

## RESEARCH ARTICLE

Smear positive tuberculosis and genetic diversity of *M. tuberculosis* isolates in individuals visiting health facilities in South Gondar Zone, northwest EthiopiaAmir Aleign<sup>1,2,3\*</sup>, Beyene Petros<sup>2</sup>, Gobena Ameni<sup>1</sup>

**1** Akililu Lemma Institute of Pathobiology, Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, **2** College of Natural Sciences, Department of Microbial, Cellular and Molecular Biology, Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, **3** College of Natural and Computational Sciences, Department of Biology, Debrebrhan University, Debrebrhan, Ethiopia

\* [aleamiro2009@gmail.com](mailto:aleamiro2009@gmail.com)

## OPEN ACCESS

**Citation:** Aleign A, Petros B, Ameni G (2019) Smear positive tuberculosis and genetic diversity of *M. tuberculosis* isolates in individuals visiting health facilities in South Gondar Zone, northwest Ethiopia. PLoS ONE 14(8): e0216437. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0216437>

**Editor:** Mark Spigelman, Hebrew University, ISRAEL

**Received:** April 16, 2019

**Accepted:** July 16, 2019

**Published:** August 8, 2019

**Copyright:** © 2019 Aleign et al. This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

**Data Availability Statement:** All relevant data are within the paper and its Supporting Information files.

**Funding:** The study was funded by Addis Ababa University (Grant Ref. No. 0162230106072100101) and the National Institute of Health (NIH, USA), H3Africa Consortium Program (Grant Ref. No. U01HG007472-01).

**Competing interests:** The authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

## Abstract

## Background

Tuberculosis (TB), a bacterial infectious disease, continues to be a public health concern in many developing countries. However, lack of data concerning the public health burden and potential risk factors for the disease hampers control programs in target areas. Therefore, the aims of present study were to determine the prevalence of TB and genetic diversity of *M. tuberculosis* isolates from individuals visiting health facilities in South Gondar Zone, northwest Ethiopia.

## Methods

A cross-sectional study was conducted between March 2015 and April 2017. Bacteriological examination, region of difference (RD) 9 based polymerase chain reaction (PCR) and spoligotyping were used.

## Results

The overall prevalence of all smear positive TB was 6.3% (186/2953). Extra pulmonary TB (EPTB) was clinically characterized in about 62.4% (116/186) TB-positive cases. Some demographic characteristics, such as patients' origin (districts where patients were recruited) [patients' origin (chi-square ( $\chi^2$ ) value; 62.8,  $p < 0.001$ ) were found to be significantly associated risk factors for the occurrence of TB in the study area. All the mycobacterial isolates were found to be *M. tuberculosis*. Among the 35 different spoligotype patterns identified, 22 patterns were shared types. The three dominantly identified families were T, CAS and Manu, each consisting of 46.9%, 24.0% and 10.4% of the isolates, respectively.

## Conclusion

The present study revealed that TB continues to be a public health problem in South Gondar Zone which suggests a need of implementing effective disease control strategies.

## Background

Tuberculosis (TB), an infectious disease caused by members of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* (*M. tuberculosis*) complex (MTBC) remains a public health threat in many parts of the world. Despite the tremendous progress in combating TB, the disease still stands as a leading cause of death worldwide [1]. In 2017, an estimated 10.0 million incident cases of TB were reported globally, which is equivalent to 133 cases per 100,000 population [1]. There were an estimated 1.3 million deaths among HIV-negative people due to the disease, and an additional 300,000 deaths from TB among HIV-positive people. Of these, about 25% of the total cases occurred in the African Region [1].

Currently, Ethiopia is one of the 30 high TB burden countries and also one of the 14 countries within the three lists of the new WHO classification of high burden countries (high TB, high MDR-TB and high TB/HIV burden countries)[2]. The estimated total TB incidence and HIV-negative TB mortality in Ethiopia in 2016 were 177 and 25/100,000 population, respectively, which is greater than the global average of 140 and 17/100,000, respectively. [2]. All the above facts suggest that TB is still a major public health concern in Ethiopia.

The emergence of HIV/AIDS coupled with socio-demographic factors and patients' characteristics such as previous history of TB, place of residency, overcrowding, malnutrition and lack of awareness towards the disease transmission were reported to be some of potential risk factors for the spread of TB in Ethiopia and elsewhere [3–7].

Despite the importance of more data on TB burden, few studies have been conducted in Ethiopia and particularly in the Amhara Region. In addition, the majority of these studies were conducted only on pulmonary TB patients recruited from urban government hospitals or other specific settings such as public prisons [8–10]. Such studies, however, do not provide enough information about the burden of all forms of TB in the general population as well as among patients from rural and semi-urban areas. Therefore, the present study was conducted to determine the prevalence of all forms of TB (pulmonary and extra pulmonary) and its associated risk factors among rural and semi-urban TB suspected residents who were attending health facilities in the study area.

## Materials and methods

### Study area and population

The study was conducted in South Gondar Zone, Amhara Region, northwest Ethiopia. Debre Tabor is the capital town of the Zone. It is 666 kms from Addis Ababa and 99 kms from the capital city of Amhara Region, Bahir Dar. There are 10 districts (third administrative unit) in the Zone. South Gondar zone has a total population of 2,051,738, and a population density of 145.56; About 90.47% of the total population were rural inhabitants. A total of 468,238 households were counted in this Zone, which results in an average of 4.38 persons to a household and 453,658 housing units [11]. Like the rest of the zones in the northwestern part of the country, the livelihood of the community in South Gondar is largely dependent on subsistence agriculture [12].

## Study design

A Cross-sectional study was conducted between March 2015 and April 2017 on smallholder farmers in South Gondar Zone. All forms of smear positive TB patients who visited the district health centers and peripheral rural health posts, zonal and regional referral hospitals (Debre-tabor, Felegehiwot and Gambi hospitals) were included in this study. TB patients who were under treatment prior to the start of the study and those under 5 years of age were excluded from the study. For convenience, the patient sources were reduced from 10 to 8 districts. A questionnaire based survey was also conducted to assess the socio-demographic and other risk factors for the occurrence of TB in the study area.

