## **BMJ Open** Evidence on the effect of gender of newborn, antenatal care and postnatal care on breastfeeding practices in Ethiopia: a meta-analysis and meta-regression analysis of observational studies

Tesfa Dejenie Habtewold,<sup>© 1,2</sup> Nigussie Tadesse Sharew,<sup>1</sup> Sisay Mulugeta Alemu<sup>3</sup>

**To cite:** Habtewold TD, Sharew NT, Alemu SM. Evidence on the effect of gender of newborn, antenatal care and postnatal care on breastfeeding practices in Ethiopia: a metaanalysis andmeta-regression analysis of observational studies. *BMJ Open* 2019;**9**:e023956. doi:10.1136/ bmjopen-2018-023956

Prepublication history and additional material for this paper are available online. To view these files, please visit the journal online (http://dx.doi. org/10.1136/bmjopen-2018-023956).

Received 4 May 2018 Revised 1 April 2019 Accepted 17 April 2019

#### Check for updates

© Author(s) (or their employer(s)) 2019. Re-use permitted under CC BY-NC. No commercial re-use. See rights and permissions. Published by BMJ.

For numbered affiliations see end of article.

Correspondence to Tesfa Dejenie Habtewold;

tesfadej2003@gmail.com

#### ABSTRACT

**Objectives** The aim of this systematic review and metaanalysis was to investigate the association of gender of newborn, antenatal care (ANC) and postnatal care (PNC) with timely initiation of breast feeding (TIBF) and exclusive breastfeeding (EBF) practices in Ethiopia.

**Design** Systematic review and meta-analysis.

**Data sources** To retrieve all available literature, PubMed, EMBASE, CINAHL, WHO Global Health Library, Web of Science and SCOPUS databases were systematically searched and complemented by manual searches. The search was done from August 2017 to September 2018.

**Eligibility criteria** All observational studies including crosssectional, case-control, cohort studies conducted in Ethiopia from 2000 to 2018 were included. Newcastle-Ottawa Scale was used for quality assessment of included studies.

**Data extraction and synthesis** Study area, design, population, number of mothers (calculated sample size and participated in the study) and observed frequency data were extracted using Joanna Briggs Institute tool. To obtain the pooled effect size, a meta-analysis using weighted inverse variance random-effects model was performed. Cochran's Q X<sup>2</sup> test,  $\tau^2$  and I<sup>2</sup> statistics were used to test heterogeneity, estimate amount of total/ residual heterogeneity and measure variability attributed to heterogeneity, respectively. Mixed-effects meta-regression analysis was done to identify possible sources of heterogeneity. Egger's regression test at p value threshold ≤0.01 was used to examine publication bias. Furthermore, the trend of evidence over time was examined by performing a cumulative meta-analysis.

**Results** Of 523 articles retrieved, 17 studies (n=26146 mothers) on TIBF and 24 studies (n=17819 mothers) on EBF were included in the final analysis. ANC (OR=2.24, 95% Cl 1.65 to 3.04, p<0.001, l<sup>2</sup>=90.9%), PNC (OR=1.86, 95% Cl 1.41 to 2.47, p<0.001, l<sup>2</sup>=63.4%) and gender of newborn (OR=1.31, 95% Cl 1.01 to 1.68, p=0.04, l<sup>2</sup>=81.7%) significantly associated with EBF. ANC (OR=1.70, 95% Cl 1.10 to 2.65, p=0.02, l<sup>2</sup>=93.1%) was also significantly associated with TIBF but not with gender of newborn (OR=1.02, 95% Cl 0.86 to 1.21, p=0.82, l<sup>2</sup>=66.2%).

#### Strengths and limitations of this study

- This systematic review and meta-analysis was conducted based on the registered and published protocol.
- Since this is the first study in Ethiopia, the evidence could be helpful for future researchers, public health practitioners and healthcare policy-makers.
- Almost all included studies were observational which might weaken the strength of evidence and hinder causality inference.
- Perhaps, the results may not be nationally representative given that studies from some regions are lacking.
- Based on the conventional method of heterogeneity test, a few analyses suffer from high between-study variation.

**Conclusions** In line with our hypothesis, gender of newborn, ANC and PNC were significantly associated with EBF. Likewise, ANC was significantly associated with TIBF. Optimal care during pregnancy and after birth is important to ensure adequate breast feeding. This meta-analysis study provided up-to-date evidence on breastfeeding practices and its associated factors, which could be useful for breastfeeding improvement initiative in Ethiopia and cross-country and cross-cultural comparison. **Trial registration number** CRD42017056768

#### INTRODUCTION

WHO and Unicef recommend timely initiation of breast feeding (TIBF) (ie, initiating breast feeding within 1 hour of birth) and exclusive breast feeding (EBF) (ie, feeding only human milk during the first 6 months)<sup>1</sup> for maintaining maternal and newborn health.<sup>2</sup> Breast feeding provides optimal nutrition, increase cognitive development, reduce morbidity and mortality for the newborn; for

#### **Open access**

example, TIBF prevents 22% of neonatal deaths.<sup>3</sup> Inappropriate breastfeeding practice, on the other hand, causes more than two-thirds of under-five child mortality, of which 41% of these deaths occur in Sub-Saharan Africa.<sup>14</sup> Breast feeding also prevents maternal long-term chronic diseases, such as diabetes mellitus.<sup>3</sup>

According to a new 2017 global Unicef and WHO report, only 42% start breast feeding within an hour of birth, leaving an estimated 78 million newborns to wait over 1 hour to be put to the breast, the majority born in low-income and middle-income countries.<sup>5</sup> The prevalence rate of TIBF varies widely across regions from 35% in the Middle East and North Africa to 65% in Eastern and Southern Africa. Another report also shows that only two in five infants <6 months of age are exclusively breast fed.<sup>6</sup> The prevalence rate of EBF ranges from 22% in East Asia and Pacific to 56% in Eastern and Southern Africa.<sup>6</sup> Based on our meta-analysis in 2018, the prevalence of TIBF and EBF in Ethiopia is 66.5% and 60.1% respectively.<sup>7</sup> To date, globally, only 22 nations have achieved the WHO goal of 70% coverage in TIBF and 23 countries have achieved at least 60% coverage in EBF.<sup>2</sup>

To promote optimal breast feeding, WHO, Unicef and other (inter)national organisations have been working in developing countries, and several studies have been conducted on the advantages of breast feeding. However, it is still challenging to achieve the expected coverage and attributed to several factors including antenatal (ANC), postnatal care (PNC) and gender of newborn,<sup>89</sup> and breastfeeding coverage continued to be suboptimal as a result. In Ethiopia, several meta-analyses studies were done on infant and young child feeding.<sup>7 10-14</sup> In our previous meta-analysis, we explored the association between maternal employment, lactation counselling, mode of delivery, place of delivery, maternal age, newborn age and discarding colostrum breastfeeding practices (ie, TIBF and EBF).<sup>7 10</sup> We also separately studied the association between TIBF and EBF.<sup>7</sup> However, none of these meta-analyses did study the pooled effect of gender of newborn, ANC and PNC on TIBF and EBF. Given the absence of pooled estimates, up-to-date evidence is required to design intervention-based studies targeting these factors. Therefore, we aimed to investigate whether TIBF and EBF in Ethiopia are influenced by gender of newborn, ANC and PNC. We hypothesised at least one ANC or PNC visit significantly improves TIBF and EBF practices. Additionally, mothers with male newborn have higher odds of TIBF and EBF compared with mothers with female newborn.

