

GOPEN ACCESS

Citation: Liang R, Tang F, Wang J, Yue Y (2019) Photo-degradation dynamics of five neonicotinoids: Bamboo vinegar as a synergistic agent for improved functional duration. PLoS ONE 14(10): e0223708. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal. pone.0223708

Editor: Yulin Gao, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences Institute of Plant Protection, CHINA

Received: June 17, 2019

Accepted: September 26, 2019

Published: October 17, 2019

Peer Review History: PLOS recognizes the benefits of transparency in the peer review process; therefore, we enable the publication of all of the content of peer review and author responses alongside final, published articles. The editorial history of this article is available here: https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0223708

Copyright: © 2019 Liang et al. This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

Data Availability Statement: All relevant data are within the manuscript and its Supporting Information files.

RESEARCH ARTICLE

Photo-degradation dynamics of five neonicotinoids: Bamboo vinegar as a synergistic agent for improved functional duration

Rui Liang¹, Feng Tang², Jin Wang², Yongde Yue^{2*}

1 School of Resource & Environment, Anhui Agricultural University, Hefei, China, 2 State Forestry Administration Key Open Laboratory, International Centre for Bamboo and Rattan, Beijing, China

* yueyd@icbr.ac.cn

Abstract

The effects of photo-degradation on the utilization of pesticides in agricultural production has been investigated. Various influencing factors were compared, with results showing that the initial pesticide concentration, light source, water quality and pH possessed different effects on neonicotinoids photo-degradation. The initial concentration and pH were found to be most critical effects. The photo-degradation rate decreased by a factor of 2-4 when the initial concentration increased from 5 mg L⁻¹ to 20 mg L⁻¹, particularly for acetamiprid and imidacloprid. The photo-degradation pathways and products of the five neonicotinoids were also investigated, with similar pathways found for each pesticide, except for acetamiprid. Degradation pathways mainly involved photo-oxidation processes, with products identified using liquid chromatography-quadrupole time-of-flight mass spectrometry (LC-Q-TOF-MS) found to be consistent with literature reported results. Bamboo vinegar exerted a photoguenching effect on the neonicotinoids, with an improved efficiency at higher vinegar concentrations. The photo-guenching rates of thiamethoxam and dinotefuran were 381.58% and 310.62%, respectively, when a 30-fold dilution of vinegar was employed. The photodegradation products in bamboo vinegar were identical to those observed in methanol, with acetic acid being the main factor influencing the observed quenching effects.

Introduction

Neonicotinoids are a relevant class of insecticides, following pyrethroids, organophosphorus, and carbamates, successfully developed based on nicotine modifications [1,2]. Since entering the market at the end of the 1980s, neonicotinoids have been extensively employed in the control of piercing-sucking mouth insects including aphids, aleyrodidae and delphacidae, due to their good root uptake, broad spectrum, high efficiency and low toxicity to mammals [3,4]. Neonicotinoids function by selectively acting as effective agonists of the nicotine acetylcholine receptors (nAChRs) which play a key role in the nervous system of insects. These insecticides can consequently lead to nerve damage and eventually paralysis and death by causing severe

Funding: This research was funded by the financial supports from the National Science and Technology Infrastructure Program (2012BAD23B03).

Competing interests: The authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

neurotoxic effects. The discovery of new nicotine-related compounds can also be regarded as a milestone in insecticide research, potentially being able to provide an improved understanding of the functional properties of insect nAChRs [5,6]. However, the stability and functional duration of neonicotinoids is limited after conventional treatments due to their unique structures. A systematic study of the photo-degradation of neonicotinoids and the effect of different environmental conditions is therefore required to develop efficient synergistic agents to enhance insecticidal duration.

Most pesticides are sensitive to photolysis because of their structural properties; thus, photo-degradation commonly occurs for pesticides in the presence of light [7]. Photo-degradation of pesticides in water, a major degradation pathway after spraying, has a direct impact on the sustainability and degradation dynamics of pesticides [8,9]. This aqueous photo-degradation process can be influenced by a number of factors and may lead to two distinct phenomena, namely, photosensitization and photo-quenching [10,11]. Furthermore, photo-degradation itself is a complex process, as the photo-degradation pathways and formed intermediates/products of different (even the same) pesticides may greatly vary as a result of variable factors under different conditions [12,13]. Consequently, investigations on the effects of different factors on the photo-degradation of pesticides are of remarkable environmental significance. Presently, the photo-degradation of neonicotinoid insecticides in the environment has attracted significant research attention. However, most studies to date lack of a systematic approach.

Bamboo vinegar has recently attracted research interest as an environmental synergistic agent [14]. A brown liquid with unique smoky taste, bamboo vinegar is collected via condensation of gases during bamboo pyrolysis or distillation. The vinegar, which contains over 80 components, comprises 80–90% water and 7–11% organic acids, mostly acetic acid (approximately 6%), formic acid, butyric acid, propionic acid, phenols, ketones, aldehydes, alcohols, esters as well as other components [15]. Bamboo vinegar possesses antimicrobial and antioxidant activities, also promoting plant growth, being employed as a soil improver, fertilizer synergistic agent, feed supplement, edible fungi production supplement, etc. [16,17]. In addition, bamboo vinegar can be utilized as a pesticide synergistic agent in agricultural production activities [18]. However, studies on the utilization of bamboo vinegar as a light-stabilizing agent in pesticide formulations are scarce in literature, particularly for neonicotinoids.

In this study, the photo-degradation dynamics of imidacloprid, acetamiprid, clothianidin, thiamethoxam and dinotefuran (Fig 1) were investigated based on effects of initial concentration, light source, water quality and pH. Furthermore, the five neonicotinoids and the photo-degradation products were identified and characterized using liquid chromatography-quadrupole time-of-flight mass spectrometry (LC-Q-TOF-MS) (Figs A-J in S1 File), with degradation pathways also evaluated. The influence of bamboo vinegar on the photo-degradation of neonicotinoids was also determined, and the photo-degradation products in vinegar were investigated. Finally, the photo-degradation patterns of the five neonicotinoids were analyzed and their synergism with bamboo vinegar was evaluated to provide a scientific basis for an improved utilization of neonicotinoids.

