Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

Metabolism Open



journal homepage: www.sciencedirect.com/journal/metabolism-open

Supplementation with aspalathin and sulforaphane protects cultured cardiac cells against dyslipidemia-associated oxidative damage

Sinenhlanhla X.H. Mthembu ^{a,b,*}, Sithandiwe E. Mazibuko-Mbeje^b, Sonia Silvestri ^{c,h,i}, Patrick Orlando^c, Bongani B. Nkambule^d, Christo J.F. Muller^{a,e,f}, Luca Tiano^c, Phiwayinkosi V. Dludla^{f,g}

^a Biomedical Research and Innovation Platform, South African Medical Research Council, Tygerberg, 7505, South Africa

^b Department of Biochemistry, Mafikeng Campus, Northwest University, Mmabatho, 2735, South Africa

^c Department of Life and Environmental Sciences, Polytechnic University of Marche, Ancona, 60131, Italy

^d School of Laboratory Medicine and Medical Sciences, University of KwaZulu-Natal, Durban, 4000, South Africa

e Centre for Cardiometabolic Research Africa (CARMA), Division of Medical Physiology, Stellenbosch University, Tygerberg, 7505, South Africa

^f Department of Biochemistry and Microbiology, University of Zululand, KwaDlangezwa, 3886, South Africa

^g Cochrane South Africa, South African Medical Research Council, Tygerberg, 7505, South Africa

^h Department of Human Sciences and Promotion of Quality of Life, University of San Raffaele, 00166 Roma, Italy

ⁱ Department of Biomolecular Sciences, University of Urbino Carlo Bo, 61029 Urbino, Italy

ARTICLE INFO

SEVIER

Keywords: Dietary compounds Aspalathin Sulforaphane Cardiac cells Dyslipidemia Mitochondrial function Oxidative stress Simvastatin

ABSTRACT

Dyslipidemia is a prominent pathological feature responsible for oxidative stress-induced cardiac damage. Due to their high antioxidant content, dietary compounds, such as aspalathin and sulforaphane, are increasingly explored for their cardioprotective effects against lipid-induced toxicity. Cultured H9c2 cardiomyoblasts, an in vitro model routinely used to assess the pharmacological effect of drugs, were pretreated with the dietary compounds, aspalathin (1 μ M) and sulforaphane (10 μ M) before exposure to palmitic acid (0.25 mM) to induce lipidemic-related complications. The results showed that both aspalathin and sulforaphane enhanced cellular metabolic activity and improved mitochondrial respiration correlating with improved mRNA expression of genes involved in mitochondrial function, including uncoupling protein 2, peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor, gamma coactivator 1-alpha, nuclear respiratory factor 1, and ubiquinol-cytochrome c reductase complex assembly factor 1. Beyond attenuating lipid peroxidation, the dietary compounds also suppressed intracellular reactive oxygen species and enhanced antioxidant responses, including the mRNA expression of nuclear factor erythroid 2-related factor 2. These envisaged benefits were associated with decreased cellular apoptosis. This preclinical study supports and warrants further investigation into the potential benefits of these dietary compounds or foods rich in aspalathin or sulforaphane in protecting against lipid-induced oxidative damage within the myocardium.

1. Introduction

Cardiovascular diseases (CVDs) are the leading cause of death globally [1]. This explains the growing interest in understanding the risk factors associated with the development of CVDs [2]. It's hypothesized that dyslipidemia, a pathophysiological condition that is associated with ectopic lipid accumulation may lead to the damage of various internal organs including the myocardium [3–5]. Indeed, available evidence suggests that dyslipidemia, specifically enhanced hypercholesterolemia, plays a significant role in causing lipid peroxidation, the pathological

feature of oxidative stress that is linked to myocardial dysfunction [2]. Enhanced uptake or dysregulation of lipid products within the myocardium are being studied as prominent mechanisms for oxidative damage, the major characteristic feature of diabetic cardiomyopathy [6–8]. The latter describes undesired myocardial structural modifications that are likely facilitated by oxidative stress-related abnormalities, occurring independent of coronary artery disease and are considered one of the leading causes of CVD-related deaths [9,10]. As a result, beyond scrutinizing the total cholesterol content, determining the oxidative status, including the levels of lipid peroxidation products like

* Corresponding author. Biomedical Research and Innovation Platform, South African Medical Research Council, PO Box 19070, Tygerberg, 7505, South Africa. *E-mail address:* 40624560@mynwu.ac.za (S.X.H. Mthembu).

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.metop.2025.100346

Received 23 August 2024; Received in revised form 19 December 2024; Accepted 3 January 2025 Available online 3 January 2025 2589-9368/© 2025 Published by Elsevier Inc. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/). malondialdehyde (MDA), has been increasingly used to assess the potential CVD risk in conditions of dyslipidemia or impaired metabolic function [11]. Pharmacological interventions with abundant antioxidant properties are emerging as a plausible strategy to attenuate oxidative stress and protect against dyslipidemia-associated cardiac damage [12,13].

Nutritional supplements containing strong antioxidant properties such as rooibos (Aspalathus linearis), including its major bioactive compound aspalathin, are actively screened for their cardioprotective effects, including attenuating oxidative stress-related complications [14]. Our group has already reviewed documented evidence indicating that the antioxidant properties of aspalathin, a dihydrochalcone C-glucoside of rooibos, can protect against oxidative damage in cultured cardiomyocytes or within the myocardium of diabetic animal models [15,16]. Similarly, another promising dietary compound is sulforaphane, an isothiocyanate rich in cruciferous vegetables of the genus Brassica like broccoli, which has also shown enhanced potential to protect against oxidative damage in preclinical models of diabetes [11, 17]. The antioxidant properties of aspalathin and sulforaphane have been linked with enhanced activation of nuclear factor erythroid 2-related factor 2 (Nrf2), which is proposed to be an important mechanism to promote cytoprotective responses against oxidative stress-induced damage within the myocardium [17,18]. Although such evidence is acknowledged, there is a need to further investigate the broader context implicating the cardioprotective effects of both aspalathin and sulforaphane against lipid-associated damage. In this study, we hypothesize that aspalathin and sulforaphane exert cardioprotective effects by enhancing mitochondrial health, through improved mitochondrial respiratory efficiency, reduced reactive oxygen species (ROS) production, and decreased lipid peroxidation. Additionally, we anticipate that these compounds will positively influence lipid homeostasis and mitigate cellular injury.

2. Reagents and methods

2.1. Reagents

The rat heart ventricular-derived H9c2 cardiomyoblasts were purchased from the American Type Culture Collection (Manassas, VA, USA; catalogue number: CRL-1446). Dulbecco's modified Eagle's medium (DMEM), (BE12-604F), Dulbecco's phosphate-buffered saline (DPBS, pH 7.4 with calcium and magnesium), (BE17-512F), and trypsin (CC-5012) were from Lonza BioWhittaker (Walkersville, MD, USA). Free fatty acid bovine serum albumin (BSA), (03117057001) was from Roche (Mannheim, Germany). The cell culture plates (3997) were from Corning (NY, USA); the Bradford kit (#5000201) was from Bio-Rad Laboratories (Hercules, CA, USA). Seahorse XF-96 microplate plates (103022-100), Seahorse XF assay media (103680-100), and Seahorse XF-cell Mito stress kit (103015-100) were all from Agilent (Santa Clara, CA, USA). QIAzol lysis reagent (79306) was from Qiagen (Hilden, Germany). Aspalathin (ca. 98 %, Batch SZI-356-54), synthesized following an already described method [19], was supplied by High Force Research LTD (Durham, UK). Gene expression probes, glyceraldehyde-3-phosphate dehydrogenase (Gapdh), NADH: ubiquinone oxidoreductase core subunit s 3 (Ndufs3), nuclear factor erythroid 2-related factor 2 (Nrf2), nuclear respiratory factor 1 (Nrf1), peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor, gamma coactivator 1-alpha ($Pprgc1\alpha$), superoxide dismutase 2 (Sod2), ubiquinol-cytochrome c reductase complex assembly factor 1 (Uqcc1), and uncoupling protein 2 (Ucp2) as well as Fetal bovine serum (FBS) (10493106) were purchased from Thermo Fisher Scientific (Waltham, MA, USA), (Table). Whereas simvastatin (S6196) \geq 97 % high-performance liquid chromatography (HPLC), sulforaphane (S6317) ≥95 % (HPLC), dimethyl sulfoxide (DMSO), (D8418), palmitic acid (cell culture grade), (P5585), cell culture tested water (W3500). All other chemicals were purchased from Sigma-Aldrich (St. Louis, MO, USA).

2.2. Palmitic acid experimental model and preparation of treatment compounds, aspalathin and sulforaphane

Briefly, 204 mg of palmitic acid was dissolved in 2 ml absolute ethanol and heated in boiling water for 5 min to make a stock concentration of 400 mM. To prepare for the working solution, the appropriate volume of 400 mM palmitic acid was conjugated in 1 % BSA for 1 h in a sonicator bath. Stock solutions of aspalathin and sulforaphane were prepared by dissolving the compounds in 100 % DMSO to make stock solutions of 22.10 mM aspalathin and 28.20 mM sulforaphane, respectively. The final working solutions of these compounds were prepared by diluting the appropriate amounts of a stock solution with DMEM (supplemented with 8 mM glucose, 3.7 g/L NaHCO₃, and 0.1 % (w/v), 1 % BSA to yield a final working solution of DMSO <0.001 % DMSO, as previously described [20].

