

# *Bradyrhizobium ivorense* sp. nov. as a potential local bioinoculant for *Cajanus cajan* cultures in Côte d'Ivoire

Romain K. Fossou<sup>1,2</sup>, Joël F. Pothier<sup>3</sup>, Adolphe Zézé<sup>2</sup> and Xavier Perret<sup>1,\*</sup>

### Abstract

For many smallholder farmers of Sub-Saharan Africa, pigeonpea (*Cajanus cajan*) is an important crop to make ends meet. To ascertain the taxonomic status of pigeonpea isolates of Côte d'Ivoire previously identified as bradyrhizobia, a polyphasic approach was applied to strains CI-1B<sup>T</sup>, CI-14A, CI-19D and CI-41S. Phylogeny of 16S ribosomal RNA (rRNA) genes placed these nodule isolates in a separate lineage from current species of the *B. elkanii* super clade. In phylogenetic analyses of single and concatenated partial *dnaK*, *glnII*, *gyrB*, *recA* and *rpoB* sequences, the *C. cajan* isolates again formed a separate lineage, with strain CI-1B<sup>T</sup> sharing the highest sequence similarity (95.2%) with *B. tropiciagri* SEMIA 6148<sup>T</sup>. Comparative genomic analyses corroborated the novel species status, with 86% ANIb and 89% ANIm as the highest average nucleotide identity (ANI) values with *B. elkanii* USDA 76<sup>T</sup>. Although CI-1B<sup>T</sup>, CI-14A, CI-19D and CI-41S shared similar phenotypic and metabolic properties, growth of CI-41S was slower in/on various media. Symbiotic efficacy varied significantly between isolates, with CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CI-41S scoring on the *C. cajan* 'Light-Brown' landrace as the most and least proficient bacteria, respectively. Also proficient on *Vigna radiata* (mung bean), *Vigna unguiculata* (cowpea, niébé) and additional *C. cajan* cultivars, CI-1B<sup>T</sup> represents a potential bioinoculant adapted to local soil conditions and capable of fostering the growth of diverse legume crops in Côte d'Ivoire. Given the data presented here, we propose the 19 *C. cajan* isolates to belong to a novel species called *Bradyrhizobium ivorense* sp. nov., with CI-1B<sup>T</sup> (=CCOS 1862<sup>T</sup>=CCMM B1296<sup>T</sup>) as a type strain.

Cultivated worldwide as a sole crop or in association with short-maturing cereals and legumes, or with long duration crops like cotton, pigeonpea (*Cajanus cajan* L.) is an important source of proteins for many smallholder farmers of developing countries [1]. In Côte d'Ivoire, diverse *C. cajan* landraces are grown for human consumption and animal feed [2], but also as plants to improve soil fertility in savannahs [3], to reduce soil erosion [4], and to serve as intercrops in upland rice cropping systems [5]. As a legume crop that forms nitrogen-fixing symbioses with soil bacteria collectively known as rhizobia, pigeonpea may overcome the low nitrogen levels often encountered in tropical and subtropical fields providing proficient rhizobia inhabit those soils. Although pigeonpea was reported to occasionally associate with fastgrowing strains of the *Rhizobium* [6, 7] and *Sinorhizobium* (*Ensifer*) [8] genera, most proficient symbionts of *C. cajan* are slow-growing strains that belong to the *Bradyrhizobium* genus [9, 10] with *B. cajani* sp. nov. AMBPC1010<sup>T</sup> as the unique type strain that was isolated from a nodule of *C. cajan* during a survey in the Dominican Republic [11].

\*Correspondence: Xavier Perret, xavier.perret@unige.ch

Keywords: Africa; symbiosis; nitrogen fixation; legumes; pigeonpea; root nodules.

003931 © 2020 The Authors

Author affiliations: <sup>1</sup>Department of Botany and Plant Biology, Microbiology Unit, University of Geneva, Sciences III, 30 quai Ernest-Ansermet, CH-1211 Geneva 4, Switzerland; <sup>2</sup>Laboratoire de Biotechnologies Végétale et Microbienne, Unité Mixte de Recherche et d'Innovation en Sciences Agronomiques et Génie Rural, Institut National Polytechnique Felix Houphouët-Boigny, Yamoussoukro, Côte d'Ivoire; <sup>3</sup>Environmental Genomics and Systems Biology Research Group, Institute of Natural Resource Sciences, Zurich University of Applied Sciences (ZHAW), Einsiedlerstrasse 31, CH-8820 Wädenswil, Switzerland.

Abbreviations: ANI, average nucleotide identity; B&D, Broughton and Dilworth nitrogen-free plant growth solution; DDH, DNA-DNA hybridisation; ddH20, double distilled water; ML, maximum-likelyhood; MLSA, multilocus sequence analysis; RMM, Rhizobium minimal medium; RMS, RMM medium supplemented with succinate.

All sequences determined for *Bradyrhizobium ivorense* sp. nov. isolates described in this study were deposited in GenBank/EMBL/DDBJ under the following accessions: dnaK of strain CI-1B<sup>T</sup> (MK376326), CI-14A (MK376327), CI-19D (MK376328), CI-41S (MK376329); glnII of strain CI-1B<sup>T</sup> (MH756157), CI-14A (MH756158), CI-19D (MH756159), CI-41S (MH756160); gyrB of strain CI-1B<sup>T</sup> (MH756161), CI-14A (MH756162), CI-19D (MH756163), CI-41S (MH756164); recA of strain CI-1B<sup>T</sup> (MK376330), CI-14A (MK376331), CI-19D (MK376332), CI-41S (MK376333); rpoB of strain CI-1B<sup>T</sup> (KX388393), CI-14A (MK376334), CI-19D (MK376335), CI-41S (MK376336). Genome sequences for CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CI-41S strains can be accessed via GenBank Assembly accessions GCA\_900696085 and GCA\_900696075, respectively.

Eight supplementary figures and eight supplementary tables are available with the online version of this article.

