# A Comparison of *Wolbachia* Infection Frequencies in *Varroa* With Prevalence of Deformed Wing Virus

# Thorben Grau,<sup>1</sup> Annely Brandt,<sup>2</sup> Sara DeLeon,<sup>1</sup> Marina Doris Meixner,<sup>2</sup> Jakob Friedrich Strauß,<sup>3</sup> Gerrit Joop,<sup>1,4,\*</sup> and Arndt Telschow<sup>3,\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Institute of Insect Biotechnology, Justus-Liebig University Giessen, Giessen, Germany (thorben.grau@agrar.uni-giessen.de; sara.deleon@agrar.uni-giessen.de; gerrit.joop@agrar.uni-giessen.de), <sup>2</sup>LLH Bee Institute, Kirchhain, Germany (annely.brandt@llh.hessen.de; marina.meixner@llh.hessen.de), <sup>3</sup>Institute for Evolution and Biodiversity, Westfaelische Wilhelms University Muenster, Muenster, Germany (jfstrauss@gmail.com; atels\_01@uni-muenster.de), and <sup>4</sup>Corresponding author, e-mail: gerrit.joop @agrar.uni-giessen.de

\*Equally contributing senior authors. Subject Editor: Sara Goodacre

Received 5 July 2016; Editorial decision 27 March 2017

# Abstract

*Wolbachia* are widely distributed bacterial endosymbionts of arthropods and filarial nematodes. These bacteria can affect host fitness in a variety of ways, such as protecting hosts against viruses and other pathogens. Here, we investigate the possible role of *Wolbachia* in the prevalence of the deformed wing virus (DWV), a highly virulent pathogen of honey bees (*Apis mellifera*) that is transmitted by parasitic *Varroa* mites (*Varroa destructor*). About 180 *Varroa* mites from 18 beehives were tested for infection with *Wolbachia* and DWV. We first screened for *Wolbachia* using two standard primers (*wsp* and 16S rDNA), and found 26% of the mites to be positive for *Wolbachia* using the *wsp* primer and 64% of the mites to be positive using the 16S rDNA primer. Using these intermediate *Wolbachia* frequencies, we then tested for statistical correlations with virus infection frequencies. The analysis revealed a significant positive correlation between DWV and *Wolbachia* using the *wsp* primer, but no significant association between DWV and *Wolbachia* using the *wsp* primer, but no significant effect of *Wolbachia* in *V. destructor*, but weak evidence for a pro-pathogenic effect. These results encourage further examination of *Wolbachia*-virus interactions in *Varroa* mites since an increased vector competence of the mites may significantly impact disease outbreaks in honey bees.

Key words: deformed wing virus, honey bee, protective symbiont, Varroa destructor, Wolbachia

Honey bees (Apis mellifera L.), important pollinators of wild plants and cultivated crops, are essential for ecosystem function and global agriculture (Fontaine et al. 2005, Bascompte et al. 2006, Klein et al. 2007). Over the past decade, there has been a serious decline in bee populations reported in the European Union and other parts of the world (EFSA 2008; van Engelsdorp et al. 2009; Potts et al. 2010a,b; van Engelsdorp and Meixner 2010; van der Zee et al. 2012, 2014; Spleen et al. 2013; Steinhauer et al. 2014; Goulson et al. 2015). While a multitude of causative factors, such as parasites, pathogens, diet quantity, quality, diversity and the exposure to pesticides, is being discussed (Alaux et al. 2010; Brodschneider and Crailsheim 2010; Genersch et al. 2010; Blacquière et al. 2012; Di Pasquale et al. 2013; Goulson 2013, 2015; Sandrock et al. 2014), infestation with the invasive ectoparasitic mite Varroa destructor is now considered the most significant cause for colony losses (Anderson and Trueman 2000, Genersch et al. 2010, Rosenkranz et al. 2010, Dainat et al. 2012a, Martin et al. 2012). Varroa destructor is originally a parasite of the Asian Apis cerana, in which it inflicts only

limited damage. In eastern Russia, this mite jumped hosts to *A. mellifera*, followed by near-global spread to *A. mellifera* populations worldwide (Rosenkranz et al. 2010, Martin et al. 2012, Mondet et al. 2014).