## Sample size and sampling techniques

The sample size for the present study was determined at district level using a population proportion with specified absolute precision formula [13]:  $n = z^2 p (1 - p) / d^2$ , where  $n$  = the number of TB suspects,  $z$  = standard normal distribution value at 95% CI which is 1.96,  $p$  = expected prevalence of tuberculosis among the population (0.05, from literature in the study area [3]),  $d$  = absolute precision, taken as 5% (we took a larger  $d$  due to resource limitations). Accordingly, the sample size calculated, including a 10% non-responsive rate was 396. Hence, for 8 districts in which the study was conducted, a total sample size of 3168 was determined.

**Inclusion criteria:** All TB suspected smallholder farmers visiting the different health facilities in South Gondar Zone, residing in rural and semi-urban settings, who were above 5 years of age, were included in the present study.

## Data collection

**Socio-demographic data.** After eligible subjects were recruited and consented on the study, socio-demographic data of the study participants was collected using a structured questionnaire. Data on patient characteristics such as age, sex, district of residency, education status, previous exposure to TB, raw milk consumption habit, and family TB history were collected. Moreover, clinical data on the form of TB cases as either pulmonary or extrapulmonary was included.

**Sputum sample collection and processing.** Paired morning-spot sputum samples from clinically suspected pulmonary TB patients and spot fine needle aspirate (FNA) samples from suspected TB lymphadenitis patients were collected by trained laboratory technicians and pathologists. Sputum samples were collected in standard sterile containers and FNA specimens were collected with cryo-tubes with phosphate buffer saline (PBS) pH 7.2. The sputum and FNA samples were processed for smear microscopic examination using standard protocols [14]. The samples were first digested and concentrated/decontaminated by the NALC-NaOH method (N-acetyl-L-cysteine-Sodium hydroxide). Smears of the final deposits from the various specimens were stained by the Ziehl-Neelsen (Z-N) method and examined under oil immersion using a binocular light microscope.

**Mycobacterium culture.** The samples were processed for culturing according to the standard methods described earlier [15, 16]. Both sputum and FNA samples were cultured at the Bahir Dar Regional Health Research Laboratory Centre. Briefly, about 100  $\mu$ l of the sample suspension was inoculated on four sterile Lowenstein Jensen (LJ) medium slopes (two were supplemented with pyruvate and the other two with glycerol) and then incubated at 37°C with weekly examination for growth. Cultures were considered to be negative when no visible growth was detected after eight weeks of incubation. The presence of AFB in positive cultures was detected by smear microscopic examination using the ZN staining method. AFB positive

cultures were prepared as 20% glycerol stocks and stored at  $-80^{\circ}\text{C}$  for reference. Heat-killed cells of each AFB isolate were prepared by mixing  $\sim 2$  loopfuls of cells ( $\geq 20\mu\text{l}$  cell pellet) in  $200\mu\text{l}$  distilled  $\text{H}_2\text{O}$  followed by incubation at  $80^{\circ}\text{C}$  for 45 minutes for the release of DNA after the breaking the cell wall. The heat killed cells were transported to the laboratory at Aklilu Lemma Institute of Pathobiology, Addis Ababa University, for molecular typing.

**Region of difference (RD) 9-based polymerase chain reaction.** To differentiate *M. tuberculosis* from other members of the *M. tuberculosis* complex (MTBC) species, RD9 based PCR was performed according to protocols previously described [17].

*M. tuberculosis* H37Rv and *M. bovis* bacille Calmette-Guérin (BCG) were included as positive controls and water was used as a negative control. Interpretation of the result was based on bands of different sizes (396 base pairs (bp) for *M. tuberculosis* and 375bp for *M. bovis*) as previously described [18].

**Spoligotyping.** Isolates genetically identified as *M. tuberculosis* were spoligotyped for further strain identification. Spoligotyping makes use of the variability of the MTBC chromosomal direct repeat (DR) locus for strain differentiation as previously described [19]. A PCR-based amplification of the DR region of the isolate was performed using oligonucleotide primers derived from the DR sequence. The amplified product was hybridized followed by subsequent membrane washing processes. Known strains of *M. bovis* and *M. tuberculosis* H37Rv were used as positive controls, whereas Qiagen water (Qiagen Company, Germany) was used as a negative control. Hybridized DNA was detected by the enhanced chemiluminescence method. The presence or absence of spacer was used to interpret the result.

**Identification of *M. tuberculosis* strains and lineages.** A web-based spoligotype database was utilized to assign shared international types (SITs) for the isolates [20]. Strains matching a preexisting pattern in the database were identified with SIT number otherwise considered as orphans. An online TB lineage tool was used to predict the lineages/family of *M. tuberculosis* using knowledge based Bayesian network (KBBN) [21].

## Data analysis

Data were double entered to Excel file format and statistical analysis was performed using SPSS software version 20. Descriptive statistics were used to depict the socio-demographic variables. Chi-square ( $\chi^2$ ) was used to determine the possible association of risk factors with the occurrence of TB. Odds ratio (OR) was used to show the association of patient characteristics with the clustering rate of mycobacterial isolates. Results were considered statistically significant whenever p-value was less than 5%.

## Ethics approval and consent to participate

The study was ethically reviewed and approved by Addis Ababa University, College of Natural Sciences Research Ethics Review Board. Each study participant gave their consent using a written form (S1 Appendix) and agreed to participate in the study after a clear explanation of the study objectives and patient data confidentiality. In case of participants under the age of 18 years, consent was obtained from their parents/guardians.