Initially proposed by Jordan as a separate taxon for slowgrowing root nodule bacteria of legumes [12], the genus Bradyrhizobium now encompasses more than 50 proposed species [13]. Phylogenetic analyses based upon sequences of the 16S ribosomal RNA (rRNA) and several core protein genes, later separated bradyrhizobia species into two main lineages: the B. japonicum and B. elkanii super clades [14]. More recent phylogenetic analyses on larger sets of isolates and gene sequences showed bradyrhizobia strains clustered into more than two discreet subgroups, however [13, 15]. Nevertheless, with more than 30 species the B. japonicum supergroup includes plant associated bacteria as diverse as B. arachidis CCBAU 051107<sup>T</sup> that was isolated from root nodules of Arachis hypogaea in Hebei, China [16]; B. betae LMG 21987<sup>T</sup> from a tumour-like outgrowth of sugar beet (Beta vulgaris) grown in northern Spain [17]; B. canariense BTA-1<sup>T</sup> that nodulated genistoid legumes from the Canary Islands [18]; B. diazoefficiens (previously japonicum) USDA 110<sup>T</sup> that was isolated from a soybean nodule in Florida (US Department of Agriculture, Beltsville, MD); B. iriomotense strain EK05<sup>T</sup> which infected a root-outgrowth of an Entada koshunensis legume in the Okinawa island in Japan [19]; B. japonicum USDA 6<sup>T</sup> that was found in a soybean nodule collected in Japan and entered a strain collection as early as 1929 [20]; the extra-slow growing B. liaoningense USDA 3622<sup>T</sup> (ESG 2281<sup>T</sup>) found inside a soybean nodule collected in the Heilongjiang Province of PR China [21]; B. ottawaense OO99<sup>T</sup> isolated from a soybean field near Ottawa, Canada [22] as well as the *B. cajani* AMBPC1010<sup>T</sup> described above [11]. Together, these nine type strains of the *B. japonicum* lineage already illustrate the diversity, ubiquitous geographic distribution and relative plant promiscuity that characterise many of the bradyrhizobia strains [13].

Yet, as recently noted by Grönemeyer and Reinhold-Hurek [23], our knowledge on the diversity and biogeography of bradyrhizobia species relies primarily on data collected in the Americas, Asia and Europe. For examples, type strains of the B. elkanii supergroup include B. icense LMTR 13<sup>T</sup> isolated from Phaseolus lunatus in Peru [24]; B. macuxiense UFLA03-321<sup>T</sup> found inside a nodule of *Centrolobium parense* in Amazonia [25] and *B. retamae* Ro19<sup>T</sup> identified as a symbiont of Retama monosperma in the Mediterranean basin [26]. A number of recent surveys identified bradyrhizobia in sub-Saharan countries, however, including in Angola and Namibia [27], Ethiopia [14], Kenya [28] and Senegal [29]. In addition, a sampling of six fields in three geographically distant regions of Côte d'Ivoire has led to the molecular characterisation of >80 pigeonpea isolates by matrix-assisted laser desorption/ ionization (MALDI) time of flight (TOF) mass spectrometry (MS) and DNA sequencing [30]. That data indicated that 63 of the 85 nodule isolates (74%) were bradyrhizobia, only one of which (strain CI-41A) belonged to the *B. japonicum* super clade. Hierarchical cluster analysis of mass spectra separated the remaining 62 nodule isolates into a group of 43 strains close to B. elkanii USDA 76T (cluster I strains) and a second group of 19 bradyrhizobia (cluster II), whose taxonomic status was unclear. Phylogenetic analyses reported herein show the cluster II strains to belong to a separate lineage of the *B. elkanii* super clade, with levels of similarity for partial *dnaK*, *glnII*, *gyrB*, *recA* and *rpoB* sequences and genomic average nucleotide identity (ANI) values supporting the designation of *Bradyrhizobium ivorense* sp. nov. as a novel species with CI-1B<sup>T</sup> being proposed as the type strain.

# PHYLOGENETIC CHARACTERIZATION

Although still recognized as universal genetic markers for classifying bacterial isolates, 16S rRNA sequences were occasionally found to be too conserved for accurately delineating bradyrhizobia species [24, 31]. By contrast multilocus sequence analysis (MLSA) of concatenated partial sequences for conserved protein-coding genes has been shown to provide reliable phylogenies, to reflect overall genome similarities and to match DNA-DNA hybridization (DDH) values [32]. MLSA has been repeatedly used for resolving bradyrhizobia lineages and has become one of the hallmark criteria for delimiting novel species (e.g [33, 34].) Similarly, DDH, that was long considered as another 'gold standard' for delimiting bacterial species, has been superseded by the more informative pairwise comparisons of genome sequences [35, 36]. Accordingly, a polyphasic approach was applied to determine the taxonomic status of the 19 pigeonpea isolates of Côte d'Ivoire grouped in cluster II. Isolates CI-1B<sup>T</sup>, CI-14A, CI-19D and CI-41S were selected as representative strains because they originated from different fields and regions of Côte d'Ivoire (Table S1, available in the online version of this article) and possessed protein mass spectra that reflected the genetic diversity existing within cluster II isolates [30]. For long term preservation, 30% glycerol stocks were kept at -60 °C and bacteria were routinely grown in/on Rhizobium minimal medium (RMM) supplemented with 12 mM succinate (RMS) [37], or in/on RMM containing alternative carbon sources when specific metabolic analyses were needed.

For MLSA studies, the *dnaK*, *glnII*, *gyrB*, *recA* and *rpoB* marker genes were amplified using procedures described in Fossou et al. [30] and primers specifically designed for bradyrhizobia sequences (Table S2). Marker genes were sequenced on both strands using Sanger sequencing. The resulting sequences were assembled and manually curated for primers and ambiguities before being archived in GenBank, with their respective accession numbers listed in Table S2. As preliminary analyses showed the pigeonpea isolates to share identical 16S rDNA sequences and to belong to the B. elkanii super clade [30], subsequent phylogenetic analyses included all 21 types strains currently described for this lineage. An additional eight type strains representative of the *B. japonicum* super clade as well as the unrelated *B. oligotrophicum* LMG 10732<sup>T</sup> strain were also included in phylogenies [13]. Together with the associated accession numbers that characterise them, the bradyrhizobia type strains of the B. japonicum and B. elkanii super clades are listed in Tables S3a and S3b, respectively. Except for type strains of the B. erythrophlei, B. ferriligni, B. namibiense and B. ripae species for which no genome data was accessible at the time of writing, all other sequence accessions



**Fig. 1.** Maximum-likelihood (ML) unrooted phylogeny of 16S rRNA gene sequences of type strains of the *Bradyrhizobium* genus and of *B. ivorense* sp. nov CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CI-41S. Sequences were aligned with MAFFT version 7 using the Q-INS-i method. Analysis used the T92 +G+I model, a total of 1182 positions, 1000 pseudoreplicates with bootstrap values>70% shown at branch nodes. Sequences for the 21 members of the *B. elkanii* super clade and *B. oligotrophicum* LMG 10732<sup>T</sup> were 1179 bp long. Except for *B. iriomotense* (1178 bp), sequences for the *B. japonicum* super clade type strains were 1177 bp long. To improve resolution of ML tree, the branch for the *M. nodulans* strain ORS 2060<sup>T</sup> outgroup was truncated. Accession numbers or source for 16S rRNA gene sequences are indicated within parentheses next to the species name, with strains of the novel species marked in bold. Bar represents the expected number of substitutions per site.

