



Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.

Accession No. GSE135860) and PRIDE (<https://www.ebi.ac.uk/pride/>) (Accession No. PXD014908). To access the GEO data, use the password: srqdeykpzmbhor; to access the PRIDE data, use this account: reviewer94895@ebi.ac.uk with password: jf8PgTab. The ribosome profiling and RNA-seq data as well as the SILAC data will be released upon the publication of this study.

Acknowledgments

This work is dedicated to Prof. Bin HAN from the CAS Center for Excellence in Molecular Plant Sciences/National Center for Rice Genomics for his generous support of our first journey into multiomics. We specially acknowledge the excellent support from Drs Chao Peng, Ping Xu and Hu Zhou for assistance in data collection and analysis, and Drs Wei Bian and Ming Cheng from the molecular and cell biology facility in SIBCB. We are particularly grateful to Drs Qi Feng, Xuehui Huang and colleagues at the National Center of Rice Genomics (Shanghai) for their kind and professional assistance. We also thank Ms. Elmira Gopur and all the other members of the laboratory for their help.

Supplementary data

Supplementary data to this article can be found online at <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhep.2021.09.036>.

References

Author names in bold designate shared co-first authorship

- [1] Guan G, Zou J, Zhang T, Lu F, Chen X. A global survey of alternative splicing of HBV transcriptome using long-read sequencing. *J Hepatol* 2022;76(1):234–236.
- [2] **Yuan S, Liao G, Zhang M, Zhu Y**, Wang K, Xiao W, et al. Translatomic profiling reveals novel self-restricting virus-host interactions during HBV infection. *J Hepatol* 2021;75:74–85.
- [3] Lim CS, Sozzi V, Littlejohn M, Yuen LKW, Warner N, Betz-Stablein B, et al. Quantitative analysis of the splice variants expressed by the major hepatitis B virus genotypes. *Microb Genom* 2021;7.
- [4] Kremsdorf D, Leckby B, Bablon P, Sotty J, Augustin J, Schnuriger A, et al. Alternative splicing of viral transcripts: the dark side of the HBV. *Gut* 2021. <https://doi.org/10.1136/gutjnl-2021-324554>.

Shilin Yuan^{1,2}
Yuedong Yang^{3,‡}
Ronggui Hu^{1,2,4,*}

¹Cancer Center, Shanghai Tenth People's Hospital, School of Medicine, Tongji University, Shanghai 200072, China

²State Key Laboratory of Molecular Biology, Shanghai Institute of Biochemistry and Cell Biology, Center for Excellence in Molecular Cell Science, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Shanghai 200031, China

³School of Computer Science and Engineering, Sun Yat-sen University, Guangzhou 510000, China

⁴School of Life Science, Hangzhou Institute for Advance Study, University of Chinese Academy of Sciences, Hangzhou 310024, China

*Corresponding author. Address: Center for Excellence in Molecular Cell Science, 320 Yue-yang Road, Shanghai 200031, China; Tel.: 86-17717541320, fax: 86-21-54921409
E-mail address: coryhu@sibcb.ac.cn (R. Hu)

‡ These authors contributed to this work equally.



Effectiveness of SARS-CoV-2 vaccination in liver transplanted patients: The debate is open!

To the Editor:

Data about the immunogenicity of SARS-CoV-2 vaccination in solid organ transplant recipients are lacking. This population was excluded from clinical trials and lower response to vaccination is a well-known problem in immunocompromised solid organ recipients. In this scenario, we read with great interest the article “Low immunogenicity to SARS-CoV-2 vaccination among liver transplant recipients” by Rabinowich L. *et al.*¹ recently published in *Journal of Hepatology* evaluating the immunogenicity of the Pfizer-BioNTech BNT162b2 SARS-CoV-2 vaccine in liver transplant (LT) recipients. They showed that only 47.5% of patients developed neutralizing antibody titers, 10–20 days after receiving the second dose.¹ Similar results have been described in recent reports on SARS-CoV-2 vaccination in solid organ transplant recipients.^{2–4}