## Results

### Socio-demographic characteristics of the study participants

A total of 3168 TB-suspected individuals, with a response rate of 93.2% (2,953/3168) participated in the study. Of these, 1,733 (58.7%) were males and 1,220 (41.3%) were females. Other socio-demographic characteristics such as patient origin, age, education status, status of prior

**Table 1. Socio-demographic characteristics of study participants and their association with tuberculosis prevalence, South Gondar Zone, northwest Ethiopia (N = 2,953) (2015–2017).**

Characteristics	Number, n (%)	AFB smear result		$\chi^2$ (df)	p-value
		Positive (%)	Negative (%)		
<b>Patient origin (Districts)</b>				62.80 (7)	<0.001
Dera	485(16.4)	48 (9.9)	437 (90.1)		
Ebinat	256(8.7)	17(6.6)	239(93.4)		
Este	308(10.4)	10 (3.2)	298 (96.8)		
Farta	424(14.4)	8 (1.9)	416 (98.1)		
Fogera	494(16.7)	56 (11.3)	438 (88.7)		
Gayint	367(12.4)	9 (2.5)	358 (91.0)		
Libokemkem	375(12.7)	28 (7.5)	347 (92.5)		
Simada	244(8.3)	10 (4.1)	234 (95.9)		
<b>Age group (year)</b>				35.46 (4)	<0.001
<18	428(14.5)	21 (4.9)	407 (95.1)		
18–30	676(22.9)	66 (9.8)	610 (90.2)		
31–43	757(25.6)	50 (6.6)	707(93.4)		
44–56	486(16.5)	37 (7.6)	449 (92.4)		
>56	606(20.5)	12 (2.0)	594 (98.0)		
<b>Sex</b>				1.98(1)	0.159
Male	1,733(58.7)	100 (5.8)	1,633 (94.2)		
Female	1,220(41.3)	86 (7.0)	1,134 (93.0)		
<b>Education status</b>				8.06 (4)	0.089
Illiterate	1654(56.0)	117 (7.1)	1,537 (92.9)		
Adult education	225(7.6)	11 (4.9)	214 (95.1)		
Primary school	790(26.8)	37 (4.7)	753 (95.3)		
Secondary school	169(5.7)	15 (8.9)	154 (91.1)		
Higher education	115(3.9)	6 (5.2)	109 (94.8)		
<b>TB history in the family</b>				182.03(1)	<0.001
Yes	2,187 (74.1)	134 (6.1)	714 (93.9)		
No	766 (25.9)	52 (6.8)	2,053 (93.2)		

N: Total number of suspected cases; n: Number of cases in each category; AFB: Acid-fast bacilli

$\chi^2$ : Chi-square; df: degree of freedom.

<https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0216437.t001>

exposure to TB within the family members and their milk consumption habits are noted and their association with TB prevalence has been determined (Table 1).

### Prevalence of tuberculosis among the study participants

The overall prevalence of smear positive all forms of TB was 6.3% (186/2953). The study showed variability in TB prevalence among the different socio-demographic characteristics such as sex, age and patient origin (districts). Accordingly, males (3.4% (100/2953), age groups from 18 to 30 years (2.2% (66/2953), and the Fogera district (1.8% (56/2953), had the highest prevalence. Moreover, the majority of smear positive cases (72.0%) had a history of TB in their family (Table 2).

EPTB was clinically characterized in 62.4% (116/186) of TB-positive cases in the study area, and 86.0% (160/186) of them were newly diagnosed for TB (Table 2). All of the EPTB cases were TB lymphadenitis.

**Table 2. Number of smear positive TB cases categorized by sex, patient category and TB type for study participants, South Gondar Zone, northwest Ethiopia (2015–2017).**

	Patient category		TB type	
	New, n (%)	Retreatment, n (%)	PTB, n (%)	EPTB, n (%)
Male	83 (44.6)	17 (9.1)	37 (19.9)	63 (33.9)
Female	77(41.4)	9(4.9)	33 (17.7)	53 (28.5)
<b>Total</b>	<b>160 (86.0)</b>	<b>26 (14.0)</b>	<b>70 (37.6)</b>	<b>116 (62.4)</b>

n: number of cases in each category; TB: Tuberculosis; PTB: Pulmonary tuberculosis; EPTB: Extra pulmonary tuberculosis.

<https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0216437.t002>

### Risk factor assessment for TB prevalence

Patients’ origin ( $p < 0.001$ ), age groups ( $p < 0.001$ ) and TB history in the family were significantly associated ( $p < 0.001$ ) with TB prevalence. However, sex, educational status and raw milk consumption habits were not significantly associated with the occurrence of all forms of TB ( $p > 0.05$  for all) (Table 3). Similarly, no significant association was observed between any of the different demographic or clinical characteristics and the prevalence of EPTB among the study participants ( $p > 0.05$  for all) (Table 3).

**Table 3. Association of risk factors to EPTB in humans, South Gondar Zone, northwest Ethiopia (2015–2017).**

Characteristics	All forms TB* (%)	EPTB (%)	p-value
<b>Age group (year)</b>			
<18	21(11.3)	17(81.0)	
18–30	66 (35.4)	43(65.2)	0.56
31–43	50 (26.9)	25(50.0)	0.23
44–56	37 (19.9)	25(67.6)	0.66
>56	12 (6.5)	6(50.0)	0.41
<b>Sex</b>			
Male	100 (53.8)	63(63.0)	1.00
Female	86 (46.2)	53(61.6)	
<b>Education status</b>			
Illiterate	117 (62.9)	71(60.7)	
Adult education	11(5.9)	8(72.7)	0.71
Primary school	37(19.9)	24(64.9)	0.82
Secondary school	15(8.1)	9(60.0)	1.00
Higher education	6 (3.2)	4(66.7)	0.88
<b>TB history in the family</b>			
Yes	52 (28.0)	37(71.2)	
No	134 (72.0)	79(59.0)	0.46
<b>Consumption of raw milk</b>			
Yes	133 (71.5)	87(65.4)	
No	53 (28.5)	29(54.7)	0.50
<b>Patient category</b>			
New	160 (86.0)	103(64.4)	
Retreatment	26 (14.0)	13(50.0)	0.48