#### **METHODS**

#### Protocol registration and publication

The study protocol was registered with the University of York, Centre for Reviews and Dissemination, International prospective register of systematic reviews (PROSPERO) and published.<sup>15</sup>

#### Search strategy and databases

PubMed, EMBASE, CINAHL, WHO Global Health Library, Web of Science and SCOPUS electronic databases were searched to extract all available literature. The search strategy was developed using Population Exposure Controls and Outcome (PECO) searching guide in consultation with a medical information specialist (online supplementary file 1). The search was done from August 2017 to September 2018. Grey literature and cross-references of included articles and previous meta-analysis were also hand searched.

#### **PECO guide**

#### Population

All mothers with newborn up to 23 months of age.

#### Exposure

Gender of the newborn, ANC and PNC visit (at least one visit).

#### Comparison

Female newborn, no ANC visit and no PNC visit.

#### Outcome

TIBF and EBF practices.

#### Inclusion and exclusion criteria

Studies were included if they met the following criteria: (1) observational studies including cross-sectional, case-control, cohort studies; (2) conducted in Ethiopia; (3) published in English language and (4) published between 2000 and 2018. Studies were excluded on any one of the following conditions: (1) conducted in women with HIV/AIDS, preterm newborn and newborn in intensive care unit; (2) published in language other than English; (3) abstracts without full text and (4) qualitative studies, symposium/conference proceedings, essays, commentaries and case reports.

#### Selection and quality assessment

Initially, all identified articles were exported to Refwork citation manager (RefWorks 2.0; ProQuest LLC, Bethesda, Maryland, USA, http://www.refworks.com), and duplicate studies were cancelled. Next, a pair of independent reviewers identified articles by analysing the title and abstract for relevance and its compliance with the proposed review topic. Agreement between the two reviewers, as measured by Cohen's Kappa,<sup>16</sup> was 0.76. After removing irrelevant studies through a respective decision after discussion, full texts were systematically reviewed for further eligibility analysis. Newcastle-Ottawa Scale (NOS) was used to examine the quality of studies and for potential risk of bias.<sup>17</sup> In line with the WHO standard definition, outcome measurements were TIBF (the percentage of newborn who breast feed within the first hour of birth) and EBF (the percentage of infants who exclusively breast fed up to 6 months since birth). Finally, Joanna Briggs Institute (JBI) tool<sup>18</sup> was used to extract the following data: study area (region and place), method (design), population, number of mothers (calculated sample size and participated in the study) and observed data (ie, 2×2 table). Geographic regions were categorised based on the current Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia administrative structure.<sup>19</sup> Disagreement between reviewers was solved through discussion and consensus.

#### Statistical analysis

A meta-analysis using a weighted inverse variance random-effects model was performed to obtain a pooled OR. In addition, a cumulative meta-analysis was done to illustrate the trend of evidence regarding the effect of gender of newborn, ANC and PNC on breastfeeding practices. Publication bias was assessed by visual inspection of a funnel plot and Egger's regression test for funnel plot asymmetry using SE as a predictor in mixed-effects meta-regression model at a p value threshold  $\leq 0.010$ .<sup>20</sup> Duval and Tweedie trim-and-fill method<sup>21</sup> was used to manage publication bias. Cochran's Q X<sup>2</sup> test,  $\tau^2$  and I<sup>2</sup> statistics were used to test heterogeneity, estimate amount of total/residual heterogeneity and measure variability attributed to heterogeneity, respectively.<sup>22</sup> Mixed-effects meta-regression analysis was done to examine the effect of variation in study area (region), residence of women, sample size and publication year on between-study heterogeneity.<sup>23</sup> The total amount of heterogeneity  $(R^2)$ accounted for these factors was calculated by subtracting the residual amount of heterogeneity from the total amount of heterogeneity and dividing by the total amount of heterogeneity. Moreover, to assess the moderation effect of these factors, Omnibus test of moderators was applied. The data were analysed using 'metafor' packages in R software V.3.2.1 for Windows.<sup>23</sup>

#### Data synthesis and reporting

We analysed the data in two groups based on outcome measurements (ie, TIBF and EBF). Results are presented using forest plots. Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guideline was strictly followed to report our results.<sup>24</sup>

#### Minor post hoc protocol changes

Based on the authors' decision and reviewers' recommendation, the following changes were made to our published protocol methods.<sup>15</sup> We added the JBI tool<sup>18</sup> to extract the data. In addition, we used the Duval and Tweedie trim-and-fill method to manage publication bias. Furthermore, cumulative meta-analysis and mixed-effects meta-regression analysis were done to reveal the trends of evidence and identify possible sources of between-study heterogeneity, respectively.

#### Patient and public involvement

The research questions and outcome measures were developed by the authors (TDH and NTS) in consultation with public health professionals and previous studies. Given this is a systematic review and meta-analysis based on published data, patients/study participants were not directly involved in the design and analysis of this study. The results of this study will be disseminated to patients/ study participants through health education on factors affecting breast feeding and disseminating the key findings using brochure in the local language.

#### RESULTS

#### Search results

In total, we obtained 533 articles from PubMed (n=169), EMBASE (n=24), Web of Science (n=200), SCOPUS (n=85) and CINHAL and WHO Global Health Library (n=5). Fifty additional articles were found through manual search. After removing duplicates and screening of titles and abstracts, 84 studies were selected for fulltext review. Of these, 43 articles were excluded due to several reasons: 19 studies on complementary feeding, 3 studies on prelacteal feeding, 3 studies on malnutrition, 17 studies with different variables of interest and 1 project review report. As a result, 41 articles fulfilled the inclusion criteria and used in this meta-analysis: 17 studies investigated the association between TIBF and gender of newborn and ANC whereas 24 studies between EBF and gender of newborn, ANC and PNC. The PRISMA flow diagram of literature screening and selection process is shown in figure 1. One study could report more than one outcome measures or associated factors.

#### **Study characteristics**

As presented in table 1, 17 studies reported the association of TIBF and gender of newborn and ANC in 26146 mothers. Among these studies, 13 of them were conducted in Amhara (n=5), Oromia (n=4) and Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples' (SNNP) (n=4) region. Regarding the residence status, eight studies were conducted in both urban and rural whereas six studies in urban women. All studies passed the NOS quality assessment criteria at a cut-off value  $\geq$ 7.

Twenty-four studies reported the association between EBF and gender of newborn, ANC and PNC in 17819 mothers. Of these studies, 11 were conducted in Amhara and seven in SNNP region. Based on the residence status, 10 studies were conducted in urban, 8 in urban and rural, and 6 in rural women. Even though almost all studies were cross-sectional, five studies have used nationally representative data of the Ethiopian Demographic Health Survey.<sup>19–23</sup> Detailed characteristics of the included studies are shown in table 2.

#### **Meta-analysis**

#### Timely initiation of breast feeding

Among the 17 selected studies, 10 studies<sup>25–34</sup> reported the association between TIBF and gender of newborn in 16411 mothers (table 1A). The pooled OR of gender of newborn was 1.02 (95% CI 0.86 to 1.21, p=0.82,  $I^2$ =66.2%) (figure 2). Mothers with male newborn had 2% higher chance of initiating breast feeding within 1 hour of birth compared with female newborn although not statistically significant. There was no significant publication bias (z=0.41, p=0.68) (online supplementary figure 1).



**Figure 1** PRISMA flow diagram of literature screening and selection process; 'n' in each stage represents the total number of studies that fulfilled particular criteria. EBF, exclusive breast feeding; PRISMA, Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses; TIBF, timely initiation of breast feeding.

