

## Article

# **Population Dynamics of** *Anopheles albimanus* (Diptera: Culicidae) at Ipetí-Guna, a Village in a Region Targeted for Malaria Elimination in Panamá

# Lisbeth Amarilis Hurtado<sup>1</sup>, Chystrie A. Rigg<sup>2</sup>, José E. Calzada<sup>2</sup>, Sahir Dutary<sup>1</sup>, Damaris Bernal<sup>3</sup>, Susana Isabel Koo<sup>3</sup> and Luis Fernando Chaves<sup>4,5,\*</sup>

- <sup>1</sup> Departamento de Análisis Epidemiológico y Bioestadísticas, Instituto Conmemorativo Gorgas de Estudios de la Salud, Apartado Postal 0816-02593, Panamá, Republic of Panama; lhurtado@gorgas.gob.pa (L.A.H.); sdutary@gorgas.gob.pa (S.D.)
- <sup>2</sup> Departamento de Investigación en Parasitología, Instituto Conmemorativo Gorgas de Estudios de la Salud, Apartado Postal 0816-02593, Panamá, Republic of Panama; chrigg@gorgas.gob.pa (C.A.R.); jcalzada@gorgas.gob.pa (J.E.C.)
- <sup>3</sup> Departamento de Investigación en Entomología Médica, Instituto Conmemorativo Gorgas de Estudios de la Salud, Apartado Postal 0816-02593, Panamá, Republic of Panama; dbernal@gorgas.gob.pa (D.B.); skoo@gorgas.gob.pa (S.I.K.)
- <sup>4</sup> Instituto Costarricense de Investigación y Enseñanza en Nutrición y Salud (INCIENSA), Apartado Postal 4-2250, Tres Ríos, Cartago, Costa Rica
- <sup>5</sup> Programa de Investigación en Enfermedades Tropicales (PIET), Escuela de Medicina Veterinaria, Universidad Nacional, Apartado Postal 304-3000, Heredia, Costa Rica
- \* Correspondence: lfchavs@gmail.com; Tel.: +506-8861-8433

Received: 22 May 2018; Accepted: 17 July 2018; Published: 16 November 2018



Abstract: Anopheles albimanus Wiedemann is a major malaria vector in Mesoamerica and the Caribbean whose population dynamics, in response to changing environments, has been relatively poorly studied. Here, we present monthly adult and larvae data collected from May 2016 to December 2017 in Ipetí-Guna, a village within an area targeted for malaria elimination in the República de Panamá. During the study period we collected a total of 1678 Anopheles spp. mosquitoes (1602 adults and 76 larvae). Over 95% of the collected Anopheles spp. mosquitoes were An. albimanus. Using time series analysis techniques, we found that population dynamics of larvae and adults were not significantly correlated with each other at any time lag, though correlations were highest at one month lag between larvae and adults and four months lag between adults and larvae. Larvae population dynamics had cycles of three months and were sensitive to changes in temperature with 5 months lag, while adult abundance was correlated with itself (1 month lag) and with the normalized difference vegetation index (NDVI) with three months lag. A key observation from our study is the absence of both larvae and adults of An. albimanus between January and April from environments associated with Guna population's daily activities, which suggests this time window could be the best time to implement elimination campaigns aimed at clearing *Plasmodium* spp. parasites from Guna populations using, for example, mass drug administration.

Keywords: human landing catch; Plasmodium; climate change; metapopulation; Comarca Madungandí

### 1. Introduction

Panamá is the nation with the highest economic growth in Mesoamerica [1], with a long history of accomplishments [2,3] and landmarks in the study [4–6] and control of mosquito vectors of diseases [7] that occurred in Panamá's territory during the development of the Canal Zone as a colonial possession,



for most of the 20th century, of the United States of America [8]. However, Malaria remains an important vector-borne infectious disease in the República de Panamá [9,10]. In Panamá, where an estimate of 900 cases occurred in 2016 [11], malaria disproportionally impacts indigenous populations, where over 90% of the confirmed malaria infections occur [9,12]. The main indigenous group affected by malaria in Panamá are the Gunas [9,13,14], a Chibcha-related ethnic group that has led the struggle for indigenous autonomy within the República de Panamá [15]. In general, indigenous populations living in the "Comarcas" have a low human development when compared with other provinces in Panamá, and most health indicators for indigenous populations lag well behind those observed in the rest of Panamá [16,17].

Since 2000, around half of the malaria cases occurring in Panamá have been concentrated in Comarca Madungandi, especially in the area surrounding Lake Bayano [18], a man-made artificial lake which historically has been associated with outbreaks of several arboviruses [19]. Research on these outbreaks suggested they were associated with changes in mosquito vector populations, triggered by the large scale landscape transformation necessary to create Lake Bayano, which affected common malaria vectors and other mosquito species [19]. Our research has shown that malaria transmission is sensitive to global climatic phenomena, for example, El Niño Southern Oscillation (ENSO) phases have been associated with changes in malaria transmission in Guna Yala [20] and Madungandí [18], the Comarcas where most of the Gunas live in Panamá. Recent research efforts have been made to understand the distribution and diversity of malaria vector species in the República de Panamá, both at the national scale [21], and in endemic regions [22], the population genetics of dominant vector species [23,24] and their insecticide resistance patterns [25,26]. Nevertheless, how weather impacts the population dynamics of major malaria vectors in Panamá remains, for the most, unknown. This is a major knowledge gap, as vulnerability of Guna populations to malaria transmission changes associated with ENSO is likely modulated by changes in mosquito populations dynamics driven by climatic change and weather variability patterns [18,20,27,28]. Moreover, this lack of knowledge is in sharp contrast with the knowledge of African malaria vectors, where clear association patterns between vector population dynamics, weather patterns and malaria transmission have been described [29–35]. Similarly, studies on the spatial distribution of malaria vectors in Mesoamerica have suggested that vegetation growth and remotely sensed data associated with vegetation growth are useful to predict the abundance of Anopheles spp. mosquitoes [36–39], but no study has looked at the temporal dynamics of association between Anopheles spp. mosquitoes and remotely sensed data on vegetation growth in Panamá, and more generally in Mesoamerica. In that sense, our hypothesis is that population dynamics of common Anopheles spp. mosquito vectors of malaria parasites might be associated with weather variables and the Normalized Difference Vegetation Index (NDVI), an index estimated from satellite images, which is associated with vegetation growth dynamics [40]. To test that hypothesis, we conducted a 20-month-long study on the anopheline fauna, sampled monthly as both larvae and adults, and evaluated the association of the abundance of these mosquito stages with weather variables and the NDVI for Ipetí-Guna, a village in Lake Bayano's basin, Comarca Guna de Madungandi, targeted for malaria elimination in the República de Panamá, and without any previous longitudinal study on Anopheles spp. population dynamics.

#### 2. Materials and Methods

#### 2.1. Study Site

Our study was done in Ipetí-Guna (8°58'12" N, 78°30'36" W) a Guna indigenous village located in Comarca Madungandí, Distrito de Chepo, Panamá Province, República de Panamá (Figure 1). At Ipetí-Guna, over 95% of the houses have a unique room with earthen floors. Construction materials mainly consist of palm fronds used to build walls and thatched roofs. Over 99% of the houses have eaves for ventilation, which are known to favor the infestation by *Anopheles* spp. [4,18]. According to the 2010 National Panamá census [17] Ipetí-Guna has a total population of 711 people in 83 households.