\*Both pulmonary and extrapulmonary TB

<https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0216437.t003>





SITs	No. of Isolates	Spoligotype families	Octal number	Spoligotype pattern
OR1	1	CAS1_Delhi	703767740007771	
OR2	2	CAS1_Delhi	703777700001171	
OR3	1	CAS1_Delhi	703677740003171	
OR4	1	T	77736777760771	
OR5	1	T	00777777760771	
OR6	1	T	77660177760771	
OR7	1	T3	77673777760771	
OR8	1	X1	77737677760771	
OR9	1	H3	777763703420771	
OR10	3	Manue2	71777777763771	
OR11	1	Manu ancestor	70336774717771	
OR12	2	Manu1	7177777777771	
OR13	1	H	700002004140371	

Fig 2. Spoligotype patterns of 13 orphan strains and their corresponding families identified from a total of 96 *M. tuberculosis* isolates collected in tuberculosis patients in South Gondar Zone, northwest Ethiopia (2015–2017). OR: Orphan.

<https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0216437.g002>

**Association of patient characteristics with *M. tuberculosis* genotype clustering.** Higher percentages of the total 96 *M. tuberculosis* isolates were identified from Dera District (30.2%) followed by Fogera District (22.9%). The clustering rates of strains isolated from these two districts were 89.7 and 72.7, respectively. The least number of *M. tuberculosis* isolates were identified from Este (3.1%) with a clustering rate of 33.3% (Table 4).

Patient origin and educational background were observed to be significantly associated patient characteristics with clustering level of the strains. TB patients from Este and Ebinat districts were less likely to have clustered strains than those from Dera [(Este vs. Dera: odds ratio [AOR] = 0.32; 95% CI:0.00–2.07; p = 0.01)] and [(Ebinat vs. Dera: AOR = 0.12; 95% CI: 0.01–0.69;p = 0.01)].

Similarly, there was lower odd of strain clustering in samples from Gayint district (Gayint vs. Dera: AOR = 0.16; 95% CI: 0.01–1.09;p = 0.03). Clustering of strains was more than three times higher in sample from illiterate individuals than from those with secondary school education level (Secondary vs. Illiterates: AOR = 0.27; 95% CI: 0.04–1.16;p = 0.05). Clustering level, however, was not significantly associated with the other demographic and clinical characteristics of the study participants (Table 4).

A total of 74 (77.1%) isolates were grouped into 13 different clusters of strains which ranged from 2 to 18 isolates. The remaining 22 (22.1%) isolates had single strains (unique strains). The overall clustering rate was 77.1 (Table 4). A higher number (26) of clustered strains occurred in the strains of the Dera district (Table 4).

## Discussion

The 6.3% overall prevalence of all forms of TB recorded in individuals visiting public health institutions in the present study was comparable with the report (6.2%) from northeast Ethiopia [6], whereas relatively lower prevalence of TB was reported among private health clinic



**Table 4. Demographic and clinical characteristics of the study participants and their association with spoligotype clustering of TB isolates from South Gondar Zone, northwest Ethiopia (2015–2017).**

Demographic characteristics	Number of isolates (%)	Number of isolates clustered Vs unique			COR (95% CI)	AOR (95%CI)	p- value
		Clustered	Unique	Clustering rate			
<b>Patient origin(District)</b>							
Dera	29 (30.2)	26	3	89.7	1.00		
Fogera	22 (22.9)	16	6	72.7	0.30(0.06–1.40)	0.35(0.01–1.93)	0.11
Libo-kemkem	10 (10.4)	7	3	70.0	0.26(0.04–1.63)	0.14 (0.02–1.65)	0.13
Simada	9 (9.4)	7	2	77.8	0.40(0.05–2.90)	0.45(0.01–3.71)	0.35
Ebinat	10 (10.4)	5	5	50.0	0.11(0.02–0.64)	0.12(0.01–0.69)	0.01
Farta	6 (6.3)	4	2	66.7	0.23(0.02–1.84)	0.28(0.01–2.37)	0.14
Gayint	7 (7.3)	4	3	57.1	0.15(0.02–1.04)	0.16(0.01–1.09)	0.03
Este	3 (3.1)	1	2	33.3	0.05(0.00–0.84)	0.32(0.00–2.07)	0.01
<b>Sex</b>							
Male	50 (52.1)	33	17	66.0	0.47(0.18–1.20)	0.52(0.13–1.73)	0.11
Female	46 (47.9)	37	9	80.4	1.00		
<b>Age (years)</b>							
5–17	9 (9.4)	7	2	77.8	1.00		
18–30	37 (38.5)	27	10	73.0	0.77(0.13–4.35)	0.96(0.20–4.80)	0.76
31–43	28 (29.1)	19	9	67.9	0.60(0.10–3.50)	0.20(0.01–4.10)	0.57
44–56	16 (16.7)	13	3	81.3	1.23(0.16–9.25)	1.05(0.05–9.27)	0.83
>56	6 (6.3)	4	2	66.7	0.57(0.05–5.77)	0.40(0.02–5.84)	0.63
<b>Education status</b>							
Illiterate	64 (66.7)	48	16	75.0	1.00		
Adult education	4 (4.1)	2	2	50.0	0.33(0.04–2.56)	0.06(0.01–2.20)	0.27
Primary school	16 (16.7)	14	2	87.5	2.33(0.47–11.4)	2.06(0.29–11.1)	0.28
Secondary level	9 (9.4)	4	5	44.4	0.26(0.06–1.11)	0.27(0.04–1.16)	0.05
College level	3 (3.1)	2	1	66.7	0.66(0.05–7.85)	0.75(0.12–8.28)	0.74
<b>Patient category</b>							
New	81 (84.4)	58	23	71.6	0.63(0.16–2.44)	0.63(0.13–2.63)	0.50
Retreatment	15 (15.6)	12	3	80.0	1.00		
<b>Family TB history</b>							
Yes	33 (34.4)	26	7	78.8	1.00		
No	63 (65.6)	44	19	69.8	0.62(0.23–1.68)	0.35(0.05–1.30)	0.34
<b>Clinical presentation</b>							
PTB	34 (35.4)	26	8	76.5	1.00		
EPTB	62 (64.6)	44	18	71.0	0.75(0.28–1.97)	0.58(0.13–1.95)	0.56
<b>Total</b>	<b>96 (100)</b>	<b>74</b>	<b>22</b>	<b>77.1</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>