Likewise, 13 studies<sup>27 28 30 31 33–41</sup> reported the association between TIBF and ANC in 12 535 mothers (table 1B). The pooled OR of ANC was 1.70 (95% CI 1.10 to 2.65, p=0.02,  $I^2=93.1\%$ ) (figure 3). Mothers who had at least one ANC visit had 70% significantly higher chance of initiating breast feeding within 1 hour of birth compared with mothers who had no ANC visit. There was no significant publication bias (z=0.96, p=0.34) (online supplementary figure 2).

#### Exclusive breast feeding

Out of the 24 studies included, 11 studies<sup>25 26 42-50</sup> reported the association between EBF and gender of newborn in 6527 mothers (table 2A). The pooled OR of newborn gender was 1.08 (95% CI 0.86 to 1.36, p=0.49,  $I^2$ =71.7%) (figure 4). Since significant publication bias detected (z=-3.64, p<0.001), we did Duval and Tweedie trim-and-fill analysis and calculated a new effect size

for gender of newborn (OR=1.31, 95% CI 1.01 to 1.68, p=0.04,  $I^2$ =81.7%) after including imputed studies (ie, estimated number of missing studies=4) (online supplementary figure 3). Therefore, mothers with male newborn had 31% significantly higher chance of exclusive breast feeding during the first 6 months compared with mothers with female newborn.

Twenty-one studies<sup>35–37</sup> <sup>42–49</sup> <sup>51–60</sup> reported the association between EBF and ANC in 16052 mothers (table 2B). The pooled OR of ANC was 2.24 (95% CI 1.65 to 3.04, p<0.0001, I<sup>2</sup>=90.9%) (figure 5). Mothers who had at least one ANC visit had 2.24 times significantly higher chance of exclusively breast feed compared with mothers who had no ANC visit. There was no significant publication bias (z=1.69, p=0.09) (online supplementary figure 4).

Table 1 Characteri	stics of included studie	s on TIBF						
						TIBF		
Author/publication year	Study area	Study design	Study population	Sample size/ Participated	Factors	Within 1 hour	After 1 hour	Total
A. Gender of newb	orn versus TIBF							
Regassa 2014 <sup>25</sup>	SNNPR, Sidama	Cross-sectional	Mothers with infants aged	1100/1094	Male	488	107	595
	zone	study	between 0 and 6		Female	389	110	499
					Total	877	217	1094
Alemayehu 2014 <sup>26</sup>	Tigray, Axum town	Cross-sectional	Mothers who had children	418/418	Male	75	141	216
		study	aged 6-12		Female	66	103	202
			SUITOTI		Total	174	244	418
Berhe <i>et al</i> 2013 <sup>27</sup>	Tigray, Mekelle town	Cross-sectional	Mothers of children aged	361/361	Male	166	42	208
		study	0–24 months		Female	112	37	149
					Total	278	79	357
Beyene <i>et al</i> 2 016 <sup>28</sup>	SNNPR, Dale	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	Mothers of children	634/634	Male	262	51	313
	Woreda	study	<24 months		Female	255	50	305
					Total	517	101	618
Lakew <i>et al</i> 2015 <sup>29</sup>	National	Cross-sectional	Mothers who had children	11 654/11 553	Male	3124	2860	5984
		study*	<5 years		Female	3057	2511	5568
					Total	6181	5371	11552
Liben and Yesuf	Afar, Dubti town	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	Mothers of infants aged	346/333	Male	81	122	203
2016		study	<6months		Female	20	130	200
					Total	151	252	403
Setegn <i>et al</i> 2011 <sup>31</sup>	Oromia, Goba	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	Mothers with children	668/608	Male	164	152	316
	district	study	(<12 months)		Female	150	133	283
					Total	314	285	599
Wolde <i>et al</i> 2014 <sup>32</sup>	Oromia, Nekemte	Cross-sectional	Mothers who had	182/174	Male	20	10	80
	town	study	a child less <24 months		Female	84	10	94
					Total	154	20	174
Woldemichael	Oromia, Tiyo Woreda	Cross-sectional	Mothers who have children	386/373	Male	153	60	213
2016		study	<1 year age		Female	98	62	160
					Total	251	122	373
								Continued

						TIBF		
Author/publication year	Study area	Study design	Study population	Sample size/ Participated	Factors	Within 1 hour	After 1 hour	Total
Mekonen <i>et al</i> 2018 <sup>34</sup>	Amhara, South Gondar	Cross-sectional study	Mothers of infants <12 months	845/823	Male Female	214 187	229 193	443 380
					Total	401	422	823
B. Antenatal care v€	ersus TIBF							
Gultie	Amhara, Debre	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	Mothers having children	548/548	ANC	482	88	570
and Sebsibie201635	Berhan town	study	aged <23 months old		No ANC	16	15	31
					Total	498	103	601
Tamiru <i>et al</i> 2012 <sup>36</sup>	Oromia, Jimma Arjo	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	Mothers of index children	384/382	ANC	115	69	184
	Woreda	study	aged		No ANC	120	71	191
					Total	235	140	375
Tamiru	SNNPR, Arba Minch	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	Mothers of infants aged	384/384	ANC	179	140	319
and Tamrat2015 <sup>37</sup>	Zuria Woreda	study	≤2 years		No ANC	40	24	64
					Total	219	164	383
Berhe <i>et al</i> 2013 <sup>27</sup>	Tigray, Mekelle town	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	Mothers of children aged 0-	361/361	ANC	263	66	329
		study	24 months		No ANC	15	13	28
					Total	278	79	357
Adugna 2014 <sup>38</sup>	SNNPR, Arba Minch	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	Women who had children	384/383	ANC	179	140	319
	Zuria	study	<2 years		No ANC	40	24	64
					Total	219	164	383
Beyene <i>et al</i> 2016 <sup>28</sup>	SNNPR, Dale	Cross-sectional	Mothers of children	634/634	ANC	206	58	264
	Woreda	study	<24 months		No ANC	311	43	354
					Total	517	101	618
Derso <i>et al</i> 2017 <sup>39</sup>	Amhara, Dabat	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	Mothers with children	6761/6761	ANC	2135	2220	4355
	district	study*	<5 years of age		No ANC	670	1364	2034
					Total	2805	3584	6389
Liben and Yesuf	Afar, Dubti town	Cross-sectional	Mothers of infants aged	346/333	ANC	110	196	306
2016		study	<6months		No ANC	41	56	97
					Total	151	252	403
								Continued

-

Contin.

Toblo

r	١.
b	
C	٦
<u> </u>	

Table 1 Continued								
						TIBF		
Author/publication year	Study area	Study design	Study population	Sample size/ Participated	Factors	Within 1 hour	After 1 hour	Total
Seid <i>et al</i> 2013 <sup>51</sup>	Amhara, Bahir Dar	Cross-sectional	Mothers who	819/819	ANC	680	94	774
	city	study	delivered in the last		No ANC	29	12	41
					Total	709	106	815
Setegn <i>et al</i> 2011 <sup>31</sup>	Oromia, Goba	Cross-sectional	Mothers with children	668/608	ANC	270	238	508
	district	study	(<12 months)		No ANC	37	19	56
					Total	307	257	564
Tewabe 2016 <sup>40</sup>	Amhara, Motta town	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	Mothers with infant	423/405	ANC	282	41	323
		study	<6 months-old		No ANC	37	45	82
					Total	319	86	405
Woldemichael	Oromia, Tiyo Woreda	Cross-sectional	Mothers who have children	386/373	ANC	194	41	235
20163		study	<1 year age		No ANC	57	81	138
					Total	251	122	373
Mekonen <i>et al</i>	Amhara,	Cross-sectional	Mothers of infants	845/823	ANC	370	332	702
2018**	South Gondar	study	<12 months		No ANC	31	06	121
					Total	401	422	823
*Used nationally repres ANC, antenatal care; E	sentative EDHS data. DHS, Ethiopian Demogra	phic Health Survey; SN	JNPR, Southern Nations, National	ities and Peoples' F	Region ; TIBF, timely in	itiation of breas	st feeding.	