Materials and methods

Chemicals

Standards of imidacloprid, acetamiprid, clothianidin, thiamethoxam and dinotefuran were purchased from Dr. Ehrenstorfer Industrial Corporation, Germany. Methanol, acetonitrile, and acetone were obtained from Xilong Chemical Reagent Co., China, and dichloromethane was purchased from Shanghai Zhenxing Chemical Reagent Co., China. Bamboo vinegar was provided by the International Centre of Bamboo and Rattan, Beijing, China.



Neonicotinoids photo-degradation in water

All five neonicotinoids were dissolved in methanol as solvent to prepare standard solutions and analyzed using high-performance liquid chromatography (HPLC) with variable-wavelength ultraviolet detection to obtain standard curves. The initial concentration, light source, water quality, and pH were employed as parameters to systematically determine the photodegradation characteristics of the neonicotinoids in water. The selected initial concentrations were 5 mg L⁻¹, 10 mg L⁻¹, and 20 mg L⁻¹; 20 mL of each solution was added to a stoppered quartz tube, and a high-pressure mercury lamp (300 W, 3300–5700 Lux, cold water reflux) was utilized as light source. The quartz tube was placed 7.0 cm away from the light source, and the temperature in the photo-degradation apparatus was carefully controlled (20 ± 2 °C). Each experiment was repeated three times.

A high-pressure mercury lamp and sunlight were employed to determine the influence of different light sources in the photo-degradation efficiency. Standard solutions of the

neonicotinoids were diluted to 5 mg L⁻¹ using ultra-pure water, and 20 mL of each solution was added to a stoppered quartz tube. Darkness experiments (in the absence of light) were conducted as control, and all samples were irradiated at different times.

Additionally, the standard solutions of the five neonicotinoids were diluted to 5 mg L^{-1} using ultra-pure water, tap water or pond water, and sunlight was employed as light source to investigate the influence of water quality on neonicotinoid photo-degradation. Neonicotinoids were also diluted to 10 mg L^{-1} using a disodium hydrogen phosphate-citric acid buffer to obtain pH values of 4.0, 5.5, 7.5, 8.5, and 10.0. A high-pressure mercury lamp was used for illumination to determine the pH effect on neonicotinoid photo-degradation.

All quantitative photo-degradation analyses were performed in an Agilent 1200 HPLC equipped with a Thermo Acclaim 120 C_{18} column (4.6 mm × 250 mm, 5 µm). Mobile phase A was acetonitrile and mobile phase B was ultra-pure water, employing a 30:70 (A:B) solvent ratio. The flow rate, column temperature and injection volume were 1000 µL min⁻¹, 30°C, and 20 µL, respectively.

Analysis of photo-degradation products

Standards of imidacloprid, acetamiprid, clothianidin, thiamethoxam and dinotefuran were prepared at a concentration of 10 mg L^{-1} in methanol. Solutions were photo-treated under UV irradiation, and a darkness control was established. Samples were then filtered using a membrane filter with a pore size of 0.22 μ m and analyzed using LC-Q-TOF-MS equipped with diode array detection.

LC separations were carried out in an Agilent 6540 Infinity II series LC system (Agilent Technologies, Santa Clara, CA) equipped with an Agilent Eclipse Plus C_{18} column (2.1 mm × 150 mm, 1.8 µm). Mobile phase A was acetonitrile, mobile phase B was ultra-pure water; the elution gradient was as follows: 0–4 min, 25% A; 4–7 min, 25–80% A; and 7–10 min, 80–25% A. The flow rate, column temperature and injection volume were 250 µL min⁻¹, 25°C and 2 µL, respectively. An Agilent 6540 Q-TOF-MS (Agilent Technologies, Santa Clara, CA) equipped with an automatic jet stream electrospray ionization (AJS-ESI) interface was employed for assay development. The typical ion source parameters were as follows: capillary voltage, +4000/-3500 V; nozzle voltage, +500/-500 V; gas temperature, 300°C; gas flow rate, 5 L min⁻¹; sheath gas temperature, 250°C; sheath gas flow rate, 11 L min⁻¹; and nebulizer pressure, 45 psi.

Influence of bamboo vinegar

All five neonicotinoids were dissolved in methanol (concentration 1000 mg L⁻¹) and combined with bamboo vinegar for a final neonicotinoid concentration of 10 mg L⁻¹ and bamboo vinegar dilution rates of 30- and 100-fold. The mixed solutions (20 mL) were placed in stoppered quartz tubes and set in the photo-degradation apparatus 7 cm away from the high-pressure mercury lamp. The temperature was carefully controlled ($20 \pm 2^{\circ}$ C) in the photo-degradation apparatus. Each experiment was conducted in triplicate, and samples were analyzed after different times of irradiation.

Analytical methodologies

The photo-degradation efficiency was calculated using the following formula:

Photodegradation rate(%) =
$$\frac{C_d - C_l}{C_d} \times 100$$
,

where C_d and C_l are neonicotinoid concentrations (darkness control) and different experiments, respectively.

The photo-degradation kinetics of the five neonicotinoids in solution were described by a first-order kinetic equation:

$$C_t = C_0 \times e^{-kt},$$

where C_0 and C_t are the initial concentration of the neonicotinoids and that at an arbitrary time t, respectively, and *k* is the photo-degradation rate constant.

Results and discussion

Effect of the neonicotinoid initial concentration on photo-degradation

Fig 2 illustrates the rate constant dynamics and attenuation curve for the photo-degradation of the five neonicotinoids at different initial concentrations. The rate constants of the aqueous neonicotinoids were negatively correlated with the initial concentration (5 mg L⁻¹, 10 mg L⁻¹, and 20 mg L⁻¹). The half-lives of imidacloprid, acetamiprid, clothianidin, thiamethoxam and dinotefuran were 45.2 min, 902.1 min, 34.7 min, 21.2 min and 163.2 min, respectively, at an initial concentration of 20 mg L⁻¹. Comparably, 17.6 min, 223.6 min, 14.7 min, 10.6 min and



Fig 2. Photo-degradation of five neonicotinoids at different initial concentrations. a = imidacloprid, b = acetamiprid, c = clothianidin, d = thiamethoxam, and e = dinotefuran.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0223708.g002

111.4 min, respectively, were obtained as half-lives for the same insecticides at an initial concentration of 5 mg L^{-1} . Larger initial pesticide concentrations correspond to a higher content of pesticide molecules in aqueous solution; this ensures more photon absorption competition and thus less light energy absorbed per unit molecule, which leads to a lower photo-degradation rate [19,20]. In addition, many intermediate products can form from neonicotinoids photo-degradation and then compete for photons, thereby reducing the quantum yield of absorbed photons [21–23].