were manually curated using as reference the corresponding genomic data, and inaccuracies were highlighted in Table S3b. In the case of *B. ferriligni* type strain CCBAU 51502<sup>T</sup>, the 16S rRNA gene sequence archived under GenBank accession KX683400 (deposited by Li Y. in 2016) was used instead of the KJ818096 sequence (deposited by Yao and Sui in 2014), which diverged too much from other bradyrhizobia sequences to be considered as reliable. DNA sequences were aligned with MUSCLE as implemented in MEGA software version 7 [38], and partial housekeeping gene sequences concatenated with Seaview ver. 4 [39]. Phylogenies were inferred with MEGA 7, with evolutionary trees reconstructed using the maximum likelihood (ML) method [40], a statistical support of 1000 bootstrap replicates and sequences of *Methylobacterium nodulans* strain ORS 2060<sup>T</sup> [41] selected as outgroups. Bestfit nucleotide substitution model was selected according



**Fig. 2.** Maximum-likelihood (ML) unrooted phylogram inferred from concatenated partial *dnaK* (279 bp), *glnll* (540 bp), *gyrB* (588 bp), *recA* (439 bp) and *rpoB* (714 bp) gene sequences of type strains of the *Bradyrhizobium* genus and of *B. ivorense* sp. nov CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CI-41S. The GTR+G+I model was used and included as parameters a total of 2566 positions and 1000 pseudoreplicates, with only bootstrap support values>70% shown at branch nodes. To improve resolution of the tree, the branch for the *M. nodulans* strain ORS 2060<sup>T</sup> outgroup was truncated. Accession numbers or source for sequences are indicated within parentheses next to the species name. Bar represents the expected number of substitutions per site.

to the Bayesian information criterion [42], and similarity levels (uncorrected genetic distances) between concatenated sequences of selected *Bradyrhizobium* species calculated as in Rashid *et al.* [43] and reported in Table S4.

Because pigeonpea isolates CI-1B<sup>T</sup>, CI-14A, CI-19D and CI-41S share identical 16S rRNA gene sequences [30], only CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CI-41S are displayed in the ML phylogenetic trees for that marker. As expected, in the phylogeny based upon 1182 positions of nearly complete 16S rRNA gene sequences that are shown in Figures 1 and S1, the taxonomic position of many of the 21 species of the *B. elkanii* supergroup (e.g. *B. elkanii* USDA 76<sup>T</sup>, *B. pachyrhizi* PAC48<sup>T</sup>, *B. ripae* WR4<sup>T</sup> and *B. tropiciagri* SEMIA 6148<sup>T</sup>) remained unresolved. Yet, strains CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CI-41S always formed a distinct branch rooted in the *B. elkanii* clade of 16S rRNA gene trees, whether a subset of eight representative or 34 species of the *B. japonicum* 

supergroup were included in the analyses (see Figs 1 and S1, respectively). Phylogenetic relationships between the C. cajan isolates and bradyrhizobia type strains was better resolved by applying MLSA using the following partial dnaK (MK376326 to MK376329), glnII (MH756157 to MH756160), gyrB (MH756161 to MH756164), recA (MK376330 to MK376333) and rpoB (MK376334 to MK376336) gene sequences for the C. cajan isolates (see also Table S2). In order to include the same set of 30 type strains used for the 16S rRNA gene phylogeny shown in Fig. 1, individual alignment lengths were trimmed to 279 (dnaK), 540 (glnII), 588 (gyrB), 439 (recA) and 714 (rpoB) nucleotides. As preliminary phylogenetic analyses confirmed that trees for each of the five selected markers were largely congruent (see Fig. S2-S6), individual sequences were combined into a dataset of 2560 bp long concatenated sequences which phylogeny showed CI-1B<sup>T</sup>

Table	1.	Average	nucleotide	identity	(ANI)	values	between
Bradyrł	nizot	oium <i>ivorer</i>	<i>ise</i> sp. nov. C	I-1B <sup>⊤</sup> , CI-4	1S and	type stra	ins of the
B. elkanii super clade with available genome data							

	CI-1B <sup>T</sup>		
Strains	ANIb (%)	ANIm (%)	
B. ivorense sp. nov. CI-41S	96.6	97.5	
B. elkanii USDA 76 <sup>⊤</sup>	86.0	89.0	
B. pachyrhizi PAC48 <sup>T</sup>	85.4	88.6	
B. macuxiense UFLA03-321 <sup><math>T</math></sup>	85.3	88.7	
<i>B. mercantei</i> SEMIA $6399^{T}$	85.2	88.6	
B. tropiciagri SEMIA $6148^{T}$	85.2	88.4	
B. embrapense SEMIA $6208^{T}$	85.0	88.3	
B. viridifuturi SEMIA $690^{T}$	85.0	88.3	
B. brasilense BR $10303^{T}$	84.1	87.9	
B. lablabi CCBAU 23086 <sup>T</sup>	79.7	85.2	
B. jicamae PAC68 <sup>™</sup>	79.4	85.4	
<i>B. paxllaeri</i> LMTR $21^{T}$	79.4	85.4	
B. algeriense $RST89^{T}$	79.2	85.2	
B. icense LMTR $13^{T}$	78.9	85.3	
<i>B. retamae</i> $Ro19^{T}$	78.9	85.2	
<i>B. valentinum</i> LmjM3 <sup>T</sup>	78.9	85.2	

and CI-41S to form a separate, highly supported lineage in a basal position of the B. elkanii super clade (Fig. 2). While concatenated sequences of CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CI-41S shared 98.4% similarity, the highest levels of sequence similarity between CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and bradyrhizobia type strains was with *B. tropiciagri* SEMIA 6148<sup>T</sup> (95.2%), followed by *B. elkanii* USDA 76<sup>T</sup>, *B.* pachyrhizi PAC48<sup>T</sup> and *B. ripae* WR4<sup>T</sup> (95.1%) (see Table S4). Surprisingly, in this study, several type strains shared sequence similarities above the 97% threshold recently proposed to separate bradyrhizobia species, when a similar set of marker genes (atpD, dnaK, glnII, gyrB, recA) was used [24]. For example, concatenated sequences of B. pachyrhizi PAC48<sup>T</sup> and *B. brasilense* UFLA03-321<sup>T</sup> shared as much as 99.1% similarity, while *B. elkanii* USDA 76<sup>T</sup> and *B. pachyrhizi* PAC48<sup>T</sup> genes were 97.8% similar (Table S4), therefore the use of 97% sequence similarity threshold for delimiting potential Bradyrhizobium species requires further investigation. That B. ivorense isolates form a separate lineage within the B. elkanii clade was further confirmed by a phylogenetic analysis of concatenated partial glnII (522 bp) and recA (411 bp) gene sequences of CI-1B<sup>T</sup>, CI-41S and 57 Bradyrhizobium type strains (see Fig. S7).

