

Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active. ELSEVIER

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

Digestive and Liver Disease



journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/dld

Meta-Analysis

Safety of SARS-CoV-2 vaccination in patients with inflammatory bowel disease: A systematic review and meta-analysis



Deepak James^{a,1}, Anuraag Jena^{a,1}, Pardhu Neelam Bharath^a, Arup Choudhury^a, Anupam K. Singh^a, Shaji Sebastian^b, Vishal Sharma^{a,*}

^a Department of Gastroenterology, Postgraduate Institute of Medical Education and Research, Chandigarh, India ^b Hull University Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust, Hull, UK

ARTICLE INFO

Article history: Received 26 December 2021 Accepted 15 March 2022 Available online 22 March 2022

Keywords: Crohn's disease SARS-CoV-2 Side-effect Ulcerative colitis

ABSTRACT

Introduction: Risk of adverse effects and flare of inflammatory bowel disease (IBD) are frequently cited reasons for COVID-19 vaccine hesitancy.

Methods: Electronic databases were searched to identify studies reporting the use of COVID-19 vaccine in IBD. We selected studies reporting the incidence of various adverse effects (local or systemic) and flares of IBD after COVID-19 vaccination. The pooled incidence rates for various adverse effects, stratified for the dose and the type of vaccine (adenoviral or mRNA) were estimated.

Results: Nine studies (16 vaccination cohorts) were included. The pooled incidence rate of overall adverse events was 0.55 (95%CI, 0.45–0.64, $l^2 = 95\%$). The pooled incidence rate of local adverse events was 0.64 (0.47–0.78, $l^2 = 100\%$). The pooled incidence rates of fatigue, headache, myalgia, fever and chills were 0.30 (0.21–0.40, $l^2 = 99\%$), 0.23 (0.17–0.30, $l^2 = 99\%$), 0.18 (0.13–0.24, $l^2 = 99\%$), 0.10 (0.06–0.17, $l^2 = 98\%$) and 0.15 (0.06–0.3, $l^2 = 86\%$), respectively. The pooled incidence rates of severe adverse events, adverse events requiring hospitalization and flares of IBD following COVID-19 vaccination were 0.02 (0.00–0.12, $l^2 = 97\%$), 0.00 (0.00–0.01, $l^2 = 27\%$) and 0.01 (0.01–0.03, $l^2 = 45\%$), respectively.

Conclusion: COVID-19 vaccination in patients with IBD appears to be safe with only mild adverse events. Flares of IBD and severe adverse events requiring hospitalization were infrequent.

© 2022 Editrice Gastroenterologica Italiana S.r.l. Published by Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

COVID-19 vaccination is recommended as an important strategy to control the pandemic. Various society guidelines recommend a full course of COVID-19 vaccination along with a booster dose [1– 4]. The management of patients with IBD has been a challenge amidst the COVID-19 pandemic [1]. Regardless of biological therapies or immunomodulators use, the non-live vaccines are generally considered safe in patients with IBD. The trials of the vaccines which led to the emergency approval had excluded patients of both ulcerative colitis (UC) and Crohn's disease (CD). The response to vaccination in patients with IBD on various immune modifying drugs, was variable [5,6]. The concerns regarding adverse events of COVID-19 vaccination increased after reports of thrombotic events following vaccination. The FDA had to issue a statement suggesting that the benefits outweigh the risks. The adverse events following vaccination are an important concern among the patients with IBD

limited information on adverse effects of various COVID-19 vaccines. We performed a systematic review and single-arm metaanalysis on the various adverse events following COVID-19 vaccination in patients with IBD in order to inform the clinicians and patients regarding the (lack of) risks) of COVID vaccination.

2. Methods

This meta-analysis was conducted in accordance with the Metaanalysis Of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (MOOSE) group recommendations and Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidance [9,10].

2.1. Database search

A literature search was done in electronic databases using PubMed and Embase (recent till 17 December, 2021) using the key-

* Corresponding author.

E-mail address: sharma.vishal@pgimer.edu.in (V. Sharma).

^{[7,8].} The concerns include possible adverse events, flaring of the underlying IBD and decreased responsiveness to vaccines. The concern for adverse events has been a major reason for vaccine hesitancy among patients with IBD [7,8]. Despite encouraging data on vaccine efficacy in IBD, there is

¹ These authors contributed equally to this work.

words inflammatory bowel disease, ulcerative colitis, Crohn's disease combined using the operator 'AND' COVID-19, SARS-COV-2 AND Vaccine or Vaccination or Immunization. The detailed strategy is described in **Supplementary Table 1.** The bibliographies of eligible studies were also searched for additional papers. Preprint servers medRxiv and bioRxiv were also searched for any additional papers. The eligible titles were combined and the duplicates were removed. The titles and abstracts were then reviewed by two reviewers (DJ and PB). After screening of titles and abstracts, full text screening was done (DJ, AJ, AC). Any differences were resolved after discussion with a third reviewer (VS).

2.2. Inclusion and exclusion criteria

We included all relevant articles (uncontrolled, single-arm prospective / retrospective studies including abstracts) pertaining to adverse events of COVID-19 vaccines or the language of publication, in the systematic review. We included studies reporting at least one of following outcomes in IBD-

- 1. Adverse events or side effects following COVID-19 vaccination.
- 2. Flare of underlying disease following COVID-19 vaccination.

We excluded case reports, case series (< 10 cases), surveys, reviews, guidelines, editorials and studies which did not report relevant data about adverse events after vaccination. Studies which reported seroconversion rates after COVID vaccination were included in full text screening to look for any additional information regarding adverse events.

2.3. Data extraction

The data was extracted from the appropriate studies by two reviewers (DJ and PB) and any disagreement was resolved by discussion with the third reviewer (VS). The data was extracted irrespective of the type (mRNA or Adenoviral) or dose of vaccine. We extracted data regarding the details of the publication (name of author and location), underlying population (ulcerative colitis or Crohn's disease), underlying disease activity, characteristics of patients (age, gender, concomitant drugs), type of vaccine (mRNA or AAV), number of doses (first or second dose) and details of adverse events.