We would like to share our preliminary results about a prospective study evaluating the effectiveness of SARS-CoV-2 vaccination (in terms of immunogenicity and safety) in a cohort of adult liver transplanted patients regularly followed up at 2 referral hospitals in Southern Italy (Cardarelli Hospital and Federico II Academic Hospital). All liver transplanted recipients had stable graft function prior to vaccination. Participants signed written informed consent. The study was approved by the Federico II Institutional Review Board (n. 214/2021). No patient transplanted during the COVID-19 pandemic received a liver from a SARS-CoV-2-positive donor; however, information about previous SARS-CoV-2 infection in the donors was not available. We enrolled 365 LT patients undergoing Pfizer-BioNTech BNT162b2 SARS-CoV-2 vaccination. All patients had a negative history for COVID-19 and tested negative for anti-SARS-CoV-2 antibodies in the 7 days preceding the first dose injection. Four weeks after the second vaccine dose, blood samples were collected for analysis of anti-Spike protein IgG using LIAISON SARS-CoV-2 S1/S2-IgG chemiluminescent assay (DiaSorin, Italy) (range < 3.8 to >400 AU/ml [positive ≥25 AU/ml]). The vaccination was well tolerated, and no major adverse events occurred in

Keywords: COVID-19; Sars-CoV-2 vaccination; liver transplantation; immunosuppression.
Received 25 June 2021; received in revised form 26 July 2021; accepted 26 July 2021; available online 3 August 2021
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhep.2021.07.034>

Table 1. Characteristics of LT recipients stratified according to the serologic response after 2 doses of the BioNTech BNT162b2 SARS-CoV-2 vaccine.

Characteristics	Overall (n = 365)	SARS-CoV-2 seronegative (n = 92)	SARS-CoV-2 seropositive (n = 273)	p value
Age, years (mean ± SD)	62.52 ± 12.97	65.01 ± 9.32	61.68 ± 13.9	<0.0001*
<40 years, n (%)	28 (7.6%)	1 (1.08%)	27 (9.8%)	<0.0001**
40-65 years, n (%)	150 (41.1%)	43 (46.7%)	107 (39.2%)	0.071**
>65 years, n (%)	187 (51.23%)	48 (52.17%)	139 (50.9%)	0.036**
Male, sex, n (%)	279 (76.4%)	73 (79.3%)	206 (75.4%)	0.06**
BMI, kg/m ² (mean ± SD)	26.56 ± 4.52	27.7 ± 7.09	26.77 ± 4.59	0.031*
Time from transplantation, years (mean ± SD)	14.08 ± 8.84	11.94 ± 8.72	14.79 ± 8.77	<0.001*
<1 year, n (%)	7 (1.91%)	5 (5.4%)	2 (0.7%)	<0.0001**
1-5 years, n (%)	69 (18.9%)	22 (23.9%)	47 (17.21)	0.0025**
5-10 years, n (%)	58 (15.89%)	15 (16.3%)	43 (15.75%)	0.058**
>10 years, n (%)	231 (63.21%)	50 (54.3%)	181 (66.3%)	<0.0001**
Immunosuppressive therapy, n (%)				
Calcineurin inhibitor	299 (81.9%)	72 (78.3%)	227 (83.1%)	0.19**
Antimetabolite	132 (36.2%)	49 (53.3%)	83 (30.4%)	<0.0001**
mTOR inhibitor	85 (23.3%)	30 (32.6%)	55 (20.1%)	0.021**
Single immunosuppressive agent, n (%)	218 (59.7%)	34 (36.9%)	184 (67.3%)	<0.0001**
Two or more immunosuppressive agents, n (%)	147 (40.3%)	58 (63.1%)	89 (32.7%)	<0.0001**
Steroids, n (%)	28 (7.6%)	9 (9.8%)	19 (6.9%)	0.07**

LT, liver transplantation.

*Kruskal-Wallis test.