<https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0216437.t004>

attendees (5.4%)[3] and in the prison population in Gondar, northwest Ethiopia (5.3%)[8]. A 4.6% lower prevalence was reported in general population living in southwest Ethiopia [22]. Lower TB prevalence was also reported in other African countries such as Zambia (4.3%) and Botswana (4.2%) [23, 24]. On the contrary, some studies in Ethiopia have revealed higher prevalence of TB within the range of 7.5% to 17.3% [10, 25–27]. Higher TB prevalence was also reported in South Africa (30.2%) [28]. The observed variations in TB prevalence might be due to differences in the quality of diagnostic techniques used as well as variations in the living condition of the study populations.

About 62.4% of smear positive TB cases in the present study were EPTB. This was higher than reports of other two studies conducted in northwest Ethiopia (59.8% and 28.3%) and a

study from pastoral communities of East Ethiopia (22.6%) [29–31]. Lower prevalence of EPTB was also reported in northern Nigeria (32.6%) and Cameroon (12.7%) [32, 33]. The reason for the high prevalence of EPTB in the present study might be due to the fact that many of the study participants were from referral hospitals where highly suspected EPTB cases were diagnosed.

In this study, higher TB prevalence was found in Dera and Fogera districts. Consistent with our finding, it was reported that place of residence was found to be a risk factor for TB [6, 8]. The relative higher population size of the study sites [11], living conditions in the study area and migration of working staff to these areas from other districts in the zone might have contributed to the recorded variation in TB prevalence among the different sites in the study area.

In agreement with previous studies in other parts of Ethiopia [3, 34], age of study participants was observed to be significantly associated with TB prevalence in the present study. Specifically, individuals within the age range of 31 to 43 years were observed to be infected with TB in a higher proportion (25.6%). In South Africa, 88.2% prevalence of TB in the 31 to 35 years of age study participants was reported [7]. The reason for the observed high prevalence of the disease in these age groups might be due to their greater chance of contact with the community due to their more interactive day to day life activities. The global high prevalence of HIV/AIDS in these age groups might have also contributed for the observed high TB prevalence [35, 36].

In the present study none of the demographic or clinical characteristics of the study participants were observed to be significantly associated with the development of EPTB. Consistently, a study in Gondar reported a non-significant association of age, sex, educational status, residence and occupational status of the respondents with EPTB infection [37]. However, some studies elsewhere have reported that the occurrence of EPTB depends on the region, ethnic background, age, underlying disease, immune status of the patient as well as genotype of the *M. tuberculosis* strain [38–40]. Such differences might be due to differences in the use of more advanced diagnostic techniques than smear microscopy that was used in the present study.

The identification of *M. tuberculosis* as the only *Mycobacterium* species in the present study, using RD9-based PCR, was in agreement with previous reports in other parts of Ethiopia in which all or the majority of the isolates found from human TB cases were *M. tuberculosis* [41–44]. In contrast, previous studies conducted in large scale commercial farms and pastoral communities in lowland areas suggested the contribution of *M. bovis* to the overall burden of TB in humans [45, 46]. The reason for the difference in *Mycobacterium* species prevalence in this study and previous studies might be due to the low TB infection rate in cattle owned by small-holder farmers that participated in the present study.

The relatively low, 36.5% (35/96), genetic diversity of spoligotype strains in this study was consistent with similar studies conducted in Ethiopia [41–43, 47]. This might be an indication that genetic diversity of spoligotype strains is limited in Ethiopia.

The most prevalent *M. tuberculosis* strains in this study, SIT53 (lineage 4) and SIT149 (lineage 4), have been frequently reported from other parts of Ethiopia [47–50], while strain SIT428 (lineage 3) appears to be specific to the study area since it was not reported in previous studies from other parts of Ethiopia and East Africa. However, SIT428 was reported in some parts of Asia such as India [51] and Iran [52]. SIT53 and SIT149 were isolated from both PTB and EPTB patients. However, all the SIT428 strains were isolated from EPTB cases only. Hence, the present finding suggested an epidemiological link of this strain, particularly to TB type, in the study area.

In agreement with previous studies conducted in Ethiopia [44, 50, 53, 54], lineage 4 (Euro-American) was the dominant (62.5%) major lineage identified, while T3-ETH, among the most prevalent T family, constituted a considerable share (14.6%) in this study. This is in

agreement with previous studies that reported a high proportion of T3-ETH from mycobacteria isolates from Ethiopia [42, 47, 55].

In the present study, except partly for the patients' origin, no significant association was observed between socio-demographic factors and mycobacterial strain clustering. Similarly, studies conducted in northwest Ethiopia [56] and elsewhere [57, 58] also reported no significant association in this respect. This lack of association may be explained by high force of interaction (proportion of susceptible individuals who have become infected in a specified period), which would result in considerable rates of TB infections [58]. In this study, the observed high clustering rates of *M. tuberculosis* strains in Dera (89.7%), Simada (77.8%) and Fogera (72.7%) were possibly due to the relatively high population density, suggesting an ongoing TB transmission in the study area.

The present study has some limitations in including other patient characteristics such as the HIV status of the study participants and failure in the use of more advanced molecular techniques than spoligotyping to better support epidemiological links to the occurrence of TB in the study area.

## Conclusions

The present study revealed high prevalence of all forms of TB with a higher proportion of EPTB and high clustering rate of the *M. tuberculosis* isolates. Moreover, patients' origin, age and family history of TB were found to be the main risk factors of TB. Hence, appropriate TB control strategies should be implemented in the study area.

