

REVIEW ARTICLE

## Antibiotic resistance in wild birds

JONAS BONNEDAHL<sup>1</sup> & JOSEF D. JÄRHULT<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Infectious Diseases, Kalmar County Hospital, Sweden and Zoonotic Ecology and Epidemiology, Faculty of Health and Life Sciences, Linnaeus University, Kalmar, Sweden, and <sup>2</sup>Section for Infectious Diseases, Department of Medical Sciences, Uppsala University, Sweden

### Abstract

Wild birds have been postulated as sentinels, reservoirs, and potential spreaders of antibiotic resistance. Antibiotic-resistant bacteria have been isolated from a multitude of wild bird species. Several studies strongly indicate transmission of resistant bacteria from human rest products to wild birds. There is evidence suggesting that wild birds can spread resistant bacteria through migration and that resistant bacteria can be transmitted from birds to humans and vice versa. Through further studies of the spatial and temporal distribution of resistant bacteria in wild birds, we can better assess their role and thereby help to mitigate the increasing global problem of antibiotic resistance.

**Key words:** Antibiotic resistant bacteria, avian, bird migration, environment, ESBL, human–animal interface, transmission

Wild birds are important with regard to antibiotic resistance in several different ways: 1) As sentinels, mirroring human activity and its impact on the environment because of the diverse ecological niches of birds and as they easily pick up human and environmental bacteria. 2) As a reservoir and melting pot of antibiotic-resistant bacteria and resistance genes. 3) As potential spreaders of antibiotic resistance through the ability to migrate long distances in short periods of time. 4) As a possible source of antibiotic-resistant bacteria colonizing and/or infecting human beings.

### Isolation of antibiotic-resistant bacteria from wild birds

The first antibiotic-resistant bacteria noted in wildlife were in fact from wild birds—strains of *Escherichia coli* resistant to multiple antibiotics, e.g. chloramphenicol—were isolated in pigeons around 1975 (1). Not until 10 years later were the famous studies with baboons in South Africa performed, where the degree

of antibiotic resistance carriage among baboons was correlated with the degree of human interactivity (2).

Many bird species have been found to carry antibiotic-resistant bacteria. Resistant *E. coli* have been isolated from ducks and geese (3–6), cormorants (7,8), birds of prey (9,10), gulls (6,8,11–15), doves (1,16), and passerines (17–22).

Extended spectrum  $\beta$ -lactamase (ESBL)-producing *E. coli* were first isolated from wild birds in 2006 (23). In recent years, many reports have followed, mostly from Europe (10,12,15,24–29). ESBL-producing *E. coli* have now been isolated from wild birds from all continents of the world except Australia and Antarctica.

### Wild birds as sentinels for antibiotic resistance

Many factors contribute to the prevalence of antibiotic resistance among wild birds in a certain geographic location. Probably, several characteristics of an area are more important than its actual location in the world. Natural preservation state, livestock and human densities, and the remoteness of an area have been postulated as important factors (30).

Correspondence: Josef D. Järhult, Department of Medical Sciences, Entrance 34/Infectious Diseases, Uppsala Academic Hospital, SE-751 85, Uppsala, Sweden.  
E-mail: josef.jarhult@medsci.uu.se

(Received 1 January 2014; accepted 13 March 2014)

ISSN 0300-9734 print/ISSN 2000-1967 online © 2014 Informa Healthcare  
DOI: 10.3109/03009734.2014.905663

