

Editorial

Paradoxical effects of tumour necrosis factor- α in adjuvant-induced arthritis

Richard O Williams

Kennedy Institute of Rheumatology Division, Imperial College London, Aspenlea Road, London W6 8LH, UK

Corresponding author: Richard O Williams, richard.o.williams@imperial.ac.uk

Published: 6 June 2008

This article is online at <http://arthritis-research.com/content/10/3/113>

© 2008 BioMed Central Ltd

Arthritis Research & Therapy 2008, **10**:113 (doi:10.1186/ar2430)

See related research article by Kim *et al.*, <http://arthritis-research.com/content/10/2/R38>

Abstract

Anti-tumour necrosis factor (TNF) α therapy is highly effective in rheumatoid arthritis and it is surprising, therefore, that a recent study showed that intraperitoneal administration of recombinant TNF α reduced the severity of adjuvant-induced arthritis and decreased IFN γ expression in cultured draining lymph node cells. Furthermore, in untreated arthritic rats, maximal TNF α expression in draining lymph node cells coincided with spontaneous disease remission, suggesting a role for endogenous TNF α in recovery from arthritis. If confirmed in further studies, these findings suggest that, in addition to its well-established pro-inflammatory properties, TNF α may also play a disease-limiting role in this model of rheumatoid arthritis by suppressing effector T cell responses.

A recent paper by Kim and colleagues [1] published in this journal reports that intraperitoneal administration of recombinant tumour necrosis factor (rTNF) α to rats with adjuvant-induced arthritis has a beneficial effect on disease outcome. This is surprising given the efficacy of anti-TNF α therapy in rheumatoid arthritis (RA) [2], with patients receiving not only immediate clinical benefit, but also reduced joint damage in the long-term [3]. How can we reconcile the fact that blockade of endogenous TNF α is beneficial in human RA, whereas administration of exogenous rTNF α reduces disease severity in an animal model of RA?

In response to this question, it is important to bear in mind that cytokines generally act within their local pericellular microenvironment. It is conceivable, therefore, that endogenous TNF α plays a pro-inflammatory role in the joints of arthritic rats whereas exogenous rTNF α triggers an anti-inflammatory response when injected into the peritoneal cavity. For example, injection of rTNF α could induce a neutralising antibody response against TNF α , or could induce the production of soluble TNF receptors, which could inhibit

TNF α activity at the site of disease activity. However, the authors found no evidence of increased levels of anti-TNF α antibodies or soluble TNF receptor (TNFR) [1].

Another possibility is that administration of TNF α could induce the production of IL-10, resulting in suppression of TNF α expression in the joint. Alternatively, injection of rTNF α could result in activation of the hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenalin axis, leading to the production of immunosuppressive glucocorticoids. Although the authors did not rule out these possibilities, they did not find any evidence of generalised immunosuppression in control mice treated with rTNF α [1]. Another possibility considered by the authors was the induction of the tryptophan-degrading enzyme indoleamine 2,3-dioxygenase, which is known to inhibit effector T cell responses. Again, however, no evidence was found to support this [1].

It was also shown that the recovery phase of adjuvant-induced arthritis in Lewis rats coincided with the peak of TNF α expression in antigen-stimulated draining lymph node cells, suggesting an immunomodulatory role for endogenous TNF α in disease remission [1]. In contrast, TNF α expression was highest in Wistar-Kyoto rats (which are resistant to adjuvant-induced arthritis) in the immediate post-immunisation period. In the light of these findings, another possibility to consider is that the pathogenesis of adjuvant-induced arthritis is fundamentally different to that of RA, such that TNF α is anti-inflammatory in the former but pro-inflammatory in the latter. In this respect it is important to point out that in the study by Kim and colleagues, arthritis was induced by immunisation with heat-killed *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* plus mineral oil [1], both of which may induce arthritis independently. Hence, multiple arthritogenic factors contri-

EAE = experimental autoimmune encephalomyelitis; IFN = interferon; IL = interleukin; RA = rheumatoid arthritis; rTNF = recombinant TNF; TNF = tumour necrosis factor; TNFR = TNF receptor.

bute to disease induction and it is possible that TNF α plays different, and perhaps changing, roles in the overall pathogenesis of this form of arthritis.

In the light of the findings presented by Kim and colleagues [1], it is interesting that a small number of studies have shown exacerbation of specific autoimmune diseases by anti-TNF α therapy. For example, TNF α blockade was shown to increase both the rate and frequency of relapse in patients with existing multiple sclerosis [4]. Similarly, in experimental autoimmune encephalomyelitis (EAE), TNF α ^{-/-} mice developed enhanced inflammation and demyelination, whereas treatment of susceptible mice with TNF α reduced disease severity [5]. In another study, EAE failed to resolve in TNF α ^{-/-} or TNFR^{-/-} mice, suggesting that TNF α plays an important role in resolution of inflammation [6]. In murine lupus it was shown that administration of rTNF α was protective [7] whereas TNF α deficiency was associated with increased production of anti-nuclear antibodies and accelerated onset of disease [8]. TNF α was also shown to have anti-inflammatory properties depending on the timing of TNF α expression in a murine model of autoimmune diabetes [9].

