# Peer

Searching for phylogenetic patterns of Symbiodiniaceae community structure among Indo-Pacific Merulinidae corals

Sébastien Leveque<sup>1,2</sup>, Lutfi Afiq-Rosli<sup>1</sup>, Yin Cheong Aden Ip<sup>1</sup>, Sudhanshi S. Jain<sup>1</sup> and Danwei Huang<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> National University of Singapore, Singapore, Singapore

<sup>2</sup> Université de La Rochelle, La Rochelle, Singapore

## ABSTRACT

Over half of all extant stony corals (Cnidaria: Anthozoa: Scleractinia) harbour endosymbiotic dinoflagellates of the family Symbiodiniaceae, forming the foundational species of modern shallow reefs. However, whether these associations are conserved on the coral phylogeny remains unknown. Here we aim to characterise Symbiodiniaceae communities in eight closely-related species in the genera Merulina, Goniastrea and Scapophyllia, and determine if the variation in endosymbiont community structure can be explained by the phylogenetic relatedness among hosts. We perform DNA metabarcoding of the nuclear internal transcribed spacer 2 using Symbiodiniaceaespecific primers on 30 coral colonies to recover three major endosymbiont clades represented by 23 distinct types. In agreement with previous studies on Southeast Asian corals, we find an abundance of *Cladocopium* and *Durusdinium*, but also detect Symbiodinium types in three of the eight coral host species. Interestingly, differences in endosymbiont community structure are dominated by host variation at the intraspecific level, rather than interspecific, intergeneric or among-clade levels, indicating a lack of phylogenetic constraint in the coral-endosymbiont association among host species. Furthermore, the limited geographic sampling of four localities spanning the Western and Central Indo-Pacific preliminarily hints at large-scale spatial structuring of Symbiodiniaceae communities. More extensive collections of corals from various regions and environments will help us better understand the specificity of the coral-endosymbiont relationship.

Subjects Biodiversity, Evolutionary Studies, Marine BiologyKeywords Coral-endosymbiont association, Coral reef, Internal transcribed spacer,Zooxanthellae, Phylogeny, Scleractinia, Metabarcoding, Next-generation sequencing

## **INTRODUCTION**

The modern coral reef is one of the most diverse marine ecosystems on Earth (*Reaka-Kudla*, 1997; *Fisher et al.*, 2015), build mainly by the habitat-forming stony corals (Cnidaria: Anthozoa: Scleractinia) with a calcification process driven largely by their intricate symbiosis with photosynthetic dinoflagellates of the family Symbiodiniaceae (*Muscatine & Cernichiari*, 1969; *Stat*, *Carter & Hoegh-Guldberg*, 2006). The host provides shelter and inorganic nutrients to the endosymbionts (*Muscatine & Porter*, 1977; *Weis et al.*, 2001; *Stat*,

Submitted 16 April 2019 Accepted 13 August 2019 Published 13 September 2019

Corresponding author Danwei Huang, huangdanwei@nus.edu.sg

Academic editor Anastazia Banaszak

Additional Information and Declarations can be found on page 11

DOI 10.7717/peerj.7669

Copyright 2019 Leveque et al.

Distributed under Creative Commons CC-BY 4.0

OPEN ACCESS

## Carter & Hoegh-Guldberg, 2006) in exchange for fixed carbon (*Muscatine & Cernichiari*, 1969; Weis et al., 2001; Yellowlees, Rees & Leggat, 2008).

Symbiodiniaceae is extremely diverse, with at least nine genus-level clades which contain hundreds of species (Arif et al., 2014; Thornhill et al., 2014), although fewer than 30 species have been formally named (LaJeunesse et al., 2018). The recognition of this remarkable diversity owes in large part to the use of molecular genetic tools that have helped biologists discover and characterise the major clades and subclades (or types) of Symbiodiniaceae (Rowan & Powers, 1991a; Rowan & Powers, 1991b; Rowan, 1998; LaJeunesse, 2002). For decades, these clades have been referred to by letters that run from A to I, but genus names have recently been established for most of them, including Symbiodinium Gert Hansen & Daugbjerg (2009) (formerly Clade A), Breviolum Parkinson & LaJeunesse (2018) (formerly Clade B), Cladocopium LaJeunesse & Jeong (2018) (formerly Clade C), and Durusdinium LaJeunesse (2018) (formerly Clade D) LaJeunesse et al. (2018). A robust phylogenetic classification of these dinoflagellates is critical for better understanding the coral reef ecosystem because different endosymbiont types have distinct physiological characteristics (Warner, Fitt & Schmidt, 1996; Baker, 2003; Sampayo et al., 2008) that result in broadly predictable responses of reef corals to environmental stress (*Warner*, Fitt & Schmidt, 1999; Baker et al., 2004; Reynolds et al., 2008). For example, coral hosts dominated by Durusdinium can generally better withstand thermal stress compared to corals with a greater abundance of Cladocopium (Rowan, 2004; Berkelmans & Van Oppen, 2006; LaJeunesse et al., 2014).

Reef corals exhibit varying levels of specificity for particular genera and types of endosymbionts (*Thomas et al., 2014*; *Smith, Ketchum & Burt, 2017a*). Generally, host species in the Indo-Pacific are mostly associated with the genus *Cladocopium* and to a lesser extent *Durusdinium* (*LaJeunesse et al., 2010a*), though endosymbioses with *Symbiodinium* and *Breviolum* have also been documented (*Loh, Carter & Hoegh-Guldberg, 1998*; *Yang et al., 2012*). Each host colony can also associate with multiple Symbiodiniaceae types (*Rowan & Powers, 1991b*; *Rowan & Knowlton, 1995*; *Baker, 2003*). For example, a single colony of *Porites lutea* can harbour three species of *Cladocopium*—C3, C15 and C91 (*Gong et al., 2018*). Environmental factors may also play a role in the distribution of Symbiodiniaceae among different colonies of a single host species. For instance, the relative abundances of *Cladocopium goreaui* (C1), *Cladocopium* C2, and *Durusdinium glynni* (D1) in *Acropora millepora* are dependent on temperature and light availability (*Cooper et al., 2011*). Dissolved nutrients have also been shown to influence the community structure of the endosymbionts present within the host (*Sawall et al., 2014*; *Gong et al., 2018*).

Apart from the coral host's ability to harbour a wide range of Symbiodiniaceae species, the composition of endosymbionts present in a host population can change in response to environmental variations. For example, following a bleaching event, *Acropora millepora* colonies that were originally dominated by the thermally sensitive *Cladocopium* C3 (=ITS1 type C2; *Tonk et al., 2013*) suffered higher mortality compared with colonies that were *Durusdinium* predominant (*Jones et al., 2008*). Furthermore, the majority of the surviving colonies that were initially *Cladocopium* C3-predominant acquired more *Cladocopium* goreaui or *Durusdinium* endosymbionts (*Jones et al., 2008*). Indeed, the ability to shuffle

and even switch symbiont communities by repopulation of more tolerant types can play an important role towards enhancing the holobiont's recovery capacity and host survivability (*LaJeunesse et al., 2010b; Kemp et al., 2014; Silverstein, Cunning & Baker, 2015*). Overall, however, the host-symbiont association in the majority of corals tends to be stable, even in the course of severe bleaching events (*Goulet, 2006; Smith et al., 2017b*). This stability may play a crucial role in the hosts' resilience during acute environmental stress.

Recently, host identities of populations and species of Pocilloporidae Gray, 1840, have been shown to affect associated Symbiodiniaceae and bacterial communities (Bongaerts et al., 2010; Bongaerts et al., 2011; Brener-Raffalli et al., 2018). Whether this phylogenetic constraint extends beyond intraspecific relationships or sister species is unclear. With rapid advances in our understanding of coral evolutionary history and taxonomy in the past decade (Frank & Mokady, 2002; Budd et al., 2010), we now can now bear on this question using an abundance of phylogenetic data (Bhattacharya et al., 2016; Kitahara et al., 2016; Quek & Huang, 2019). It is generally acknowledged that gross morphological traits can converge among distinct taxa living under similar environmental influences and these traits evolve at vastly different rates among lineages (Cairns, 2001; Fukami et al., 2004b; *Flot et al.*, 2011), partly explaining why taxonomy based solely on morphology has been problematic (Fukami, 2008; Fukami et al., 2008; Kitahara et al., 2010). However, there exist a number of species traits which are phylogenetically constrained among corals, in that closely-related species tend to possess similar trait states (Madin et al., 2016a). These include growth rates (Madin et al., 2016b), sexuality (Baird, Guest & Willis, 2009), reproductive mode (Kerr, Baird & Hughes, 2011), endosymbiont transmission strategy (Hartmann et al., 2017), and even susceptibility to and resistance against anthropogenic stressors (Huang, 2012; Huang & Roy, 2013). The present study extends this line of inquiry to determine if endosymbiont communities are constrained by the phylogenetic relationships among hosts, focusing on a clade of three genera in the family Merulinidae Verrill, 1865, that have a well-characterised phylogeny (Huang et al., 2014a). These corals obtain their algal symbionts from the environment (horizontal acquisition), in contrast to the well-studied pocilloporids which vertically transmit their endosymbionts, and thus offer a distinct life history strategy for study (Baird, Guest & Willis, 2009; Hartmann et al., 2017).

