rock costs, prices and resources interaction, Sci. Total Environ. 542 (2016) 1008–1012, 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2015.08.045.
- [6] W.A.V. Stiles, D. Styles, S.P. Chapman, S. Esteves, A. Bywater, L. Melville, A. Silkina, I. Lupatsch, C. Fuentes Grünewald, R. Lovitt, T. Chaloner, A. Bull, C. Morris, C.A. Llewellyn, Using microalgae in the circular economy to valorise anaerobic digestate: challenges and opportunities, Bioresour. Technol. 267 (2018) 732–742, 10.1016/j.biortech.2018.07.100.
- [7] Y. Li, Y.F. Chen, P. Chen, M. Min, W. Zhou, B. Martinez, J. Zhu, R. Ruan, Characterization of a microalga Chlorella sp. well adapted to highly concentrated municipal wastewater for nutrient removal and biodiesel production, Bioresour. Technol. 102 (2011) 5138–5144, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2011.01.091.
- [8] Green microalga Scenedesmus acutus grown on municipal wastewater to couple nutrient removal with lipid accumulation for biodiesel production | Elsevier Enhanced Reader, (n.d.). https://reader.elsevier.com/reader/sd/pii/ S0960852413011292?token=D1FB9896E5915B17495B9699AF4B50021132DDA 083E9FE106CEB6FC1EE49087F5A748870DB592FA79C65F5E424 9C4323&originRegion=eu-west-1&originCreation=20211214072642 (accessed December 14, 2021).
- [9] Nitrogen and phosphorus removal from municipal wastewater effluent using microalgal biofilms | Elsevier Enhanced Reader, (n.d.). https://reader.elsevier. com/reader/sd/pii/S0043135411004921?token=7BD736BDDA4298BF7098563 42EDC880E7D32E216313AF3557DD6DAA87D52 7D1B7FE4DF270BE8C9E77F1412D5F010407C&originRegion=eu-west-1&originCreation=20211214072357 (accessed December 14, 2021).
- [10] C. Alcántara, E. Posadas, B. Guieysse, R. Muñoz, Microalgae-based Wastewater Treatment, Handb. Mar. Microalgae Biotechnol. Adv. (2015) 439–455, 10.1016/ B978-0-12-800776-1.00029-7.
- [11] A. Solovchenko, A.M. Verschoor, N.D. Jablonowski, L. Nedbal, Phosphorus from wastewater to crops: an alternative path involving microalgae, Biotechnol. Adv. 34 (2016) 550–564, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biotechadv.2016.01.002.
- [12] E. Alobwede, J.R. Leake, J. Pandhal, Circular economy fertilization: testing micro and macro algal species as soil improvers and nutrient sources for crop production in greenhouse and field conditions, Geoderma 334 (2019) 113–123, https://doi. org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2018.07.049.
- [13] A.A. Melnikova, A.V. Komova, R.A. Vasilev, Z.B. Namsaraev, K.V. Gorin, Flocculation-based methods of microalgae removal from the eutrophic pond enrichment culture, Water Supply (2021) 1–9, https://doi.org/10.2166/ ws.2021.174, 00.
- [14] T.E. Grigoriev, K.I. Lukanina, P.M. Gotovtsev, K.V. Gorin, A.A. Melnikova, C. G. Antipova, R. Kamyshinsky, S.N. Chvalun, Chitosan-based fiber-sponge materials as a promising tool for microalgae harvesting from Lake Baikal, J. Appl. Polym. Sci. 137 (2020) 1–9, https://doi.org/10.1002/app.49209.
- [15] B. Molinuevo-Salces, B. Riaño, D. Hernández, M.C. García-González, Microalgae and wastewater treatment: advantages and disadvantages, Microalgae Biotechnol. Dev. Biofuel Wastewater Treat. (2019) 505–533, https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-13-2264-8\_20.
- [16] K.A. Ross, L.M. Feazel, C.E. Robertson, B.Z. Fathepure, K.E. Wright, R.M. Turk-MacLeod, M.M. Chan, N.L. Held, J.R. Spear, N.R. Pace, Phototrophic phylotypes dominate mesothermal microbial mats associated with hot springs in yellowstone national park, Microb. Ecol. 64 (2012) 162–170, 10.1007/S00248-012-0012-3/FIGURES/4.
- [17] O.S. Samylina, Z.B. Namsaraev, D.S. Grouzdev, N.V. Slobodova, V.V. Zelenev, G. V. Borisenko, D.Y. Sorokin, The patterns of nitrogen fixation in haloalkaliphilic phototrophic communities of Kulunda Steppe soda lakes (Altai, Russia), FEMS Microbiol. Ecol. (2019) 95, https://doi.org/10.1093/FEMSEC/FIZ174.