*Varroa* mites are known as effective vectors for several honey bee viruses (Bowen-Walker et al. 1999, Chen et al. 2004, Sumpter and Martin 2004, Berthoud et al. 2010). They are also hypothesized to downregulate honey bee immune genes (Nazzi et al. 2012), which may consequently activate covert virus infections (Yang and Cox-Foster 2005). Viral infections, as a consequence of high *Varroa* mite infestation rates, strongly correlate with the collapse of colonies (Cox-Foster et al. 2007, Highfield et al. 2009, Berthoud et al. 2010, Genersch et al. 2010, Le Conte et al. 2010, Dainat et al. 2012b, Francis et al. 2013). The association between *V. destructor* and Deformed Wing Virus (DWV) in particular is being discussed as one of the main causes for colony losses (de Miranda and Genersch 2010, Schroeder and Martin 2012, Mordecai et al. 2015a). This virus is widely prevalent and has a nearly worldwide distribution

1

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/), which permits non-commercial re-use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited. For commercial re-use, please contact journals.permissions@oup.com

<sup>©</sup> The Authors 2017. Published by Oxford University Press on behalf of Entomological Society of America.

(Ellis and Munn 2005, Gauthier et al. 2007). Even though DWV can be found in *Varroa*-free colonies or bee populations, it rarely leads to overt disease in the absence of *Varroa* mites. Yet, the presence of *Varroa* mites has been shown to dramatically increase the prevalence of DWV (Martin et al. 2012). In addition to being vectored by the mite, DWV is also known to survive and successfully replicate in the mite (Yue and Genersch 2005). Moreover, *Varroa* mites influence the balance of different DWV strains with differing virulence, potentially leading to an increase of more virulent strains (Martin et al. 2012, Mondet et al. 2014, Ryabov et al. 2014, Mordecai et al. 2015b). Investigations of the viral composition of *Varroa* mites and factors that influence virus prevalence and the mite's vector competence will contribute to understanding the dynamics of the *Varroa*virus system and the potential threat it presents to honey bees.

Recent progress in microbiome studies reveals that host microbial composition has a significant impact on both host susceptibility to pathogen infection, and pathogen performance in infected hosts (Kamada et al. 2013, Dennision et al. 2014, Vogt et al. 2015, reviewed in Bäumler and Sperandio 2016). Not only the complete microbiota but also symbiotic microbes, have been shown to impact host's susceptibility and resistance. Of particular interest are intracellular bacteria of the genus Wolbachia (Werren et al. 2008). Wolbachia are widely distributed in terrestrial arthropods and filarial nematodes, with an estimated 20-70% of insect species infected (Hilgenboecker et al. 2008, Weinert et al. 2015). Empirical studies show that Wolbachia interferes with viruses and other pathogens inside the arthropod host, thereby either impeding or promoting the pathogen's replication and survival (reviewed in Zug and Hammerstein 2015) as well as the host's survival (Wong et al. 2011, Shokal et al. 2016). Anti-pathogenic effects of Wolbachia were demonstrated for Dengue virus (Moreira et al. 2009, Bian et al. 2010), West Nile virus (Hussain et al. 2013), and Plasmodium falciparum (Moreira et al. 2009), whereas neutral or pro-pathogenic effects of Wolbachia were shown for Brugia pahangi (Dutton and Sinkins 2005), Japanese encephalitis virus (Tsai et al. 2006), Drosophila C virus (Osborne et al. 2009) and Plasmodium gallinaceum (Baton et al. 2013).

Although Wolbachia has been previously detected in V. destructor (Pattabhiramaiah et al. 2010), information about possible interactions of Wolbachia with the mite's virome is lacking. Here, taking a correlative approach, we compare infection frequencies of Wolbachia and DWV in V. destructor to investigate whether the presence of Wolbachia correlates with virus prevalence in the mites. We hypothesize that an anti-pathogenic effect of Wolbachia will result in lower virus frequencies among the Wolbachia-infected mites compared to Wolbachia-free mites, and a pro-pathogenic effect will result in the opposite pattern.

# **Materials and Methods**

# Mite Collection

Apis mellifera samples were collected in October 2011 from 18 hives in 9 different apiaries across Hesse (Germany) (2 colonies per apiary). From each hive, bees were shaken from a comb onto a plastic sheet, immediately transferred to a labeled vial, and frozen at -20 °C until analysis (Genersch et al. 2010). To collect the mites, individual bees of each sample were visually inspected and mites were removed manually with forceps.

# **DNA/RNA** Extraction

Both DNA for Wolbachia detection and RNA for DWV detection were extracted from 10 individual mites per hive (180 total samples) according to the NucleoSpin TriPrep protocol (Macherey & Nagel, Düren, Germany).

## PCR for Wolbachia Detection

Wolbachia infection rate is commonly measured by using primers for 16S rDNA, or primers for the outer surface-protein coding gene *wsp* (Marcon et al. 2011, Beckmann and Fallon 2012, Zha et al. 2014). Specifically, we used the *wsp*81f and *wsp*691r (Zhou et al. 1998) primers and the 16S rDNA76f and 16S rDNA1012r (O'Neill et al. 1992) primers (Supp Table 1 [online only]). PCR products were analyzed on an agarose gel. Approximately 10% positive amplicons of both primer pairs were sent for sequencing to confirm identity (Macrogen, Amsterdam, Netherlands) and sequences were deposited in GenBank (Supp Table 2 [online only]).