Furthermore, levels of resistance seem to correlate with the degree of association to human activities (30,31). Contaminated habitats where antibiotic-resistant bacteria have been frequently isolated include intensively managed livestock farms, landfills, and waste-water treatment facilities (9,13,32). Gulls have been found to carry the same strains of *E. coli* as can be isolated from landfills and waste-water treatment plants, which demonstrates the possibility of transmission between sewage and birds (33). Another example of the association between waste/sewage and birds is red-billed crows (*Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax*) that feed on soil invertebrates and thus can pick up antibiotic-resistant bacteria from contaminated manure used as fertilizer. In areas where the spreading of manure is extensively used in agriculture, resistance to multiple antibiotics can be found in bacteria from crows. The resistance profiles of the bacteria resemble those found in pig slurry and sewage sludge from the same area (9). Transmission routes from livestock to birds can be exemplified by the use of *muladares* in Spain—places where carcasses are left for consumption by scavengers. In this way, both antibiotics and antibiotic-resistant bacteria resulting from an intense livestock industry can be spread to birds and environment (9). Aquatic associated species seem, however, especially prone to pick up antibiotic resistance including ESBL-producing strains (34).

### Wild birds as spreaders of antibiotic resistance

Given that birds can migrate long distances in short periods of time and the abundance of reports of carriage of antibiotic-resistant bacteria discussed above, there is a possibility that wild birds can act as spreaders of antibiotic resistance. For humans, the spread of antibiotic-resistant bacteria through travel has been demonstrated (35). There are also examples where wild bird migration has been linked to the spread of pathogens, such as the dissemination of West Nile Virus in the US (36). A study on chickens has demonstrated carriage of ESBL-producing bacteria for several weeks and that ESBL-producing bacteria can be rapidly transmitted between individuals (37). Although this study was performed in a domesticated bird, it is reasonable to believe that also wild birds can carry antibiotic-resistant bacteria long enough during migration with the potential of intercontinental spread of resistance.

A recent study in Chile has shown a prevalence of ESBL-producing *E. coli* among Franklin's gulls (*Leucophaeus pipixcan*) that is more than twice as high as in humans in the same area. Humans and gulls share sequence types indicating transmission, but interestingly gulls also share sequence types with

human clinical samples from central Canada, a nesting place for those gulls suggesting that migration could be a mechanism of dissemination (29). Similarly, the isolation of antibiotic-resistant *Salmonella* strains from black-headed gulls (*Chroicocephalus ridibundus*) just arriving in southern Sweden from non-breeding areas in West and Southwest Europe suggests spread through migration (38). Antibiotic-resistant strains including ESBL-producing *E. coli* have also been isolated from birds from remote and/or preservation areas (39–43). This could be interpreted as possible footprint of human activity, but at least in some cases it seems more plausible with spread through bird migration (39,42). Spread of antibiotic-resistant bacteria to remote areas that are reached mainly by migrating birds could also influence bacterial communities in these fragile ecosystems, as antimicrobial substances are part of the cross-talk of bacteria (30).

### Conclusions

There is ample evidence to suggest that wild birds can carry antibiotic-resistant bacteria and that transmission can occur from human rest products. There are indications of spread of antibiotic resistance through migration of wild birds and of transmission between humans and wild birds and vice versa. As previously suggested, thorough spatial and temporal studies of antimicrobial drug resistance in different natural habitats of wild birds are warranted (39,44). This research can help us to better understand the dissemination of antibiotic resistance in the environment, to understand and potentially be able to decrease spread through bird migration, and to assess the risk of spread of resistance from wild birds to humans.

**Declaration of interest:** The authors report no conflicts of interest. The authors alone are responsible for the content and writing of the paper.

### References

1. Sato G, Oka C, Asagi M, Ishiguro N. Detection of conjugative R plasmids conferring chloramphenicol resistance in *Escherichia coli* isolated from domestic and feral pigeons and crows. *Zentralbl Bakteriol Orig A*. 1978;241:407–17.
2. Rolland RM, Hausfater G, Marshall B, Levy SB. Antibiotic-resistant bacteria in wild primates: increased prevalence in baboons feeding on human refuse. *Appl Environ Microbiol*. 1985;49:791–4.
3. Cole D, Drum DJ, Stalknecht DE, White DG, Lee MD, Ayers S, et al. Free-living Canada geese and antimicrobial resistance. *Emerg Infect Dis*. 2005;11:935–8.