Table 2 Characteristics of	included studies on Ef	ЗF						
				Sample size/		EBF		
Author/publication year	Study area	Study design	Study population	Participated	Factors	Yes	No	Total
A. Gender of newborn vers	sus EBF							
Asemahagn 2016 <sup>42</sup>	Amhara, Azezo	Cross-sectional	Women having	346/332	Male	95	38	133
	district	study	children aged from 0 to		Female	167	32	199
			o monues		Total	262	70	332
Setegn et al 2012 <sup>43</sup>	Oromia, Bale Zone,	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	Mothers-infant pairs	668/608	Male	107	43	150
	Goba district	study			Female	92	37	129
					Total	199	80	279
Sonko and Worku 201544	SNNPR, Halaba	Cross-sectional	Mothers	422/420	Male	145	60	205
	special woreda	study	with children <6months		Female	151	64	215
			ul aye		Total	296	124	420
Regassa 2014 <sup>25</sup>	SNNPR, Sidama	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	With infants aged	1100/1094	Male	109	19	128
	zone	study	between 0 and 6		Female	89	17	106
					Total	198	36	234
Alemayehu 2014 <sup>26</sup>	Tigray, Axum town	Cross-sectional	Mothers who had	418/418	Male	97	119	216
		study	children aged 6-12		Female	77	128	205
					Total	174	247	421
Biks <i>et al</i> 2015 <sup>45</sup>	Amhara, Dabat	Nested case-	All pregnant women	1769/1769	Male	271	619	890
	district	control study*	in the second/third		Female	727	1148	1875
					Total	998	1767	2765
Arage and Gedamu 2016 <sup>46</sup>	Amhara, Debre	Cross-sectional	Mothers of infants <6	470/453	Male	119	40	159
	Tabor Town	study	months of age		Female	227	67	294
					Total	346	107	453
Adugna <i>et al</i> 2017 <sup>47</sup>	SNNPR, Hawassa	Cross-sectional	Mothers with infants	541/529	Male	169	88	257
	city	study	aged 0–6 months		Female	153	119	272
					Total	322	207	529
Egata <i>et al</i> 2013 <sup>48</sup>	Oromia, Kersa	Cross-sectional	Mothers of children	881/860	Male	323	124	447
	district	study*	<2 years of age		Female	294	119	413
					Total	617	243	860
Teka <i>et al</i> 2015 <sup>49</sup>	Tigray, Enderta	Cross-sectional	Mothers having children	541/530	Male	158	60	218
	woreda	study	aged <24 months		Female	214	98	312
					Total	372	158	530
								Continued

Table 2 Continued								
				Sample size/		EBF		
Author/publication year	Study area	Study design	Study population	Participated	Factors	Yes	No	Total
Sefene 2013 <sup>50</sup>	Amhara, Bahir Dar	Cross-sectional	Mothers who had a	170/159	Male	36	47	83
	city	study	child aged <6months		Female	42	34	76
					Total	78	81	159
B. Antenatal care versus E	BF							
Asemahagn 2016 <sup>42</sup>	Amhara, Azezo	Cross-sectional	Women having	346/332	ANC	243	57	300
	district	study	children aged from 0 to		No ANC	19	13	32
			o months		Total	262	70	332
Gultie and Sebsibie 2016 <sup>35</sup>	Amhara, Debre	Cross-sectional	Mothers having children	548/548	ANC	263	253	516
	Berhan town	study	aged <23months old		No ANC	10	21	31
					Total	273	274	547
Hunegnaw <i>et al</i> 2017 <sup>52</sup>	Amhara, Gozamin	Cross-sectional	Mothers who had	506/478	ANC	341	109	450
	district	study	infants aged between 6		No ANC	17	11	28
					Total	358	120	478
Lenja e <i>t al</i> 2016 <sup>53</sup>	SNNPR, Offa district	Cross-sectional	Mothers of infants	403/396	ANC	233	43	276
		study	<6months		No ANC	44	88	132
					Total	277	131	408
Seid <i>et al</i> 2013 <sup>51</sup>	Amhara, Bahir Dar	Cross-sectional	Mothers who	819/819	ANC	405	372	777
	city	study	delivered in the last		No ANC	7	35	42
			1 Z III OLI II Z		Total	412	407	819
Setegn <i>et al</i> 2011 <sup>31</sup>	Oromia, Goba	Cross-sectional	Mothers with children	668/608	ANC	166	65	231
	district	study	(<12 months)		No ANC	27	10	37
					Total	193	75	268
Sonko and Worku 2015 <sup>44</sup>	SNNPR, Halaba	Cross-sectional	Mothers	422/420	ANC	258	88	346
	special woreda	study	with children <6months		No ANC	38	36	74
			ul age		Total	296	124	420
Tadesse <i>et al</i> 2016 <sup>54</sup>	SNNPR, Sorro	Cross-sectional	Mothers with infants	602/579	ANC	211	121	332
	District	Study	aged 0-5 months		No ANC	59	123	182
					Total	270	244	514
Tariku <i>et al</i> 2017 <sup>55</sup>	Amhara, Dabat	Cross-sectional	Mothers with children	5227/5227	ANC	1979	1353	3332
	District	study *	aged <59months		No ANC	713	876	1589
					Total	2692	2229	4921
								Continued

Open access

Iable z Continuea									
				Sample size/		EBF			
Author/publication year	Study area	Study design	Study population	Participated	Factors	Yes	No	Total	
Tewabe 2016 <sup>40</sup>	Amhara, Motta town,	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	Mothers with an infant	423/405	ANC	185	164	349	
	East Gojjam zone	study	<6 months old		No ANC	18	38	56	
					Total	203	202	405	
Tamiru <i>et al</i> 2012 <sup>36</sup>	Oromia, Jimma Arjo	Cross-sectional	Mothers of index	384/382	ANC	87	103	190	
	Woreda	study	children aged		No ANC	96	96	192	
					Total	183	199	382	
Tamiru and Tamrat 2015 <sup>37</sup>	SNNPR, Arba Minch	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	Mothers of infants aged	384/384	ANC	228	92	320	
	Zuria Woreda	study	≤2 years		No ANC	27	37	64	
					Total	255	129	384	
Biks <i>et al</i> 2015 <sup>45</sup>	Amhara, Dabat	Nested case-	All pregnant women	1769/1769	ANC	180	277	457	
	district	control study*	in the second/third		No ANC	363	949	1312	
			rrinester		Total	543	1226	1769	
Abera 2012 <sup>56</sup>	Harari, Harar town	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	Mothers of children	604/583	ANC	194	163	357	
		study	aged <2 years		No ANC	13	29	42	
					Total	207	192	399	
Arage and Gedamu 2016 <sup>46</sup>	Amhara, Debre	Cross-sectional	Mothers of infants <6	470/453	ANC	384	39	423	
	Tabor Town	study	months of age		No ANC	18	12	30	
					Total	402	51	453	
Adugna <i>et al</i> 2017 <sup>47</sup>	SNNPR, Hawassa	<b>Cross-sectional</b>	Mothers with infants	541/529	ANC	221	111	332	
	city	study	aged 0–6 months		No ANC	101	96	197	
					Total	322	207	529	
Egata <i>et al</i> 2013 <sup>48</sup>	Oromia, Kersa	Cross-sectional	Mothers of children	881/860	ANC	233	135	368	
	district	study*	<2 years of age		No ANC	384	108	492	
					Total	617	243	860	
Taddele 2014 <sup>57</sup>	Amhara, Injibara	Comparative	Employed and	524/473	ANC	06	98	188	
	Town	cross-sectional	unemployed mothers of		No ANC	9	23	29	
		ətudy	umuen ageu > i year		Total	96	121	217	
Echamo 2012 <sup>58</sup>	SNNPR, Arbaminch	Cross-sectional	Mothers of infants	768/768	ANC	332	360	692	
	town	study	within the age of 6-12		No ANC	25	51	76	
					Total	357	411	768	
								Continued	