2.4. Outcomes

We performed a single-arm meta-analysis (pooled data analysis) in absence of control arms. The pooled incidence rates of adverse events after COVID-19 vaccine were calculated. We calculated the pooled incidence rates of both the local and systemic adverse events following vaccination. The definitions of local or systemic adverse event were used as defined in individual studies. We also calculated the pooled rates of flare of underlying disease activity in IBD, severe adverse events and adverse events requiring hospitalization after COVID vaccination. The analysis was performed separately for single and double dose vaccine regimens.

2.5. Data analysis

The analysis was conducted using the R statistical software, version 4.0.1. In addition to it, meta and metafor packages for R were also used [11,12]. The pooled rates of each adverse event was calculated using the random effects model with inverse variance approach. The random effects model was chosen because of the underlying heterogeneity in the studies, included population, vaccines and doses, and the reported outcomes. Subgroup analysis was conducted for calculating the pooled adverse events rate depending on the type and dose of vaccine. The heterogeneity was determined by

 I^2 and P value of heterogeneity. A standard continuity correction of 0.5 was applied when the number of events was zero.

2.5.1. Methodological quality and risk of bias assessment

Two of the investigators (DJ and AJ) independently assessed the methodological quality and risk of bias of studies using the New-castle Ottawa Scale (NOS) for cohort studies [13]. Any discordance in risk of bias, was settled with mutual agreement with a third reviewer (VS). The included studies were rated as having good/ fair or poor quality as per the scale provided along with the NOS table (Supplementary Table 3).

3. Results

The search yielded 429 citations. (Fig. 1, **PRISMA flow chart**) Of the total of 429 studies, there were 95 duplicates. We excluded 302 citations after abstract screening. We obtained 3 further studies after manual searching of the references of included studies. After full text screening of 35 articles, we excluded 26 studies not fulfilling inclusion criteria. Eventually, 9 studies (8 full texts and one abstract) with 16 cohorts were included in the final analysis. The details of the included studies are illustrated in Table 1 [14–22]. The details of the excluded studies with the reason for exclusion is shown in **Supplementary Table 2** [23–48].

3.1. Total adverse events in patients with IBD following vaccination

There were 6 studies (9 cohorts, 3930 patients) reporting adverse events following COVID-19 vaccination in patients with IBD. The pooled incidence rate of adverse events in IBD patients following COVID-19 vaccination was 0.55 (95%CI, 0.45–0.64, $I^2 = 95\%$) (Fig. 2). There were 3 studies (4 cohorts, 2944 patients) reporting adverse events following m-RNA based COVID-19 vaccination in patients with IBD. The pooled incidence rate of adverse events in IBD patients following only m-RNA based COVID-19 vaccination was 0.52 (95%CI, 0.33–0.71, $I^2 = 95\%$) (Fig. 2). There were 4 studies of 1948 patients and 4 studies of 1946 patients reporting adverse events following single and double dose vaccination, respectively. The pooled incidence rate of adverse events in IBD patients following single dose COVID-19 vaccination was 0.47 (95%CI, 0.36-0.58, $I^2 = 93\%$) (Fig. 3). The pooled incidence rate of adverse events in IBD patients following double dose COVID-19 vaccination was 0.57 (95%CI, 0.45–0.69, $I^2 = 89\%)$ (Fig. 3).

3.2. Local adverse events following vaccination in patients of IBD

There were 5 studies (8 cohorts, 9710 patients) reporting local injection site adverse events following COVID-19 vaccination. The pooled incidence rate of local adverse events in IBD patients following COVID-19 vaccination was 0.64 (95%CI, 0.47–0.78, $I^2 = 100\%$) (Fig. 4). The pooled incidence rate of local adverse events following mRNA based COVID-19 vaccination was 0.53 (95%CI, 0.40–0.66, $I^2 = 97\%$) (Fig. 4). The pooled incidence rate of local adverse events following a single dose COVID-19 vaccination was 0.60 (95%CI, 0.32–0.83, $I^2 = 100\%$) (Supplementary Fig. 1). The pooled incidence rate of local adverse events following a double dose of COVID-19 vaccination was 0.71 (95%CI, 0.47–0.87, $I^2 = 100\%$) (Supplementary Fig. 1). The pooled incidence rate of soreness of the arm was 0.52 (95%CI, 0.43–0.60, $I^2 = 98\%$) (Supplementary Fig. 2). Supplementary Table 4 provides definitions for local and systemic adverse events as used in individual studies.

3.3. Systemic adverse events following vaccination in patients of IBD

The pooled incidence rate of fever and chills following COVID-19 vaccination in patients of IBD was 0.10 (95%CI, 0.06–0.17,

Table 1

The included studies with details regarding the included population and vaccination.

Authors Country 1		Type of study	Vaccine type, Vaccination status (Complete/ Incomplete/ Mixed)		iplete/			Number	of pat	ients			Dose breakup		p Adverse events				Follow up duration	
			mRNA	mRNA type	AAV	AAV type	Total	Mean Age (SD) (years)	Female	CD	UC	Disease activity	Drugs	D1	D2	Total	Local	Systemic	Miscellaneous	
Dailey et al. [14]	USA	Prospective longitudinal cohort study	28 Mixed	21 - Pfizer- BioNTech 7 - Moderna	5 Complete	Johnson & Johnson 5	33	NA	NA	NA	NA	Not mentioned	NA	33	28	NA	NA	NA	NA	2 weeks to 6 months
Botwin et al [15]	. USA	Prospective longitudinal study	246 Mixed	141- Pfizer- BioNTech, 105 - Moderna	0	0	246	47.4 (15.5)	139	165	81	Not mentioned	Oral/ rectal Sulfasalazine/ mesalamine, Budesonide, Oral/ parenteral steroids, 6MP/ Azathioprine, Methotrexate, Anti TNF, Anti integrin, IL12/23 inhibitor, IAK inhibitor	246	NA	96	93	NA	NA	At least 7 days
Wong et al. [16]	USA	Longitudinal nested case-control study	48 Mixed	23 – Pfizer- BioNTech, 25 -NIH-Moderna	0	0	48	49.1 (20.2)	25	23	25	Not mentioned	Infliximab, Adalimumab, Vedolizumab, Ustekinumab, Tofacitinib, Oral steroids, Immunomodulator, Mesalamine, No medications	48	26	29	19	NA	NA	85 days
Edelman- Klapper et al. [17]	Israel	Multicenter prospective observational study	185 Mixed	Pfizer- BioNTech	0	0	185	38.1(14.3)	73	122	53	120 – remission 65 - active disease	Adalimumab, Adalimumab, Vedolizumab, Ustekinumab, 5-ASA, Steroids, Immunomodulators JAK inhibitor	185	185	Expressed dose-wise				30 days median
Garrido et al. [18]	Portugal	Single center longitudinal cohort study	190 Mixed	141 - Pfizer- BioNTech, 49 - Moderna	49 Mixed	34 - Johnson & Johnson, 15 - AstraZeneca	1 239	NA	NA	NA	NA	Not mentioned	Anti TNF, Ustekinumab, Vedolizumab	239	173	Expressed dose-wise				NA

