

ADOPTED: 4 July 2023

doi: 10.2903/j.efsa.2023.8154

## Assessment of the feed additive consisting of *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* (formerly *Lactobacillus plantarum*) NCIMB 30083 for all animal species for the renewal of its authorisation (Chr. Hansen A/S)

EFSA Panel on Additives and Products or Substances used in Animal Feed (FEEDAP), Vasileios Bampidis, Giovanna Azimonti, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Henrik Christensen, Birgit Dusemund, Mojca Durjava, Maryline Kouba, Marta López-Alonso, Secundino López Puente, Francesca Marcon, Baltasar Mayo, Alena Pechová, Mariana Petkova, Fernando Ramos, Yolanda Sanz, Roberto Edoardo Villa, Ruud Woutersen, Maria Saarela, Montserrat Anguita, Natalia Alija Novo, Nicole Bozzi, Rosella Brozzi, Joana P Firmino, Yolanda García-Cazorla, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Joana Revez and Angelica Amaduzzi

### Abstract

Following a request from the European Commission, the Panel on Additives and Products or Substances used in Animal Feed (FEEDAP) was asked to deliver a scientific opinion on the assessment of the application for renewal of authorisation of *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* (previously *Lactobacillus plantarum*) NCIMB 30083 as a technological additive, silage additive for all animal species. The applicant has provided evidence that the additive currently on the market complies with the existing conditions of authorisation. There is no evidence that would lead the FEEDAP Panel to reconsider its previous conclusions. Thus, the Panel concluded that the additive remains safe for all animal species, consumers and the environment under the authorised conditions of use. Regarding user safety, the additive should be considered as a respiratory sensitiser. No conclusions can be drawn on the skin sensitisation, and skin and eye irritancy potential of the additive. There is no need for assessing the efficacy of the additive in the context of the renewal of the authorisation.

© 2023 European Food Safety Authority. *EFSA Journal* published by Wiley-VCH GmbH on behalf of European Food Safety Authority.

**Keywords:** technological additive, silage additive, *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* NCIMB 30083, safety, efficacy, QPS, renewal

**Requestor:** European Commission

**Question number:** EFSA-Q-2022-00317

**Correspondence:** [feedap@efsa.europa.eu](mailto:feedap@efsa.europa.eu)

**Panel members:** Vasileios Bampidis, Giovanna Azimonti, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Henrik Christensen, Birgit Dusemund, Mojca Durjava, Maryline Kouba, Marta López-Alonso, Secundino López Puente, Francesca Marcon, Baltasar Mayo, Alena Pechová, Mariana Petkova, Fernando Ramos, Yolanda Sanz, Roberto Edoardo Villa and Ruud Woutersen

**Legal notice:** The scientific output published implements EFSA's decision on the confidentiality requests submitted on specific items. As certain items have been awarded confidential status by EFSA, they are consequently withheld from public disclosure by redaction.

**Declaration of interest:** If you wish to access the declaration of interests of any expert contributing to an EFSA scientific assessment, please contact [interestmanagement@efsa.europa.eu](mailto:interestmanagement@efsa.europa.eu).

**Suggested citation:** EFSA FEEDAP Panel (EFSA Panel on Additives and Products or Substances used in Animal Feed), Bampidis, V., Azimonti, G., Bastos, M. L., Christensen, H., Dusemund, B., Durjava, M., Kouba, M., López-Alonso, M., López Puente, S., Marcon, F., Mayo, B., Pechová, A., Petkova, M., Ramos, F., Sanz, Y., Villa, R. E., Woutersen, R., Saarela, M., ... Amaduzzi, A. (2023). Assessment of the feed additive consisting of *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* (formerly *Lactobacillus plantarum*) NCIMB 30083 for all animal species for the renewal of its authorisation (Chr. Hansen A/S). *EFSA Journal*, 21(8), 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2023.8154>

**ISSN:** 1831-4732

© 2023 European Food Safety Authority. *EFSA Journal* published by Wiley-VCH GmbH on behalf of European Food Safety Authority.

This is an open access article under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution-NoDerivs](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) License, which permits use and distribution in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited and no modifications or adaptations are made.

EFSA may include images or other content for which it does not hold copyright. In such cases, EFSA indicates the copyright holder and users should seek permission to reproduce the content from the original source.



The EFSA Journal is a publication of the European Food Safety Authority, a European agency funded by the European Union.