- [18] D.J. Des Marais, Microbial mats and the early evolution of life, Trends Ecol. Evol. 5 (1990) 140–144, https://doi.org/10.1016/0169-5347(90)90219-4.
- [19] J. Doucha, K. Lívanský, Productivity, CO2/O2 exchange and hydraulics in outdoor open high density microalgal (Chlorella sp.) photobioreactors operated in a Middle and Southern European climate, J. Appl. Phycol. 18 (2006) 811–826, https://doi. org/10.1007/s10811-006-9100-4.
- [20] G. Mujtaba, M. Rizwan, G. Kim, K. Lee, Removal of nutrients and COD through coculturing activated sludge and immobilized Chlorella vulgaris, Chem. Eng. J. 343 (2018) 155–162, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2018.03.007.
- [21] S. Bengtsson, A. Werker, T. Welander, Production of polyhydroxyalkanoates by glycogen accumulating organisms treating a paper mill wastewater, Water Sci. Technol. 58 (2008) 323–330, 10.2166/WST.2008.381.
- [22] H.K. Lichtenthaler, Chlorophylls and Carotenoids: pigments of Photosynthetic Biomembranes, Methods Enzymol. 148 (1987) 350–382, 10.1016/0076-6879(87) 48036-1.

- [23] View of seed vigour tests to estimate seedling emergence in cress (Lepidium sativum L.) seed lots, (n.d.). https://www.notulaebotanicae.ro/index.php/nbha/ article/view/11453/8810 (accessed December 15, 2021).
- [24] A.V. Bryanskaya, Z.B. Namsaraev, O.M. Kalashnikova, D.D. Barkhutova, B. B. Namsaraev, V.M. Gorlenko, Biogeochemical processes in the algal-bacterial mats of the Urinskii alkaline hot spring, Microbiology 75 (2006) 611–620, https://doi. org/10.1134/S0026261706050122.
- [25] M.R. Awual, Efficient phosphate removal from water for controlling eutrophication using novel composite adsorbent, J. Clean. Prod. 228 (2019) 1311–1319, https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.04.325.
- [26] M.R. Awual, Efficient phosphate removal from water for controlling eutrophication using novel composite adsorbent, J. Clean. Prod. 228 (2019) 1311–1319, https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.04.325.
- [27] W.J. Xia, L.Z.J. Xu, L.Q. Yu, Q. Zhang, Y.H. Zhao, J.R. Xiong, X.Y. Zhu, N.S. Fan, B. C. Huang, R.C. Jin, Conversion of municipal wastewater-derived waste to an adsorbent for phosphorus recovery from secondary effluent, Elsevier B.V (2020), https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.135959.
- [28] Y. Ge, J. Lan, C. Zhan, Y. Zhou, C. Ma, L. Zhao, Biological removal of phosphorus and diversity analysis of microbial community in the enhanced biological phosphorus removal (EBPR) system, Water Environ. J. 34 (2020) 563–574, https:// doi.org/10.1111/wej.12485.
- [29] Z. Yang, W. Zhu, D. Yu, Y. Bo, J. Li, Enhanced carbon and nitrogen removal performance of simultaneous anammox and denitrification (SAD) with mannitol addition treating saline wastewater, J. Chem. Technol. Biotechnol. 94 (2019) 377–388, https://doi.org/10.1002/jctb.5781.
- [30] M. Daria, L. Krzysztof, M. Jakub, Characteristics of biodegradable textiles used in environmental engineering: a comprehensive review, J. Clean. Prod. 268 (2020), 122129. 10.1016/J.JCLEPRO.2020.122129.
- [31] R.J. Craggs, W.H. Adey, K.R. Jenson, M.S. St. John, F.B. Green, W.J. Oswald, Phosphorus removal from wastewater using an algal turf scrubber, Water Sci. Technol. 33 (1996) 191–198, https://doi.org/10.1016/0273-1223(96)00354-X.
- [32] F. Gao, Z.H. Yang, C. Li, G.M. Zeng, D.H. Ma, L. Zhou, A novel algal biofilm membrane photobioreactor for attached microalgae growth and nutrients removal from secondary effluent, Bioresour. Technol. 179 (2015) 8–12, 10.1016/j. biortech.2014.11.108.
- [33] X. Chen, Z. Li, N. He, Y. Zheng, H. Li, H. Wang, Y. Wang, Y. Lu, Q. Li, Y. Peng, Nitrogen and phosphorus removal from anaerobically digested wastewater by microalgae cultured in a novel membrane photobioreactor, Biotechnol. Biofuels. 11 (2018) 1–11, 10.1186/s13068-018-1190-0.
- [34] M. Sacristán de Alva, V.M. Luna Pabello, M.T. Orta Ledesma, M.J. Cruz Gómez, Carbon, nitrogen, and phosphorus removal, and lipid production by three saline microalgae grown in synthetic wastewater irradiated with different photon fluxes, Algal Res 34 (2018) 97–103, 10.1016/j.algal.2018.07.006.
