



# Article Adverse Drug Reactions among Children with Tuberculosis in Tashkent, Uzbekistan, 2019

Makhliyo Abdusalomova <sup>1</sup>,\*, Olga Denisiuk <sup>2</sup>, Hayk Davtyan <sup>3</sup>, Jamshid Gadoev <sup>4</sup>, Barno Abdusamatova <sup>5</sup>, Nargiza Parpieva <sup>6</sup> and Abduvohid Sodikov <sup>6</sup>

- <sup>1</sup> Department of Phthisiology and Pulmonology, Tashkent Pediatric Medical Institute, Tashkent 100140, Uzbekistan
- <sup>2</sup> Alliance for Public Health, 01601 Kyiv, Ukraine; o.denisiuk@gmail.com
- <sup>3</sup> Tuberculosis Research and Prevention Center, Yerevan 0014, Armenia; haykdav@gmail.com
- <sup>4</sup> World Health Organization Country Office, Tashkent 100100, Uzbekistan; gadoevj@who.int
- <sup>5</sup> Main Department of Protection of Maternity and Childhood, Ministry of Health of Uzbekistan, Tashkent 100011, Uzbekistan; barnoa@mail.ru
- <sup>6</sup> The Republican Specialized Scientific and Practical Medical Center of Phtisiology and Pulmonology, Tashkent 100179, Uzbekistan; nargizaparpieva@gmail.com (N.P.); Tashobl-optd@mail.ru (A.S.)
- \* Correspondence: mahliyo.abdusalomova@mail.ru; Tel.: +998-71-260-3126

**Abstract**: The treatment of childhood tuberculosis can be challenging due to the lack of pediatric drug formulations and monitoring of drug-toxicity in routine settings. There are no published studies from Uzbekistan on the adverse drug reactions (ADR) associated with anti-tuberculosis treatment in children. In this study, we aimed to investigate the ADR associated with anti-tuberculosis treatment in children. This was a cohort study using secondary program data of children treated at the city and regional tuberculosis clinics in Tashkent, Uzbekistan. Of the 302 patients evaluated, 135 (44.7%) reported ADR. New tuberculosis was registered in 277 (92%) patients and 262 (87%) had extrapulmonary tuberculosis. Factors associated with ADR included treatment at a regional hospital (adjusted odds ratio, aOR = 1.75; p = 0.026), female sex (aOR = 2.2; p = 0.004), and treatment with second-line drugs (aOR = 8.82; p < 0.001). The most common ADRs were gastrointestinal disorders (28.5%) followed by hepatitis (8.9%) and dermatologic reactions (8.6%). Most of the ADRs were mild (55.6%) or moderate (43.7%), only one child had severe ADR. Patients with the identified risk factors should be closely monitored during the treatment. We also recommend expansion of ADR surveillance throughout the country for more representative data in the future.

Keywords: SORT IT; tuberculosis management; pediatric tuberculosis

# 1. Introduction

Tuberculosis (TB) is a disease caused by *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* (*MTB*) and is one of the top 10 causes of death worldwide [1]. In 2019, 10 million people developed TB including 1.2 million TB patients in children (<15 years of age). There were 1.4 million deaths due to TB in the same year and 16% of them occurred in children [1].

Compared to adults, children have a higher risk of progressing rapidly to active TB disease after infection, and there are also differences in the immune reactivity and pathophysiology which makes the diagnosis of TB more difficult in children compared to adults [2,3].

The main principles of pediatric TB treatment are similar to the treatment of TB in adults [4]. Although the risk of serious adverse drug reactions (ADR) caused by anti-TB drugs is less frequent in children [5], the treatment of childhood TB can still be challenging due to the lack of pediatric drug formulations and the difficulties involved in monitoring toxicity in routine settings [6].



Citation: Abdusalomova, M.; Denisiuk, O.; Davtyan, H.; Gadoev, J.; Abdusamatova, B.; Parpieva, N.; Sodikov, A. Adverse Drug Reactions among Children with Tuberculosis in Tashkent, Uzbekistan, 2019. *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health* **2021**, *18*, 7574. https://doi.org/10.3390/ ijerph18147574

Academic Editor: Paul B. Tchounwou

Received: 4 March 2021 Accepted: 5 May 2021 Published: 16 July 2021

**Publisher's Note:** MDPI stays neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.



**Copyright:** © 2021 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/ 4.0/). Most of the TB patients in children are present in low-income and lower middleincome countries with limited recourses and the systems for reporting treatment-related ADR are not well established.

