PERSPECTIVE

The European tiered approach for virucidal efficacy testing - rationale for rapidly selecting disinfectants against emerging and re-emerging viral diseases

Maren Eggers¹, Ingeborg Schwebke², Miranda Suchomel³, Valerie Fotheringham⁴, Jürgen Gebel⁵, Bernhard Meyer⁶, Graziella Morace⁷, Hans Joachim Roedger⁸, Christine Roques⁹, Pilar Visa¹⁰, Katrin Steinhauer¹¹
1. Labor Prof Gisela Enders MVZ GbR, Stuttgart, Germany

- 2. Robert Koch-Institute, Berlin, Germany
- 3. Institute of Hygiene and Applied Immunology, Medical University, Vienna, Austria
- 4. Evans Vanodine International PLC, Preston, United Kingdom
- 5. Institute for Hygiene and Public Health, University of Bonn, Germany
- 6. ECOLAB Deutschland GmbH, Monheim, Germany
- 7. Istituto Superiore di Sanità, Rome, Italy
- 8. Lysoform Dr. Hans Rosemann GmbH, Berlin, Germany
- 9. Faculté des sciences pharmaceutiques, Paul Sabatier University, Toulouse, France
- 10. Eurofins BioPharma Product Testing Spain S.L.U, Barcelona, Spain
- 11. Schülke & Mayr GmbH, Norderstedt, Germany

Correspondence: Maren Eggers (eggers@labor-enders.de)

Erggers Maren, Schwebke Ingeborg, Suchomel Miranda, Fotheringham Valerie, Gebel Jürgen, Meyer Bernhard, Morace Graziella, Roedger Hans Joachim, Roques Christine, Visa Pilar, Steinhauer Katrin. The European tiered approach for virucidal efficacy testing – rationale for rapidly selecting disinfectants against emerging and re-emerging viral diseases. Euro Surveill. 2021;26(3):pii=2000708. https://doi.org/10.2807/1560-7917.ES.2021.26.3.2000708

Article submitted on 22 Apr 2020 / accepted on 27 Oct 2020 / published on 21 Jan 2021

When facing an emerging virus outbreak such as severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2), a quick reaction time is key to control the spread. It takes time to develop antivirals and vaccines, and implement vaccination campaigns. Therefore, preventive measures such as rapid isolation of cases and identification and early quarantine of cases' close contacts—as well as masks, physical distancing, hand hygiene, surface disinfection and air control—are crucial to reduce the risk of transmission. In this context, disinfectants and antiseptics with proven efficacy against the outbreak virus should be used. However, biocidal formulations are quite complex and may include auxiliary substances such as surfactants or emollients in addition to active substances. In order to evaluate disinfectants' efficacy objectively, meaningful efficacy data are needed. Therefore, the European Committee for Standardisation technical committee 216 'Chemical disinfectants and antiseptics' Working Group 1 (medical area) has developed standards for efficacy testing. The European tiered approach grades the virucidal efficacy in three levels, with corresponding marker test viruses. In the case of SARS-CoV-2, disinfectants with proven activity against vaccinia virus, the marker virus for the European claim 'active against enveloped viruses', should be used to ensure effective hygiene procedures to control the pandemic.

Background

When facing an emerging infectious disease outbreak, a quick reaction time is crucial to control the spread. However, it takes time to develop and produce therapeutics and/or vaccines [1]. The challenge becomes even greater with a fast-spreading disease such as coronavirus disease (COVID-19) [2]. Like viruses that cause severe acute respiratory syndrome (SARS), Ebola virus disease, Middle East respiratory syndrome (MERS) and Nipah virus infection, SARS coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2)—the causing agent of COVID-19—is an example of a virus that has emerged at the human-animal interface within the last two decades [2-6]. Additionally, air travel has facilitated an increasingly interconnected world with more frequent cross-border movements of people and trade goods, enabling the rapid spread of infectious diseases globally [7].

Measures are needed to control COVID-19, whether these are non-pharmaceutical, a pharmaceutical prophylactic or a pharmaceutical treatment [8,9]. Though COVID-19 pandemic activity decreased in Europe in the early summer months of 2020, a second wave began in autumn and it is possible that additional waves could occur this winter [10]. Non-pharmaceutical measures (NPM)—including rapid isolation of positively tested cases and identification and early quarantine of cases' close contacts, as well as barriers such as masks, physical distancing [11], hand hygiene, surface disinfection and air control in concerned hospital settings remain crucial to reduce the risk of person-to-person