# **GENOMIC CHARACTERIZATION**

To further characterize the *C. cajan* isolates, draft genomes were obtained for CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CI-41S using paired-end sequencing  $(2\times300 \text{ bp})$  with an Illumina MiSeq instrument at the Zürich University of Applied Sciences (ZHAW). Once isolated via a NucleoSpin tissue kit (Macherey-Nagel, Düren, Germany),

**Table 2.** Differential characteristics of Bradyrhizobium *ivorense* sp. nov. isolates, using as reference strain *B. elkanii* USDA 76<sup>T</sup> that was grown in the same conditions. For comparison, corresponding phenotypes of *B. pachyrhizi* PAC48<sup>T</sup> and *B. tropiciagri* SEMIA 6149<sup>T</sup> were taken from Ramírez-Bahena *et al.* (2009) [52] and Delamuta *et al.* (2015) [53], respectively. Bacterial response was qualified as: +, positive; ±, weak or variable; –, negative; or ND, not determined

		Strains					
Differential characteristics	CI-1B <sup>T</sup>	CI-14A	CI-19D	CI-41S	USDA 76 <sup>T</sup>	PAC48 <sup>T</sup>	SEMIA 6148 <sup>T</sup>
Growth at 35 °C	-	-	±	±	+	+	+
Aesculin hydrolysis	±	-	-	ND	-	±	±
Reduction of nitrate to nitrite	-	-	-	-	+	+	ND
Assimilation as carbon source:							
Arabinose	+	±	+	ND	±	+	+
Glucose	+	±	+	±	±	+	-
Maltose	+	+	+	±	±	±	-
<i>N</i> -acetylglucosamine	+	+	+	ND	±	-	-
Resistant to (µg per disc):							
Ampicillin (100)	+	+	±	-	-	±	ND
Kanamycin (100)	+	+	+	+	-	-	ND
Growth in YM with 0.5% NaCl	+	+	-	+	+	+	+
0.75% NaCl	-	-	-	-	+	+	+

Table 3. Profiles of cellular fatty acids detected in Bradyrhizobium
<i>ivorense</i> sp. nov. isolates $CI-1B^{T}$ and $CI-41S$ and in <i>B. elkanii</i> USDA $76^{T}$
as a reference strain. Reported values correspond to percentages of
the total amount of fatty acid compounds found in each strain. Not
detected, ND

		Strain	
Fatty acid compound detected	CI-1B <sup>T</sup>	CI-41S	USDA 76 <sup>T</sup>
С <sub>12:1</sub> 3-ОН	0.42	ND	ND
C <sub>14:0</sub>	ND	0.50	ND
C <sub>16:0</sub>	9.68	12.31	7.23
C <sub>16:1</sub> w5cis	0.31	ND	0.16
$C_{16:1}\omega$ 7 <i>cis</i> , $C_{16:1}\omega$ 6cis	1.83	1.18	0.55
C <sub>17:0</sub>	ND	ND	0.36
C <sub>17:0</sub> cyclo	ND	ND	1.13
C <sub>17:1</sub> ω8 <i>cis</i>	ND	ND	0.31
C <sub>18:0</sub>	0.40	0.58	0.57
C <sub>18:1</sub> ω5cis	0.47	0.35	0.68
C <sub>18:1</sub> ω7 <i>cis</i>	86.03	81.30	67.88
C <sub>19:0</sub> cyclo ω8 <i>cis</i>	0.86	3.78	21.01
C <sub>20:1</sub> ω7 <i>cis</i>	ND	ND	0.11

genomic DNAs of CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CI-41S were fragmented with a Covaris E220 ultrasonicator, aiming for an average target size of 550 bp. Preparation of sequencing libraries followed the Illumina NeoPrep library system protocol. A total of 5090206 and 1570172 reads were obtained that provided a sequencing coverage of 115- and 36-folds for CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CI-41S, respectively. De novo sequence assemblies were obtained with MIRA version 4.0 [44] using standard settings in accurate mode. This was followed by contig reassembly using SeqMan Pro from the Lasergene genomics package version 12.1.0 (DNAStar, Madison, WI) with Pro assembler parameters and read mapping using SeqMan NGen with standard settings to check for mapping inconsistencies. Sequence contigs were ordered using Mauve 20150226 version 10 [45] and the genome of *B*. elkanii USDA 76<sup>T</sup> as reference. Automatic genome annotation was performed using the Prokka software tool version 1.12 [46]. The main characteristics of the CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CI-41S genomes are reported in Table S5, with individual sequence contigs archived under the GenBank Nucleotide accessions CAADFC020000001 to CAADFC020000044 for strain CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CAADFB020000001 to CAADFB020000059 for strain CI-41S. ANI values between B. ivorense sp. nov. CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CI-41S, and the type strains B. algeriense RST89<sup>T</sup> (PYCM01000000), B. brasilense BR 10303<sup>T</sup> (MPVQ01000000), B. elkanii USDA 76<sup>T</sup> (ARAG00000000), B. embrapense SEMIA 6208<sup>T</sup> (LFIP00000000), B. icense LMTR 13<sup>T</sup> (CP016428), *B. jicamae* PAC68<sup>T</sup> (LLXZ01000000), B. lablabi CCBAU 23086<sup>T</sup> (LLYB01000000), B. macuxiense UFLA03-321<sup>T</sup> (LNCU01000000), B. mercantei SEMIA 6399 (MKFI0100000), *B. pachyrhizi* PAC 48<sup>T</sup> (LFIQ0100000), *B.* paxllaeri LMTR  $21^{T}$  (MAXB0100000), *B.* retamae Ro19<sup>T</sup> (LLYA0000000), *B.* tropiciagri SEMIA 6148<sup>T</sup> (LFLZ01000000), *B. valentinum* LmjM3<sup>T</sup> (LLXX01000000) and *B. viridifuturi* SEMIA 690<sup>T</sup> (LGTB01000000) were calculated with JSpeciesWS [47] using BLAST (ANIb) and Mummer (ANIm) for sequence alignments [48]. Calculations showed that CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and closely related bradyrhizobia type strains shared as highest ANIb and ANIm, values of 86 and 89%, respectively (Table 1). Since both calculated ANIb and ANIm scores are well below the 95–96% threshold proposed for delineating species [48], genomic data also supported the proposal that cluster II *C. cajan* isolates belong to a novel *Bradyrhizobium* species.

