MAJOR ARTICLE



Epidemic *Clostridioides difficile* Ribotype 027 Lineages: Comparisons of Texas Versus Worldwide Strains

Bradley T Endres. ,¹ Khurshida Begum,¹ Hua Sun,² Seth T. Walk,³ Ali Memariani,¹ Chris Lancaster,¹ Anne J. Gonzales-Luna,¹ Kierra M. Dotson,¹ Eugénie Bassères,¹ Charlene Offiong,⁴ Shawn Tupy,⁵ Kristi Kuper,⁶ Edward Septimus,⁷ Raouf Arafat,⁴ M. Jahangir Alam,¹ Zhongming Zhao,² Julian G. Hurdle,⁸ Tor C. Savidge,^{9,10} and Kevin W. Garey¹

¹Department of Pharmacy Practice and Translational Research, University of Houston College of Pharmacy, Texas; ²Center for Precision Health, School of Biomedical Informatics, The University of Texas Health Science Center at Houston; ³Department of Microbiology and Immunology, Montana State University, Bozeman; ⁴Houston Health Department, Texas; ⁵Texas Department of State Health Services, Austin; ⁶Center for Pharmacy Practice Excellence, Vizient, Houston, Texas; ⁷Harvard Medical School and Harvard Pilgrim Health Care Institute, Boston, Massachusetts; ⁸Center for Infectious and Inflammatory Diseases, Institute of Biosciences and Technology, Texas A&M Health Science Center, Houston; ⁹Texas Children's Microbiome Center, Texas Children's Hospital, Houston; ¹⁰Department of Pathology and Immunology, Baylor College of Medicine, Houston, Texas

Background. The epidemic *Clostridioides difficile* ribotype 027 strain resulted from the dissemination of 2 separate fluoroquinolone-resistant lineages: FQR1 and FQR2. Both lineages were reported to originate in North America; however, confirmatory large-scale investigations of *C difficile* ribotype 027 epidemiology using whole genome sequencing has not been undertaken in the United States.

Methods. Whole genome sequencing and single-nucleotide polymorphism (SNP) analysis was performed on 76 clinical ribotype 027 isolates obtained from hospitalized patients in Texas with *C difficile* infection and compared with 32 previously sequenced worldwide strains. Maximum-likelihood phylogeny based on a set of core genome SNPs was used to construct phylogenetic trees investigating strain macro- and microevolution. Bayesian phylogenetic and phylogeographic analyses were used to incorporate temporal and geographic variables with the SNP strain analysis.

Results. Whole genome sequence analysis identified 2841 SNPs including 900 nonsynonymous mutations, 1404 synonymous substitutions, and 537 intergenic changes. Phylogenetic analysis separated the strains into 2 prominent groups, which grossly differed by 28 SNPs: the FQR1 and FQR2 lineages. Five isolates were identified as pre-epidemic strains. Phylogeny demonstrated unique clustering and resistance genes in Texas strains indicating that spatiotemporal bias has defined the microevolution of ribotype 027 genetics.

Conclusions. Clostridioides difficile ribotype 027 lineages emerged earlier than previously reported, coinciding with increased use of fluoroquinolones. Both FQR1 and FQR2 ribotype 027 epidemic lineages are present in Texas, but they have evolved geographically to represent region-specific public health threats.

Keywords. anaerobe infections; antimicrobial stewardship; molecular epidemiology; whole genome sequencing.

Broad spectrum of activity, favorable safety profiles, and multiple indications favored fluoroquinolone use as a widely prescribed class of antimicrobials in the 1990s and early 2000s [1]. However, continued use of fluoroquinolones is associated with development of resistance [2]. Introduction of the first quinolone, nalidixic acid, rapidly led to the development of resistance, especially in Escherichia *coli* [2, 3]. Resistance mutations were genetically mapped to subunits of deoxyribonucleic acid (DNA) gyrase, which were found to be the target of fluoroquinolone antibiotics [4].

Open Forum Infectious Diseases[®]

Clostridioides difficile, а Gram-positive, anaerobic, spore-forming bacterium, is also associated with fluoroquinolone resistance. The epidemic caused by the ribotype 027 strain was primarily characterized by the acquisition of a transposable element and a mutation in the gyrA gene that ultimately led to high-level fluoroquinolone resistance within ribotype 027 C difficile strains [5]. Distinct mutation acquisition events led to the generation of 2 unique fluoroquinolone-resistant lineages designated FQR1 and FQR2 [6]. Both lineages emerged with high probability in the United States in the early 1990s. However, the use of whole genome sequencing to assess national and global dissemination have been limited by a low number of ribotype 027 isolates available for investigation [5]. In addition, previous reports are limited by the lack of United States-derived ribotype 027 C difficile strains, especially of the FQR1 lineage.

Considering this, we sought to conduct a large, epidemiologic study to better understand the emergence and dissemination of ribotype 027 in the United States. Since 2011, we have conducted several Texas state-wide surveillance studies to type

Received 1 October 2018; editorial decision 8 January 2019; accepted January 25, 2019; Published online February 9, 2019.

Correspondence: K. W. Garey, PharmD, MS, FASHP, Department of Pharmacy Practice and Translational Research, University of Houston College of Pharmacy, 4849 Calhoun Road, Houston, TX 77204 (kgarey@uh.edu).

[©] The Author(s) 2019. Published by Oxford University Press on behalf of Infectious Diseases Society of America. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs licence (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/ by-nc-nd/4.0/), which permits non-commercial reproduction and distribution of the work, in any medium, provided the original work is not altered or transformed in any way, and that the work is properly cited. For commercial re-use, please contact journals.permissions@oup.com DOI: 10.1093/ofid/ofz013

C difficile isolates obtained from hospitalized patients with a focus on healthcare centers in Houston, the fourth largest city in the United States [7, 8]. *Clostridioides difficile* ribotype 027 comprised approximately 20% of isolates obtained from these studies. Given the international healthcare nature of Houston, which includes the Texas Medical Center—the largest medical center in the world—we investigated whether both ribotype 027 lineages are present, providing a unique opportunity to study the evolution of this epidemic strain in the United States.

METHODS

Sample Collection

Institutional Review Boards at the University of Houston and participating hospitals approved this study. Fecal samples were collected from hospitalized patients diagnosed with *C difficile* infection (CDI) between 2011 and 2018. All patient samples were deidentified. Isolates were purified and ribotyped as previously described [7–9]. Previously sequenced *C difficile* strains from He et al [5] and Steglich et al [10] were used for comparative bioinformatics analyses.

Sequencing and Analyses

Deoxyribonucleic acid was extracted using either the QIAamp DNA mini kit (QIAGEN) or AnaPrep automated DNA extractor (BioChain). Deoxyribonucleic acid was quantified by NanoDrop (ThermoFisher Scientific) and Qubit (ThermoFisher Scientific), and DNA quality was assessed using a BioAnalyzer (Agilent). The DNA libraries were prepared according to Illumina's protocols, multiplexed on a flow cell, and run on a NextSeq (Illumina) using paired-end sequencing. The generated fastq files were trimmed using Trimmomatic [11] and sequencing quality was examined by software FastQC. The presence of known antimicrobial resistance genes was determined from cleaned reads using the ARG-ANNOT database [12] and SRST2 pipeline [13].

For whole genome SNP analysis, cleaned sequence reads were mapped to the R20291 reference genome (GenBank accession number FN545816) using the RedDog pipeline according to the developer's guidelines (https://github. com/katholt/ RedDog). In brief, Bowtie2 version 2.2.3 was used for mapping [14] and SAMtools version 0.1.19 was used for calling SNPs [15]. Only high-quality SNPs were used for phylogenetic analyses [5, 10, 16–19]. Phylogenetic trees were created in FigTree and heat maps were generated using R. STRING (version 9.05) was used for pathway analyses. BEAST 2.4.7 was used to incorporate spatial and temporal variables into the phylogeny [20]. Analyses were done after the tutorial "Ancestral reconstruction/ discrete phylogeography" with BEAST 2.0 (available at http:// www.beast2.org/ wiki/index.php/Tutorials) and by using previously published manuscripts as guides [10]. Phylogeographic reconstruction was done using SpreaD3 [21]. Quark (https:// zhanglab.ccmb.med.umich.edu/QUARK/) was used for modeling SNP effects on protein structure [22].