Merulinidae is a clade containing 25 living genera with around 140 species distributed widely in the Indo-Pacific and Caribbean Sea (*Veron, 2000; Huang et al., 2014a; Huang et al., 2014b*). Since the landmark studies of *Fukami et al. (2004b*) and *Fukami et al. (2008*) that showed severe polyphyly involving four traditional families of Merulinidae Verrill (1865), Faviidae Gregory (1900), Pectiniidae Vaughan & Wells (1943) and Trachyphylliidae Verrill (1901), there has been considerable progress in building a phylogenetic classification of the clade (*Huang et al., 2009; Huang et al., 2011; Huang et al., 2014b; Budd & Stolarski, 2011; Benzoni et al., 2011; Arrigoni et al., 2012; Budd et al., 2012*). In particular, one subclade ('A' *sensu Budd & Stolarski, 2011*) comprising the genera *Merulina* Ehrenberg (1834), *Goniastrea* Milne Edwards & Haime (1848), *Scapophyllia* Milne Edwards & Haime (1848), and *Paraclavarina* Veron (1985), was analysed in detail using both nuclear and mitochondrial DNA markers to produce a well-supported phylogeny (Fig. 1). The groups



**Figure 1** Molecular phylogenetic tree of Merulinidae corals. Phylogeny based on *Huang et al. (2014a)*. Nodes at least moderately supported, with maximum likelihood and parsimony bootstrap >60 and Bayesian posterior probability >0.95, are labelled with circles. Host clades A1 and A3 follow the previous study, and are tested for differences in Symbiodiniaceae communities with *Merulina* + *Scapophyllia* (clade M + S).

Full-size 🖾 DOI: 10.7717/peerj.7669/fig-1

defined by these supports (e.g., A1 and A3 *sensu* (*Huang et al., 2014a*) could be tested for phylogenetic conservatism of Symbiodiniaceae communities hosted by these corals.

Here, we apply DNA metabarcoding using the internal transcribed spacer 2 (ITS2) marker to test if closer lineages of merulinid corals host more similar communities and diversity of Symbiodiniaceae types (*Quigley et al., 2014*). We also test if the endosymbiont communities are structured according to conventional host taxonomy or geographic locality. The data show that endosymbiont community variation within host species overwhelms interspecific, intergeneric and among-lineage differences, and geography may play a role in structuring Symbiodiniaceae communities among closely-related corals.

## **MATERIALS & METHODS**

#### **Field sampling**

Samples from eight merulinid species—*Goniastrea retiformis* (Lamarck, 1816), *G. pectinata* (Ehrenberg, 1834), *G. favulus* (Dana, 1846), *G. edwardsi* Chevalier, 1971, *G. minuta Veron, 2000, Merulina ampliata* (Ellis & Solander, 1786), *M. scabricula* Dana, 1846, and *Scapophyllia cylindrica* Milne Edwards & Haime, 1849—were collected from Singapore, Fiji, Seychelles and the Great Barrier Reef in Australia (Table S1). Field collections were approved by the National Parks Board Singapore (NP/RP16-156), Fiji Ministry of Education (21/10/10), Seychelles Bureau of Standards (A0347), and Great Barrier Reef Marine Park

Authority (G09/29715.1). In total, 30 healthy colonies were sampled across localities, with sampling at each locality performed within a maximum of one week, except for Singapore, for which samples were obtained in two batches in 2007 and 2017. Sampling periods were tracked to check if Symbiodiniaceae communities differed between them. Coral colonies were photographed in the field and a 10 to 100 cm<sup>2</sup> piece of tissue was sampled and preserved in 100% ethanol or CHAOS solution (4 M guanidine thiocyanate, 0.1% N-lauroyl sarcosine sodium, 10 mM Tris pH 8, 0.1 M 2-mercaptoethanol) (*Sargent, Jamrich & Dawid, 1986; Fukami et al., 2004a; Huang et al., 2008*).

#### DNA extraction, amplification and sequencing

Isolation of digested material from CHAOS-preserved samples was performed with a phenol extraction buffer (100 mM TrisCl pH 8, 10 mM EDTA, 0.1% SDS), while ethanol-preserved samples were digested overnight with 900  $\mu$ l CTAB buffer (cetyltrimethylammonium bromide; 0.1M Tris pH 8, 1.4M NaCl, 0.02M EDTA, 20 g/l CTAB) and 20  $\mu$ l proteinase K (20 mg/ml). Phase separation was carried out using phenol:chloroform:isoamyl-alcohol (25:24:1), and precipitated DNA was eluted in 100–200  $\mu$ l of water and stored at -80 °C.

Polymerase chain reaction (PCR) amplified a ~350-bp fragment from the nuclear ribosomal internal transcribed spacer 2 (ITS2) region, targeted using a Symbiodiniaceae-specific primer set: ITSintfor2 (forward: 5'–GAA TTG CAG AAC TCC GTG–3'; *LaJeunesse & Trench, 2000*) and ITS-Reverse (reverse: 5'–GGG ATC CAT ATG CTT AAG TTC AGC GGG T–3'; *Coleman, Suarez & Goff, 1994*). This marker is located between the 5.8S and 28S ribosomal RNA genes, and has been informative for studying the diversity of Symbiodiniaceae (e.g., *LaJeunesse, 2001; LaJeunesse, 2002; LaJeunesse & Thornhill, 2011; Arif et al., 2014; Boulotte et al., 2016*). A unique 8-bp barcode was added to the 5'end of each primer for multiplexed amplicon sequencing. In total, 100 sets of tagged primers were used for 90 PCR reactions (triplicates of 30 samples) and 10 no-template controls. Each reaction mixture comprised a total volume of 25.0 µl, including 12.5 µl GoTaq DNA polymerase (Promega Corporation, Madison, WI, USA), 1.0 µl 10 µM primers (forward and reverse), 1.0 µl DNA template and 9.5 µl water. The PCR profile consisted of an initial denaturation of 94 °C for 180 s, following by 35 cycles of 94 °C for 30 s, 55 °C for 30 s and 72 °C for 45 s, and a final extension step of 72 °C for 180 s.

The quality of PCR products was assessed with electrophoresis on a 1% agarose gel stained with GelRed (Cambridge Bioscience, Cambridge, UK) and visualised under ultraviolet exposure. Gel band intensities were used to approximate normalisation during pooling of amplicons. The pooled library was purified using 1.0 × Sera-Mag SpeedBeads (GE Healthcare Life Sciences) in 18% polyethylene glycol (PEG) buffer suspension:DNA ratio and finally eluted with 30  $\mu$ l of water. The amount of DNA post-purification was quantified using a Qubit Fluorometer 3.0 (Life Technologies) and made up to 20 ng/ $\mu$ l, with 50  $\mu$ l sent to Axil Scientific Pte Ltd for DNA library preparation using the TruSeq DNA PCR-Free Library Prep Kit (Illumina). Sequencing was carried out in ~50% of an Illumina MiSeq run, using the Reagent Kit v3 for 300-bp paired-end reads. All sequences generated here are available at the National Center for Biotechnology Information (NCBI; BioProject ID: PRJNA549817).

#### Data analysis

The bioinformatics pipeline was based primarily on Sze et al. (2018), Afiq-Rosli et al. (2019) and Lim et al. (2019) (but see Hume et al., 2019). Briefly, Paired-End reAd mergeR (PEAR) (version 0.9.8) (*Zhang et al.*, 2014) was used to assemble paired-end sequences with a default minimum overlap of 100 bp; minimum and maximum lengths of 300 and 390 bp respectively, based on the expected amplicon size; and a minimum Phred quality score of 30 to ensure accurate base calls. OBITools (version 1.2.11) (Boyer et al., 2016) were used to process the assembled paired-end reads. Reads were demultiplexed using *ngsfilter* based on the primer sequences, unique tags and sample information to obtain sample sequences. obiunia collapsed identical sequences and assigned read counts for each unique DNA sequence. *obisplit* sorted sample data into separate files based on their sample names. Sequences with only a single read were discarded using obigrep. Finally, obiclean was used to identify amplification and sequencing errors by assigning sequence records as 'head' (most common sequence amongst all the sequences), 'internal' (erroneous sequences) and 'singleton' (rare, likely true sequences with no other variants). Sequences assigned as 'head' were retained for further analysis. No sequences were found in the negative PCR controls following quality checks and filtering.

Sequences were searched against the NCBI *nt* database using BLAST+ (version 2.3.0; *blastn*) (*Altschul et al., 1990*), with maximum *E*-value of  $10^{-6}$  and minimum identity match of 85%. Identity of each sequence was established based on the top match of Symbiodiniaceae type with  $\geq$ 97% identity, in accordance with previous studies using the ITS2 marker (*Arif et al., 2014; Cunning, Gates & Edmunds, 2017*). Following sequence filtering and taxon identification, two endosymbiont community datasets were assembled for subsequent analyses: (1) types with minimum of 10 reads summed across PCR triplicates for each sample; and (2) types present in at least two of the three PCR replicates for each sample. These strict filtering steps would help reduce false positives associated with amplification and sequencing errors. The datasets are available at Zenodo (http://dx.doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3344613).