(continued on next page)

Table 1 (continued)

Authors Country Type		Type of study	y Vaccine type, Vaccinatio Incomplete/ Mixed)		1 status (Complete/				Number	of pati	ients			Dose l	breakup	Adverse ever	nts			Follow up duration
			mRNA	mRNA type	AAV	AAV type	Total	Mean Age (SD) (years)	Female	CD	UC	Disease activity	Drugs	D1	D2	Total	Local	Systemic	Miscellaneous	
Cannatelli et al. [19]	Italy	Prospective study	470 Mixed	320 - Pfizer- BioNTech, 150 - Moderna	18 Mixed	AstraZeneca	488	55.3 (14.4)	270	233	246	397 – remission, 91 – active disease	No treatment, Mesalamine, Corticosteroids, Azathioprine, Infliximab, Adalimumab, Golimumab, Vedolizumab, Ustekinumab, Tofacitinib	488	433	228	Expressed dose-wise	1		NA
Weaver et al. [10]	USA	Prospective observational cohort study	3155 Mixed	1908 - Pfizer- BioNTech, 1247 - Moderna	161 Complete	Johnson & Johnson	3316	43.7 (15.1)	2378	1811	NA	1077 - remission 2239 - active disease	Oral/parenteral steroids, Oral budesonide, Oral mesalamine, Sulfasalazine, Thiopurine, Methotrexate, Infliximab, Adalimumab, Certolizumab, Golimumab, Vedolizumab, Ustekinumab, Tofacitinib, Cyclosporine, Tarcnlimus	3316	3080	Expressed dose-wise				Up to 7 days
Mujukian et al. [21]	USA	longitudinal case control study	1391 Mixed	828 - Pfizer- BioNTech, 563 - Moderna	0	0	1391	NA	873	904	487	Not mentioned	NA	1391	1271	Expressed dose-wise				On Day 7
Classen et al. [22]	Germany	Retrospective observational		Heterogeneous data			72	48.4 (15.2)	38	40	32	Not mentioned, One case was in flare	Steroids, Mesalazine, Azathioprine, Methothrexate, Calcineurin inhibitor, Anti TNF, Anti integrin, JAK inhibitors, Ustekinumab	NA	NA	Expressed dose-wise				NA



Fig. 1. PRISMA flow chart depicting the study screening and selection of the systematic review.

Study	Total Adverse Events	Total			Proportion	95%-CI	Weight (common) (Weight random)
Vaccine = mRNA								
Botwin GJ (m1)et al.	96	246			0.39	[0.33; 0.45]	6.2%	11.7%
Wong SY (mM)et al.	29	36			- 0.81	[0.64; 0.92]	0.6%	7.9%
Mujukian A (m1) et al.	515	1391			0.37	[0.34; 0.40]	34.6%	12.2%
Mujukian A (m2) et al.	705	1271	-	<u>.</u>	0.55	[0.53; 0.58]	33.5%	12.2%
Common effect model	1	2944	\diamond		0.46	[0.44;0.48]	75.0%	
Random effects mode					0.52	[0.33;0.71]		44.1%
Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 97\%$,	$\tau^2 = 0.6254$	1, <i>p</i> < 0	.01					
Vaccine = Both								
Garrido I (B1) et al.	136	239		<u> </u>	0.57	[0.50; 0.63]	6.3%	11.7%
Garrido I (B2) et al.	128	173			0.74	[0.67; 0.80]	3.6%	11.3%
Cannatelli R (B2) et al.	228	433		<u>+-</u>	0.53	[0.48; 0.57]	11.5%	12.0%
Classen JM (B1) et al.	42	72	+	•	0.58	[0.46; 0.70]	1.9%	10.5%
Classen JM (B2) et al.	31	69			0.45	[0.33; 0.57]	1.8%	10.4%
Common effect mode		986		\diamond	0.57	[0.54;0.60]	25.0%	
Random effects mode					0.58	[0.48;0.67]		55.9%
Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 85\%$,	$\tau^2 = 0.1717$	7, <i>p</i> < 0	.01					
Common effect mode	I	3930	\$		0.48	[0.47;0.50]	100.0%	
Random effects mode	el			\sim	0.55	[0.45;0.64]		100.0%
Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 95\%$,	$\tau^2 = 0.3128$	B, p < 0	.01					

Test for subgroup differences (random effects): $\chi_1 = 0.24$, df = 1 (p = 0.63)

Fig. 2. Adverse events following COVID-19 vaccination in patients with IBD subtyped for type of vaccine.

 $I^2 = 98\%$) and 0.15 (95%CI, 0.06–0.3, $I^2 = 86\%$), respectively (**Supplementary Figs. 3 and 4**). The pooled incidence rate of fatigue and myalgia following COVID-19 vaccination in patients of IBD was 0.30 (95%CI, 0.21–0.40, $I^2 = 99\%$) and 0.18 (95%CI, 0.13–0.24, $I^2 = 99\%$), respectively (**Supplementary Figs. 5 and 6**). The pooled incidence rate of headache following COVID-19 vaccination in patients of IBD was 0.23 (95%CI, 0.17–0.30, $I^2 = 99\%$) (**Supplementary Fig. 7**) while for joint pain it was 0.10 (95%CI, 0.06–0.17, $I^2 = 98\%$) (**Supplementary Fig. 8**). The pooled incidence rate of skin rash following COVID-19 vaccination in patients of IBD was 0.01 (95%CI, 0.17–0.10).