2.3. Cell culture conditions for H9c2 cardiomyoblasts

The H9c2 cardiomyoblasts are routinely used as a screening tool for novel therapeutic agents against cardiotoxicity [21]. Here, H9c2 cardiomyoblasts were cultured in DMEM supplemented with 10 % FBS at standard tissue culture conditions (37 °C, in humidified air and 5 % CO₂). Cells were regularly sub-cultured at a confluency of 80–90 % and seeded in 96-well or 6-well plates at a density of 5 x10⁴ cells/ml for all the assays performed.

2.4. Determination of cellular metabolic activity using ATP production

To assess the potential toxicity of aspalathin, sulforaphane, and simvastatin on H9c2 cardiomyoblasts, a dose-response study was conducted. The concentrations tested were selected based on previous research: 1 and 10 µM for aspalathin (Dludla, Muller et al., 2017), 2.5 and 10 μ M for sulforaphane [22], and 2.5 μ M for simvastatin [23] which served as the experimental-comparative control. Additionally, a palmitic acid concentration of 0.25 mM was derived from our previous study study [3]. Subsequently, cellular metabolic activity was assessed. Briefly, cells were pretreated with aspalathin and sulforaphane, together with simvastatin as a comparator, for 24 h before exposure to 0.25 mM palmitic acid (together with treatment compounds) for an additional 24 h. Subsequently, cytoplasmic adenosine triphosphate (ATP), as a measure of cellular metabolic activity, was quantified using a CellTiter-Glo® Luminescent Cell Viability Assay Kit from Promega (MA, USA), as per the manufacturer's instructions. The SpectraMax i3x multi-mode microplate reader (Molecular Devices, CA, USA) was used to measure the luminescence. Protein concentrations quantified using Bradford assay (Bio-Rad Laboratories, Hercule, CA, USA), as per manufacturer instructions, were used for normalization.

2.5. Assessment of mitochondrial respiration status

To assess mitochondrial respiration in H9c2 cardiomyoblasts, oxygen consumption rate (OCR) and extracellular acidification rate (ECAR) were measured using the Mito Stress Kit and XF-96 Extracellular Flux Analyser from Seahorse Bioscience (MA, USA), following a method that has already been described [3]. Measuring oxygen consumption is crucial in this study as this can be used to explore how palmitic acid-induced metabolic shifts affect mitochondrial function and energy production in cardiomyoblasts. Briefly, the protocol involves injections of 10 μ M oligomycin in port A (20 μ l) to inhibit ATP synthase, 7.5 μ M carbonyl cyanide 4 trifluoromethoxy-phenylhydrazone (FCCP) in port B (22 μ l) for maximal respiration, as well as 5 μ M of rotenone (complex I inhibitor) combined with antimycin A (complex III inhibitor) in port C (25 μ l). After the assay protein concentrations were quantified using the Bradford for normalization, as previously explained [3].

2.6. mRNA expression analysis

To quantify the gene expression, RNA was extracted using QIAzol lysis reagent, cleaned, and reverse transcribed into complementary DNA (cDNA) using a High-Capacity cDNA Reverse Transcription kit from Applied Biosystems (Thermo ScientificTM, MA, USA). cDNA synthesis was carried out using Applied Biosystems® 2720 Thermal Cycler with the following conditions: 10 min at 25 °C, 120 min at 37 °C, 5 s at 85 °C and 4 °C for cooling the samples. The TaqMan gene expression probes used are included in Table 1 and gene expression was analyzed using a QuantStudioTM 7 Flex Real-Time PCR System (Thermo Scientific TM, MA, USA). The quantitative RT-PCR conditions were as follows: 95 °C for 10 min, followed by 40 cycles of 95 °C for 15 s and 60 °C for 1 min. Gene expression data was normalized to Glyceraldehyde-3-phosphate dehydrogenase (*Gapdh*).

2.7. Evaluation of mitochondrial mass and changes in mitochondrial membrane potential ($\Delta \psi m$)

The fluorescent dyes, MitoTracker Green (Thermo Fisher Scientific, MA, USA) and JC-10 (5,5',6,6'-tetrachloro-1,1',3,3-tetraethylbenzimidazolyl-carbocyanine iodide; Sigma-Aldrich, St Louis, MO, USA) were used to measure mitochondrial mass and determine changes in mitochondrial membrane potential, respectively. Both assays were performed using methods that have already been described [3]. Mitochondrial mass was measured using a BD Accuri® C6 flow cytometer (Becton Dickinson, NJ, USA). For the changes in mitochondrial membrane potential, the fluorescence intensity of JC-10 aggregates, orange fluorescence at ~590 nm (excited by 540 nm), and JC-10 monomers, green fluorescence at ~525 nm (excited by 490 nm) was measured using the SpectraMax i3x multi-mode microplate reader.

2.8. Measuring total cholesterol content and lipid peroxidation

Total cholesterol content was quantified using the Cholesterol/ Cholesteryl Ester Assay Kit from Abcam (Cambridge, UK). Lipid peroxidation was assessed by measuring the MDA levels, using an OxiSelect[™] Thiobarbituric Acid Reactive Substances (TBARS) Assay Kit from Cell Biolabs (San Diego, USA). Both assays were performed using the manufacturer's protocol, and the relevant fluorescence was read on a SpectraMax i3x multi-mode microplate reader (Molecular Devices, CA, USA).

2.9. Evaluation of cytosolic and mitochondrial reactive oxygen species production (ROS)

Cytosolic and mitochondrial ROS production were detected using an OxiSelect Intracellular ROS Assay Kit from Cell Biolab (San Diego, CA, USA), and MitoSOX (mitochondrial superoxide indicators) Red kit (Thermo Fisher Scientific, MA, USA), respectively. Briefly, cytosolic and mitochondrial ROS were measured using fluorescent dyes, 2', 7'dichlorodihydrofluorescin diacetate (DCFH-DA) and MitoSox red,

Table 1

The list of TaqMan probes used in the study.

| Probe | Gene | Assay ID |
|---|---------|---------------|
| Glyceraldehyde-3-phosphate dehydrogenase | Gapdh | Rn01775763_g1 |
| NADH: Ubiquinone Oxidoreductase Core Subunit S3 | Ndufs3 | Rn01484390_m1 |
| Nuclear factor erythroid 2-related factor 2 | Nrf2 | Rn00582415_m1 |
| Nuclear respiratory factor 1 | Nrf1 | Rn01455958_m1 |
| Peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor Gamma coactivator 1-alpha | Pprgc1a | Rn00580241_m1 |
| Superoxide dismutase 2 | Sod2 | Rn00690588_g1 |
| Ubiquinol-Cytochrome C Reductase Complex Assembly Factor 1 | Uqcc1 | Rn01535673_m1 |
| Uncoupling protein 2 | Ucp2 | Rn01754856_m1 |

respectively. For both assays, the fluorescence was measured using a BD Accuri® C6 flow cytometer (Becton Dickinson, NJ, USA).

2.10. Evaluation of intracellular antioxidants

The levels of intracellular antioxidants, total glutathione (GSH) content, and superoxide dismutase (SOD) activity were measured using the OxiSelect Total Glutathione Assay Kit from Cell Bio-lab (San Diego, USA), as well as the Superoxide Dismutase Activity Assay Kit from Abcam (Cambridge, UK), respectively. The assays were performed as per the manufacturer's instructions. The relative optical density was measured using a SpectraMax i3x multi-mode microplate reader at 405 nm for total GSH content and 440 nm for SOD activity.

2.11. Evaluation of cellular damage

Cellular apoptosis and necrosis in H9c2 cardiomyoblasts were assessed using Annexin V-FITC from Invitrogen (Carlsbad, CA, USA), and propidium iodide from Sigma-Aldrich (St Louis, MO, USA), respectively. Fluorescence measurements for both annexin V (apoptosis) and propidium iodide (necrosis) were acquired using a BD Accuri C6 flow cytometer following the method previously described [3]. The following channels were used, FITC signal detector FL1 (excitation = 488 nm; emission = 530 nm) for Annexin V positive (apoptotic) cells, and the FL3 detector (excitation = 488 nm; emission = 670/LP) for propidium positive (necrotic) cells.

2.12. Statistical analysis

Data was expressed as the mean \pm standard error of the mean (SEM). Results for all experiments consist of three independent experimental repeats. Specifically, the ATP production assay and the Seahorse (Mito stress) analysis included six technical replicates per experiment (n = 6), while mRNA analysis and flow cytometry assays had three technical replicates each (n = 3). To ensure that repeated measurements were derived from biologically distinct samples, each well in the 96-well or 6well plates was treated as an independent biological sample. To further guarantee the independence of the measurements, cells were seeded on different days and from different passages, across three separate plates. Statistical analysis was performed using GraphPad Prism software version 8.0.1 (GraphPad Software, Inc., La Jolla, CA, USA). To reduce the variability of data, seahorse and PCR mean values were logtransformed (Y = Log *Y). Prior to the statistical analysis both a normality test and an outlier test were performed using GraphPad Prism. After that, comparisons between groups were performed using one-way multivariate ANOVA, followed by a Tukey post-hoc test, this method is specifically designed to control for family-wise error rates across all pairwise comparisons, ensuring that the significance level remains valid despite multiple tests. Where appropriate, the student's t-test (and nonparametric test) was used, with p < 0.05 considered significant for all experiments performed.