# PHENOTYPIC CHARACTERIZATION

Metabolic properties of C. cajan isolates were characterised using a number of assays and *B. elkanii* USDA  $76^{T}$  as the reference type strain. At first, API 20 NE strips (BioMérieux SA, Marcy-l'Etoile, France) were used, with slower growth of bradyrhizobia implying modifications to the manufacturer's protocol as described below. Cells were precultured at 27 °C in RMS [37] to an  $OD_{600}$  of 0.6 then washed in sterile 0.5% NaCl solution. Slots for enzymatic reactions were inoculated with 10<sup>8</sup> cells resuspended in saline solution, whereas ca. 10<sup>7</sup> cells in RMM agar were inoculated onto the various carbon sources included in the assay. Duplicated API galleries were incubated at 27 °C, in a sterile and sealed container with a moist atmosphere, with reactions assessed every second day for at least 2 weeks. When needed, sterile ddH<sub>2</sub>O was added to compensate for evaporation. Utilization of several carbon sources was validated by additional in vitro assays carried out in RMM liquid cultures of 5 ml supplemented with 10 mM succinate or malate, or 20 mM galactose, glucose, fructose, maltose, mannose, pyruvate or sucrose. Cultures were inoculated with 107 fresh cells, in duplicate for each strain, and incubated at 27 °C with shaking, with growth monitored every third day and considered as positive if  $OD_{600}$  >0.2 after 10 days. For growth at different NaCl concentrations, OD<sub>600</sub> was measured every second day for a week. Catalase activity was determined by rubbing colonies onto a glass slide in presence of 3% H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> and checking for presence of bubbles. Oxidase activity was detected by rubbing colonies on a Whatman paper soaked with 0.1% N,N-dimethyl-1,4-phenylenediamine oxalate solution. Sensitivity to antibiotics was determined with large (Ø145 mm) RMS agar plates pre-inoculated with  $10^8$  cells from early log phase (0.2<OD<sub>600</sub><0.4) RMS cultures onto which antibiotic discs were placed at equidistance. Discs contained the following amounts of antibiotics: ampicillin 100 µg, chloramphenicol 500 µg, erythromycin 50 µg, gentamycin 50 µg, kanamycin 100 µg, penicillin 10 µg, streptomycin 250 µg or tetracycline 50 µg. For each strain, tests were duplicated with plates incubated at 27 °C for a maximum of 10 days, with cells considered as sensitive to the antibiotic if a growth halo of  $\emptyset$ >2 mm was observed from the disc edge [49]. Differential growth and metabolic properties of C. cajan isolates and of USDA 76<sup>T</sup> strain are reported in Table 2, with all phenotypic characteristics listed in Table S6.

Strain	Test	Plants	mNN	mNFW (mg)	mSDW (mg)
No inoculum	1	6	0.0	0.0	73.7 (±7.9)*
	2	5	0.0	0.0	83.4 (±33.2)*
Bradyrhizobium elkanii USDA $76^{T}$	1	8	32.0 (±5.8)	898.0 (±227.5)	2176.1 (±471.7)
	2	7	46.0 (±9.4)	1160.6 (±183.0)	2700.4 (±342.7)
$CI-1B^{T}$	1	8	75.1 (±25.3)	1581.1 (±477.2)	2655.0 (±777.7)
	2	8	75.9 (±12.5)	1624.1 (±213.1)	3041.6 (±483.7)
CI-4A2	1	8	59.1 (±18.6)	1050.5 (±377.8)	1876.3 (±449.8)*
CI-4A3	2	8	80.4 (±19.6)	1140.3 (±148.9)	2386.8 (±412.3)*
CI-4C	1	8	75.6 (±17.0)	1534.4 (±357.6)	2718.3 (±600.2)
CI-4D	2	8	100.0 (±35.2)	1208.1 (±286.1)	2230.3 (±404.5)*
CI-14A	1	8	58.6 (±11.4)	925.3 (±210.2)	2112.6 (±527.5)
CI-15A	2	8	35.9 (±8.0)	1184.4 (±140.8)	3027.1 (±574.0)
CI-18C	1	7	46.9 (±17.0)	943.0 (±292.2)	1833.7 (±482.9)*
CI-19D	1	8	36.5 (±7.3)	896.1 (±133.9)	1933.3 (±337.3)*
CI-33F	2	8	62.4 (±18.7)	1033.8 (±245.2)	1637.3 (±355.5)*
CI-35B	1	8	75.4 (±18.8)	910.5 (±203.5)	1765.9 (±426.1)*
CI-41S	1	8	39.4 (±7.7)	492.5 (±113.3)	691.0 (±156.3)*
	2	8	36.5 (±7.3)	896.1 (±133.9)	1155.1 (±403.8)*

**Table 4.** Symbiotic efficacy of selected Bradyrhizobium *ivorense* isolates on the *Cajanus cajan* 'Light Brown' landrace. Strain proficiency is reported as the mean nodule number (mNN), nodule fresh weight (mNFW) and shoot dry weight (mSDW) per plant, with standard deviations shown in parentheses. SDW values marked with an asterisk were found to be statistically different from the corresponding values measured for CI-1B<sup>T</sup> at the level  $\alpha$ =5%

The composition in cellular fatty acids of strains CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CI-41S was analysed at the Culture Collection of Switzerland (CCOS) in Wädenswil (Switzerland) using standard procedures and gas-chromatography-based analyses. As a reference control, the fatty acid composition of the B. elkanii USDA 76<sup>T</sup> type strain was determined in parallel. The fatty acid profile obtained for USDA 76<sup>T</sup> matched well the mean fatty acid concentrations determined for group I B. elkanii strains by Tighe and co-workers [50], with predominant fatty acids being of the  $C_{18:1}\omega$ 7*cis* [67.88% vs. 67.05 (±5.04)% in Tighe et al. 2000],  $C_{19:0}$  cyclo  $\omega 8cis$  [21.01% vs. 19.99 (±3.47)%] and C<sub>16:0</sub> [7.23% vs. 10.49 (±2.35)%] forms. Although CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CI-41S strains contained lower concentrations of C<sub>19:0</sub> cyclo  $\omega 8 cis$  (0.86% in CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and 3.78% in CI-41S), the most abundant fatty acids remained of the  $C_{18:1}\omega$ 7*cis* and (86.03 and 81.3%, respectively) and  $C_{16:0}$  (9.68 and 12.31%, respectively) types. Other differences between the CI-1B<sup>T</sup>, CI-41S and USDA 76<sup>T</sup> strains are the absence in the pigeonpea isolates of the C<sub>17.0</sub> cyclo compound found in USDA 76<sup>T</sup> at 1.13%, and the presence in CI-41S of  $C_{14:0}$  that was not detected in the other two strains. The respective concentrations of cellular fatty acids reliably detected in extracts are reported in Table 3.