The Republic of Uzbekistan, situated in Central Asia, is among the 18 high-priority countries for TB control in the World Health Organization (WHO) European Region and one of the 30 high burden countries for multidrug-resistant TB (MDR-TB) globally. In 2019, about 2060 multidrug-/ rifampicin- resistant TB (MDR/RR-TB) patients were registered in the country [1]. Amongst the 16,272 notified incident TB patients (new and relapse), 2190 (13.5%) were children aged 0–14 years. The treatment success percentage was 92% among new and relapse patients with first-line TB drugs in 2018. There are no data for treatment outcomes specifically for children in Uzbekistan. For the WHO European Region, TB treatment success among children was 89.3% [1]. Treatment success is influenced by various factors including ADR and their management, which plays a crucial role in ensuring treatment compliance and retention in care. WHO defines an ADR as "any response to a drug which is noxious and unintended, and which occurs at doses normally used in man for prophylaxis, diagnosis, or treatment of disease, or for the modification of physiological function" [7]. ADR increases morbidity as well as the overall cost of care [8].

Therefore, it is important to have a clear understanding of the frequency and severity of ADR as these may influence TB treatment duration, adherence to drugs and if treatment is interrupted or stopped, individual mortality and morbidity or spread of infection in the community [9].

A literature search revealed no published studies from Uzbekistan about ADRs among children treated for TB. This information may be beneficial for improving the current programs for pediatric TB care and treatment in Uzbekistan.

For all HIV-negative children undergoing inpatient treatment in Tashkent City Children TB Hospital (TCCTH) and the Tashkent Regional Children TB Hospital (TRCTH) for the period of 2019, we aimed to investigate: (a) Socio-demographic and clinical characteristics; (b) frequency and spectrum of ADR and proportion of children having ADR; (c) factors associated with the occurrence of the ADR.

# 2. Materials and Methods

# 2.1. Study Design

This was a cohort study using secondary program data obtained from the Tashkent City Children TB Hospital (TCCTH) and the Tashkent Regional Children TB Hospital (TRCTH) for the period of 2019.

# 2.2. Setting

General setting: The Republic of Uzbekistan is a lower middle-income country located in Central Asia with a population of about 33 million. It consists of 13 administrative regions, one autonomous republic (Karakalpakstan) and Tashkent metropolitan area, the capital city.

Specific setting: TB care and control activities in the country are coordinated by the National TB Program (NTP) of Uzbekistan. TB care is free of charge for all patients throughout the country. National treatment guidelines are in line with WHO guidelines. In the provinces, specialized dispensaries/hospitals and specialized TB units located in primary health care (PHC) facilities provide care to TB patients. Apart from the above mentioned facilities, there is also the Republican Specialized Scientific-Practical Medical Center of Phthisiology and Pulmonology (RSSPMCPP) which is the national TB care facility providing the highest level of care to patients throughout the country.

Inpatient TB care for children: This is provided in "pediatric departments" at the provincial TB hospitals and in RSSPMCPP. Additionally, in the Tashkent region and Tashkent city there are two specialized hospitals for children (TRCTH and TCCTH) providing similar TB care. Anti-TB medications (fixed-dose combinations as well as individual drugs) are available for children throughout the country. Treatment regimens used for the TB treatment in children are the same as for adult patients in terms of used medications and duration of treatment both for drug-susceptible and drug-resistant TB. The dosage of drugs for children is calculated based on weight and adjustments are made during the course of the treatment if necessary depending on weight change and/or ADR. In clinically diagnosed patients (for example, using a tuberculin skin test, a Diaskin test or a chest radiograph) where there is no laboratory confirmation of TB, the treatment regimen is selected based on the drug-susceptibility profile of the index TB patient with whom the child is in contact with.

ADR surveillance: A newly introduced order (2018) on pharmacovigilance has established a system for recording and reporting ADR, serious ADR (SADR), and ADR of special interest (ADRSI). All the treatment facilities are obliged to record ADR and report all SADR and ADRSI to the pharmacovigilance center at the national level.

Details on the patients' selection criteria for inpatient and outpatient treatment, recommended pediatric TB diagnostic algorithm, recommended pediatric TB treatment algorithms, recommended dosages for pediatric TB drugs formulations, and severity of ADR are presented in Tables 1–5.

**Table 1.** Patient selection criteria for inpatient and outpatient treatment for children with tuberculosisin Uzbekistan, 2019.

Patient Selection Criteria for Inpatient	Patient Selection Criteria for Outpatient		
Treatment	Treatment		
Children (aged 0–17 years) with active tuberculosis in various sites, regardless of bacteriological confirmation, shall undergo inpatient treatment for at least 2 months, while the decision is made on an individual basis when there is cavitary disease with bacterial excretion.	Children (0–17) with milder forms of active tuberculosis, clinically diagnosed patients, non-cavitary disease, and no intoxication symptoms; Children with active forms of tuberculosis without risk factors (cohabitation with a diagnosed TB patient who has a positive sputum smear (SS+), HIV-positive or evident cachexia in a child).		