The host phylogeny was reconstructed in *Huang et al. (2014a)* and pruned to show only the coral samples used here (Fig. 1). Briefly, phylogenetic analyses were carried out on the concatenated matrix comprising the nuclear histone H3 (*Colgan et al., 1998*), internal transcribed spacers 1 and 2 (*Takabayashi et al., 1998a*; *Takabayashi et al., 1998b*), and mitochondrial non-coding intergenic region (*Fukami et al., 2004a*). The maximum likelihood tree was inferred in RAxML 7.7.9 (*Stamatakis, 2006*; *Stamatakis, Hoover & Rougemont, 2008*) with 50 random starting trees and 1,000 bootstrap replicates. Bayesian inference was carried out in MrBayes 3.2.2 (*Huelsenbeck & Ronquist, 2001*; *Ronquist & Huelsenbeck, 2003*; *Ronquist et al., 2012*) with four Markov chains of 6 million generations implemented in two runs, logging one tree per 100 generations and discarding the first 10,001 trees as burn-in. Maximum parsimony analysis was performed in PAUP\* 4.0b10 (*Swofford, 2003*) with 10,000 random additions and 1,000 bootstrap replicates.

Endosymbiont data analysis was performed in R (version 3.4) (*R Core Team, 2013*) using the *vegan* package (version 2.4.6) (*Oksanen et al., 2013*). Variation of Symbiodiniaceae communities among the coral colonies was examined using non-metric multidimensional

scaling (NMDS) with the Bray-Curtis dissimilarity—based on proportional read abundance—and Jaccard distance measures. Analysis of similarities (ANOSIM; 999 permutations) was performed to test for differences in the proportional read abundances of Symbiodiniaceae types among the host coral lineages (A1, A3 and M+S; Fig. 1), host genera (*Goniastrea, Merulina* and *Scapophyllia*), and host localities (Australia, Fiji, Singapore and Seychelles), independently. The taxonomic distinctness index was also computed to characterise patterns of Symbiodiniaceae assemblage dissimilarity among host species (*Clarke & Warwick, 1998; Warwick & Clarke, 2001*).

## **RESULTS & DISCUSSION**

A total of 10,496,267 reads have been obtained from the MiSeq sequencing run, with 10,119,346 paired-end reads assembled (96.4%). These reads correspond to 646,568 unique haplotypes. Following error pruning and sequence filtering, 294 haplotypes remain, belonging to three major Symbiodiniaceae genera that are common in Indo-Pacific corals—*Symbiodinium* (formerly clade A), *Cladocopium* (formerly clade C) and *Durusdinium* (formerly clade D) (*LaJeunesse et al., 2010a*; *LaJeunesse et al., 2018*; *Yang et al., 2012*).

*Cladocopium* is overall the most abundant endosymbiont, accounting for 78.2% of sequences retained, and furthermore the most dominant taxon based on proportional read abundance in six of the eight host species examined (Fig. 2). Cladocopium is present in all host species, while Durusdinium and Symbiodinium are present in six and three host species, respectively. Our results mirror previous community-level studies of Symbiodiniaceae showing that *Cladocopium* is more abundant in tropical latitudes compared to other clades such as Symbiodinium which is mostly found at higher latitudes (Rodriguez-Lanetty et al., 2001; Savage et al., 2002; Baker, 2003). In particular, endosymbiont communities in corals from the tropical Pacific and Southeast Asian regions appear to be dominated by Cladocopium and, to a lesser extent, Durusdinium (Rodriguez-Lanetty et al., 2001; Van Oppen et al., 2001; Baker, 2003; LaJeunesse et al., 2010a; Tanzil et al., 2016). While there are distinct patterns in read abundances of Symbiodiniaceae genera among coral species, proportional read count variance between samples of each host species is large (Fig. 2), revealing large intraspecific variation of endosymbiont abundances. For example, among G. pectinata colonies, Durusdinium reads are on average more abundant than Symbiodinium reads, but Durusdinium is not present in three colonies examined. Therefore, at the Symbiodiniaceae genus level, variation among coral colonies within each species may mask differences between species.

Twenty-three Symbiodiniaceae ITS2 types have been found across all colonies, comprising three types from *Symbiodinium*, eighteen from *Cladocopium* and two from *Durusdinium*. *Cladocopium goreaui* (ITS2 type C1) and *Cladocopium* C3 are the most common types, present in 32% and 55% of all colonies examined. The latter is also present in every merulinid species except *Goniastrea minuta*, corroborating past studies showing that *Cladocopium* C3 is a generalist type in the Indo-Pacific (*LaJeunesse et al., 2003; Wham, Carmichael & LaJeunesse, 2014*), prevalent even in some of the world's warmest reefs



 Figure 2
 Proportional abundance of sequencing reads recovered. MiSeq sequencing data for each Symbiodiniaceae genus among coral species examined.

 Full-size IDOI: 10.7717/peerj.7669/fig-2

(*Hume et al., 2013*). Similarly, *Cladocopium goreaui* (ITS2 type C1) is also considered to be a generalist taxon worldwide (*LaJeunesse et al., 2003; LaJeunesse, 2005; Wham, Carmichael* 

#### & LaJeunesse, 2014).

Among the coral species examined here, *Goniastrea pectinata* and *Scapophyllia cylindrica* contain the richest Symbiodiniaceae assemblages of 11 and 10 types respectively, with *Goniastrea retiformis*, *Goniastrea favulus* and *Merulina ampliata* following with nine different types. *Merulina scabricula* only hosts two Symbiodiniaceae types despite being a congener and clustering most closely with *M. ampliata* (Fig. 1), which has nine types.

Endosymbiont community structure does not differ among host genera (R = -0.180, p = 0.979) and lineages (R = 0.085, p = 0.142; as defined in Fig. 1) when analysing sequences based on minimum of 10 reads summed across PCR triplicates for each sample (Fig. 3). Results are the same for types present in at least two of the three PCR replicates for each sample (R = -0.110, p = 0.792 for genera; R = 0.110, p = 0.146 for lineages; Fig. S1). Furthermore, no genus- or lineage-specific patterns of endosymbiont-type taxonomic distinctness were apparent among host taxa (Fig. S2). In support, although *Goniastrea retiformis* and *G. minuta* are in a lineage distinct from the rest of the species examined (Fig. 1), their endosymbiont communities are neither clustered nor separated from the other species on the NMDS (Fig. 3). Symbiodiniaceae communities does appear to be structured spatially as they are significantly different between Australia, Fiji, Singapore and Seychelles (R = 0.162, p = 0.036), though this pattern is not significant when considering the types present in at least two of the three PCR replicates (R = 0.054, p = 0.313). These results should therefore be interpreted with caution.





Full-size 🖾 DOI: 10.7717/peerj.7669/fig-3

Host species identity has been shown to play a role in determining endosymbiont community composition (*Thornhill et al., 2009; Thornhill et al., 2014; Tonk et al., 2013*). For example, *Siderastrea siderea* in the Belize Mesoamerican Barrier Reef System contains a distinct Symbiodiniaceae community signal (*Baumann et al., 2018*). This host specificity reflects various interacting physiological needs of the coral species, such as their depth, light, temperature or nutrient preferences (*Finney et al., 2010*), and the endosymbiont populations can be further structured according to the environment (*Thornhill et al., 2009; Davies et al., 2019*). Interestingly, the host species signal breaks down at the genus level, as Symbiodiniaceae communities in *Siderastrea radians* are more similar to *Pseudodiploria strigosa* than its congeneric *Siderastrea siderea* (*Baumann et al., 2018*).

Indeed, various combinations and diversity of endosymbionts allow the holobiont to face distinct environmental stressors (*Toller, Rowan & Knowlton, 2001a; Toller, Rowan & Knowlton, 2001b; Berkelmans & Van Oppen, 2006; LaJeunesse et al., 2009*). For instance, while the presence of endosymbiotic *Cladocopium* is associated with large depth ranges and stable growth rates of coral hosts (*Little, Van Oppen & Willis, 2004; Cantin et al., 2009*), this genus and in particular the supposed generalist *Cladocopium* C3 can be sensitive to thermal variation at local scales (*Keshavmurthy et al., 2012*). Therefore, the intraspecific variation in community structure shown in each of the species examined here may be related to environmental differences among host localities (*Howells et al., 2012*). Because

our samples originate from a large spatial range, and since *Cladocopium* can be found throughout the Indo-Pacific realm (*LaJeunesse et al., 2003; Howells et al., 2012; Wham, Carmichael & LaJeunesse, 2014; Wong et al., 2016; Keshavmurthy et al., 2017)*, our sampling is expected to capture a considerable fraction of the environmental affinities associated with this Symbiodiniaceae genus.