0.01–0.01, I^2 =29%) **(Supplementary Fig. 9)**. The pooled incidence rate of gastrointestinal adverse events following vaccination in patients with IBD was 0.08 (95%CI, 0.05–0.12, I^2 = 97%) **(Supplementary Fig. 10)**.

3.4. Severe adverse events following vaccination in patients of IBD

Of the 6 studies (7590 total events) the pooled rates of severe adverse events were 0.02 (95%CI, 0.00–0.12, $I^2 = 97\%$) (Fig. 5, **Top Panel**). There were 5 studies (7 cohorts, 7578 patients) reporting

Study	Total Adverse Events	e Total	Proportion	95%-CI	Weight (common) (r	Weight andom)
Dose = 1 Botwin GJ (m1)et al. Garrido I (B1) et al. Mujukian A (m1) et al. Classen JM (B1) et al. Common effect model Random effects model Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 93\%$, τ^2	96 136 515 42	246 - 239 1391 72 1948	0.39 0.57 0.37 0.58 0.41 0.47	[0.33; 0.45] [0.50; 0.63] [0.34; 0.40] [0.46; 0.70] [0.38; 0.43] [0.36; 0.58]	6.2% 6.3% 34.6% 1.9% 49.0%	11.7% 11.7% 12.2% 10.5% 46.2%
Dose = Mixed Wong SY (mM)et al. Common effect model Random effects model Heterogeneity: not applicab	29	36 36	0.81 0.81 0.81	[0.64; 0.92] [0.64; 0.90] [0.64; 0.90]	0.6% 0.6% 	7.9% 7.9%
Dose = 2 Garrido I (B2) et al. Cannatelli R (B2) et al. Mujukian A (m2) et al. Classen JM (B2) et al. Common effect model Random effects model Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 89\%$, τ^2	128 228 705 31	173 433 1271 69 - 1946	0.74 0.53 0.55 0.45 0.56 0.57	[0.67; 0.80] [0.48; 0.57] [0.53; 0.58] [0.33; 0.57] [0.54; 0.58] [0.45; 0.69]	3.6% 11.5% 33.5% 1.8% 50.4%	11.3% 12.0% 12.2% 10.4% 46.0%
Common effect model Random effects model Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 95\%$, τ^2	² = 0.3128	3930 3, <i>p</i> < 0.0	0.48 	[0.47;0.50] [0.45;0.64]	100.0% 	 100.0%

Test for subgroup differences (random effects): $\chi_2 = 10.30$, df = 2 (p < 0.01)

Fig. 3. Adverse events following COVID-19 vaccination in patients with IBD subtyped for dose of vaccine.

Local Study	Advers Events	e Total			Proportion	95%-CI	Weight (common) (Weight (random)
Vaccine = mRNA Botwin GJ (m1)et al. Wong SY (mM)et al. Edelman-Klapper H (m1)et al. Edelman-Klapper H (m2) et al. Mujukian A (m1) et al. Mujukian A (m2) et al. Common effect model Random effects model Heterogeneity: $l^2 = 97\%$, $\tau^2 = 0.42i$	93 19 134 128 483 657 02, <i>p</i> < 0.	246 36 185 185 1391 1271 3314 01	**************************************		0.38 0.53 0.72 0.69 0.35 0.52 0.46 0.53	[0.32; 0.44] [0.35; 0.70] [0.65; 0.79] [0.62; 0.76] [0.32; 0.37] [0.49; 0.54] [0.44; 0.47] [0.40; 0.66]	3.8% 0.6% 2.4% 2.6% 20.7% 20.8% 50.9%	12.6% 11.5% 12.4% 12.5% 12.8% 12.8% 74.5%
Vaccine = Both Weaver KN (B1) et al. Weaver KN (B2) et al. Common effect model Random effects model Heterogeneity: $l^2 = 0\%$, $\tau^2 = 0$, $p =$	2871 2660 0.80	3316 3080 6396		++ ++ \$	0.87 0.86 0.86 0.86	[0.85; 0.88] [0.85; 0.88] [0.86; 0.87] [0.86; 0.87]	25.3% 23.8% 49.1% 	12.8% 12.8% 25.5%
Common effect model Random effects model Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 100\%$, $\tau^2 = 0.9$	423, <i>p</i> = 0	9710		-	0.69 0.64	[0.68;0.70] [0.47;0.78]	100.0% 	 100.0%

Test for subgroup differences (random effects): $\chi_1 = 39.18$, df = 1 (p < 0.01)

Fig. 4. Local adverse events following COVID-19 vaccination in patients with IBD subtyped for type of vaccine.

Study	SAE	Total			Proportion	95%-CI (Weight (common) (I	Weight random)
Botwin GJ et al	80	246			0.33	[0.27; 0.39]	9.5%	20.0%
Wong SY et al	0	36 -			0.00	[0.00; 0.10]	0.1%	13.9%
Edelman-Klapper et al	0	185 -	-		0.00	[0.00; 0.02]	0.1%	14.0%
Garrido I et al	0	239 -	-		0.00	[0.00; 0.02]	0.1%	14.0%
Cannatelli R et al	2	488 +	-		0.00	[0.00; 0.01]	0.4%	18.1%
Weaver KN et al	558	6396	+		0.09	[0.08; 0.09]	89.9%	20.1%
Common effect model		7590			0.10	[0.09;0.11]	100.0%	
Random effects model		<		-	0.02	[0.00;0.12]		100.0%
Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 97\%$, τ	² = 4.5953	3, <i>p</i> < 0.6	1 1			- Contraction and a second and a second second		
		. 0	0.050.	0.150.20.250.30.35				