Effect of the light source

In general, pesticides are exposed to sunlight or other light sources to investigate the effect of the light source on their photo-degradation behaviour [24,25]. Sunlight and a high-pressure mercury lamp were herein employed to evaluate such effects on the photo-degradation of the five neonicotinoids in this study, with results shown in Fig 3. Photo-degradation occurred under irradiation with both light sources, following a first-order kinetic equation. The photo-degradation rate under high-pressure mercury lamp irradiation was significantly higher as compared to that observed under sunlight irradiation. According to the regression equation of the photo-degradation reaction kinetics, the half-life of thiamethoxam under sunlight (20.8 min) was comparably higher to that under high-pressure mercury lamp irradiation (10.8 min) by a factor of 2, whereas the half-lives of the other pesticides were higher by a factor of over 1.5.

This difference may be related to the emission spectra of the light sources and the absorption spectra of the neonicotinoids. The emission spectrum of a high-pressure mercury lamp ranges from 190 nm to 1000 nm [26], while the maximum absorption wavelengths of the tested neonicotinoids are concentrated in the ultraviolet region near 260 nm [27]. Therefore, under irradiation from the high-pressure mercury lamp, photo-degradation of the neonicotinoid pesticides can rapidly occur. In contrast, the emission spectrum of sunlight is mainly in the visible region and less in the ultraviolet region; thus, the neonicotinoids absorb only part of sunlight. The absorption efficiency of photon energy under sunlight irradiation is comparatively lower to that of the high-pressure mercury lamp, which results in the expected lower photo-degradation rate under sunlight irradiation [28–30].

Effect of water quality

The effects of ultra-pure water, tap water and pond water on the photo-degradation of neonicotinoids were subsequently investigated, with results depicted in Fig 4.

No significant differences could be observed in the photo-degradation rates or half-lives of thiamethoxam or dinotefuran in the different water media. Imidacloprid exhibited the largest differences, with half-lives of 19.5 min, 67.4 min, and 73.9 min in ultra-pure water, tap water and pond water, respectively. The photo-degradation rate constants of acetamiprid were 0.00390 K min⁻¹, 0.00385 K min⁻¹ and 0.00288 K min⁻¹ in ultra-pure, tap, and pond water, respectively, whereas those of clothianidin were 0.01350 K min⁻¹, 0.01190 K min⁻¹, and 0.01090 K min⁻¹, respectively.

Ultra-pure water exhibits the lowest conductivity $(1.0 \times 10^{-4} \text{ S m}^{-1})$, lowest amount of dissolved substances and almost no light absorption and transmission scattering; thus, pesticides exhibited the fastest photo-degradation rate in this medium [31,32]. The electrical conductivity of tap water $(1.4 \times 10^{-2} \text{ S m}^{-1})$ is higher with respect to that of ultra-pure water due to the presence of certain ions, soluble substances, and so forth. These substances can have a shielding effect in the absorption and transmission of light and may thus play a role in quenching the photo-degradation of pesticides in tap water [33,34]. Pond water contains a large amount of inorganic ions and dissolved organic matter, including humic acids, which can produce singlet



Fig 3. Photo-degradation of five neonicotinoids under different light source irradiation. a = imidacloprid, b = acetamiprid, c = clothianidin, d = thiamethoxam, and e = dinotefuran.

oxygen molecules with a stronger oxidation capacity as compared to molecular oxygen when exposed to sunlight [35,36]. These molecules can rapidly react with organic pollutants in water, thus promoting pollutant decomposition. However, humic acids and other organic matter may also reduce the photo-degradation rate of pesticides through competitive absorption of photons [37-39]. Importantly, dichromate oxidizability (COD_{Cr}) of pond water (126.5 mg



Fig 4. Photo-degradation of five neonicotinoids in water of different quality. a = imidacloprid, b = acetamiprid, c = clothianidin, d = thiamethoxam, and e = dinotefuran.

 L^{-1}) was found to be significantly higher with respect to ultra-pure water and tap water (0 mg L^{-1} and 1.7 mg L^{-1} , respectively). In view of these premises, water quality seem to influence photo-degradation rates via competitive absorption of photons as dominant process [40-42]. The photo-degradation kinetics of pesticides in natural water are related to the physical and

chemical properties of water as well as the absorption and transmission of light by soluble

substances in the water and the differences in the photochemical reactions [43,44]. Tap water and pond water contain a large amount of ions including NO_3^- , SO_4^{-2-} , and Cl^- , and soluble organic matter, which exhibit different behaviours in terms of photosensitization and photoquenching of different pesticides [45,46]. No significant differences could be observed in the photo-degradation rates of imidacloprid and clothianidin in tap water and pond water, acetamiprid in ultra-pure water and tap water or thiamethoxam and dinotefuran in all three types of employed water.

Effect of pH

The pH has a significant influence on the photo-degradation of organic pollutants [47,48]. In this study, a disodium hydrogen phosphate-citric acid buffer was employed to obtain pH values of 4.0, 5.5, 7.5, 8.5, and 10.0 in order to investigate pH effects on the photo-degradation of neonicotinoids. As listed in Table 1, the photo-degradation rate was low in an acidic buffer solution, whereas photodegradation rates were relatively high (and generally increased at increasing pH) in neutral and alkaline buffer solutions. At pH 4.0, the photo-degradation rates of all neonicotinoids were the lowest, with that of imidacloprid being similar at all tested pH values. Furthermore, the degradation rate of acetamiprid increased at increasing pHs, whereas that of clothianidin increased at pH 8.5 and 10.0. The photo-degradation rates of thiamethoxam and dinotefuran were similar at pH 7.5, 8.5, and 10.0.

Neonicotinoids readily produce hydroxyl radicals in alkaline solutions as compared to in acidic and neutral solutions, with such radicals being correlated to greater pesticide degradation [49,50]. The acidic buffer solution is more likely to absorb photons near 260 nm, maximum absorption wavelength of neonicotinoids, consequently competing with photon absorption (for photo-degradation) of the five pesticides, and resulting in reduced photo-degradation rates [51,52]. In alkaline solution, an increase in photo-degradation rates can be correlated to a higher photo-quantum yield and protonation level of the excited pesticide molecules [53–55].