TABLE 1

Standard test methods to substantiate activity claims for medical products for hand, surface and instrument disinfection, according to EN 14885

of virtucidal activity against enveloped Adenovirus struction address of the control of the cont		Test virus	Product claim/field of application							
Vaccinia virus Vaccinia virus (strain Ettree and/or or MWA) Enveloped Fine Monor enveloped Vaccinia virus (strain Ettree and/or or MWA) Enveloped Fine Monor enveloped Vaccinia virus (strain Ettree and/or or MWA) Enveloped Adenovirus Garneriorus (strain Ettree and/or MWA) Enveloped Adenovirus Mono-enveloped Muriae norovirus (MMV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus ype 5, strain Adenovirus (MMV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Muriae norovirus (MMV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus ype 1 (VYL, strain LS-caab) Non-enveloped Adenovirus Mono-enveloped Adenovirus Mono-enveloped Adenovirus Mono-enveloped Muriae norovirus (MMV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus Mono-enveloped Adenovirus Mono-enveloped Adenovirus Gadenovirus ype 5, strain Adenovirus Adenovirus (MMV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus Gadenovirus Gadenovirus Gadenovirus Gadenovirus Gadenovirus Gadenovirus Gadenovirus Gadenovirus Adenovirus Gadenovirus Gadenovirus Gadenovirus Gadenovirus Adenovirus Gadenovirus Gadeno	Type of activity		Surgical							
	Type of delivity		Phase/step			handrub or	mechanical	mechanical		
Windida		Vaccinia virus								
enveloped viruses Vaccinia virus Vac	Virucidal		2/1	EN 14476	EN 14476	NI	EN 14476	EN 14476	EN 14476 ^b	
Virucidal activity Virucid		Enveloped								
Enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type s, strain Adenovirus (andenovirus type s, strain Adenovirus (andenovirus (andenovirus type s, strain Adenovirus (andenovirus (andenoviru		Vaccinia virus							EN 17111 [30]	
Enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped spectrum of virucidal activity against enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus ((ANN, strain S99) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus ((ANN, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus ((ANN, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus type 1 ((PVI, strain LSc-zab) Non-enveloped Adenovirus type 1 ((PVI, strain LSc-zab) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus ((ANN, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus ((ANN		(strain Elstree and/or MVA)	2/2	NA	NA	NI	EN 16777	Approved ^c	pre-cleaning	
(adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain 599) Non-enveloped spectrum of virucidal activity against noro-rota- and adenovirus spectrum of virucidal serveloped viruses plus noro-rota- and adenovirus spectrum (MNV, strain 599) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (Adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain 599) Non-enveloped Adenovirus type 1 (PV1. strain LSc-zab) Non-enveloped Adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (Adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain 599) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain 599) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (Adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain 599) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (MNV, strain 599)		,								
Limited spectrum of viruscidal and adenovirus surges place in the provided spectrum of viruscidal selections of the provided spectrum of viruscidal selections of the provided spectrum of viruscidal selections of virus selections of viru			2/1	EN 14476	EN 14476	NI	EN 14476	EN 14476	NI	
Limited spectrum of virucidal activity against enveloped (MNV, strain S99) **Mon-enveloped adenovirus** Murine norovirus										
Limited spectrum of virucidal activity against enveloped wiruses plus noro-, rota- and adenovirus spectrum (MNV, strain S99) **Non-enveloped Murine norovirus** (MNV, strain S99) **Non-enveloped Murine norovirus** (MNV, strain S99) **Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) **Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) **Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) **Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) **Non-enveloped Adenovirus (MNV, strain S99) **Non-enveloped Adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) **Non-enveloped Adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) **Non-enveloped Adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) **Non-enveloped Adenovirus type 6, strain Adenoid 75) **Non-enveloped Adenovirus type 7, strain Adenoid 75) **Non-enveloped Adenovirus ty		Non-enveloped								
Spectrum of virucidal activity against enveloped (Adenovirus Spectrum of virucidal activity against enveloped (Adenovirus Spectrum of virus) (AMN, strain 599) Non-enveloped (Adenovirus) (MNV, strain 599) Non-enveloped (Adenovirus) (Adenovirus) Non-enveloped (Adenovirus) (Adenovirus) Non-enveloped (Adenovirus) (Adenovirus) (Adenovirus) (Adenovirus) (Adenovirus) Non-enveloped (Adenovirus) (Aden		Murine norovirus								
activity against enveloped Adenovirus enveloped viruses plus noro-, rota- and adenovirus specification in Adenoid 75) **Non-enveloped Adenovirus ((adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75)** **Non-enveloped Poliovirus type 1 ((PV1, strain LSc-2ab)) **Non-enveloped Adenovirus ((adenovirus type 1, strain Adenoid 75)** **Non-enveloped Adenovirus ((adenovirus type 1, strain Adenoid 75)** **Non-enveloped Adenovirus ((adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75)** **Non-enveloped Adenovirus ((adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75)** **Non-enveloped Murine norovirus ((MNV, strain S99)** **Non-enveloped Adenovirus ((adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75)** **Non-enveloped Adenovirus ((adenovirus type 6, strain Adenoid 75)** **Non-enveloped Adenoid 75)** **Non-enveloped Adenovirus ((adenovirus type 6, strain Adenoid 75)** **Non-enveloped Adenoid 75)	spectrum	(MNV, strain S99)								