#### One-step RT-PCR for DWV Detection

DWV infection was detected with RT-PCR according to the protocol of OneStep-RT-PCR Kit and as previously described in Genersch (2005), using the primer pair F7, B11 (Supp Table 1 [online only]) for DWV detection. Around 10% positive amplicons were sent for sequencing to confirm identity and sequences were deposited in GenBank (Supp Table 2 [online only]). Only a short RNA region was used for DWV detection, so that even degraded DNA caused by long-term storage at -20 °C would provide a suitable template (Dainat et al. 2011).

#### Statistics

All analyses were performed using R 3.1.1. We performed the analysis with the infection frequency of each of the 18 hives, testing 10 individual mites per hive. To determine the relationship between *Wolbachia* prevalence and virus presence in *Varroa* mites, we used a completely balanced experimental design, i.e., equal sample numbers. In a correlative approach, we used the 16S r DNA, *wsp* and an additive combination of both primers, where there were 16 degrees of freedom left.

# Results

Using the *wsp* primer, we detected *Wobachia* in only 26% of *V. destructor*. Less than 70% of mites from one hive were found infected, and 44.4% of hives were *Wolbachia* free (Fig. 1A). In contrast, when using the 16S rDNA primer, 64% of *V. destructor* were positive for *Wolbachia* and all hives were found to be infected (Fig. 1B). Overall, *Wolbachia* prevalence in our samples varied from 30% to 70% in the majority of hives. Notably, not all mites with a positive signal for *wsp* were also positive with the 16S rDNA primer pair. For example, hive 5 showed higher infection frequencies with *wsp* than with 16S rDNA. DWV presence differed substantially between mites from different hives (Fig. 1C). We found a total DWV infection frequency of 61%. Only 5 out of 18 hives had a 100% DWV infection, while in two hives no DWV was detected. Sequencing of positive samples did not reveal false positive *Wolbachia* signals.

To test our hypothesis of the anti- or pro-pathogenic properties of *Wolbachia*, we ran a multivariate correlational analysis between the *Wolbachia* and DWV infection frequencies based on the two *Wolbachia* primers, *wsp* and 16S rDNA. The analysis suggests that *Wolbachia* has a pro-pathogenic function in *Varroa*, indicated by the positive linear correlation between *Wolbachia* prevalence and DWV presence, when *Wolbachia* infection was determined using the *wsp* primer (t=3.774, P=0.002, Fig. 2A). When *Wolbachia* 



Fig. 1. Infection frequencies of *Wolbachia* (A) using *wsp* primer (B) using 16S rDNA primer and Deformed Wing Virus (C) using DWV primer in *Varroa* mites collected from 18 different hives from across Hesse, Germany in 2011. DNA and RNA from 10 mites from each hive were sampled, identical mites were used with all three primers.

infection was determined using the 16S rDNA primer there was no significant correlation (t = 0.050, P = 0.961, Fig. 2B). The additive combination of both primers result in no significant correlation (t=0.127, P=0.901, Fig. 2C).

# Discussion

Wolbachia infections have been recently reported in Varroa (Pattabhiramaiah et al. 2010), a vector of DWV (de Miranda and Genersch 2010). To explore the potential of Wolbachia bacteria mediating virus transfer, we investigated the Wolbachia frequency in V. destructor. Our results gave a first indication of Wolbachia having an effect on the prevalence of DWV in Varroa. The results were remarkably different depending on whether wsp or 16S rDNA primers were used. Most notably, mites tested for Wolbachia infection using the *wsp* primer resulted in far lower frequencies of infection than those tested with the 16S rDNA primer. This is in line with previous studies showing that wsp produces false negatives in certain Wolbachia-host systems, particularly when Wolbachia titers are low (Schneider et al. 2014). Therefore, the lower percentage of Varroa mites that tested positive for Wolbachia using the wsp primer was not unexpected. However, surprisingly, >20% of the wsp positive mites (10 out of 47) were negative for 16S rDNA. A possible

explanation for this finding is that *Varroa* harbors more than one *Wolbachia* strains and that the different strains are detected differentially well by the two primers (de Oliveira et al. 2015). Alternatively, *wsp* may have detected, at least in some samples, a closely related species from the order of Rickettsiales (Simoes et al. 2011). Whatever the reason for the difference between the primers, the results suggest that *Wolbachia* frequencies in our sampling of *V. destructor* are at intermediate levels.