RESULTS

Whole genome sequencing data from a total of 108 ribotype 027 (NAP1/BI) C difficile isolates were analyzed from 23 different geographic regions worldwide. Among the 108 samples, 83 (77%) were isolated from the United States, 76 of which were collected from 15 different regional hospitals in Texas (Table 1), primarily from the greater Houston metropolitan area. After mapping to the R20291 reference genome, SNP calling identified 2841 high-quality discriminatory SNPs, which defined the maximum-likelihood phylogeny (Figure 1A). The SNPs consisted of 900 nonsynonymous mutations, 1404 synonymous substitutions, and 537 intergenic changes. Two disparate groupings of isolates affected the resolution of the phylogeny; however, the FQR lineages were prominent after removing these outlier groups (Figure 1B). One group of outliers was identified as of pre-epidemic origin (Figure 1A, green), whereas the other grouping (Figure 1A, blue) clustered amongst other FQR1 strains. Upon further examination of these distant FQR1 strains, we identified 760 SNP sites, >500 indels, and significant homologous recombination that was shared amongst these 2 distant FOR1 isolates compared with other FOR1 strains (Supplemental Figure 1A). These changes were highly related and corresponded to shared changes in metabolic pathways (Supplemental Figure 1B). In total, the phylogenetic tree (Figure 1B) consists of 49 FQR1 strains (n = 35 Texas-specific), 54 FQR2 strains (n = 36 Texas-specific), and 5 pre-epidemic strains. To our knowledge, this is the largest collection of FQR1 strains that has been analyzed thus far and, overall, the largest collection of ribotype 027 strains that has been sequenced from the United States. It is interesting to note that the maximum-likelihood phylogeny tended to closely group the Texas strains within each lineage resulting in a sublineage, which suggests that there is a local genetic uniqueness to these strains.

The major SNP difference that delineates the pre-epidemic strain from the epidemic strains is the gyrA mutation (c.245C>T) at position 6310 (R20291 genome location), which confers high-level fluoroquinolone resistance in the FQR1 and FQR2 lineages. The primary SNP differences between the FQR1 and FQR2 could be titrated to 28 SNP differences (Table 2), 21 of which are nonsynonymous and unique compared with the SNPs identified by He et al [5]. Of the 21 nonsynonymous SNP differences, 8 SNPs were located to genes linked to drug resistance in orthologous species, including the DNA-directed ribonucleic acid polymerase beta chain (encodes rifampicin resistance), putative penicillin-binding proteins, a putative 5-nitroimidazole reductase, and a putative drug/sodium antiporter [23-25]. Using predictive protein modeling, the SNP in putative 5-nitroimidazole reductase within FQR1 strains affects protein folding and may impact nitroimidazole (metronidazole) action (Supplemental Figure 2). Other SNPs identified occurred more frequently in FQR1 strains and were found in genes involved in cell metabolism, which suggests that this