**Table 2.** Recommended pediatric TB diagnostic algorithm for children with tuberculosis in Uzbekistan, 2019.

History	Careful Analysis (Including History of TB Contacts and Symptoms Consistent with TB).		
Clinical examination	Assessment of physical development.		
Tuberculin immunological skin test	Mantoux test, Interferon-gamma release assays (Diaskin test, TB-Spot test).		
Bacteriological	Sputum microscopy, Xpert MTB/RIF assay, line probe assay (HAIN TEST), liquid (MGIT) culture, solid (Löwenstein-Jensen) culture.		
X-ray	X-ray, chest fluorography, computer tomography (CT), bone and joints X-rays, magnetic resonance imaging (MRI).		
Laboratory testing	Complete blood count, urine test, spinal puncture, fine needle aspiration, test of pleural and ascitic fluid sample, if needed.		

\_

MTB and Drug Susceptibility	Phases of Chemotherapy Course			
Testing	Intensive Phase	Continuation Phase		
MTB+, susceptible to first-line drugs MTB (bacteriologically negative) Strong recommendation	2 HR ZE	4 HR		
MTB+, resistant to H or to H in combination with S, Z, E Conditional recommendation	3 RZE Km Lfx	6 RZE Lfx		
MDR/RR-TB Strong recommendation	8 Z Km (Cm) Lfx Pto Cs (PAS)	12 Z Lfx Pto Cs (PAS)		
Pre-XDR-TB, MDR/RR-TB with resistance to ofloxacin Weak recommendation	6 Bdq 8 Z Km (Cm) Pto Cs PAS	16 Z Pto Cs PAS		
Pre-XDR-TB, MDR/RR-TB with resistance to second-line injectables Weak recommendation	8 Z Cm Lfx Pto Cs PAS	16 Z Lfx Pto Cs PAS		
XDR-TB Weak recommendation	6 Bdq Cm Lzd PAS Im/Cln Amx/clv	18 Mfx Lzd PAS Amx/clv		

**Table 3.** Recommended pediatric TB treatment algorithms for children with tuberculosis in Uzbek-istan, 2019.

MTB: Mycobacterium tuberculosis; H: Isoniazid; R: Rifampicin; Z: Pyrazinamide; E: Ethambutol; S: Streptomycin; Km: Kanamycin; Lfx: Levoflaxacin; MDR-TB: Multidrug-resistant tuberculosis; Cm: Capreomycin; Pto: Protionamide; Cs: Cycloserine; PAS: Para-aminosalicylic acid; XDR-TB: Extensively drug-resistant tuberculosis; Bdq: Bedaquiline; Lzd: Linezolid; Im/Cln: Imipenem with cilastatin; Amx/Clv: Amoxicillin potentiated with clavulanate; Mfx: Moxifloxacin.

**Table 4.** Recommended dosages for pediatric TB drugs formulations for children with tuberculosisin Uzbekistan, 2019.

Drug	Daily Dose (mg/kg)	Frequency	Maximum Daily Dose
Isoniazid	10 (10–15)	Once a day	600 mg 2000 mg
Rifampicin	15 (10–20)	Once a day	600 mg
Pyrazinamide	35 (30–40)	Once a day	2 g
Ethambutol	20 (15–25)	Once a day	1.2–2 g
Streptomycin	20–40	Once a day	1 g
Kanamycin	15–30	Once a day	1 g
Amikacin	15–22.5	Once a day	1 g
Capreomycin	15–30	Once a day	1 g
Levofloxacin	7.5–10	Once a day	750 mg
Moxifloxacin	7.5–10	Once a day	400 mg
Ethionamide	15–20	Twice a day	1 g
Protionamide	15–20	Twice a day	1 g
Cycloserine	10–20	Once or twice a day	1 g
Para-aminosalicylic acid	150	Twice or three times a day	12 g

Severity Level	Determining the Severity Level
Level 1—mild	Transient or mild discomfort (<48 h); medical intervention/therapy is not required.
Level 2—moderate	Mild to moderate limitations in activity—some assistance is required; medical intervention/therapy is required in minimum or is not required at all.
Level 3—severe	Noticeable limitations in activity, some assistance is usually required; medical intervention/therapy is required, with possible hospitalization.
Level 4—life-threatening	Excessive limitations in activity, extensive assistance is required; extensive medical intervention/therapy is required.

Table 5. Adverse drug reaction severity levels among children with tuberculosis in Uzbekistan, 2019.