Meta-analysis studies of terrestrial arthropods show that Wolbachia infection frequencies are usually either high (>90%) or low (<20%) (Hilgenboecker et al. 2008, Weinert et al. 2015). High Wolbachia infected arthropods include Culex pipiens (Rasgon and Scott 2003), Aedes albopictus (Kitrayapong et al. 2002, Joanne et al. 2015), Drosophila simulans (Kriesner et al. 2013), as well as the Nasonia species complex (Bordenstein et al. 2001). These examples of high infection frequencies are explained by the joint effects of high maternal transmission rates (95-100%) and Wolbachiainduced cytoplasmic incompatibility (Engelstädter and Telschow 2009). Systems with low Wolbachia frequencies are less well understood. Low infection rates can be caused by low levels of maternal inheritance (80-90%) and by Wolbachia strains that cause malekilling of the insect, as reported in Drosophila innubila (Dyer and Jaenike 2004, Unckless and Jaenike 2012). Paternal and horizontal transmission of Wolbachia is considered to be negligible in all



**Fig. 2.** Relationship between *Wolbachia* prevalence and Deformed Wing Virus (DWV) load in *Varroa* mites. When using the *wsp* primer (A) a positive linear correlation between *Wolbachia* prevalence and DWV load can be detected, in accordance with our hypothesis on pro-pathogenic function of *Wolbachia* infection in *Varroa*. No such relation can be detected upon using the 16S rDNA primer (B) and the additive combination of *wsp* with 16S rDNA primer (C). *R*<sup>2</sup> and RSME (root-mean-square error) given as estimates for goodness of fit. For better visual presentation overlapping points were jittered.

mentioned species (Hoffmann and Turelli 1988, Schuler et al. 2016). Our observed intermediate *Wolbachia* frequencies in *V. destructor* differ from this general pattern and resemble the frequencies of the two-spotted spider mite *Tetranychus urticae*. This plant herbivore has been extensively studied for *Wolbachia* infection and showed a remarkable temporal and local variation in infection frequencies that ranged between 2.5% and 77.5%, with a median of  $\sim$ 30% (Chen et al. 2009, Yu et al. 2011, Su et al. 2012). Although the factors that drive *Wolbachia* infection dynamics in *T. urticae* are not well understood, this case suggests that *Wolbachia* frequencies can fluctuate around intermediate levels without spreading to fixation or going to extinction. This may also be the case in *V. destructor*, especially when considering the relatively young age of this system. Currently, the system is most likely not evolutionary stable, and instead, strong coevolutionary dynamics are dominating.

In this study, we give a first indication of whether Wolbachia infections in V. destructor correlates in a pro-pathogenic, neutral, or anti-pathogenic manner with DWV. Our analysis revealed a significant positive correlation between Wolbachia infection measured by the wsp primer and DWV (Fig. 2). The results based on 16S rDNA and the additive combination of both primers, however, revealed no significant correlation, suggesting that the presence of Wolbachia is not correlated to DWV infection (Fig. 2). These results are puzzling at a first sight. A possible explanation is that the Wolbachia-infected mites differ with respect to Wolbachia titer, and possibly also with respect to the number of present Wolbachia strains. The positive correlation between *wsp* and DWV may then be the result of an increased susceptibility to the virus in mites with high Wolbachia titer and/or the presence of certain Wolbachia strains. However, a more in depth quantitative analysis is needed to answer whether high Wolbachia titers and/or certain Wolbachia strains really have a pro-pathogenic effect on DWV. Furthermore, the results strongly

suggest careful choice of *Wolbachia*-primers in future studies, especially in systems with presumably low titers.

With our approach, we cannot rule out whether the *Wolbachia* found in mites results from a true infection of the mite or rather from ingested honey bee hemolymph, which was infected with *Wolbachia*. For example, in *Metaseiulus occidentalis* mites, mite starvation reduced and eliminated *Wolbachia* detection (Wu and Hoy 2012). Therefore, the question remains whether *Wolbachia* is a true endosymbiont of *V. destructor*. Future studies should consider starving mites or collecting the respective hosting bee to add to our understanding. Nevertheless, in this study we give a first indication of whether *Wolbachia* infections in *V. destructor* correlates in a propathogenic, neutral, or anti-pathogenic with DWV.

In conclusion, we found strong evidence for intermediate *Wolbachia* frequencies in *V. destructor*, but based on the presented data, we can neither conclude nor disprove that *Wolbachia* affects DWV. We suggest that additional quantitative information on *Wolbachia* and the internal virus titers of corresponding mites will contribute to a better understanding of the role of *Wolbachia* in the composition of the *V. destructor* virome. Furthermore, future studies should consider artificial infection experiments in mite backgrounds with and without *Wolbachia*, as well as differing *Wolbachia* titers and DWV concentrations. These data may reveal the answer to the important question: Do *Wolbachia* infections in *Varroa* mites, and their temporal and spatial variation, play a role the epidemiology of virus infections in bees and possibly influence colony losses?