Table 1. Strain Information

| Database Garmeny Landsu-Phale FOR2 Sequide start IV 0800070 Garmeny Landsu-Phale FOR2 Sequide start IV 0800072 Garmeny Sandafragan FOR2 Sequide start IV 1000084 Garmeny Landsu-Phale FOR2 Sequide start IV 1000084 Garmeny Landsu-Phale FOR2 Sequide start IV 1000084 Garmeny Landsu-Phale FOR2 Sequide start IV 1200001 Garmeny Landsu-Phale FOR1 Singuide start IV 1200014 Garmeny Aladbale FOR1 Singuide start IV 1200015 Garmeny Zadbale FOR1 Singuide start IV 1200016 Garmeny Zadbale FOR1 Singuide start IV 1200017 Garmeny Zadbale FOR1 Singuide start IV 1200018 Garmeny Zadbale FOR1 Singuide start IV 1200018 Garmeny Zadbale Forna FOR1 Singuide start IV 1200014 | Isolate | Isolation Country | Isolation Region | FQR Lineage | Reference | |
|--|-----------|-------------------|------------------|--------------|---------------------|--|
| BHOD270GermanyBel LangenshanFDR2Stepich et B1 10008-00072GermanySo-IdelTagenshanFDR2Stepich et B1 10012-00004GermanyIngrigFDR1Stepich et B1 10012-00004GermanyBieldeldFDR2Stepich et B1 10012-00004GermanyBieldeldFDR2Stepich et B1 10012-00004GermanyBieldeldFDR1Stepich et B1 10012-00004GermanyBieldeldFDR1Stepich et B1 10012-00004GermanyBieldeldFDR1Stepich et B1 10012-00005GermanyZinasFDR1Stepich et B1 10012-00007GermanyTinasFDR1Stepich et B1 10012-00008GermanyTinasFDR1He et B1 B112-0008GermanyTinasFDR2He et B1 B112-00098GermanyTinasFDR2He et B1 B112-00097CandoStansFDR2He et B1 B112-00004CandoMortralFDR2He et B1 B112-0005Unted KingdomEvertrFDR2He et B1 B112-0007Unted KingdomEvertrFDR2He et B1 B112-012Unted StatesTinasFDR1He et B1 B112-014Unted StatesTinasFDR1He et B1 B112-014Unted StatesTinasFDR1He et B1 B112-014Unted StatesTinasFDR1He et B1 B112-014Unted StatesTinas <td>07-00080</td> <td>Germany</td> <td>Stuttgart</td> <td>FQR2</td> <td>Steglich et al [10]</td> | 07-00080 | Germany | Stuttgart | FQR2 | Steglich et al [10] | |
| 00-0022GernarySack ImponentationFDR2Steplin et al I 10000-00077GernaryLexingFDR1Steplin et al I 10010-00484GernaryHortoryFDR1Steplin et al I 10012-00014GernaryHortoryFDR1Steplin et al I 10012-00014GernaryLexingFDR1Steplin et al I 10012-00014GernaryLexingFDR1Steplin et al I 10012-00014GernaryRodebalFDR1Steplin et al I 10012-00014GernaryZitauFDR1Steplin et al I 10012-00015GernaryZitauFDR1Steplin et al I 10012-00016GernaryZitauFDR2He et al IS112-00016GernaryExterFDR2He et al IS112-00017Unted KingdornExterFDR2He et al IS112-0018Unted KingdornExterFDR2He et al IS112-0014Unted KingdornExterFDR2He et al IS1 <tr< td=""><td>08-00070</td><td>Germany</td><td>Landau/Pfalz</td><td>FQR2</td><td colspan="2">Steglich et al [10]</td></tr<> | 08-00070 | Germany | Landau/Pfalz | FQR2 | Steglich et al [10] | |
| 00-0077GarmanySinclaitingenFDR2Sincylint et al 10010-00001CernmanyHorkingFDR2Sincylint et al 10012-00014GernmanyBelefieldFDR2Sincylint et al 10012-00014GernmanyBelefieldFDR1Sincylint et al 10012-00015GernmanyRadebulaFDR1Sincylint et al 10012-00016GernmanyRadebulaFDR1Sincylint et al 10012-00016GernmanyRadebulaFDR1Sincylint et al 10012-00016GernmanyRadebulaFDR2He et al 16112-00016GernmanyRadebulaFDR2He et al 16112-00016GardaMethourneFDR2He et al 16112-00016CandoMethourneFDR2He et al 16112-00017CandoMethourneFDR2He et al 16112-00018CandoMethourneFDR2He et al 16112-00019CandoMethourneFDR2He et al 16112-0018United StatesTonasFDR2He et al 16112-0019CandoMethourneFDR2He et al 16112-0014United StatesTonasFDR2He et al 16112-014United StatesTonasFDR1He et al 16112-014United StatesNoreaFDR1He et al 16112-014KoreaFDR1He et al 161Korea12-014United StatesTonasFDR1He et al 16112-014Korea </td <td>09-00022</td> <td>Germany</td> <td>Bad Langensalza</td> <td>FQR2</td> <td colspan="2">Steglich et al [10]</td> | 09-00022 | Germany | Bad Langensalza | FQR2 | Steglich et al [10] | |
| 10.008.43GermanyLexpinFDR1Steplior et al 10012.00004GermanyHonkurgFDR2Steplior et al 10012.00004GermanyLexpinFDR1Steplior et al 10012.00004GermanyLexpinFDR1Steplior et al 10012.00007GermanyRackehulFDR1Steplior et al 10112.00008GermanyRackehulFDR1Steplior et al 10112.00078GermanyRackehulFDR1Steplior et al 10112.00078GermanyRackehulFDR1He et al 15112.00078GermanyRackehulFDR2He et al 15112.00078GermanyRackehulFDR2He et al 15112.00078CanadaMottrealFDR2He et al 15113.0007CanadaMottrealFDR2He et al 15114.001CanadaForesFDR2He et al 15115.0024Unted KngdomEveterFDR2He et al 15115.003Unted KngdomEveterFDR2He et al 15115.004Unted KngdomEveterFDR2He et al 15115.005Unted KngdomEveterFDR1He et al 15115.006Unted KngdomEveterFDR1He et al 15115.007KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al 15115.007KoreaKoreaFDR1He et al 15115.007Unted KngdomEveterFDR1He et al 15115.007Unted KngdomEveterFDR1 </td <td>09-00077</td> <td>Germany</td> <td>Sindelfingen</td> <td>FQR2</td> <td>Steglich et al [10]</td> | 09-00077 | Germany | Sindelfingen | FQR2 | Steglich et al [10] | |
| 12.00001 Germany Homburg FCH2 Steplich et al 100 12.00014 Germany Leipzig FCH3 Steplich et al 100 12.00014 Germany Leipzig FCH3 Steplich et al 100 12.00017 Germany Bate Berkia FCH3 Steplich et al 101 12.00019 Germany Zatau FCH3 Steplich et al 101 12.00019 Germany Zatau FCH3 He et al 161 12.00019 Cantak Melbourne FCH2 He et al 161 12.00010 Cantak Melbourne FCH2 He et al 161 12.00010 Cantak Montreal FCH2 He et al 161 12.00010 Cantak Montreal FCH2 He et al 161 12.00010 Cantak Montreal FCH2 He et al 161 12.0001 Cantak FGM2 He et al 161 12.0014 Kingdom Everter FCH2 He et al 161 12.0014 He et al 161 Everter FCH2 He et | 10-00484 | Germany | Leipzig | FQR1 | Steglich et al [10] | |
| 12.0000/1GermanyBielefeldF0R2Stepich et al 10012.00017GermanyBack BekaF0R1Stepich et al 10012.00018GermanyBack BekaF0R1Stepich et al 10012.00019GermanyZitzauF0R1Stepich et al 10012.00019GermanyZitzauF0R1Stepich et al 10012.00019GermanyZitzauF0R1Stepich et al 10012.00019GermanyZitzauF0R2He et al 15712.00019GermanyEminiphemF0R2He et al 15712.0012United KingtomExerterF0R2He et al 16712.0013CanadaMontealF0R2He et al 16712.0014United KingtomExerterF0R2He et al 16712.0015United KingtomExerterF0R2He et al 16712.0014United KingtomExerterF0R2He et al 16712.0015United KingtomLondonF0R2He et al 16712.0016KoreaKoreaF0R1He et al 16712.0017United KingtomLondonF0R2He et al 16712.0018United KingtomLondonF0R2He et al 16712.0019United StatesForeaF0R1He et al 16712.0020United StatesAronaF0R1He et al 16712.0020United StatesAronaF0R1He et al 16712.0020United StatesAronaF0R1He et al 16712.0020Uni | 12-00001 | Germany | Homburg | FQR2 | Steglich et al [10] | |
| 12-00014 Germany Laipzig FDR1 Steglich et al 100 12-00017 Germany Batelseu FDR1 Steglich et al 100 12-00018 Germany Zatau FDR1 Steglich et al 101 12-00010 Germany Zatau FDR1 Steglich et al 104 12-00010 Australia Melbourne FDR2 He et al 161 8/002 United Kingdom Birningham FDR3 He et al 161 8/002 United Kingdom Exeter FDR3 He et al 161 Exeth14 United Kingdom Exeter FDR3 He et al 161 Exeth15 United Kingdom Exeter FDR3 He et al 161 Exeth14 United States Texes FDR3 He et al 161 Exeth15 United States Texes FDR3 He et al 161 Exeth14 United States Texes FDR3 He et al 161 Exeth25 United States Texes FDR3 He et al 161 Exeth155 United States <t< td=""><td>12-00004</td><td>Germany</td><td>Bielefeld</td><td>FQR2</td><td>Steglich et al [10]</td></t<> | 12-00004 | Germany | Bielefeld | FQR2 | Steglich et al [10] | |
| 12-0007GermanyBad BekaFOR1Snegkh et al 10012-00018GermanyRateboulFOR1Snegkh et al 10112-00018GermanyZitauFOR1Snegkh et al 101Ast001AusträlsMebourneFOR2He et al 151Ast005AusträlsMebourneFOR2He et al 161BMC18Uhietd KrigdomBirminghamFOR2He et al 161BMC18Uhietd KrigdomExeterFOR2He et al 161Can010CanadaMontrealFOR2He et al 161Ea0141United KrigdomExeterFOR2He et al 161Ea0141United KrigdomExeterFOR2He et al 161FCH4United StatesToxasFOR2Endres at al 191FCH4United StatesToxasFOR2He et al 161FCH4United StatesToxasFOR2He et al 161Kor003KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al 161Kor004KoreaFOR3He et al 161ESTM005United StatesArconaFOR1He et al 161LSTM002United StatesToxasFOR2Endres et al 181LSTM002United StatesToxasFOR2E | 12-00014 | Germany | Leipzig | FQR1 | Steglich et al [10] | |
| 12-00113GermaryRatebulFOR1Stiglich et al 10Aux001AustraliaMebourneFDR2He et al 15Aux002Unde KingdornBirmighernFDR2He et al 15BMC-18United KingdornExasFDR1Rom this studyBMC-18United KingdornExerFDR2He et al 15Exo101CondoMohrelaFDR2He et al 15Exo104United KingdornExerFDR2He et al 15Exo105United KingdornExerFDR2He et al 15FCH-1United KingdornExerFDR2He et al 15FCH-1United KingdornExerFDR2Endres et al 161FCH-4United StatesTexasFDR2Endres et al 161FCH-4United StatesTexasFDR2Endres et al 161FCH-4United StatesTexasFDR1He et al 15Ker002KoreaKoreaFDR1He et al 15Ker003KoreaKoreaFDR1He et al 15Ker004KoreaFOR2Endres et al 161LSTM005United StatesArizonaFDR1He et al 15LSTM005United StatesArizonaFDR1He et al 15LSTM005United StatesFoxasFDR1He et al 15LSTM005United StatesFoxasFDR2Endres et al 16LSTM005United StatesTexasFDR2Endres et al 16LSTM005United StatesTexasFDR2Endres | 12-00017 | Germany | Bad Berka | FQR1 | Steglich et al [10] | |
| 12.0001bGarmaryZitsuFOR1Singlin et al. [10]Aus001AustraliaMebourneFOR2He et al. [5]Aus002United KingdomBirminghamFOR2He et al. [5]BIV021United KingdomBirminghamFOR2He et al. [5]BIV018United StatesTexasFOR1Hen et al. [5]Can010CanadaMontrealFOR2He et al. [5]Exe014United KingdomExetrerFOR2He et al. [5]Exe014United KingdomExetrerFOR2He et al. [6]FCH-1United KingdomExetrerFOR2Enders et al. [9]FCH-1United KingdomLondonFOR2Enders et al. [9]FCH-1United KingdomLondonFOR2Enders et al. [9]FCH4United KingdomLondonFOR2He et al. [5]Kor002KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al. [5]Kor003KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al. [5]Kor004KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al. [5]Kor005KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al. [5]Kor005United StatesAizonaFOR1He et al. [6]Kor005United StatesAizonaFOR1He et al. [6]Kor005United StatesAizonaFOR1He et al. [6]Kor005United StatesAizonaFOR1He et al. [6]Kor005United StatesForasFOR2Enders et al. [6]Kor005United State | 12-00018 | Germany | Radebeul | FQR1 | Steglich et al [10] | |
| Aus001 Australia Melbourne FOR2 He et al [5] Aus005 Australia Melbourne FOR2 He et al [5] BMC-18 United Kingdom Texas FOR1 He et al [5] Ch010 Cando Montrelal FOR2 He et al [5] Exe014 United Kingdom Exerer FOR2 He et al [5] FCH-1 United Kingdom Exerer FOR2 He et al [5] FCH-4 United States Texas FOR2 Enders et al [9] FCH-4 United States Texas FOR2 Enders et al [9] FCH-4 United States Texas FOR1 He et al [5] Kor005 Korea Korea FOR1 He et al [5] Kor004 Korea Korea FOR1 He et al [5] StM002 United States Arcona FOR1 He et al [5] StM003 United States Arcona FOR1 He et al [5] StM004 United States Arcona FOR1 | 12-00019 | Germany | Zittau | FQR1 | Steglich et al [10] | |
| AusdöfsAustraliaMelbourneFOR2He et al [5]BV022United KingdomBirminghamFOR2He et al [5]BVC16United KingdomExeterFOR2He et al [5]Ex014United KingdomExeterFOR2He et al [5]Ex015United KingdomExeterFOR2He et al [5]Ex016United KingdomExeterFOR2He et al [5]Ex015United KingdomExeterFOR2He et al [6]FCH-1United StatesToxasFOR2Endres et al [8]FCH-2United StatesToxasFOR2He et al [5]K0020KoreaKoreaFOR3FOR1He et al [5]K0020KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]K0030KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]K0040KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]K0050KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]L51M002United StatesArzonaFOR1He et al [5]L51M003United StatesArzonaFOR1He et al [5]L51M004United StatesCregonFOR1He et al [5]L51M005United StatesToxasFOR2Endres et al [8]L51M005United StatesToxasFOR2Endres et al [8]L51M005United StatesToxasFOR2Endres et al [8]L51M005United StatesToxasFOR2Endres et al [8]L51M055United StatesToxas< | Aus001 | Australia | Melbourne | FQR2 | He et al [5] | |
| Br002United KingdomBrminghamFOR2He at al [5]BMC-18United KingdomExaterFOR2He at al [5]Exe014United KingdomExaterFOR2He at al [5]Exe015United KingdomExaterFOR2He at al [5]FCH-1United KingdomExaterFOR2He at al [5]FCH-1United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]FCH-4United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]FCH-4United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]Kor005United KingdomLondonFOR1He at al [5]Kor003KoreaKoreaFOR1He at al [5]Kor004KoraaKoraaFOR1He at al [5]Kor005KoreaKoreaFOR1He at al [5]LSTM002United StatesArizonaFOR1He at al [5]LSTM005United StatesArizonaFOR1He at al [5]LSTM005United StatesArizonaFOR2Erdres et al [9]LSTM025United StatesTexasFOR2Erdres et al [9]LSTM025 <td< td=""><td>Aus005</td><td>Australia</td><td>Melbourne</td><td>FQR2</td><td>He et al [5]</td></td<> | Aus005 | Australia | Melbourne | FQR2 | He et al [5] | |
| BMC-18 United States Texas FOR1 From this study Can00 Carada Montreal FOR2 He et al [5] Exe014 United Kingdom Exister FOR2 He et al [5] Exe015 United Kingdom Exister FOR2 He et al [5] FCH-1 United States Texas FOR2 Endres et al [9] FCH-4 United States Texas FOR2 Endres et al [9] FCH-4 United States Texas FOR2 Endres et al [9] FCH-4 United States Texas FOR2 He et al [5] Kor002 Korea Korea FOR1 He et al [5] Kor003 Korea Korea FOR1 He et al [5] Kor004 Korea Korea FOR1 He et al [5] LSTM005 United States Arizona FOR1 He et al [5] LSTM005 United States Arizona FOR1 He et al [5] LSTM005 United States Texas FOR2 Fodres et al [9] LSTM005 United States Texas FOR2 Fodres et al [9] LSTM005 United States Texas FOR2 Endres et al [5] LSTM005 <td< td=""><td>Bir002</td><td>United Kingdom</td><td>Birmingham</td><td>FQR2</td><td>He et al [5]</td></td<> | Bir002 | United Kingdom | Birmingham | FQR2 | He et al [5] | |
| Can010CanadaMontrealFOR2He et al (5)Exe014United KingdomExetterFOR2He et al (5)Exe015United KingdomExetterFOR2He et al (5)FCH-1United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (9)FCH-2United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (9)FCH-4United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (9)FCH-4United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (9)Ka002KoreaKoreaKoreaFOR1He et al (5)Ka003KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al (5)Ka004KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al (5)STM005United StatesAnzonaFOR1He et al (5)STM006United StatesAnzonaFOR1He et al (5)STM005United StatesAnzonaFOR1He et al (5)STM005United StatesAnzonaFOR1He et al (5)STM005United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (9)LSTM025United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (8)LTC16United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (8)LTC14United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (8)LTC15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (8)LTC16United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (8)LTC14United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (8)LTC15United States | BMC-18 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study | |