Durusdinium is present in six host species despite being represented by lower read abundance compared with *Cladocopium*. This is not surprising given that it is the second most-dominant clade behind *Cladocopium* in the tropical Indo-Pacific (*Rodriguez-Lanetty et al., 2001; Van Oppen et al., 2001; Baker, 2003; LaJeunesse et al., 2010a; Tanzil et al., 2016*). Importantly, *Durusdinium* is considered an opportunistic taxon, increasing in abundance *in hospite* during challenging conditions such as coral bleaching, and more generally under extreme or variable levels of heat or light (*Toller, Rowan & Knowlton, 2001a; Chen et al., 2003; Lien et al., 2007; Lien et al., 2013*). Therefore, the presence and abundance, or absence, of *Durusdinium* could serve as an indicator of coral community health (*Warner, Fitt & Schmidt, 1999; Burnett, 2002; Baker et al., 2004; Reynolds et al., 2008*).

The high light tolerance of *Durusdinium* in shallow water environments may underlie the capacity of colonies living on the reef flat that are often exposed to elevated irradiance levels (see *Innis et al., 2018*). These corals consist of species such as *Goniastrea retiformis, G. minuta* and *G. pectinata* (*Huang et al., 2006*; *Ng, Chen & Chou, 2012*) which we have found to host *Durusdinium* (Fig. 2). Furthermore, this endosymbiont genus tolerates the warmer periods during the May-June inter-monsoon when the water temperature is in excess of 30 °C (*Sin et al., 2016*; see *Berkelmans, 2002*). In more seasonal localities, the summer may bring about the increased dominance of *Durusdinium* in symbiosis among certain taxa such as *Acropora* (*Chen et al., 2005*; *Berkelmans & Van Oppen, 2006*; *Yorifuji et al., 2017*), although the degree of symbiont shuffling is affected by each colony's thermal history (*Hsu et al., 2012*). Here, despite being collected during different time periods throughout the year and over time (Table S1), there are no patterns to suggest discernible seasonality in endosymbiont composition in the merulinids, but further temporal sampling at each study site is needed to uncover any seasonal variations.

## **CONCLUSIONS**

Overall, our results show that Symbiodiniaceae communities are not clustered according to coral host species or genera, and show no discernible patterns based on the host phylogeny. Clearly, intraspecific differences dominate the variation among corals in both endosymbiont community structure and diversity, with no distinct communities hosted by particular coral species or genera. We posit that the complexity related to horizontal endosymbiont acquisition among the broadcast-spawning coral species examined here could contribute to this (*Baird, Guest & Willis, 2009; Hartmann et al., 2017*). Even as heritability of symbionts has been shown to be substantial in some species (*Quigley, Willis & Bay, 2017*), it is not uncommon for a coral host to harbour distinct Symbiodiniaceae communities over its life cycle. For example, juvenile hosts of *Acropora* corals contain a more diverse Symbiodiniaceae community compared to their adult stage

(*Cumbo, Baird & Van Oppen, 2013; Suzuki et al., 2013; Yamashita et al., 2013*). Subsequent dispersal to areas with differing backgrounds of Symbiodiniaceae diversity (*Nitschke, Davy & Ward, 2016*) may further enhance this complexity as uptake of environmental Symbiodiniaceae or community changes induced under the new conditions could drive shifts in endosymbiotic composition (*Quigley, Willis & Bay, 2017*). To a limited extent, coral colonies examined here do show consistent patterning of Symbiodiniaceae communities based on their areas of origin. More extensive collections of corals from various regions and environments will help us better understand the specificity of the coral-endosymbiont relationship.

Large-scale spatial structuring of endosymbionts has been hypothesised during the earliest stages of such research (*Baker & Rowan, 1997; Rowan, 1998*) and also demonstrated in studies across a diverse range of invertebrates (*LaJeunesse et al., 2004; Gong et al., 2018*). Today, even with the application of new sequencing technologies that confer higher sensitivity for detecting Symbiodiniaceae types, the resolution of spatial patterns remains rough due to sparse sampling. Certainly, a concerted sampling effort at more reef localities will help verify our findings and provide new insights into the distribution and biogeography of this vital symbiosis.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Computational work was partially performed with resources from the National Supercomputing Centre, Singapore (https://www.nscc.sg).

## **ADDITIONAL INFORMATION AND DECLARATIONS**

#### Funding

This work was supported by the National Research Foundation, Prime Minister's Office, Singapore under its Marine Science R&D Programme (MSRDP-P03). The funders had no role in study design, data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript.

#### **Grant Disclosures**

The following grant information was disclosed by the authors: National Research Foundation, Prime Minister's Office: MSRDP-P03.

#### **Competing Interests**

The authors declare there are no competing interests.

## **Author Contributions**

- Sébastien Leveque performed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper, approved the final draft.
- Lutfi Afiq-Rosli, Yin Cheong Aden Ip and Sudhanshi S. Jain contributed reagents/materials/analysis tools, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper, approved the final draft.

• Danwei Huang conceived and designed the experiments, contributed reagents/materials/analysis tools, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper, approved the final draft.

#### **Field Study Permissions**

The following information was supplied relating to field study approvals (i.e., approving body and any reference numbers):

Field collections were approved by the National Parks Board Singapore (NP/RP16-156), Fiji Ministry of Education (21/10/10), Seychelles Bureau of Standards (A0347), and Great Barrier Reef Marine Park Authority (G09/29715.1).

#### **DNA Deposition**

The following information was supplied regarding the deposition of DNA sequences: All sequences are available at NCBI: BioProject ID PRJNA549817.

#### **Data Availability**

The following information was supplied regarding data availability:

The datasets are available at Zenodo: Leveque, Sébastien, Afiq-Rosli, Lutfi, Ip, Yin Cheong Aden, Jain, Sudhanshi S., & Huang, Danwei. (2019). Searching for phylogenetic patterns of Symbiodiniaceae community structure among Indo-Pacific Merulinidae corals [Data set]. PeerJ. Zenodo. http://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3344613

#### **Supplemental Information**

Supplemental information for this article can be found online at http://dx.doi.org/10.7717/ peerj.7669#supplemental-information.

## REFERENCES

- Afiq-Rosli L, Huang D, Toh TC, Taira D, Ng CSL, Song T, Chou LM. 2019. Maximising genetic diversity during coral transplantation from a highly impacted source reef. *Conservation Genetics* 20:629–637 DOI 10.1007/s10592-019-01164-6.
- Altschul SF, Gish W, Miller W, Myers EW, Lipman DJ. 1990. Basic local alignment search tool. *Journal of Molecular Biology* 215:403–410 DOI 10.1016/S0022-2836(05)80360-2.
- Arif C, Daniels C, Bayer T, Banguera-Hinestroza E, Barbrook A, Howe CJ, LaJeunesse TC, Voolstra CR. 2014. Assessing *Symbiodinium* diversity in scleractinian corals via next-generation sequencing-based genotyping of the ITS2 rDNA region. *Molecular Ecology* 23:4418–4433 DOI 10.1111/mec.12869.
- Arrigoni R, Stefani F, Pichon M, Galli P, Benzoni F. 2012. Molecular phylogeny of the Robust clade (Faviidae, Mussidae, Merulinidae, and Pectiniidae): an Indian Ocean perspective. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution* 65:183–193 DOI 10.1016/j.ympev.2012.06.001.
- **Baird AH, Guest JR, Willis BL. 2009.** Systematic and biogeographical patterns in the reproductive biology of scleractinian corals. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics* **40**:551–571 DOI 10.1146/annurev.ecolsys.110308.120220.

- Baker AC. 2003. Flexibility and specificity in coral-algal symbiosis: diversity, ecology, and biogeography of *Symbiodinium*. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics* 34:661–689 DOI 10.1146/annurev.ecolsys.34.011802.132417.
- **Baker AC, Rowan R. 1997.** Diversity of symbiotic dinoflagellates (zooxanthellae) in scleractinian corals of the Caribbean and eastern Pacific. *Proceedings of the 8th International Coral Reef Symposium* **2**:1301–1306.
- Baker AC, Starger CJ, McClanahan TR, Glynn PW. 2004. Corals' adaptive response to climate change. *Nature* **430**:741–741 DOI 10.1038/430741a.
- Baumann JH, Davies SW, Aichelman HE, Castillo KD. 2018. Coral *Symbiodinium* community composition across the Belize Mesoamerican Barrier Reef System is influenced by host species and thermal variability. *Microbial Ecology* 75:903–915 DOI 10.1007/s00248-017-1096-6.
- Benzoni F, Arrigoni R, Stefani F, Pichon M. 2011. Phylogeny of the coral genus Plesiastrea (Cnidaria, Scleractinia). Contributions to Zoology 80:231–249 DOI 10.1163/18759866-08004002.
- Berkelmans R. 2002. Time-integrated thermal bleaching thresholds of reefs and their variation on the Great Barrier Reef. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 229:73–82 DOI 10.3354/meps229073.
- Berkelmans R, Van Oppen MJH. 2006. The role of zooxanthellae in the thermal tolerance of corals: a nugget of hope for coral reefs in an era of climate change. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 273:2305–2312 DOI 10.1098/rspb.2006.3567.
- Bhattacharya D, Agrawal S, Aranda M, Baumgarten S, Belcaid M, Drake JL, Erwin D, Foret S, Gates RD, Gruber DF, Kamel B, Lesser MP, Levy O, Liew YJ, MacManes M, Mass T, Medina M, Mehr S, Meyer E, Price DC, Putnam HM, Qiu H, Shinzato C, Shoguchi E, Stokes AJ, Tambutté S, Tchernov D, Voolstra CR, Wagner N, Walker CW, Weber AP, Weis V, Zelzion E, Zoccola D, Falkowski PG. 2016. Comparative genomics explains the evolutionary success of reef-forming corals. *eLife* 5:e13288 DOI 10.7554/eLife.13288.
- Bongaerts P, Riginos C, Hay KB, Van Oppen MJH, Hoegh-Guldberg O, Dove S.
   2011. Adaptive divergence in a scleractinian coral: physiological adaptation of *Seriatopora hystrix* to shallow and deep reef habitats. *BMC Evolutionary Biology* 11:303 DOI 10.1186/1471-2148-11-303.
- Bongaerts P, Riginos C, Ridgway T, Sampayo EM, Van Oppen MJH, Englebert N,
   Vermeulen F, Hoegh-Guldberg O. 2010. Genetic divergence across habitats in the widespread coral *Seriatopora hystrix* and its associated *Symbiodinium*. *PLOS ONE* 5:e10871 DOI 10.1371/journal.pone.0010871.
- Boulotte NM, Dalton SJ, Carroll AG, Harrison PL, Putnam HM, Peplow LM, Van Oppen MJ. 2016. Exploring the *Symbiodinium* rare biosphere provides evidence for symbiont switching in reef-building corals. *ISME Journal* 10:2693–2701 DOI 10.1038/ismej.2016.54.

