



Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.

## COVID-19: stigmatising the unvaccinated is not justified

In the USA and Germany, high-level officials have used the term pandemic of the unvaccinated, suggesting that people who have been vaccinated are not relevant in the epidemiology of COVID-19. Officials' use of this phrase might have encouraged one scientist to claim that "the unvaccinated threaten the vaccinated for COVID-19".<sup>1</sup> But this view is far too simple.

There is increasing evidence that vaccinated individuals continue to have a relevant role in transmission. In Massachusetts, USA, a total of 469 new COVID-19 cases were detected during various events in July, 2021, and 346 (74%) of these cases were in people who were fully or partly vaccinated, 274 (79%) of whom were symptomatic. Cycle threshold values were similarly low between people who were fully vaccinated (median 22·8) and people who were unvaccinated, not fully vaccinated, or whose vaccination status was unknown (median 21·5), indicating a high viral load even among people who were fully vaccinated.<sup>2</sup> In the USA, a total of 10 262 COVID-19 cases were reported in vaccinated people by April 30, 2021, of whom 2725 (26·6%) were asymptomatic, 995 (9·7%) were hospitalised, and 160 (1·6%) died.<sup>3</sup> In Germany, 55·4% of symptomatic COVID-19 cases in patients aged 60 years or older were in fully vaccinated individuals,<sup>4</sup> and this proportion is increasing each week. In Münster, Germany, new cases of COVID-19 occurred in at least 85 (22%) of 380 people who were fully vaccinated or who had recovered from COVID-19 and who attended a nightclub.<sup>5</sup> People who are vaccinated have a lower risk of severe disease but are still a relevant part of the pandemic. It is therefore wrong and dangerous to speak of a pandemic

of the unvaccinated. Historically, both the USA and Germany have engendered negative experiences by stigmatising parts of the population for their skin colour or religion. I call on high-level officials and scientists to stop the inappropriate stigmatisation of unvaccinated people, who include our patients, colleagues, and other fellow citizens, and to put extra effort into bringing society together.

I declare no competing interests.

Günter Kampf  
gunter.kampf@uni-greifswald.de

University Medicine Greifswald, Institute for Hygiene and Environmental Medicine, 17475 Greifswald, Germany

- 1 Goldman E. How the unvaccinated threaten the vaccinated for COVID-19: a Darwinian perspective. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 2021; **118**: e21114279118.
- 2 Brown CM, Vostok J, Johnson H, et al. Outbreak of SARS-CoV-2 infections, including COVID-19 vaccine breakthrough infections, associated with large public gatherings—Barnstable County, Massachusetts, July 2021. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep* 2021; **70**: 1059–62.
- 3 US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention COVID-19 Vaccine Breakthrough Case Investigations Team. COVID-19 vaccine breakthrough infections reported to CDC—United States, January 1–April 30, 2021. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep* 2021; **70**: 792–93.
- 4 Robert Koch Institut. Wöchentlicher Lagebericht des RKI zur Coronavirus-Krankheit-2019 (COVID-19)—14·10·2021—aktualisierter Stand für Deutschland. Oct 14, 2021. [https://www.rki.de/DE/Content/InfAZ/N/Neuartiges\\_Coronavirus/Situationsberichte/Wochenbericht/Wochenbericht\\_2021-10-14.pdf?\\_\\_blob=publicationFile](https://www.rki.de/DE/Content/InfAZ/N/Neuartiges_Coronavirus/Situationsberichte/Wochenbericht/Wochenbericht_2021-10-14.pdf?__blob=publicationFile) (accessed Oct 18, 2021).
- 5 Von Dolle F. Münster: Inzwischen 85 Infizierte nach 2G-Party im Club. Sept 20, 2021. <https://www1.wdr.de/nachrichten/westfalen-lippe/corona-infektionen-clubbesuch-muenster-100.html> (accessed Sept 23, 2021).

## Long-term effects on survivors with COVID-19

Lixue Huang and colleagues<sup>1</sup> reported that patients discharged from hospital with COVID-19 showed good physical and functional recovery 1 year after symptom onset. Because of several concerns with the methods, we contend that the findings should be interpreted cautiously.