Overall, this village has a low coverage of basic services and most of the inhabitants live in conditions of poverty, for example, over 98% of the people access water from the river, 100% of the household do not have a sanitation system and over 80% of the households (with an average size of 5 members) have a monthly income below 250 US \$ per month, i.e., well below the poverty line of 3 US \$ per person per day [17]. Moreover, less than 1% of the population is covered by Panamá's social security [17].



**Figure 1.** República de Panamá map, highlighting East Panamá province and the location of Ipetí-Guna near the southeastern shore of Lake Bayano. This map was made using as a base a public domain map from the US National Park Service [41].

#### 2.2. Mosquito Sampling

Mosquitoes, adults and larvae, were monthly collected from May 2016 to December 2017. *Anopheles* spp. adults mosquitoes were collected by human landing catch [22], a highly sensitive mosquito sampling method for anopheline mosquitoes [42], at the peridomicile of a housing cluster in Ipetí-Guna (Figure 2). This housing cluster was chosen given the abundance of nearby positive larval habitats. It is worth highlighting that distance from the sampling location to the huts in the housing cluster ranged between 5 m and 10 m. The adult mosquito collections were made over three consecutive nights between 18:00 h and 21:00 h by two trained collectors that switched positions to minimize bias in the abundance estimates [41]. To minimize the infection risk, catches followed World Health Organization (WHO) biosecurity guidelines [43]. *Anopheles* spp. larvae were collected by dipping larval habitats near the households, but also on the Ipetí-Guna River banks and in the farmlands of the community (Figure 2), following the procedure recommended by WHO, of ten dips per square m at a sampling location [43]. Larvae and adults mosquitoes were morphologically identified using a dissection scope and taxonomic keys for the anophelines of Mesoamerica [44,45] and the reference collection at the Instituto Commemorativo Gorgas de Estudios de la Salud (ICGES).



**Figure 2.** Map of Ipetí-Guna, showing the four sampling locations. Mosquito stages sampled are highlighted by colors, and sampling location codes are indicated by letters. For further details please refer to the letters and colors indicated in the inset legends. This map was made using as a base an image from Google Earth [46].

#### 2.3. Weather Data

Temperature and rainfall data were obtained from gridded databases. The data were extracted from the Royal Netherlands Meteorological Institute website, using the KNMI explorer [47]. The specific gridded databases that we employed were: (i) NOAA CPC Morphing Technique ("CMORPH") database to obtain monthly rainfall data, which has a resolution of 0.25° [48]; (ii) NOAA Global Historical Climatology Network version 2 and the Climate Anomaly Monitoring System (GHCN\_CAMS 2m model) for temperature, which has a spatial resolution of 0.5° [49]. To create a seasonal climate profile, with monthly boxplots for the 12 months of the year, monthly data were downloaded from 1998 to 2017 for the study area.

#### 2.4. Vegetation Data

We employed images for the NDVI from the biweekly, 250 m resolution, vegetation product (M\*D13A3), courtesy of the NASA Land Processes Distributed Active Archive Center, USGS/Earth Resources Observation and Science (EROS) Center, Sioux Falls, South Dakota [50]. We used the R package MODIStsp [51] to download and clip NDVI images from the study period. Further GIS

5 of 17

procedures for the downloaded images were made using the package raster also in the statistical software R [52]. Briefly, all images from the study period were stacked into a geotiff, from which the monthly values were extracted, generating a time series in the process [20].

#### 2.5. Time Series Analysis

To study the abundance patterns of *Anopheles albimanus* adults and larvae we followed a standard procedure for time series analysis, where we first inspected the autocorrelation patterns of both time series. We started by inspecting the autocorrelation function (ACF) and the partial autocorrelation function (PACF). Briefly, the ACF depicts the correlation of the time series with itself through time, while the PACF does so considering the correlation between consecutive time lags [53]. With information from both of these functions it was possible to identify time lags associated with population size, of both larvae and adults, at any given time. This information was then used to fit a null model that was used to pre-whiten time series from all the environmental covariates described before. Pre-whitening is a procedure that removes any potential similar autocorrelation from the environmental covariates time series, thus ensuring cross-correlation functions (CCF) show associations that do not emerge from time series having similar autocorrelation structure. To estimate CCFs, we used residuals from the null models fitted to the adults and larvae data and the pre-whitened time series from each environmental covariate. Based on the resulting CCFs we chose lags to fit time series models including the covariates that were associated with mosquito abundance by stage (adults and larvae). The time series models we fitted can be described by the following equation:

$$y_t = \mu + \sum_x \varphi_x(y_{t-x} - \mu) + \sum_x \alpha_x(cov_{t-x} - mean(cov)) + \varepsilon_t$$
(1)

where  $y_t$  is the mosquito abundance at time t, x indicates the time lag,  $\mu$  is the average mosquito abundance during the study period,  $\varphi_x$  the autoregressive coefficients, *cov* indicates a covariate (weather and vegetation variables described above),  $\alpha_x$  the coefficients for the covariates and  $\varepsilon_t$  is the error, which was assumed to be normal, identical and independent [53]. To select the environmental covariates, we used backward elimination guided by the minimization of the Akaike Information Criterion (AIC). AIC is a parameter that trades-off model goodness-of-fit and parameter number, and whose minimization can be used to select among models with a similar number of parameters [53]. For the best model, error assumptions were verified using standard procedures for time series analysis [53].

#### 3. Results

During the study period we collected a total of 1678 mosquitoes, 1602 were adults and 76 larvae. Over 95% of the collected *Anopheles* spp. mosquitoes were *An. albimanus*, 1585 adults and 71 larvae (Table 1). The monthly abundance ( $\pm$ S.D.) of *An. albimanus* was 79.25  $\pm$  96.40 for adults and 3.55  $\pm$  4.70 for larvae. Other anopheline mosquito species collected at the study site included: *Anopheles punctimacula* Dyar & Knab, and *Anopheles punctipennis* (Say), both of these species collected as adults and larvae, and *Anopheles apicimacula* Dyar and Knab, collected only as adult (Table 1).

**Table 1.** Monthly mean abundance of *Anopheles* spp mosquitoes, by stage, collected between May 2016 and December 2017 in Ipetí-Guna, Comarca Madungandí, República de Panamá. The column "Total" indicates the total number of individuals collected for each species during the study period, and the column "Persistence" the proportion of the sampling sessions when a given mosquito species was found among the samples.

|                        | Adults          |       |                 | Larvae        |       |                 |
|------------------------|-----------------|-------|-----------------|---------------|-------|-----------------|
| Species                | Mean $\pm$ SD   | Total | Persistence (%) | Mean $\pm$ SD | Total | Persistence (%) |
| Anopheles albimanus    | $79.25\pm96.40$ | 1585  | 75              | $3.55\pm4.70$ | 71    | 60              |
| Anopheles punctimacula | $0.75\pm2.05$   | 15    | 15              | $0.10\pm0.45$ | 2     | 5               |
| Anopheles apicimacula  | $0.05\pm0.22$   | 1     | 5               |               | —     | _               |
| Anopheles punctipennis | $0.05\pm0.22$   | 1     | 5               | $0.15\pm0.67$ | 3     | 5               |

The mosquito *An. albimanus* was not only the most abundant anopheline mosquito species, but also the most persistent, being present at the study site 75% and 60% of the times mosquitoes were sampled, respectively, as adults and larvae. *An. albimanus* was absent in adult mosquito samples from April to May of 2016 and from February to April of 2017 (Figure 3A), while larvae were absent in May and August 2016, and from January to May, and July of 2017 (Figure 3B). Meanwhile, all other *Anopheles* spp., had very low persistence (Table 1) and were caught mainly during 2016 as both adults (Figure 3C) and larvae (Figure 3D).