#### 2.3. Study Population and Period

All HIV-negative children (0–18 years) with TB treated at the Tashkent City Children TB Hospital and the Tashkent Regional Children TB Hospital during 2019, were included in the study.

## 2.4. Data Collection, Sources, and Statistical Analysis

The following data was collected from patient cards and forms: Age, sex, history of TB treatment, disease localization, bacteriological confirmation, treatment regimen, facility, area of residence, Mantoux and Diaskin test results, vaccination with BCG, number of documented ADRs, type of most severe ADRs, and grade of severity of ADR. EpiData Entry (version 4.6.0.0, Odense, Denmark) was used for data capture. The data was collected during the period from November 2019 to March 2020. After extraction, data were checked for errors. Inconsistencies detected were resolved by retrieving the source documents.

#### 2.5. Analysis and Statistics

Sociodemographic and clinical characteristics of the study population were summarized with frequencies and proportions. The outcome of interest was any ADR, while age, sex, category, localization of disease, bacteriological confirmation, treatment regimen, comorbidities, facility, area of residence, Mantoux, Diaskin test, and BCG vaccination were considered as potential risk factors. Odds ratios (OR) were calculated to measure the association between risk factors and ADR and the Chi squared test of association was used for testing of statistical significance of deviation of OR from one. Variables with a *p*-value of <0.1 in the unadjusted analysis were chosen for the multivariable regression model. Age and sex were treated as *a priori* risk factors. Adjusted ORs, confidence intervals, and *p*-values were calculated from the final multivariable logistic regression model. All statistical tests were two-tailed and a *p*-value of <0.05 was considered statistically significant. Statistical analysis was completed using the Stata software version 15 (Stata Corp., College Station, TX, USA).

## 3. Results

#### Socio-Demographic, Clinical Characteristics, Frequency, and Predictors of Adverse Drug Reactions

Of the 302 children enrolled in the study, 159 (52%) were male. The mean age of participants was 9.9 (4.2) years. Almost half (47%) of all patients were in the age group of 11–17 years. New TB was registered in 277 (92%) patients and most of the patients (262, 87%) had extrapulmonary TB; most of the patients (296, 98%) were clinically diagnosed and 285 (94%) received first-line drugs; 174 (58%) patients had other co-morbidities reported. Among those with documented test results, the Mantoux and Diaskin test were reported positive in 121 (97%) and 170 (92%) patients, respectively. There were 170 (56%) patients enrolled from the Tashkent Regional Children TB Hospital and 132 (44%) from the Tashkent City Children TB Hospital.

Of all the 302 patients enrolled in the study, a total of 135 (44.7%) patients reported having ADR. Females had two times higher odds of development of ADR compared to male patients (aOR = 2.02; p = 0.011). As expected, the patients enrolled in the second-line TB treatment had nearly nine times higher odds of ADR, compared to those receiving the first-line TB treatment (aOR = 8.82; p = 0.002). Patients who received the treatment at TRCTH had 75% higher odds of ADR than those receiving the treatment at TCCCH (aOR = 1.75; p = 0.003) (Table 6).

**Table 6.** Socio-demographic, clinical characteristics, and factors associated with the occurrence of the adverse drug reactions among pediatric tuberculosis patients registered at Tashkent City Children Tuberculosis Hospital and Tashkent Regional Children Tuberculosis Hospital, Uzbekistan, 2019.