10

Table 2 Continued								
				Sample size/		EBF		
Author/publication year	Study area	Study design	Study population	Participated	Factors	Yes	No	Total
Teka <i>et al</i> 2015 <sup>49</sup>	Tigray, Enderta	Cross-sectional	Mothers having children	541/530	ANC	325	134	459
	Woreda	study	aged <24months		No ANC	47	24	71
					Total	372	158	530
Chekol <i>et al</i> 2017 <sup>59</sup>	Amhara, Gondar	Cross-sectional	Mothers with children	333/333	ANC	131	117	248
	town	study	aged 7-12months		No ANC	29	56	85
					Total	160	173	333
C. Postnatal care versus E	BF							
Asemahagn 2016 <sup>42</sup>	Amhara, Azezo	Cross-sectional	Women having	346/332	PNC	137	25	162
	district	study	children aged from 0 to		No PNC	125	45	170
					Total	262	70	332
Lenja <i>et al</i> 2016 <sup>53</sup>	SNNPR, Offa district	Cross-sectional	Mothers of infants	403/396	PNC	188	33	221
		study	<6months		No PNC	121	54	175
					Total	309	87	396
Sonko and Worku 2015 <sup>44</sup>	SNNPR, Halaba	Cross-sectional	Mothers with children	422/420	PNC	98	25	123
	special woreda	study	<6months of age		No PNC	197	66	296
					Total	295	124	419
Tadesse <i>et al</i> 2016 <sup>54</sup>	SNNPR, Sorro	Cross-sectional	Mothers with infants	602/579	PNC	204	127	331
	District	Study	aged 0-5 months		No PNC	66	117	183
					Total	270	244	514
Tewabe <i>et al</i> 2016 <sup>60</sup>	Amhara, Motta town,	Cross-sectional	Mothers with an infant	423/405	PNC	116	81	197
	East Gojjam zone	Study	<6months old		No PNC	87	121	208
					Total	203	202	405
Abera 2012 <sup>56</sup>	Harari, Harar town	Cross-sectional	Mothers of children	604/583	PNC	29	31	60
		study	aged <2 years		No PNC	178	161	339
					Total	207	192	399
Teka <i>et al</i> 2015 <sup>49</sup>	Tigray, Enderta	Cross-sectional	Mothers having children	541/530	PNC	167	86	253
	woreda	study	aged <24months		No PNC	205	72	277
					Total	372	158	530
*Used nationally representative ANC, antenatal care; EBF, exclu	EDHS data. usive breast feeding; EDH9	3, Ethiopian Demogr	aphic Health Survey; PNC, p	oostnatal care; SNNP	R, Southern Natio	ons, Nationalitie	es and Peoples	Region.

	M	ale	Fen	nale	
Studies and Publication year	TIBF	LIBF	TIBF	LIBF	Odds Ratio [95% CI]
Regassa; 2014	488	107	389	110	1.29 [0.96, 1.74]
Alemayehu et al,; 2014	75	141	99	103	0.55 [0.37, 0.82]
Berhe et al.; 2013	166	42	112	37	1.31 [0.79, 2.16]
Beyene et al.; 2017	262	51	255	50	1.01 [0.66, 1.54]
Lakew et al; 2015	3124	2860	3057	2511	0.90 [0.83, 0.97]
Liben et al; 2016	81	122	70	130	+=→ 1.23 [0.82, 1.85]
Setegn et al; 2011	164	152	150	133	0.96 [0.69, 1.32]
Wolde et al; 2014	70	10	84	10	0.83 [0.33, 2.12]
Woldemichael et al; 2016	153	60	98	62	1.61 [1.04, 2.50]
Mekonen et al; 2018	214	229	187	193	0.96 [0.73, 1.27]
Summary REM test for beterogeneity (Q =	22.28 d	lf=9.p=	= 0 01 <sup>.</sup> I <sup>2</sup> =	66 2%)	1.02 [0.86, 1.21]
	, 0	J, P			
					02 1 2 45

			Far			
Studies and Publication year	EBF	NEBF	EBF	NEBF	Ode	ds Ratio [95% CI]
Asemahagn; 2016	95	38	167	32		0.48 [0.28, 0.82]
Setegn et al.; 2012	107	43	92	37	- <del></del>	1.00 [0.59, 1.68]
Sonko et al; 2015	145	60	151	64	- <u>+</u>	1.02 [0.67, 1.56]
Regassa; 2014	109	19	89	17	<u> </u>	1.10 [0.54, 2.23]
Alemayehu et al,; 2014	97	119	77	128		1.36 [0.92, 2.00]
Biks et al; 2015	271	619	272	1148	-	1.85 [1.52, 2.24]
Arage et al; 2016	119	40	227	67		0.88 [0.56, 1.38]
Adugna et al; 2017	169	88	153	119		1.49 [1.05, 2.12]
Egata et al; 2013	323	124	294	119	÷-	1.05 [0.78, 1.42]
Teka et al; 2015	158	60	214	98		1.21 [0.82, 1.77]
Sefene et al; 2013	36	47	42	34		0.62 [0.33, 1.16]
Summary					+	1.08 [0.86, 1.36]
REM test for heterogeneity (Q =	39.19, c	lf = 10, p	= 0.00; I <sup>2</sup>	= 71.7%)		Г

Favours LIBF Favours TIBF

Figure 2 Forest plot of the unadjusted odds ratios with corresponding 95% CIs of 10 studies on the association of gender of newborn and TIBF. The horizontal line represents the CI, the box and its size in the middle of the horizontal line represents the weight of sample size. The polygon represents the pooled OR. The reference category is 'Female'. LIBF, late initiation of breast feeding; REM, random-effects model; TIBF, timely initiation of breast feeding.

Furthermore, seven studies<sup>42 44 49 53 54 56 60</sup> reported the association between EBF and PNC in 2995 mothers (table 2C). The pooled OR of PNC was 1.86 (95% CI 1.41 to 2.47, p<0.0001, I<sup>2</sup>=63.4%) (figure 6). Mothers

	A	NC	No /	ANC	
Studies and Publication year	TIBF	LIBF	TIBF	LIBF	Odds Ratio [95% CI]
Gultie et al; 2016	428	88	16	15	4.56 [2.17, 9.56]
Tamiru et al.; 2012	115	69	120	71	0.99 [0.65, 1.50]
Tamiru et al; 2015	179	140	40	24	0.77 [0.44, 1.33]
Berhe et al.; 2013	263	66	15	13	3.45 [1.57, 7.61]
Adugna; 2014	179	140	40	24	0.77 [0.44, 1.33]
Beyene et al.; 2017	206	58	311	43	0.49 [0.32, 0.76]
Derso et al.; 2017	2135	2220	670	1364	1.96 [1.75, 2.19]
Liben et al; 2016	110	196	41	56	0.77 [0.48, 1.22]
Seid; 2014	680	94	29	12	<b>2.99</b> [1.48, 6.07]
Setegn et al; 2011	270	238	37	45	1.38 [0.86, 2.20]
Tewabe; 2016	282	67	37	19	2.16 [1.17, 3.99]
Woldemichael et al; 2016	194	41	57	81	<b>→</b> 6.72 [4.17, 10.84]
Mekonen et al; 2018	370	332	31	90	→ 3.24 [2.10, 4.99]
Summary REM test for heterogeneity (Q	= 124.	59, df =	12, p = 0	.00; I <sup>2</sup> =	= 93.1%)
				C	0.08 1 3 11