**Figure 3.** Monthly mosquito abundance time series (**A**) *Anopheles albimanus* adults (**B**) *Anopheles albimanus* larvae (**C**) Less common *Anopheles* spp. adults (**D**) Less common *Anopheles* spp. larvae. Adults were sampled by human landing catch, and larvae using a dipper. Collected *Anopheles* spp. are presented in the inset legend of panel (**D**). All time series correspond to the studied period, from May 2016 to December 2017. For further details about the sampling, please refer to the mosquito sampling section in the methods.

The persistence and abundance patterns of *An. albimanus* seemed to track changes in rainfall (Figure 4A) and temperature (Figure 4B) at the study site, with both adult and larvae being absent during the dry season that spans from January to April (Figure 4C) and during the hottest season, with the highest temperatures, from February to May (Figure 4D). It is worth highlighting that both rainfall and temperature had record high values during the study period, where rainfall in July 2017, at the peak of the rainy season (Figure 4C), was well above the median, and temperatures were hotter than usual in January, April and December (Figure 4D) when compared with the distribution of records from 1998 to 2017.



**Figure 4.** Monthly weather time series (**A**) Rainfall (**B**) Temperature (**C**) Seasonal rainfall (**D**) Seasonal temperature. In panels (**A**,**B**) the time series correspond to the studied period, from May 2016 to December 2017. In panels (**C**,**D**) each monthly boxplot represents the distribution of records between 1998 and 2017, and the studied period is highlighted by blue lines described in the inset legend of panel (**C**). In the boxplots, the line at the center of each box indicates the median of the collected weather records.

Figure 5 shows the NDVI of the sampling sites for 2016 and 2017, showing the Housing pixel, where larvae and adults were both sampled (Figure 2), had the highest NDVI during the entire study period, followed by the river site and the farm site, which reached low values during the dry season. Autocorrelation functions from the *An. albimanus* abundance time series suggest that adults and larvae had different patterns of temporal abundance association, where adults had a decaying autocorrelation function (Figure 6A), but larvae had a cyclic autocorrelation function (Figure 6B). Both of these were patterns confirmed by the partial autocorrelation functions, which suggested a first order autoregressive process for the adult abundance, i.e., the time series was significantly correlated (p < 0.05) up to one month lag (Figure 6C), while, by contrast, larvae abundance was significantly associated (p < 0.05) in a pattern that suggested cycles with a three month lag (Figure 6D). Regarding the environmental covariates, adults were significantly correlated (p < 0.05) with NDVI

with a three month lag (Figure 6E), while larvae were associated (p < 0.05) with temperature with a five month lag (Figure 6F).



**Figure 5.** Monthly NDVI records. For line codes please refer to the inset legend. House pools and the adult sampling location were in the same 250 m MODIS pixel, referred as Housing in the inset legend.



**Figure 6.** Correlation functions (**A**) *Anopheles albimanus* adult abundance autocorrelation function, ACF; (**B**) *An. albimanus* larvae abundance ACF; (**C**) *An. albimanus* adult abundance partial ACF, PACF; (**D**) *An. albimanus* larvae abundance PACF. Cross correlation functions, CCF, between *An. Albimanus*; (**E**) adults and rainfall, temperature and NDVI, based on the data for House (**F**) larvae and rainfall, temperature and NDVI, based on the data for House (**F**) larvae and rainfall, temperature and NDVI, based on the data for house pools, farm pools and the river. The inset legend of panel (**E**) shows the color coding for the different environmental variables, while the inset legend of panel (**F**) shows the line coding for the NDVI measured at the different sampling locations. In each plot, blue dashed lines indicate the confidence intervals within which correlations are expected to arise by random (p > 0.05).

Meanwhile, the association between adults and larvae was not statistically significant at any time lag, yet it had a peak at four month lag (Figure 7A). The association between larvae and adults was highest at one month lag (Figure 7B), but not statistically significant, yet higher than the four month lag association between adults and larvae.



**Figure 7.** Cross correlation functions between *Anopheles albimanus* stage abundance (**A**) Adults as a function of larvae (**B**) Larvae as a function of adults. In each plot, blue dashed lines indicate the confidence intervals within which correlations are expected to emerge by random (p > 0.05).

The significant lags found in the different cross correlation functions were used to fit time series models described in the following lines. Table 2 shows the results of the model selection process for the time series model explaining *An. albimanus* adult abundance. As shown in Table 2, the autoregressive model including NDVI with a three month lag outperformed an autoregressive model.

**Table 2.** Model selection for variables explaining *Anopheles albimanus* adult abundance at Ipetí-Guna, República de Panamá. AIC indicates the Akaike Information Criterion for the model, and Variables the covariates considered in each model. In the variables, AR indicates Autoregressive. The best model, with the lowest AIC, is in bold font.

| Variables [Lag in Months] | AIC    |
|---------------------------|--------|
| AR[1]                     | 234.51 |
| AR[1], NDVI[3]            | 227.60 |

Parameter estimates for the best *An. albimanus* adult abundance model are presented in Table 3, showing that *An. albimanus* adult abundance was positively associated with NDVI (p < 0.05), indicating that mosquito abundance increases following vegetation growth at the study site.

**Table 3.** Parameter estimates for the best time series model explaining *Anopheles albimanus* adult abundance at Ipetí-Guna, República de Panamá. In parameters AR stands for Autoregressive.

| Parameter [Lag in Months]         | Estimate $\pm$ S.D.  |
|-----------------------------------|----------------------|
| Intercept $(\hat{\mu})$           | $83.60 \pm 39.79$ *  |
| $AR[1](\hat{\phi_1})$             | 0.71 $\pm$ 0.16 *    |
| NDVI[3] $(\alpha_3^{\hat{NDVI}})$ | $3.85\pm1.15~{}^{*}$ |
| Error Variance $(\hat{\sigma}^2)$ | 3320                 |
| * 0,                              | . ( 0.05)            |

\* Statistically significant (p < 0.05).

Table 4 shows the results of model selection for variables associated with *An. albimanus* larvae abundance. As shown in Table 4, the best model included temperature with five month lag as a covariate, adult abundance with one month lag and a seasonal autoregressive component with three month period. Although the associations between *An. albimanus* stages, i.e., adult and larvae, were not

statistically significant, we considered the one month lag adult abundance in the *An. albimanus* larvae model because the correlation was slightly larger than that observed between adults and larvae.