viruses plus noro-, rota- and adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Poliovirus type 1 (PV1, strain LSc-2ab) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (morine for polivirus type 1) (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (morine for polivirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (morine for polivirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (morine for polivirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (morine for polivirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (morine for polivirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (morine for polivirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenoid for polivirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenoid for polivirus type 6, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenoid for polivirus type 6, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenoid for polivirus type 6, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenoid for polivirus type 6, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenoid for polivirus type 6, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenoid for polivirus type 6, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenoid for polivirus type 6, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenoid for polivirus type 6, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenoid for polivirus type 6, strain Adenoid for polivirus type 6, strain Adenoid for polivirus type 7, polivirus type 8,	activity against	Non-enveloped								
Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus type I (PV1, strain LSc-zab) Non-enveloped Adenovirus type s, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (indepoint in the strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus type s, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (indepoint in the strain S99) Not yet approved by Not yet	enveloped	Adenovirus	2/2	(exclusively murine		NI	EN 16777		NI	
Non-enveloped 2/2 (exclusively murine norovirus) Not yet approved Ni EN 16777 Not yet approved Ni EN 14476 Ni EN 14476 EN 14										
Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Politovirus type I (PV1, strain LSc-zab) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99)		Non-enveloped								
Non-enveloped Poliovirus type I (PV1, strain LSc-zab) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99)		Murine norovirus								
Poliovirus type I ((PV1, strain LSc-2ab) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Virucidal activity Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (indenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (indenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (indenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (indenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Not yet approved be appro		(MNV, strain S99)								
(PV1, strain LSc-2ab) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99)		Non-enveloped								
Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus (adenovirus (adenovirus)) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (mon-enveloped Adenovirus (mon-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (mon-enveloped Murine norovirus)		Poliovirus type I								
Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Mon-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Mon-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99)		(PV1, strain LSc-2ab)								
(adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Virucidal activity Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Mon-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99)		Non-enveloped	2/1	EN 14476	EN 14476	NI	EN 14476	EN 14476		
Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Virucidal activity Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (mnv, strain S99) Non-enveloped Adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (mnv, strain S99) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (mnv, strain S99)		Adenovirus							EN 14476	
Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Poliovirus Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Not yet approvedb Not yet approvedb Not yet approvedb Not yet approvedb (a to 'C: exclusively MVM for chemothermal disinfection)									exclusively MVM for chemothermal	
Virucidal activity Non-enveloped Poliovirus Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Non-enveloped Non-enveloped Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) PrEN 17430 (exclusively murine norovirus (mNV, strain S99) Mot yet approved NI		Non-enveloped								
Virucidal activity Non-enveloped		Murine norovirus								
Non-enveloped Poliovirus Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99)	Virucidal activity	(MNV, strain S99)								
Poliovirus ^d Non-enveloped Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Poliovirus ^d Non-enveloped Adenovirus prEN 17430 (exclusively murine norovirus) Not yet approved ^b NI EN 16777 Not yet approved ^b exclusively MVM for chemothermal disinfection)		Non-enveloped								
Adenovirus (adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Adenovirus prEN 17430 (exclusively murine norovirus) Not yet approvedb in 16777 Not yet approvedb in 16777 Not yet approvedb in 16777 in 16777		Poliovirus ^d	2/2	(exclusively murine		NI	EN 16777		(≥40°C: exclusively MVM for chemothermal	
(adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) prEN 17430 (exclusively murine norovirus) Not yet approvedb in 16777 Not yet approvedb in 16777 Not yet approvedb in 16777		Non-enveloped								
(adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75) Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99) Adenoid 75) 2/2 (exclusively murine noroved burine norovirus) Not yet approved burine noroved burine norovirus) Not yet approved burine norovirus Not yet approved burine norovirus) Not yet approved burine norovirus		Adenovirus								
Non-enveloped Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99)										
Murine norovirus (MNV, strain S99)		Non-enveloped								
		Murine norovirus								
		(MNV, strain S99)								
in circulated a second s		Non-enveloped								

MNV: murine norovirus; MVA: modified vaccinia virus Ankara; MVM: minute virus of mice; NA: not applicable; NI: no intention to develop a test; PV1: poliovirus type 1.