#### Favours LIBF Favours TIBF

Figure 3 Forest plot of the unadjusted odds ratios with corresponding 95% CIs of 13 studies on the association of ANC and TIBF. The horizontal line represents the CI, the box and its size in the middle of the horizontal line represents the weight of sample size. The polygon represents the pooled OR. The reference category is 'No ANC follow-up'. ANC, antenatal care; LIBF, late initiation of breast feeding; REM, random-effects model; TIBF, timely initiation of breast feeding. Favours NEBF Favours EBF

1 2 4.5

Figure 4 Forest plot of the unadjusted odds ratios with corresponding 95% CIs of 11 studies on the association of newborn gender and EBF. The horizontal line represents the CI, the box and its size in the middle of the horizontal line represents the weight of sample size. The polygon represents the pooled OR. The reference category is 'Female'. EBF, exclusive breast feeding; NEBF, non exclusive of breast feeding; REM, random-effects model.

who had at least one PNC visit had 86% significantly higher chance of exclusively breast feed during the first 6 months compared with mothers who had no PNC

	AN	C	N	ANC	
Studies and Publication year	EBF	NEBF	EBF	NEBF	Odds Ratio [95% CI]
Asemahagn; 2016	243	57	19	13	2.92 [1.36, 6.25]
Gultie et al; 2016	263	253	10	21	2.18 [1.01, 4.73]
Hunegnawu et al; 2017	341	109	17	11	2.02 [0.92, 4.45]
Lenja et al.; 2016	223	43	44	88	ID.37 [6.37, 16.89]
Seid et al; 2013	405	372	7	35	5.44 [2.39, 12.40]
Setegn et al.; 2012	166	65	27	10	0.95 [0.43, 2.06]
Sonko et al; 2015	258	88	38	36	2.78 [1.66, 4.65]
Tadesse et al; 2016	211	121	59	123	→ 3.64 [2.48, 5.33]
Tariku et al.; 2017	1979	1353	713	876	1.80 [1.59, 2.03]
Tewabe et al.; 2017	185	164	18	38	2.38 [1.31, 4.33]
Tamiru et al.; 2012	87	103	96	96	0.84 [0.57, 1.26]
Tamiru et al; 2015	228	92	27	37	3.40 [1.96, 5.90]
Biks et al; 2015	180	277	363	949	1.70 [1.36, 2.12]
Abera; 2012	194	163	13	29	2.66 [1.34, 5.28]
Arage et al; 2016	384	39	18	12	6.56 [2.95, 14.63]
Adugna et al; 2017	221	111	101	96	1.89 [1.32, 2.71]
Egata et al; 2013	233	135	384	108	• <b>•</b> • 0.49 [0.36, 0.66]
Taddele et al; 2014	90	98	6	23	3.52 [1.37, 9.04]
Echamo; 2012	332	360	25	51	1.88 [1.14, 3.11]
Teka et al; 2015	325	134	47	24	1.24 [0.73, 2.11]
Chekol et al; 2017	131	117	29	56	<b>→</b> 2.16 [1.29, 3.61]
Summary					• 2.24 [1.65, 3.04]
REM test for heterogeneity (Q =	185.02	, df = 20	), p = (	0.00; l <sup>2</sup> =	90.9%)
				Г	
				1	

Favours NEBF Favours EBF

17

Figure 5 Forest plot of the unadjusted odds ratios with corresponding 95% CIs of 21 studies on the association of ANC and EBF. The horizontal line represents the CI, the box and its size in the middle of the horizontal line represents the weight of sample size. The polygon represents the pooled OR. The reference category is 'No ANC follow-up'. ANC, antenatal care; EBF, exclusive breast feeding; NEBF, nonexclusive of breast feeding; REM, random-effects model.

0.08

	Р	NC	No PNC		
Studies and Publication year	EBF	NEBF	EBF	NEBF	Odds Ratio [95% CI]
Asemahagn; 2016	137	25	125	45	1.97 [1.14, 3.40]
Lenja et al.; 2016	188	33	121	54	<b>→→→</b> 2.54 [1.56, 4.15]
Sonko et al; 2015	98	25	197	99	1.97 [1.19, 3.25]
Tadesse et al; 2016	204	127	66	117	-∎- 2.85 [1.96, 4.14]
Tewabe et al.; 2017	116	81	87	121	<b>---</b> 1.99 [1.34, 2.96]
Abera; 2012	29	31	178	161	0.85 [0.49, 1.47]
Teka et al; 2015	205	72	167	86	1.47 [1.01, 2.13]
Summary					- 1.86 [1.41, 2.47]
REM test for heterogeneity (Q =	16.11,	df = 6, p	= 0.01; I <sup>2</sup>	= 63.4%)	
				]	i
					· · ·
				0.0	9 12 7

#### Favours NEBF Favours EBF

**Figure 6** Forest plot of the unadjusted odds ratios with corresponding 95% CIs of seven studies on the association of PNC and EBF. The horizontal line represents the CI, the box and its size in the middle of the horizontal line represents the weight of sample size. The polygon represents the pooled OR. The reference category is 'No PNC follow-up'. EBF, exclusive breast feeding; NEBF, non-exclusive breast feeding; PNC, postnatal care; REM, random-effects model.

follow-up. There was no significant publication bias (z=-0.91, p=0.36) (online supplementary figure 5).

#### **Cumulative meta-analysis**

As illustrated in figure 7, the effect of gender of newborn (figure 7) has not been changed whereas the effect of ANC on TIBF (figure 8) has been increasing over time.

Similarly, the effect of gender of newborn on EBF (figure 9) has not been changed over time. The effect



#### Odds Ratio (log scale)

**Figure 7** Forest plot showing the results from a cumulative meta-analysis of studies examining the effect of gender of newborn on TIBF. TIBF, timely initiation of breast feeding.

#### Studies and Publication year

Setern et al: 2011

ication year

# Odds ratio [95% Cl]

ootogii ot al, zorr		1.00 [0.00, 2.20]
+ Tamiru et al.; 2012		1.15 [0.83, 1.59]
+ Berhe et al.; 2013		1.56 [0.80, 3.05]
+ Adugna; 2014	<b></b>	1.30 [0.74, 2.30]
+ Seid; 2014	÷∎	1.53 [0.87, 2.66]
+ Tamiru et al; 2015	•÷•	1.35 [0.82, 2.23]
+ Gultie et al; 2016	·	1.61 [0.93, 2.76]
+ Liben et al; 2016	·	1.45 [0.88, 2.39]
+ Tewabe; 2016		1.51 [0.97, 2.37]
+ Woldemichael et al; 2016	·	1.79 [1.08, 2.97]
+ Beyene et al.; 2017	<b></b>	1.58 [0.95, 2.65]
+ Derso et al.; 2017		1.61 [1.01, 2.57]
+ Mekonen et al; 2018	· <b>-</b>	1.70 [1.10, 2.65]
	0.5 1 2 3.5	

Odds Ratio (log scale)

**Figure 8** Forest plot showing the results from a cumulative meta-analysis of studies examining the effect of ANC on TIBF. ANC, antenatal care; TIBF, timely initiation of breast feeding.

of ANC (figure 10) and PNC (figure 11) have been increasing.