**Chi squared, Fisher exact test

any of the enrolled patients. Protective levels of antibodies were detected in 273/365 patients (74.8%) with a mean value of 214.79 ± 143 AU/ml. In the 92 patients with negative serology, statistically significant associated factors were: older age (>65 years), higher BMI, shorter time from transplantation and immunosuppressive regimens with multiple drugs and antimetabolite therapy (see Table 1 for details). These preliminary results are partially in line with Rabinowich *et al.*¹ who reported negative serologic response in older patients (>63 years), those receiving a high dose of prednisone in the past 12 months, and regimens including antimetabolites and triple immunosuppressive therapy. Furthermore, we compared the serology of LT patients with a control group of 340 healthcare workers with no major comorbidities matched for age and sex (mean age 57.86 ± 8.28; 64% males). In the control group only 5/340 (1.4% vs. 26.2%) showed a negative serology 4 weeks after full vaccination, and mean antibodies levels were 314.32 ± 94.1 AU/ml, which was statistically higher than in the LT group (*p* <0.0001).

Our results highlight the decreased humoral response in LT recipients. Moreover, we define the most vulnerable individuals among them (*i.e.*, older, overweight/obese patients, and those receiving multiple drug immunosuppressive regimens and regimens including antimetabolites). Even if these findings were expected, given the known scarce antibody response to other vaccines in immunocompromised patients, we are continuing our study to obtain data about the long-term effectiveness and immunogenicity of SARS-CoV-2 vaccination and the impact of an additional dose, as recently suggested by Werbel *et al.*⁵

Financial support

No source of funding to declare.

Conflict of interest

No personal or financial conflicts of interest for all the authors.

Please refer to the accompanying ICMJE disclosure forms for further details.

Authors' contributions

M.G., IE, V.C. made substantial contributions to the conception and the design; MG wrote the article; A.F. acquired data; F.M. revised the article critically for important intellectual contribution. All authors read and approved the final version of the article.

Supplementary data

Supplementary data to this article can be found online at <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhep.2021.07.034>.

References

- Rabinowich L, Grupper A, Baruch R, Ben-Yehoyada M, Halperin T, Turner D, et al. Low immunogenicity to SARS-CoV-2 vaccination among liver transplant recipients. *J Hepatol* 2021;75(2):435–438.
- Boyarsky BJ, Werbel WA, Avery RK, Tobian AAR, Massie AB, Segev DL, et al. Antibody response to 2-dose SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccine series in solid organ transplant recipients. *JAMA* 2021 Jun 1;325(21):2204–2206.
- Malinis M, Cohen E, Azar MM. Effectiveness of SARS-CoV-2 vaccination in fully-vaccinated solid organ transplant recipients. *Am J Transplant* 2021 Jun 8. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ajt.16713>.
- Miele M, Busà R, Russell G, Sorrentino MC, Di Bella M, Timoneri F, et al. Impaired anti-SARS-CoV-2 humoral and cellular immune response induced by Pfizer-BioNTech BNT162b2 mRNA vaccine in solid organ transplanted patients. *Am J Transplant* 2021 May 31. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ajt.16702>.
- Werbel WA, Boyarsky BJ, Ou MT, Massie AB, Tobian AAR, Garonzik-Wang JM, et al. Safety and immunogenicity of a third dose of SARS-CoV-2 vaccine in solid organ transplant recipients: a case series. *Ann Intern Med* 2021 Jun 15. <https://doi.org/10.7326/L21-0282>.

Maria Guarino¹
Valentina Cossiga^{1,*}
Ilaria Esposito²
Alessandro Furno³
Filomena Morisco¹

¹Department of Clinical Medicine and Surgery, Gastroenterology and Hepatology Unit, University of Naples "Federico II", Naples, Italy

²Hepatology Unit, AORN A. Cardarelli, Naples, Italy

³Department of Translational Medical Science, University of Naples “Federico II”, Naples, Italy

80131 Naples (NA), Italy; Tel.: +39 081 7464746; fax: +39 081 7464746.

*Corresponding author. Address: Department of Clinical Medicine and Surgery, University of Naples “Federico II”, Via Sergio Pansini, 5 -

E-mail address: valentina.cossiga@gmail.com (V. Cossiga)



Reply to: “Effectiveness of SARS-CoV-2 vaccination in liver transplanted patients: The debate is open!”