Study	Hospitalization	Total	Proportion	95%-CI (c	Weight common) (r	Weight andom)
Botwin GJ (m Wong SY (m Garrido I (B1) Garrido I (B2)	11)et al. 3 M)et al. 0) et al. 0) et al. 0 (P1) et al. 1	246 <u>-</u> 36 <u>-</u> 239 <u>-</u> 173 <u>-</u> 488 <u>-</u>	0.01 0.00 0.00 0.00	[0; 0.04] [0; 0.10] [0; 0.02] [0; 0.02]	13.8% 2.3% 2.3% 2.3%	18.9% 5.0% 5.1% 5.0%
Weaver KN (E Weaver KN (E	31) et al. 10 32) et al. 6	488	0.00	[0; 0.01] [0; 0.01] [0; 0.00]	4.7% 46.6% 28.0%	9.0% 30.8% 26.2%
Random effe Heterogeneity:	ects model : $I^2 = 27\%$, $\tau^2 = 0.2727$	p = 0.22 , $p = 0.22$, $p = 0.02$, $p = 0.04$, $p = 0.08$, $p =$	0.00	[0;0.01]		100.0%
Study	IBD Flare	Total	Proportion	95%-CI	Weigh (common)	t Weight (random)

olddy		iotai		rioportion			unuonij
Dailey J (B1) et al.	0	33	<u> </u>	0.00	[0.00; 0.11]	0.7%	7.8%
Dailey J (m2) et al.	0	28	<u> </u>	- 0.00	[0.00; 0.12]	0.7%	7.8%
Garrido I (B1) et al.	4	239		0.02	[0.00; 0.04]	5.2%	27.3%
Cannatelli R (B1) et a	l. 0	488	<u>—</u>	0.00	[0.00; 0.01]	0.7%	7.9%
Cannatelli R (B2) et a	l. 0	433		0.00	[0.00; 0.01]	0.7%	7.9%
Weaver KN (B1) et al.	. 71	3316	-	0.02	[0.02; 0.03]	92.2%	41.3%
Common effect mod	lel	4537	\$	0.02	[0.02;0.03]	100.0%	
Random effects mod	del		·	0.01	[0.01;0.03]		100.0%
Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 45\%$	$\%, \tau^2 = 0.4537$	7, <i>p</i> = 0	10 1 1 1 1				
			0 0.02 0.04 0.06 0.08 0.1 0.12				

Fig. 5. Top panel: severe Adverse events following COVID-19 vaccination in patients with IBD; Middle Panel: adverse events requiring hospitalization following COVID-19 vaccination in patients with IBD; bottom panel: adverse events causing flare of disease in IBD following COVID-19 vaccination.

adverse events requiring hospitalization in IBD following COVID-19 vaccination. The pooled incidence rate of adverse events requiring hospitalization following COVID-19 vaccination was 0.00 (95%Cl, 0.00-0.01, $I^2 = 27\%$) (Fig. 5- Middle panel).

3.5. IBD flare following vaccination

There were 4 studies (6 cohorts, 4537 patients) reporting flare of disease in IBD following COVID-19 vaccination. The pooled incidence rate of flare of disease following COVID-19 vaccination was 0.01 (95%CI, 0.01–0.03, $I^2 = 45\%$) (Fig. 5- bottom panel).

3.6. Risk of bias analysis

The quality analysis of the included studies was done using Newcastle-Ottawa Quality Assessment Form for Cohort Studies. The results of the assessment are shown in Supplementary Table 3

[14-22]. Of the included studies, two studies were of good quality, three studies were of fair quality and four studies were of poor quality.

4. Discussion

SARS-CoV2 virus, being a mutating virus with emerging variants of concern, vaccination remains the core strategy for control of the pandemic [49]. In the real-world analysis of patients of IBD, adverse events following COVID-19 vaccination were seen in nearly half of the entire cohort irrespective of the dose of vaccine. However, most of these were local adverse events, the majority being injection site related. Systemic adverse events following vaccination were rare with the majority not requiring hospitalization. Fatigue, headache, myalgia, fever and chills were the most common systemic adverse events following COVID-19 vaccination. The findings suggest that COVID-19 vaccination is safe for patients with IBD.

Fear of adverse events especially flare of disease activity in IBD remains a major concern in patients with IBD [7,8,50]. This is one of the important causes of vaccine hesitancy in patients with IBD. A survey in Italy revealed fear of negative impact on the course of IBD was seen in 52% of respondents [51]. To address this, we found gastrointestinal related adverse effects were also low in incidence and a flare of underlying disease activity in IBD following vaccination was seen in extremely small numbers. The data reaffirms the fact that vaccination has minimal impact on the course of disease in IBD.

The risk of adverse events in a survey in China was seen at 88% and was one of the major reasons behind the lack of intention to take vaccines [52]. Other causes include concern that vaccines are being made quickly. The findings of our meta-analysis show a majority of adverse events were limited to injection site side effects. Systemic adverse events were reported only in a small subset. Adverse events of importance like immune mediated thrombocytopenia, Guillain-Barré syndrome, transverse myelitis, stroke, deep vein thrombosis, myocarditis and myocardial infarction were reported in a study and was seen in a minority (2.03%) of patients of IBD [31]. There is a need for close monitoring and reporting of these severe adverse events in patients of IBD.

There were similar adverse events after the first or second dose of COVID-19 vaccine in patients with IBD. The pooled incidence rates were similar between the first and second dose of COVID-19 vaccine. There was only one study reporting about adverse events after the third dose and showed adverse events in 41% of the patients [36]. They found that the adverse events were similar to that of the second dose while post vaccination symptoms were lower than that of the second dose. Data from vaccination in general population suggest that of a cohort with 655 590 doses (mRNA and AAV), systemic side-effects occurred in 13.5% and 33.7% after first dose of mRNA and AAV vaccine, respectively and 22.0% after second dose of mRNA vaccine. Local side-effects were reported 71.9% and 58.7% after first dose of mRNA and AAV vaccine, respectively and 68.5% after the second dose of mRNA vaccine [53]. The local adverse events are comparable to our analysis in IBD patients. We do not have estimates for systemic adverse events overall for IBD patients.