To examine the symbiotic properties of *B. ivorense* sp. nov., strains were inoculated onto *C. cajan* cv. 'Light Brown' (see [30]), *Glycine max* cv. Davis, *Macroptilium atropurpureum* 

cv. Siratro, Leucaena leucocephala, Tephrosia vogelii, Vigna radiata cv. King (mung bean), and V. unguiculata cv. Red Caloona (cowpea). Nodulation assays were carried out in autoclaved Magenta jars containing vermiculite and nitrogen free B&D as a plant growth solution [51], using two plants per pot, an inoculum of 2×108 bacteria per seedling and controlled growth conditions of 12h light phase at 10000 Lux and night/day temperatures of 20/27 °C, respectively. Depending on the legume species, plants were grown for 35 to 98 days post inoculation (dpi) with as many as 12 different C. cajan isolates being tested for assessing the diversity of symbiotic responses, for example in function of the geographic distribution of strains. As shown in Table 4, on C. cajan cv. 'Light Brown' symbiotic efficacy of B. ivorense sp. nov. isolates varied considerably, with CI-1B<sup>T</sup>, CI-4C and CI-15A being the most proficient strains when shoot dry weight (SDW) was selected as criterion. When inoculated onto other legume species, C. cajan isolates formed nitrogen fixing nodules on cowpea, mungbean and siratro, pseudonodules on L. leucocephala and few sporadic pink nodules on soybean cv. Davis (see Table S7). Interestingly, on all plant species tested, CI-41S was always the least proficient bacterium, except on T. vogelii on which CI-41S was nearly as proficient as CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and clearly more effective than the promiscuous Sinorhizobium fredii strain NGR234. Together, these nodulation assays confirmed that strain CI-1B<sup>T</sup> was highly proficient on several legume crops cultivated by smallholder farmers in West Africa, including cowpea (also known locally as 'niébé'), mungbean and pigeonpea. In respect to nitrogen fixation genes, CI-1B<sup>T</sup>, CI-14A, CI-19D and CI-41S share nearly identical *nifH* genes [30], with corresponding loci of *B. elkanii* USDA 76<sup>T</sup> and *B.ferriligni* CCBAU 51502<sup>T</sup> strains being the closest in the *nifH* phylogeny shown in Fig. S8.

# DESCRIPTION OF BRADYRHIZOBIUM IVORENSE SP. NOV.

*Bradyrhizobium ivorense* (i.vor.en'se. N.L. neut. adj. *ivorense* referring to Côte d'Ivoire, the country where isolates of this species were collected from *C. cajan* nodules).

Cells are Gram-stain-negative, aerobic, 0.6-0.7 µm wide by 1.1-3.4 µm long rods of size similar to other members of the genus. Generation time of the proposed B. ivorense sp. nov. CI-1B<sup>T</sup> strain was estimated at 14h ( $\pm$ 3h) when cells were grown in RMS liquid cultures and at 27 °C. On RMS agar, colonies are whitish, convex, circular, with 2 to 3 mm diameter after 10 days incubation at 27 °C. Optimal growth was observed at neutral pH, at temperatures comprised between 25 to 30 °C, and at NaCl concentrations<0.5%. Although some growth still occurred at 20 and 35 °C, plates incubated at 40 °C exhibited no growth. Strains CI-1B<sup>T</sup>, CI-14A and CI-19D did not show significant inhibition zones when in presence of all antibiotics tested, at least when challenged with discs containing the following amounts: ampicillin 100 µg, chloramphenicol 500 µg, erythromycin 50 µg, gentamycin 50 µg, kanamycin 100 µg, penicillin 10 µg, streptomycin 250 µg or tetracycline 50 µg. Strain CI-41S was found to be sensitive to ampicillin 100 µg but grew in presence of other antibiotic discs. Strains CI-1B<sup>T</sup>, CI-14A and CI-19D were all positive for oxidase, arginine dihydrolase and urease reactions, while only CI-1B<sup>T</sup> responded weakly to aesculin hydrolysis. These same three strains were all negative for catalase, D-glucose fermentation, gelatin hydrolysis, indole production, nitrate reduction and para-nitrophenyl-BD-galactopyranosidase reactions. Assimilation tests were positive for adipic acid, D-glucose, maltose, D-mannitol, D-mannose, L-arabinose, N-acetyl-glucosamine and potassium gluconate; weak for malic acid, trisodium citrate, phenylacetic acid; and negative for capric acid. In addition, CI-1B<sup>T</sup> and CI-41S were found to assimilate fructose, galactose, malate and pyruvic acid; but apparently could not use sucrose as sole carbon source. Effective nodules were formed on C. cajan, M. atropurpureum, V. radiata, V. unguiculata and T. vogelii but not on G. max and L. leucocephala.

The type strain, CI-1B<sup>T</sup> (=CCOS 1862<sup>T</sup>=CCMM B1296<sup>T</sup>) was isolated from a root nodule of a *C. cajan* plant growing in Kossou-Bouafla, Côte d'Ivoire. The draft genome of the type strain is characterized by a size of 9.4 Mbp and a G+C content of 64.2 mol%. The GenBank accession number of the 16S rRNA gene sequence of strain CI-1B is KX396570, and its draft genome sequence accession number is GCA\_900696085.

#### Funding information

Financial support for this work was provided by the University of Geneva and the Swiss National Science Foundation (grants 31 003A-146548 and 31 003A-173191).

#### Acknowledgements

The 19 *B. ivorense* sp. nov. strains described in this work were all isolated from nodules of pigeonpea collected in fields of Côte d'Ivoire (see [30]). Sampling of the *C. cajan* nodules in fields of Côte d'Ivoire was supported by a research collaboration fellowship attributed by the Centre Suisse de Recherche Scientifique (CSRS) of Abidjan to Adolphe Zézé (AZ) and Xavier Perret (XP), thanks to a donation of the United Nations Development Program. Transfer of *C. cajan* nodules to the University of Geneva and the subsequent genotyping of the rhizobia isolated from these nodules, were subject to conditions described in a Material Transfer Agreement that was signed by AZ and XP on July 12, 2012.

#### Conflicts of interest

The authors declare that there are no conflicts of interest.