# Supplementary Data

Supplementary data are available at Journal of Insect Science online.

#### Acknowledgments

We gratefully thank H. Strasser, E. Leider, and U. Hubbe for sample collection. This project was funded by the Volkswagen Foundation's Initiative on Evolutionary Biology with grants to G.J. and A.T. S.D., T.G., and G.J. are funded within the LOEWE Center for Insect Biotechnology and Bioresources (ZIB), granted by the German state of Hessen's excellence initiative. G.J. as well as J.F.S. and A.T. were supported by the German Science Foundation (SPP 1399, JO 962/1-1 and TE 976/2-1).

# **References Cited**

- Alaux, C., J.-L. Brunet, C. Dussaubat, F. Mondet, S. Tchamitchan, and M. Cousin. 2010. Interactions between *Nosema* microspores and a neonicotinoid weaken honeybees (*Apis mellifera*). Environ. Microbiol. 12: 774–782.
- Anderson, D. L., and J. W. Trueman. 2000. *Varroa jacobsoni* (Acari: Varroidae) is more than one species. Exp. Appl. Acarol. 24: 165–189.
- Bascompte, J., P. Jordano, and J. M. Olesen. 2006. Asymmetric coevolutionary networks facilitate biodiversity maintenance. Science 312: 431–433.
- Baton, L. A., E. C. Pacidônio, D. Gonçalves, and L. A. Moreira. 2013. wFlu: characterization and evaluation of a native Wolbachia from the mosquito Aedes fluviatilis as a potential vector control agent. PLoS One 8: e59619.
- Bäumler, A. J., and V. Sperandio. 2016. Interactions between the microbiota and pathogenic bacteria in the gut. Nature 535: 85–93.
- Beckmann, J. F., and A. M. Fallon. 2012. Decapitation improves detection of Wolbachia pipientis (Rickettsiales: Anaplasmataceae) in *Culex pipiens* (Diptera: Culicidae) mosquitoes by the polymerase chain reaction. J. Med. Entomol. 49: 1103–1108.
- Berthoud, H., A. Imdorf, M. Haueter, S. Radloff, and P. Neumann. 2010. Virus infections and winter losses of honey bee colonies (*Apis mellifera*). J. Apicult. Res. 49: 60–65.
- Bian, G., Y. Xu, P. Lu, Y. Xie, and Z. Xi. 2010. The endosymbiotic bacterium Wolbachia induces resistance to dengue virus in Aedes aegypti. PLoS Pathog, 6: e1000833.
- Blacquière, T., G. Smagghe, C. A. M. van Gestel, and V. Mommaerts. 2012. Neonicotinoids in bees: a review on concentrations, side-effects and risk assessment. Ecotoxicology 21: 973–992.
- Bordenstein, S. R., P. O'Hara, and J. H. Werren. 2001. Wolbachia-induced incompatibility precedes other hybrid incompatibilities in Nasonia. Nature 409: 707–710.
- Bowen-Walker, P. L., J. Martin, and A. Gunn. 1999. The transmission of deformed wing virus between honeybees (*Apis mellifera L.*) by the ectoparasitic mite Varroa iacobsoni Oud. J. Invertebr. Pathol. 73: 101–106.
- Brodschneider, R., and K. Crailsheim. 2010. Nutrition and health in honey bees. Apidologie 41: 278–294.
- Chen, X.-L., R. Xie, G. Q. Li, and X. Y. Hong. 2009. Simultaneous detection of endosymbionts Wolbachia and Cardinium in spider mites (Acari: Tetranychidae) by multiplex-PCR. Int. J. Acarol. 35: 397–403.
- Cox-Foster, D. L., Conlan, E. C. Holmes, G. Palacios, J. D. Evans, and N. A. Moran. 2007. A metagenomic survey of microbes in honey bee colony collapse disorder. Science 318: 283–287.
- Dainat, B., J. D. Evans, Y. P. Chen, and P. Neumann. 2011. Sampling and RNA quality for diagnosis of honey bee viruses using quantitative PCR. J. Virol. Methods 174: 150–152.
- Dainat, B., J. D. Evans, Y. P. Chen, L. Gauthier, and P. Neumann. 2012a. Dead or alive: deformed wing virus and *Varroa destructor* reduce the life span of winter honeybees. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 78: 981–987.
- Dainat, B., J. D. Evans, Y. P. Chen, L. Gauthier, and P. Neumann. 2012b. Predictive markers of honey bee colony collapse. PLoS One 7: e32151.
- de Miranda, J. R., and E. Genersch. 2010. Deformed wing virus. J. Invert. Pathol. 103(Suppl): S48–S61.
- de Oliveira, C. D., S. Gonçalves, L. A. Baton, P. H. F. Shimabukuro, F. D. Carvalho, and L. A. Moreira. 2015. Broader prevalence of Wolbachia in insects including potential human disease vectors. Bull. Entomol. Res. 105: 305–315.
- Dennision, N. J., N. Jupatanakul, and G. Dimopoulos. 2014. The mosquito microbiota influences vector competence for human pathogens. Curr. Opin. Insect Sci. 3: 6–13.