Quality of life (QOL) was measured using the EuroQol five-dimension five-level (EQ-5D-5L) questionnaire. However, the authors did not seem to use the validated Chinese version of the EQ-5D-5L, nor did they cite relevant studies.<sup>2</sup> Additionally, the EQ-5D-5L item on anxiety or depression was used on its own as a major health outcome, which is not appropriate since the EQ-5D-5L item on anxiety or depression has not been validated in Chinese populations. Furthermore, depression and anxiety each consist of a cluster of different symptoms that cannot simply be assessed using one EQ-5D-5L item. The study findings on the anxiety or depression risk factors are therefore tentative.

Clinically, depression refers to major depressive disorder, and anxiety refers to anxiety disorder. The investigators did not clarify that the EQ-5D-5L item on anxiety or depression only reflects their symptoms, which is misleading. Strictly speaking, specific methods of measuring anxiety and depression symptoms such as the Generalized Anxiety Disorder 7-item scale and Patient Health Questionnaire-9 should be used. Further, for anxiety disorder and major depressive disorder, structured diagnostic instruments such as the Mini-International Neuropsychiatric Interview or the Structured Clinical Interview for Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders are routinely used.

Moreover, most somatic symptoms reported in the Article<sup>1</sup> could be attributed to, or at least be partly explained by, depression or anxiety, or both, since it is widely documented that Chinese populations tend to somatise their mental health problems.<sup>3,4</sup> Most of the somatic symptoms were therefore probably incorrectly assumed to be sequelae symptoms caused by COVID-19. Furthermore, the risk factors of fatigue or muscle weakness were examined using multiple logistic regression analysis; anxiety and



Alfredo Estrella/Getty Images

depression should have been handled as either major contributing factors or covariates with confounding effects.

Finally, aside from the depression and anxiety symptoms, other notable and common mental health problems in COVID-19 survivors such as post-traumatic stress disorder symptoms and stigma<sup>5,6</sup> were not examined. Such problems could lead to a host of negative health outcomes, including depression and anxiety in the survivors of serious infectious diseases.<sup>7,8</sup>

We declare no competing interests. Y-JZ and WB contributed equally.

Yan-Jie Zhao, Wei Bai, Zhaohui Su, Chee H Ng, \*Yu-Tao Xiang  
xyutly@gmail.com

Unit of Psychiatry, Department of Public Health and Medicinal Administration, Institute of Translational Medicine, Faculty of Health Sciences (Y-JZ, WB, Y-TX), Centre for Cognitive and Brain Sciences (Y-JZ, WB, Y-TX), and Institute of Advanced Studies in Humanities and Social Sciences (Y-JZ, WB, Y-TX), University of Macau, Macau Special Administrative Region 999078, China; Center on Smart and Connected Health Technologies, Mays Cancer Center, School of Nursing, University of Texas Health Science Center at San Antonio, San Antonio, TX, USA (ZS); Department of Psychiatry, The Melbourne Clinic and St Vincent's Hospital, University of Melbourne, Richmond, VIC, Australia (CHN)

- Huang L, Yao Q, Gu X, et al. 1-year outcomes in hospital survivors with COVID-19: a longitudinal cohort study. *Lancet* 2021; **398**: 747–58.
- Wang H-M, Patrick DL, Edwards TC, Skalicky AM, Zeng HY, Gu WW. Validation of the EQ-5D in a general population sample in urban China. *Qual Life Res* 2012; **21**: 155–60.
- Ryder AG, Yang J, Zhu X, et al. The cultural shaping of depression: somatic symptoms in China, psychological symptoms in North America? *J Abnorm Psychol* 2008; **117**: 300–13.
- Kleinman A. Culture and depression. *N Engl J Med* 2004; **351**: 951–53.
- Yuan Y, Liu Z-H, Zhao Y-J, et al. Prevalence of post-traumatic stress symptoms and its associations with quality of life, demographic and clinical characteristics in COVID-19 survivors during the post-COVID-19 era. *Front Psychiatry* 2021; **12**: 665507.
- Duan W, Bu H, Chen Z. COVID-19-related stigma profiles and risk factors among people who are at high risk of contagion. *Soc Sci Med* 2020; **266**: 113425.
- Park HY, Park WB, Lee SH, et al. Posttraumatic stress disorder and depression of survivors 12 months after the outbreak of Middle East respiratory syndrome in South Korea. *BMC Public Health* 2020; **20**: 605.
- Grov C, Golub SA, Parsons JT, Brennan M, Karpiak SE. Loneliness and HIV-related stigma explain depression among older HIV-positive adults. *AIDS Care* 2010; **22**: 630–39.