Time for comprehensive data analysis

To the Editor:

Guarino *et al.* recently published data from 365 liver transplant (LT) recipients receiving 2 doses of the Pfizer-BioNTech BNT162b2 SARS-CoV-2 vaccine, reporting a positive serological response rate of 74.8%.¹ Earlier this year we published data showing only a 47.5% positive serological response in LT

recipients following an identical vaccination protocol.² This significant difference in outcomes requires discussion regarding the effectiveness of the SARS-CoV-2 vaccine in LT recipients.

Initial data regarding SARS-CoV-2 vaccination response in LT recipients were limited. A number of recently published studies add valuable information, with reported response rates ranging from 37.5% to 81%.^{3–8} Several SARS-CoV-2 vaccination studies

Table 1. Summary of recently published SARS-CoV-2 2nd vaccine studies that included LT patients.

Paper	Number of LT recipients	Type of SARS-CoV-2 vaccine	Positive serological response rate	Antibody titer compared to control group [†]	Factor related to reduced response rate
Guarino <i>et al.</i> ¹	365	Pfizer-BioNTech BNT162b2	74.8%	214.79 ± 143 vs. 314.32 ± 94.1 AU/ml (<i>p</i> < 0.0001) ^{††}	Age >65 yr, higher BMI, shorter time from transplantation, immunosuppressive regimens with multiple drugs, antimetabolite therapy
Rabinowich <i>et al.</i> ²	80	Pfizer-BioNTech BNT162b2	47.5%	95.41 ± 92.4 vs. 200.5 ± 65.1 AU/ml (<i>p</i> < 0.001) ^{††}	Age, lower eGFR, high dose prednisone in the past 12, triple therapy immunosuppression, MMF
Strauss <i>et al.</i> ^{3**}	161	Pfizer-BioNTech BNT162b2 Moderna mRNA-1273	81%	81.9–250 U/ml, no control [‡]	Antimetabolite therapy, type of vaccine
Rashidi-Alavijeh <i>et al.</i> ⁴	43	Pfizer-BioNTech BNT162b2	79%	552.7 vs. >2,080 BAU/ml (<i>p</i> = 0.0001) ^{††}	MMF
Boyarsky <i>et al.</i> ^{5*}	129 (cohort of 658 SOT recipients)	Pfizer-BioNTech BNT162b2 Moderna mRNA-1273	79.8%		For all SOT recipients: age, type of organ, years since transplant, antimetabolite therapy, type of vaccine
Marion <i>et al.</i> ^{6*}	58 (cohort of 367 SOT recipients)	Pfizer-BioNTech BNT162b2 Moderna mRNA-1273	50%		No clinical data
Mazzola <i>et al.</i> ^{7*}	58 (cohort of 143 SOT recipients)	Pfizer-BioNTech BNT162b2	37.5%		For all SOT recipients: age >60 yr, type of organ, treated with corticoids, triple-therapy immunosuppression, transplanted <2 yr, diabetic patients

eGFR, estimated glomerular filtration rate; LT, liver transplant; MMF, mycophenolate mofetil; SOT, solid organ transplant.

*Studies including LT recipients in a cohort of SOT patients.

**Patients from this study were included in a previous all organ report.⁸

[†]Antibody titers provided only for studies exclusive to LT recipients.

^{††}LIAISON SARS-CoV-2 S1/S2 IgG chemiluminescent assay (DiaSorin, Italy).

[‡]Anti-RBD immunoassay (Roche Elecsys).

Received 16 September 2021; accepted 28 September 2021; available online 8 October 2021

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhep.2021.09.037>