| Exe014United KingdomExeterFOR2He et al [5]Exe015United KingdomExeterFOR2Endres et al [5]FCH-1United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [6]FCH-4United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [6]FCH-4United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [6]Kor005United KingdomLondonFOR2He et al [5]Kor004KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor005KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor004KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor005United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM002United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM005United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM005United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM022United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [6]LC100United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [6]LTC14United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [6]LTC15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [6]LTC164United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [6]LTC154United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [6]LTC154United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [6]LTC154United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [6]LTC154Unite | Can010 | Canada | Montreal | FQR2 | He et al [5] | |
| Bed015United KingdomExterFOR2He et al [5]FCH-1United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]FCH-4United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]FCH-4United KingdomLondonFOR2He et al [5]Kor002KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor003KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor004KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor005KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor005KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor005United StatesPennsylvaniaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM002United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM005United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM005United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC10United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC14United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC16United StatesTexas | Exe014 | United Kingdom | Exeter | FOR2 | He et al [5] | |
| FCH-1United StatesTaxasFOR2Endres et al [9]FCH-4United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]Ham005United KingdomLondonFOR2He et al [5]Kor020KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor030KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor030United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM005United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM022United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM025United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC14United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC16United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC18United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC18United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC18United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC30United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFOR2 | Exe015 | United Kingdom | Exeter | FOR2 | He et al [5] | |
| FCH-2United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]FCH-4United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]Kor005United KingdornLondonFOR2He et al [5]Kor002KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor003KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor004KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor005KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor005KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM002United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM005United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM005United StatesOregonFOR1He et al [5]LSTM025United KingdornDundeeFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC10United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC14United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC16United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexas <td>FCH-1</td> <td>United States</td> <td>Texas</td> <td>FOR2</td> <td>Endres et al [9]</td> | FCH-1 | United States | Texas | FOR2 | Endres et al [9] | |
| Dr.1.2Dr.102Dr.102Endres et al [9]Ham:005United StatesTexasFOR2He et al [6]Kor002KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [6]Kor003KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [6]Kor004KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [6]Kor005KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [6]Kor005KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [6]LSTM002United StatesPennsylvaniaFOR1He et al [6]LSTM005United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [6]LSTM005United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [6]LSTM022United StatesOregonFOR1He et al [6]LSTM025United KingdornDundeeFOR2He et al [6]LTC10United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC14United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC16United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC18United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFOR2 | FCH-2 | United States | Texas | FOR2 | Endres et al [9] | |
| Non-SectionCondorFondFondFondEntroperiodKarrobaKorreaKorreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor020KorreaKorreaFOR1He et al [6]Kor030KorreaKorreaFOR1He et al [6]Kor040KorreaKorreaFOR1He et al [6]Kor050KorreaKorreaFOR1He et al [6]Kor050KorreaKorreaFOR1He et al [6]LSTM002United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [6]LSTM005United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [6]LSTM005United StatesOregonFOR1He et al [6]LSTM022United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [6]LTC10United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [6]LTC14United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [8]LTC15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC16AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC3AUnited StatesT | FCH-4 | | Texas | FOR2 | Endres et al [9] | |
| NambolDrived NationDrived NationDrived NationKord02KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor033KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor044KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]Kor055KoreaKoreaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM005United StatesPennsylvaniaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM006United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM022United StatesOregonFOR1He et al [5]LSTM025United KatesTexasFOR2He et al [5]LSTM025United KingdomDundeeFOR2He et al [5]LTC10United KatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC14United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15BUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexas | Ham005 | United States | London | FOR2 | | |
| NoticalNotesFCh1Index and a index and a Kord03Kord03KoreaKoreaKoreaFCR1He et al [5]Kord04KoreaKoreaFCR1He et al [6]LSTM005United StatesKoreaFCR1He et al [6]LSTM005United StatesArizonaFCR1He et al [6]LSTM006United StatesArizonaFCR1He et al [6]LSTM022United StatesArizonaFCR1He et al [6]LSTM025United StatesOregonFCR1He et al [6]LSTM025United StatesTexasFCR2He et al [6]LTC10United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC14United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC15United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC16AUnited StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC19United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC | Kor002 | Koroa | Koroa | EOR1 | | |
| NotesNotesNotesFor aFOR1He at al [5]KorlodKoreaKoreaFOR1He at al [5]KorlodKoreaKoreaFOR1He at al [5]LSTM005United StatesPennsylvaniaFOR1He at al [5]LSTM006United StatesArizonaFOR1He at al [5]LSTM022United StatesOregonFOR1He at al [5]LSTM025United StatesOregonFOR2He at al [5]LSTM025United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC10United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC14United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15BUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC44United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC34< | Kor002 | Korea | Korea | FOB1 | | |
| NOLO4NotesNotesPCR1He et al [5]Korlo5KoreaKoreaFCR1He et al [5]LSTM002United StatesPennsylvaniaFCR1He et al [5]LSTM005United StatesArizonaFCR1He et al [5]LSTM022United StatesArizonaFCR1He et al [5]LSTM025United StatesOregonFCR1He et al [5]LSTM025United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC10United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC14United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC15United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC16United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC163United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC38United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC34United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC44United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC44United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC44United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC44 <td>Kor004</td> <td>Koroo</td> <td>Koree</td> <td>EOP1</td> <td></td> | Kor004 | Koroo | Koree | EOP1 | | |
| NotedNotedNotedPCR1He et al [5]LSTM002United StatesPennsylvaniaFQR1He et al [5]LSTM006United StatesArizonaFQR1He et al [5]LSTM002United StatesArizonaFQR1He et al [5]LSTM022United StatesOregonFQR1He et al [5]LSTM025United StatesTexasFQR2He et al [5]LTC10United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC14United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC15United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC164United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC155United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC164United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC34United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC44United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC78United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC78United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC78United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9] | K01004 | Korea | Korea | FOR1 | He et al [5] | |
| La Induo2United StatesPerinsyvarialPOn1The et al [5]LSTM005United StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM022United StatesOregonFOR1He et al [5]LSTM025United StatesOregonFOR1He et al [5]LSTM025United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC10United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15BUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC16AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15BUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9 | | Noted | Denney durania | FOR1 | | |
| La modoUnited StatesArizonaFOR1He et al [5]LSTM005United StatesOregonFOR1He et al [5]LSTM025United KingdomDundeeFOR2He et al [5]LTC10United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC14United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC16United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC16United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC19United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC44United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]MCD-173United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]MCD-174United StatesTexasFOR1From this studyMDA133United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS-301United StatesTexasFOR2From this study <td></td> <td>United States</td> <td>Arizona</td> <td></td> <td></td> | | United States | Arizona | | | |
| La IndoidoOnited StatesAnzolaPAN1The et al [5]LSTM022United StatesOregonFQR1He et al [5]LSTM025United KingdomDundeeFQR2He et al [5]LTC10United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC14United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC15United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC15AUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC15BUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC19United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC44United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC44United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC78United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC78United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-116United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMCD-116United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS430United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS431United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS430United StatesTexasFQR2From this study< | | | Arizona | FOR1 | | |
| La Indez StatesOregonFOR1He et al [5]LSTM022United StatesTexasFOR2He et al [5]LTC 10United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC 14United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC 15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC 16United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC 16United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC 19United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC 36United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC 39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC 34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC 34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC 44United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC 44United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC 78United StatesTexasFOR1From this studyMCD-116United StatesTexasFOR1From this studyMCD-106United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMDA133United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS-400United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS-410United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS-420United StatesTexasFOR2From this study< | | United States | Arizona | FURI | | |
| La InvizaUnited KingdomDundeeFUR.2He et al (s)LTC10United KitesTexasFOR2Endres et al (s)LTC-14United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (s)LTC15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (s)LTC15AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (s)LTC15BUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (s)LTC19United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (s)LTC36United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (s)LTC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (s)LTC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (s)LTC44United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (s)LTC5AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al (s)< | | | Durada a | FOR | | |