There are some limitations of the study. There is no control arm in most studies. We could not address the impact of age, comorbidities and drugs on the incidence of adverse events by a metaregression largely due to small number of studies (< 10). There were only two studies reporting AAV related adverse events. Lastly, the included studies were not homogeneous with some studies reporting mixed vaccine schedules. The assessment for publication bias could not be done using the relevant statistical tests due to small number of studies. Also, there could be an overlap in certain definition e.g. gastrointestinal symptoms and flare of IBD. We have used the definitions exactly as provided in individual studies (Supplementary Table 4); it clearly shows that some studies consider flares as a component of gastrointestinal symptoms while others considered these as separate entities. Further although we have done subgroup analysis of adverse events after one or two dose, this is not the same as incomplete or complete vaccination. Certain vaccines like Janssen may have a single dose only in the complete schedule.

To conclude, the meta-analysis confirms that COVID-19 vaccine is safe in patients with IBD and not associated with flares of disease. This study should reduce the vaccine hesitancy among the patients with IBD and the clinicians should affirm that benefits outweigh the risks. Future studies should look into adverse events of each vaccine type and critically look into mechanisms of severe adverse events following vaccination. Post marketing surveillance of vaccine related adverse events especially of patients of pediatric population, elderly and with comorbidities are needed.

Conflict of interest

None declared.

Funding

None.

Supplementary materials

Supplementary material associated with this article can be found, in the online version, at doi:10.1016/j.dld.2022.03.005.

References

- [1] Singh AK, Jena A, Kumar MP, Sharma V, Sebastian S. Risk and outcomes of coronavirus disease in patients with inflammatory bowel disease: a systematic review and meta-analysis. United Eur Gastroenterol J 2021;9(2):159–76 MarEpub 2021 Mar 23. PMID:33210980; PMCID: PMC8250629. doi:10.1177/ 2050640620972602.
- [2] Siegel CA, Melmed GY, McGovern DP, Rai V, Krammer F, Rubin DT, Abreu MT, Dubinsky MCInternational Organization for the Study of Inflammatory Bowel Disease (IOIBD); International Organization for the Study of Inflammatory Bowel Diseases (IOIBD). SARS-CoV-2 vaccination for patients with inflammatory bowel diseases: recommendations from an international consensus meeting. Gut 2021;70(4):635–40 AprEpub 2021 Jan 20. PMID:33472895; PMCID: PMC7818789. doi:10.1136/gutjnl-2020-324000.
- [3] Alexander JL, Moran GW, Gaya DR, Raine T, Hart A, Kennedy NA, Lindsay JO, MacDonald J, Segal JP, Sebastian S, Selinger CP, Parkes M, Smith PJ, Dhar A, Subramanian S, Arasaradnam R, Lamb CA, Ahmad T, Lees CW, Dobson L, Wakeman R, Iqbal TH, Arnott I, Powell NInflammatory Bowel Disease section of the British Society of Gastroenterology and the the Inflammatory Bowel Disease Clinical Research Group. SARS-CoV-2 vaccination for patients with inflammatory bowel disease: a British society of gastroenterology inflammatory bowel disease section and IBD clinical research group position statement. Lancet Gastroenterol Hepatol 2021;6(3):218–24 MarEpub 2021 Jan 26. PMID:33508241; PMCID: PMC7834976. doi:10.1016/S2468-1253(21)00024-8.
- [4] Alexander JL, Selinger CP, Powell NBritish Society of Gastroenterology Inflammatory Bowel Disease section and the Inflammatory Bowel Disease Clinical Research Group. Third doses of SARS-CoV-2 vaccines in immunosuppressed patients with inflammatory bowel disease. Lancet Gastroenterol Hepatol 2021;6(12):987-8 DecEpub 2021 Oct 13. PMID:34653395; PMCID: PMC8511687. doi:10.1016/S2468-1253(21)00374-5.
- [5] Sakuraba A, Luna A, Micic D. Serologic response to coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) vaccination in patients with immune-mediated inflammatory diseases: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Gastroenterology 2022;162(1):88-108 Jane9Epub 2021 Sep 29. PMID:34599933; PMCID: PMC8479970. doi:10.1053/j.gastro.2021.09.055.
- [6] Jena A, Mishra S, Deepak P, Kumar-M P, Sharma A, Patel YI, Kennedy NA, Kim AHJ, Sharma V, Sebastian S. Response to SARS-CoV-2 vaccination in immune mediated inflammatory diseases: systematic review and metaanalysis. Autoimmun Rev 2021;21(1):102927 Aug 30Epub ahead of print. PMID:34474172; PMCID: PMC8404391. doi:10.1016/j.autrev.2021.102927.
- [7] Dalal RS, McClure E, Marcus J, Winter RW, Hamilton MJ, Allegretti JR. COVID-19 vaccination intent and perceptions among patients with inflammatory bowel diseases. Clin Gastroenterol Hepatol 2021;19(8):1730–2 Auge2Epub 2021 Feb 4. PMID:33549869; PMCID: PMC7859624. doi:10.1016/j.cgh.2021.02.004.
- [8] Wu X, Lin J, Buch H, Ding Q, Zhang F, Cui B, Ji G. The COVID-19 vaccination hesitancy among the people with inflammatory bowel disease in China: a questionnaire study. Front Public Health 2021;9:731578 Oct 11PMID:34708016; PMCID: PMC8542757. doi:10.3389/fpubh.2021.731578.
- [9] Stroup DF, Berlin JA, Morton SC, Olkin I, Williamson GD, Rennie D, Moher D, Becker BJ, Sipe TA, Thacker SB. Meta-analysis of observational studies in epidemiology: a proposal for reporting. Meta-analysis of observational studies in epidemiology (MOOSE) group. JAMA 2000;283(15):2008–12 Apr 19PMID:10789670. doi:10.1001/jama.283.15.2008.
- [10] Page MJ, McKenzie JE, Bossuyt PM, Boutron I, Hoffmann TC, Mulrow CD, Shamseer L, Tetzlaff JM, Akl EA, Brennan SE, Chou R, Glanville J, Grimshaw JM, Hróbjartsson A, Lalu MM, Li T, Loder EW, Mayo-Wilson E, McDonald S, McGuinness LA, Stewart LA, Thomas J, Tricco AC, Welch VA, Whiting P, Moher D. The PRISMA 2020 statement: an updated guideline for reporting systematic reviews. BMJ 2021;372:n71 Mar 29PMID:33782057; PMCID: PMC8005924. doi:10.1136/bmj.n71.
- [11] Balduzzi S, Rücker G, Schwarzer G. How to perform a meta-analysis with {R}: a practical tutorial. Evid Based Ment Health 2019;22:153–60.
- [12] Viechtbauer W. Conducting meta-analyses in R with the metafor package. J Stat Softw 2010;36:1–48. doi:10.18637/jss.v036.i03.