## Supporting information

**S1 Appendix. Informed consent form for the study participants.** The consent form was designed for the study participants or witnesses in case of illiterate ones who attend health facilities during the study period in South Gondar Zone, northwest Ethiopia. (PDF)

## Acknowledgments

We also would like to thank all laboratory working staff and administrators at the Regional Health research Center, Bahirdar and ALIPB, Addis Ababa University, for their support in the development of this study. We also greatly thank health officials, laboratory workers and study participants in the study area, without whom this study would have not been completed.

## Author Contributions

**Conceptualization:** Amir Alelign.

**Data curation:** Amir Alelign, Beyene Petros, Gobena Ameni.

**Formal analysis:** Amir Alelign.

**Investigation:** Amir Alelign.

**Methodology:** Gobena Ameni.

**Project administration:** Gobena Ameni.

**Resources:** Gobena Ameni.

**Supervision:** Beyene Petros, Gobena Ameni.

**Writing – original draft:** Amir Alelign.

**Writing – review & editing:** Beyene Petros, Gobena Ameni.

## References

1. World Health Organization. Global Tuberculosis Report 2018. <http://www.who.int/tb/strategy> accessed date [15/01/2019].
2. World Health Organization. Global tuberculosis report 2017. Geneva, Switzerland, available at: [http://www.who.int/tb/publications/global\\_report/](http://www.who.int/tb/publications/global_report/). Accessed 26 Sep 2017.
3. Alemayehu M, Tigabu A, Yunkura S, Hagos F, Tegene B. Prevalence of Smear Positive Pulmonary Tuberculosis and Associated Risk Factors among Pulmonary Tuberculosis Suspected Patients at Private Health Institutions in Gondar Town, Northwest Ethiopia: A Cross-sectional Study. *Am J Infect Dis Microbiol.* 2017; 5 (1): 61–65.
4. Addis Z, Adem E, Alemu A, Birhan W, Mathewos B, Tachebele B, Takele Y. Prevalence of smear positive pulmonary tuberculosis in Gondar prisoners, northwest Ethiopia. *Asian Pac Trop Med.* 2015; 8 (2):127–131.
5. Mumpe-Mwanja D, Verver S, Yeka A, Etworm A, Waako J, Ssengooba W, et al. Prevalence and predictors of latent tuberculosis among adolescents in rural Eastern Uganda. *Afr Health Sci.* 2015; 15(3):851–60. <https://doi.org/10.4314/ahs.v15i3.20> PMID: 26957974
6. Amare H, Gelaw A, Anagaw B, Gelaw B. Smear positive pulmonary tuberculosis among diabetic patients at the Dessie referral hospital, northeast Ethiopia. *Infect Dis Poverty.* 2013; 2:6. <https://doi.org/10.1186/2049-9957-2-6> PMID: 24499664
7. Wood R, Liang H, Hulin W, Middelkoop K, Onid T, Rangaka M. Changing prevalence of TB infection with increasing age in high TB burden townships in South Africa. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis.* 2010; 14(4): 406–412. PMID: 20202297
8. Gebrechekos T, Gelaw B, Tessema B. Smear positive pulmonary tuberculosis and HIV co-infection in prison settings of North Gondar Zone, Northwest Ethiopia. *BMC Public Health.* 2016; 16:1091. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-016-3761-y> PMID: 27756279
9. Maru M, Mariam S, Airgecho T, Gadissa E, Aseffa A. Prevalence of Tuberculosis, Drug Susceptibility Testing, and Genotyping of Mycobacterial Isolates from Pulmonary Tuberculosis Patients in Dessie, Ethiopia. *Tuberc Res Treat.* 2015. Available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1155/2015/215015>.
10. Wondimeneh Y, Muluye D, Belyhun Y. Prevalence of Pulmonary tuberculosis and immunological profile of HIV co-infected patients in Northwest Ethiopia. *BMC Res Notes.* 2012; 5:331. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1756-0500-5-331> PMID: 22738361
11. Central Statistics Agency, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Summary and Statistical Report of the 2007. Population and Housing Census: Population Size by Age and Sex. 2007. Available at: <https://www.scribd.com/doc/28289334/Summary-and-Statistical-Report-of-the-2007>. Accessed 9 Aug 2016.
12. Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey: Central Statistical Agency, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia and ICF International Calverton, Maryland, USA. 2011. Available at: [https://www.unicef.org/ethiopia/ET\\_2011\\_EDHS.pdf](https://www.unicef.org/ethiopia/ET_2011_EDHS.pdf). Accessed 4 May 2017.
13. Lwanga S, Lemeshow S. Sample size determination in Health Studies: A practical manual. World Health Organization Geneva. 1991. Available at: [apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/40062](http://apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/40062).
14. International Union against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease: Sputum examination for tuberculosis by direct microscopy in low income countries. 5th ed. Paris. 2000. Available at: [www.uphs.upenn.edu/bugdrug/antibiotic\\_manual/IUATLD\\_afb%20microscopy\\_guide.pdf](http://www.uphs.upenn.edu/bugdrug/antibiotic_manual/IUATLD_afb%20microscopy_guide.pdf).
15. World Health Organization. Laboratory Services in Tuberculosis Control: Culture. Part III, Geneva, Switzerland. 1998. Available at: [http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/10665/65942/1/WHO\\_TB\\_98.258\\_.pdf](http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/10665/65942/1/WHO_TB_98.258_.pdf). Accessed 14 Feb 2016.
16. Federal Ministry of Health of Ethiopia. Tuberculosis, Leprosy and TB/HIV Prevention and Control Programme. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. 2008. Available at: [http://www.who.int/hiv/pub/guidelines/ethiopia\\_tb.pdf](http://www.who.int/hiv/pub/guidelines/ethiopia_tb.pdf). Accessed 3 Feb 2016.
17. Berg S, Firdessa R, Habtamu M, Gadisa E, Mengistu A, Yamuah, et al. The Burden of Mycobacterial Disease in Ethiopian Cattle: Implications for Public Health. *PLoS ONE.* 2009; 4:e5068. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0005068> PMID: 19352493
18. Parsons ML, Brosch R, Stewart T, Somoskövi A, Loder A, Bretzel G, et al. Rapid and simple approach for identification of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex isolates by PCR-based genomic deletion analysis. *J Clin Microbiol.* 2002; 40: 2339–2345. <https://doi.org/10.1128/JCM.40.7.2339-2345.2002> PMID: 12089245