4. Fallacara DM, Monahan CM, Morishita TY, Wack RF. Fecal shedding and antimicrobial susceptibility of selected bacterial pathogens and a survey of intestinal parasites in free-living waterfowl. *Avian Dis.* 2001;45:128–35.
5. Middleton JH, Ambrose A. Enumeration and antibiotic resistance patterns of fecal indicator organisms isolated from migratory Canada geese (*Branta canadensis*). *J Wildl Dis.* 2005;41:334–41.
6. Tsubokura M, Matsumoto A, Otsuki K, Animas SB, Sanekata T. Drug resistance and conjugative R plasmids in *Escherichia coli* strains isolated from migratory waterfowl. *J Wildl Dis.* 1995;31:352–7.
7. Dobbin G, Hariharan H, Daoust PY, Hariharan S, Heaney S, Coles M, et al. Bacterial flora of free-living double-crested cormorant (*Phalacrocorax auritus*) chicks on Prince Edward Island, Canada, with reference to enteric bacteria and antibiotic resistance. *Comp Immunol Microbiol Infect Dis.* 2005;28:71–82.
8. Rose JM, Gast RJ, Bogomolni A, Ellis JC, Lentell BJ, Touhey K, et al. Occurrence and patterns of antibiotic resistance in vertebrates off the Northeastern United States coast. *FEMS Microbiol Ecol.* 2009;67:421–31.
9. Blanco G, Lemus JA, Grande J, Gangoso L, Grande JM, Donazar JA, et al. Geographical variation in cloacal microflora and bacterial antibiotic resistance in a threatened avian scavenger in relation to diet and livestock farming practices. *Environ Microbiol.* 2007;9:1738–49.
10. Costa D, Poeta P, Saenz Y, Vinue L, Coelho AC, Matos M, et al. Mechanisms of antibiotic resistance in *Escherichia coli* isolates recovered from wild animals. *Microb Drug Resist.* 2008;14:71–7.
11. Camarda A, Circella E, Pennelli D, Madio A. Wild birds as biological indicators of environmental pollution: biotyping and antimicrobial resistance patterns of *Escherichia coli* isolated from Audouin's gulls (*Larus Audouinii*) living in the Bay of Gallipoli (Italy). *Ital J Anim Sci.* 2006;5:287–90.
12. Dolejska M, Biersova B, Kohoutova L, Literak I, Cizek A. Antibiotic-resistant *Salmonella* and *Escherichia coli* isolates with integrons and extended-spectrum beta-lactamases in surface water and sympatric black-headed gulls. *J Appl Microbiol.* 2009;106:1941–50.
13. Dolejska M, Cizek A, Literak I. High prevalence of antimicrobial-resistant genes and integrons in *Escherichia coli* isolates from black-headed gulls in the Czech Republic. *J Appl Microbiol.* 2007;103:11–19.
14. Gionechetti F, Zucca P, Gombac F, Monti-Bragadin C, Lagatolla C, Tonin E, et al. Characterization of antimicrobial resistance and class 1 integrons in Enterobacteriaceae isolated from Mediterranean herring gulls (*Larus cachinnans*). *Microb Drug Resist.* 2008;14:93–9.
15. Poeta P, Radhouani H, Igrejas G, Goncalves A, Carvalho C, Rodrigues J, et al. Seagulls of the Berlengas natural reserve of Portugal as carriers of fecal *Escherichia coli* harboring CTX-M and TEM extended-spectrum beta-lactamases. *Appl Environ Microbiol.* 2008;74:7439–41.
16. Radimersky T, Frolkova P, Janoszowska D, Dolejska M, Svec P, Roubalova E, et al. Antibiotic resistance in faecal bacteria (*Escherichia coli*, *Enterococcus* spp.) in feral pigeons. *J Appl Microbiol.* 2010;109:1687–95.
17. Blanco G, Lemus JA, Grande J. Microbial pollution in wildlife: linking agricultural manuring and bacterial antibiotic resistance in red-billed choughs. *Environ Res.* 2009;109:405–12.
18. Dolejska M, Senk D, Cizek A, Rybarikova J, Sychra O, Literak I. Antimicrobial resistant *Escherichia coli* isolates in cattle and house sparrows on two Czech dairy farms. *Res Vet Sci.* 2008;85:491–4.