- Boyer F, Mercier C, Bonin A, Le Bras Y, Taberlet P, Coissac E. 2016. OBITOOLS: a UNIX-inspired software package for DNA metabarcoding. *Molecular Ecology Resources* 16:176–182 DOI 10.1111/1755-0998.12428.
- Brener-Raffalli K, Clerissi C, Vidal-Dupiol J, Adjeroud M, Bonhomme F, Pratlong M, Aurelle D, Mitta G, Toulza E. 2018. Thermal regime and host clade, rather than geography, drive *Symbiodinium* and bacterial assemblages in the scleractinian coral *Pocillopora damicornis* sensu lato. *Microbiome* **6**:Article 39 DOI 10.1186/s40168-018-0423-6.
- **Budd AF, Fukami H, Smith ND, Knowlton N. 2012.** Taxonomic classification of the reef coral family Mussidae (Cnidaria: Anthozoa: Scleractinia). *Zoological Journal of the Linnean Society* **166**:465–529 DOI 10.1111/j.1096-3642.2012.00855.x.
- **Budd AF, Romano SL, Smith ND, Barbeitos MS. 2010.** Rethinking the phylogeny of scleractinian corals: a review of morphological and molecular data. *Integrative and Comparative Biology* **50**:411–427 DOI 10.1093/icb/icq062.
- **Budd AF, Stolarski J. 2011.** Corallite wall and septal microstructure in scleractinian reef corals: comparison of molecular clades within the family Faviidae. *Journal of Morphology* **272**:66–88 DOI 10.1002/jmor.10899.
- **Burnett WJ. 2002.** Longitudinal variation in algal symbionts (zooxanthellae) from the Indian Ocean zoanthid *Palythoa caesia*. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* **234**:105–109 DOI 10.3354/meps234105.
- **Cairns SD. 2001.** A generic revision and phylogenetic analysis of the Dendrophylliidae (Cnidaria: Scleractinia). *Smithsonian Contributions to Zoology* **615**:1–75.
- Cantin NE, Van Oppen MJH, Willis BL, Mieog JC, Negri AP. 2009. Juvenile corals can acquire more carbon from high-performance algal symbionts. *Coral Reefs* 28:405–414 DOI 10.1007/s00338-009-0478-8.
- **Chen CA, Lam KKY, Nakano Y, Tsai W-S. 2003.** A stable association of the stresstolerant zooxanthellae, *Symbiodinium* clade D, with the low-temperature-tolerant coral, Oulastrea crispata (Scleractinia: Faviidae) in subtropical non-reefal coral communities. *Zoological Studies* **42**:540–550.
- **Chen CA, Wang J-T, Fang L-S, Yang Y-W. 2005.** Fluctuating algal symbiont communities in Acropora palifera (Scleractinia: Acroporidae) from Taiwan. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* **295**:113–121 DOI 10.3354/meps295113.
- Clarke KR, Warwick RM. 1998. A taxonomic distinctness index and its statistical properties. *Journal of Applied Ecology* 35:523–531 DOI 10.1046/j.1365-2664.1998.3540523.x.
- **Coleman AW, Suarez A, Goff LJ. 1994.** Molecular delineation of species and syngens in volvocacean green algae (Chlorophyta). *Journal of Phycology* **30**:80–90 DOI 10.1111/j.0022-3646.1994.00080.x.
- Colgan DJ, McLauchlan A, Wilson GDF, Livingston SP, Edgecombe GD, Macaranas J, Cassis G, Gray MR. 1998. Histone H3 and U2 snRNA DNA sequences and arthropod molecular evolution. *Australian Journal of Zoology* **46**:419–437 DOI 10.1071/ZO98048.
- Cooper TF, Berkelmans R, Ulstrup KE, Weeks S, Radford B, Jones AM, Doyle J, Canto M, O'Leary RA, Van Oppen MJ. 2011. Environmental factors controlling the

distribution of *Symbiodinium* harboured by the coral Acropora millepora on the Great Barrier Reef. *PLOS ONE* **6**:e25536 DOI 10.1371/journal.pone.0025536.

- **Cumbo VR, Baird AH, Van Oppen MJH. 2013.** The promiscuous larvae: flexibility in the establishment of symbiosis in corals. *Coral Reefs* **32**:111–120 DOI 10.1007/s00338-012-0951-7.
- Cunning R, Gates RD, Edmunds PJ. 2017. Using high-throughput sequencing of ITS2 to describe *Symbiodinium* metacommunities in St. John, US Virgin Islands. *PeerJ* 5:e3472 DOI 10.7717/peerj.3472.
- **Davies SW, Wham DC, Kanke MR, Matz MV. 2019.** Contrasting population genetic structure in *Acropora* coral hosts and their algal symbionts across multiple spatial scales. *BioRxiv* DOI 10.1101/575183.
- **Finney JC, Pettay DT, Sampayo EM, Warner ME, Oxenford HA, LaJeunesse TC. 2010.** The relative significance of host–habitat, depth, and geography on the ecology, endemism, and speciation of coral endosymbionts in the genus *Symbiodinium*. *Microbial Ecology* **60**:250–263 DOI 10.1007/s00248-010-9681-y.
- Fisher R, O'Leary RA, Low-Choy S, Mengersen K, Knowlton N, Brainard RE, Caley MJ. 2015. Species richness on coral reefs and the pursuit of convergent global estimates. *Current Biology* 25:500–505 DOI 10.1016/j.cub.2014.12.022.
- Flot J-F, Blanchot J, Charpy L, Cruaud C, Licuanan WY, Nakano Y, Payri C, Tillier S. 2011. Incongruence between morphotypes and genetically delimited species in the coral genus Stylophora: phenotypic plasticity, morphological convergence, morphological stasis or interspecific hybridization? *BMC Ecology* 11:22 DOI 10.1186/1472-6785-11-22.
- Frank U, Mokady O. 2002. Coral biodiversity and evolution: recent molecular contributions. *Canadian Journal of Zoology* **80**:1723–1734 DOI 10.1139/z02-131.
- **Fukami H. 2008.** Short review: molecular phylogenetic analyses of reef corals. *Galaxea* **10**:47–55.
- Fukami H, Budd AF, Levitan DR, Jara J, Kersanach R, Knowlton N. 2004a. Geographic differences in species boundaries among members of the Montastraea annularis complex based on molecular and morphological markers. *Evolution* 58:324–337 DOI 10.1111/j.0014-3820.2004.tb01648.x.
- **Fukami H, Budd AF, Paulay G, Solé-Cava A, Chen CA, Iwao K, Knowlton N. 2004b.** Conventional taxonomy obscures deep divergence between Pacific and Atlantic corals. *Nature* **427**:832–835 DOI 10.1038/nature02339.
- Fukami H, Chen CA, Budd AF, Collins A, Wallace C, Chuang Y-Y, Chen C, Dai CF, Iwao K, Sheppard C, Knowlton N. 2008. Mitochondrial and nuclear genes suggest that stony corals are monophyletic but most families of stony corals are not (Order Scleractinia, Class Anthozoa, Phylum Cnidaria). PLOS ONE 3:e3222 DOI 10.1371/journal.pone.0003222.
- Gong S, Chai G, Xiao Y, Xu L, Yu K-F, Li J, Liu F, Cheng H, Zhang F, Liao B, Li Z. 2018. Flexible symbiotic associations of *Symbiodinium* with five typical coral species in tropical and subtropical reef regions of the northern South China Sea. *Frontiers in Microbiology* **9**:Article 2485 DOI 10.3389/fmicb.2018.02485.