- Di Pasquale, G., M. Salignon, Y. Le Conte, L. P. Belzunces, A. Decourtye, and A. Kretzschmar. 2013. Influence of pollen nutrition on honey bee health: do pollen quality and diversity matter?. PLoS One. 8: e72016.
- Dutton, T. J., and S. P. Sinkins. 2005. Filarial susceptibility and effects of Wolbachia in Aedes pseudoscutellaris mosquitoes. Med. Vet. Entomol. 19: 60–65.
- Dyer, K. A., and J. Jaenike. 2004. Evolutionarily stable infection by a male-killing endosymbiont in *Drosophila innubila*. Genetics 168: 1443–1455.
- EFSA 2008. Bee mortality and bee surveillance in Europe. Efsa J. 154: 1-28.
- Ellis, J. D., and P. A. Munn. 2005. The worldwide health status of honey bees. Bee World 86: 88–101.
- Engelstädter, J., and A. Telschow. 2009. Cytoplasmic incompatibility and host population structure. Heredity 103: 196–207.
- Fontaine, C., I. Dajoz, J. Meriguet, and M. Loreau. 2005. Functional diversity of plant–pollinator interaction webs enhances the persistence of plant communities. PLoS Biol. 4: e1.
- Francis, R. M., L. Nielsen, and P. Kryger. 2013. Varroa-virus interaction in collapsing honey bee colonies. PLoS One 8: e57540.
- Gauthier, L., Tentcheva, D. M. Tournaire, B. Dainat, F. Cousserans, Amd, and M. E. Colin. 2007. Viral load estimation in asymptomatic honey bee colonies using the quantitative RT-PCR technique. Apidologie 38: 426–435.
- Genersch, E. 2005. Development of a rapid and sensitive RT-PCR method for the detection of deformed wing virus, a pathogen of the honeybee (*Apis mellifera*). Vet. J. 169: 121–123.
- Genersch, E., W. von der Ohe, H. Kaatz, A. Schroeder, C. Otten, and R. Büchler. 2010. The German bee monitoring project: a long term study to understand periodically high winter losses of honey bee colonies. Apidologie 41: 332–352.
- Goulson, D. 2013. REVIEW: An overview of the environmental risks posed by neonicotinoid insecticides. J. Appl. Ecol. 50: 977–987.
- Goulson, D., E. Nicholls, C. Botías, and E. L. Rotheray. 2015. Bee declines driven by combined stress from parasites, pesticides, and lack of flowers. Science 347: 1255957.
- Highfield, A. C. El Nagar, L. C. M. Mackinder, L. M. L. J. Noël, M. J. Hall, and S. J. Martin. 2009. Deformed wing virus implicated in overwintering honeybee colony losses. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 75: 7212–7220.
- Hilgenboecker, K. P., Hammerstein, A. Schlattmann, A. Telschow, and J. H. Werren. 2008. How many species are infected with *Wolbachia?* – a statistical analysis of current data: *Wolbachia* infection rates. FEMS Microbiol. Lett. 281: 215–220.
- Hoffmann, A. A., and M. Turelli. 1988. Unidirectional incompatibility in Drosophila Simulans: inheritance, geographic variation and fitness effects. Genetics 119: 435–444.
- Hussain, M., G. Lu, S. Torres, J. H. Edmonds, B. H. Kay, and A. A. Khromykh. 2013. Effect of *Wolbachia* on replication of West Nile virus in a mosquito cell line and adult mosquitoes. J. Virol. 87: 851–858.
- Joanne, S., I. Vythilingam, N. Yugavathy, C. S. Leong, M. L. Wong, and S. AbuBakar. 2015. Distribution and dynamics of Wolbachia infection in Malaysian Aedes albopictus. Acta Trop. 148: 38–45.
- Kamada, N., G. Y. Chen, N. Inohara, and G. Núñez. 2013. Control of pathogens and pathobionts by the gut microbiota. Nat. Immunol. 14: 685–690.
- Kitrayapong, P., V. Baimai, and S. L. O'Neill. 2002. Field prevalence of Wolbachia in the mosquito vector Aedes albopictus. Am. J. Trop. Med. Hyg. 66: 108–111.
- Klein, A.-M., E. Vaissière, J. H. Cane, I. Steffan-Dewenter, S. A. Cunningham, and C. Kremen. 2007. Importance of pollinators in changing landscapes for world crops. Proc. R. Soc. Lond B Biol. Sci. 274: 303–313.
- Kriesner, P., A. Hoffmann, S. F. Lee, M. Turelli, and A. R. Weeks. 2013. Rapid sequential spread of two Wolbachia variants in Drosophila simulans. PLoS Pathog. 9: e1003607.
- Le Conte, Y., M. Ellis, and W. Ritter. 2010. *Varroa* mites and honey bee health: can *Varroa* explain part of the colony losses?. Apidologie 41: 353–363.
- Marcon, H. S., E. Coscrato, D. Selivon, A. L. P. Perondini, and C. L. Marino. 2011. Variations in the sensitivity of different primers for detecting *Wolbachia* in *Anastrepha* (diptera: tephritidae). Braz. J. Microbiol. 42: 778–785.