19. Literak I, Vanko R, Dolejska M, Cizek A, Karpiskova R. Antibiotic resistant *Escherichia coli* and *Salmonella* in Russian rooks (*Corvus frugilegus*) wintering in the Czech Republic. *Lett Appl Microbiol.* 2007;45:616–21.
20. Livermore DM, Warner M, Hall LM, Enne VI, Projan SJ, Dunman PM, et al. Antibiotic resistance in bacteria from magpies (*Pica pica*) and rabbits (*Oryctolagus cuniculus*) from west Wales. *Environ Microbiol.* 2001;3:658–61.
21. Nakamura M, Yoshimura H, Koeda T. Drug resistance and R plasmids of *Escherichia coli* strains isolated from six species of wild birds. *Nippon Juigaku Zasshi.* 1982;44:465–71.
22. Rybarikova J, Dolejska M, Materna D, Literak I, Cizek A. Phenotypic and genotypic characteristics of antimicrobial resistant *Escherichia coli* isolated from symbiotic flies, cattle and sympatric insectivorous house martins from a farm in the Czech Republic (2006–2007). *Res Vet Sci.* 2010;89:179–83.
23. Costa D, Poeta P, Saenz Y, Vinue L, Rojo-Bezares B, Jouini A, et al. Detection of *Escherichia coli* harbouring extended-spectrum beta-lactamases of the CTX-M, TEM and SHV classes in faecal samples of wild animals in Portugal. *J Antimicrob Chemother.* 2006;58:1311–12.
24. Bonnedahl J, Drobni M, Gauthier-Clerc M, Hernandez J, Granholm S, Kayser Y, et al. Dissemination of *Escherichia coli* with CTX-M type ESBL between humans and yellow-legged gulls in the south of France. *PLoS One.* 2009;4:e5958.
25. Bonnedahl J, Drobni P, Johansson A, Hernandez J, Melhus A, Stedt J, et al. Characterization, and comparison, of human clinical and black-headed gull (*Larus ridibundus*) extended-spectrum beta-lactamase-producing bacterial isolates from Kalmar, on the southeast coast of Sweden. *J Antimicrob Chemother.* 2010;65:1939–44.
26. Literak I, Dolejska M, Rybarikova J, Cizek A, Strejckova P, Vyskocilova M, et al. Highly variable patterns of antimicrobial resistance in commensal *Escherichia coli* isolates from pigs, sympatric rodents, and flies. *Microb Drug Resist.* 2009;15:229–37.
27. Simoes RR, Poirel L, Da Costa PM, Nordmann P. Seagulls and beaches as reservoirs for multidrug-resistant *Escherichia coli*. *Emerg Infect Dis.* 2010;16:110–12.
28. Wallensten A, Hernandez J, Ardiles K, Gonzalez-Acuna D, Drobni M, Olsen B. Extended spectrum beta-lactamases detected in *Escherichia coli* from gulls in Stockholm, Sweden. *Infect Ecol Epidemiol.* 2011;1:7030.
29. Hernandez J, Johansson A, Stedt J, Bengtsson S, Porczak A, Granholm S, et al. Characterization and comparison of extended-spectrum beta-lactamase (ESBL) resistance genotypes and population structure of *Escherichia coli* isolated from Franklin's gulls (*Leucophaeus pipixcan*) and humans in Chile. *PLoS One.* 2013;8:e76150.
30. Allen HK, Donato J, Wang HH, Cloud-Hansen KA, Davies J, Handelsman J. Call of the wild: antibiotic resistance genes in natural environments. *Nat Rev Microbiol.* 2010;8:251–9.
31. Skurnik D, Ruimy R, Andreumont A, Amorin C, Rouquet P, Picard B, et al. Effect of human vicinity on antimicrobial resistance and integrons in animal faecal *Escherichia coli*. *J Antimicrob Chemother.* 2006;57:1215–19.
32. Cizek A, Dolejska M, Karpiskova R, Dedicova D, Literak I. Wild black-headed gulls (*Larus ridibundus*) as an environmental reservoir of *Salmonella* strains resistant to antimicrobial drugs. *Eur J Wildl Res.* 2007;53:55–60.
33. Nelson M, Jones SH, Edwards C, Ellis JC. Characterization of *Escherichia coli* populations from gulls, landfill trash, and wastewater using ribotyping. *Dis Aquat Organ.* 2008;81:53–63.