**Table of contents**

Abstract..... 1

1. Introduction..... 4

1.1. Background and Terms of Reference..... 4

1.2. Additional information..... 4

2. Data and methodologies ..... 4

2.1. Data..... 4

2.2. Methodologies..... 5

3. Assessment..... 5

3.1. Characterisation ..... 5

3.1.1. Characterisation of the additive ..... 5

3.1.2. Characterisation of the active agent..... 6

3.1.3. Conditions of use ..... 6

3.2. Safety ..... 6

3.2.1. Safety for the target species, consumers and environment..... 6

3.2.2. Safety for the user ..... 7

3.2.2.1. Conclusions on safety..... 7

3.3. Efficacy ..... 7

4. Conclusions..... 7

References..... 7

Abbreviations..... 8

## 1. Introduction

### 1.1. Background and Terms of Reference

Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003<sup>1</sup> establishes the rules governing the Community authorisation of additives for use in animal nutrition. In particular, Article 14(1) of that Regulation lays down that an application for renewal shall be sent to the Commission at the latest 1 year before the expiry date of the authorisation.

The European Commission received a request from Chr. Hansen A/S<sup>2</sup> for the renewal of the authorisation of the additive consisting of *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* (formerly *Lactobacillus plantarum*) NCIMB 30083, when used as a feed additive for all animal species (category: technological; functional group: silage).

According to Article 7(1) of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003, the Commission forwarded the application to the European Food Safety Authority (EFSA) as an application under Article 14(1) (renewal of the authorisation). The dossier was received on 19 May 2022 and the general information and supporting documentation are available at <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00317>. The particulars and documents in support of the application were considered valid by EFSA as of 5 December 2022.

According to Article 8 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003, EFSA, after verifying the particulars and documents submitted by the applicant, shall undertake an assessment in order to determine whether the feed additive complies with the conditions laid down in Article 5. EFSA shall deliver an opinion on the safety for the target animals, consumer, user and the environment and on the efficacy of the feed additive consisting of *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* NCIMB 30083, when used under the proposed conditions of use (see **Section 3.1.3**).

### 1.2. Additional information

The additive is a preparation containing *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* NCIMB 30083 is currently authorised for use in feed for all animal species (1 k20736).<sup>3</sup>

EFSA issued an opinion on the safety and efficacy of this product when used in forages for all animal species (EFSA FEEDAP Panel, 2013).

## 2. Data and methodologies

### 2.1. Data

The present assessment is based on data submitted by the applicant in the form of a technical dossier<sup>4</sup> in support of the authorisation request for the use of *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* (previously *Lactobacillus plantarum*) NCIMB 30083 as a feed additive.

In accordance with Article 38 of the Regulation (EC) No 178/2002<sup>5</sup> and taking into account the protection of confidential information and of personal data in accordance with Articles 39 to 39e of the same Regulation, and of the Decision of EFSA's Executive Director laying down practical arrangements concerning transparency and confidentiality, a non-confidential version of the dossier has been published on Open.EFSA.

According to Article 32c(2) of Regulation (EC) No 178/2002 and to the Decision of EFSA's Executive Director laying down the practical arrangements on pre-submission phase and public consultations,<sup>6</sup> EFSA carried out a public consultation on the non-confidential version of the technical dossier from 23 May to 13 June 2023 for which no comments were received.

<sup>1</sup> Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 22 September 2003 on the additives for use in animal nutrition. OJ L 268, 18.10.2003, p. 29.

<sup>2</sup> Chr. Hansen A/S, Boege Allé 10–12, DK-2970, Hoersholm, Denmark.

<sup>3</sup> Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) No 308/2013 of 3 April 2013 concerning the authorisation of a preparation of *Lactobacillus plantarum* NCIMB 30083 and of a preparation of *Lactobacillus plantarum* NCIMB 30084 as feed additives for all animal species. OJ L 94, 4.4.2013, p. 1–3.

<sup>4</sup> Dossier reference: FEED-2022-3271.

<sup>5</sup> Regulation (EC) No 178/2002 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 28 January 2002 laying down the general principles and requirements of food law, establishing the European Food Safety Authority and laying down procedures in matters of food safety. OJ L 31, 1.2.2002, p.1–48.

<sup>6</sup> Decision available at: <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate-pubs/transparency-regulation-practical-arrangements>

The confidential version of the technical dossier was subject to a target consultation of the interested Member States from 5 December 2022 to 6 March 2023 for which the received comments were considered for the assessment.