**Table 4.** Model selection for variables explaining *Anopheles albimanus* larvae abundance at Ipetí-Guna, República de Panamá. AIC indicates the Akaike Information Criterion for the model, and Variables the covariates considered in each model. In the variables, SAR indicates Seasonal Autoregressive. The best model, with the lowest AIC, is in bold font.

| Variables [Lag in Months]         | AIC    |
|-----------------------------------|--------|
| SAR[3]                            | 108.60 |
| SAR[3], Adults[1]                 | 107.40 |
| SAR[3], Temperature[5]            | 102.20 |
| SAR[3], Temperature[5], Adults[1] | 101.87 |

Parameter estimates for the best model describing the population dynamics of *An. albimanus* larvae are presented in Table 5, which shows a positive and significant (p < 0.05) association between larvae abundance and temperature with 5 months lag, and a positive but non-significant association with *An. albimanus* adult abundance with 1 month lag.

**Table 5.** Parameter estimates for the best time series model explaining *Anopheles albimanus* larvae abundance at Ipetí-Guna, República de Panamá. In parameters, SAR stands for Seasonal Autoregressive.

| Parameter [Lag in Months]                | Estimate $\pm$ S.D. |  |  |
|--|---------------------|--|--|
| Intercept $(\hat{\mu})$                  | $2.59 \pm 1.53$ *   |  |  |
| SAR[3] $(\hat{\phi_3})$                  | $0.67 \pm 0.19$ *   |  |  |
| Temperature[5] $(\alpha_5^{T\hat{E}MP})$ | $1.35\pm0.44$ *     |  |  |
| Adults[1] $(\alpha_1^{A\hat{dults}})$    | $0.010\pm0.006$     |  |  |
| Error Variance $(\hat{\sigma^2})$        | 6.69                |  |  |

\* Statistically significant (p < 0.05).

# 4. Discussion

Although malaria has been significantly decreasing in Mesoamerica [54], this vector-borne disease remains a public health problem in the region, particularly in Panamá, the only country in Mesoamerica that did not reach the millennium development goal of a 75% reduction of malaria transmission [55]. In Panamá, it has become increasingly clear that malaria mainly affects the Gunas [9,22]. The vulnerability of this group to malaria is such that transmission of highly pathogenic malaria parasites, often resistant to antimalarials [13,14], has been clonal, indicative of epidemic transmission as revealed by low parasitic genetic diversity, and geographically widespread [56]. Malaria transmission patterns in Panamá, although without a clear seasonality, have interannual transmission cycles linked to ENSO [18,20], a global climatic phenomenon associated with changes in malaria transmission worldwide [57–61]. This situation calls for increased efforts to define and implement focalized activities to control and eliminate malaria from the Gunas, where their overarching situation of social exclusion, poverty, and different cultural beliefs [9,22] on top of their poor housing quality [12,22], exclude a fast-paced change favoring improved living conditions. For example, housing improvement [62], a change that has been decisive for malaria disappearance from diverse settings around the world [8,63–71] is out of reach for Guna communities in Panamá. In this context, insights from studying malaria mosquito vector ecology could be useful to guide malaria transmission reduction [72,73].

Our longitudinal study revealed a strong seasonality in *An. albimanus;* its abundance greatly decreases during the dry season, January to April, a pattern observed for anophelines elsewhere

in the New World [74–78]. This reduced mosquito abundance pattern makes the dry season ideal for interventions aimed at eliminating parasites from the human population, for example, via mass drug administration (MDA) [79–81]. MDA can be adapted to reduce malaria transmission among indigenous populations with unique cultural characteristics [82], like the Gunas. Indeed, models of adaptive management in changing environments have already proved successful for natural resource extraction and food sovereignty among the Gunas [83]. Timing parasite clearance interventions from Guna populations during the dry season is expected to be optimal, mainly because the likelihood of any transmission, as parasites are cleared from the human population is greatly reduced when mosquitoes are scarce [76]. Moreover, MDA has been successfully applied for malaria elimination from indigenous populations elsewhere [80,84].

Our results confirm the importance that vegetation growth changes have on regulating the abundance of host seeking adult mosquitoes [42,74], given the time series model for adults indicated that peaks in mosquito abundance follow NDVI changes, with a lag of three months. The three month lag could reflect at least a couple of phenomena, delayed density dependence and resonant generational cycles. In delayed density dependence, population growth in the larvae, which are sensitive to vegetation growth changes [36-38], is seen with a delay in the adults [85]. Meanwhile, in resonant generational cycles [86–88], environmental impacts on population size have a build-up time to be observed in the adult mosquito population and can be enhanced by a positive autocorrelation structure in the environment, something that could also explain the 5 month lag for the impact of temperature in aquatic mosquito, i.e., larvae, population growth, as has been observed in other mosquito vectors of pathogens [89]. These relationships with environmental factors are also important to design interventions aimed at reducing the contact between the Gunas and malaria vector populations, since, for example, in Sub-Saharan Africa it is known that adherence to use insecticide treated nets is influenced by perceived mosquito nuisance [90] and the concomitant perceived malaria transmission risk [91]. In that sense, the best timing for interventions aimed at reducing contact between humans and vectors, or suppressing vector populations, will be during the wet season, for example, three months after peaks in NDVI, which are correlated with peaks in host-seeking mosquitoes, as shown in this study. Among the tools used to reduce the contact between Gunas and mosquitoes, it is unlikely that insecticide treated nets, a tool with an extraordinary success in reducing malaria transmission in Sub-Saharan Africa [92,93], will be effective among the Gunas, as they sleep in hammocks. However, the use of insecticide-treated hammocks [94,95] might be an option that can be adopted by the Gunas as it fits their cultural practices [82].

We think the entomological risk of malaria transmission posed by the three other collected species needs to be further evaluated because all the *Anopheles* spp. we collected have been found infected with malaria parasites [6,96–98], and might surge in case strategies aimed at suppressing *An. albimanus* vector populations are implemented in Guna communities. This phenomenon has been commonly observed when knocking down the density of dominant vector species elsewhere [27,28,99].

Finally, some limitations of our study include the limited sampling which was constrained by the lack of economic resources to sample mosquitoes across the sparse Guna villages in Lake Bayano basin, that are extremely difficult to access during the rainy season. Our study was also limited by our ability to find larval habitats at the study site which, although productive, seemed to be very scarce compared with descriptions for African [100,101] and South American [75,78] settings. Although it has been suggested that human landing catch is the best method to sample adult mosquitoes in the Neotropics [42], we think our study could have benefited by using other sampling methods for the adult populations, such as Mosquito Magnet<sup>®</sup> traps [102]. Also, our environmental data could have been more descriptive of the local environmental conditions of our sampling sites if our budget had allowed us to use data loggers measuring local weather variables [103] instead of resorting to spatially coarsely grained records from gridded databases. We also think that a more frequent sampling, for example, biweekly instead of monthly, could have been helpful to straightforwardly link patterns

of larvae and adult abundance, which at the monthly time scale, were not significantly correlated with each other.