Characteristics	To n	otal %	A N	DR (%)	No n	ADR (%)	OR	95% CI	<i>p</i> -Value	aOR	95% CI	LRT <i>p</i> -Value
Total	302		135	44.7	167	55.3						
Age group <5 years 5–10 years 11–17 years	60 101 141	(19.9) (33.4) (46.7)	23 40 72	(38.3) (39.6) (51.1)	37 61 69	(61.7) (60.4) (48.9)	1 1.05 1.68	(0.55–2.03) (0.91–3.12)	0.873 0.100	1 1.2 1.46	(0.57–2.50) (0.71–3.03	0.209
Sex Male Female	159 143	(52.6) (47.4)	60 75	(37.7) (52.4)	99 68	(62.3) (47.6)	1 1.82	(1.15–2.88)	0.011	2.02	(1.25–3.27)	0.004
TB category New Retreatment	277 25	(91.7) (8.3)	122 13	(44.0) (52.0)	155 12	(56.0) (48.0)	1 1.37	(0.61–3.12)	0.445			
TB localization Pulmonary Extrapulmonary Missing	38 262 2	(12.7) (87.3)	18 117	(47.4) (44.7)	20 145	(52.6) (55.3)	1 0.9	(0.45–1.77)	0.754			
Bacteriological confirmation Yes No	6 296	(52.6) (47.4)	2 133	(33.3) (44.9)	4 163	(66.7) (55.1)	1 1.63	(0.29–9.05)	0.575			
Treatment FLD SLD	285 17	(94.4) (5.6)	120 15	(42.1) (88.2)	165 2	(57.9) (11.8)	1 10.3	(2.31–45.9)	1 0.002	8.82	(1.92–40.60)	<0.001
Co-morbidities Yes No	174 128	(57.6) (42.4)	79 56	(45.4) (43.8)	95 72	(54.6) (56.3)	1.07 1	(0.68–1.69)	0.775			
Clinic TCCTH TRCTH	132 170	(43.7) (56.3)	46 89	(34.8) (52.4)	86 81	(65.2) (47.6)	1 2.05	(1.29–3.28)	0.003	1 1.75	(1.07–2.88)	0.026
Residence Urban Rural	140 162	(46.4) (56.3)	49 86	(35.0) (53.1)	91 76	(65.0) (46.9)	1 2.1	(1.32–3.34)	0.002			
Had contact with TB patients No Yes Missing	153 146 3	(51.2) (48.8)	62 71	(40.5) (48.6)	91 75	(59.5) (51.4)	1 1.19	(0.92–1.55)	0.194			
Mantoux test Negative Positive No test done	4 121 177	(3.2) (96.8)	0 61	(0.0) (50.4)	4 60	(100.0) (49.6)			0.047			
Diaskin test Negative Positive No test done	14 170 120	(7.6) (92.4)	1 93	(7.1) (54.7)	12 76	(85.7) (44.7)	1 14.7	(1.87–115.5)	0.011			
BCG Yes No Missing	154 21 127	(88.0) (12.0)	67 11	(43.5) (52.4)	87 10	(56.5) (47.6)	1.03 1	(0.81–1.30)	0.803			

ADR: Adverse drugs reaction; OR: Odds ratio; aOR: Adjusted odds ratio; CI: Confidence interval; TB: Tuberculosis; TCCTH: Tashkent City Children Tuberculosis Hospital; TRCTH: Tashkent Regional Children Tuberculosis Hospital; FLD: First-line TB drugs; SLD: Second-line TB drugs; BCG: Bacillus Calmette-Guerin. The Diaskin test result was not included in the final model, as 39% of children were not tested, however, those that tested positive had 14 times increased chance of development of ADR compared to those that tested negative.

The frequency of ADR is shown in Table 7. A total of 167 (55.3%) patients experienced no ADRs, while 101 (33.4%), 28 (9.3%), and 5 (1.7%) experienced 1, 2 or 3 ADR, respectively. Only one patient experienced five ADR.

**Table 7.** Frequency of adverse drug reactions among pediatric tuberculosis patients registered at Tashkent City Children Tuberculosis Hospital and Tashkent Regional Children Tuberculosis Hospital, Uzbekistan, 2019.

Frequency of ADR	Number	%
No ADR	167	55.3
One ADR	101	33.4
Two ADR	28	9.3
Three ADR	5	1.7
Five ADR	1	0.3
Total	302	100.0

TB: Tuberculosis; ADR: Adverse drug reaction.

The spectrum of ADR is described in Table 8. The most frequently documented ADR was gastrointestinal disorders accounting for about half of all ADRs, and observed in 28.5% of the patients followed by hepatitis (15.3% of total ADR) and dermatologic reaction (rash/itching) (14.8% of total ADR).

**Table 8.** Spectrum of adverse drug reactions among pediatric tuberculosis patients registered at Tashkent City Children Tuberculosis Hospital and Tashkent Regional Children Tuberculosis Hospital, Uzbekistan, 2019.

Types of ADR	Number ADR	% Patients with ADR	% Total ADR
Gastro-intestinal	86	28.5	48.9
Hepatitis	27	8.9	15.3
Dermatological	26	8.6	14.8
Psychiatric, CNS disorder	14	4.6	8.0
Urinary tract disorder	11	3.6	6.3
Bone pain	4	1.3	2.3
Myalgia	3	1.0	1.7
Arthralgia	2	0.7	1.1
Peripheral neuropathy	2	0.7	1.1
Hypokalemia	1	0.3	0.6
Total	176	58.3	100.0

ADR: Adverse drug reaction; CNS: Central nervous system.

The severity assessment is described in Table 9. Most of the reported ADRs were of mild severity (55.7%), followed by moderate severity (43.7%), and severe ADR was observed in one patient.