The conditions that linger after recovery from COVID-19 are commonly referred to as the long-term effects of COVID-19 (long COVID). The risk for sequelae varies according to the severity of the initial acute SARS-CoV-2 infection.<sup>1</sup>

We note that the proportion of patients admitted to intensive care units included in Lixue Huang and colleagues' analysis of 1-year outcomes in hospital survivors with COVID-19 was small (4%) and might not realistically capture the repercussions of long COVID. Furthermore, patients with comorbid activity-limiting health conditions or disabilities, a patient demographic previously shown to have an increased prevalence of long COVID by the UK Office for National Statistics, were excluded.<sup>3</sup>

Anxiety or depression were observed infrequently in patients at both 6 months (23%) and 12 months (26%). Self-reported symptoms of depression might be misleading and overestimate the actual prevalence. This overestimation might explain why only one patient with COVID-19 reported participation in a psychological intervention programme.<sup>2</sup> In the future, the investigators might consider using questionnaires specific to depression and anxiety to avoid this issue.

Cytokines are closely associated with the progression and severity of chronic fatigue syndrome.<sup>4</sup> Given the high rate of fatigue and weakness and the availability of data on cytokines, are the investigators able to compare the difference in the number of survivors between patients with fatigue or muscle weakness and those without fatigue or muscle weakness?

Lastly, reinfection with SARS-CoV-2 variants have been confirmed with genetic evidence.<sup>5</sup> It is unclear whether patients with long COVID also have an increased susceptibility to reinfection because of the poor durability of their antibody response. Despite the success of COVID-19 vaccines, their effectiveness in preventing long COVID has yet to be elucidated.

SJT reports a grant from the Canadian Institutes of Health Research. All other authors declare no competing interests.

Chengliang Yang, Hedi Zhao,  
\*Scott J Tebbutt  
scott.tebbutt@hli.ubc.ca

Prevention of Organ Failure Centre of Excellence, Vancouver, BC, Canada (CY, SJT); Faculty of Medicine, McGill University, Montreal, QC, Canada (HZ); Centre for Heart Lung Innovation, Providence Health Care Research Institute, St Paul's Hospital, Vancouver, BC V6Z 1Y6, Canada (SJT); Division of Respiratory Medicine, Department of Medicine, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, BC, Canada (SJT)

- Al-Aly Z, Xie Y, Bowe B. High-dimensional characterization of post-acute sequelae of COVID-19. *Nature* 2021; **594**: 259–64.
- Huang L, Yao Q, Gu X, et al. 1-year outcomes in hospital survivors with COVID-19: a longitudinal cohort study. *Lancet* 2021; **398**: 747–58.
- The UK Office for National Statistics. Prevalence of ongoing symptoms following coronavirus (COVID-19) infection in the UK: 1 July 2021. July 1, 2021. <https://www.ons.gov.uk/peoplepopulationandcommunity/healthandsocialcare/conditionsanddiseases/bulletins/prevalenceofongoingsymptomsfollowingcoronaviruscovid19infectionintheuk/1july2021> (accessed Aug 29, 2021).
- Yang T, Yang Y, Wang D, et al. The clinical value of cytokines in chronic fatigue syndrome. *J Transl Med* 2019; **17**: 213.
- To KK-W, Hung IF-N, Ip JD, et al. COVID-19 re-infection by a phylogenetically distinct SARS-coronavirus-2 strain confirmed by whole genome sequencing. *Clin Infect Dis* 2020; published online Aug 25. <https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/ciaa1275>.

### Authors' reply

Yan-Jie Zhao and colleagues and Chengliang Yang and colleagues all recommend specific questionnaires to evaluate depression and anxiety symptoms in hospital survivors with COVID-19 1 year after onset.<sup>1</sup> We agree that the professional questionnaires could provide the actual prevalence of psychiatric symptoms. However, these questionnaires are somewhat complex and time-consuming. It is challenging to integrate all these assessments into our follow-up study.<sup>1</sup> The EuroQol five-dimension five-level (EQ-5D-5L) questionnaire is commonly used to assess the quality of life from five domains in clinical studies. The EQ-5D-5L questionnaire used in our research is from the Chinese version of the EQ-5D user guide.<sup>2</sup> Zhao and colleagues point out that the EQ-5D-5L