#### 5. Conclusions

Our study describes basic features of An. albimanus population dynamics, a dominant malaria vector in Mesoamerica [6,21], highlighting An. albimanus abundance association with environmental variables at a site where this disease has a large burden on indigenous Guna populations [18]. Based on our observations, we can suggest the use of measures aimed at clearing parasites from the Gunas, for example, mass drug administration, during the dry season from January to April, when host-seeking malaria mosquito abundance is low and the likelihood of transmission is reduced. In contrast, the deployment of interventions aimed at reducing human and vector contact might be more successful during the wet season, when mosquito nuisance might promote the adherence to use protective measures against mosquito bites or lead to perceptible changes in nuisance, when using tools aimed at reducing vector populations, producing a positive feedback on their use and acceptance [104,105]. Fine tuning for the deployment time of interventions affecting malaria vectors can benefit from remotely sensed data of vegetation growth, for example, using NDVI, and also with the use of temperature records, as inferred from the lagged association between these variables and An. albimanus abundance, respectively, as adults and larvae. Given our previous findings about the association of ENSO and malaria transmission at Comarca Madungandi [18] and Comarca Guna Yala [20], where ENSO, respectively, has a positive and negative impact on malaria transmission, we think studies on malaria vector population ecology are a priority in Guna Yala, since local weather conditions might have different impacts on Anopheles spp. abundance that explain the contrasting impacts of ENSO on malaria transmission. We think that areas like Cartí in Comarca Guna Yala, a town with malaria transmission [20,22] and expected to receive an influx of Gunas from Caribbean islands that are disappearing as result of climate change [106], and for which no malaria related environmental health assessment has been made, are the priority for developing studies designed to understand malaria vector ecology, in order to propose interventions that ensure malaria transmission reduction and elimination from the Gunas in the República de Panamá.

Author Contributions: Conceptualization, L.A.H., C.A.R., J.E.C. and L.F.C.; Data curation, C.A.R. and S.D.; Formal analysis, L.A.H., C.A.R. and L.F.C.; Funding acquisition, L.A.H., J.E.C. and L.F.C.; Investigation, L.A.H. and L.F.C.; Methodology, L.A.H., C.A.R., S.D., D.B. and S.I.K.; Writing—original draft, L.A.H., C.A.R., J.E.C. and L.F.C.; Writing—review & editing, L.A.H., C.A.R., J.E.C., S.D., D.B., S.I.K. and L.F.C.

Funding: This research was funded by Ministerio de Economía de la República de Panamá, grant number 9044-024.

Acknowledgments: We thank Lorenzo Caceres and Lleysa Pineda for their assistance during field sampling.

**Conflicts of Interest:** The authors declare no conflict of interest. J.E.C. is a member of the Sistema Nacional de Investigación (SNI), SENACYT, República de Panamá. The funding sponsors had no role in the design of the study; in the collection, analyses, or interpretation of data; in the writing of the manuscript, and in the decision to publish the results.

#### References

- 1. The Economist Intelligence Unit. Panama Country Report. Available online: http://country.eiu.com/ panama (accessed on 8 May 2018).
- 2. Gorgas, W.C. Anti-mosquito work at Panama. Proc. R. Soc. Med. 1914, 31, 32-40.
- 3. Gorgas, W.C. The conquest of the tropics for the white race. JAMA 1909, 52, 1967–1969. [CrossRef]
- 4. Zetek, J. Behavior of *Anopheles albimanus* Wiede. and *tarsimaculata* Goeldi. *Ann. Èntomol. Soc. Am.* **1915**, *8*, 221–271. [CrossRef]
- 5. Jennings, A.H. Some problems of mosquito control in the tropics. *J. Econ. Entomol.* **1912**, *5*, 131–142. [CrossRef]
- 6. Rozeboom, L.E. The The rôle of some common anopheline mosquitoes of Panama in the transmission of malaria. *Am. J. Trop. Med. Hyg.* **1938**, *s1-18*, 289–302. [CrossRef]

- 7. Dehné, E.J. Fifty years of malaria control in the Panama area. *Am. J. Trop. Med. Hyg.* **1955**, *4*, 800–811. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 8. Sutter, P.S. Nature's agents or agents of empire? Entomological workers and environmental change during the construction of the Panama Canal. *Isis* **2007**, *98*, 724–754. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Cáceres, L.; Calzada, J.E.; Gabster, A.; Young, J.; Márquez, R.; Torres, R.; Griffith, M. Social representations of malaria in the Guna indigenous population of Comarca Guna de Madungandi, Panama. *Malar. J.* 2017, 16, 256. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Béguin, A.; Hales, S.; Rocklöv, J.; Åström, C.; Louis, V.R.; Sauerborn, R. The opposing effects of climate change and socio-economic development on the global distribution of malaria. *Glob. Environ. Chang.* 2011, 21, 1209–1214. [CrossRef]
- 11. World Health Organization. *World Malaria Report 2017;* World Health Organization: Geneva, Switzerland, 2017; p. 196.
- 12. Obaldia, N. Determinants of low socio-economic status and risk of Plasmodium vivax malaria infection in Panama (2009–2012): A case-control study. *Malar. J.* **2015**, *14*, 14. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Samudio, F.; Santamaría, A.M.; Obaldía, N.; Pascale, J.M.; Bayard, V.; Calzada, J.E. Prevalence of *Plasmodium falciparum* mutations associated with antimalarial drug resistance during an epidemic in Kuna Yala, Panama, Central America. *Am. J. Trop. Med. Hyg.* 2005, *73*, 839–841. [PubMed]
- Calzada, J.E.; Samudio, F.; Bayard, V.; Obaldia III, N.; de Mosca, I.B.; Pascale, J.M. Revising antimalarial drug policy in Central America: Experience in Panama. *Trans. R. Soc. Trop. Med. Hyg.* 2008, 102, 694–698. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 15. Martínez Mauri, M. *La autonomía indígena en Panamá: La Experiencia del Pueblo Kuna (Siglos XVI-XXI);* Senacyt Panamá—Editorial Abya Yala: Quito, Ecuador, 2011.
- 16. Ministerio de Economia y Finanzas. *Indice de Pobreza Multidimensional de Panamá Año 2017;* Ministerio de Economia y Finanzas: Panamá, República de Panamá, 2017.
- 17. Contraloria General de la República de Panamá. Base de datos de Censos de Población. Available online: http://www.contraloria.gob.pa/inec/Redatam/index\_censospma.htm (accessed on 8 May 2018).
- 18. Hurtado, L.A.; Cáceres, L.; Chaves, L.F.; Calzada, J.E. When climate change couples social neglect: Malaria dynamics in Panamá. *Emerg. Microbes Infect.* **2014**, *3*, e27. [PubMed]
- 19. Galindo, P.; Adames, A.; Peralta, P.; Johnson, C.; Read, R. Impacto de la hidroeléctrica de Bayano en la transmisión de arbovirus. *Revista Médica de Panamá* **1983**, *8*, 89–134. [PubMed]
- Hurtado, L.A.; Calzada, J.E.; Rigg, C.A.; Castillo, M.; Chaves, L.F. Climatic fluctuations and malaria transmission dynamics, prior to elimination, in Guna Yala, República de Panamá. *Malar. J.* 2018, 17, 85. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 21. Loaiza, J.R.; Bermingham, E.; Scott, M.E.; Rovira, J.R.; Conn, J.E. Species Composition and Distribution of Adult *Anopheles* (Diptera: Culicidae) in Panama. *J. Med.* Èntomol. **2008**, 45, 841–851. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Calzada, J.E.; Marquez, R.; Rigg, C.; Victoria, C.; De La Cruz, M.; Chaves, L.F.; Caceres, L. Characterization of a recent malaria outbreak in the autonomous indigenous region of Guna Yala, Panama. *Malar. J.* 2015, 14, 459. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 23. Loaiza, J.R.; Scott, M.E.; Bermingham, E.; Sanjur, O.I.; Wilkerson, R.; Rovira, J.; Gutiérrez, L.A.; Correa, M.M.; Grijalva, M.J.; Birnberg, L.; et al. Late Pleistocene environmental changes lead to unstable demography and population divergence of *Anopheles albimanus* in the northern Neotropics. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* **2010**, *57*, 1341–1346. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 24. Loaiza, J.R.; Scott, M.E.; Bermingham, E.; Sanjur, O.I.; Rovira, J.R.; Dutari, L.C.; Linton, Y.-M.; Bickersmith, S.; Conn, J.E. Novel genetic diversity within *Anopheles punctimacula* s.l: Phylogenetic discrepancy between the Barcode cytochrome c oxidase I (COI) gene and the rDNA second internal transcribed spacer (ITS2). *Acta Trop.* **2013**, *128*, 61–69. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 25. Cáceres, L.; Rovira, J.; Torres, R.; García, A.; Calzada, J.; De La Cruz, M. Caracterización de la transmisión de la malaria por *Plasmodium vivax* en la región fronteriza de Panamá con Costa Rica en el municipio de Barú, Panamá. *Biomédica* **2012**, *32*, 557–569. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 26. Cáceres, L.; Rovira, J.; García, A.; Torres, R. Determinación de la resistencia a insecticidas organofosforados, carbamatos y piretroides en tres poblaciones de *Anopheles albimanus* (Diptera: Culicidae) de Panamá. *Biomédica* **2011**, *31*, 419–427. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