- [35] S. Aslan, I.K. Kapdan, Batch kinetics of nitrogen and phosphorus removal from synthetic wastewater by algae, Ecol. Eng. 28 (2006) 64–70, 10.1016/j. ecoleng.2006.04.003.
- [36] T. Garbowski, M. Pietryka, K. Pulikowski, D. Richter, The use of a natural substrate for immobilization of microalgae cultivated in wastewater, Sci. Rep. 10 (2020) 1–9, https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-64656-3.
- [37] S. Sawayama, K. Rao, D.O. Hall, Immobilization of Rhodobacter capsulatus on cellulose beads and water treatment using a photobioreactor, J. Ferment. Bioeng. 86 (1998) 517–520, 10.1016/S0922-338X(98)80164-5.
- [38] L. Sun, Z. Wang, X. Wei, P. Li, H. Zhang, M. Li, B. Li, S. Wang, Enhanced biological nitrogen and phosphorus removal using sequencing batch membrane-aerated biofilm reactor, Chem. Eng. Sci. 135 (2015) 559–565, 10.1016/j.ces.2015.07.033.
- [39] Y. Park, S. Park, V.K. Nguyen, J. Yu, C.I. Torres, B.E. Rittmann, T. Lee, Complete nitrogen removal by simultaneous nitrification and denitrification in flat-panel aircathode microbial fuel cells treating domestic wastewater, Chem. Eng. J. 316 (2017) 673–679, 10.1016/j.cej.2017.02.005.
- [40] Y. Zhang, J. Li, J. Bai, X. Li, Z. Shen, L. Xia, S. Chen, Q. Xu, B. Zhou, Total organic carbon and total nitrogen removal and simultaneous electricity generation for nitrogen-containing wastewater based on the catalytic reactions of hydroxyl and chlorine radicals, Elsevier B.V. (2018), 10.1016/j.apcatb.2018.07.036.
- [41] F. Lananan, S.H. Abdul Hamid, W.N.S. Din, N. Ali, H. Khatoon, A. Jusoh, A. Endut, Symbiotic bioremediation of aquaculture wastewater in reducing ammonia and phosphorus utilizing Effective Microorganism (EM-1) and microalgae (Chlorella sp.), Int. Biodeterior. Biodegrad. 95 (2014) 127–134, 10.1016/j. ibiod.2014.06.013.
- [42] G. Mujtaba, M. Rizwan, G. Kim, K. Lee, Removal of nutrients and COD through coculturing activated sludge and immobilized Chlorella vulgaris, Chem. Eng. J. 343 (2018) 155–162, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2018.03.007.
- [43] F. Gao, Z.H. Yang, C. Li, G.M. Zeng, D.H. Ma, L. Zhou, A novel algal biofilm membrane photobioreactor for attached microalgae growth and nutrients removal from secondary effluent, Bioresour. Technol. 179 (2015) 8–12, 10.1016/j. biortech.2014.11.108.
- [44] J. Shi, B. Podola, M. Melkonian, Removal of nitrogen and phosphorus from wastewater using microalgae immobilized on twin layers: an experimental study, J. Appl. Phycol. 19 (2007) 417–423, https://doi.org/10.1007/s10811-006-9148-1.
- [45] L. Sun, Z. Wang, X. Wei, P. Li, H. Zhang, M. Li, B. Li, S. Wang, Enhanced biological nitrogen and phosphorus removal using sequencing batch membrane-aerated biofilm reactor, Chem. Eng. Sci. 135 (2015) 559–565, 10.1016/j.ces.2015.07.033.
- [46] A. Renman, G. Renman, Long-term phosphate removal by the calcium-silicate material Polonite in wastewater filtration systems, Chemosphere 79 (2010) 659–664, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2010.02.035.

# A. Melnikova et al.

- [47] W. Huang, S. Wang, Z. Zhu, L. Li, X. Yao, V. Rudolph, F. Haghseresht, Phosphate removal from wastewater using red mud, J. Hazard. Mater. 158 (2008) 35–42, 10.1016/j.jhazmat.2008.01.061.
- [48] C. Barca, C. Gérente, D. Meyer, F. Chazarenc, Y. Andrès, Phosphate removal from synthetic and real wastewater using steel slags produced in Europe, Water Res 46 (2012) 2376–2384, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2012.02.012.
- [49] P. Molle, A. Liénard, A. Grasmick, A. Iwema, A. Kabbabi, Apatite as an interesting seed to remove phosphorus from wastewater in constructed wetlands, Water Sci. Technol. 51 (2005) 193–203, https://doi.org/10.2166/wst.2005.0318.