19. Kamerbeek J, Schouls L, Kolk A, Van Agterveld M, Van Soolingen D, Kuijper S, et al. Simultaneous detection and strain differentiation of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* for diagnosis and epidemiology. *J Clin Microbiol.* 1997; 35(4): 907–914. PMID: [9157152](#)
20. The Spoligotype International Database. <http://www.pasteurguadeloupe.fr:8081/SITVITDemo/>. Accessed 10 Apr 2017.
21. Run TB-Lineage tool. [http://tbinsight.cs.rpi.edu/run\\_tb\\_lineage.html](http://tbinsight.cs.rpi.edu/run_tb_lineage.html). Accessed 14 Apr 2017.
22. Eliso E, Medhin G, Belay M. Prevalence of smear positive pulmonary tuberculosis among outpatients presenting with cough of any duration in Shashogo Woreda, Southern Ethiopia. *BMC Public Health.* 2015; 15:112. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-015-1411-4> PMID: [25879547](#)
23. Kapata N, Chanda-Kapata P, Ngosa W, Metitiri M, Klinkenberg E, Kalisvaart N, et al. The Prevalence of Tuberculosis in Zambia: Results from the First National TB Prevalence Survey, 2013–2014. *PLoS ONE.* 2016; 11(1): e0146392. doi:10.1371/. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0146392> PMID: [26771588](#)
24. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report 2003. Rapid assessment of tuberculosis in large prison system Botswana. *Public Med.* 2002; 28: 250–252. Available at: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/12680520>
25. Mesfin M, Tasew W, Richard J. The quality of tuberculosis diagnosis in districts of Tigray region of northern Ethiopia. *Ethiopian J Health Development* 2005; 19:13–20. Available at: <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.555.6674&rep=rep1&type=pdf>.
26. Moges B, Amare B, Asfaw F, Tesfaye W, Yiruneh M, Belyhun Y, et al. Prevalence of smear positive pulmonary tuberculosis among prisoners in North West Ethiopia. *BMC Infect Dis.* 2012; 12:352. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2334-12-352> PMID: [23241368](#)
27. Tulu B, Dida N, Kassa Y, Taye B. Prevalence of Smear positive pulmonary tuberculosis and its risk factors among tuberculosis suspect in South East Ethiopia as a hospital based cross-sectional study. *BMC Res Notes.* 2014; 7:285. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1756-0500-7-285> PMID: [24884870](#)
28. Hesselting A, Cotton M, Jennings T, Whitelaw A, Johnson L, Eley B, et al. High incidence of tuberculosis among HIV-infected infants: evidence from a South African population-based study highlights the need for improved tuberculosis control strategies. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2009; 48: 108–114. <https://doi.org/10.1086/595012> PMID: [19049436](#)
29. Tsegaye F, Defar A, Beyene T, Shafi O, Klinkenberg E, Howe R. Documentation and treatment outcomes of smear-negative and extra-pulmonary tuberculosis in Ethiopia. *Public Health Action.* 2014; 4 (Suppl3):S25–S30.
30. Tessema B, Mucho A, Bekele A, Reissig D, Emmrich F, Sack U. Treatment outcome of tuberculosis patients at Gondar University Teaching Hospital, Northwest Ethiopia. A five-year retrospective study. *BMC Public Health.* 2009; 9: 371.
31. Gele A, Bjune G, Abebe F. Pastoralism and delay in diagnosis of TB in Ethiopia. *BMC Public Health.* 2009; 9: 5 <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2458-9-5> PMID: [19128498](#)
32. Ilyasu Z, Babashani M. Prevalence and predictors of tuberculosis coinfection among HIV-seropositive patients attending the Aminu Kano Teaching Hospital, northern Nigeria. *JEpidemiol.* 2009; 19: 81–87.
33. Pefura-Yone W, Kengne E, Balkissou A, Irene A, Endale N, Amadou L, et al. Clinical forms and determinants of different locations of extrapulmonary tuberculosis in an African country. *IMSEAR: Index Medicus for South-East Asia Region.* *Ind J Tuberc* 2103; 60: 107–113.
34. Ali H, Zeynudin A, Mekonnen A, Abera S, Ali S. Smear Positive Pulmonary Tuberculosis (PTB) Prevalence amongst Patients at Agaro teaching health center, Southwest Ethiopia. *Ethiopian J Health Sci.* 2012; 22 (1): 71–76.
35. Converse P. J. Dual Infection: The challenge of HIV/AIDS and TB in Ethiopia. *Northeast African studies.* Special Issue: HIV/AIDS in Ethiopia, Part I: Risk and Preventive Behavior, Sexually and Opportunistic infections. 2000; 7(1):147–165.
36. Ngowi J, Mfinanga K, Bruun N, Morkve O. Pulmonary tuberculosis among people living with HIV/AIDS attending care and treatment in rural northern Tanzania. *BMC Public Health.* 2008; 8: 341. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2458-8-341> PMID: [18826574](#)
37. Zenebe Y, Anagaw B, Tesfay W, Debebe T, Gelaw B. Smear positive extra pulmonary tuberculosis disease at University of Gondar Hospital, Northwest Ethiopia. *BMC Res Notes.* 2013; 6:21. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1756-0500-6-21> PMID: [23331864](#)
38. Forssbohm M, Zwahlen M, Loddenkemper R, Rieder L. Demographic characteristics of patients with extrapulmonary tuberculosis in Germany. *Europ Respir J.* 2008; 31: 99–105.
39. Garcia de Viedma D, Lorenzo G, Cardona P, Rodriguez N, Gordillo S, Serrano M et al. Association between the Infectivity of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* Strains and their Efficiency for Extra respiratory Infection. *J Infect Dis.* 2005; 192:2059–65. <https://doi.org/10.1086/498245> PMID: [16288368](#)