- [13] Wells G., Shea B., O'Connell D., Peterson J., Welch V., Losos M., Tugwell P.: The newcastle-ottawa scale (NOS) for assessing the quality of nonrandomised studies in meta-analyses. 2013, http://www.ohri.ca/programs/clinical_ epidemiology/oxford.asp.
- [14] Dailey J, Kozhaya L, Dogan M, et al. Antibody responses to SARS-CoV-2 after infection or vaccination in children and young adults with inflammatory bowel disease. Inflamm Bowel Dis 2021:izab207.
- [15] Botwin GJ, Li D, Figueiredo J, et al. Adverse events after SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccination among patients with inflammatory bowel disease. Am J Gastroenterol 2021;116(8):1746–51.
- [16] Wong SY, Dixon R, Martinez Pazos V, et al. Serologic response to messenger RNA coronavirus disease 2019 vaccines in inflammatory bowel disease patients receiving biologic therapies. Gastroenterology 2021;161(2):715–18 e4.
- [17] Edelman-Klapper H, Zittan E, Bar-Gil Shitrit A, et al. Lower serologic response to COVID-19 mRNA Vaccine in patients with inflammatory bowel diseases treated with anti-TNFα. Gastroenterology 2022;162(2):454–67 S0016-5085(21)03701-X.
- [18] Garrido I, Lopes S, Macedo G. "Safety of COVID-19 vaccination in inflammatory bowel disease patients on biologic therapy". [published online ahead of print, 2021 Oct 30]. J Crohns Colitis 2021:jjab189.
- [19] Cannatelli R, Ferretti F, Carmagnola S, et al. Risk of adverse events and reported clinical relapse after COVID-19 vaccination in patients with IBD. [published online ahead of print, 2021 Nov 24]. Gut 2021 gutjnl-2021-326237.
- [20] Weaver KN, Zhang X, Dai X, et al. Impact of SARS-CoV-2 vaccination on inflammatory bowel disease activity and development of vaccine-related adverse events: results from PREVENT-COVID. [published online ahead of print, 2021 Dec 6]. Inflamm Bowel Dis 2021:izab302.
- [21] Mujukian A, Botwin G, Kumar R, et al. S950-Symptomology following SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccination among patients with inflammatory bowel disease relative to healthcare workers. Am J Gastroenterol 2021;116:S453–5 October.
- [22] Classen JM, Muzalyova A, Nagl S, et al. Antibody response to SARS-CoV-2 vaccination in patients with inflammatory bowel disease - results of a singlecenter cohort study in a tertiary hospital in Germany. [published online ahead of print, 2021 Dec 10]. Digit Distrib 2021. doi:10.1159/000521343.
- [23] Abdullah L, Awada B, Kurban M, Abbas O. Comment on 'Vitiligo in a COVID-19-vaccinated patient with ulcerative colitis: coincidence?': type I interferons as possible link between COVID-19 vaccine and vitiligo. Clin Exp Dermatol 2021;47(2):436–7.
- [24] Alexander JL, Kennedy NA, Lees CW, Ahmad T, Powell N. SARS-CoV-2 vaccination for patients with inflammatory bowel disease – authors' reply. Lancet Gastroenterol Hepatol 2021;6(7):523–4.
- [25] Cerna K, Duricova D, Lukas M, Machkova N, Hruba V, Mitrova K, et al. Anti-SARS-CoV-2 vaccination and antibody response in patients with inflammatory bowel disease on immune-modifying therapy: prospective single-tertiary study. Inflamm Bowel Dis 2021.
- [26] D'Amico F, Rabaud C, Peyrin-Biroulet L, Danese S. SARS-CoV-2 vaccination in IBD: more pros than cons. Nat Rev Gastroenterol Hepatol 2021;18(4):211–13.
- [27] Doherty J, Fennessy S, Stack R, Om N, Cullen G, Ryan EJ, et al. Review article: vaccination for patients with inflammatory bowel disease during the COVID-19 pandemic. Aliment Pharmacol Ther 2021;54(9):1110–23.
- [28] Fagni F, Simon D, Tascilar K, Schoenau V, Sticherling M, Neurath MF, et al. COVID-19 and immune-mediated inflammatory diseases: effect of disease and treatment on COVID-19 outcomes and vaccine responses. Lancet Rheumatol 2021;3(10):e724–ee36.
- [29] Festa S, Aratari A, De Biasio F, Fascì-Spurio F, Papi C. Screening for active COVID-19 infection prior to biologic therapy in IBD patients: let's not increase our uncertainty without reducing our concerns. Dig Liver Dis 2020;52(11):1246–7.
- [30] Garrido HMG, Grobusch MP, D'Haens G, Goorhuis A. SARS-CoV-2 vaccination for patients with inflammatory bowel disease. Lancet Gastroenterol Hepatol 2021;6(7):523.
- [31] Hadi YB, Thakkar S, Shah-Khan SM, Hutson W, Sarwari A, Singh S. COVID-19 vaccination is safe and effective in patients with inflammatory bowel disease: analysis of a large multi-institutional research network in the United States. Gastroenterology 2021;161(4):1336–9 e3.
- [32] Kothadia S, Ward C, Akerman P. New diagnosis of severe ulcerative colitis immediately following mRNA-1273 SARS-CoV2 vaccination. Am J Gastroenterol 2021;116:S1027.
- [33] Kumar R, Botwin GJ, Horizon A, Appel KL, Mujukian A, Boland B, et al. Gastrointestinal symptoms in patients with inflammatory bowel disease after SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccination. Am J Gastroenterol 2021;116:S427–S4S8.
- [34] Latypov L, Khan A, Manohar H, Bhagat U. Acute exacerbation of Crohn's disease after COVID-19 Pfizer vaccine. Am J Gastroenterol 2021;116:S1025.