3. Results

3.1. Aspalathin and sulforaphane enhanced the ATP production in cardiomyoblasts exposed to palmitic acid

ATP production served as a measure of cellular metabolic function (Fig. 1). After exposing cells to 0.25 mM palmitic acid for 24 h, there was a significant decrease in ATP production compared to the experimental control (p < 0.001). However, pretreatment with both doses of aspalathin and sulforaphane increased ATP production (p < 0.01) compared to the palmitate control (Fig. 1). The comparative control, simvastatin (p < 0.01) similarly demonstrated enhanced ATP production compared to the palmitic acid control (Fig. 1).



Fig. 1. Aspalathin and sulforaphane enhanced the metabolic activity in cardiomyoblasts exposed to palmitic acid. Briefly, H9c2 cardiomyoblasts were pretreated with aspalathin (Asp) and sulforaphane (Sul) followed by cotreatment with palmitic acid (Pal) for an additional 24 h. Simvastatin (Simva) was used as a comparative control. Subsequently, cellular metabolic activity was assessed using an ATP production kit. Results are presented as the mean \pm standard error of the mean (SEM) from three independent experiments, each with at six technical replicates (n = 6), relative to the control (Ctrl). Comparisons between groups were performed using one-way multivariate ANOVA, followed by Tukey's multiple comparisons test. Statistical significance was represented by ***p < 0.001 compared to the experimental control, while ## p < 0.01 and ### p < 0.001 were compared to the palmitic acid control.

3.2. Aspalathin and sulforaphane enhanced mitochondrial respiration and glycolytic energy levels while reducing proton leak (H+) in cardiomyoblasts exposed to palmitic acid

Mitochondrial respiration was assessed by measuring OCR, and ECAR (Fig. 2AB), respectively. Exposure to palmitic acid significantly reduced basal respiration (p < 0.001), maximal respiration (p < 0.001), and non-mitochondrial respiration (p < 0.01), while increasing H+ (proton) leak (p < 0.05) (Fig. 2C–G). Aspalathin and sulforaphane demonstrated significant improvement in both basal (p < 0.01) and maximal respiration (p < 0.05) compared to the palmitic acid control. Remarkably, this improvement surpassed the effect observed with simvastatin, which was used as a comparative control, as depicted in Fig. 2CD. Spare capacity was also not affected by treatment compounds (Fig. 2E), however, elevated H+ (proton) leak was significantly reduced by aspalathin (p < 0.05), sulforaphane (p < 0.001), and simvastatin (p< 0.05) compared to the palmitic acid control (Fig. 2F). Notably, nonmitochondrial respiration was also improved by aspalathin (p < 0.05) and sulforaphane (p < 0.05), comparable to simvastatin relative to the palmitic acid control (Fig. 2G).

3.3. Aspalathin and sulforaphane increased the mRNA expression levels of some markers involved in mitochondrial function in cardiomyoblasts exposed to palmitic acid

We further explored the effects of aspalathin and sulforaphane on the mRNA expression of *Pprgc1a*, *Nrf1*, *Ucp2*, *Ndufs3*, and *Uqcc1* (Fig. 3A–E). Among the analyzed genes, results showed that palmitic acid significantly decreased the mRNA expression of *Pprgc1a* (p < 0.01), *Nrf1* (p < 0.05), and *Uqcc1* (p < 0.001) when compared to the experimental control (Fig. 3A–E). Aspalathin supplementation significantly increased the mRNA expression of *Pprgc1a* (p < 0.05), *nrf1* (

0.05), and *Uqcc1* (p < 0.05) (Fig. 3A–E). Simvastatin supplementation did not have much effect on regulating most genes, except for increasing the mRNA expression of *Ucp2* (p < 0.05) in comparison to the palmitic acid control (Fig. 3A–E).

3.4. Aspalathin and sulforaphane increased mitochondrial mass and improved mitochondrial membrane potential in cardiomyoblasts exposed to palmitic acid

Exposure to palmitic acid led to a significant decrease in mitochondrial mass (p < 0.001), accompanied by observable alterations in the morphology and structure of H9c2 cardiomyoblasts, as indicated by green fluorescence in the accompanying representative images (Fig. 4A). However, both aspalathin (p < 0.001) and sulforaphane (p < 0.001) 0.001), along with the comparative control-simvastatin (p < 0.001) improved mitochondrial mass and improved cellular morphology/ structure (as highlighted in accompanying images) compared to the palmitic acid control (Fig. 4A). Exposure to palmitic acid also induced undesirable changes in mitochondrial membrane potential (p < 0.001), as evidenced by increased intensity of green fluorescence intensity (highlighting JC-10 monomers) (Fig. 4B). Notably, treatment with both aspalathin (p < 0.05) and sulforaphane (p < 0.05) resulted in improved mitochondrial membrane potential, even more significantly compared to simvastatin (which did not show any significance) (Fig. 4B). Representative images further demonstrate improved mitochondrial membrane integrity, showing the increased intensity of orange fluorescence (highlighting JC-10 aggregates and orange color within accompanying images) (Fig. 4B).

3.5. Aspalathin and sulforaphane reduce cytosolic and mitochondrial production of reactive oxygen species (ROS) in cardiomyoblasts exposed to palmitic acid

Exposure to palmitic acid resulted in a significant increase in both cytosolic (p < 0.001) and mitochondrial ROS levels, respectively (Fig. 5AB). This effect was similar to the intracellular ROS control, H₂O₂, which significantly elevated cytosolic and mitochondrial ROS production (p < 0.001). Notably, treatment with aspalathin (p < 0.001) and sulforaphane (p < 0.001) effectively mitigated this effect by reducing cytosolic ROS production compared to the palmitic acid control (Fig. 5A). Both aspalathin (p < 0.01) and sulforaphane (p < 0.001) demonstrated comparable effects to simvastatin (p < 0.01) in reducing mitochondrial ROS production relevance to the palmitic acid control (Fig. 5B).

3.6. Aspalathin and sulforaphane did not affect cholesterol levels but protected against lipid peroxidation in cardiomyoblasts exposed to palmitic acid

We evaluated the impact of both aspalathin and sulforaphane on cholesterol levels (Fig. 6A) and lipid peroxidation (Fig. 6B). Exposure to palmitic acid caused an increase in total cholesterol content (p < 0.001) (Fig. 6A). However, only treatment with simvastatin, a known lipid-lowering agent, effectively reduced cholesterol content (p < 0.001) compared to the palmitic acid control (Fig. 6A). As expected, palmitic acid caused an elevation in MDA levels (p < 0.05), indicating enhanced lipid peroxidation compared to the experimental control (Fig. 6B). Treatment with aspalathin (p < 0.001) and sulforaphane (p < 0.01) demonstrated comparable efficacy in reducing MDA levels (p < 0.001) (Fig. 6B).

3.7. Aspalathin and sulforaphane enhance intracellular antioxidant response in H9c2 cardiomyoblasts exposed to palmitic acid

We further explored the protective effects of aspalathin and sulforaphane against oxidative damage by analyzing the mRNA expression of



Fig. 2. Aspalathin and sulforaphane enhanced mitochondrial respiration and glycolytic energy levels while reducing proton leak (H+) in H9c2 cardiomyoblasts exposed to palmitic acid. Briefly, H9c2 cardiomyoblasts were pretreated with 1 μ M aspalathin (Asp) and 10 μ M sulforaphane (Sul) as well as 2.5 μ M Simvastatin (Simva) which was used as a comparative control. Thereafter, cells were co-treated with 0.25 mM palmitic acid (Pal) for an additional 24 h. Oxygen consumption rate (OCR) and extracellular acidification rate (ECAR) were measured for all treatments (A and B). Parameters assessed included basal respiration (C), maximal respiration (D), spare respiratory capacity (E), proton leak (H+) (F), and non-mitochondrial respiration (G). Results are presented as Log values, representing the mean \pm standard error of the mean (SEM) from three independent experiments, control consist of 6 technical repeats and all the treatment groups consists of 8 technical repeats per experiments. Comparisons between groups were performed using student's *t*-test (and nonparametric test). Statistical significance was represented by *p < 0.05, **p < 0.01, ***p < 0.001 compared to the experimental control; and #p < 0.05, ##p < 0.01, ###p < 0.001 compared to the palmitic acid control.

intracellular antioxidants, specifically *Nrf2* and *Sod2*, together with SOD activity and total GSH content (Fig. 7AB). The mRNA expression of both *Nrf2* and *Sod2* was significantly reduced after exposure to palmitic acid (p < 0.05 and p < 0.001, respectively) (Fig. 7AB). However, the mRNA expression of *Nrf2* and *Sod2* was significantly enhanced by the treatment of aspalathin and sulforaphane (p < 0.01), along with the comparative control, simvastatin (p < 0.05) in comparison to the palmitic acid control (Fig. 7AB). These results were collaborated by assessing the activity of SOD activity and total GSH content, which showed that both aspalathin (p < 0.001 and p < 0.001, respectively) and sulforaphane (p < 0.05 and p < 0.001, respectively) and sulforaphane (p < 0.05 and p < 0.001, respectively) could significantly increase the levels of these antioxidants in comparison to the palmitic acid control (Fig. 7CD). This was similar to the effect of simvastatin on SOD activity (p < 0.001), whereas this comparative control did not affect the GSH content (Fig. 7CD).