- 27. Chaves, L.F.; Koenraadt, C.J.M. Climate Change and Highland Malaria: Fresh Air for a Hot Debate. *Q. Rev. Boil.* **2010**, *85*, 27–55. [CrossRef]
- 28. Chaves, L.F. Climate change and the biology of insect vectors of human pathogens. In *Invertebrates and Global Climate Change*; Johnson, S., Jones, H., Eds.; Wiley: Chichester, UK, 2017; pp. 126–147.
- 29. Minakawa, N.; Omukunda, E.; Zhou, G.; Githeko, A.; Yan, G. Malaria vector productivity in relation to the highland environment in Kenya. *Am. J. Trop. Med. Hyg.* **2006**, *75*, 448–453. [PubMed]
- 30. Minakawa, N.; Sonye, G.; Yan, G. Relationships between occurrence of *Anopheles gambiae s.l.* (Diptera: Culicidae) and size and stability of larval habitats. *J. Med. Entomol.* **2005**, *42*, 295–300. [PubMed]
- 31. Minakawa, N.; Sonye, G.; Mogi, M.; Githeko, A.; Yan, G.Y. The effects of climatic factors on the distribution and abundance of malaria vectors in Kenya. *J. Med. Entomol.* **2002**, *39*, 833–841. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Gimnig, J.E.; Ombok, M.; Otieno, S.; Kaufman, M.G.; Vulule, J.M.; Walker, E.D. Density-dependent development of *Anopheles gambiae* (Diptera: Culicidae) larvae in artificial habitats. *J. Med. Entomol.* 2002, 39, 162–172. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 33. Russell, T.L.; Lwetoijera, D.W.; Knols, B.G.J.; Takken, W.; Killeen, G.F.; Ferguson, H.M. Linking individual phenotype to density-dependent population growth: The influence of body size on the population dynamics of malaria vectors. *Proc. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci.* **2011**, *278*, 3142–3151. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 34. Pascual, M.; Cazelles, B.; Bouma, M.J.; Chaves, L.F.; Koelle, K. Shifting patterns: Malaria dynamics and rainfall variability in an African highland. *Proc. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci.* 2008, 275, 123–132. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Pascual, M.; Ahumada, J.A.; Chaves, L.F.; Rodo, X.; Bouma, M. Malaria resurgence in the East African highlands: Temperature trends revisited. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 2006, 103, 5829–5834. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Rejmankova, E.; Roberts, D.; Harbach, R.; Pecor, J.; Peyton, E.; Manguin, S.; Krieg, R.; Polanco, J.; Legters, L. Environmental and regional determinants of *Anopheles* (Diptera: Culicidae) larval distribution in Belize, Central America. *Environ.* Èntomol. 1993, 22, 978–992. [CrossRef]
- Rejmankova, E.; Savage, H.; Rodriguez, M.; Roberts, D.; Rejmanek, M. Aquatic vegetation as a basis for classification of *Anopheles albimanus* Weideman (Diptera: Culicidae) larval habitats. *Environ. Entomol.* 1992, 21, 598–603. [CrossRef]
- 38. Rejmankova, E.; Savage, H.M.; Rejmanek, M.; Arredondo-Jimenez, J.I.; Roberts, D.R. Multivariate Analysis of Relationships between Habitats, Environmental Factors and Occurrence of Anopheline Mosquito Larvae *Anopheles albimanus* and *A. pseudopunctipennis* in Southern Chiapas, Mexico. *J. Appl. Ecol.* **1991**, *28*, 827–841.
- Berti, J.; González, J.; Navarro-Bueno, E.; Zoppi, E.; Gordon, E.; Delgado, L. Larval seasonality of the mosquito *Anopheles aquasalis* (Diptera: Culicidae) and other insects associated to its habitat in Sucre, Venezuela. *Rev. Boil. Trop.* 2010, 58, 777–787.
- Pettorelli, N.; Vik, J.O.; Mysterud, A.; Gaillard, J.-M.; Tucker, C.J.; Stenseth, N.C. Using the satellite-derived NDVI to assess ecological responses to environmental change. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* 2005, 20, 503–510. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 41. USNPS. Data Sources & Accuracy for National Park Service Maps. Available online: https://www.nps.gov/ hfc/carto/data-sources.cfm (accessed on 8 May 2018).
- 42. Rubio-Palis, Y.; Curtis, C.F. Evaluation of different methods of catching anopheline mosquitoes in western Venezuela. *J. Am. Mosq. Control Assoc.* **1992**, *8*, 261–267. [PubMed]
- 43. World Health Organization. *Técnicas Entomológicas de Campo Para la Lucha Antipalúdica;* World Health Organization: Geneva, Switzerland, 1993.
- 44. Wilkerson, R.C.; Strickman, D.; Fernández Salas, I. *Clave Ilustrada Para la Identificación de Las Hembras de Mosquitos Anofelinos de México y Centroamérica*; Universidad Autónoma de Nuevo León: San Nicolás de Los Garza, México, 1993.
- 45. Stojanovich, C.; Gorham, J.; Scott, H. *Clave Ilustrada Para los Mosquitos Anofelinos de America Central y Panama;* Training Branch, Communicable Disease Center: Atlanta, GA, USA, 1966; p. 37.
- 46. Patterson, T.C. Google Earth as a (not just) geography education tool. J. Geogr. 2007, 106, 145–152. [CrossRef]
- 47. KMNI. KMNI Climate Explorer. Available online: http://climexp.knmi.nl (accessed on 8 May 2018).
- 48. NOAA. GPCP Version 2.3 Combined Precipitation Data Set. Available online: https://www.esrl.noaa.gov/psd/data/gridded/data.gpcp.html (accessed on 8 May 2018).
- 49. NOAA. GHCN\_CAMS Gridded 2m Temperature (Land). Available online: https://www.esrl.noaa.gov/psd/data/gridded/data.ghcncams.html (accessed on 8 May 2018).