#### **Meta-regression analysis**

In studies reporting the association between TIBF and ANC, 26.29% of the heterogeneity was accounted for the variation in study area (region), residence of mothers, sample size and publication year. Based on the omnibus test of moderators, however, none of these factors influenced association between TIBF and ANC ( $Q_M$ =11.57, df=8, p=0.17). In studies reporting the association between TIBF and gender of newborn, the estimated amount of total heterogeneity was substantially low (tau<sup>2</sup>=4.28%);

Studies and Publication year	Odds ratio [95% CI]				
Setegn et al.; 2012	<b>└──</b> 1.00 [0.59, 1.68]				
+ Egata et al; 2013	1.04 [0.80, 1.35]				
+ Sefene et al; 2013	0.97 [0.76, 1.23]				
+ Regassa; 2014	0.98 [0.78, 1.23]				
+ Alemayehu et al,; 2014	1.06 [0.87, 1.29]				
+ Sonko et al; 2015	1.06 [0.88, 1.26]				
+ Biks et al; 2015	1.16 [0.89, 1.51]				
+ Teka et al; 2015	1.18 [0.94, 1.47]				
+ Asemahagn; 2016	1.06 [0.81, 1.38]				
+ Arage et al; 2016	1.04 [0.82, 1.33]				
+ Adugna et al; 2017	1.08 [0.86, 1.36]				
	0.5 1 2				

Odds Ratio (log scale)

**Figure 9** Forest plot showing the results from a cumulative meta-analysis of studies examining the effect of gender of newborn on EBF. EBF, exclusive breast feeding.



Odds Ratio (log scale)



as a result, it is not relevant to investigate the possible reasons for heterogeneity.

Among studies reporting the association between EBF and gender of newborn, ANC and PNC, 77.66%, 60.29% and 100% of the heterogeneity were accounted for the variation in study area (region), residence of mothers, sample size and publication year, respectively. Based on the omnibus test of moderators, study area (region) and publication year negatively influenced the association between gender of newborn and EBF practice  $(Q_M=18.46, df=7, p=0.01)$ . Study area (region) negatively influenced the association between ANC and EBF practice  $(Q_M=27.55, df=8, p=0.001)$  (table 3).



#### Odds Ratio (log scale)

**Figure 11** Forest plot showing the results from a cumulative meta-analysis of studies examining the effect of PNC on EBF. EBF, exclusive breast feeding; PNC, postnatal care.

This meta-analysis assessed the association between breastfeeding practices (ie, TIBF and EBF) and gender of newborn, ANC and PNC. The key findings were EBF was significantly associated with ANC, PNC and gender of newborn whereas TIBF was significantly associated with ANC but not with gender of newborn.

In congruent with our hypothesis and the large body of global evidence,<sup>61–66</sup> our finding indicated that mothers who had at least one antenatal visit had a significantly higher chance of initiating breast feeding within 1 hour of birth and exclusively breast feed for the first 6 months compared with mothers who had no ANC visit. This may be because health professionals provide breastfeeding guidance and counselling during ANC visit.<sup>7</sup> The Ethiopian Ministry of Health has also adopted Baby-Friendly Hospital Initiative programme as part of the national nutrition programme and is now actively working to integrate to all public and private health facilities and improving breastfeeding practice as a result.

We also showed that mothers who had at least one PNC visit had nearly twice higher chance of exclusively breast feeding during the first 6 months compared with mothers who had no PNC follow-up. This result supported our hypothesis, and various studies have similarly reported a significantly high rate of EBF in mothers who had a postnatal visit at health institution<sup>66</sup> or postnatal home visit.<sup>67</sup> The possible justification could be that postnatal visit health education may positively influence the belief and decision of the mothers to exclusively breast feed. Previous studies have also shown that postnatal education and counselling are important to increase EBF practice.<sup>68</sup> In addition, in our previous meta-analyses, we showed that guidance and counselling during PNC was significantly associated with high-rate EBF.<sup>7</sup> Furthermore, PNC may ease breastfeeding difficulty, increase maternal confidence and encourage social/family support which lead the mother to continue EBF for 6 months.

Finally, in agreement with our hypothesis and previous studies,<sup>69–71</sup> we uncovered gender of newborn was significantly associated with EBF practice. Mothers with male newborn had a 31% significantly higher chance of exclusively breast feeding during the first 6 months compared with mothers of female newborn. This finding disproved the traditional perception and belief in Ethiopia that male newborn has prelacteal feeding to be strong and healthy compared with female newborn. On the other hand, several studies<sup>63 66</sup> depicted that gender of newborn is not significantly associated with breastfeeding practice, such as TIBF as we showed in our meta-analysis. This discrepancy might be due to the sociocultural difference and lack of adequate power given that we only found 10 studies to estimate the pooled effect size.

This systematic review and meta-analysis was conducted based on published protocol,<sup>15</sup> and PRISMA guideline for literature reviews. In addition, publication bias was quantified using Egger's regression statistical test and NOS was used to assess the quality of included studies. Since it is

Table 3 Meta-regression analysis to identify possible factors of heterogeneity among the included studies							
Variables (reference category)*	Estimate	SE	Z value	P value	CI.lb	Cl.ub	
TIBF							
ANC							
Amhara region (Afar)	1.71	1.17	1.46	0.15	-0.59	4.01	
Oromia region (Afar)	1.48	0.91	1.62	0.10	-0.31	3.28	
SNNPR region (Afar)	0.54	1.09	0.50	0.62	-1.58	2.67	
Tigray region (Afar)	1.58	1.30	1.21	0.23	-0.97	4.12	
Urban residence (Rural)	0.71	1.07	0.67	0.51	-1.38	2.80	
Urban and rural residence (Rural)	0.65	1.25	0.52	0.61	-1.81	3.10	
≥501 mothers (≤500 mothers)	-0.54	0.81	-0.66	0.51	-2.13	1.06	
Published 2016–2018 (2011–2015)	0.14	0.82	0.17	0.87	-1.47	1.74	
EBF							
Gender of newborn							
Oromia region (Amhara)	-0.54	0.24	-2.22	0.03	-1.02	-0.06	
SNNPR region (Amhara)	0.12	0.26	0.46	0.64	-0.39	0.63	
Tigray region (Amhara)	-0.39	0.30	-1.31	0.19	-0.98	0.19	
Urban residence (Rural)	0.79	0.51	1.57	0.12	-0.20	1.78	
Urban and rural residence (Rural)	-0.10	0.44	-0.24	0.81	-0.96	0.75	
$\geq$ 501 mothers ( $\leq$ 500 mothers)	0.78	0.23	3.34	<0.001	0.32	1.24	
Published 2016–2018 (2011–2015)	-1.14	0.44	-2.59	0.01	-1.99	-0.28	
ANC							
Harari region (Amhara)	-0.11	0.64	-0.17	0.87	-1.37	1.16	
Oromia region (Amhara)	-1.27	0.39	-3.28	0.001	-2.03	-0.51	
SNNPR region (Amhara)	0.09	0.35	0.27	0.78	-0.59	0.78	
Tigray region (Amhara)	-0.49	0.57	-0.87	0.38	-1.60	0.62	
Urban residence (Rural)	-0.18	0.38	-0.47	0.63	-0.92	0.56	
Urban and rural residence (Rural)	-0.26	0.52	-0.49	0.62	-1.28	0.76	
≥501 mothers (≤500 mothers)	-0.30	0.34	-0.87	0.38	-0.96	0.37	
Published 2016–2018 (2011–2015)	0.08	0.28	0.29	0.77	-0.46	0.62	
PNC†							
Harari region (Amhara)	-0.60	0.48	-1.24	0.22	-1.54	0.35	
SNNPR region (Amhara)	0.25	0.30	0.82	0.41	-0.34	0.83	
Tigray region (Amhara)	-0.16	0.64	-0.25	0.80	-1.42	1.10	
≥501 mothers (≤500 mothers)	0.11	0.31	0.36	0.72	-0.50	0.73	
Published 2016-2018 (2011-2015)	0.26	0.36	0.71	0.47	-0.45	0.96	

\*Since we do not have a specific hypothesis, the reference category is selected arbitrarily; †Residence is dropped from the model due to small sample size of included studies. Cut-off value for sample size and publication year was arbitrarily chosen.