3.8. Aspalathin and sulforaphane protect against cellular apoptosis induced by palmitic acid in cardiomyoblasts

In this study, we assessed the protective effects of aspalathin and sulforaphane against palmitate-induced cellular damage, by measuring the apoptotic rate and necrosis using annexin V and propidium iodide, respectively (Fig. 8). Measuring live cells showed that palmitic acid reduced cell viability (p < 0.001); however, both aspalathin (p < 0.05) and sulforaphane (p < 0.01) could reverse this effect (Fig. 8A). Palmitic exposure also significantly increased the rates of early (p < 0.01) and late (p < 0.01) apoptosis, including cell necrosis (p < 0.01) (Fig. 8B–D). Treatment with both aspalathin and sulforaphane decreased early (p < 0.05) and late (p < 0.01) apoptosis (Fig. 8BC). Simvastatin reduced early apoptosis (p < 0.05) but failed to affect the later stage of apoptosis or cell necrosis, while all treatment compounds did not protect against cell



Fig. 3. Aspalathin and sulforaphane increased the mRNA expression of some markers involved in mitochondrial function in cardiomyoblasts exposed to palmitic acid. Briefly, H9c2 cardiomyoblasts were pretreated with 1 μ M aspalathin (Asp) and 10 μ M sulforaphane (Sul) as well as 2.5 μ M Simvastatin (Simva) which was used as a comparative control. Thereafter, cells were co-treated with 0.25 mM palmitic acid (Pal) for an additional 24 h. The mRNA expression levels of peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor gamma coactivator 1-alpha (*Pprgc1a*), nuclear respiratory factor 1 (*Nrf1*), NADH: ubiquinone oxidoreductase core subunit S3 (*Ndufs3*), ubiquinol-cytochrome C reductase complex assembly factor 1 (*Uqcc1*), and uncoupling protein 2 (*Ucp2*) were quantified (**A**, **B**, **C**, **D**, and **E**, respectively). Results are presented as the mean \pm standard error of the mean (SEM) from three independent experiments, each with three technical repeats (n = 3), relative to the experimental control (Ctrl). Comparisons between groups were performed using student's *t*-test (and nonparametric test). Statistical significance was represented by *p < 0.05, **p < 0.01, ***p < 0.001 compared to the experimental control; and [#]p < 0.05 compared to the palmitic acid control.

necrosis (Fig. 8B-D).

4. Discussion

Myocardial-induced lipid overload, as a consequence of dyslipidemia, is considered a prominent pathological feature contributing to increased CVD risk [24]. As such, several experiments have made use of cultured heart cells, including H9c2 cardiomyoblasts, exposed to palmitic acid as an experimental model to study the detrimental effects of lipid overload on myocardial physiology [3,25–27]. In the current study, we evaluated whether the dietary compounds aspalathin and sulforaphane with reputable antioxidant properties can mitigate the detrimental effects associated with palmitic acid-induced cardiac toxicity. To assess cellular responses, an ATP production assay was utilized for its sensitivity, followed by real-time cell viability analysis through flow cytometry. This included the use of a reactive oxygen species (ROS) detection kit and fluorescent staining dyes (Annexin V and propidium iodide) to quantify apoptotic and necrotic cell populations, thereby offering detailed insights into the effects of palmitic acid-induced stress. Our results showed that exposing cardiomyoblasts to elevated levels of palmitic acid was associated with reduced metabolic activity which was measured by ATP production. The potentially toxic effects of palmitic acid could be reflected through reduced ATP production in collaboration with accelerated apoptosis in cultured H9c2 cardiomyoblasts [3]. The myocardium relies on a fine balance of respiratory production, and the availability of ATP levels, necessary for contractile function [28]. The current study showed that palmitic acid exposure interfered with the

efficiency of the mitochondrial respiratory processes as seen with reduced basal and maximal respiration, which could have hindered the oxidative capacity of the cells. Measuring oxygen consumption is a highly informative experimental method that provides valuable insights [29]. It is particularly useful for identifying mitochondrial functionality parameters that could be influenced by pharmacological treatments and for characterizing energy metabolism within a physiological and pathological state [30]. For example, changes in oxygen consumption rates can indicate metabolic shifts, such as a transition from aerobic to anaerobic metabolism, triggered by exposure to palmitic acid [31,32]. This shift may disrupt ATP production and affect the overall cellular energy balance. Additionally, alterations in oxygen consumption can serve as a marker for oxidative stress, as increased proton leak and elevated production of ROS may lead to cellular damage [33,34].

Our results showed that palmitic acid exposure facilitated H+ (proton) leak, indicating an imbalance of membrane proton gradient, together with suppressing the mRNA expression of markers involved in mitochondrial function, including both biogenesis and bioenergetics (*Pprgc1a*, *Nrf1*, and *Uqcc1*). In fact, beyond affecting mitochondrial oxidative capacity, palmitic acid exposure also interfered with mitochondrial biogenesis by reducing the expression of *Nrf1*, which is consistent with what has been previously reported ([35]; X. [36]). Furthermore, mitochondrial dysfunction has been linked with excessive accumulation of ROS [37]. Reviewed literature [38] suggests that exacerbated H+ (proton) leak may be associated with increased oxidative stress and subsequently cardiovascular complications. In this study, palmitic acid exposure enhanced the production of both cytosolic and Α





В







(caption on next page)

Fig. 4. Aspalathin and sulforaphane increased mitochondrial mass and membrane potential ($\Delta \psi m$) in cardiomyoblasts exposed to palmitic acid. Briefly, H9c2 cardiomyoblasts were pretreated with 1 μ M aspalathin (Asp) and 10 μ M sulforaphane (Sul) as well as 2.5 μ M Simvastatin (Simva) which was used as a comparative control. Thereafter, cells were co-treated with 0.25 mM palmitic acid (Pal) for an additional 24 h. Mitochondrial mass was detected using Mito Tracker Green, while changes in mitochondrial membrane potential were probed through JC-10 fluorescent stain (**B**). The quantification of JC-10 aggregates, indicated by orange fluorescence at ~590 nm (excited by 540 nm), and JC-10 monomers, indicated by green fluorescence for mitochondrial membrane depolarization at ~525 nm (excited by 490 nm). Results are presented as the mean \pm standard error of the mean (SEM) from three independent experiments, each with three technical replicates (n = 3) for mitochondrial mass and six technical replicates (n = 6) for mitochondrial membrane potential, relative to the control (Ctrl). Comparisons between groups were performed using one-way multivariate ANOVA, followed by Tukey's multiple comparisons test. Statistical significance was represented by ***p < 0.001 compared to the experimental control while # p < 0.05, # # p < 0.01, # # # p < 0.001 compared to the palmitic acid control. In **Figure A**, the images depict green fluorescence representing changes in cellular ultrastructure to represent intact mitochondrial mass. In **Figure B**, images depict intact mitochondria in orange colour, whereas mitochondrial membrane depolarization is stained green. (For interpretation of the references to colour in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the Web version of this article.)



Fig. 5. Aspalathin and sulforaphane reduced cytosolic and mitochondrial production of reactive oxygen species (ROS) in cardiomyoblasts exposed to palmitic acid. Briefly, H9c2 cardiomyoblasts were pretreated with 1 μ M aspalathin (Asp) and 10 μ M sulforaphane (Sul) as well as 2.5 μ M Simvastatin (Simva) which was used as a comparative control. Thereafter, cells were co-treated with 0.25 mM palmitic acid (Pal) for an additional 24 h. Simvastatin (Simva) was used as a comparative control. 2', 7'-dichlorodihydrofluorescin diacetate (DCFH-DA) (A) and MitoSox (mitochondrial superoxide indicators) fluorescent stains (B) were used for the detection of cytosolic and mitochondrial ROS production, respectively. Results are represented as the mean \pm standard error of the mean (SEM) of three independent experiments, with three technical repeats (n = 3), per experiment relative to the control (Ctrl). Comparisons between groups were performed using one-way multivariate ANOVA, followed by Tukey's multiple comparisons test. Statistical significance was represented by ***p < 0.001 compared to the experimental control and $^{\#}p < 0.05$; $^{\#}p < 0.01$, $^{\#\#\#}p < 0.001$ compared to the palmitic acid control.