- **Goulet TL. 2006.** Most corals may not change their symbionts. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* **321**:1–7 DOI 10.3354/meps321001.
- Hartmann AC, Baird AH, Knowlton N, Huang D. 2017. The paradox of environmental symbiont acquisition in obligate mutualisms. *Current Biology* 27:3711–3716 DOI 10.1016/j.cub.2017.10.036.
- Howells EJ, Beltran VH, Larsen NW, Bay LK, Willis BL, Van Oppen MJH. 2012. Coral thermal tolerance shaped by local adaptation of photosymbionts. *Nature Climate Change* 2:116–120 DOI 10.1038/nclimate1330.
- Hsu C-M, Keshavmurthy S, Denis V, Kuo C-Y, Wang J-T, Meng P-J, Chen AC. 2012. Temporal and spatial variations in symbiont communities of catch bowl coral Isopora palifera (Scleractinia: Acroporidae) on reefs in Kenting National Park, Taiwan. *Zoological Studies* **51**:1343–1353.
- Huang D. 2012. Threatened reef corals of the world. *PLOS ONE* 7(3):e34459 DOI 10.1371/journal.pone.0034459.
- Huang D, Benzoni F, Arrigoni R, Baird AH, Berumen ML, Bouwmeester J, Chou LM, Fukami H, Licuanan WY, Lovell ER, Meier R, Todd PA, Budd AF. 2014a. Towards a phylogenetic classification of reef corals: the Indo-Pacific genera Merulina, Goniastrea and Scapophyllia (Scleractinia, Merulinidae). *Zoologica Scripta* **43**:531–548 DOI 10.1111/zsc.12061.
- Huang D, Benzoni F, Fukami H, Knowlton N, Smith ND, Budd AF. 2014b. Taxonomic classification of the reef coral families Merulinidae, Montastraeidae, and Diploastraeidae (Cnidaria: Anthozoa: Scleractinia). *Zoological Journal of the Linnean Society* 171:277–355 DOI 10.1111/zoj.12140.
- Huang D, Chou LM, Todd PA, Ang KH, Boon PY, Cheng L. 2006. Algal and invertebrate diversity of the intertidal zone at Labrador Nature Reserve, Singapore. *Malayan Nature Journal* **59**:93–102.
- Huang D, Licuanan WY, Baird AH, Fukami H. 2011. Cleaning up the Bigmessidae: molecular phylogeny of scleractinian corals from Faviidae, Merulinidae, Pectiniidae and Trachyphylliidae. *BMC Evolutionary Biology* 11:37 DOI 10.1186/1471-2148-11-37.
- Huang D, Meier R, Todd PA, Chou LM. 2008. Slow mitochondrial COI sequence evolution at the base of the metazoan tree and its implications for DNA barcoding. *Journal of Molecular Evolution* 66:167–174 DOI 10.1007/s00239-008-9069-5.
- Huang D, Meier R, Todd PA, Chou LM. 2009. More evidence for pervasive paraphyly in scleractinian corals: systematic study of Southeast Asian Faviidae (Cnidaria; Scleractinia) based on molecular and morphological data. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution* **50**:102–116 DOI 10.1016/j.ympev.2008.10.012.
- Huang D, Roy K. 2013. Anthropogenic extinction threats and future loss of evolutionary history in reef corals. *Ecology and Evolution* 3:1184–1193 DOI 10.1002/ece3.527.
- Huelsenbeck JP, Ronquist F. 2001. MRBAYES: Bayesian inference of phylogenetic trees. *Bioinformatics* 17:754–755 DOI 10.1093/bioinformatics/17.8.754.
- Hume B, D'Angelo C, Burt J, Baker AC, Riegl BM, Wiedenmann J. 2013. Corals from the Persian/Arabian Gulf as models for thermotolerant reef-builders: prevalence of

clade C3 *Symbiodinium*, host fluorescence and *ex situ* temperature tolerance. *Marine Pollution Bulletin* **72**:313–322 DOI 10.1016/j.marpolbul.2012.11.032.

- Hume BCC, Smith EG, Ziegler M, Warrington HJM, Burt JA, LaJeunesse TC, Wiedenmann J, Voolstra CR. 2019. SymPortal: a novel analytical framework and platform for coral algal symbiont next-generation sequencing ITS2 profiling. *Molecular Ecology Resources* 19:1063–1080.
- Innis T, Cunning R, Ritson-Williams R, Wall CB, Gates RD. 2018. Coral color and depth drive symbiosis ecology of *Montipora capitata* in Kane'ohe Bay, O'ahu, Hawai'i. *Coral Reefs* 37:423–430 DOI 10.1007/s00338-018-1667-0.
- Jones AM, Berkelmans R, Van Oppen MJH, Mieog JC, Sinclair W. 2008. A community change in the algal endosymbionts of a scleractinian coral following a natural bleaching event: field evidence of acclimatization. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 275:1359–1365 DOI 10.1098/rspb.2008.0069.
- Kemp DW, Hernandez-Pech X, Iglesias-Prieto R, Fitt WK, Schmidt GW. 2014. Community dynamics and physiology of *Symbiodinium* spp. before, during, and after a coral bleaching event. *Limnology and Oceanography* **59**:788–797 DOI 10.4319/lo.2014.59.3.0788.
- Kerr AM, Baird AH, Hughes TP. 2011. Correlated evolution of sex and reproductive mode in corals (Anthozoa: Scleractinia). *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 278:75–81 DOI 10.1098/rspb.2010.1196.
- Keshavmurthy S, Hsu C-M, Kuo C-Y, Meng P-J, Wang J-T, Chen CA. 2012. Symbiont communities and host genetic structure of the brain coral Platygyra verweyi, at the outlet of a nuclear power plant and adjacent areas. *Molecular Ecology* 21:4393–4407 DOI 10.1111/j.1365-294X.2012.05704.x.
- Keshavmurthy S, Tang K-H, Hsu C-M, Gan C-H, Kuo C-Y, Soong K, Chou HN, Chen CA. 2017. *Symbiodinium* spp. associated with scleractinian corals from Dongsha Atoll (Pratas), Taiwan, in the South China Sea. *PeerJ* 5:e2871 DOI 10.7717/peerj.2871.
- Kitahara MV, Cairns SD, Stolarski J, Blair D, Miller DJ. 2010. A comprehensive phylogenetic analysis of the Scleractinia (Cnidaria, Anthozoa) based on mitochondrial CO1 sequence data. *PLOS ONE* 5:e11490 DOI 10.1371/journal.pone.0011490.
- **Kitahara MV, Fukami H, Benzoni F, Huang D. 2016.** The new systematics of Scleractinia: integrating molecular and morphological evidence. In: Goffredo S, Dubinsky Z, eds. *The cnidaria, past, present and future*. Cham: Springer International Publishing, 41–59.
- **LaJeunesse TC. 2001.** Investigating the biodiversity, ecology, and phylogeny of endosymbiotic dinoflagellates in the genus *Symbiodinium* using the ITS region: in search of a species level marker. *Journal of Phycology* **37**:866–880 DOI 10.1046/j.1529-8817.2001.01031.x.
- LaJeunesse TC. 2002. Diversity and community structure of symbiotic dinoflagellates from Caribbean coral reefs. *Marine Biology* 141:387–400 DOI 10.1007/s00227-002-0829-2.