^a EN 14476 is not applicable for surgical handrub and handwash products because surgical products are designed to be effective against resident microbiota and viruses are part of the transient microbiota.

^b No work item yet approved, but relevant standards may become available in the future.

 $^{^{\}mbox{\tiny c}}$ Work item approved.

^d Must be tested in the corresponding suspension test; poliovirus cannot be used for surfaces, because of drying problems.

transmission of SARS-CoV-2 by asymptomatic, presymptomatic or symptomatic infected persons in healthcare and non-healthcare (e.g. community) settings.

The use of antiseptics and disinfectants has long been a widely accepted part of infection prevention and control to support healthcare professionals, patients and people at higher risk of serious illness with rapid and efficacious measures. In general, biocidal disinfectant or antiseptic formulations are complex and may include auxiliary substances such as surfactants or emollients in addition to active substances, which can influence the effect of the disinfectant. Therefore, recommending to use a product that contains a certain biocidal active substance is not adequate to identify suitable products.

In general, it is important to have a standardised test protocol for comparing the efficacy of disinfectant and antiseptic products [12]. In order to select antiseptics and disinfectants with proven efficacy, the European Committee for Standardisation (CEN, Comité Européen de Normalisation in French) established the technical committee (TC) 216 in 1990 for chemical disinfectants and antiseptics. The scope of this TC is to set up guidance for the standardisation of the terminology, requirements, test methods (including potential efficacy under in-use conditions), recommendations for use and labelling of chemical disinfectants and antiseptics. This committee consists of delegates from different European countries, with representatives from governments, competent authorities (i.e. public health institutes, regulatory authorities), official institutes, universities, test laboratories and manufacturers of antiseptics and disinfectants.

European standards for testing antiseptics and disinfectants are based on a tiered approach, using relevant surrogate test organisms. This helps to facilitate efficacy tests and to develop adequate practical recommendations regarding the disinfectants that can be used immediately in an ongoing outbreak, which will add confidence to the bundle of measures necessary to prevent spread of infectious diseases.

Test principle of European standards: surrogate test viruses and tiered test approach in EN 14476

Information on the efficacy of disinfectants and antiseptics against emerging enveloped viruses such as Ebola virus (EBOV) or SARS-CoV-2 is limited because of the high biosafety level (BSL) of these viruses or because they are not available in laboratories, particularly at the beginning of an outbreak. To avoid this problem, vaccinia virus (modified vaccinia virus Ankara (MVA) or vaccinia virus strain Elstree, respectively) was introduced as a surrogate virus for the European claim 'active against enveloped viruses' in 2015, after in vitro studies comparing MVA with EBOV, SARS-CoV-1 and MERS-coronavirus (CoV) using povidone-iodine (PVP-I)

showed that vaccinia virus was the most resilient virus [13,14]. This is in line with a publication that demonstrated in its investigation of enveloped viruses—such as Zika virus, EBOV and coronaviruses—that vaccinia is a suitable and safe surrogate when looking at the virucidal efficacy of alcoholic formulations for hand disinfectants [15]. Meanwhile, the efficacy of these disinfectants (PVP-I and alcoholic World Health Organization formulations) has also been proven against SARS-CoV-2 [16,17].

The European approach with surrogate organisms has been effective for more than 60 years against bacteria and for about 40 years against viruses, e.g. in German national standards. The choice of surrogate viruses is of great importance when establishing a standardised test. The requirements for standardised surrogate viruses are: high resistance to disinfectants and drying, combined with simple virus propagation in cell culture, availability in virus collections and a low BSL (BSL 1 and 2). For example, 30 years ago, European virucidal activity tests focused only on the most resistant virus: hepatitis A, a picornavirus that it is difficult to handle in a routine testing laboratory. The poliovirus 1 Sabin vaccine strain Lsc-2ab, another picornavirus, can easily be handled in cell culture for virus propagation and therefore became the first surrogate virus for the claim 'virucidal activity'.

Presently, the tiered approach on the virucidal standard EN 14476 [18] consists of two parts: three different activity levels and two kinds of test methods, as shown in Table 1.

The three European virucidal activity levels take into account that enveloped viruses contain lipids and have lipophilic properties (Box). These viruses are sensitive to disinfectants that contain active substances that disrupt their lipid bilayer envelope. In contrast, nonenveloped viruses are usually hydrophilic and less susceptible to disinfectants. Thus, viruses can be grouped according to these properties (Table 2).

