

Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active. Public Health 199 (2021) 32-33

ELSEVIER

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

Public Health

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/puhe



Uninformative and unuseful: why it is necessary to actively challenge COVID-19 antibody testing postvaccination



RSPH

D. Romero-Alvarez ^{a, b, *}, D.F. López-Cevallos ^c, I. Torres ^d

^a Biodiversity Institute and Department of Ecology & Evolutionary Biology, University of Kansas, KS, USA

^b OneHealth Research Group, Facultad de Medicina, Universidad de las Américas, Quito, Ecuador

^c School of Language, Culture & Society, Oregon State University, Corvallis, OR, USA

^d Fundación Octaedro, Quito, Ecuador

ARTICLE INFO

Article history: Received 7 June 2021 Accepted 18 August 2021 Available online 25 August 2021

Keywords: COVID-19 Vaccination Antibody testing Immunological response

ABSTRACT

Objectives: We aimed to assess the evidence on the usefulness of postvaccination testing of COVID-19 antibodies.

Study design: We used a descriptive analytical approach. Methods: We synthesized insights of studies on the immunological responses to SARS-CoV-2 after

natural infection or vaccination and recommendations by regulatory institutions, such as the Food and Drug Administration and the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention in the United States. *Results:* Based on the multiple humoral and cellular responses elicited by either the virus or the vaccines,

the high variability of antibodies in blood, and the lack of correlation between the presence of antibodies and active cellular immunity against SARS-CoV-2, there has been explicit advice against assessing immunological status postvaccination.

Conclusions: Postvaccination antibody testing is not warranted to assess immunity status for COVID-19. Patients may misinterpret results, leading to the spread of misinformation regarding vaccine efficacy or the need to continue self-protection or the protection of others. Therefore, public health authorities should actively challenge the promotion and commercialization of this type of tests.

© 2021 The Royal Society for Public Health. Published by Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

In countries highly impacted by the COVID-19 pandemic, slow vaccine rollout has been met with offers to get tested for antibodies after being vaccinated against SARS-CoV-2. Prices may vary from £49 in England¹ and £43 (€50) in Spain² to £14 (US\$ 20) in Ecuador.³ We examine here the evidence for the usefulness of postvaccination testing of COVID-19 antibodies and, accordingly, for the potential need to limit the promotion and commercialization of this type of tests.

Through clinical trials, we know that vaccines against COVID-19 act in the human body to impede the clinical progression of the disease into a severe case, including death.⁴ Evidence is based on observed decreases in morbidity, mortality, and potential transmission of COVID-19 on vaccinated individuals.⁵ However, the presence of antibodies has not yet been measured systematically.

Studies assessing COVID-19 immunological responses are crucial because these dynamics offer key insights into the control of the pandemic. After vaccination, we can expect the presence of antibodies against the spike protein responsible for SARS-CoV-2 cell invasion in a blood sample (e.g. receptor binding domain immunoglobulin G). Nevertheless, science has yet to determine the threshold of either optimal or negligible immunological antibody response, which means that neither a positive result is automatically equivalent to immunity nor a negative result is equivalent to lack thereof.^{6,7} This is why regulatory institutions such as the Food and Drug Administration and the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention in the United States have explicitly advised against postvaccination testing of SARS-CoV-2 antibodies.^{8,9}

Studies show that antibody presence is highly variable.¹⁰ A potentially negative or low antibody test result does not automatically translate into a diminished immunological status for two main reasons. First, the test might be failing to detect the number of antibodies due to lower sensitivity (i.e. ~80%¹¹). Second, vaccines also elicit immune responses (Fig. 1), which play an important role in early virus clearance via T-cells (i.e. CD4+ and CD8+) and long-lasting protection via memory B cells (Fig. 1).^{6,7,12} Testing for antibodies does not assess cellular response, but, more importantly, titers of antibodies in blood may correlate poorly with the presence of an active cellular immunity against SARS-CoV-2 (Fig. 1).^{6,12} To be

^{*} Corresponding author. Dyche Hall, University of Kansas, 1345 Jayhawk Blvd., Lawrence, KS, 66045-7534, USA.

E-mail address: daromero88@gmail.com (D. Romero-Alvarez).