Fig. 6. Aspalathin and sulforaphane reduced cholesterol content and lipid peroxidation levels in H9c2 cardiomyoblasts. Briefly, H9c2 cardiomyoblasts were pretreated with 1 μ M aspalathin (Asp) and 10 μ M sulforaphane (Sul) as well as 2.5 μ M Simvastatin (Simva) which was used as a comparative control. Thereafter, cells were co-treated with 0.25 mM palmitic acid (Pal) for an additional 24 h. Thereafter, the total cholesterol content (A) and malondialdehyde (MDA) levels were measured as indicators of lipid peroxidation (B). Results are represented as the mean \pm standard error of the mean (SEM) of three independent experiments, with three technical repeats (n = 3), per experiment relative to the control (Ctrl). Comparisons between groups were performed using one-way multivariate ANOVA, followed by Tukey's multiple comparisons test. Statistical significance was represented by *p < 0.05, ***p < 0.001 compared to the experimental control; and [#]p < 0.05, ^{##}p < 0.01, ^{###}p < 0.001 compared to the palmitic acid control.

mitochondrial ROS consistent with impairments in mitochondrial respiration. In agreement, previous data [3,39,40] suggests that prolonged exposure to saturated fatty acids could cause impairments in mitochondrial respiration and enhance the generation of oxidative stress. As such, advances in treatments for CVD-related complications have increasingly focused on targeting alleviating mitochondrial abnormality with pharmacological compounds [41,42].

decreased activities of intracellular antioxidants within a pathological state [43]. Endogenous antioxidants are vital for maintaining optimal cellular function and overall systemic health [44]. GSH is considered the most abundant endogenous antioxidant molecule in humans, found in relatively high concentrations enabling it to directly interact with superoxide radicals and other ROS molecules, while also indirectly supporting the function of other antioxidants [45]. Another crucial antioxidant is SOD also which also primarily neutralizes superoxide

Furthermore, increased levels of ROS production are linked to



Fig. 7. Aspalathin and sulforaphane enhanced intracellular antioxidant responses in H9c2 cardiomyoblasts exposed to palmitic acid. Briefly, H9c2 cardiomyoblasts were pretreated with 1 μ M aspalathin (Asp) and 10 μ M sulforaphane (Sul) as well as 2.5 μ M Simvastatin (Simva) which was used as a comparative control. Thereafter, cells were co-treated with 0.25 mM palmitic acid (Pal) for an additional 24 h. Subsequently, mRNA expression of nuclear factor erythroid 2-related factor 2 (*Nrf2*) and superoxide dismutase (*Sod2*) was quantified (A and B, respectively). This was in addition to the enzymatic capacity of superoxide dismutase (SOD) and glutathione (GSH) (C and D). Results are represented as the mean \pm standard error of the mean (SEM) of three independent experiments, with three technical repeats (n = 3), per experiment relative to the control (Ctrl). Comparisons between groups were performed using student's *t*-test (and nonparametric test) for *Nrf2* and *Sod2* and one-way multivariate ANOVA, followed by Tukey's multiple comparisons test for SOD activity and GSH. Statistical significance was represented by *p < 0.05, **p < 0.01, ***p < 0.001 compared to the experimental control; and [#]p < 0.05, ^{##}p < 0.01, ^{###}p < 0.001 compared to the palmitic acid control.

radicals as a protection against oxidative stress [46]. In this study, palmitic acid toxicity interfered with oxidative capacity and increased lipid peroxidation while diminishing the capacity of antioxidant enzymatic responses (SOD and GSH). Similar effects were observed with a reduction in the mRNA expression levels of Nrf2, the master regulator of antioxidant response, which is required for adequate responses for cytoprotective actions and attenuation of oxidative stress [47]. The reduced mRNA expression of Nrf2, together with other intracellular antioxidants, in response to palmitic acid exposure was associated with accelerated apoptosis and necrosis within our experimental model. These results support previous studies implying that cell death could occur as the consequence of impaired mitochondrial function under the condition of lipid-induced toxicity within the myocardium [48,49]. Furthermore, this study provides novel insights into the molecular mechanisms by which palmitic acid induces mitochondrial dysfunction in cardiac cells, specifically through the downregulation of key mitochondrial markers.

There is no doubt that oxidative stress is the sole driver of suppressed intracellular antioxidant response within many pathological conditions [50], necessitating the supplementation with dietary antioxidants to support cellular function [51]. The capacity of dietary compounds to enhance or conserve intracellular antioxidant responses could significantly contribute to cardiovascular protection [52]. Published preclinical studies indicate that plant extracts or bioactive compounds from plants, including those found in rooibos and broccoli, like aspalathin and sulforaphane, could potentially enhance the intracellular antioxidants to protect against diabetes-related complications [53,54]. These dietary compounds can protect the heart against oxidative damage by activating the antioxidant response element, Nrf2, within hyperglycemic conditions [55,56]. Clinical studies have demonstrated that consuming six cups of rooibos tea, which is rich in aspalathin, can help improve the oxidative status in individuals at risk of CVD [57]. Aspalathin has shown promising bioavailability, with evidence indicating its absorption in the gastrointestinal tract and detection in plasma following consumption [58]. It has been suggested that regular consumption of rooibos tea may further enhance its beneficial effects [59]. On the other hand, sulforaphane exhibits relatively low bioavailability due to rapid metabolism and instability [60]. This can limit its effectiveness in certain clinical contexts. However, consuming whole food sources or supplements, as well as utilizing advanced formulation strategies like myrosinase supplementation and encapsulation, have been shown to improve sulforaphane's absorption and stability [60-62]. Despite challenges in bioavailability, sulforaphane has shown therapeutic potential in clinical studies, particularly in cancer prevention,



Fig. 8. Aspalathin and sulforaphane protected against cellular apoptosis induced by palmitic acid in cardiomyoblasts. Briefly, H9c2 cardiomyoblasts were pretreated with 1 μ M aspalathin (Asp) and 10 μ M sulforaphane (Sul) as well as 2.5 μ M Simvastatin (Simva) which was used as a comparative control. Annexin V and propidium iodide staining were used to assess apoptotic and necrotic rates, respectively. The fluorescent images represent different stages of cell death, with viable cells in the lower left quadrant, early and late apoptotic cells in the lower and upper right quadrants respectively, and necrotic cells in the upper right quadrant. The graphs display the percentages of viable cells (A), as well as the rate of early apoptosis (B), and late apoptosis (C), including cell necrosis (D). Results are presented as the mean \pm standard error of the mean (SEM) from three independent experiments, each with three technical repeats (n = 3), relative to the experimental control (Ctrl). Comparisons between groups were performed using student's *t*-test (and nonparametric test). Statistical significance was represented by **p < 0.01, ***p < 0.001 compared to the experimental control; and *p < 0.05, *#p < 0.01, ***p < 0.001 compared to the palmitic acid control.

neuroprotection, and inflammation, with promising effects even at lower concentrations [63]. Nonetheless, further research is required to understand its pharmacokinetics and optimize its clinical application fully.

The primary objective of this study was to evaluate the cardioprotective effects of aspalathin and sulforaphane, focusing on mitochondrial respiratory chain efficiency, reactive oxygen species (ROS) production, and lipid peroxidation, all of which serve as key indicators of mitochondrial health and oxidative stress. In addition to these primary outcomes, we also assessed secondary measures, including cholesterol levels and apoptosis/necrosis rates, to gain a more comprehensive understanding of the impact of these dietary compounds on lipid homeostasis and cellular injury. Our results showed that both aspalathin and sulforaphane could neutralize the harmful effects of palmitic acid by maintaining the metabolic activity of cells, while also positively affecting some parameters of mitochondrial respiration such as basal and maximal respiration, proton leak, and non-mitochondrial consumption. Spare capacity is a critical indicator of a cell's ability to respond to increased energy demands and manage stress [64]. Notably, we observed no significant differences in spare capacity across the treatment groups. This lack of effect suggests that while aspalathin and sulforaphane enhance ATP production under baseline conditions, they do not significantly alter the cardiomyoblasts' capacity to respond to additional energy demands. This finding is noteworthy, as spare capacity is commonly used as an indicator of pathophysiological stress states [65]. The absence of an effect on spare capacity under these experimental conditions suggests that further exploration is needed to understand the specific mechanisms through which aspalathin and sulforaphane may influence cellular stress responses. The dietary compounds further improved mitochondrial membrane potential including the mRNA expression of key markers involved in this process, including *Pprgc1a*, *Nrf1*, and *Uqcc1*. Additionally, these dietary compounds could reduce H+ (proton) leaks while restoring the physiological state of cardiac cells by ameliorating the toxic effects of ROS. These results align with previously published studies from different experimental models, which demonstrated the protection of aspalathin by improving mitochondrial function in hepatic and skeletal muscle cells against palmitate insult [30,66]. Beyond aspalathin, other dietary compounds like curcumin and resveratrol have been shown to have enhanced therapeutic potential by improving mitochondrial function and detoxifying ROS production to improve cardiac function in conditions of metabolic stress [67,68]. Interestingly, these results corroborate previous findings supporting the potential therapeutic effects of sulforaphane improving the mitochondrial function and cellular function of cultured cardiomyocytes exposed to elevated palmitic acid levels [69]. Further, affirming the therapeutic potential of these dietary compounds, or foods rich in them, in protecting against diabetes-related complications.

We have also observed that conventional pharmacological approaches for both primary and secondary prevention of CVDs often focus on lowering circulating cholesterol levels [70,71]. Although our compounds of interest did not significantly affect the cholesterol levels, our results showed that they were able to reduce lipid peroxidation following the detrimental effect of palmitic acid. The strong antioxidant properties of these dietary compounds are aligned with their capability to up-regulate Nrf2 expression as a strategy to protect against hyperglycemia-induced oxidative damage in cardiac cells [55,56]. Activation of *Nrf2*, including its downstream target genes, is one of the major mechanisms to protect against cardiac damage [72]. However, our results showed that both aspalathin and sulforaphane can inhibit apoptosis but fail to protect against cell necrosis. Perhaps inferring that these dietary compounds cannot reverse severe damage to the myocardium can serve as an appropriate intervention to protect against the development of the disease. However, this is a hypothesis that must be confirmed in well-designed in vivo studies, or clinical trials.

