

Commentary

# “Excessive muscle strain as the direct cause of injury” should not be generalized to hamstring muscle strain injury in sprinting

Mianfang Ruan

Faculty of Physical Education, Ningbo University, Ningbo 315211, China

Received 1 May 2017; revised 6 May 2017; accepted 8 May 2017

Available online 19 May 2017

The debate about the mechanisms of hamstring injuries in sprinting in the *Journal of Sport and Health Science* reminded me of the discussion of the force enhancement mechanisms in stretch-shortening cycles (SSCs) 20 years ago in the *Journal of Applied Biomechanics*. The controversies concerning the proposed mechanisms were mainly due to the difference in the levels of observation between animal and human studies.<sup>1,2</sup> An important question debated 20 years ago was “Are the muscle fibers and muscle spindles lengthened during SSCs?” a question that is also important to the current discussion on hamstring strain injuries.

Yu et al.<sup>3</sup> proposed that excessive muscle strain is the direct, if not exclusive, cause of muscle strain injury. However, they ignored the idea that there might be different types of acute hamstring strains: high-speed running type and stretching-type (i.e., kicking) injuries.<sup>4</sup> The animal experiments<sup>5–7</sup> cited by Yu et al. provide the general mechanisms for stretching-type injuries. However, they should not necessarily be generalized to hamstring injuries in sprinting because not all animal studies support the notion that high strains are necessary to cause muscle injuries.

Warren et al.<sup>8</sup> investigated muscle injuries in isolated rat soleus muscles subjected to 5 eccentric contractions. They measured peak eccentric contraction force, stretch magnitude, stretch velocity, and initial muscle length. They observed that immediate muscle injuries were most closely related to the peak force produced during stretching, and injuries at 60-min following the eccentric protocol were most closely related to the initial muscle length. Brooks et al.<sup>9</sup> found that injury immediately following a single stretch was associated with muscle strain and work done during the stretch. Hunter and Faulkner<sup>10</sup> found that the best single predictor of eccentric injury was the final length to which muscle fibers were stretched, and

differences in force deficits were best explained by the work during stretching and the initial length.

Thelen et al.<sup>11</sup> reported that the peak hamstring muscle-tendon lengths in sprint running occurred during the late swing phase. Schache et al.<sup>12</sup> reported that the peak hamstring muscle-tendon unit length occurred at an intermediate running speed of  $6.9 \pm 0.1$  m/s. Peak biceps femoris long head strains in pre-injury and injury trials of sprint running were 12.2%<sup>13</sup> and 12.9%.<sup>14</sup> The length of the hamstrings in the upright posture is 88% of the optimal length.<sup>15</sup> Therefore, the maximum hamstring lengths in sprint running are close to the muscle optimal length, which is different than the strains reported in animal studies of eccentric muscle injury<sup>5–7</sup> cited by Yu and colleagues, and they cannot be regarded as excessive. Muscle strain as the primary cause of muscle strain injury is further challenged by the observation that the maximum hamstring strain does not increase when running speed increases from 6.9 to 9.0 m/s,<sup>12</sup> while most hamstring injuries in sprinting occur while sprinting at or close to the maximum speed.<sup>16</sup>

It has been suggested<sup>17–20</sup> that muscle fibers may shorten while the muscle tendon unit is elongating. Unfortunately, there are no experimental studies on fascicle lengths of the hamstring muscles in sprint running, and while theoretical studies suggest a lengthening of the hamstrings in the mid-swing phase,<sup>21,22</sup> these findings cannot be taken as direct evidence of hamstring fascicle lengthening because hamstring slack lengths are not known with certainty.<sup>23</sup> Even if the hamstring fascicles were lengthened in the swing phase of sprint running, the strain would be limited because of the presumed high gear ratio of the pennate hamstring muscles.<sup>24</sup>

In summary, it might not be justified to assume that excessive strain causes hamstring injuries in the late swing phase of sprint running. Muscle strain injuries produced by eccentric actions in animal studies are typically induced by strains beyond the optimal muscle fiber length, while hamstring injuries in sprint running likely occur near optimal lengths; that is, at relatively short lengths. Studies investigating the fascicle behavior *in vivo*

Peer review under responsibility of Shanghai University of Sport.

E-mail address: [ruanmf@yahoo.com](mailto:ruanmf@yahoo.com)

during sprint running, and studies focusing on injury mechanisms based on injury trials, are needed.

### Competing interests

The author declares that he has no competing interests.