The European Union Reference Laboratory (EURL) considered that the conclusions and recommendations reached in the previous assessment regarding the methods used for the control of the active agent in animal feed are valid and applicable for the current application.<sup>7</sup>

## 2.2. Methodologies

The approach followed by the FEEDAP Panel to assess the safety and the efficacy of *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* NCIMB 30083 is in line with the principles laid down in Regulation (EC) No 429/2008<sup>8</sup> and the relevant guidance documents: Guidance on the renewal of the authorisation of feed additives (EFSA FEEDAP Panel, 2021).

## 3. Assessment

The product consisting of viable cells of *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* NCIMB 30083 (previously *Lactobacillus plantarum* NCIMB 30083) is currently authorised as a technological additive (functional group: silage additive) for use in silage material for all animal species. This assessment regards the renewal of the authorisation of *L. plantarum* NCIMB 30083 as a silage additive.

### 3.1. Characterisation

#### 3.1.1. Characterisation of the additive

The additive is currently authorised with a minimum content of the active agent (*Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* NCIMB 30083) of  $5 \times 10^{10}$  colony forming units (CFU)/g of additive. The applicant declared that the manufacturing process and the composition have not been changed since the previous authorisation and that no antimicrobials are used during the manufacturing process.<sup>9</sup> The active agent is grown by fermentation and concentrated by centrifugation and filtration. Cryoprotectant agents (17–42%) are added and the cell concentrate is freeze-dried. The final product is a powder containing the freeze-dried cell concentrate (which include a maximum of 6% of fermentation medium, a maximum of 3% of water and 17–42% of cryoprotectants), synthetic amorphous silica as anticaking agent (8%)<sup>10</sup> and maltodextrin as carrier (50–75%), to reach the minimum concentration specified for *L. plantarum* NCIMB 30083.<sup>11</sup>

Analytical data to confirm the specification were provided for nine samples of the additive, showing an average value of  $6.6 \times 10^{11}$  CFU/g additive (range from  $6.2 \times 10^{11}$  to  $7.2 \times 10^{11}$  CFU/g additive)<sup>12</sup>.<sup>13</sup> However, the Panel notes that these samples were obtained from only four independent fermentation batches.<sup>14</sup>

Six recent batches (three independent) of the additive were tested for arsenic (range 0.017–0.051 mg/kg), lead (< 0.01 mg/kg), cadmium (range 0.015–0.034 mg/kg) and mercury (range 0.0035–0.0089 mg/kg). Aflatoxin B1 was tested in the same batches resulting < 0.46 µg/kg.<sup>15</sup>

Specifications are set for coliforms (< 1,000 CFU/g), *Escherichia coli* (< 10 CFU/g), *Salmonella* spp. (no detection in 25 g frozen product or 5 g freeze dried bulk) and yeasts and filamentous fungi (< 1,000 CFU/g). Nine samples of the additive from four independent fermentation batches showed compliance with the respective specifications. The Panel notes that the specification for *Salmonella* spp. detection has been modified and that data from analyses of 5 g instead of 25 g were provided for

<sup>7</sup> Evaluation report available on the EU Science Hub [https://joint-research-centre.ec.europa.eu/eurl-fa-eurl-feed-additives/eurl-fa-authorisation/eurl-fa-evaluation-reports\\_en](https://joint-research-centre.ec.europa.eu/eurl-fa-eurl-feed-additives/eurl-fa-authorisation/eurl-fa-evaluation-reports_en)

<sup>8</sup> Commission Regulation (EC) No 429/2008 of 25 April 2008 on detailed rules for the implementation of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of the European Parliament and of the Council as regards the preparation and the presentation of applications and the assessment and the authorisation of feed additives. OJ L 133, 22.5.2008, p. 1.

<sup>9</sup> Statement\_NCIMB30083\_2023

<sup>10</sup> Currently under evaluation by the FEEDAP Panel.

<sup>11</sup> Sect\_II\_Identity\_L.plantarum\_NCIMB30083\_ID+Charact\_V3.

<sup>12</sup> Samples from common batches were considered as unique batches and their averages were used to calculate the final average of the nine samples.

<sup>13</sup> Annex\_II\_1.3a Batch to batch, Annex\_II\_1.3a\_New\_CoA\_NCIMB30083\_V1, Annex\_II\_1.3a\_New\_CoAs\_NCIMB30083\_V2.

<sup>14</sup> Five samples from one fermentation batch, two samples from another fermentation batch and one sample from two independent batches (one each).

<sup>15</sup> '<' means below the analytical limit of quantification (LOQ).

four out of five batches. In addition, the applicant provided data on Enterobacteriaceae for three batches, with results below the limit of quantification (< 10 CFU/g).<sup>16</sup>

The FEEDAP Panel considers that the microbial contamination and the amounts of the detected impurities do not raise safety concerns.