Test methods to prove efficacy of a disinfectant

The CEN/TC 216 requires a stepwise procedure for efficacy testing of disinfectants, i.e. first a test in suspension (EN phase 2, step 1), followed by a test simulating practical conditions in the laboratory (EN phase 2, step 2). This tiered approach, including organic soiling, is described in the framework standard EN 14885 [19]. The quantitative suspension test EN 14476 is a phase 2, step 1 test [18] and is the first tier to evaluate the performance of the disinfectant in terms of concentration and contact time ratio. The EN 14476 demands a 4 log reduction (deactivating 99.99%) of the respective test viruses as the minimum measure of efficacy. In addition, activity tests have to be performed in compliance with adequate quality assurance systems and according to valid test procedures, as described in the relevant European standard(s) [19]. In recent years,

TABLE 2

Activity spectrum of the surrogate viruses for virucidal efficacy testing

Activity claim	Test virus	Activity spectrum (examples ^a)			
		Viruses causing blood-borne infections			
	Vaccinia virus (strain Elstree and/ or MVA)	Hepatitis B virus (HBV), hepatitis C virus (HCV), human immunodeficiency virus (HIV)			
		Viruses causing respiratory infections			
		Human coronaviruses (e.g. SARS-CoV-2 and MERS-CoV), influenza virus A (e.g. subtype H1N1, H3N2) and B, metapneumovirus, respiratory syncytial virus (RSV)			
Minusidal activitus and act		Viruses causing other viral infections			
Virucidal activity against enveloped viruses		Herpesviridae (cytomegalievirus (CVMV), herpes-simplex-virus types 1 and 2 (HSV-1, HSV-2), Epstein-Barr virus (EBV), varizella zoster virus (VZV))			
	Enveloped	Paramyxoviruses (Nipah virus, measles virus, mumps virus, rubella virus)			
		Viruses causing travel-associated or vector-borne infections			
		Bunyavirus (sandfly fever virus), dengue virus (DENV), Ebola virus (EBOV), tick-borne encephalitis virus (TBEV), Hantaan virus, Crimean-Congo hemorrhagic fever virus, Lassa virus, Marburg virus, rabies virus, West Nile virus (WNV), Yellow fever virus (YFV), Zika virus			
	Adenovirus	Viruses mentioned above			
	(adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75)	Viruses causing viral gastrointestinal infections			
Limited spectrum of virucidal activity:		Adenovirus serotypes 40 and 41, norovirus, rotavirus			
enveloped viruses plus noro-,	Non-enveloped	Viruses causing respiratory infections			
rota- and adenoviruses	Murine norovirus	Adenovirus serotype 7			
	(MNV, strain S99)	Viruses causing keratoconjunctivitis			
	Non-enveloped	Adenovirus serotypes 8, 19 and 37			
	Poliovirus type I	Viruses mentioned above			
	(PV1, strain LSc- 2ab)	Viruses causing gastrointestinal infections			
		Adenovirus serotypes 40 and 41, norovirus, rotavirus			
	Non-enveloped	Viruses causing respiratory infections			
Virucidal activity:	Adenovirus	Adenovirus serotype 7			
non-enveloped viruses and enveloped viruses	(adenovirus type 5, strain Adenoid 75)	Viruses causing keratoconjunctivitis			
enveloped viruses	Non-enveloped	Adenovirus serotypes 8, 19 and 37			
	Murine norovirus	Viruses causing other virus infections			
	(MNV, strain S99)	Enteroviruses (Coxsackie virus, echovirus, polioviruses, rhinoviruses, enterovirus 71, Enterovirus 68 (EV-D68))			
	Non-enveloped	Parechoviruses (echovirus 22 and 23)			
	Murine parvorvirus				
Chemothermal disinfection≥40°C	(minute virus of mice (MVM), strain Crawford)	Textile disinfection or instrument disinfection			
	Non-enveloped				

MVA: modified vaccinia virus Ankara.

^aThis list is not exhaustive.