#### References

- Varshney RK, Penmetsa RV, Dutta S, Kulwal PL, Saxena RK et al. Pigeonpea genomics initiative (PGI): an international effort to improve crop productivity of pigeonpea (*Cajanus cajan* L.). *Mol Breed* 2010;26:393–408.
- Fossou RK, Kouassi NKI, kouadjo GCZ, Zako S, Zézé A. Diversité de rhizobia dans un Champ cultivé de pois d'Angole (Cajanus cajan L.) Yamoussoukro (centre de la Côte d'Ivoire). Agronomie Africaine 2012;24:29–38.
- Koné AW, Edoukou EF, Tondoh JE, Gonnety JT, Angui PKT et al. Comparative study of earthworm communities, microbial biomass, and plant nutrient availability under 1-year Cajanus cajan (L.) Millsp and Lablab purpureus (L.) Sweet cultivations versus natural regrowths in a guinea savanna zone. Biol Fertil Soils 2012;48:337–347.
- Charpentier H, Doumbia S, Coulibaly Z, Zana O. Fixation de l'agriculture au Nord et au centre de la Côte d'Ivoire: quels nouveaux systèmes de culture? Agri Dév 1999;21:41–70.
- Akanvou R, Kropff MJ, Bastiaans L, Becker M. Evaluating the use of two contrasting legume species as relay intercrop in upland rice cropping systems. *Field Crops Res* 2002;74:23–36.
- Degefu T, Wolde-meskel E, Frostegård Åsa. Phylogenetic diversity of *Rhizobium* strains nodulating diverse legume species growing in Ethiopia. *Syst Appl Microbiol* 2013;36:272–280.
- Wolde-Meskel E, Terefework Z, Frostegård A, Lindström K. Genetic diversity and phylogeny of rhizobia isolated from agroforestry legume species in southern Ethiopia. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2005;55:1439–1452.
- Stępkowski T, Czaplińska M, Miedzinska K, Moulin L. The variable part of the *dnaK* gene as an alternative marker for phylogenetic studies of rhizobia and related alpha *Proteobacteria*. Syst Appl Microbiol 2003;26:483–494.
- Araújo J, Díaz-Alcántara C-A, Velázquez E, Urbano B, González-Andrés F. Bradyrhizobium yuanmingense related strains form nitrogen-fixing symbiosis with Cajanus cajan L. in Dominican Republic and are efficient biofertilizers to replace N fertilization. Sci Hortic 2015;192:421–428.
- Ramsubhag A, Umaharan P, Donawa A. Partial 16S rRNA gene sequence diversity and numerical taxonomy of slow growing pigeonpea (*Cajanus cajan* L. Millsp) nodulating rhizobia. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* 2002;216:139–144.
- 11. Araújo J, Flores-Félix JD, Igual JM, Peix A, González-Andrés F et al. Bradyrhizobium cajani sp. nov. isolated from nodules of Cajanus cajan. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2017;67:2236–2241.
- Jordan DC. Notes: transfer of *Rhizobium japonicum* Buchanan 1980 to *Bradyrhizobium* gen. nov., a genus of slow-growing, root nodule bacteria from leguminous plants. *Int J Syst Bacteriol* 1982;32:136–139.

- 13. Stępkowski T, Banasiewicz J, Granada C, Andrews M, Passaglia L. Phylogeny and phylogeography of rhizobial symbionts nodulating legumes of the tribe Genisteae. *Genes* 2018;9:163.
- Aserse AA, Räsänen LA, Aseffa F, Hailemariam A, Lindström K. Phylogenetically diverse groups of *Bradyrhizobium* isolated from nodules of *Crotalaria* spp., *Indigofera* spp., *Erythrina brucei* and *Glycine max* growing in Ethiopia. *Mol Phylogenet Evol* 2012;65:595–609.
- 15. Avontuur JR, Palmer M, Beukes CW, Chan WY, Coetzee MPA *et al.* Genome-informed *Bradyrhizobium* taxonomy: where to from here? *Syst Appl Microbiol* 2019.
- 16. Wang R, Chang YL, Zheng WT, Zhang D, Zhang XX *et al.* Bradyrhizobium arachidis sp. nov., isolated from effective nodules Arachis hypogaea grown in China. Syst Appl Microbiol 2013;36:101–105.
- Rivas R, Willems A, Palomo JL, Garciá-Benavides P, Mateos PF et al. Bradyrhizobium betae sp. nov., isolated from roots of Beta vulgaris affected by tumour-like deformations. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2004;54:1271–1275.
- Vinuesa P, León-Barrios M, Silva C, Willems A, Jarabo-Lorenzo A et al. Bradyrhizobium canariense sp. nov., an acid-tolerant endosymbiont that nodulates endemic genistoid legumes (Papilionoideae: Genisteae) from the Canary Islands, along with Bradyrhizobium japonicum bv. genistearum, Bradyrhizobium genospecies alpha and Bradyrhizobium genospecies beta. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2005;55:569–575.
- Islam MS, Kawasaki H, Muramatsu Y, Nakagawa Y, Seki T. Bradyrhizobium iriomotense sp. nov., isolated from a tumor-like root of the legume Entada koshunensis from Iriomote Island in Japan. Biosci Biotech Biochem 2008;72(6:1416–1429.
- Kaneko T, Maita H, Hirakawa H, Uchiike N, Minamisawa K et al. Complete genome sequence of the soybean symbiont *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* strain USDA6T. *Genes* 2011;2:763–787.
- LM X, Ge C, Cui Z, Li J, Fan H. Bradyrhizobium liaoningense sp. nov., isolated from the root nodules of soybeans. Int J Syst Bacteriol 1995;45:706–711.
- XM Y, Cloutier S, Tambong JT, Bromfield ESP. Bradyrhizobium ottawaense sp. nov., a symbiotic nitrogen fixing bacterium from root nodules of soybeans in Canada. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2014;64:3202–3207.
- 23. Grönemeyer JL, Reinhold-Hurek B. Diversity of bradyrhizobia in subsahara Africa: a rich resource. *Front Microbiol* 2018;9.
- Durán D, Rey L, Mayo J, Zúñiga-Dávila D, Imperial J et al. Bradyrhizobium paxllaeri sp. nov. and Bradyrhizobium icense sp. nov., nitrogen-fixing rhizobial symbionts of Lima bean (Phaseolus lunatus L.) in Peru. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2014;64:2072–2078.
- Michel DC, Passos SR, Simões-Araujo JL, Baraúna AC, da Silva K et al. Bradyrhizobium centrolobii and Bradyrhizobium macuxiense sp. nov. isolated from Centrolobium paraense grown in soil of Amazonia, Brazil. Arch Microbiol 2017;199:657–664.
- Guerrouj K, Ruíz-Díez B, Chahboune R, Ramírez-Bahena M-H, Abdelmoumen H et al. Definition of a novel symbiovar (sv. retamae) within Bradyrhizobium retamae sp. nov., nodulating Retama sphaerocarpa and Retama monosperma. Syst Appl Microbiol 2013;36:218–223.
- 27. Grönemeyer JL, Kulkarni A, Berkelmann D, Hurek T, Reinhold-Hurek B. Rhizobia Indigenous to the Okavango region in sub-Saharan Africa: diversity, adaptations, and host specificity. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 2014;80:7244–7257.
- Ndungu SM, Messmer MM, Ziegler D, Gamper HA, Mészáros Éva et al. Cowpea (Vigna unguiculata L. Walp) hosts several widespread bradyrhizobial root nodule symbionts across contrasting agro-ecological production areas in Kenya. Agric Ecosyst Environ 2018;261:161–171.
- Wade TK, Le Quéré A, Laguerre G, N'Zoué A, Ndione JA *et al.* Ecogeographical diversity of cowpea bradyrhizobia in Senegal is marked by dominance of two genetic types. *Syst Appl Microbiol* 2014;37:129–139.