| LIC10United StatesTexasFUR2Endres et al [9]LIC14United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LIC15United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LIC15AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LIC15BUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LIC19United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LIC36United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LIC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LIC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LIC34United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LIC5AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LIC44United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LIC5AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LIC7BUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LIC7BUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]MCD-116United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]MCD-173United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]MCD-173United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]MDA133United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]MHS-301United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS-302United StatesTexasFOR2From this study | LSTIVIU25 | | Dundee | FURZ | He et al [5] | |
| LTC-14United StatesTexasFCH2Endres et al [9]LTC 15United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC 15AUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC 15BUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC 19United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC 36United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC 39United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC 34United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC 5AUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC 7BUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC 7BUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]MCD-116United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]MCD-173United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-60United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]MLS 301United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS 430United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS 4479United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS 4490United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS 490United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS 490United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS 490United StatesTexasFQR2 | | United States | lexas T | FQR2 | Endres et al [9] | |
| LIC15United StatesTexasFUR2Endres et al [9]LTC15AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15BUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC19United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC44United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC7BUnited StatesTexasFOR1From this studyMCD-116United StatesTexasFOR1From this studyMCD-173United StatesTexasFOR1From this studyMDA133United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS-301United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS-480United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS-480United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS480United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS480United StatesTexasFOR2From this study | LIC-14 | United States | lexas | FUR2 | Endres et al [9] | |
| LIC15AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC15BUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC19United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC44United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC5AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC7BUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC7BUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]MCD-116United StatesTexasFOR1From this studyMCD-13United StatesTexasFOR1From this studyMDA133United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS-301United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS-479United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS-480United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS-480United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFOR2From this study <td>LIC15</td> <td>United States</td> <td>lexas</td> <td>FQR2</td> <td>Endres et al [9]</td> | LIC15 | United States | lexas | FQR2 | Endres et al [9] | |
| LIC13BUnited StatesTexasFGR2Endres et al [9]LTC19United StatesTexasFGR2Endres et al [9]LTC36United StatesTexasFGR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFGR2Endres et al [9]LTC39AUnited StatesTexasFGR2Endres et al [9]LTC44United StatesTexasFGR2Endres et al [9]LTC5AUnited StatesTexasFGR2Endres et al [9]LTC7BUnited StatesTexasFGR2Endres et al [9]LTC7BUnited StatesTexasFGR1From this studyMCD-116United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-60United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMDA133United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-301United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-479United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-479United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS480United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1039United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR2From this study< | LIC15A | United States | lexas | FQR2 | Endres et al [9] | |
| LTC19United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC-36United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC39AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC44United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC5AUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC7BUnited StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]LTC7BUnited StatesTexasFOR1Endres et al [9]MCD-116United StatesTexasFOR1From this studyMCD-60United StatesTexasFOR2Endres et al [9]MDA133United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS-301United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS-479United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS-480United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS480United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS480United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFOR2From this studyMT1340United StatesTexasFOR2From this study <td>LTC15B</td> <td>United States</td> <td>Texas</td> <td>FQR2</td> <td>Endres et al [9]</td> | LTC15B | United States | Texas | FQR2 | Endres et al [9] | |
| LTC-36United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC39United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC39AUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC44United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC5AUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC7BUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC7BUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]MCD-116United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-173United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-60United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMDA133United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-301United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-322United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-479United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-480United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | LTC19 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | Endres et al [9] | |
| LTC39United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC39AUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC44United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC5AUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC7BUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]MCD-116United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-173United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-60United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMDA133United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-301United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-322United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-480United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1340United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1340United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | LTC-36 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | Endres et al [9] | |
| LTC39AUnited StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC44United StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC5AUnited StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]LTC7BUnited StatesTexasFCR2Endres et al [9]MCD-116United StatesTexasFCR1From this studyMCD-173United StatesTexasFCR1From this studyMCD-60United StatesTexasFCR2From this studyMDA133United StatesTexasFCR2From this studyMHS-301United StatesTexasFCR2From this studyMHS-479United StatesTexasPre-epidemicFrom this studyMHS480United StatesTexasFCR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasFCR2From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFCR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFCR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFCR2From this studyMT1340United StatesTexasFCR1From this stu | LTC39 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | Endres et al [9] | |
| LTC44United StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC5AUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC7BUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]MCD-116United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-173United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-60United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMDA133United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-301United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-322United StatesTexasPre-epidemicFrom this studyMHS-479United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS480United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | LTC39A | United States | Texas | FQR2 | Endres et al [9] | |
| LTC5AUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]LTC7BUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]MCD-116United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-173United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-60United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMDA133United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-301United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-479United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | LTC44 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | Endres et al [9] | |
| LTC7BUnited StatesTexasFQR2Endres et al [9]MCD-116United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-173United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-60United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMDA133United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-301United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-479United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS480United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1039United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | LTC5A | United States | Texas | FQR2 | Endres et al [9] | |
| MCD-116United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-173United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-60United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMDA133United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-301United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-479United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-480United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1039United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | LTC7B | United States | Texas | FQR2 | Endres et al [9] | |
| MCD-173United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMCD-60United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMDA133United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-301United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-322United StatesTexasPre-epidemicFrom this studyMHS-479United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-480United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1039United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | MCD-116 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study | |
| MCD-60United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMDA133United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-301United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-322United StatesTexasPre-epidemicFrom this studyMHS-479United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-480United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1039United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | MCD-173 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study | |
| MDA133United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-301United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-322United StatesTexasPre-epidemicFrom this studyMHS-479United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-480United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1039United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | MCD-60 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study | |
| MHS-301United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-322United StatesTexasPre-epidemicFrom this studyMHS-479United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-480United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasPre-epidemicFrom this studyMT1039United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | MDA133 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study | |
| MHS-322United StatesTexasPre-epidemicFrom this studyMHS-479United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-480United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasPre-epidemicFrom this studyMT1039United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | MHS-301 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study | |
| MHS-479United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS-480United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasPre-epidemicFrom this studyMT1039United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | MHS-322 | United States | Texas | Pre-epidemic | From this study | |
| MHS-480United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMHS490United StatesTexasPre-epidemicFrom this studyMT1039United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | MHS-479 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study | |
| MHS490United StatesTexasPre-epidemicFrom this studyMT1039United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | MHS-480 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study | |
| MT1039United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | MHS490 | United States | Texas | Pre-epidemic | From this study | |
| MT1300United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | MT1039 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study | |
| MT1344United StatesTexasFQR2From this studyMT1349United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | MT1300 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study | |
| MT1349United StatesTexasFQR1From this studyMT1410United StatesTexasFQR2From this study | MT1344 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study | |
| MT1410 United States Texas FQR2 From this study | MT1349 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study | |
| | MT1410 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study | |