No new data were provided regarding the physico-chemical properties or stability of the additive. Since no changes were introduced in the manufacturing process, the data described in the previous opinion (EFSA FEEDAP Panel, 2013) still apply.

### 3.1.2. Characterisation of the active agent

*Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* NCIMB 30083 was isolated from silage and it is deposited in The National Collections of Industrial and Marine Bacteria (NCIMB) with the accession number NCIMB 30083.<sup>17</sup> It has not been genetically modified.

The taxonomical identification of *L. plantarum* NCIMB 30083 was confirmed by average nucleotide identity (ANI) determination using whole genome sequence (WGS) data. The ANI value obtained was 99.9% with the type strain *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* DSM 20174<sup>T</sup>.<sup>18</sup>

The susceptibility of the strain *L. plantarum* NCIMB 30083 to antimicrobials was tested using a broth microdilution method and including the set of antibiotics recommended by EFSA (EFSA FEEDAP Panel, 2018).<sup>19</sup> All the minimum inhibitory concentration values were below the cut-off values, except for kanamycin, which was one dilution higher. Exceeding the cut-off by one dilution is considered within the normal range of variation, and therefore, the strain is considered susceptible to all the relevant antibiotics.

The WGS data of the strain were interrogated for the presence of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) genes against two databases. The interrogation was performed with a threshold of [REDACTED] identity and [REDACTED] coverage at protein level with the NCBI Bacterial Antimicrobial Resistance Reference Gene database and at nucleotide level with ResFinder. No hits of concern were identified.<sup>20</sup>

### 3.1.3. Conditions of use

The additive is currently authorised for use in silage material for all animal species. Under other provisions of the authorisation, it is specified that:

- In the directions for the use of the additive, indicate the storage temperature and storage life.
- Minimum dose of the additive when it is not used in combination with other microorganisms as silage additive:  $1 \times 10^8$  CFU/kg of fresh material.
- The additive shall be used in easy and moderately difficult to ensile material.
- For safety: It is recommended to use breathing protection and gloves during handling.

The applicant has requested to maintain the same conditions of use.

## 3.2. Safety

The applicant stated that no adverse effects or incidents/accidents have been reported from the use of the feed additive since the first authorisation of the product.<sup>21</sup>

### 3.2.1. Safety for the target species, consumers and environment

In the previous opinion, the Panel concluded that following the qualified presumption of safety (QPS) approach, the use of *L. plantarum* NCIMB 30083 in the production of silage was considered safe for target species, consumers and the environment (EFSA FEEDAP Panel, 2013). In the context of this application, the identity of the strain as *L. plantarum* was confirmed, and evidence that the strain does not show acquired antimicrobial determinants for antibiotics of human and veterinary importance was provided (EFSA, 2007; EFSA BIOHAZ Panel, 2023). Consequently, the conclusions already reached are

<sup>16</sup> Annex\_II\_1.3a Batch to batch, Annex\_II\_1.3a\_New\_CoA\_NCIMB30083\_V1, Annex\_II\_1.3a\_New\_CoAs\_NCIMB30083\_V2 and Annex\_II\_1.4.2a\_Enterobacteriaceae.

<sup>17</sup> Annex\_II\_2.1.2a Deposit Statement.

<sup>18</sup> Annex\_II\_2.1.2b Identification certificate.

<sup>19</sup> Annex\_II\_2.2.2c Antibiotic susceptibility.

<sup>20</sup> Annex\_II\_2.2.2b AMR genes.

<sup>21</sup> Statement\_NCIMB30083\_2023.

still valid, and the Panel considers that *L. plantarum* NCIMB 30083 remains safe for the target species, consumers and the environment.

An extensive literature search, however, has been performed to support the safety of the *L. plantarum* species and the *L. plantarum* NCIMB 30083 strain. The literature search presented several methodological limitations and, therefore, was not further considered for the assessment.<sup>22</sup>

### 3.2.2. Safety for the user

In the previous assessment (EFSA FEEDAP Panel, 2013), the Panel concluded regarding user safety: 'In the absence of data the potential of the additives to be irritants and/or to act as skin/respiratory sensitisers cannot be totally excluded. [...] Given the proteinaceous nature of the active agent, the additive should be considered to have the potential to be a skin/respiratory sensitiser and treated accordingly'.