European virucidal activity levels

- Virucidal activity against enveloped viruses: Activity against enveloped viruses (e.g. influenza (including avian influenza A (H7N9)), herpes viruses, HIV, HBV, HCV, Zika virus, Ebola virus, coronaviruses (including SARS-CoV-2 and MERS-CoV) and flaviviruses). This claim is for hand disinfection, surface disinfection and pre-cleaning products for instruments, which are combined cleaner/disinfectants.
- Limited spectrum virucidal activity: Activity against non-enveloped noroviruses, rotaviruses, adenoviruses and enveloped viruses. This claim is for hand disinfection and surface disinfection.
- Virucidal activity: Activity against viruses, including non-enveloped (e.g. polioviruses and enteroviruses, such as enterovirus 71 and enterovirus D68) and enveloped viruses. This claim is for hand disinfection, surface disinfection, instrument disinfection and taytile disinfection

HBV: hepatitis B virus; HCV: hepatitis C virus; MERS-CoV: Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus; SARS-CoV-2: severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2.

tests simulating practical conditions have been developed for surface, instrument and hand disinfectants that take into account the application of a specific disinfectant under evaluation.

Phase 2, step 2 tests reflecting close to real-life conditions

Surface disinfection

Viruses may persist on surfaces for several days or even months [20] and can be transferred directly from contaminated surfaces to susceptible individuals [21]. Therefore, the disinfection of surfaces frequently touched by patients and staff such as door handles, faucets and railings plays an important role in the prevention and control of viral outbreaks in healthcare settings. Disinfectants must be tested for their efficacy under standardised, close to real-life conditions to ensure that they are able to inactivate viruses. This approach has long been standardised according to European principles for testing the bactericidal activity of chemical disinfectants [22,23]. Bactericidal disinfectants are tested stepwise according to European test principles, starting with a suspension test (EN phase 2, step 1) and then a quantitative non-porous carrier test simulating practical conditions (EN phase 2, step 2) [18]. It is also possible for the activity of virucidal products intended for surface disinfection to be tested under practical conditions (phase 2, step 2) according to the EN 16777 standard [24,25].

Handrub disinfection

In order to further improve our knowledge of the time/concentration relationships of handrubs, taking into consideration practical conditions for use in clinical surroundings, more practical testing (phase 2, step 2 tests) are necessary, such as the EN 1500 for evaluating the bactericidal efficacies of hygienic handrubs [26]. In such tests, the bactericidal efficacy of products is compared with that of a reference procedure on hands of volunteers artificially contaminated with *Escherichia coli* K12. Since most emerging viruses are enveloped viruses, a relevant surrogate for products with activity against enveloped viruses should be sought. More than

30 years ago, tests with vaccinia virus were performed on the fingertips of volunteers [27]; however, today this can no longer be justified ethically due to safety concerns. Thus, there is currently no approved surrogate enveloped virus available for testing hand hygiene products that is harmless and can be used in studies with volunteers. Until a suitable assay with an appropriate surrogate can be proposed, only data of the EN 14476 suspension test (phase 2, step 1) is available. However, there is a preliminary phase 2, step 2 standard prEN 17430 [28] that employs the murine norovirus strain S99, a non-enveloped and non-pathogenic RNA virus to simulate practical conditions for virucidal hygienic handrub products; this is harmonised with the EN 1500 standard. Being more resistant to chemicals than enveloped viruses, the murine norovirus can be considered a suitable surrogate to support the claims 'limited spectrum virucidal activity' and 'virucidal activity' (if all criteria have been met in a phase 2, step 1 test) based on the tiered concept of CEN/TC 216 [29].

Conclusions

Disinfectants and antiseptics are part of the bundle of measures necessary to achieve infection prevention and control in healthcare settings and the community. The European tiered approach of grading the virucidal efficacy as 'virucidal activity against enveloped viruses', 'limited spectrum of virucidal activity' and 'virucidal activity' helps to select the most appropriate claim for emerging or re-emerging virus outbreaks, with a proven concentration and contact time. This leads to the correct choice of test method to determine the appropriate use, concentration and contact time of antiseptics and disinfectants.

The standards outlined in Table 1 are subject to mutual recognition in the European Union and replace previous national standards. Furthermore, the standardised test protocol based on the use of surrogate viruses and two methodical steps also helps to compare formulations in an objective way, thus providing proven efficacy to the end user.

Acknowledgements

We thank the CEN/TC 216 /WG5 strategy group and Glenn Sung, Singapore, for the helpful discussion.

Conflict of interest

ME: Member of the European Committees for standardisation (Chemical disinfectants and antiseptics) WG 1 and WG5, responsible for the virucidal task group of CEN/TC 216/ WG1. In addition, chairwoman of the Commission for Virus Disinfection of the German Association for the Control of Virus Diseases (DVV) e.V. and the German Society for Virology e.V.