Overall, both these dietary compounds demonstrated improved beneficial effects in mitigating palmitic acid-induced cardiac abnormalities in our experimental model. The enhancement of intracellular antioxidants, possibly through the activation of Nrf2, appears to be the potential mechanism for blocking oxidative stress-induced cardiac apoptosis. Remarkably, both aspalathin and sulforaphane exhibit antioxidant effects that surpass simvastatin, a widely recognized lipidlowering medication known to influence Nrf2/HO-1 signaling in diverse diseases ([73]; Q. [36]). These results indicate that both compounds not only have the capacity to protect against oxidative stress-induced cardiac damage but also potentially reduce lipid levels to prevent dyslipidemia and its associated complications. Our results offer promising insights into potential dietary strategies for mitigating cardiac oxidative damage, but we recognize that these findings are preliminary and largely based on in vitro models. The concentrations of compounds used in this study are higher than what is typically achievable through standard dietary intake. While dietary sources of these compounds may provide beneficial effects, their bioavailability and metabolism in humans could limit their ability to replicate the cellular responses observed in vitro [74]. To fully understand the practical applicability of these findings, further research is necessary to determine the optimal concentrations needed to achieve similar protective effects in human tissues, particularly in the context of lipid overload. Continued investigation will be crucial for refining dietary recommendations and assessing their real-world potential to improve cardiovascular health.

5. Conclusion

Our findings provide new insights into the potential therapeutic effects of aspalathin and sulforaphane in protecting against dyslipidemiarelated cardiac toxicity. While we observed that these compounds enhanced ATP production under baseline conditions, there were no significant changes in spare capacity, suggesting that their protective effects may not extend to the ability of cardiomyoblasts to respond to additional energy demands under stress. These results highlight the need for further exploration into the mechanisms through which aspalathin and sulforaphane exert their cardioprotective effects.

This preclinical study supports the potential benefits of dietary compounds or foods rich in aspalathin or sulforaphane, such as rooibos and broccoli, in protecting against dyslipidemia-associated cardiac complications. However, it's important to recognize the limitations of using the H9c2 cardiomyoblasts model in vitro, which does not fully replicate human cardiac tissue complexities. Additionally, the concentrations of these dietary compounds used in the experiments may exceed those typically attainable through diet, posing challenges in applying these findings directly to dietary practices. Therefore, to comprehensively assess the cardioprotective properties of aspalathin and sulforaphane, further research using advanced models, such as primary cardiomyocytes, the AC16 human cardiac cell line, and animal studies, is essential to better understand their mechanisms and enhance the relevance of these findings to human health.

CRediT authorship contribution statement

Sinenhlanhla X.H. Mthembu: Writing – review & editing, Writing – original draft, Methodology, Formal analysis, Data curation, Conceptualization. Sithandiwe E. Mazibuko-Mbeje: Writing – review & editing, Supervision, Funding acquisition. Sonia Silvestri: Writing – review & editing, Supervision. Patrick Orlando: Writing – review & editing, Conceptualization. Bongani B. Nkambule: Writing – review & editing, Supervision. Christo J.F. Muller: Writing – review & editing. Luca Tiano: Writing – review & editing. Phiwayinkosi V. Dludla: Writing – review & editing, Supervision, Funding acquisition.

Data availability statement

All data used to support the findings of this study are included in the article. Raw data can be available on request after publication.

Funding statement

The work reported herein was made possible through the research funding received from the National Research Foundation (NRF) (Grant numbers: 117829 and 141929), awarded to Phiwayinkosi V. Dludla. This includes additional funding from NRF Competitive Programme for Rated Researchers: CPRR23030781214 awarded to Sithandiwe E. Mazibuko-Mbeje. The authors also acknowledge the Research of Capacity Development under the Early Investigators Program from the South African National Treasury (funding number: HDID8682/ MB2022/EIP052). Funding from the Biomedical Research and Innovation Platform of the South African Medical Research Council (SAMRC) as well as Northwest University is also acknowledged. The content hereof is the sole responsibility of the authors and do not necessarily represent the official views of the NRF or the funders.

Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

Acknowledgments

Sinenhlanhla X.H. Mthembu is funded by the SAMRC through its Division of Research Capacity Development under the internship scholarship program from funding received from the South African National Treasury. Grant holders acknowledge that opinions, findings and conclusions, or recommendations expressed in any publication generated by the SAMRC supported research are those of the authors and that the SAMRC accepts no liability whatsoever in this regard.

Abbreviations

 $\Delta \psi m$: changes in mitochondrial membrane potential; ATP: adenosine triphosphate; Asp: aspalathin; CVD: cardiovascular disease; Ctrl: control; DCFH-DA: 2', 7'-dichlorodihydrofluorescin diacetate; ECAR: glycolytic energy as measured by extracellular acidification rate; *Gapdh*: glyceraldehyde-3-phosphate dehydrogenase; GSH: glutathione; LDL: low-density lipoprotein; MDA: malondialdehyde; *Ndufs3*: NADH: ubi-quinone oxidoreductase core subunit s 3; *Nrf1*: nuclear respiratory factor 1; *Nrf2*: nuclear factor erythroid 2-related factor 2; OCR: oxygen consumption rate; Pal: palmitic acid; *Pprgc1a*: peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor, gamma coactivator 1-alpha; ROS: reactive oxygen species; *Ucp2*: uncoupling protein 2; SEM: standard error mean; Sul: sulforaphane; SOD: superoxide dismutase; Simva: simvastatin; TBARS: thiobarbituric Acid Reactive Substances; *Uqcc1*: ubiquinol-cytochrome c reductase complex assembly factor 1.

References

- [1] Di Cesare M, Perel P, Taylor S, Kabudula C, Bixby H, Gaziano TA, McGhie DV, Mwangi J, Pervan B, Narula J, Pineiro D, Pinto FJ. The heart of the world. Glob Heart 2024;19(1):11. https://doi.org/10.5334/gh.1288.
- [2] Harvey PA, Leinwand LA. The cell biology of disease: cellular mechanisms of cardiomyopathy. J Cell Biol 2011;194(3):355–65. https://doi.org/10.1083/ jcb.201101100.
- [3] Mthembu SXH, Mazibuko-Mbeje SE, Silvestri S, Orlando P, Marcheggiani F, Cirilli I, Nkambule BB, Muller CJF, Tiano L, Dludla PV. Low levels and partial exposure to palmitic acid improves mitochondrial function and the oxidative status of cultured cardiomyoblasts. Toxicol Rep 2024;12:234–43. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.toxrep.2024.01.014.
- [4] Nishi H, Higashihara T, Inagi R. Lipotoxicity in kidney, heart, and skeletal muscle dysfunction. Nutrients 2019;11(7). https://doi.org/10.3390/nu11071664.
- [5] Zhao S, Ren Z, Yu S, Chi C, Tang J, Maimaitiaili R, Teliewubai J, Li J, Xu Y, Zhang Y. Association between lipid accumulation product and target organ damage in elderly population: the northern Shanghai study. Clin Interv Aging 2021;16: 1769–76. https://doi.org/10.2147/CIA.S330313.
- [6] De Geest B, Mishra M. Role of oxidative stress in diabetic cardiomyopathy. Antioxidants 2022;11(4). https://doi.org/10.3390/antiox11040784.
- [7] Liu Q, Wang S, Cai L. Diabetic cardiomyopathy and its mechanisms: role of oxidative stress and damage. J Diabetes Investig 2014;5(6):623–34. https://doi. org/10.1111/jdi.12250.
- [8] Mthembu SXH, Orlando P, Silvestri S, Ziqubu K, Mazibuko-Mbeje SE, Mabhida SE, Nyambuya TM, Nkambule BB, Muller CJF, Basson AK, Tiano L, Dludla PV. Impact of dyslipidemia in the development of cardiovascular complications: delineating the potential therapeutic role of coenzyme Q10. Biochimie 2023;204:33–40. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biochi.2022.08.018.
- Boudina S, Abel ED. Diabetic cardiomyopathy, causes and effects. Rev Endocr Metab Disord 2010;11(1):31–9. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11154-010-9131-7.
- [10] Gulsin GS, Athithan L, McCann GP. Diabetic cardiomyopathy: prevalence, determinants and potential treatments. Ther Adv Endocrinol Metab 2019;10: 2042018819834869. https://doi.org/10.1177/2042018819834869.
- [11] Mthembu SXH, Mazibuko-Mbeje SE, Moetlediwa MT, Muvhulawa N, Silvestri S, Orlando P, Nkambule BB, Muller CJF, Ndwandwe D, Basson AK, Tiano L, Dludla PV. Sulforaphane: a nutraceutical against diabetes-related complications. Pharmacol Res 2023;196:106918. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.phrs.2023.106918.
- [12] Byrne NJ, Rajasekaran NS, Abel ED, Bugger H. Therapeutic potential of targeting oxidative stress in diabetic cardiomyopathy. Free Radic Biol Med 2021;169: 317–42. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.freeradbiomed.2021.03.046.