- 50. NASALPDAAC. NASA Land Processes Distributed Active Archive Center. Available online: https://lpdaac. usgs.gov (accessed on 8 May 2018).
- 51. Busetto, L.; Ranghetti, L. MODIStsp: An R package for automatic preprocessing of MODIS Land Products time series. *Comput. Geosci.* 2016, 97, 40–48. [CrossRef]
- 52. R Core Team. *R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing;* R Foundation for Statistical Computing: Vienna, Austria, 2018.
- 53. Shumway, R.H.; Stoffer, D.S. *Time Series Analysis and Its Applications*, 3rd ed.; Springer: New York, NY, USA, 2011; p. 572.
- 54. Pan American Health Organization (PAHO). *Report on the Situation of Malaria in the Americas*, 2014; Pan American Health Organization: Washington, DC, USA, 2016.
- 55. Pan American Health Organization (PAHO). *Report on the Situation of Malaria in the Americas*, 2000–2015; Pan American Health Organization: Washington, DC, USA, 2016.
- Obaldia, N.; Baro, N.K.; Calzada, J.E.; Santamaria, A.M.; Daniels, R.; Wong, W.; Chang, H.-H.; Hamilton, E.J.; Arevalo-Herrera, M.; Herrera, S.; et al. Clonal Outbreak of *Plasmodium falciparum* Infection in Eastern Panama. *J. Infect. Dis.* 2015, 211, 1087–1096. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 57. Chaves, L.F.; Hashizume, M.; Satake, A.; Minakawa, N. Regime shifts and heterogeneous trends in malaria time series from Western Kenya Highlands. *Parasitology* **2012**, *139*, 14–25. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 58. Chaves, L.F.; Satake, A.; Hashizume, M.; Minakawa, N. Indian Ocean Dipole and Rainfall Drive a Moran Effect in East Africa Malaria Transmission. *J. Infect. Dis.* **2012**, 205, 1885–1891. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 59. Bouma, M.J.; Poveda, G.; Rojas, W.; Chavasse, D.; Quiñones, M.; Cox, J.; Patz, J. Predicting high-risk years for malaria in Colombia using parameters of El Niño Southern Oscillation. *Trop. Med. Int. Health* **1997**, *2*, 1122–1127. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 60. Grillet, M.-E.; El Souki, M.; Laguna, F.; León, J.R. The periodicity of *Plasmodium vivax* and *Plasmodium falciparum* in Venezuela. *Acta Trop.* **2014**, *129*, 52–60. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 61. Chaves, L.F.; Kaneko, A.; Taleo, G.; Pascual, M.; Wilson, M.L. Malaria transmission pattern resilience to climatic variability is mediated by insecticide-treated nets. *Malar. J.* **2008**, *7*, 100. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 62. Kirby, M.J.; Ameh, D.; Bottomley, C.; Green, C.; Jawara, M.; Milligan, P.J.; Snell, P.C.; Conway, D.J.; Lindsay, S.W. Effect of two different house screening interventions on exposure to malaria vectors and on anaemia in children in The Gambia: A randomised controlled trial. *Lancet* **2009**, *374*, 998–1009. [CrossRef]
- 63. Celli, A. Remarks on the Epidemiology and prophylaxis of malaria in the light of recent researches. *Br. Med. J.* **1900**, *1*, 301–306. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 64. Chaves, L.F. Casas Muertas and Oficina No. 1: Internal migrations and malaria trends in Venezuela 1905–1945. *Parasitol. Res.* **2007**, *101*, 19–23. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 65. De Zulueta, J. Changes in the geographical distribution of malaria throughout history. *Parassitologia* **1987**, *29*, 193–205. [PubMed]
- 66. De Zulueta, J. Malaria and Mediterranean history. Parassitologia 1973, 15, 1–15. [PubMed]
- 67. Kitron, U.; Spielman, A. Suppression of transmission of malaria through source reduction: Antianopheline measures applied in Israel, the United States, and Italy. *Rev. Infectious Dis.* **1989**, *11*, 391–406. [CrossRef]
- 68. Kitron, U. Malaria, agriculture, and development: Lessons from past campaigns. *Int. J. Health Serv.* **1987**, 17, 295–326. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 69. Humphreys, M. *Malaria: Poverty, Race, and Public Health in the United States;* Johns Hopkins University Press: Baltimore, MD, USA, 2001.
- 70. Kendall, A.I. Malarial infection in certain native villages of the canal zone. *JAMA* **1906**, *46*, 1266–1273. [CrossRef]
- 71. Kendall, A.I. Malarial infection in certain native villages of the canal zone. *JAMA* **1906**, *46*, 1151–1154. [CrossRef]
- 72. Mukabana, W.R.; Kannady, K.; Kiama, G.M.; Ijumba, J.N.; Mathenge, E.M.; Kiche, I.; Nkwengulila, G.; Mboera, L.; Mtasiwa, D.; Yamagata, Y.; et al. Ecologists can enable communities to implement malaria vector control in Africa. *Malar. J.* **2006**, *5*, 9. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 73. Spielman, A.; Kitron, U.; Pollack, R.J. Time Limitation and the Role of Research in the Worldwide Attempt to Eradicate Malaria. *J. Med. Entomol.* **1993**, *30*, 6–19. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