Table 1. Continued

| Isolate | Isolation Country | Isolation Region | FQR Lineage | Reference |
|----------|-------------------|------------------|-------------|-----------------|
| MT1433 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study |
| MT1443 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study |
| MT1453 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study |
| MT1470 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study |
| MT1641 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study |
| MT1753 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT1821 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT188 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT189 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study |
| MT201 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT2040 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT207 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT2252 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT2626 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT2710 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT2715 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study |
| MT2780 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT2795 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study |
| MT3133 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT3227 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study |
| MT3678 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT443 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT-4447 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT-5025 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT-5051 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study |
| MT-5055 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT-5064 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT5314 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT5337 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT5342 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study |
| MT5370 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| MT785 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| P23 | United States | Pennsylvania | FQR2 | He et al [5] |
| P31 | United States | Pennsylvania | FQR2 | He et al [5] |
| P45 | United States | Pennsylvania | FQR2 | He et al [5] |
| R20291 | United Kingdom | Stoke Mandeville | FQR2 | He et al [5] |
| SH1171 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| SH515 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| SH541 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study |
| SH-769 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| SH-797 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study |
| SH-804 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| VM-2-S41 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| VM-2-S60 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| VM-5-S43 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| VM-5-S59 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| VM-8-S42 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| VM-8-S58 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| WH-28 | United States | Texas | FQR1 | From this study |
| WH-29 | United States | Texas | FQR2 | From this study |
| ZKS-32 | United States | Kansas | FQR1 | From this study |

lineage's worldwide dissemination may have been hampered by cell fitness.

groups, possibly due to differences in sequence coverage in some strains (Figure 2A). However, targeted analysis of high variability regions separated strains into 2 prominent groups, corresponding to FQR1 and FQR2 lineages (Figure 2A). The

Gene presence or absence was also used to discriminate ribotype 027 strains [5]. This analysis separated strains into distinct



Figure 1. Maximum-likelihood phylogeny based on 2841 core genome single-nucleotide polymorphisms amongst ribotype 027 *Clostridioides difficile* samples. (A) The phylogenetic tree includes 108 samples, which depicts some isolates as outliers. (B) A zoomed in phylogenetic tree clearly separates the FQR1 and FQR2 lineages.

region shared among epidemic strains (FQR1 and FQR2) that was absent in the pre-epidemic strain was the transposable element, Tn6192. In contrast, Tn6105 was present in FQR2 strains and was absent in FQR1 strains. The presence or absence of a genomic region corresponding to ABC transporter proteins was not able to discriminate between the FQR1 and FQR2 strains because this was present in approximately half of the strains. This region was more commonly found in strains outside of the United States. Another noticeable missing feature in 6 US strains was CDR20291_1079, which encodes for a putative teicoplanin resistance protein. Finally, 3 strains were missing a gene cluster corresponding to ethanolamine metabolism. Two of the 3 strains were of the FQR1 lineage and were found to be outliers by maximum-likelihood phylogeny using whole genome SNP analysis. Clinical data were available for these 2 patients, 1 of which had fatal refractory CDI. Coincidentally, these strains were also found to harbor SNPs in several other metabolic pathways that may impact virulence properties (Supplemental Figure 1B).

Because the FQR strains are genetically resistant to fluoroquinolones, we also determined whether other known antimicrobial resistance genes were coinherited. In total, 69 of 108

samples (64%) had at least 1 other antimicrobial resistance gene with the most common being ermB (67%) encoding the MLSb (macrolide, lincosamide, and streptogramin B) phenotype (Figure 2B). Other genes encoding aminoglycoside (AAC(6')-Ie-APH(2")-Ia, AAC(6')-Im, APH2-Ib, and Sttr), β-lactam (TEM-1d and BlaZ), trimethoprim (DfrC), MLSb (MsrA and VgaA), and tetracycline resistance (tetM and tetW) were also present in some strains. Tetracycline resistance was more common in US strains compared with other worldwide strains (n = 17 of 18 total). In general, antimicrobial resistance genes could be used as a means of separating the 2 lineages (Figure 2B). In total, FQR1 strains contained more antimicrobial resistance genes compared with the FQR2 strains (Figure 2C). It is interesting to note that 31.5% of FQR2 strains from Houston were positive for *ermB*, whereas no geographically removed strain was positive for this.