- [13] Huynh K, Bernardo BC, McMullen JR, Ritchie RH. Diabetic cardiomyopathy: mechanisms and new treatment strategies targeting antioxidant signaling pathways. Pharmacol Therapeut 2014;142(3):375–415. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. pharmthera.2014.01.003.
- [14] Johnson R, Dludla PV, Muller CJ, Huisamen B, Essop MF, Louw J. The transcription profile unveils the cardioprotective effect of aspalathin against lipid toxicity in an in vitro H9c2 model. Molecules 2017;22(2). https://doi.org/10.3390/ molecules22020219.
- [15] Johnson R, Beer D, Dludla PV, Ferreira D, Muller CJF, Joubert E. Aspalathin from rooibos (aspalathus linearis): a bioactive C-glucosyl dihydrochalcone with potential to target the metabolic syndrome. Planta Med 2018;84(9–10):568–83. https://doi.org/10.1055/s-0044-100622.
- [16] Muller CJF, Joubert E, Chellan N, Miura Y, Yagasaki K. New insights into the efficacy of aspalathin and other related phytochemicals in Type 2 diabetes-A review. Int J Mol Sci 2021;23(1). https://doi.org/10.3390/ijms23010356.
- [17] Bai Y, Wang X, Zhao S, Ma C, Cui J, Zheng Y. Sulforaphane protects against cardiovascular disease via Nrf2 activation. Oxid Med Cell Longev 2015;2015: 407580. https://doi.org/10.1155/2015/407580.
- [18] Dludla PV, Muller CJ, Joubert E, Louw J, Essop MF, Gabuza KB, Ghoor S, Huisamen B, Johnson R. Aspalathin protects the heart against hyperglycemiainduced oxidative damage by up-regulating Nrf2 expression. Molecules 2017;22 (1). https://doi.org/10.3390/molecules22010129.
- [19] Han Z, Achilonu MC, Kendrekar PS, Joubert E, Ferreira D, Bonnet SL, van der Westhuizen JH. Concise and scalable synthesis of aspalathin, a powerful plasma sugar-lowering natural product. J Nat Prod 2014;77(3):583–8. https://doi.org/ 10.1021/np4008443.
- [20] Dludla PV, Jack B, Viraragavan A, Pheiffer C, Johnson R, Louw J, Muller CJF. A dose-dependent effect of dimethyl sulfoxide on lipid content, cell viability and oxidative stress in 3T3-L1 adipocytes. Toxicol Rep 2018;5:1014–20. https://doi. org/10.1016/j.toxrep.2018.10.002.
- [21] Yang DK, Kim S-J. Cucurbitacin I protects H9c2 cardiomyoblasts against H₂O₂induced oxidative stress via protection of mitochondrial dysfunction. Oxid Med Cell Longev 2018;2018:3016382. https://doi.org/10.1155/2018/3016382.
- [22] Carrasco-Pozo C, Tan KN, Gotteland M, Borges K. Sulforaphane protects against high cholesterol-induced mitochondrial bioenergetics impairments, inflammation, and oxidative stress and preserves pancreatic beta-cells function. Oxid Med Cell Longev 2017;2017:3839756. https://doi.org/10.1155/2017/3839756.
- [23] Marcheggiani F, Kordes S, Cirilli I, Orlando P, Silvestri S, Vogelsang A, Möller N, Blatt T, Weise JM, Damiani E, Tiano L. Anti-ageing effects of ubiquinone and ubiquinol in a senescence model of human dermal fibroblasts. Free Radic Biol Med 2021;165:282–8. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.freeradbiomed.2021.01.032.
- [24] Yan A, Xie G, Ding X, Wang Y, Guo L. Effects of lipid overload on heart in metabolic diseases. Horm Metab Res 2021;53(12):771–8. https://doi.org/10.1055/a-1693-8356.
- [25] Dludla PV, Silvestri S, Orlando P, Mazibuko-Mbeje SE, Johnson R, Marcheggiani F, Cirilli I, Muller CJF, Louw J, Chellan N, Obonye N, Nkambule BB, Tiano L. Palmitate-induced toxicity is associated with impaired mitochondrial respiration and accelerated oxidative stress in cultured cardiomyocytes: the critical role of coenzyme Q9/10. Toxicol Vitro 2020;68:104948. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. tiv.2020.104948.
- [26] He Y, Zhou L, Fan Z, Liu S, Fang W. Palmitic acid, but not high-glucose, induced myocardial apoptosis is alleviated by N-acetylcysteine due to attenuated mitochondrial-derived ROS accumulation-induced endoplasmic reticulum stress. Cell Death Dis 2018;9(5):568. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41419-018-0593-y.
- [27] Wang Y, Qian Y, Fang Q, Zhong P, Li W, Wang L, Fu W, Zhang Y, Xu Z, Li X, Liang G. Saturated palmitic acid induces myocardial inflammatory injuries through direct binding to TLR4 accessory protein MD2. Nat Commun 2017;8:13997. https://doi.org/10.1038/ncomms13997.
- [28] Gandoy-Fieiras N, Gonzalez-Juanatey JR, Eiras S. Myocardium metabolism in physiological and pathophysiological states: implications of epicardial adipose tissue and potential therapeutic targets. Int J Mol Sci 2020;21(7). https://doi.org/ 10.3390/ijms21072641.
- [29] Divakaruni AS, Jastroch M. A practical guide for the analysis, standardization and interpretation of oxygen consumption measurements. Nat Metab 2022;4(8): 978–94. https://doi.org/10.1038/s42255-022-00619-4.
- [30] Mthembu SXH, Muller CJF, Dludla PV, Madoroba E, Kappo AP, Mazibuko-Mbeje SE. Rooibos flavonoids, aspalathin, isoorientin, and orientin ameliorate antimycin A-induced mitochondrial dysfunction by improving mitochondrial bioenergetics in cultured skeletal muscle cells. Molecules 2021;26(20). https://doi. org/10.3390/molecules26206289.
- [31] Broniarek I, Koziel A, Jarmuszkiewicz W. The effect of chronic exposure to high palmitic acid concentrations on the aerobic metabolism of human endothelial EA. hy926 cells. Pflügers Archiv 2016;468(9):1541–54. https://doi.org/10.1007/ s00424-016-1856-z.
- [32] Kann SH, Shaughnessey EM, Coppeta JR, Azizgolshani H, Isenberg BC, Vedula EM, Zhang X, Charest JL. Measurement of oxygen consumption rates of human renal proximal tubule cells in an array of organ-on-chip devices to monitor drug-induced metabolic shifts. Microsystems & Nanoengineering 2022;8(1):109. https://doi.org/ 10.1038/s41378-022-00442-7.
- [33] Kowaltowski AJ, de Souza-Pinto NC, Castilho RF, Vercesi AE. Mitochondria and reactive oxygen species. Free Radic Biol Med 2009;47(4):333–43. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.freeradbiomed.2009.05.004.
- [34] Zorov DB, Juhaszova M, Sollott SJ. Mitochondrial reactive oxygen species (ROS) and ROS-induced ROS release. Physiol Rev 2014;94(3):909–50. https://doi.org/ 10.1152/physrev.00026.2013.