Photo-degradation products of neonicotinoids

The photo-degradation products of the five neonicotinoids in methanol were subsequently investigated. The product peaks in the total ion flow (TIC) diagram were compared to those in the parent standard TIC diagram. The mass spectra of the products was collected, and the attributes of the characteristic ions were analysed. The products and possible photo-degradation pathways were then compared to those reported in the existing literature.

As shown in Fig 5A, the photo-degradation product of imidacloprid is $C_7H_{14}N_2O_2$, in good agreement to that previously reported by Ding et al. [56]. The possible photo-degradation pathway proceeds via an imidacloprid molecule absorbing a photon under illumination, followed by N-N bond cleavage and NO₂ removal from the molecule. The C = N bond then combines with a hydroxyl radical (·OH) in water to form a C = O bond via substitution reaction [57].

The possible photo-degradation pathway of acetamiprid is shown in Fig 5B, for which $C_{10}H_{12}N_4O$ was detected as photo-degradation product. Such pathway for acetamiprid can be stimulated under light irradiation. A Cl atom linked to the pyridine ring is replaced by O, forming a double bond, with C bonds at positions 1 and 4 on the pyridine ring leading to bicyclic olefins [58, 59].

Fig 5C illustrates the possible photo-degradation pathway of clothianidin ($C_6H_8N_3OSCl$ as photo-degradation product), similar to that observed for imidacloprid, and different from results reported by Mulligan et al. [60].

Neonicotinoids	pH value	Kinetic equation $\ln C_t = \ln C_0 - kt$	Rate constant K min ⁻¹	Half-life period T _{1/2} min ⁻¹
Imidacloprid	4.0	$\ln C_t = 2.1351 - 0.0121t$	0.01210	57.3a
	5.5	$\ln C_t = 2.1757 - 0.0198t$	0.01980	35.0b
	7.5	$\ln C_t = 2.1412 - 0.0208t$	0.02080	33.3b
	8.5	$\ln C_t = 2.1504 - 0.0213t$	0.02130	32.5b
	10.0	$\ln C_t = 2.1609 - 0.0220t$	0.02200	31.5b
Acetamiprid	4.0	$\ln C_t = 2.0396 - 0.0704t$	0.00117	590.8a
	5.5	$\ln C_t = 2.1135 - 0.0768t$	0.00128	541.5b
	7.5	$\ln C_t = 2.1521 - 0.0909t$	0.00152	457.5c
	8.5	$\ln C_t = 2.2300 - 0.1075t$	0.00179	386.9d
	10.0	$\ln C_t = 2.1022 - 0.1305t$	0.00218	318.7e
Clothianidin	4.0	$\ln C_t = 1.9161 - 0.0210t$	0.02100	33.0a
	5.5	$\ln C_t = 1.8984 - 0.0191t$	0.01910	36.3a
	7.5	$\ln C_t = 1.8803 - 0.0225t$	0.02250	30.8a
	8.5	$\ln C_t = 1.8988 - 0.0256t$	0.02560	27.1b
	10.0	$\ln C_t = 1.9102 - 0.0259t$	0.02590	26.8b
Thiamethoxam	4.0	$\ln C_t = 1.8123 - 0.0250t$	0.02500	27.7a
	5.5	$\ln C_t = 1.9628 - 0.0425t$	0.04250	19.3b
	7.5	$\ln C_t = 2.1090 - 0.0561t$	0.05610	12.4c
	8.5	$\ln C_t = 2.1701 - 0.0605t$	0.06050	11.5c
	10.0	$\ln C_t = 2.1357 - 0.0571t$	0.05710	12.1c
Dinotefuran	4.0	$\ln C_t = 1.9168 - 0.0120t$	0.01200	57.8a
	5.5	$\ln C_t = 2.0342 - 0.0146 \mathrm{x}$	0.01460	47.5b
	7.5	$\ln C_t = 2.3123 - 0.0211t$	0.02110	32.9c
	8.5	$\ln C_t = 2.4425 - 0.0239t$	0.02390	29.0c
	10.0	$\ln C_t = 2.2540 - 0.0224t$	0.02240	30.9c

Table 1. Photo-degradation of five neonicotinoids at different pH values.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0223708.t001

As shown in Fig 5D, the photo-degradation product of thiamethoxam is $C_6H_8SN_3OCl$, with a plausible photo-degradation pathway involving the absorption of a photon by thiamethoxam molecules which induces N-N bond cleavage followed by -NO₂ removal. As indicate before, the C = N bond combines with a hydroxyl radical (·OH) in water and forms a C = O bond through a substitution reaction; the five-membered ring is finally separated - C_2H_2O to obtain the product [61–63].

The possible photo-degradation pathway of dinotefuran is illustrated in Fig.5E, leading to the formation of $C_7H_{14}N_2O_2$, identical to that observed for imidacloprid and clothianidin [64–66].

On the basis of the identified photo-degradation products of the five neonicotinoids in methanol, it can be inferred that the degradation pathways mainly consist of photo-oxidation processes [67,68].

Effect of bamboo vinegar

The effect of bamboo vinegar on the photo-degradation of neonicotinoids was also investigated, with results illustrated in Fig 6. The addition of bamboo vinegar significantly decreased the photo-degradation rate of the five neonicotinoids. Under the irradiation of the high-pressure mercury lamp, bamboo vinegar diluted 30-fold and 100-fold had significant effects on the photo-degradation half-lives of the pesticides, where the photo-degradation rate decreased at increasing vinegar concentration.



Fig 5. Photo-degradation pathways and products of five neonicotinoids. a = imidacloprid, b = acetamiprid, c = clothianidin, d = thiamethoxam, and e = dinotefuran.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0223708.g005

The photo-quenching rates of imidacloprid, acetamiprid, clothianidin, thiamethoxam, and dinotefuran reached 67.35%, 125.00%, 143.13%, 381.58%, and 310.62%, respectively, when the neonicotinoids were mixed with diluted 30-fold bamboo vinegar. Comparably, 6.49%, 28.57%, 34.78%, 114.02%, and 129.61%, respectively, accounted for photo-quenching rates of the same insecticides mixed with diluted 100-fold vinegar. These findings indicate that bamboo vinegar has a remarkable photo-stabilizing effect on the five neonicotinoids under high-pressure mercury lamp irradiation. The dependency of the photo-quenching effect of bamboo vinegar on the degree of dilution was similar for all five samples; as bamboo vinegar concentration increased, its light stabilization of the neonicotinoids became more significant. In addition, 30-fold diluted bamboo vinegar exhibited the most significant effect on the photo-stability of thiamethoxam and dinotefuran, for which the photo-quenching rates increased by a factor over 3. All photo-degradation products of the five neonicotinoids in bamboo vinegar were identical to those observed in methanol.