Bayesian phylogenetic and phylogeographic analyses were carried out on the FQR1 and FQR2 strains as previously reported [5, 10]. Consistent with these prior findings, our analysis indicated that mutations arose in the *C difficile* ribotype 027 core genome at a rate of 1.4×10^{-7} SNPs per site per year corresponding to approximately 1 mutation per genome

Table 2. Prominent SNP Differences Between FQR1 and FQR2 Strains

| Position (bp) | Gene | Gene Product | Change | R20291 | FQR1 | FQR2 |
|---------------|---------------|--|---------------|--------|------|------|
| 95422 | CDR20291_0060 | DNA-directed RNA polymerase beta chain | Nonsynonymous | G | А | G |
| 95552 | CDR20291_0060 | DNA-directed RNA polymerase beta chain | Nonsynonymous | А | G | А |
| 118571 | CDR20291_0090 | Putative ribosomal protein | Nonsynonymous | G | А | G |
| 563962 | CDR20291_0466 | Chemotaxis protein methyltransferase | Nonsynonymous | А | С | А |
| 879963 | CDR20291_0712 | Penicillin-binding protein | Nonsynonymous | С | Т | С |
| 1026853 | CDR20291_0842 | 2-isopropylmalate synthase | Synonymous | G | А | G |
| 1202866 | CDR20291_0985 | Putative penicillin-binding protein | Nonsynonymous | С | G | С |
| 1203554 | CDR20291_0985 | Putative penicillin-binding protein | Nonsynonymous | С | Т | С |
| 1232712 | CDR20291_1013 | Conserved hypothetical protein | Nonsynonymous | С | А | С |
| 1460490 | CDR20291_1231 | Probable transporter | Nonsynonymous | А | С | А |
| 1547479 | CDR20291_1308 | Putative 5-nitroimidazole reductase | Nonsynonymous | Т | А | Т |
| 1600434 | CDR20291_1354 | Putative drug/sodium antiporters | Nonsynonymous | G | С | G |
| 1600436 | CDR20291_1354 | Putative drug/sodium antiporters | Nonsynonymous | Т | С | Т |
| 1794733 | CDR20291_1522 | 2-component response regulator | Nonsynonymous | А | G | А |
| 2448413 | CDR20291_2088 | ATP-dependent RNA helicase | Nonsynonymous | А | G | А |
| 2459187 | CDR20291_2096 | Cyclomaltodextrinase (maltogenic alpha-amylase) | Synonymous | А | G | А |
| 2568546 | | | Intergenic | G | А | G |
| 2649551 | CDR20291_2259 | Quinolinate synthetase A | Nonsynonymous | G | Т | G |
| 2665592 | CDR20291_2272 | Putative signaling protein | Nonsynonymous | Т | G | Т |
| 2803020 | CDR20291_2394 | Putative histidinol-phosphate aminotransferase | Nonsynonymous | G | А | G |
| 2931889 | CDR20291_2499 | Hypothetical protein | Nonsynonymous | А | G | А |
| 2942446 | | | Intergenic | G | А | G |
| 3111866 | CDR20291_2643 | Phosphoenolpyruvate-protein phosphotransferase | Synonymous | С | А | С |
| 3128507 | CDR20291_2657 | Capsular polysaccharide biosynthesis protein | Synonymous | А | G | А |
| 3163982 | CDR20291_2682 | Cell surface protein (S-layer precursor protein) | Nonsynonymous | G | А | G |
| 3248655 | CDR20291_2744 | D-alanine–poly(phosphoribitol) ligase subunit 1 (D-alanine-activating enzyme) | Nonsynonymous | А | С | A |
| 3500659 | | | Intergenic | G | А | G |
| 3600925 | CDR20291_3018 | Ribonuclease R | Nonsynonymous | G | Т | G |

per year. Bayesian analyses confirmed the distribution of isolates within the fluoroquinolone resistance lineages and also demonstrated sublineages of Houston isolates within FQR1 and FQR2. Emergence of the FQR1 strain was calculated to be as early as 1985, whereas emergence of the FQR2 strain was calculated to be in 1990 (Figure 3A). Ciprofloxacin and norfloxacin were approved shortly before 1985 by the US Food and Drug Administration, suggesting that use of these antibiotics may have contributed to the ribotype 027 epidemic. Although these are predictions for the emergence of the first fluoroquinolone-resistant strains, the strains began proliferating and spreading in the mid-1990s [5, 10]. Both lineages are predicted to have emerged from the United States with high probability (Figure 3B). Considering the number of hospital systems in Houston and Texas-wide, we also investigated the transmission events that have occurred within the city and to neighboring cities. Most of the isolates were derived from Texas Medical Center hospitals and were transmitted to other hospitals/sites (Figure 3C). There was significant mixing amongst hospital systems within Houston likely resulting in the unique Houston strains that are described (Supplemental Figure 3).

DISCUSSION

Prior investigations into the worldwide dissemination of the ribotype 027 epidemic strain are limited by a low number of globally available strains for typing, specifically FQR1 lineage isolates from the United States. Considering this, we sought to conduct a large, epidemiologic study to better understand the emergence of ribotype 027 in the United States. Using whole genome sequencing, we demonstrated that both fluoroquinolone resistance lineages (FQR1 and FQR2) were equally present in hospitalized patients with CDI in Texas. Core genome SNP analysis was able to discriminate between the 2 lineages, as well as determine the presence or absence of specific genes (Tn6192, Tn6105, putative teicoplanin resistance gene, and the ethanolamine gene cluster). Worldwide resistance differences were noted including teicoplanin resistance that was relatively absent in US strains. The ethanolamine gene cluster was absent in only 3 strains in our collection, all isolated from the United States. Mechanistic gene mutation studies have shown that absence of this gene cluster increases virulence, suggesting that this may have also contributed to more aggressive infections in humans [26]. Several antimicrobial resistance traits unique to



Figure 2. Gene presence or absence analysis amongst 108 clinical strains. (A) Genes that were covered by sequencing in the R20291 genome for each strain were plotted as green, whereas gene absence is plotted red. Gene absence may have been due to low coverage in some of the strains. A closer view of regions of high variability on the right allows for complete discrimination between FQR1 and FQR2 strains. (B) Antimicrobial resistance genes were found in the genomes of the samples, and (C) overall gene presence is shown for FQR1, FQR2, and the pre-epidemic strains.

Houston strains were also identified in our collection, including increased presence of tetracycline resistance genes. In general, FQR1 strains had more antimicrobial resistance genes compared with FQR2 strains, which may be partially explained by this strain emerging earlier. All of these findings will need to be expanded and confirmed in future studies.

Although previous reports provided a global overview of the 2 epidemic ribotype 027 lineages, they do not show how isolates differ genetically at the geographic level, especially in the United States. In this study, we demonstrated that sublineages of FQR1 and FQR2 have become unique to the greater Houston vicinity compared with worldwide comparators. This study also provides data to support a hypothesis that extends the potential emergence of the ribotype 027 lineage back to the 1980s and early 1990s.

These dates coincide with the clinical use of fluoroquinolone antibiotics in the United States, suggesting that resistance developed quickly after introduction of these drugs into clinical practice [2]. Fluoroquinolone resistance was first documented in *E coli* as early as 1969 after the introduction of nalidixic acid into clinical practice in 1967, and thus resistance in *C difficile* approximately 15 years later may be expected. Compared to the relatively slow mutation rate observed in *C difficile*, *E coli* mutate at a rate almost 10 000 times faster, which likely contributed to the earlier accelerated resistance [27]. However, as fluoroquinolones became more widely used in the 1990s and early 2000s, increased antimicrobial selection pressure on *C difficile* strains increased the likelihood that a fluoroquinolone-resistant mutant could emerge as an epidemic ribotype. This hypothesis will require further testing.



Figure 3. Bayesian phylogenetic and phylogeographic analyses of FQR1 and FQR2 strains. The computational tool BEAST2 was used to incorporate time and geography variables with the single-nucleotide polymorphism analysis. (A) Phylogenetic analyses are plotted with US Food and Drug Administration approval dates for certain fluoroquinolones. (B) Predictive dissemination of FQR1 (red lines) and FQR2 (blue lines) strains worldwide and (C) within Texas.