IS: Chairwoman of the Commission for Virus Disinfection of the DVV e.V. and the German Society for Virology e.V. MS: No conflict of interest

VF: Former convenor of CEN/TC 216 /WG2 and retired chief microbiologist at Evans Vanodine International PLC, Preston, United Kingdom

JG: Convenor of the German mirror group of CEN/TC 216/ WG1

BM: Senior Scientist at ECOLAB Deutschland GmbH, Monheim, Germany

GM: No conflict of interest

HJR: Convenor of CEN/TC 216/ WG5 (strategy group) and CEO at Lysoform Dr. Hans Rosemann GmbH, Berlin, Germany

CR: Chairperson of CEN/TC 216

PV: Spanish delegate of Spanish Association for Standardisation and Certification (AENOR) and Senior Scientific Advisor at Eurofins BioPharma Product Testing Spain S.L.U, Barcelona, Spain

KS: Convenor of CEN/TC 216/ WG1 and Senior Head of Research & Scientific Services at Schülke & Mayr GmbH, Norderstedt, Germany

Authors' contributions

ME designed, coordinated and formulated the position paper. IS, MS, VF, JG, PV, BM, GM, HJR, CR, and KS mainly helped to draft the position paper. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

References

6

- Lurie N, Saville M, Hatchett R, Halton J. Developing Covid-19 Vaccines at Pandemic Speed. N Engl J Med. 2020;382(21):1969-73. https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMp2005630 PMID: 32227757
- Zhu N, Zhang D, Wang W, Li X, Yang B, Song J, et al. A novel coronavirus from patients with pneumonia in China, 2019. N Engl J Med. 2020;382(8):727-33. https://doi.org/10.1056/ NEJM0a2001017 PMID: 31978945
- 3. Chua KB, Bellini WJ, Rota PA, Harcourt BH, Tamin A, Lam SK et al. Nipah virus: a recently emergent deadly paramyxovirus. Science. 2000;288:1432-35.4.
- 4. Peiris JS, Yuen KY, Osterhaus AD, Stohr K. The severe acute respiratory syndrome. N Engl J Med. 2003;349:2431-41.5.
- 5. Zaki AM, van Boheemen S, Bestebroer TM, Osterhaus AD, Fouchier RA. Isolation of a novel coronavirus from a man with pneumonia in Saudi Arabia. N Engl J Med. 2012;367:1814-20.6.
- Piot P, Spencer J. From 1976 to 2018: reflections on early investigations into the Ebola virus. Trans R Soc Trop Med Hyg. 2018;112:527-28.7.
- Suk JE, Van Cangh T, Beauté J, Bartels C, Tsolova S, Pharris A, et al. The interconnected and cross-border nature of