- Martin, S. J., C. Highfield, L. Brettell, E. M. Villalobos, G. E. Budge, and M. Powell. 2012. Global honey bee viral landscape altered by a parasitic mite. Science 336: 1304–1306.
- Mondet, F., J. R. de Miranda, A. Kretzschmar, Y. Le Conte, and A. R. Mercer. 2014. On the front line: quantitative virus dynamics in honeybee (*Apis mellifera L.*) colonies along a new expansion front of the parasite Varroa destructor. PLoS Pathog. 10: e1004323.
- Moreira, L. A., Iturbe-Ormaetxe, J. A. Jeffery, G. Lu, A. T. Pyke, and L. M. Hedges. 2009. A Wolbachia symbiont in Aedes aegypti limits infection with dengue, chikungunya, and Plasmodium. Cell 139: 1268–1278.
- Nazzi, F., S. P. Brown, D. Annoscia, F. Del Piccolo, G. Di Prisco, and P. Varricchio. 2012. Synergistic parasite-pathogen interactions mediated by host immunity can drive the collapse of honeybee colonies. PLoS Pathog. 8: e1002735.
- O'Neill, S. L., Giordano, A. M. Colbert, T. L. Karr, and H. M. Robertson. 1992. 16S rRNA phylogenetic analysis of the bacterial endosymbionts associated with cytoplasmic incompatibility in insects. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. 89: 2699–2702.
- Pattabhiramaiah, M., D. Brückner, and M. S. Reddy. 2010. Horizontal transmission of *Wolbachia* in the honeybee subspecies *Apis mellifera carnica* and its ectoparasite *Varroa destructor*. Int. J. Environ. Sci. 2: 526–535.
- Potts, S. G., C. Biesmeijer, C. Kremen, P. Neumann, O. Schweiger, and W. E. Kunin. 2010a. Global pollinator declines: trends, impacts and drivers. Trends Ecol. Evol. 25: 345–353.
- Potts, S. G., P. M. Roberts, R. Dean, G. Marris, M. A. Brown, and R. Jones. 2010b. Declines of managed honey bees and beekeepers in Europe. J. Apicul. Res. 49: 15–22.
- Rasgon, J. L., and T. W. Scott. 2003. Wolbachia and cytoplasmic incompatibility in the California *Culex pipiens* mosquito species complex: parameter estimates and infection dynamics in natural populations. Genetics 165: 2029–2038.
- Rosenkranz, P., P. Aumeier, and B. Ziegelmann. 2010. Biology and control of Varroa destructor. J. Invert. Pathol. 103: S96–S119.
- Ryabov, E. V., R. Wood, J. M. Fannon, J. D. Moore, J. C. Bull, and D. Chandler. 2014. A virulent strain of Deformed Wing Virus (DWV) of honeybees (*Apis mellifera*) prevails after *Varroa destructor*-mediated, or in vitro, transmission. PLoS Pathog. 10: e1004230.
- Sandrock, C., M. Tanadini, L. G. Tanadini, A. Fauser-Misslin, S. G. Potts, and P. Neumann. 2014. Impact of chronic neonicotinoid exposure on honeybee colony performance and queen supersedure. PLoS One 9: e103592.
- Schneider, D. I., Klasson, A. E. Lind, and W. J. Miller. 2014. More than fishing in the dark: PCR of a dispersed sequence produces simple but ultrasensitive *Wolbachia* detection. BMC Microbiol. 14: 121.
- Schroeder, D. C., and S. J. Martin. 2012. Deformed wing virus: The main suspect in unexplained honeybee deaths worldwide. Virulence 3: 589–591.
- Simoes, P. M., Mialdea, D. Reiss, M. F. Sagot, and S. Charlat. 2011. Wolbachia detection: an assessment of standard PCR Protocols. Mol. Ecol. Resour. 11: 567–572.
- Spleen, A. M., J. Lengerich, K. Rennich, D. Caron, R. Rose, and J. S. Pettis. 2013. A national survey of managed honey bee 2011–12 winter colony losses in the United States: results from the Bee Informed Partnership. J. Apicul. Res. 52: 44–53.
- Steinhauer, N. A., Rennich, M. E. Wilson, D. M. Caron, E. J. Lengerich, and J. S. Pettis. 2014. A national survey of managed honey bee 2012–2013 annual colony losses in the USA: results from the Bee Informed Partnership. J. Apicul. Res. 53: 1–18.