An additional notable finding was that both FQR1 and FQR2 strains were present in equal abundance in the United States, compared with other global sites. FQR1 strains harbored more antimicrobial resistance genes, and 2 FQR1 isolates were identified that predicted more serious infection course. Further studies will be needed to establish whether FQR1 strains remained in the United States because of changes in cellular metabolism (increased SNPs found in metabolic genes) and natural selection due to antibiotic use. This is indicated from the Bayesian genetic analysis (Figure 3A) as a stepwise evolution of the FQR1 strains compared with the FQR2 strains in which sublineages emerged at the same time. Regardless of this, our study shows that these strains are still present in the United States and represent a continued urgent threat.

This study has limitations. We sampled a limited number of regional isolates and compared them to the worldwide collection of ribotype 027 isolates that have already been reported. Increasing sample size would strengthen the Bayesian and phylogeographic analyses and allow more precise mapping of isolates within the United States. In addition, because of the highly international nature of healthcare in the Texas Medical Center Houston, many patients travel to Houston from other countries and may have impacted the phylogeographic analyses. The geographic clustering that we observed in this study will need to be demonstrated in other large regional medical centers as well.

CONCLUSIONS

In conclusion, we found that both FQR1 and FQR2 epidemic C *difficile* ribotype 027 lineages were present in our sample cohort and emerged earlier than previous reports coinciding with increased use of fluoroquinolones. Our findings also indicate that local prescribing patterns may have led to antibiotic resistance that is present in these genomes. Looking forward, more epidemiological tracking studies are needed to understand the evolving dynamics of *C difficile*.

Supplementary Data

Supplementary materials are available at *Open Forum Infectious Diseases* online. Consisting of data provided by the authors to benefit the reader, the posted materials are not copyedited and are the sole responsibility of the authors, so questions or comments should be addressed to the corresponding author.

Acknowledgments

We thank the University of Houston Seq-N-Edit core for help with sequencing. We also thank the University of Houston Center for Advanced Computing and Data Science, specifically Peggy Lindner, for their assistance and support with the bioinformatics analyses.

Author contributions. All authors contributed equally and made substantial contributions to the following: the conception or design of the work; the acquisition, analysis, or interpretation of data for the work; and drafting the work or revising it critically for important intellectual content and final approval of the version to be published. They agree to be accountable for all aspects of the work in ensuring that questions related to the accuracy or integrity of any part of the work are appropriately investigated and resolved. *Financial support.* This work was funded by the National Institutes of Health National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases (U01AI124290-01 and 1R56AI126881-01A1) and the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC-RFA-CK17-1701).

Potential conflict of interests. K. W. G. has received consulting fees and research grant support from Merck & Co., Synthetic Biologics, and Summit, PLC. All authors have submitted the ICMJE Form for Disclosure of Potential Conflicts of Interest. Conflicts that the editors consider relevant to the content of the manuscript have been disclosed.

References

- Neuhauser MM, Weinstein RA, Rydman R, et al. Antibiotic resistance among Gram-negative bacilli in US intensive care units: implications for fluoroquinolone use. JAMA 2003; 289:885–8.
- Emmerson AM, Jones AM. The quinolones: decades of development and use. J Antimicrob Chemother 2003; 51(Suppl 1):13–20.
- Hooper DC. Clinical applications of quinolones. Biochim Biophys Acta 1998; 1400:45-61.
- Fàbrega A, Madurga S, Giralt E, Vila J. Mechanism of action of and resistance to quinolones. *Microb Biotechnol* 2009; 2:40–61.
- He M, Miyajima F, Roberts P, et al. Emergence and global spread of epidemic healthcare-associated *Clostridium difficile*. Nat Genet 2013; 45:109–13.
- McDonald LC, Killgore GE, Thompson A, et al. An epidemic, toxin gene-variant strain of *Clostridium difficile*. N Engl J Med 2005; 353:2433–41.
- Aitken SL, Alam MJ, Khaleduzzaman M, et al. In the endemic setting, *Clostridium difficile* ribotype 027 is virulent but not hypervirulent. *Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol* 2015; 36:1318–23.
- Alam MJ, Walk ST, Endres BT, et al. Community environmental contamination of toxigenic Clostridium difficile. Open Forum Infect Dis 2017; 4:ofx018.
- Endres BT, Dotson KM, Poblete K, et al. Environmental transmission of *Clostridioides* difficile ribotype 027 at a long-term care facility; an outbreak investigation guided by whole genome sequencing. *Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol* 2018; 39:1322–9.
- Steglich M, Nitsche A, von Müller L, et al. Tracing the spread of *Clostridium difficile* ribotype 027 in Germany based on bacterial genome sequences. *PLoS One* 2015; 10:e0139811.
- Bolger AM, Lohse M, Usadel B. Trimmomatic: a flexible trimmer for Illumina sequence data. *Bioinformatics* 2014; 30:2114–20.

- Gupta SK, Padmanabhan BR, Diene SM, et al. ARG-ANNOT, a new bioinformatic tool to discover antibiotic resistance genes in bacterial genomes. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 2014; 58:212–20.
- Inouye M, Dashnow H, Raven LA, et al. SRST2: Rapid genomic surveillance for public health and hospital microbiology labs. *Genome Med* 2014; 6:90.
- Langmead B, Salzberg SL. Fast gapped-read alignment with Bowtie 2. Nat Methods 2012; 9:357–9.
- Li H, Handsaker B, Wysoker A, et al. The sequence alignment/map format and SAMtools. *Bioinformatics* 2009; 25:2078–9.
- Knetsch CW, Kumar N, Forster SC, et al. Zoonotic transfer of *Clostridium difficile* harboring antimicrobial resistance between farm animals and humans. *J Clin Microbiol* 2018; 56: pii: e01384-17.
- Cairns MD, Preston MD, Hall CL, et al. Comparative genome analysis and global phylogeny of the toxin variant *Clostridium difficile* PCR ribotype 017 reveals the evolution of two independent sublineages. J Clin Microbiol 2017; 55:865–76.
- Kumar N, Miyajima F, He M, et al. Genome-based infection tracking reveals dynamics of *Clostridium difficile* transmission and disease recurrence. *Clin Infect Dis* 2016; 62:746–52.
- Knetsch CW, Connor TR, Mutreja A, et al. Whole genome sequencing reveals potential spread of *Clostridium difficile* between humans and farm animals in the Netherlands, 2002 to 2011. *Euro Surveill* 2014; 19:20954.
- Bouckaert R, Heled J, Kühnert D, et al. BEAST 2: a software platform for Bayesian evolutionary analysis. *PLoS Comput Biol* 2014; 10:e1003537.
- Bielejec F, Baele G, Vrancken B, et al. SpreaD3: interactive visualization of spatiotemporal history and trait evolutionary processes. *Mol Biol Evol* 2016; 33:2167–9.
- Xu D, Zhang Y. Ab initio protein structure assembly using continuous structure fragments and optimized knowledge-based force field. *Proteins* 2012; 80:1715–35.
- Li XZ, Nikaido H. Efflux-mediated drug resistance in bacteria: an update. Drugs 2009; 69:1555–623.
- Zapun A, Contreras-Martel C, Vernet T. Penicillin-binding proteins and beta-lactam resistance. *FEMS Microbiol Rev* 2008; 32:361–85.
- Leiros HK, Kozielski-Stuhrmann S, Kapp U, et al. Structural basis of 5-nitroimidazole antibiotic resistance: the crystal structure of NimA from *Deinococcus radiodurans. J Biol Chem* 2004; 279:55840–9.
- Nawrocki KL, Wetzel D, Jones JB, et al. Ethanolamine is a valuable nutrient source that impacts *Clostridium difficile* pathogenesis. *Environ Microbiol* 2018; 20:1419–35.
- Lee H, Popodi E, Tang H, Foster PL. Rate and molecular spectrum of spontaneous mutations in the bacterium *Escherichia coli* as determined by whole-genome sequencing. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 2012; 109:E2774–83.