pH values of diluted 30-fold and 100-fold bamboo vinegar were 3.40 and 3.72, respectively, whereas that of ultra-pure water was 6.50. According to the above experimental results, the photo-degradation rate of the five neonicotinoids decreases at increasing acidity (from pH 3.40 to 6.50) in good agreement with previous reports of pH being reported as an influencing factor [69,70]. Since bamboo vinegar is a reddish-brown solution, natural pigments may compete with neonicotinoids for photon absorption [71,72]. With an increase in concentration of bamboo vinegar, the concentration of pigments also increases, inducing significant photon competition [73–75]. This competition is consistent with the observed correlation between the dilution degree of bamboo vinegar and its light stabilization effect. The potential main components involved in the quenching of neonicotinoid photo-degradation in bamboo vinegar include acetic acid and pigments as previously reported [76–79].

Conclusions

The photo-degradation dynamics of five neonicotinoids and the influence of the initial concentration, light source, water quality and pH were investigated in this work. The photo-degradation half-lives of the neonicotinoids increased by nearly 1-fold when the initial neonicotinoid concentration decreased from 20 to 5 mg L⁻¹ (except for that of acetamiprid which increased by a factor of 3). The photo-degradation rates of the five neonicotinoids under high-pressure mercury lamp irradiation were comparably higher (by nearly a factor of 1.5) to those under sunlight irradiation. Photo-degradation rates were also different depending on the type of employed aqueous media, being the highest in ultra-pure water, followed by tap water and finally pond water, following a similar trend in terms of pH (lowest in acidic buffer solution and relatively high in alkaline and neutral buffer solutions).

Photo-degradation pathways of imidacloprid, clothianidin, thiamethoxam and dinotefuran were similar, mainly consisting of photo-oxidation processes. Bamboo vinegar exhibited a quenching effect on the photo-degradation of the five neonicotinoids, with this effect became significant at high vinegar concentrations (i.e. photo-quenching rates of thiamethoxam and dinotefuran were 381.58% and 310.62%, respectively, for 30-fold diluted vinegar). The photo-degradation rates of neonicotinoids decrease with increasing acidity, with acetic acid in bamboo vinegar considered as main factor influencing the observed photo-quenching effect.



Fig 6. The effect of bamboo vinegar on the photo-degradation of five neonicotinoids. a = imidacloprid, b = acetamiprid, c = clothianidin, d = thiamethoxam, and e = dinotefuran.

These results have great significance in terms of improving functional lifetimes of neonicotinoids and the environmental friendliness of pesticides via addition and concentration adjustment of bamboo vinegar.

Supporting information

S1 File. Figs A-J in Supporting Information file summary of the results of extraction ionic and ion fragmentation of neonicotinoids and photo-degradation products. (DOCX)

Author Contributions

Data curation: Rui Liang.

Formal analysis: Rui Liang.

Investigation: Rui Liang.

Methodology: Rui Liang, Jin Wang.

Supervision: Feng Tang, Yongde Yue.

Writing - original draft: Rui Liang.

Writing - review & editing: Rui Liang, Jin Wang.

References

- Raut-Jadhav S, Saharan VK, Pinjari D, Sonawane S, Saini D, Pandit A. Synergetic Effect of Combination of AOP's (Hydrodynamic Cavitation and H₂O₂) on the Degradation of Neonicotinoid Class of Insecticide. J Hazard Mater. 2013; 261: 139–147. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2013.07.012 PMID: 23912079
- Finnegan MC, Baxter LR, Maul JD, Hanson ML, Hoekstra PF. Comprehensive Characterization of the Acute and Chronic Toxicity of the Neonicotinoid Insecticide Thiamethoxam to a Suite of Aquatic Primary Producers, Invertebrates, and Fish. Environ Toxicol Chem. 2017; 36: 2838–2848. https://doi.org/10. 1002/etc.3846 PMID: 28493485
- Ahmed S, Nisar MS, Shakir MM, Imran M, Iqbal K. Comparative Efficacy of Some Neonicotinoids and Traditional Insecticides on Sucking Insect Pests and Their Natural Enemies on Bt-121 Cotton Crop. J Anim Plant Sci. 2014; 24: 660–663.
- Leiva JA, Nkedikizza P, Morgan KT, Kadyampakeni DM. Imidacloprid Transport and Sorption Nonequilibrium in Single and Multilayered Columns of Immokalee Fine Sand. PLoS One. 2017; 12: e0183767. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0183767 PMID: 28837702
- Bao HB, Meng XK, Liu ZW. Spider Acetylcholine Binding Proteins: An Alternative Model to Study the Interaction between Insect nAChRs and Neonicotinoids. Insect Biochem Molec. 2017; 90: 82–89.
- Yu N, Liu Y, Wang X, Li J, Bao HB, Liu ZW. Heterologous Formation of Neonicotinoid-sensitive nAChRs Containing UNC-38 and UNC-29 Subunits from Bursaphelenchus xylophilus. Pestic Biochem Physi. 2017; 143: 168–172.
- Socorro J, Durand A, Gligorovski S, Wortham H, Quivet E. Light Induced Degradation of Eight Commonly Used Pesticides Adsorbed on Atmospheric Particles: Kinetics and Product Study. Agu Fall Meeting. 2014.
- Bonnechere A, Hanot V, Jolie R, Hendrickx M, Bragard C, Bedoret T, et al. Processing Factors of Several Pesticides and Degradation Products in Carrots by Household and Industrial Processing. J Food R. 2012; 1: 68–83.
- 9. Azenha ME, Romeiro A, Sarakha M. Photodegradation of Pesticides and Photocatalysis in the Treatment of Water and Waste. Applied Photochemistry. 2013; 247–266.
- Wu SP, Schwab J, Yang BY, Yuan CS. Effect of Phenolic Compounds on Photodegradation of Anthracene and Benzo [a]Anthracene in Media of Different Polarity. J Photoch Photobio A. 2015; 309: 55–64.