Fig. 1. Schematic representation of different immunological responses elicited by either infection or vaccination against SARS-CoV-2. As of June 2021, antibody testing to assess immunity has not been recommended because antibodies are poorly correlated with the immunological cellular compartments, features that are key to long-lasting COVID-19 immune protection.

truly informative, tests should follow scientific guidelines, including on cutoffs to determine antibody presence and immunological compartments beyond antibodies.^{6,7}

Individuals who are curious as to whether they have been "properly" vaccinated or if the vaccine is "working" may not know that an antibody test will not help to resolve these doubts. To the contrary, they may even interpret results in two ways. If the result is negative, the belief that a specific vaccine is ineffective could become extended and hamper vaccination efforts in countries where vaccine rollout is slow and inconsistent. Conversely, people with antibodies may feel safer and therefore possibly disregard current recommendations to prevent SARS-CoV-2 infection (e.g. maintain physical distance, use a face mask, and avoid large indoor gatherings in poorly ventilated spaces). Because there is no clear evidence that vaccines prevent us from infecting others,¹³ this may place highly susceptible individuals (e.g. immunocompromised) at further risk.

Although we appreciate the right of individuals to satisfy their curiosity in contexts of uncertainty—that is, countries with limited diagnostic capacity—postvaccination antibody tests are not warranted to assess immunity status for COVID-19.

The results may contribute to misinformation regarding individual practices of self-protection and protection of others, as well as trigger opposition to vaccination-documented benefits. Therefore, as a public health measure, governments should actively challenge the promotion and commercialization of this type of tests.

Author statements

Ethical approval

The present study is an analysis of published literature and therefore does not require ethical approval.

Funding

The authors declare that the present study was developed without any source of funding.

Competing interests

The authors declare no competing interests associated with the present study.

References

- 1. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC7954518/pdf/main.pdf.
- https://ceydes.com/tienda-de-salud/prueba-anticuerpos-post-vacunacioncovid-19/.
- https://www.facebook.com/CisealPuce/photos/a.452694978265861/ 1802334356635243/.
- 4. Krammer F. SARS-CoV-2 vaccines in development. Nature 2020;586:516-27.
- Rossman H, Shilo S, Meir T, Gorfine M, Shalit U, Segal E. COVID-19 dynamics after a national immunization program in Israel. Nat Med 2021;27: 1055-61.
- Dan JM, Mateus J, Kato Y, Hastie KM, Yu ED, Faliti CE, et al. Immunological memory to SARS-CoV-2 assessed for up to 8 months after infection. *Science* 2021;371:eabf4063.
- Goel RR, Apostolidis SA, Painter MM, Mathew D, Pattekar A, Kuthuru O, et al. Distinct antibody and memory B cell responses in SARS-CoV-2 naïve and recovered individuals following mRNA vaccination. *Sci Immunol* 2021;6: eabi6950.
- Food and Drug Administration. Antibody testing is not currently recommended to assess immunity after COVID-19 vaccination: FDA safety communication. 2021. https://www.fda.gov/medical-devices/safety-communications/antibodytesting-not-currently-recommended-assess-immunity-after-covid-19vaccination-fda-safety. [Accessed 2 June 2021].
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, United States of America. Interim clinical considerations for use of Covid-19 vaccines currently authorized in the United States. 2021. https://www.cdc.gov/vaccines/covid-19/clinicalconsiderations/covid-19-vaccines-us.html?CDC_AA_refVal=https%3A%2F% 2Fwww.cdc.gov%2Fvaccines%2Fcovid-19%2Finfo-by-product%2Fclinicalconsiderations.html. [Accessed 2 June 2021].
- Wajnberg A, Amanat F, Firpo A, Altman DR, Bailey MJ, Mansour M, et al. Robust neutralizing antibodies to SARS-CoV-2 infection persist for months. *Science* 2020;**370**:1227–30.
- Bastos ML, Tavaziva G, Abidi SK, Campbell JR, Haraoui LP, Johnston JC, et al. Diagnostic accuracy of serological tests for covid-19: systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMJ* 2020;**370**:m2516.
- Turner JS, Kim W, Kalaidina E, Goss CW, Rauseo AM, Schmitz AJ, et al. SARS-CoV-2 infection induces long-lived bone marrow plasma cells in humans. *Nature* 2021;595:421–5.
- Peiris M, Leung GM. What can we expect from first-generation COVID-19 vaccines? Lancet 2020;396:1467-9.