- Digestive and Liver Disease 54 (2022) 713–721
- [35] Levine I, Swaminath A, Roitman I, Sultan K. COVID-19 vaccination and inflammatory bowel disease: desired antibody responses, future directions, and a note of caution. Gastroenterology 2022;162(1):349–50.
- [36] Li D, Debbas P, Cheng S, Braun J, McGovern DPB, Melmed GY. Post-Vaccination Symptoms after A Third Dose of mRNA SARS-CoV-2 Vaccination in Patients with Inflammatory Bowel Disease. medRxiv [Preprint]. 2021 Dec 7:2021.12.05.21266089. doi:10.1101/2021.12.05.21266089. PMID: 34909797; PMCID: PMC8669864.
- [37] Melmed GY, Rubin DT, McGovern DPB. Winter is coming! Clinical, immunologic, and practical considerations for vaccinating patients with inflammatory bowel disease during the coronavirus disease-2019 pandemic. Gastroenterology 2021;160(3):639–44.
- [38] Murthy SK, Kuenzig ME, Windsor JW, Ghia JE, Griffiths AM, Panaccione R, et al. Crohn's and colitis Canada's 2021 impact of COVID-19 and inflammatory bowel disease in Canada: COVID-19 vaccines-biology, current evidence and recommendations. J Can Assoc Gastroenterol 2021;4:S54–60.
- [39] Prentice RE, Rentsch C, Al-Ani AH, Zhang E, Johnson D, Halliday J, et al. SARS-CoV-2 vaccination in patients with inflammatory bowel disease. GastroHep 2021;3(4):212–28.
- [40] Sangha M, Roitman I, Sultan K, Swaminath A. SARS-CoV-2 immunization in patients with inflammatory bowel disease may result in disease flares. Am J Gastroenterol 2021;116(12):2480–1. doi:10.14309/ajg.000000000001416.
- [41] Shah SRA, Dolkar S, Mathew J, Vishnu P. COVID-19 vaccination associated severe immune thrombocytopenia. Exp Hematol Oncol 2021;10(1):42.
- [42] Siegel CA, Melmed GY, McGovern DPB, Rai V, Krammer F, Rubin DT, et al. SARS-CoV-2 vaccination for patients with inflammatory bowel diseases: recommendations from an international consensus meeting. Gut 2021;70(4):635–40.
- [43] Spencer EA, Klang E, Dolinger M, Pittman N, Dubinsky MC. Seroconversion following SARS-CoV-2 infection or vaccination in pediatric IBD patients. Inflamm Bowel Dis 2021;27(11):1862–4.
- [44] Spiera E, Agrawal M, Ungaro R. COVID-19 mRNA vaccine short-term safety in patients with inflammatory bowel disease. Gastroenterology 2022;162(3):987– 8. doi:10.1053/j.gastro.2021.10.004.
- [45] Squire JD, Gonzalez-Estrada A, Caldera F, Farraye FA. COVID-19 vaccination in patients with inflammatory bowel disease and history of reaction to injectable therapies. Inflamm Bowel Dis 2021;27(8):1358–60.
- [46] Tepasse PR, Vollenberg R, Nowacki TM. Vaccination against SARS-CoV-2 in patients with inflammatory bowel diseases: where do we stand? Life 2021;11(11):1220 (Basel).
- [47] Tse F, Moayyedi P, Waschke KA, MacMillan M, Forbes N, Carroll MW, et al. COVID-19 vaccination in patients with inflammatory bowel disease: communiqué from the canadian association of gastroenterology. J Can Assoc Gastroenterol 2021;4(1):49.
- [48] Veereman G, Bronsky J. Severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 vaccination for paediatric patients with inflammatory bowel diseases. J Pediatr Gastroenterol Nutr 2021;73(4):433–6.
- [49] Wellens J, Colombel JF, Satsangi JJ, Wong SY. SARS-CoV-2 vaccination in IBD: past lessons, current evidence, and future challenges. J Crohns Colitis 2021;15(8):1376–86 Aug 2PMID:33721882; PMCID: PMC7989537. doi:10.1093/ ecco-jcc/jjab046.
- [50] Costantino A, Noviello D, Conforti FS, Aloi M, Armuzzi A, Bossa F, et al. COVID-19 vaccination willingness and hesitancy in patients with inflammatory bowel diseases: analysis of determinants in antional survey of the Italian IBD patients' association. Inflamm Bowel Dis 2022;28(3):474-8 Jul 14Epub ahead of print. PMID:34259844; PMCID: PMC8344425. doi:10.1093/ibd/izab172.
- [51] Crispino F, Brinch D, Carrozza L, Cappello M. Acceptance of SARS-CoV-2 vaccination among a cohort of IBD patients from Southern Italy: a cross-sectional survey. Inflamm Bowel Dis 2021;27(11):e134–5 Oct 20PMID:34089256; PM-CID: PMC8195093. doi:10.1093/ibd/izab133.
- [52] Dai C, Jiang M, Huang YH. COVID-19 vaccination in patients with inflammatory bowel disease: a survey from China. Dig Dis Sci 2021:1–3 Aug 19Epub ahead of print. PMID:34410574; PMCID: PMC8375283. doi:10.1007/ s10620-021-07169-x.
- [53] Menni C, Klaser K, May A, Polidori L, Capdevila J, Louca P, Sudre CH, Nguyen LH, Drew DA, Merino J, Hu C, Selvachandran S, Antonelli M, Murray B, Canas LS, Molteni E, Graham MS, Modat M, Joshi AD, Mangino M, Hammers A, Goodman AL, Chan AT, Wolf J, Steves CJ, Valdes AM, Ourselin S, Spector TD. Vaccine side-effects and SARS-CoV-2 infection after vaccination in users of the COVID symptom study app in the UK: a prospective observational study. Lancet Infect Dis 2021;21(7):939–49 JulEpub 2021 Apr 27. PMID:33930320; PMCID: PMC8078878. doi:10.1016/S1473-3099(21)00224-3.