- Zhang N, Schindelka J, Herrmann H, George G, Rosell M, Herrero-Martín S, et al. Investigation of Humic Substance Photosensitized Reactions Via Carbon and Hydrogen Isotope Fractionation. Environ Sci Technol. 2015; 49: 233–242. https://doi.org/10.1021/es502791f PMID: 25427194
- Xu P, Zeng GM, Huang DL, Liu L, Lai C, Chen M, et al. Photocatalytic Degradation of Phenol by the Heterogeneous Fe3O4 Nanoparticles and Oxalate Complex System. Rsc Adv. 2014; 4: 40828–40836.
- Hintz H, Egelhaaf HJ, Lüer L, Hauch J, Peisert H, Chassé T. Photodegradation of P3HT-A Systematic Study of Environmental Factors. Chem Mater. 2016; 23: 145–154.
- Song L, Wang J, Ma XJ. The Effect of Bamboo Vinegar on Photodegradation of Azadirachtin A and Prochloraz. J Anhui Agr Univ. 2017; 44: 434–438.
- Mathew S, Zakaria ZA, Musa NF. Antioxidant Property and Chemical Profile of Pyroligneous Acid from Pineapple Plant Waste Biomass. Process Biochem. 2015; 50: 1985–1992.
- Bakir S, Devecioglu D, Kayacan S, Toydemir G, Karbancioglu-Guler F, Capanoglu E. Investigating the Antioxidant and Antimicrobial Activities of Different Vinegars. Eur Food Res Technol. 2017; 243: 2083– 2094.
- Zhang HY, He P, Kang HB, Li HL. Antioxidant and Antimicrobial Effects of Edible Coating Based on Chitosan and Bamboo Vinegar in Ready to Cook Pork Chops. LWT. 2018; 93: 470–476.
- Wang HF, Wang JL, Wang C, Zhang WM, Liu JX, Dai B. Effect of Bamboo Vinegar as an Antibiotic Alternative on Growth Performance and Fecal Bacterial Communities of Weaned Piglets. Livest Sci. 2012; 144: 173–180.
- Lavtižara V, Van Gestel CAM, Dolenc D, Trebšea P. Chemical and Photochemical Degradation of Chlorantraniliprole and Characterization of Its Transformation Products. Chemosphere. 2014; 95: 408– 414. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2013.09.057 PMID: 24125717
- Bao YP, Niu JF. Photochemical Transformation of Tetrabromobisphenol A under Simulated Sunlight Irradiation: Kinetics, Mechanism and Influencing Factors. Chemosphere. 2015; 134: 550–556. <u>https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2014.12.016</u> PMID: 25559172
- Li Y, Su PD, Li YD, Wen KJ, Bi GH, Cox M. Adsorption-desorption and Degradation of Insecticides Clothianidin and Thiamethoxam in Agricultural Soils. Chemosphere. 2018; 207: 708–714. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2018.05.139</u> PMID: 29857203
- Zhang P, Ren C, Sun HW, Min LJ. Sorption, Desorption and Degradation of Neonicotinoids in Four Agricultural Soils and Their Effects on Soil Microorganisms. Sci Total Environ. 2018; 615: 59–69. <u>https://</u> doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.09.097 PMID: 28968584
- Basley K, Goulson D. Neonicotinoids Thiamethoxam and Clothianidin Adversely Affect the Colonisation of Invertebrate Populations in Aquatic Microcosms. Environ Sci Pollut R. 2018; 25: 9593–9599.
- Englert D, Bakanov N, Zubrod JP, Schulz R, Bundschuh M. Modeling Remobilization of Neonicotinoid Residues from Tree Foliage in Streams-A Relevant Exposure Pathway in Risk Assessment? Environ Sci Technol. 2017; 51: 1785–1794. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.6b05213 PMID: 28001052
- Lu Z, Challis JK, Wong CS. Quantum Yields for Direct Photolysis of Neonicotinoid Insecticides in Water: Implications for Exposure to Nontarget Aquatic Organisms. Environ Sci Tech Let. 2015; 2: 188– 192.
- Hölz K, Lietard J, Somoza MM. High-Power 365 nm UV LED Mercury Arc Lamp Replacement for Photochemistry and Chemical Photolithography. ACS Sustain. Chem. Eng. 2017; 5: 828–834.
- 27. Cañamares MV, Feis A. Surface-enhanced Raman Spectra of the Neonicotinoid Pesticide Thiacloprid. J Raman Spectrosc. 2013; 44: 1126–1135.
- Kowal SF, Allen SR, Kahan TF. Wavelength-Resolved Photon Fluxes of Indoor Light Sources: Implications for HOx Production. Environ Sci Technol. 2017; 51: 10423–10430. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs. est.7b02015 PMID: 28805371
- Xu J, Shen XY, Wang DL, Zhao CX, Liu ZZ, Pozdnyakove IP, et al. Kinetics and Mechanisms of pHdependent Direct Photolysis of P-arsanilic Acid under UV-C Light. Chem Eng J. 2017; 336: 334–341.
- Li W, Patton S, Gleason JM, Mezyk SP, Kenneth P, Ishida KP, et al. UV Photolysis of Chloramine and Persulfate for 1,4-dioxane Removal in Reverse Osmosis Permeate for Potable Water Reuse. Environ Sci Technol. 2018; 52: 6417–6425. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.7b06042 PMID: 29653056
- Prak DJL, Gordon KC, Peterson JM, O'Sullivan DW. Photolysis of Dinitrobenzyl Alcohols, Dinitrobenzaldehydes, and Nitrobenzoic Acids in Seawater, Estuary Water, and Pure Water. Mar Chem. 2012; 145–147: 29–36.
- Ding SL, Wang XK, Jiang WQ, Zhao RS, Shen TT, Wang X. Influence of pH, Inorganic Anions, and Dissolved Organic Matter on the Photolysis of Antimicrobial Triclocarban in Aqueous Systems under Simulated Sunlight Irradiation. Environ Sci Pollut R. 2015; 22: 5204–5211.