40. Pareek M, Evans J, Innes J, Smith G, Hingley-Wilson S, Loughheed K et al. Ethnicity and mycobacterial lineage as determinants of tuberculosis disease phenotype. *Thorax jnl.* 2012; 201824.
41. Diriba B, Berkessa T, Mamo G, Tedla Y, Ameni G. Spoligotyping of multidrug resistant *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* isolates in Ethiopia. *Int. J Tuberc Lung Dis.* 2013; 17(2):246–250. <https://doi.org/10.5588/ijtld.12.0195> PMID: 23317962
42. Belay M, Ameni G, Bjune G, Couvin D, Rastogi N, Abebe F. Strain diversity of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* isolates from pulmonary tuberculosis patients in Afar pastoral region of Ethiopia. *Biomedical Research International.* <http://dx.doi.org/10.1155/2014/>.
43. Debebe T, Admassu A, Mamo G, Ameni G. Molecular characterization of *M. tuberculosis* isolated from pulmonary tuberculosis patients in Felege Hiwot Referral Hospital, northwest Ethiopia. *J Microbiol Immunol Infect.* 2014; 47:333–338. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmii.2013.03.012> PMID: 23727395
44. Nuru A, Mamo G, Teshome L, Zewdie A, Medhin G, Pieper R. et al. Bovine tuberculosis and its risk factors among dairy cattle herds in andaround Bahir Dar City, Northwest Ethiopia. *Ethiop. Vet J.* 2015; 19(2):27–40.
45. Gumi B, Schelling E, Berg S, Firdessa R, Erenso G, Mekonnen W. et al. Zoonotic Transmission of Tuberculosis between Pastoralists and Their Livestock in South-East Ethiopia. *EcoHealth.* 2012; 9:139–149. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10393-012-0754-x> PMID: 22526748
46. Tibebe M, Mekonnen W, Awoke T, Gebre-Selassie S, Yamuah L. A High Prevalence of Tuberculosis among Dairy Farm Workers in Addis Ababa and its Surroundings. *J Mycobact Dis* 2014; 4: 139.
47. Mihret A, Bekele Y, Aytenew M, Assefa Y, Abebe M, Wassie L. et al. Modern lineages of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: implications for the tuberculosis control programme. *Afri. Health Sci.* 2012; 12(3):339–344.
48. Firdessa R, Berg S, Hailu E, Schelling E, Gumi B, Erenso G. et al. Mycobacterial lineages causing pulmonary and extrapulmonary Tuberculosis, Ethiopia. *Emerg Infect Dis.* 2013; 19(3): 460–463. <https://doi.org/10.3201/eid1903.120256> PMID: 23622814
49. Garedeu L, Mihret A, Mamo G, Abebe T, Firdessa R, Bekele Y. et al. Strain diversity of mycobacteria isolated from pulmonary tuberculosis patients at Debre Birhan Hospital, Ethiopia. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis.* 2013; 17(8):1076–1081. <https://doi.org/10.5588/ijtld.12.0854> PMID: 23827032
50. Korma W, Mihret A, Hussien J, Anthony R, Lakew M, Aseffa A. Clinical, molecular and drug sensitivity-pattern of mycobacterial isolates from extra-pulmonary tuberculosis cases in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. *BMC Infect Dis.* 2015; 15:456. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12879-015-1177-4> PMID: 26503529
51. Desikan P, Chauhan D., Sharma P, Panwalkar N, Chourey M, Patidar M. et al. Genetic diversity of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* isolates from central India. *Indian J Med Res.* 2016; 143: 481–486. <https://doi.org/10.4103/0971-5916.184287> PMID: 27377505
52. Mozafari M, Farnia P, Afraei M, Derakhshani Nezhad Z, Masjedi M, Velayati A. Molecular diversity of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* strains indifferent provinces of Iran. *Iranian J Microbiol.* 2013; 5(4): 366–373.
53. Disassa H, Tafess K, Worku A, Ameni G. A Preliminary Study on Molecular Characterization of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* in Benishangul Gumuz Region, Western Ethiopia. *Br. Microbiol. Res. J.* 2015; 10(6): 1–10.
54. Asebe G, Worku A, Zewude A, Tafess K, Ameni G. Molecular characterization of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex in Gambella region, Southwest Ethiopia. *Afri. J. Microbiol. Res.* 2016; 10(29):1086–1093.
55. Esmael A, Ali I, Agonafir M, Endris M, Getahun M, Yarega Z, et al. Drug Resistance Pattern of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* in Eastern Amhara Regional State, Ethiopia. *Microb. Biochem. Technol.* 2014; 6:2.
56. Nuru A, Mamo G, Zewude A, Mulat Y, Yitayew G, Admasu A, et al. Medhin G, Pieper R, Ameni G. Preliminary investigation of the transmission of tuberculosis between farmers and their cattle in smallholder farms in northwestern Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. *BMC Res. Notes.* 2017; 10:31. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13104-016-2349-z> PMID: 28061860
57. Oelemann C, Die IR, Vatin V, Haas W, Rusch-Gerdes S, Loch C, Niemann S, et al. Assessment of an optimized mycobacterial interspersed repetitive-unit-variable-number tandem repeat typing system combined with spoligotyping for population based molecular epidemiology studies of tuberculosis. *J. Clin. Microbiol.* 2007; 45:691–697. <https://doi.org/10.1128/JCM.01393-06> PMID: 17192416
58. Mathema B, Lewis J, Connors J, Chihot V, Shashkina E, Meulen M. et al. Molecular Epidemiology of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* among South African Gold Miners. *Anna. Am. Thor. Soc.* 2015; 12(1): 12–20.