One possibility to consider is that TNF α acts on cells of the joint (for example, endothelial cells) to promote cellular infiltration but acts on cells of the adaptive immune system to suppress T cell responses, possibly as part of a negative feedback loop. This is supported by the observation by Kim and colleagues that administration of rTNF α suppressed IFN γ production by antigen-stimulated T cells. Furthermore, studies from the laboratory of Cope and colleagues have shown that prolonged exposure of T cells to TNF α in the context of RA leads to the induction of hyporesponsiveness to T cell receptor signalling [10]. However, the fact that Kim and colleagues did not observe reduced T cell responses in TNF α treated rats immunised with a control antigen (hen egg lysozyme) would argue against a generalised immunosuppressive effect [1]. Another possibility is that TNF α modulates antigen presenting cell function, leading to alterations in T cell activity. For example, two recent studies have shown that TNF α selectively inhibits expression of p40, the common subunit of IL-12 and IL-23, in human and mouse myeloid cells, respectively [11,12].

In summary, this paper raises intriguing questions about the diverse roles played by TNF α in adjuvant-induced arthritis although further studies will be required to establish their relevance to human disease.

Competing interests

The author declares that they have no competing interests.

References

1. Kim EY, Chi HH, Rajaiah R, Moudgil KD: **Exogenous tumor necrosis factor- α induces suppression of autoimmune arthritis.** *Arthritis Res Ther* 2008, **10**:R38.
2. Feldmann M, Maini RN: **Lasker Clinical Medical Research**

3. Smolen JS, Han C, Bala M, Maini RN, Kalden JR, van der Heijde D, Breedveld FC, Furst DE, Lipsky PE: **Evidence of radiographic benefit of treatment with infliximab plus methotrexate in rheumatoid arthritis patients who had no clinical improvement: a detailed subanalysis of data from the anti-tumor necrosis factor trial in rheumatoid arthritis with concomitant therapy study.** *Arthritis Rheum* 2005, **52**:1020-1030.
4. **TNF neutralization in MS: results of a randomized, placebo-controlled multicenter study. The Lenercept Multiple Sclerosis Study Group and The University of British Columbia MS/MRI Analysis Group.** *Neurology* 1999, **53**:457-465.
5. Liu J, Marino MW, Wong G, Grail D, Dunn A, Bettadapura J, Slavin AJ, Old L, Bernard CC: **TNF is a potent anti-inflammatory cytokine in autoimmune-mediated demyelination.** *Nat Med* 1998, **4**:78-83.
6. Kassiotis G, Kollias G: **Uncoupling the proinflammatory from the immunosuppressive properties of tumor necrosis factor (TNF) at the p55 TNF receptor level: implications for pathogenesis and therapy of autoimmune demyelination.** *J Exp Med* 2001, **193**:427-434.
7. Jacob CO, McDevitt HO: **Tumour necrosis factor-alpha in murine autoimmune 'lupus' nephritis.** *Nature* 1988, **331**:356-358.
8. Kontoyiannis D, Kollias G: **Accelerated autoimmunity and lupus nephritis in NZB mice with an engineered heterozygous deficiency in tumor necrosis factor.** *Eur J Immunol* 2000, **30**:2038-2047.
9. Christen U, Wolfe T, Mohrle U, Hughes AC, Rodrigo E, Green EA, Flavell RA, von Herrath MG: **A dual role for TNF-alpha in type 1 diabetes: islet-specific expression abrogates the ongoing autoimmune process when induced late but not early during pathogenesis.** *J Immunol* 2001, **166**:7023-7032.
10. Cope AP: **Exploring the reciprocal relationship between immunity and inflammation in chronic inflammatory arthritis.** *Rheumatology (Oxford)* 2003, **42**:716-731.
11. Ma X, Sun J, Pappasavvas E, Riemann H, Robertson S, Marshall J, Bailer RT, Moore A, Donnelly RP, Trinchieri G, Montaner LJ: **Inhibition of IL-12 production in human monocyte-derived macrophages by TNF.** *J Immunol* 2000, **164**:1722-1729.
12. Zakharova M, Ziegler HK: **Paradoxical anti-inflammatory actions of TNF-alpha: inhibition of IL-12 and IL-23 via TNF receptor 1 in macrophages and dendritic cells.** *J Immunol* 2005, **175**:5024-5033.