- Vebrosky EN, Saranjampour P, Crosby DG, Armbrust KL. Photodegradation of Dicloran in Freshwater and Seawater. J Agr Food Chem. 2018; 66: 2654–2659.
- Anderson TA, Salice CJ, Erickson RA, McMurry ST, Cox SB, Smith LM. Effects of Landuse and Precipitation on Pesticides and Water Quality in Playa Lakes of the Southern High Plains. Chemosphere. 2019; 92: 84–90.
- Sun LN, Chen HM, Abdulla HA, Mopper K. Estimating Hydroxyl Radical Photochemical Formation Rates in Natural Waters during Long-term Laboratory Irradiation Experiments. Environ Sci Processes Impacts. 2014; 16: 757–763.
- Nam SW, Yoon Y, Choi DJ, Zoh KD. Degradation Characteristics of Metoprolol during UV/chlorination Reaction and a Factorial Design Optimization. J Hazard Mater. 2015; 285: 453–463. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2014.11.052</u> PMID: 25540942
- Zhang SY, Chen JW, Wang Y, Wei XX. Humic Acids Decrease the Photodegradation of the Sunscreen UV Filter 2-phenylbenzimidazole-5-sulfonic Acid in Natural Waters. Environ Chem Lett. 2012; 10: 389– 394.
- Sun ZY, Zhang CJ, Chen P, Zhou Q, Hoffmannb MR. Impact of Humic Acid on the Photoreductive Degradation of Perfluorooctane Sulfonate (PFOS) by UV/lodide Process. Water Res. 2017; 127: 50–58. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2017.10.010 PMID: 29031799
- He H, Dan X, Han F X, Xu ZA, Huang B, Pan XJ. Dissolved Oxygen Inhibits the Promotion of Chlorothalonil Photodegradation Mediated by Humic Acid. J Photoch Photobio A. 2018; 360: 289–297.
- Du H, Chen W, Cai P, Rong XM, Feng XH, Huang QY. Competitive Adsorption of Pb and Cd on Bacteria-montmorillonite Composite. Environ Pollut. 2016; 218: 168–175. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.</u> 2016.08.022 PMID: 27566847
- Qi PF, Pichler T. Competitive Adsorption of As(III), As(V), Sb(III) and Sb(V) onto Ferrihydrite in Multicomponent Systems: Implications for Mobility and Distribution. J Hazard Mater. 2017; 330: 142–148. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2017.02.016 PMID: 28222347
- **42.** Hu W, Lu SH, Song WC, Chen TH, Hayat T, Njud S, et al. Competitive Adsorption of U(VI) and Co(II) on Montmorillonite: A Batch and Spectroscopic Approach. Appl Clay Sci. 2018; 157: 121–129.
- Bouzidi H, Fittschen C, Coddeville P, Tomas A. Photolysis of 2,3-pentanedione and 2,3-hexanedione: Kinetics, Quantum Yields, and Product Study in a Simulation Chamber. Atmos Environ. 2014; 82: 250– 257.
- 44. Beiknejad D, Chaichi MJ. Estimation of Photolysis Half-lives of Dyes in a Continuous-flow System with the Aid of Quantitative Structure-property Relationship. Front Env Sci Eng. 2014; 8: 683–692.
- **45.** Souza GA, Amorin CAL, Cardeal LZ. Studies of the Analysis of Pesticide Degradation in Environmental Samples. Curr Anal Chem. 2010; 6: 237–248.
- Liu W, Chen XL, Yang LS, Zhang JC, Yi P, Fan AP, et al. Photochemical Events during the Photosensitization of Hypocrellin A on ZnS Quantum Dots. Adv Mater Res. 2013; 581–582, 574–577.
- **47.** Wei ZS, Spinney R, Ke RH, Yang ZH, Xiao RY. Effect of pH on the Sonochemical Degradation of Organic Pollutants. Environ Chem Lett. 2016; 14: 163–182.
- Lan Q, Cao MY, Ye ZJ, Zhu JS, Chen MJ, Chen XQ, et al. Effect of Oxalate and pH on Photodegradation of Pentachlorophenol in Heterogeneous Irradiated Maghemite System. J Photoch Photobio A. 2016; 328: 198–206.
- **49.** Li GT, Zhu MY, Chen J, Li YX, Zhang XW. Production and Contribution of Hydroxyl Radicals between the DSA Anode and Water Interface. J Environ Sci. 2011; 23: 744–748.
- 50. Miao J, Sunarso J, Su C, Zhou W, Wang SB, Shao ZP. SrCo1-xTixO3-δ Perovskites as Excellent Catalysts for Fast Degradation of Water Contaminants in Neutral and Alkaline Solutions. Sci Rep. 2017; 7: 44215. https://doi.org/10.1038/srep44215 PMID: 28281656
- Xia XH, Li GC, Yang ZF, Chen YM, Huang GH. Effects of Fulvic Acid Concentration and Origin on Photodegradation of Polycyclic Aromatic Hydrocarbons in Aqueous Solution: Importance of Active Oxygen. Environ Pollut. 2009; 157: 1352–1359. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2008.11.039</u> PMID: 19117648
- Vorobey P, Steindal AE, Off MK, Vorobey A, Moan JE. Influence of Human Serum Albumin on Photodegradation of Folic Acid in Solution. Photochem Photobiol. 2010; 82: 817–822.
- Sortino S, Guidi GD, Giuffrida S, Monti S, Velardita A. pH Effects on the Spectroscopic and Photochemical Behavior of Enoxacin: A Steady-State and Time-Resolved Study. Photochem Photobiol. 1998; 67: 167–173. https://doi.org/10.1562/0031-8655(1998)067<0167:peotsa>2.3.co;2 PMID: 9487794
- Kirk AD, Moss KC, Valentin JG. The Photolysis in Acidic Aqueous Solutions of the Monooxalatobisethylenediamine Chromium (III) Cation and the Bisoxalatomonoethylenediamine Chromate (III) Anion: Photolysis Modes and Quantum Yields. Can J Chem. 2011; 49: 375–383.