Severity	n	(%)
Mild	75	55.6
Moderate	59	43.7
Severe	1	0.7

**Table 9.** Severity of adverse drug reactions among pediatric tuberculosis patients registered at Tashkent City Children Tuberculosis Hospital and Tashkent Regional Children Tuberculosis Hospital, Uzbekistan, 2019.

ADR: Adverse drug reaction.

#### 4. Discussion

The anti-tuberculosis drugs-induced ADR are less frequent in children than in adults [5]. However, despite the availability of effective treatment regimens which can cure TB, the ADR can prolong hospitalization, lead to discontinuation of treatment, and treatment failure [10].

The timely detection of ADR is crucial to manage them adequately and understanding the factors associated with ADR may help develop appropriate ADR prevention and mitigation strategies [11].

This is the first study from Uzbekistan reporting ADR in children with TB. We observed that nearly half of the patients developed ADR which is consistent with the data from other studies in adults [12] but is higher compared to the recent study of ADR among children in Pakistan (13.2%) [13]. The ADR incidence in the study from Brazil was 83.5% [14].

Gastrointestinal disorders were the most commonly observed ADRs which accounted for half of all documented ADRs. Our finding is consistent with the results of the study from Pakistan where also gastro-intestinal disorder was the most frequently observed ADRs (65.7%) [13] and somewhat higher compared to the data of ADR in adults from Iran (22%) [15]. Hepatitis was a second most frequently observed ADR and was seen in nearly one in ten patients. Previous studies suggest isoniazid to be associated with hepatitis with a reported incidence of hepatotoxicity ranging from 0.8% to 16.2% patients [13,16,17]. Compared to the study conducted in Pakistan (0.8%) our study showed a higher level of hepatotoxicity [13]. Anti-TB drug-induced hepatotoxicity is a serious ADR which can be deadly if it is not addressed on time. The monthly monitoring of liver function is recommended for patients on anti-TB treatment.

Skin reaction is known to be caused by rifampicin [18]. In our study, dermatological ADR was observed in 8.6% of patients, which was relatively higher than data from Pakistan (0.8%) [13] but lower compared to adults (21%) [19]. Hypersensitivity skin reactions and hepatitis are known to be one of the most difficult ADRs to manage and can lead to the discontinuation of treatment and poor treatment outcomes [20].

The study from Pakistan showed that female children, those aged 6–10 years, children with EPTB, previously treated patients, and children without a BCG scar had a higher risk of ADRs [13]. In our study too, female sex was associated with higher odds of ADR [13]. Studies of ADR in adults also showed that the severity of ADR was greater in females [15]. The reasons for this association are unclear. Females tend to have reduced hepatic clearance, a lean body mass, and lower glomerular filtration rate—thus it is not clear if this association occurs due to the differences in pharmacokinetics or due to the other factors. Hence, female patients should be monitored carefully for ADR while on the treatment.

Patients who were treated in the TRCTH hospital were almost twice likely to be registered with ADR as compared to those in the TCCTH. Both clinics are following the same TB treatment and ADR management protocol. We speculate that this might reflect better documentation of ADRs in the patient's cards.

Many studies have shown that ADRs are higher in patients who are treated with second-line anti-TB drugs, which is in line with our study finding [21]. This might be due to the toxic nature of the drugs used, longer duration of treatment, and lack of pediatric formulations making it challenging to adjust the dosage based on body weight [22].

The Diaskin test indicates the accuracy of the diagnosis and the severity of tuberculosis [23]. Our study shows the association between the positive Diaskin test and the ADR occurrence, which might be due to the severity of the disease.

Our study has several limitations. First, we had to rely on the program data given the retrospective nature of the study. Hence, we were unable to rule out any errors that may have occurred during data collection or recording. Second, we were not able to collect data on the timing of ADR occurrence and to follow-up on the treatment outcomes and their association with ADR.

The strength of the study is that we collected and analyzed all the available data for the defined period and it potentially reflects the reality of the pediatric TB care in Uzbekistan.

# 5. Conclusions

ADRs are frequently seen in children with TB. The medical providers should be attentive in order to prevent, detect ADRs at the earliest, and manage them appropriately. Patients with risk factors associated with ADR, such as females, patients on SLD, and those with a positive Diaskin test should be closely monitored during the treatment. Such surveillance for ADR should be expanded throughout the country so that more representative data can be obtained in the future. All the health care providers involved in pediatric TB care should be educated on ADR detection and management.