- Fossou RK, Ziegler D, Zézé A, Barja F, Perret X. Two major clades of bradyrhizobia dominate symbiotic interactions with pigeonpea in fields of Côte d'Ivoire. *Front Microbiol* 1793;2016:7.
- Willems A, Coopman R, Gillis M. Phylogenetic and DNA-DNA hybridization analyses of *Bradyrhizobium* species. *Int J Syst Evol Microbiol* 2001;51:111–117.
- 32. Rivas R, Martens M, de Lajudie P, Willems A. Multilocus sequence analysis of the genus *Bradyrhizobium*. *Syst Appl Microbiol* 2009;32:101–110.
- Grönemeyer JL, Bünger W, Reinhold-Hurek B. Bradyrhizobium namibiense sp. nov., a symbiotic nitrogen-fixing bacterium from root nodules of Lablab purpureus, hyacinth bean, in Namibia. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2017;67:4884–4891.
- Helene LCF, Delamuta JRM, Ribeiro RA, Ormeño-Orrillo E, Rogel MA et al. Bradyrhizobium viridifuturi sp. nov., encompassing nitrogen-fixing symbionts of legumes used for green manure and environmental services. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2015;65:4441–4448.
- Auch AF, von Jan M, Klenk HP, Göker M. Digital DNA-DNA hybridization for microbial species delineation by means of genome-togenome sequence comparison. *Stand Genomic Sci* 2010;2:117–134.
- Chun J, Oren A, Ventosa A, Christensen H, Arahal DR et al. Proposed minimal standards for the use of genome data for the taxonomy of prokaryotes. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2018;68:461–466.
- Broughton WJ, Wong C-H, Lewin A, Samrey U, Myint H. Identification of *Rhizobium* plasmid sequences involved in recognition of *Psophocarpus*, *Vigna*, and other legumes. *J Cell Biol* 1986;102:1173–1182.
- Kumar S, Stecher G, Tamura K. MEGA7: molecular evolutionary genetics analysis version 7.0 for bigger datasets. *Mol Biol Evol* 2016;33:1870–1874.
- Gouy M, Guindon S, Gascuel O. SeaView version 4: a multiplatform graphical user interface for sequence alignment and phylogenetic tree building. *Mol Biol Evol* 2010;27:221–224.
- Rogers JS, Swofford DL. A fast method for approximating maximum likelihoods of phylogenetic trees from nucleotide sequences. Syst Biol 1998;47:77–89.
- 41. Jourand P, Giraud E, Bena G, Sy A, Willems A *et al. Methylobacterium nodulans* sp. nov., for a group of aerobic, facultatively methylotrophic, legume root-nodule-forming and nitrogen-fixing bacteria. *Int J Syst Evol Microbiol* 2004;54:2269–2273.
- 42. Schwarz G. Estimating the dimension of a model. Ann Statist. 1978;6:461–464.
- 43. Rashid MH-or, Clercx P, Everall I, Wink M, Willems A et al. Average nucleotide identity of genome sequences supports the description of *Rhizobium lentis* sp. nov., *Rhizobium bangladeshense* sp. nov. and *Rhizobium binae* sp. nov. from lentil (*Lens culinaris*) nodules. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2015;65:3037–3045.
- Chevreux B, Wetter T, Suhai S. Genome sequence assembly using trace signals and additional sequence information. *Computer Science and Biology. German Conference on Bioinformatics (CGB)*, 99; 1999.
- Darling AE, Mau B, Perna NT. progressiveMauve: multiple genome alignment with gene gain, loss and rearrangement. *PLoS One* 2010;5:e11147.
- 46. Seemann T. Prokka: rapid prokaryotic genome annotation. *Bioinformatics* 2014;30:2068–2069.
- Richter M, Rosselló-Móra R, Oliver Glöckner F, Peplies J. JSpeciesWS: a web server for prokaryotic species circumscription based on pairwise genome comparison. *Bioinformatics* 2016;32:929–931.
- Richter M, Rosselló-Móra R. Shifting the genomic gold standard for the prokaryotic species definition. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 2009;106:19126–19131.
- Martínez-Hidalgo P, Ramírez-Bahena MH, Flores-Félix JD, Igual JM, Sanjuán J et al. Reclassification of strains MAFF 303099T and R7A into *Mesorhizobium japonicum* sp. nov. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2016;66:4936–4941.

- Tighe SW, de Lajudie P, Dipietro K, Lindström K, Nick G et al. Analysis of cellular fatty acids and phenotypic relationships of Agrobacterium, Bradyrhizobium, Mesorhizobium, Rhizobium and Sinorhizobium species using the sherlock microbial identification system. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2000;50:787–801.
- Fumeaux C, Bakkou N, Kopćinska J, Golinowski W, Westenberg DJ et al. Functional analysis of the nifQdctA1y4vGHIJ operon of Sinorhizobium fredii strain NGR234 using a transposon with a NifAdependent read-out promoter. Microbiology 2011;157:2745–2758.
- Ramírez-Bahena MH, Peix A, Rivas R, Camacho M, Rodríguez-Navarro DN et al. Bradyrhizobium pachyrhizi sp. nov. and Bradyrhizobium jicamae sp. nov., isolated from effective nodules of Pachyrhizus erosus. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2009;59:1929–1934.
- 53. Delamuta JRM, Ribeiro RA, Ormeño-Orrillo E, Parma MM, Melo IS et al. Bradyrhizobium tropiciagri sp. nov. and Bradyrhizobium embrapense sp. nov., nitrogen-fixing symbionts of tropical forage legumes. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2015;65:4424–4433.

#### Five reasons to publish your next article with a Microbiology Society journal

- 1. The Microbiology Society is a not-for-profit organization.
- 2. We offer fast and rigorous peer review average time to first decision is 4–6 weeks.
- 3. Our journals have a global readership with subscriptions held in research institutions around the world.
- 4. 80% of our authors rate our submission process as 'excellent' or 'very good'.
- 5. Your article will be published on an interactive journal platform with advanced metrics.

#### Find out more and submit your article at microbiologyresearch.org.