- Batchu SR, Panditi VR, O'Shea KE, Gardinali PR. Photodegradation of Sulfonamide Antibiotics in Simulated and Natural Sunlight: Implications for Their Environmental Fate. J Environ Sci Heal B. 2014; 49: 299–310.
- Ding T, Jacobs D, Lavine BK. Liquid Chromatography-mass Spectrometry Identification of Imidacloprid Photolysis Products. Microchem J. 2011; 99: 535–541.
- Kurwadkar S, Evans A, Dewinne D, White P, Mitchell F. Modeling Photodegradation Kinetics of Three Systemic Neonicotinoids-dinotefuran, Imidacloprid, and Thiamethoxam-in Aqueous and Soil Environment. Environ Toxicol Chem. 2016; 35: 1718–1726. https://doi.org/10.1002/etc.3335 PMID: 26660507
- Djilali T, Chekir N, Benhabiles O, Mouzaoui O, Mahidine S, Kasbadji NM, et al. Effect and Interaction Study of Acetamiprid Photodegradation Using Experimental Design. Water Sci Technol. 2016; 74: 1953–1963. https://doi.org/10.2166/wst.2016.382 PMID: 27789896
- Pinto MI, Salgado R, Laia CAT, Cooper WJ, Sontage G, Burrows HD, et al. The Effect of Chloride lons and Organic Matter on the Photodegradation of Acetamiprid in Saline Waters. J Photoch Photobio A. 2018; 360: 117–124.
- Mulligan RA, Redman ZC, Keener MR, Ball DB, Tjeerdema RS. Photodegradation of Clothianidin under Simulated California Rice Field Conditions. Pest Manag Sci. 2016; 72: 1322–1327. https://doi.org/10. 1002/ps.4150 PMID: 26374572
- Paim CS, Palma E, Malesuik MD, Steppe M. LC/MS/MS Study for Identification of Entacapone Degradation Product Obtained by Photodegradation Kinetics. J Aoac Int. 2010; 93: 1856–1861. PMID: 21313812
- Yamamoto A, Terao T, Hisatomi H, Kawasaki H, Arakawa R. Evaluation of River Pollution of Neonicotinoids in Osaka City (Japan) by LC/MS with Dopant-assisted Photoionisation. J Environ Monitor. 2012; 14: 2189–2194.
- Fenoll J, Garrido I, Hellín P, Flores P, Navarro S. Photodegradation of Neonicotinoid Insecticides in Water by Semiconductor Oxides. Environ Sci Pollut R. 2015; 22: 15055–15066.
- Rocco A, Aturki Z, Fanali S. Chiral Separations in Food Analysis. Trac-Trend Anal Chem. 2013; 52: 206–225.
- Chen X, Dong FS, Xu J, Liu XG, Wang YH, Zheng YQ. Enantioselective Degradation of Chiral Insecticide Dinotefuran in Greenhouse Cucumber and Soil. Chirality. 2015; 27: 137–141. <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/chir.22402 PMID: 25378099</u>
- Sayako Y, Masataka I, Shunsuke N, Masayuki M, Masaki O, Yukitaka T, et al. Runoff and Degradation of Aerially Applied Dinotefuran in Paddy Fields and River. B Environ Contam Tox. 2015; 94: 796–800.
- Medellin-Castillo NA, Ocampo-Pérez R, Leyva-Ramos R, Sanchez-Polo M, Rivera-Utrilla J, Méndez-Díaz JD. Removal of Diethyl Phthalate from Water Solution by Adsorption, Photo-oxidation, Ozonation and Advanced Oxidation Process (UV/H₂O₂, O₃/H₂O₂ and O₃/Activated Carbon). Sci. Total Environ. 2013; 442: 26–35. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2012.10.062 PMID: 23178761
- Czaplicka M, Jaworek K, Bąk M. Study of Photodegradation and Photooxidation of P -arsanilic Acid in Water Solutions at pH = 7: Kinetics and By-products. Environ Sci Pollut R. 2015; 22: 16927–16935.
- 69. Wang XJ, Wu Z, Wang Y, Wang W, Wang X, Bu YJ, et al. Adsorption-photodegradation of Humic Acid in Water by Using ZnO Coupled TiO₂ /Bamboo Charcoal under Visible Light Irradiation. J Hazard Mater. 2013; 262: 16–24. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2013.08.037 PMID: 24004575
- 70. Ge SB, Wang LS, Liu ZL, Jiang SC, Yang XX, Yang W, et al. Properties of Nonvolatile and Antibacterial Bioboard Produced from Bamboo Macromolecules by Hot Pressing. Saudi J Biol Sci. 2018; 25: 474– 478. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sjbs.2017.12.003 PMID: 29692650
- Chen YX, Huang XD, Han ZY, Huang X, Hu B, Shi DZ, et al. Effects of Bamboo Charcoal and Bamboo Vinegar on Nitrogen Conservation and Heavy Metals Immobility During Pig Manure Composting. Chemosphere. 2010; 78: 1177–1181. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2009.12.029 PMID: 20060567
- 72. Ho CL, Lin CY, Ka SM, Chen A, Tasi YL, Liu ML, et al. Bamboo Vinegar Decreases Inflammatory Mediator Expression and NLRP3 Inflammasome Activation by Inhibiting Reactive Oxygen Species Generation and Protein Kinase C-α/δ Activation. PLoS One. 2013; 8: e75738. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal. pone.0075738 PMID: 24124509
- He HY, Huang JF, Cao LY, Wu JP. Photodegradation of Methyl Orange Aqueous on MnWO4 Powder under Different Light Resources and Initial pH. Desalination. 2010; 252: 66–70.
- Zhang XY, Xu Z, Ge ZY, Ouyanga XH, Ji W. Tunable Molecular Configuration for Significant Enhancement of Two-photon Absorption Based on Novel Octupolar Benzoimidazole Derivatives. J Photoch Photobio A. 2014; 290: 22–30.

- Ren D, Huang B, Bi TT, Xiong D, Pan XJ. Effects of pH and Dissolved Oxygen on the Photodegradation of 17a-ethynylestradiol in Dissolved Humic Acid Solution. Environ Sci Process Impacts. 2016; 18: 78– 86. https://doi.org/10.1039/c5em00502g PMID: 26611276
- Laet ND, Lycke S, Pevenage JV, Moens L, Vandenabeele P. Investigation of Pigment Degradation Due to Acetic Acid Vapours: Raman Spectroscopic Analysis. Eur J Mineral. 2013; 25: 855–862.
- 77. Zhang L, Tian HT, Hong R, Wang C, Wang Y, Peng AP, et al. Photodegradation of Atrazine in the Presence of Indole-3-acetic Acid and Natural Montmorillonite Clay Minerals. Environ Pollut. 2018; 240: 793–801. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2018.05.002 PMID: 29778815
- Chowdhury IH, Kundu S, Naskar MK. Effect of Organic Acids on the Physicochemical Properties of Titania and Its Photodegradation Efficiency of Methyl Orange. J Phys Chem Solids. 2018; 121: 367–374.
- Guo Y, Xue Q, Cui KP, Zhang J, Wang H, Zhang HZ, et al. Study on the Degradation Mechanism and Pathway of Benzene Dye Intermediate 4-methoxy-2-nitroaniline Via Multiple Methods in Fenton Oxidation Process. Rsc Adv. 2018; 8: 10764–10775.