34. Veldman K, van Tulden P, Kant A, Testerink J, Mevius D. Characteristics of cefotaxime-resistant *Escherichia coli* from wild birds in The Netherlands. *Appl Environ Microbiol.* 2013;79:7556–61.
35. Peirano G, Asensi MD, Pitondo-Silva A, Pitout JD. Molecular characteristics of extended-spectrum beta-lactamase-producing *Escherichia coli* from Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. *Clin Microbiol Infect.* 2011;17:1039–43.
36. Reed KD, Meece JK, Henkel JS, Shukla SK. Birds, migration and emerging zoonoses: west nile virus, lyme disease, influenza A and enteropathogens. *Clin Med Res.* 2003;1:5–12.
37. Le Devendec L, Boudier A, Dheilly A, Hellard G, Kempf I. Persistence and spread of qnr, extended-spectrum beta-lactamase, and ampC resistance genes in the digestive tract of chickens. *Microb Drug Resist.* 2011;17:129–34.
38. Palmgren H, Sellin M, Bergstrom S, Olsen B. Enteropathogenic bacteria in migrating birds arriving in Sweden. *Scand J Infect Dis.* 1997;29:565–8.
39. Hernandez J, Bonnedahl J, Eliasson I, Wallensten A, Comstedt P, Johansson A, et al. Globally disseminated human pathogenic *Escherichia coli* of O25b-ST131 clone, harbouring blaCTX-M-15, found in Glaucous-winged gull at remote Commander Islands, Russia. *Environ Microbiol Rep.* 2010;2:329–32.
40. Pinto L, Radhouani H, Coelho C, Martins da Costa P, Simoes R, Brandao RM, et al. Genetic detection of extended-spectrum beta-lactamase-containing *Escherichia coli* isolates from birds of prey from Serra da Estrela Natural Reserve in Portugal. *Appl Environ Microbiol.* 2010;76:4118–20.
41. Drobni M, Bonnedahl J, Hernandez J, Haemig P, Olsen B. Vancomycin-resistant enterococci, Point Barrow, Alaska, USA. *Emerg Infect Dis.* 2009;15:838–9.
42. Sjolund M, Bengtsson S, Bonnedahl J, Hernandez J, Olsen B, Kahlmeter G. Antimicrobial susceptibility in *Escherichia coli* of human and avian origin—a comparison of wild-type distributions. *Clin Microbiol Infect.* 2009;15:461–5.
43. Guenther S, Aschenbrenner K, Stamm I, Bethe A, Semmler T, Stubbe A, et al. Comparable high rates of extended-spectrum-beta-lactamase-producing *Escherichia coli* in birds of prey from Germany and Mongolia. *PLoS One.* 2012;7:e53039.
44. Gilliver MA, Bennett M, Begon M, Hazel SM, Hart CA. Antibiotic resistance found in wild rodents. *Nature.* 1999;401:233–4.