**Author Contributions:** Conceptualization, M.A., H.D. and J.G.; methodology, M.A., H.D. and O.D.; software, H.D.; validation, H.D. and O.D.; investigation, M.A., B.A. and N.P.; resources, M.A., B.A., N.P. and A.S.; data curation, M.A., B.A., N.P. and A.S.; writing—original draft preparation, M.A., H.D., O.D. and J.G.; writing—review and editing, M.A., H.D., O.D. and J.G.; supervision, M.A., B.A., N.P., A.S.; project administration, M.A.; funding acquisition, J.G. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

**Funding:** World Health Organization Country Office in Uzbekistan and the German KfW Development Bank, the project "TB prevention and control in Uzbekistan".

**Institutional Review Board Statement:** Permission to access the data was obtained from the Republican Specialized Scientific Practical Medical Centre of Phthisiology and Pulmonology under the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan. Ethics approval was obtained from the National Ethics Committee of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan based in Tashkent, Uzbekistan. The study was exempted from review by the World Health Organization Research Ethics Review Committee based in Geneva, Switzerland (ERC.0003417/12.08.2020), as the research project analyzed retrospective anonymized patient data.

**Informed Consent Statement:** A waiver of informed consent was granted by ethics review bodies, as the study collected and analyzed de-identified routine recording and reporting data.

**Data Availability Statement:** The data that support the findings of this study are available from the corresponding author, (M.A.), upon reasonable request.

Acknowledgments: The authors thank the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan, Republican Specialized Scientific Practical Medical Centre of Phthisiology and Pulmonology under the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan for defining research questions and providing data for this study, and the secretariat of the European TB Research Initiative (ERI-TB) at the World Health Organization Regional Office for Europe and World Health Organization Country Office in Uzbekistan for organizing the Structured Operational Research Training (SORT-TB) supported by the German KfW Development Bank, in line with the joint World Health Organization/KfW "TB prevention and control in Uzbekistan" project. The SORT-TB curriculum was an adaptation of the SORT IT course of the UNICEF/UNDP/World Bank/WHO Special Programme for Research and Training in Tropical Diseases (TDR) SORT IT course (https://www.who.int/tdr/capacity/strengthening/sort/en/ accessed on 1 March 2021) to the eastern European and central Asian context. We thank to Arax Hovhannesyan for support in data analysis. The current course was co-facilitated by officers from the World Health Organization Country Office in Uzbekistan; the World Health Organization Regional Office for Europe; the International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease (the Union); and individual experts in the area of tuberculosis research. Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

**Disclaimer:** The authors alone are responsible for the views expressed in this publication and they do not necessarily represent the decisions or policies of the World Health Organization.

**©World Health Organization 2021:** All rights reserved. The WHO Regional Office for Europe has granted the Publisher permission for the reproduction of this article.

**Open Access Statement:** In accordance with WHO's open-access publication policy for all work funded by WHO or authored/co-authored by WHO staff members, the WHO retains the copyright of this publication through a Creative Commons Attribution IGO license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/igo/legalcode) which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium provided the original work is properly cited.