No specific data have been submitted for the renewal of the authorisation regarding the effects of the additive on the skin and eyes. Therefore, the FEEDAP Panel cannot conclude on the eye/skin irritancy potential of the additive. The FEEDAP Panel notes that the OECD test guidelines available at present are designed to assess the skin sensitisation potential of chemical substances only and that currently no validated assays for assessing the sensitisation potential of microorganisms are available. Therefore, no conclusion can be drawn on the skin sensitisation potential of the additive. Owing to the proteinaceous nature of the active agent, the additive should be considered a respiratory sensitiser.

#### 3.2.2.1. Conclusions on safety

The FEEDAP Panel concludes that there is no new evidence that would lead to reconsider the previous conclusions that *L. plantarum* NCIMB 30083 is safe for the target species, consumers and the environment under the authorised conditions of use. No conclusions can be drawn on the skin sensitisation, and skin and eye irritancy potential of the additive. The additive should be considered as a respiratory sensitiser.

### 3.3. Efficacy

The present application for renewal of the authorisation does not include a proposal for amending or supplementing the conditions of the original authorisation that would have an impact on the efficacy of the additive. Therefore, there is no need for assessing the efficacy of the additive in the context of the renewal of the authorisation.

## 4. Conclusions

The applicant has provided evidence that the additive currently on the market complies with the existing terms of authorisation.

The Panel concludes that *L. plantarum* NCIMB 30083 remains safe for all animal species, consumers and the environment under the authorised conditions of use. Regarding user safety, the additive should be considered as a respiratory sensitiser. No conclusions can be drawn on the skin sensitisation, and skin and eye irritancy potential of the additive.

There is no need for assessing the efficacy of the additive in the context of the renewal of the authorisation.

## References

- EFSA (European Food Safety Authority), 2007. Opinion of the Scientific Committee on a request from EFSA on the introduction of a Qualified Presumption of Safety (QPS) approach for assessment of selected microorganisms referred to EFSA. EFSA Journal 2007;5(12):587, 16 pp. <https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2007.587>
- EFSA BIOHAZ Panel (EFSA Panel on Biological Hazards), Koutsoumanis K, Allende A, Alvarez-Ordóñez A, Bolton D, Bover-Cid S, Chemaly M, Davies R, De Cesare A, Hilbert F, Lindqvist R, Nauta M, Peixe L, Ru G, Simmons M, Skandamis P, Suffredini E, Coconcelli PS, Fernández Escámez PS, Maradona MP, Querol A, Suarez JE, Sundh I, Vlak J, Barizzone F, Correia S and Herman L, 2023. Scientific Opinion on the update of the list of qualified presumption of safety (QPS) recommended microorganisms intentionally added to food or feed as notified to EFSA. EFSA Journal 2023; 21(1):7747, 23 pp. <https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2023.7747>

<sup>22</sup> Annex\_III\_1.

- EFSA FEEDAP Panel (EFSA Panel on Additives and Products or Substances used in Animal Feed); Scientific Opinion on the safety and efficacy of *Lactobacillus plantarum* (NCIMB 30083 and NCIMB 30084) as a feed additive for all species. EFSA Journal 2013;11(1):3041, 11 pp. <https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2013.3041>
- EFSA FEEDAP Panel (EFSA Panel on Additives and Products or Substances used in Animal Feed), Bampidis V, Azimonti G, Bastos ML, Christensen H, Dusemund B, Fašmon Durjava M, Kouba M, López-Alonso M, López Puente S, Marcon F, Mayo B, Pechová A, Petkova M, Ramos F, Sanz Y, Villa RE, Woutersen R, Anguita M, Galobart J, Muñoz Guajardo I and Innocenti ML, 2021. Guidance on the renewal of the authorisation of feed additives. EFSA Journal 2021;19(1):6340, 14 pp. <https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2021.6340>
- EFSA FEEDAP Panel (EFSA Panel on Additives and Products or Substances used in Animal Feed), Rychen G, Aquilina G, Azimonti G, Bampidis V, Bastos ML, Bories G, Chesson A, Cocconcelli PS, Flachowsky G, Gropp J, Kolar B, Kouba M, López-Alonso M, López Puente S, Mantovani A, Mayo B, Ramos F, Saarela M, Villa RE, Wallace RJ, Wester P, Glandorf B, Herman L, Kärenlampi S, Aguilera J, Anguita M, Brozzi R and Galobart J, 2018. Guidance on the characterisation of microorganisms used as feed additives or as production organisms. EFSA Journal 2018;16(3):5206, 24 pp. <https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2018.5206>

## Abbreviations

CFU	colony forming unit
EURL	European Union Reference Laboratory
FEEDAP	EFSA Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances used in Animal Feed
LOD	limit of detection
LOQ	limit of quantification
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
RH	relative humidity