- 74. Rubio-Palis, Y.; Bevilacqua, M.; Medina, D.A.; Moreno, J.E.; Cárdenas, L.; Sánchez, V.; Estrada, Y.; Anaya, W.; Martínez, Á. Malaria entomological risk factors in relation to land cover in the Lower Caura River Basin, Venezuela. *Memórias Inst. Oswaldo Cruz* 2013, 108, 220–228. [CrossRef]
- 75. Rubio-Palis, Y.; Moreno, J.E.; Bevilacqua, M.; Medina, D.; Martínez, Á.; Cardenas, L.; Guzmán, H.; González, J. Caracterización ecológica de los anofelinos y otros culícidos en territorio indígena del Bajo Caura, Estado Bolívar, Venezuela. *Boletín Malariol. Salud Ambient.* **2010**, *50*, 95–107.
- 76. Lindsay, S.; Joyce, A. Climate Change and the Disappearance of Malaria from England. *Glob. Chang. Hum. Health* **2000**, *1*, 184–187. [CrossRef]
- 77. Rubio-Palis, Y.; Curtis, C.F. Biting and resting behaviour of anophelines in western Venezuela and implications for control of malaria transmission. *Med. Vet. Entomol.* **1992**, *6*, 325–334. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Moreno, J.E.; Rubio-Palis, Y.; Sánchez, V.; Martínez, Á. Characterization of anophelines larval habitats in the municipality of Sifontes, Bolívar State, Venezuela. *Boletín Malariol. Salud Ambient.* 2015, 55, 117–131.
- 79. Kaneko, A.; Taleo, G.; Kalkoa, M.; Yamar, S.; Kobayakawa, T.; Björkman, A. Malaria eradication on islands. *Lancet* **2000**, *356*, 1560–1564. [CrossRef]
- 80. Kaneko, A. A community-directed strategy for sustainable malaria elimination on islands: Short-term MDA integrated with ITNs and robust surveillance. *Acta Trop.* **2010**, *114*, 177–183. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 81. Poirot, E.; Skarbinski, J.; Sinclair, D.; Kachur, S.P.; Slutsker, L.; Hwang, J. Mass drug administration for malaria. *Cochrane Database Syst. Rev.* 2013, *12*, CD008846. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 82. Bevilacqua, M.; Rubio-Palis, Y.; Medina, D.A.; Cárdenas, L. Malaria Control in Amerindian Communities of Venezuela. *EcoHealth* **2015**, *12*, 253–266. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 83. Apgar, M.J.; Allen, W.; Moore, K.; Ataria, J. Understanding adaptation and transformation through indigenous practice: The case of the Guna of Panama. *Ecol. Soc.* **2015**, *20*, 45. [CrossRef]
- 84. Smith, D.L.; Drakeley, C.J.; Chiyaka, C.; Hay, S.I. A quantitative analysis of transmission efficiency versus intensity for malaria. *Nat. Commun.* **2010**, *1*, 108. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 85. Chaves, L.F.; Morrison, A.C.; Kitron, U.D.; Scott, T.W. Nonlinear impacts of climatic variability on the density-dependent regulation of an insect vector of disease. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* 2012, *18*, 457–468. [CrossRef]
- 86. Nisbet, R.M.; Gurney, W.S.C. Population dynamics in a periodically varying environment. *J. Theor. Biol.* **1976**, 56, 459–475. [CrossRef]
- Tuljapurkar, S. Population dynamics in variable environments. VI. Cyclical environments. *Theor. Popul. Biol.* 1985, 28, 1–17. [CrossRef]
- 88. Tuljapurkar, S.D. Population dynamics in variable environments. II. Correlated environments, sensitivity analysis and dynamics. *Theor. Popul. Biol.* **1982**, *21*, 114–140. [CrossRef]
- Chaves, L.F.; Scott, T.W.; Morrison, A.C.; Takada, T. Hot temperatures can force delayed mosquito outbreaks via sequential changes in *Aedes aegypti* demographic parameters in autocorrelated environments. *Acta Trop.* 2014, 129, 15–24. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Hoshi, T.; Martin Banda, P.; Foster Pemba, D.; Sunahara, T.; Minakawa, N. Beyond buzzing: Mosquito watching stimulates malaria bednet use a household-based cluster-randomized controlled assessor blind educational trial. *Emerg. Microbes Infect* 2013, 2, e67. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 91. Honjo, K.; Chaves, L.F.; Satake, A.; Kaneko, A.; Minakawa, N. When they don't bite, we smell money: Understanding malaria bednet misuse. *Parasitology* **2013**, *140*, 580–586. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 92. O'Meara, W.P.; Mangeni, J.N.; Steketee, R.; Greenwood, B. Changes in the burden of malaria in sub-Saharan Africa. *Lancet Infect. Dis.* **2010**, *10*, 545–555. [CrossRef]
- Lines, J.; Lengeler, C.; Cham, K.; de Savigny, D.; Chimumbwa, J.; Langi, P.; Carroll, D.; Mills, A.; Hanson, K.; Webster, J.; et al. Scaling-up and sustaining insecticide-treated net coverage. *Lancet Infect. Dis.* 2003, *3*, 465–466. [CrossRef]
- 94. Magris, M.; Rubio-Palis, Y.; Alexander, N.; Ruiz, B.; Galván, N.; Frias, D.; Blanco, M.; Lines, J. Community-randomized trial of lambdacyhalothrin-treated hammock nets for malaria control in Yanomami communities in the Amazon region of Venezuela. *Trop. Med. Int. Health* 2007, *12*, 392–403. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 95. Peeters Grietens, K.; Nguyen Xuan, X.; Muela Ribera, J.; Ngo Duc, T.; van Bortel, W.; Truong Ba, N.; Van, K.P.; Le Xuan, H.; D'Alessandro, U.; Erhart, A. Social Determinants of Long Lasting Insecticidal Hammock-Use Among the Ra-Glai Ethnic Minority in Vietnam: Implications for Forest Malaria Control. *PLoS ONE* 2012, 7, e29991. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

- 96. Boyd, M.F.; Kitchen, S.F. The Comparative Susceptibility of *Anopheles quadrimaculatus*, Say, and *Anopheles punctipennis*, Say, to *Plasmodium vivax*, Grassi and Feletti, and *Plasmodium falciparum*, Welch. *Am. J. Trop. Med. Hyg.* **1936**, *s*1-16, 67–71. [CrossRef]
- 97. Simmons, J.S. Observations on the Importance of *Anopheles punctimacula* as a Malaria Vector in Panama, and Report of Experimental Infections in *A. neomaculipalpus*, *A. apicimacula*, and *A. eiseni*. *Am. J. Trop. Med. Hyg.* **1937**, *s*1-17, 191–212.
- Simmons, J.S. Anopheles (Anopheles) punctimacula Naturally Infected with Malaria Plasmodia. Am. J. Trop. Med. Hyg. 1936, s1-16, 105–108. [CrossRef]
- 99. Iwashita, H.; Dida, O.; Sonye, G.O.; Sunahara, T.; Futami, K.; Njenga, S.M.; Chaves, L.F.; Minakawa, N. Push by a net, pull by a cow: Can zooprophylaxis enhance the impact of insecticide treated bed nets on malaria control. *Parasites Vectors* **2014**, *7*, 52. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 100. Fillinger, U.; Sombroek, H.; Majambere, S.; van Loon, E.; Takken, W.; Lindsay, S. Identifying the most productive breeding sites for malaria mosquitoes in The Gambia. *Malar. J.* **2009**, *8*, 62. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 101. Fillinger, U.; Sonye, G.; Killeen, G.F.; Knols, B.G.J.; Becker, N. The practical importance of permanent and semipermanent habitats for controlling aquatic stages of *Anopheles gambiae sensu lato* mosquitoes: Operational observations from a rural town in western Kenya. *Trop. Med. Int. Health* 2004, *9*, 1274–1289. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 102. Rubio-Palis, Y.; Moreno, J.E.; Sánchez, V.; Estrada, Y.; Anaya, W.; Bevilacqua, M.; Cárdenas, L.; Martínez, Á.; Medina, D. Can Mosquito Magnet®substitute for human-landing catches to sample anopheline populations? *Memórias Inst. Oswaldo Cruz* 2012, 107, 546–549. [CrossRef]
- 103. Chaves, L.F.; Jian, J.-Y.; Moji, K. Overwintering in the Bamboo Mosquito *Tripteroides bambusa* (Diptera: Culicidae) During a Warm, But Unpredictably Changing, Winter. *Environ. Environ.* 2018, 47, 148–158. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 104. Predescu, M.; Levins, R.; Awerbuch-Friedlander, T. Analysis of a nonlinear system for community intervention in mosquito control. *Discret. Contin. Dyn. Syst.-Ser. B* **2006**, *6*, 605–622.
- 105. Predescu, M.; Sirbu, G.; Levins, R.; Awerbuch-Friedlander, T. On the dynamics of a deterministic and stochastic model for mosquito control. *Appl. Math. Lett.* **2007**, *20*, 919–925. [CrossRef]
- 106. Displacement Solutions. *Cambio Climático y desplazamiento en la región autónoma de Guna Yala, Panamá;* Displacement Solutions: Geneva, Switzerland, 2014; p. 103.



© 2018 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).