- [35] Kiyama T, Chen CK, Wang SW, Pan P, Ju Z, Wang J, Takada S, Klein WH, Mao CA. Essential roles of mitochondrial biogenesis regulator Nrf1 in retinal development and homeostasis. Mol Neurodegener 2018;13(1):56. https://doi.org/10.1186/ s13024-018-0287-z.
- [36] Zhang Q, Qu H, Chen Y, Luo X, Chen C, Xiao B, Ding X, Zhao P, Lu Y, Chen AF, Yu Y. Atorvastatin induces mitochondria-dependent ferroptosis via the modulation of nrf2-xCT/GPx4 Axis [original research]. Front Cell Dev Biol 2022;10. https:// doi.org/10.3389/fcell.2022.806081.
- [37] Bhat AH, Dar KB, Anees S, Zargar MA, Masood A, Sofi MA, Ganie SA. Oxidative stress, mitochondrial dysfunction and neurodegenerative diseases; a mechanistic insight. Biomed Pharmacother 2015;74:101–10. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. biopha.2015.07.025.
- [38] Cheng J, Nanayakkara G, Shao Y, Cueto R, Wang L, Yang WY, Tian Y, Wang H, Yang X. Mitochondrial proton leak plays a critical role in pathogenesis of cardiovascular diseases. Adv Exp Med Biol 2017;982:359–70. https://doi.org/ 10.1007/978-3-319-55330-6_20.
- [39] Mansuri ML, Sharma G, Parihar P, Dube KT, Sharma T, Parihar A, Parihar MS. Increased oxidative stress and mitochondrial impairments associated with increased expression of TNF-α and caspase-3 in palmitic acid-induced lipotoxicity in myoblasts. J Biochem Mol Toxicol 2021;35(5):e22744. https://doi.org/ 10.1002/ibt.22744.
- [40] Zhang X, Mao M, Zuo Z. Palmitate induces mitochondrial energy metabolism disorder and cellular damage via the PPAR signaling pathway in diabetic cardiomyopathy. Diabetes Metab Syndr Obes 2022;15:2287–99. https://doi.org/ 10.2147/dmso.S360931.
- [41] Cox FF, Misiou A, Vierkant A, Ale-Agha N, Grandoch M, Haendeler J, Altschmied J. Protective effects of curcumin in cardiovascular diseases—impact on oxidative stress and mitochondria. Cells 2022;11(3):342. https://www.mdpi.com /2073-4409/11/3/342.
- [42] Victor V, Rocha M. Targeting antioxidants to mitochondria: a potential new therapeutic strategy for cardiovascular diseases. Curr Pharmaceut Des 2007;13(8): 845–63.
- [43] Valko M, Leibfritz D, Moncol J, Cronin MT, Mazur M, Telser J. Free radicals and antioxidants in normal physiological functions and human disease. Int J Biochem Cell Biol 2007;39(1):44–84.
- [44] Shabalala SC, Johnson R, Basson AK, Ziqubu K, Hlengwa N, Mthembu SXH, Mabhida SE, Mazibuko-Mbeje SE, Hanser S, Cirilli I, Tiano L, Dludla PV. Detrimental effects of lipid peroxidation in Type 2 diabetes: exploring the neutralizing influence of antioxidants. Antioxidants 2022;11(10). https://doi.org/ 10.3390/antiox11102071.
- [45] Espinosa-Diez C, Miguel V, Mennerich D, Kietzmann T, Sánchez-Pérez P, Cadenas S, Lamas S. Antioxidant responses and cellular adjustments to oxidative stress. Redox Biol 2015;6:183–97. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.redox.2015.07.008.
- [46] Karmakar A, Das AK, Ghosh N, Sil PC. Chapter2.7 superoxide dismutase. In: Nabavi SM, Silva AS, editors. Antioxidants effects in health. Elsevier; 2022. p. 139–66. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-819096-8.00027-6.
- [47] Dinkova-Kostova AT, Abramov AY. The emerging role of Nrf2 in mitochondrial function. Free Radic Biol Med 2015;88:179–88.
- [48] Li A, Gao M, Liu B, Qin Y, Chen L, Liu H, Wu H, Gong G. Mitochondrial autophagy: molecular mechanisms and implications for cardiovascular disease. Cell Death Dis 2022;13(5):444. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41419-022-04906-6.
- [49] Wei CD, Li Y, Zheng HY, Tong YQ, Dai W. Palmitate induces H9c2 cell apoptosis by increasing reactive oxygen species generation and activation of the ERK1/2 signaling pathway. Mol Med Rep 2013;7(3):855–61. https://www.spandido s-publications.com/10.3892/mmr.2013.1276/download.
- [50] Checa J, Aran JM. Reactive oxygen species: drivers of physiological and pathological processes. J Inflamm Res 2020;13:1057–73. https://doi.org/10.2147/ jir.\$275595.
- [51] Kurutas EB. The importance of antioxidants which play the role in cellular response against oxidative/nitrosative stress: current state. Nutr J 2016;15(1):71. https:// doi.org/10.1186/s12937-016-0186-5.
- [52] Jiménez-Cortegana C, Iglesias P, Ribalta J, Vilariño-García T, Montañez L, Arrieta F, Aguilar M, Durán S, Obaya JC, Becerra A, Pedro-Botet J, Sánchez-Margalet V, On Behalf Of The Cardiovascular Disease Working Group Of The Spanish Society Of Diabetes, S. Nutrients and dietary approaches in patients with Type 2 diabetes mellitus and cardiovascular disease: a narrative review. Nutrients 2021;13(11). https://doi.org/10.3390/nu13114150.
- [53] Chaudhary SK, Sandasi M, Makolo F, van Heerden FR, Viljoen AM. Aspalathin: a rare dietary dihydrochalcone from Aspalathus linearis (rooibos tea). Phytochemistry Rev 2021;20(6):1161–92. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11101-021-09741-9.
- [54] de Figueiredo SM, Binda NS, Nogueira-Machado JA, Vieira-Filho SA, Caligiorne RB. The antioxidant properties of organosulfur compounds (sulforaphane). Recent Pat Endocr Metab Immune Drug Discov 2015;9(1):24–39. https://doi.org/10.2174/1872214809666150505164138.

- [55] Bai Y, Cui W, Xin Y, Miao X, Barati MT, Zhang C, Chen Q, Tan Y, Cui T, Zheng Y, Cai L. Prevention by sulforaphane of diabetic cardiomyopathy is associated with up-regulation of Nrf2 expression and transcription activation. J Mol Cell Cardiol 2013;57:82–95. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yjmcc.2013.01.008.
- [56] Dludla PV, Joubert E, Muller CJF, Louw J, Johnson R. Hyperglycemia-induced oxidative stress and heart disease-cardioprotective effects of rooibos flavonoids and phenylpyruvic acid-2-O-β-D-glucoside. Nutr Metab 2017;14:45. https://doi.org/ 10.1186/s12986-017-0200-8.
- [57] Marnewick JL, Rautenbach F, Venter I, Neethling H, Blackhurst DM, Wolmarans P, Macharia M. Effects of rooibos (Aspalathus linearis) on oxidative stress and biochemical parameters in adults at risk for cardiovascular disease. J Ethnopharmacol 2011;133(1):46–52. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. jep.2010.08.061.
- [58] Breiter T, Laue C, Kressel G, Gröll S, Engelhardt UH, Hahn A. Bioavailability and antioxidant potential of rooibos flavonoids in humans following the consumption of different rooibos formulations. Food Chem 2011;128(2):338–47. https://doi. org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2011.03.029.
- [59] Piek H, Venter I, Rautenbach F, Marnewick JL. Rooibos herbal tea: an optimal cup and its consumers. Health SA Gesondheid 2019;24(1):1–9. https://doi.org/ 10.4102/hsag.v24i0.1090.
- [60] Clarke JD, Hsu A, Riedl K, Bella D, Schwartz SJ, Stevens JF, Ho E. Bioavailability and inter-conversion of sulforaphane and erucin in human subjects consuming broccoli sprouts or broccoli supplement in a cross-over study design. Pharmacol Res 2011;64(5):456–63. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.phrs.2011.07.005.
- [61] Egner PA, Chen JG, Wang JB, Wu Y, Sun Y, Lu JH, Zhu J, Zhang YH, Chen YS, Friesen MD, Jacobson LP, Muñoz A, Ng D, Qian GS, Zhu YR, Chen TY, Botting NP, Zhang Q, Fahey JW, Kensler TW. Bioavailability of Sulforaphane from two broccoli sprout beverages: results of a short-term, cross-over clinical trial in Qidong, China. Cancer Prev Res 2011;4(3):384–95. https://doi.org/10.1158/1940-6207.Capr-10-0296.
- [62] Yuanfeng W, Chengzhi L, Ligen Z, Juan S, Xinjie S, Yao Z, Jianwei M. Approaches for enhancing the stability and formation of sulforaphane. Food Chem 2021;345: 128771. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2020.128771.
- [63] Yuan J-M. Randomized clinical trial of lung cancer chemoprevention with sulforaphane in former smokers. https://clinicaltrials.gov/study/NCT03232138; 2017.
- [64] Marchetti P, Fovez Q, Germain N, Khamari R, Kluza J. Mitochondrial spare respiratory capacity: mechanisms, regulation, and significance in non-transformed and cancer cells. Faseb J 2020;34(10):13106–24. https://doi.org/10.1096/ fj.202000767R.
- [65] Nicholls DG. Spare respiratory capacity, oxidative stress and excitotoxicity. Citeseer; 2009.
- [66] Mazibuko-Mbeje SE, Dludla PV, Johnson R, Joubert E, Louw J, Ziqubu K, Tiano L, Silvestri S, Orlando P, Opoku AR, Muller CJF. Aspalathin, a natural product with the potential to reverse hepatic insulin resistance by improving energy metabolism and mitochondrial respiration. PLoS One 2019;14(5):e0216172. https://doi.org/ 10.1371/journal.pone.0216172.
- [67] Hou D, Liao H, Hao S, Liu R, Huang H, Duan C. Curcumin simultaneously improves mitochondrial dynamics and myocardial cell bioenergy after sepsis via the SIRTI-DRP1/PGC-1α pathway. Heliyon 2024;10(7):e28501. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. heliyon.2024.e28501.
- [68] Tao W, Zhang H, Jiang X, Chen N. Resveratrol combats chronic diseases through enhancing mitochondrial quality. Food Sci Hum Wellness 2024;13(2):597–610. https://doi.org/10.26599/FSHW.2022.9250140.
- [69] Li-zhen -H, Ya-jie -L, Hong-feng X, et al. Sulforaphane prevents palmitic acidinduced mitochondrial impairments of cardiomyocyte in vitro. Chin J Public Health 2013;29(10):1466. https://doi.org/10.11847/zgggws2013-29-10-20.
- [70] Costet P. Molecular pathways and agents for lowering LDL-cholesterol in addition to statins. Pharmacol Ther 2010;126(3):263–78. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. pharmthera.2010.02.006.
- [71] Kopecky SL, Alias S, Klodas E, Jones PJH. Reduction in serum LDL cholesterol using a nutrient compendium in hyperlipidemic adults unable or unwilling to use statin therapy: a double-blind randomized crossover clinical trial. J Nutr 2022;152 (2):458–65. https://doi.org/10.1093/jn/nxab375.
- [72] Chen QM. Nrf2 for protection against oxidant generation and mitochondrial damage in cardiac injury. Free Radic Biol Med 2022;179:133–43. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.freeradbiomed.2021.12.001.
- [73] Mansouri A, Reiner Ž, Ruscica M, Tedeschi-Reiner E, Radbakhsh S, Bagheri Ekta M, Sahebkar A. Antioxidant effects of statins by modulating Nrf2 and Nrf2/HO-1 signaling in different diseases. J Clin Med 2022;11(5). https://doi.org/10.3390/ jcm11051313.
- [74] Madorran E, Stožer A, Bevc S, Maver U. In vitro toxicity model: upgrades to bridge the gap between preclinical and clinical research. Bosn J Basic Med Sci 2020;20(2): 157–68. https://doi.org/10.17305/bjbms.2019.4378.