### References

- van Ingen Schenau GJ, Bobbert MF, deHaan A. Mechanics and energetics of the stretch-shortening cycle: a stimulating discussion. *J Appl Biomech* 1997;**13**:484–96.
- Goubel F. Series elasticity behavior during the stretch-shortening cycle. *J Appl Biomech* 1997;**13**:439–43.
- Yu B, Liu H, Garrett WE. Mechanism of hamstring muscle strain injury in sprinting. *J Sport Health Sci* 2017;**6**:130–2.
- Askling CM, Malliaropoulos N, Karlsson J. High-speed running type or stretching-type of hamstring injuries makes a difference to treatment and prognosis. *Br J Sports Med* 2012;**46**:86–7.
- Garrett Jr WE, Safran MR, Seaber AV, Glisson RR, Ribbeck BM. Biomechanical comparison of stimulated and nonstimulated skeletal muscle pulled to failure. *Am J Sports Med* 1987;**15**:448–54.
- Lieber RL, Woodburn TM, Friden J. Muscle damage induced by eccentric contractions of 25% strain. *J Appl Physiol* 1991;**70**:2498–507.
- Lieber RL, Friden J. Muscle damage is not a function of muscle force but active muscle strain. *J Appl Physiol* 1993;**74**:520–6.
- Warren GL, Hayes DA, Lowe DA, Armstrong RB. Mechanical factors in the initiation of eccentric contraction-induced injury in rat soleus muscle. *J Physiol* 1993;**464**:457–75.
- Brooks SV, Zerba E, Faulkner JA. Injury to muscle fibres after single stretches of passive and maximally stimulated muscles in mice. *J Physiol* 1995;**488**(Pt 2):459–69.
- Hunter KD, Faulkner JA. Pliometric contraction-induced injury of mouse skeletal muscle: effect of initial length. *J Appl Physiol* 1997;**82**:278–83.
- Thelen DG, Chumanov ES, Hoerth DM, Best TM, Swanson SC, Li L, et al. Hamstring muscle kinematics during treadmill sprinting. *Med Sci Sports Exerc* 2005;**37**:108–14.
- Schache AG, Dorn TW, Wrigley TV, Brown NA, Pandy MG. Stretch and activation of the human biarticular hamstrings across a range of running speeds. *Eur J Appl Physiol* 2013;**113**:2813–28.
- Heiderscheit BC, Hoerth DM, Chumanov ES, Swanson SC, Thelen BJ, Thelen DG. Identifying the time of occurrence of a hamstring strain injury during treadmill running: a case study. *Clin Biomech (Bristol, Avon)* 2005;**20**:1072–8.
- Schache AG, Wrigley TV, Baker R, Pandy MG. Biomechanical response to hamstring muscle strain injury. *Gait Posture* 2009;**29**:332–8.
- Wan X, Qu F, Garrett WE, Liu H, Yu B. Relationships among hamstring muscle optimal length and hamstring flexibility and strength. *J Sport Health Sci* 2017;**6**:275–82.
- Askling CM, Tengvar M, Saartok T, Thorstensson A. Acute first-time hamstring strains during high-speed running: a longitudinal study including clinical and magnetic resonance imaging findings. *Am J Sports Med* 2007;**35**:197–206.
- Alexander RF, Ker RF. The architecture of leg muscles. In: Winter JM, Woo SLY, editors. *Multiple muscle systems*. New York, NY: Springer Verlag; 1990.p.568–77.
- Voigt M, Bojsen-Møller F, Simonsen EB, Dyhre-Poulsen P. The influence of tendon Young's modulus, dimensions and instantaneous moment arms on the efficiency of human movement. *J Biomech* 1995;**28**:281–91.
- Herzog W. Eccentric vs. concentric muscle contraction: that is the question. *J Sport Health Sci* 2017;**6**:128–9.
- Kurokawa S, Fukunaga T, Fukashiro S. Behavior of fascicles and tendinous structures of human gastrocnemius during vertical jumping. *J Appl Physiol* 2001;**90**:1349–58.
- Thelen DG, Chumanov ES, Best TM, Swanson SC, Heiderscheit BC. Simulation of biceps femoris musculotendon mechanics during the swing phase of sprinting. *Med Sci Sports Exerc* 2005;**37**:1931–8.
- Chumanov ES, Heiderscheit BC, Thelen DG. The effect of speed and influence of individual muscles on hamstring mechanics during the swing phase of sprinting. *J Biomech* 2007;**40**:3555–62.
- Van Hooren B, Bosch F. Is there really an eccentric action of the hamstrings during the swing phase of high-speed running? part I: a critical review of the literature. *J Sports Sci* 2016;**12**:1–9.
- Azizi E, Roberts TJ. Geared up to stretch: pennate muscle behavior during active lengthening. *J Exp Biol* 2014;**217**:376–81.