- LaJeunesse TC. 2005. Species radiations of symbiotic dinoflagellates in the Atlantic and Indo-Pacific since the Miocene-Pliocene transition. *Molecular Biology and Evolution* 22:570–581 DOI 10.1093/molbev/msi042.
- LaJeunesse TC, Bhagooli R, Hidaka M, DeVantier L, Done T, Schmidt GW, Fitt WK, Hoegh-Guldberg O. 2004. Closely related *Symbiodinium* spp. differ in relative dominance in coral reef host communities across environmental, latitudinal and biogeographic gradients. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 284:147–161 DOI 10.3354/meps284147.
- LaJeunesse TC, Loh WKW, Van Woesik R, Hoegh-Guldberg O, Schmidt GW, Fitt WK. 2003. Low symbiont diversity in southern Great Barrier Reef corals, relative to those of the Caribbean. *Limnology and Oceanography* **48**:2046–2054 DOI 10.4319/lo.2003.48.5.2046.
- LaJeunesse TC, Parkinson JE, Gabrielson PW, Jeong HJ, Reimer JD, Voolstra CR, Santos SR. 2018. Systematic revision of Symbiodiniaceae highlights the antiquity and diversity of coral endosymbionts. *Current Biology* 28:2570–2580 DOI 10.1016/j.cub.2018.07.008.
- LaJeunesse TC, Pettay DT, Sampayo EM, Phongsuwan N, Brown B, Obura DO, Hoegh-Guldberg O, Fitt WK. 2010a. Long-standing environmental conditions, geographic isolation and host-symbiont specificity influence the relative ecological dominance and genetic diversification of coral endosymbionts in the genus *Symbiodinium*. *Journal of Biogeography* 37:785–800 DOI 10.1111/j.1365-2699.2010.02273.x.
- LaJeunesse TC, Smith RT, Finney J, Oxenford H. 2009. Outbreak and persistence of opportunistic symbiotic dinoflagellates during the 2005 Caribbean mass coral bleaching event. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 276:4139–4148 DOI 10.1098/rspb.2009.1405.
- LaJeunesse TC, Smith R, Walther M, Pinzon J, Pettay DT, McGinley MP, Aschaffenburg M, Medina-Rosas P, Cupul-Magana AL, Pérez AL, Reyes-Bonilla H, Warner ME. 2010b. Host-symbiont recombination versus natural selection in the response of coral-dinoflagellate symbioses to environmental disturbance. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 277:2925–2934 DOI 10.1098/rspb.2010.0385.
- **LaJeunesse TC, Thornhill DJ. 2011.** Improved resolution of reef-coral endosymbiont (*Symbiodinium*) species diversity, ecology, and evolution through psbA non-coding region genotyping. *PLOS ONE* **6(12)**:e29013 DOI 10.1371/journal.pone.0029013.
- LaJeunesse TC, Trench RK. 2000. Biogeography of two species of *Symbiodinium* (Freudenthal) inhabiting the intertidal sea anemone Anthopleura elegantissima (Brandt). *Biological Bulletin* 199:126–134 DOI 10.2307/1542872.
- LaJeunesse TC, Wham DC, Pettay DT, Parkinson JE, Keshavmurthy S, Chen CA. 2014. Ecologically differentiated stress-tolerant endosymbionts in the dinoflagellate genus *Symbiodinium* (Dinophyceae) Clade D are different species. *Phycologia* 53:305–319 DOI 10.2216/13-186.1.
- Lien Y-T, Keshavmurthy S, Nakano Y, Plathong S, Huang H, Hsu C-M, Fukami H, Yamashita Y, Hsieh HJ, Wang J-T, Chen CA. 2013. Host genetics and *Symbiodinium*

D diversity in a stress-tolerant scleractinian coral, Oulastrea crispata, in the West Pacific. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* **473**:163–177 DOI 10.3354/meps10041.

- Lien Y-T, Nakano Y, Plathong S, Fukami H, Wang J-T, Chen CA. 2007. Occurrence of the putatively heat-tolerant *Symbiodinium* phylotype D in high-latitudinal outlying coral communities. *Coral Reefs* 26:35–44 DOI 10.1007/s00338-006-0185-7.
- Lim SSQ, Huang D, Soong K, Neo ML. 2019. Diversity of endosymbiotic Symbiodiniaceae in giant clams at Dongsha Atoll, northern South China Sea. *Symbiosis* 78:251–262 DOI 10.1007/s13199-019-00615-5.
- Little AF, Van Oppen MJH, Willis BL. 2004. Flexibility in algal endosymbioses shapes growth in reef corals. *Science* 304:1492–1494 DOI 10.1126/science.1095733.
- Loh W, Carter D, Hoegh-Guldberg O. 1998. Diversity of zooxanthellae from scleractinian corals of One Tree Island (The Great Barrier Reef). In: *Proceedings of the Australian Coral Reef Society 75th Anniversary Conference, Heron Island, October 1997.* Brisbane: School of Marine Science, The University of Queensland, 87–95.
- Madin JS, Anderson KD, Andreasen MH, Bridge TCL, Cairns SD, Connolly SR, Darling ES, Diaz M, Falster DS, Franklin EC, Gates RD, Harmer A, Hoogenboom MO, Huang D, Keith SA, Kosnik MA, Kuo CY, Lough JM, Lovelock CE, Luiz O, Martinelli J, Mizerek T, Pandolfi JM, Pochon X, Pratchett MS, Putnam HM, Roberts TE, Stat M, Wallace CC, Widman E, Baird AH. 2016a. The Coral Trait Database, a curated database of trait information for coral species from the global oceans. *Scientific Data* 3:160017 DOI 10.1038/sdata.2016.17.
- Madin JS, Hoogenboom MO, Connolly SR, Darling ES, Falster DS, Huang D, Keith SA, Mizerek T, Pandolfi JM, Putnam HM, Baird AH. 2016b. A trait-based approach to advance coral reef science. *Trends in Ecology & Evolution* 31:419–428 DOI 10.1016/j.tree.2016.02.012.
- Muscatine L, Cernichiari E. 1969. Assimilation of photosynthetic products of zooxanthellae by a reef coral. *Biological Bulletin* 137:506–523 DOI 10.2307/1540172.
- Muscatine L, Porter JW. 1977. Reef corals: mutualistic symbioses adapted to nutrient-poor environments. *BioScience* 27:454–460 DOI 10.2307/1297526.
- Ng CSL, Chen D, Chou LM. 2012. Hard coral assemblages on seawalls in Singapore. In: Tan KS, ed. *Contributions to marine science*. Singapore: National University of Singapore, 75–79.
- Nitschke MR, Davy SK, Ward S. 2016. Horizontal transmission of *Symbiodinium* cells between adult and juvenile corals is aided by benthic sediment. *Coral Reefs* 35:335–344 DOI 10.1007/s00338-015-1349-0.
- Oksanen J, Blanchet FG, Kindt R, Legendre P, Minchin PR, O'Hara RB, Simpson GL, Solymos P, Stevens MHH, Wagner H. 2013. vegan: Community Ecology Package. R Package Version 2.0-8.
- **Quek ZBR, Huang D. 2019.** Effects of missing data and data type on phylotranscriptomic analysis of stony corals (Cnidaria: Anthozoa: Scleractinia). *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution* **134**:12–23 DOI 10.1016/j.ympev.2019.01.012.
- **Quigley KM, Davies SW, Kenkel CD, Willis BL, Matz MV, Bay LK. 2014.** Deepsequencing method for quantifying background abundances of *Symbiodinium* types:

exploring the rare *Symbiodinium* biosphere in reef-building corals. *PLOS ONE* **9**:e94297 DOI 10.1371/journal.pone.0094297.

- **Quigley KM, Willis BL, Bay LK. 2017.** Heritability of the *Symbiodinium* community in vertically- and horizontally-transmitting broadcast spawning corals. *Scientific Reports* 7:8219 DOI 10.1038/s41598-017-08179-4.
- **R Core Team. 2013.** R: a language and environment for statistical computing. Vienna: R Foundation for Statistical Computing. *Available at https://www.r-project.org*.
- **Reaka-Kudla ML. 1997.** The global biodiversity of coral reefs: a comparison with rain forests. In: Reaka-Kudla ML, Wilson DE, Wilson EO, eds. *Biodiversity II: understanding and protecting our biological resources*. Washington, D.C.: Joseph Henry Press, 83–108.
- Reynolds JM, Bruns BU, Fitt WK, Schmidt GW. 2008. Enhanced photoprotection pathways in symbiotic dinoflagellates of shallow-water corals and other cnidarians. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 105:13674–13678 DOI 10.1073/pnas.0805187105.
- Rodriguez-Lanetty M, Loh W, Carter D, Hoegh-Guldberg O. 2001. Latitudinal variability in symbiont specificity within the widespread scleractinian coral *Plesiastrea versipora*. *Marine Biology* **138**:1175–1181 DOI 10.1007/s002270100536.
- Ronquist F, Huelsenbeck JP. 2003. MrBayes 3: Bayesian phylogenetic inference under mixed models. *Bioinformatics* 19:1572–1574 DOI 10.1093/bioinformatics/btg180.
- Ronquist F, Teslenko M, Van der Mark P, Ayres DL, Darling A, Höhna S, Larget B, Liu L, Suchard MA, Huelsenbeck JP. 2012. MrBayes 3.2: efficient Bayesian phylogenetic inference and model choice across a large model space. *Systematic Biology* 61:539–542 DOI 10.1093/sysbio/sys029.
- Rowan R. 1998. Diversity and ecology of zooxanthellae on coral reefs. *Journal of Phycology* 34:407–417 DOI 10.1046/j.1529-8817.1998.340407.x.
- Rowan R. 2004. Thermal adaptation in reef coral symbionts. *Nature* 430:Article 742 DOI 10.1038/430742a.
- Rowan R, Knowlton N. 1995. Intraspecific diversity and ecological zonation in coralalgal symbiosis. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 92:2850–2853 DOI 10.1073/pnas.92.7.2850.
- Rowan R, Powers DA. 1991a. A molecular genetic classification of zooxanthellae and the evolution of animal-algal symbioses. *Science* 251:1348–1351 DOI 10.1126/science.251.4999.1348.
- Rowan R, Powers DA. 1991b. Molecular genetic identification of symbiotic dinoflagellates (zooxanthellae). *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 71:65–73 DOI 10.3354/meps071065.
- Sampayo EM, Ridgway T, Bongaerts P, Hoegh-Guldberg O. 2008. Bleaching susceptibility and mortality of corals are determined by fine-scale differences in symbiont type. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 105:10444–10449 DOI 10.1073/pnas.0708049105.