- Sumpter, D. J. T., and S. J. Martin. 2004. The dynamics of virus epidemics in *Varroa*-infested honey bee colonies. J. Anim. Ecol. 73: 51–63.
- Tsai, K.-H., G. Huang, W. J. Wu, C. K. Chuang, C. C. Lin, and W. J. Chen. 2006. Parallel infection of Japanese encephalitis virus and *Wolbachia* within cells of mosquito salivary glands. J. Med. Entomol. 43: 752–756.
- Unckless, R. L., and J. Jaenike. 2012. Maintenance of a male-killing Wolbachia in Drosophila innubila by male-killing dependent and male-killing independent mechanisms. Evology 66: 678–689.
- van der Zee, R., R. Brodschneider, V. Brusbardis, J. D. Charrière, R. Chlebo, and M. F. Coffey. 2014. Results of international standardised beekeeper surveys of colony losses for winter 2012–2013: analysis of winter loss rates and mixed effects modelling of risk factors for winter loss. J. Apicul. Res. 53: 19–34.
- van der Zee, R., L. Pisa, S. Andonov, R. Brodschneider, J. D. Charrière, and R. Chlebo. 2012. Managed honey bee colony losses in Canada, China, Europe, Israel and Turkey, for the winters of 2008-9 and 2009-10. J. Apicul. Res. 51: 100–114.
- van Engelsdorp, D., and M. D. Meixner. 2010. A historical review of managed honey bee populations in Europe and the United States and the factors that may affect them. J. Invert. Pathol. 103(Suppl): S80–S95.
- van Engelsdorp, D., J. D. Evans, C. Saegerman, C. Mullin, E. Haubruge, and B. K. Nguyen. 2009. Colony collapse disorder: a descriptive study. PLoS One. 4: e6481.
- Vogt, S. L., Peña-Díaz, and B. B. Finlay. 2015. Chemical communication in the gut: Effects of microbiota-generated metabolites on gastrointestinal bacterial pathogens. Anaerobe 34: 106–115.
- Weinert, L. A., V. Araujo-Jnr, M. Z. Ahmed, and J. J. Welch. 2015. The incidence of bacterial endosymbionts in terrestrial arthropods. Proc. R. Soc. B: Biol. Sci. 282: 20150249–20150249.
- Werren, J. H., Baldo, and M. E. Clark. 2008. Wolbachia: master manipulators of invertebrate biology. Nat. Rev. Microbiol. 6: 741–751.
- Wu, K., and Hoy M. A. 2012. Extended starvation reduced and eliminated Wolbachia, but not Cardinium, from Metaseiulus occidentalis females (Acari: Phytoseiidae): A need to reassess Wolbachia's status in this predatory mite? Journal of Invertebrate Pathology. 109, 20–26.
- Yang, X., and D. L. Cox-Foster. 2005. Impact of an ectoparasite on the immunity and pathology of an invertebrate: evidence for host immunosuppression and viral amplification. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 102: 7470–7475.
- Yu, M.-Z., J. Zhang, X. F. Xue, and X. Y. Hong. 2011. Effects of Wolbachia on mtDNA variation and evolution in natural populations of *Tetranychus urticae* Koch. Insect Mol. Biol. 20: 311–321.
- Yue, C., E. Genersch. 2005. RT-PCR analysis of Deformed wing virus in honeybees (*Apis mellifera*) and mites (*Varroa destructor*). J. Gen. Virol. 86: 3419–3424.
- Zha, X., W. Zhang, C. Zhou, L. Zhang, Z. Xiang, and Q. Xia. 2014. Detection and characterization of *Wolbachia* infection in silkworm. Genet. Mol. Biol. 37: 573–580.
- Zhou, W., F. Rousset, and S. O'Neill. 1998. Phylogeny and PCR-based classification of *Wolbachia* strains using *wsp* gene sequences. Proc. R. Soc. Lond. B Biol. Sci. 265: 509–515.
- Zug, R., and P. Hammerstein. 2015. Bad guys turned nice? A critical assessment of Wolbachia mutualisms in arthropod hosts: Wolbachia mutualisms in arthropods. Biol. Rev. 90: 89–111.