- risks posed by infectious diseases. Glob Health Action. 2014;7(1):25287. https://doi.org/10.3402/gha.v7.25287 PMID: 25308818
- 8. World Health Organization (WHO). WHO COVID-19. Experimental Treatments. Classification of treatment types. Geneva: WHO; 2020. Available from: https://www.who.int/docs/de-fault-source/coronaviruse/covid-classi-fication-of-treatment-types-rev.pdf
- World Health Organization (WHO). DRAFT landscape of COVID-19 candidate vaccines 2020. Geneva: WHO. [Accessed 20 Jan 2021]. Available from: https://www.who.int/publications/m/item/ draft-landscape-of-covid-19-candidate-vaccines
- 10. European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control (ECDC). Risk related to spread of new SARS-CoV-2 variants of concern in the EU/EEA -29 December2020. Stockholm: ECDC; 2020. Available from: https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/publications-data/covid-19-risk-assessment-spread-new-sars-cov-2-variants-eueea
- Chu DK, Akl EA, Duda S, Solo K, Yaacoub S, Schünemann HJ, et al. Physical distancing, face masks, and eye protection to prevent person-to-person transmission of SARS-CoV-2 and COVID-19: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Lancet. 2020;395(10242):1973-87. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(20)31142-9 PMID: 32497510
- Liu Y, Li T, Deng Y, Liu S, Zhang D, Li H, et al. Stability of SARS-CoV-2 on environmental surfaces and in human excreta. J Hosp Infect. 2021;107:105-7. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. jhin.2020.10.021 PMID: 33137445
- 13. Eggers M, Eickmann M, Kowalski K, Zorn J, Reimer K. Povidoneiodine hand wash and handrub products demonstrated excellent in vitro virucidal efficacy against Ebola virus and modified vaccinia virus Ankara, the new European test virus for enveloped viruses. BMC Infect Dis. 2015;15(1):375. https://doi. org/10.1186/s12879-015-1111-9 PMID: 26381737
- 14. Eggers M, Eickmann M, Zorn J. Rapid and Effective Virucidal Activity of Povidone-Iodine Products Against Middle East Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus (MERS-CoV) and Modified Vaccinia Virus Ankara (MVA). Infect Dis Ther. 2015;4(4):491-501. https://doi.org/10.1007/s40121-015-0091-9 PMID: 26416214
- 15. Siddharta A, Pfaender S, Vielle NJ, Dijkman R, Friesland M, Becker B, et al. Virucidal Activity of World Health Organization-Recommended Formulations Against Enveloped Viruses, Including Zika, Ebola, and Emerging Coronaviruses. J Infect Dis. 2017;215(6):902-6. https://doi.org/10.1093/infdis/jix046 PMID: 28453839
- 16. Anderson DE, Sivalingam V, Kang AEZ, Ananthanarayanan A, Arumugam H, Jenkins TM, et al. Povidone-lodine Demonstrates Rapid In Vitro Virucidal Activity Against SARS-CoV-2, The Virus Causing COVID-19 Disease. Infect Dis Ther. 2020;9(3):669-75. https://doi.org/10.1007/540121-020-00316-3 PMID: 32643111
- 17. Kratzel A, Todt D, V'kovski P, Steiner S, Gultom M, Thao TTN, et al. Inactivation of Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus 2 by WHO-Recommended Hand Rub Formulations and Alcohols. Emerg Infect Dis. 2020;26(7):1592-5. https://doi.org/10.3201/eid2607.200915 PMID: 32284092
- 18. EN 14476:2013+A1:2015+prA2:2019. Chemical disinfectants and antiseptics. Quantitative suspension test for the evaluation of virucidal activity in the medical area. Test method and requirements (Phase 2/Step 1).
- EN 14885:2018. Chemical disinfectants and antiseptics -Application of European Standards for chemical disinfectants and antiseptics.
- 20. Kramer A, Schwebke I, Kampf G. How long do nosocomial pathogens persist on inanimate surfaces? A systematic review. BMC Infect Dis. 2006;6(1):130. https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2334-6-130 PMID: 16914034
- Otter JA, Yezli S, French GL. The role played by contaminated surfaces in the transmission of nosocomial pathogens. Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol. 2011;32(7):687-99. https://doi. org/10.1086/660363 PMID: 21666400
- van Klingeren B. Disinfectant testing on surfaces. J Hosp Infect. 1995;30(Suppl):397-408. https://doi.org/10.1016/0195-6701(95)90044-6 PMID: 7560978
- 23. van Klingerem B, Koller W, Bloomfield SF, Böhm R, Cremieux A, Holah J, et al. Assessment of the efficacy of disinfectants on surfaces. Int Biodeterior Biodegradation. 1998;41(3-4):289-96. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0964-8305(98)00020-1
- 24. Rabenau HF, Steinmann J, Rapp I, Schwebke I, Eggers M. Evaluation of a virucidal quantitative carrier test for surface disinfectants. PLoS One. 2014;9(1):e86128. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0086128 PMID: 24475079
- 25. EN 16777:2018. Chemical disinfectants and antiseptics Quantitative non-porous surface test without mechanical action for the evaluation of virucidal activity of chemical

- disinfectants used in the medical area Test method and requirements (phase 2/step 2); German version.
- 26. EN 1500:2013 Chemical disinfectants and antiseptics. Hygienic handrub. Test method and requirements (Phase 2/Step 2).
- 27. Schürmann W, Eggers HJ. Antiviral activity of an alcoholic hand disinfectant. Comparison of the in vitro suspension test with in vivo experiments on hands, and on individual fingertips. Antiviral Res. 1983;3(1):25-41. https://doi.org/10.1016/0166-3542(83)90012-8 PMID: 6870229
- 28. prEN17430:2019. Chemical disinfectants and antiseptics Hygienic handrub virucidal Test method and requirements (phase 2/step 2).
- 29. Eggers M, Benzinger C, Suchomel M, Hjorth E. Virucidal activity of three ethanol-based hand rubs against murine norovirus in a hand hygiene clinical simulation study. Future Microbiol. 2020;15(14):1335-41.; Epub ahead of print. https:// doi.org/10.2217/fmb-2020-0168 PMID: 32960094
- 30. EN 17111:2018. Chemical disinfectants and antiseptics -Quantitative carrier test for the evaluation of virucidal activity for instruments used in the medical area - Test method and requirements (phase 2, step 2); German version

License, supplementary material and copyright

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY 4.0) Licence. You may share and adapt the material, but must give appropriate credit to the source, provide a link to the licence and indicate if changes were made.

Any supplementary material referenced in the article can be found in the online version.

This article is copyright of the authors or their affiliated institutions, 2021.