- Sargent TD, Jamrich M, Dawid IB. 1986. Cell interactions and the control of gene activity during early development of *Xenopus laevis*. *Developmental Biology* 114:238–246 DOI 10.1016/0012-1606(86)90399-4.
- Savage AM, Goodson MS, Visram S, Trapido-Rosenthal H, Wiedenmann J, Douglas AE. 2002. Molecular diversity of symbiotic algae at the latitudinal margins of their distribution: dinoflagellates of the genus *Symbiodinium* in corals and sea anemones. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 244:17–26 DOI 10.3354/meps244017.
- Sawall Y, Al-Sofyani A, Banguera-Hinestroza E, Voolstra CR. 2014. Spatio-temporal analyses of *Symbiodinium* physiology of the coral *Pocillopora verrucosa* along large-scale nutrient and temperature gradients in the Red Sea. *PLOS ONE* **9(8)**:e103179 DOI 10.1371/journal.pone.0103179.
- Silverstein RN, Cunning R, Baker AC. 2015. Change in algal symbiont communities after bleaching, not prior heat exposure, increases heat tolerance of reef corals. *Global Change Biology* 21:236–249 DOI 10.1111/gcb.12706.
- Sin TM, Ang HP, Buurman J, Lee AC, Leong YL, Ooi SK, Steinberg P, Teo SL-M. 2016. The urban marine environment of Singapore. *Regional Studies in Marine Science* 8:331–339 DOI 10.1016/j.rsma.2016.01.011.
- Smith EG, Ketchum RN, Burt JA. 2017a. Host specificity of *Symbiodinium* variants revealed by an ITS2 metahaplotype approach. *ISME Journal* 11:1500–1503 DOI 10.1038/ismej.2016.206.
- Smith EG, Vaughan GO, Ketchum RN, McParland D, Burt JA. 2017b. Symbiont community stability through severe coral bleaching in a thermally extreme lagoon. *Scientific Reports* 7:2428 DOI 10.1038/s41598-017-01569-8.
- **Stamatakis A. 2006.** RAxML-VI-HPC: Maximum likelihood-based phylogenetic analyses with thousands of taxa and mixed models. *Bioinformatics* **22**:2688–2690 DOI 10.1093/bioinformatics/btl446.
- Stamatakis A, Hoover P, Rougemont J. 2008. A rapid bootstrap algorithm for the RAxML web servers. *Systematic Biology* **57**:758–771 DOI 10.1080/10635150802429642.
- Stat M, Carter DA, Hoegh-Guldberg O. 2006. The evolutionary history of Symbiodinium and scleractinian hosts—Symbiosis, diversity, and the effect of climate change. Perspectives in Plant Ecology, Evolution and Systematics 8:23–43 DOI 10.1016/j.ppees.2006.04.001.
- Suzuki G, Yamashita H, Kai S, Hayashibara T, Suzuki K, Iehisa Y, Okada W, Ando W, Komori T. 2013. Early uptake of specific symbionts enhances the postsettlement survival of Acropora corals. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* **494**:149–158 DOI 10.3354/meps10548.
- **Swofford DL. 2003.** PAUP\*. Phylogenetic analysis using parsimony and other methods. Version 4. Sunderland: Sinauer Associates.
- Sze Y, Miranda LN, Sin TM, Huang D. 2018. Characterising planktonic dinoflagellate diversity in Singapore using DNA metabarcoding. *Metabarcoding Metagenomics* 2:e25136 DOI 10.3897/mbmg.2.25136.

- **Takabayashi M, Carter DA, Loh WKW, Hoegh-Guldberg O. 1998a.** A coral-specific primer for PCR amplification of the internal transcribed spacer region in ribosomal DNA. *Molecular Ecology* **7**:928–930.
- Takabayashi M, Carter DA, Ward S, Hoegh-Guldberg O. 1998b. Inter- and intraspecific variability in ribosomal DNA sequence in the internal transcribed spacer region of corals. In: *Proceedings of the Australian Coral Reef Society 75th Anniversary Conference*. 241–248.
- Tanzil JTI, Ng PKA, Tey YQ, Tan HYB, Yun YE, Huang D. 2016. A preliminary characterisation of *Symbiodinium* diversity in some common corals from Singapore. *COSMOS* 12:15–27 DOI 10.1142/S0219607716500014.
- Thomas L, Kendrick GA, Kennington WJ, Richards ZT, Stat M. 2014. Exploring Symbiodinium diversity and host specificity in Acropora corals from geographical extremes of Western Australia with 454 amplicon pyrosequencing. Molecular Ecology 23:3113–3126 DOI 10.1111/mec.12801.
- Thornhill DJ, Lewis AM, Wham DC, LaJeunesse TC. 2014. Host-specialist lineages dominate the adaptive radiation of reef coral endosymbionts. *Evolution* 68:352–367 DOI 10.1111/evo.12270.
- Thornhill DJ, Xiang Y, Fitt WK, Santos SR. 2009. Reef endemism, host specificity and temporal stability in populations of symbiotic dinoflagellates from two ecologically dominant Caribbean corals. *PLOS ONE* **4**(7):e6262 DOI 10.1371/journal.pone.0006262.
- **Toller WW, Rowan R, Knowlton N. 2001a.** Repopulation of zooxanthellae in the Caribbean corals Montastraea annularis and M. faveolata following experimental and disease-associated bleaching. *Biological Bulletin* **201**:360–373 DOI 10.2307/1543614.
- **Toller WW, Rowan R, Knowlton N. 2001b.** Zooxanthellae of the Montastraea annularis species complex: patterns of distribution of four taxa of *Symbiodinium* on different reefs and across depths. *Biological Bulletin* **201**:348–359 DOI 10.2307/1543613.
- Tonk L, Bongaerts P, Sampayo EM, Hoegh-Guldberg O. 2013. SymbioGBR: a webbased database of *Symbiodinium* associated with cnidarian hosts on the Great Barrier Reef. *BMC Ecology* 13:7 DOI 10.1186/1472-6785-13-7.
- Van Oppen MJH, Palstra FP, Piquet AMT, Miller DJ. 2001. Patterns of coraldinoflagellate associations in Acropora: significance of local availability and physiology of *Symbiodinium* strains and host–symbiont selectivity. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 268:1759–1767 DOI 10.1098/rspb.2001.1733.

Veron JEN. 2000. Corals of the world. Townsville: Australian Institute of Marine Science.

- Warner ME, Fitt WK, Schmidt GW. 1996. The effects of elevated temperature on the photosynthetic efficiency of zooxanthellae in hospite from four different species of reef coral: a novel approach. *Plant, Cell and Environment* 19:291–299 DOI 10.1111/j.1365-3040.1996.tb00251.x.
- Warner ME, Fitt WK, Schmidt GW. 1999. Damage to photosystem II in symbiotic dinoflagellates: a determinant of coral bleaching. *Proceedings of the*

*National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* **96**:8007–8012 DOI 10.1073/pnas.96.14.8007.

- Warwick RM, Clarke KR. 2001. Practical measures of marine biodiversity based on relatedness of species. *Oceanography and Marine Biology* **39**:207–231.
- Weis VM, Reynolds WS, DeBoer MD, Krupp DA. 2001. Host-symbiont specificity during onset of symbiosis between the dinoflagellates *Symbiodinium* spp. and planula larvae of the scleractinian coral Fungia scutaria. *Coral Reefs* 20:301–308 DOI 10.1007/s003380100179.
- Wham DC, Carmichael M, LaJeunesse TC. 2014. Microsatellite loci for Symbiodinium goreaui and other Clade C Symbiodinium. Conservation Genetics Resources 6:127–129 DOI 10.1007/s12686-013-0023-5.
- Wong JCY, Thompson P, Xie JY, Qiu J-W, Baker DM. 2016. Symbiodinium clade C generality among common scleractinian corals in subtropical Hong Kong. *Regional Studies in Marine Science* 8:439–444 DOI 10.1016/j.rsma.2016.02.005.
- Yamashita H, Suzuki G, Hayashibara T, Koike K. 2013. Acropora recruits harbor rare *Symbiodinium* in the environmental pool. *Coral Reefs* 32:355–366 DOI 10.1007/s00338-012-0980-2.
- Yang S-Y, Keshavmurthy S, Obura D, Sheppard CRC, Visram S, Chen CA. 2012. Diversity and distribution of *Symbiodinium* associated with seven common coral species in the Chagos Archipelago, central Indian Ocean. *PLOS ONE* 7(5):e35836 DOI 10.1371/journal.pone.0035836.
- Yellowlees D, Rees TAV, Leggat W. 2008. Metabolic interactions between algal symbionts and invertebrate hosts. *Plant, Cell and Environment* 31:679–694 DOI 10.1111/j.1365-3040.2008.01802.x.
- Yorifuji M, Harii S, Nakamura R, Fudo M. 2017. Shift of symbiont communities in *Acropora tenuis* juveniles under heat stress. *PeerJ* 5:e4055 DOI 10.7717/peerj.4055.
- Zhang J, Kobert K, Flouri T, Stamatakis A. 2014. PEAR: a fast and accurate Illumina Paired-End reAd mergeR. *Bioinformatics* 30:614–620 DOI 10.1093/bioinformatics/btt593.