## References

- 1. World Health Organization (WHO). Global Tuberculosis Report; World Health Organization (WHO): Geneva, Switzerland, 2020.
- Marais, B.J.; Gie, R.P.; Schaaf, H.S.; Hesseling, A.C.; Obihara, C.C.; Starke, J.J.; Enarson, D.A.; Donald, P.R.; Beyers, N. The natural history of childhood intra-thoracic tuberculosis: A critical review of literature from the pre-chemotherapy era. *Int. J. Tuberc. Lung Dis.* 2004, *8*, 392–402.
- 3. Shingadia, D.; Novelli, V. Diagnosis and treatment of tuberculosis in children. Lancet Infect. Dis. 2003, 3, 624–632. [CrossRef]
- 4. Tate, K.; Holden, A.; Watson, P.; Strouse, J.; Herr, J. Guidance for national tuberculosis programmes on the management of tuberculosis in children Second Edition. *Archit. Dig.* **2014**, *67*, 82–89.
- 5. Marais, B.J.; Schaaf, H.S. Tuberculosis in Children. Cold Spring Harb. Perspect. Med. 2014, 4, a017855. [CrossRef]
- 6. Usherenko, I.; Basu Roy, U.; Mazlish, S.; Liu, S.; Benkoscki, L.; Coutts, D.; Epstein, S.; Qian, M.; Rafiq, S.; Scott, C. Pediatric tuberculosis drug market: An insider perspective on challenges and solutions. *Int. J. Tuberc. Lung Dis.* **2015**, *19*, 23–31. [CrossRef]
- American Society of Health-System Pharmacists. ASHP guidelines on adverse drug reaction monitoring and reporting. *Am. J. Health Syst. Pharm.* 1995, 52, 417–419. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 8. Koh, Y.; Yap, C.W.; Li, S.C. A quantitative approach of using genetic algorithm in designing a probability scoring system of an adverse drug reaction assessment system. *Int. J. Med. Inform.* **2008**, 77, 421–430. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 9. Nagpal, M.; Devgun, P.; Kalra, R.K.; Chawla, N. Study on the adverse effects affecting treatment outcome in smear positive tuberculosis patients under DOTS in Amritsar city. *Int. J. Community Med. Public Health* **2018**, *5*, 801. [CrossRef]
- Han, X.Q.; Pang, Y.; Ma, Y.; Liu, Y.H.; Guo, R.; Shu, W.; Huang, X.R.; Ge, Q.P.; Du, J.; Gao, W.W. Prevalence and Risk Factors Associated with Adverse Drug Reactions among Previously Treated Tuberculosis Patients in China. *Biomed. Environ. Sci.* 2017, 30, 139–142. [CrossRef]
- 11. Oshikoya, K. Review Article: Adverse drug reactions in children: Types, incidence and risk factors. *Niger. J. Paediatr.* **2008**, *33*, *33*. [CrossRef]
- 12. Gholami, K.; Kamali, E.; Hajiabdolbaghi, M.; Shalviri, G. Evaluation of anti-tuberculosis induced adverse reactions in hospitalized patients. *Pharm. Pract. (Granada)* 2006, *4*, 134–138. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 13. Laghari, M.; Talpur, B.; Syed Sulaiman, S.; Khan, A.; Bhatti, Z. Adverse drug reactions of anti-tuberculosis treatment among children with tuberculosis. *Int. J. Mycobacteriol.* **2020**, *9*, 281. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Maciel, E.L.N.; Guidoni, L.M.; Favero, J.L.; Hadad, D.J.; Molino, L.P.; Jonhson, J.L.; Dietze, R. Adverse effects of the new tuberculosis treatment regimen recommended by the Brazilian Ministry of Health. *J. Bras. Pneumol.* 2010, 36, 232–238. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 15. Farazi, A.; Sofian, M.; Jabbariasl, M.; Keshavarz, S. Adverse Reactions to Antituberculosis Drugs in Iranian Tuberculosis Patients. *Tuberc. Res. Treat.* **2014**, 2014, 1–6. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 16. Metushi, I.; Uetrecht, J.; Phillips, E. Mechanism of isoniazid-induced hepatotoxicity: Then and now. *Br. J. Clin. Pharmacol.* **2016**, *81*, 1030–1036. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 17. Schaberg, T.; Rebhan, K.; Lode, H. Risk factors for side-effects of isoniazid, rifampin and pyrazinamide in patients hospitalized for pulmonary tuberculosis. *Eur. Respir. J.* **1996**, *9*, 2026–2030. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 18. Bartakke, S.; Shinde, V.; Shrividya, S. Anti-tuberculosis treatment-induced Drug Rash with Eosinophilia and Systemic Symptoms syndrome. *Med. J. Dr. D.Y. Patil Univ.* **2016**, *9*, 271. [CrossRef]
- 19. Fei, C.M.; Zainal, H.; Ali, I.A.H. Evaluation of Adverse Reactions Induced by Anti-Tuberculosis Drugs in Hospital Pulau Pinang. *Malays. J. Med. Sci.* 2018, 25, 103–114. [CrossRef]
- 20. Rashed, A.N.; Wong, I.C.K.; Cranswick, N.; Tomlin, S.; Rascher, W.; Neubert, A. Risk factors associated with adverse drug reactions in hospitalised children: International multicentre study. *Eur. J. Clin. Pharmacol.* **2012**, *68*, 801–810. [CrossRef]
- Lan, Z.; Ahmad, N.; Baghaei, P.; Barkane, L.; Benedetti, A.; Brode, S.K.; Brust, J.C.M.; Campbell, J.R.; Chang, V.W.L.; Falzon, D.; et al. Drug-associated adverse events in the treatment of multidrug-resistant tuberculosis: An individual patient data metaanalysis. *Lancet Respir. Med.* 2020, *8*, 383–394. [CrossRef]
- 22. Donald, P.R.; Maritz, J.S.; Diacon, A.H. The pharmacokinetics and pharmacodynamics of rifampicin in adults and children in relation to the dosage recommended for children. *Tuberculosis* **2011**, *91*, 196–207. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

23. Nikitina, I.Y.; Karpina, N.L.; Kasimceva, O.V.; Gergert, V.Y.; Ergeshov, A.; Lyadova, I.V. Comparative performance of QuantiFERON-TB Gold versus skin test with tuberculosis recombinant allergen (Diaskintest) among patients with suspected pulmonary tuberculosis in Russia. *Int. J. Infect. Dis.* **2019**, *86*, 18–24. [CrossRef] [PubMed]