ANC, antenatal care; Cl.lb, Clinterval, lower bound; Cl.ub, Clinterval, upper bound; EBF, exclusive breast feeding; PNC, postnatal care; SNNPR, Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples' Region; TIBF, timely initiation of breast feeding.

the first study in Ethiopia, the evidence could be helpful for future researchers, public health practitioners and healthcare policy-makers. The inclusion of all previously published studies is a further strength of this meta-analysis. This study has limitations as well. Almost all included studies were observational, which weakens the strength of evidence and hinder causality inference. Even though we have used broad search strategies, the possibility of missing relevant studies cannot be fully exempted and the finding may not be nationally representative. Based on the conventional method of heterogeneity test, a few analyses suffer from high between-study variation. The course of heterogeneity was carefully explored using meta-regression analysis, and this variation may be due to the difference in study area (region), residence of mothers, sample size, publication year or other residual

#### **Open access**

factors; therefore, the result should be interpreted with caution. Moreover, the dose–response relationship between the number of ANC or PNC visits and breast-feeding practices was not examined. Lastly, significant publication bias was detected in studies that reported the association between EBF and gender of newborn. We did Duval and Tweedie trim-and-fill analysis to adjust publication bias and to provide an unbiased estimate; however, the result should be cautiously interpreted.

#### **CONCLUSIONS**

In line with our hypothesis, we found that increasing the use of antenatal and PNC has a positive effect on breastfeeding practices (ie, TIBF and EBF), which signifies stakeholders would provide emphasis on ANC and PNC service to optimise breast feeding. This meta-analysis study provided an overview of up-to-date evidence for public nutrition professionals and policy-makers in Ethiopia. It could also be useful for breastfeeding improvement initiative in Ethiopia and cross-country and cross-cultural comparison. From the research point of view, in general, intervention and outcome based studies on breast feeding in Ethiopia are required.

#### **Author affiliations**

<sup>1</sup>Department of Nursing, Debre Berhan University, Debre Berhan, Ethiopia <sup>2</sup>Department of Epidemiology, University Medical Center Groningen, University of Groningen, Groningen, The Netherlands

<sup>3</sup>Department of Public Health, University Medical Center Groningen, University of Groningen, Groningen, The Netherlands

Acknowledgements Our special gratitude forwarded to Sjoukje van der Werf (University of Groningen, the Netherlands) for her support to develop the search strings and Balewgizie Sileshi (University of Groningen, the Netherlands) for his support during the title and abstract screening.

**Contributors** NTS and TDH conceived and designed the study. TDH developed a syntax for searching databases, analysed the data and interpreted the results. TDH and SMA wrote and revised the manuscript. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

**Funding** The authors have not declared a specific grant for this research from any funding agency in the public, commercial or not-for-profit sectors.

Competing interests None declared.

Patient consent for publication Not required.

Provenance and peer review Not commissioned; externally peer reviewed.

**Data sharing statement** All data generated or analysed in this study are included in the article and its supplementary files.

**Open access** This is an open access article distributed in accordance with the Creative Commons Attribution Non Commercial (CC BY-NC 4.0) license, which permits others to distribute, remix, adapt, build upon this work non-commercially, and license their derivative works on different terms, provided the original work is properly cited, appropriate credit is given, any changes made indicated, and the use is non-commercial. See: http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/.

#### REFERENCES

- 1. World Health Organization. Infant and young child feeding: a tool for assessing national practices, policies and programmes, 2003.
- World Health Organization. Babies and mothers worldwide failed by lack of investment in breastfeeding. Saudi Med J 2017;38:974–5.

- Edmond KM, Zandoh C, Quigley MA, et al. Delayed breastfeeding initiation increases risk of neonatal mortality. *Pediatrics* 2006;117:e380–6.
- 4. World Health Organization. Infant and young child feeding: model chapter for textbooks for medical students and allied health professionals. Infant and young child feeding: model chapter for textbooks for medical students and allied health professionals, 2009.
- 5. Unicef W. Capture the Moment Early initiation of breastfeeding: The best start for every newborn, 2018.
- UNICEF. Infant and young child feeding. 2018. Available at https:// data.unicef.org/topic/nutrition/infant-and-young-child-feeding/ (Accessed 20 Sep 2018).
- Habtewold TD, Mohammed SH, Endalamaw A, et al. Breast and complementary feeding in Ethiopia: new national evidence from systematic review and meta-analyses of studies in the past 10 years. Eur J Nutr 2018.
- Boccolini CS, MLd C. Oliveira, Maria Inês Couto de. Factors associated with exclusive breastfeeding in the first six months of life in Brazil: a systematic review. *Rev Saude Publica* 2015:49.
- Sharma IK, Byrne A. Early initiation of breastfeeding: a systematic literature review of factors and barriers in South Asia. *Int Breastfeed* J 2016;11:17.
- Alemu SM, Alemu YM, Habtewold TD. Association of age and colostrum discarding with breast-feeding practice in Ethiopia: systematic review and meta-analyses. *Public Health Nutr* 2019:1–20.
- 11. Alebel A, Dejenu G, Mullu G, *et al.* Timely initiation of breastfeeding and its association with birth place in Ethiopia: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Int Breastfeed J* 2017;12:44.
- Alebel A, Tesma C, Temesgen B, et al. Exclusive breastfeeding practice in Ethiopia and its association with antenatal care and institutional delivery: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Int Breastfeed J 2018;13:31.
- Temesgen H, Negesse A, Woyraw W, et al. Dietary diversity feeding practice and its associated factors among children age 6-23 months in Ethiopia from 2011 up to 2018: a systematic review and metaanalysis. *Ital J Pediatr* 2018;44:109.
- Temesgen H, Negesse A, Woyraw W, et al. Prelacteal feeding and associated factors in Ethiopia: systematic review and meta-analysis. Int Breastfeed J 2018;13:49.
- Habtewold TD, Islam MA, Sharew NT, et al. SystEmatic review and meta-aNAlysis of infanT and young child feeding Practices (ENAT-P) in Ethiopia: protocol. BMJ Open 2017;7:e017437.
- Kraemer HC. Kappa coefficient. Wiley StatsRef: Statistics Reference Online 2014:1–4.
- Peterson J, Welch V, Losos M, et al. The Newcastle-Ottawa scale (NOS) for assessing the quality of nonrandomised studies in metaanalyses. 2011.
- Munn Z, Tufanaru C, Aromataris E. JBI's systematic reviews: data extraction and synthesis. *Am J Nurs* 2014;114:49–54.
- Brinkhoff T. Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia. 2015. 2018. Available at http://www.citypopulation.de/Ethiopia.html.
- 20. Egger M, Davey Smith G, Schneider M, *et al.* Bias in meta-analysis detected by a simple, graphical test. *BMJ* 1997;315:629–34.
- Duval S, Tweedie R. Trim and fill: A simple funnel-plot-based method of testing and adjusting for publication bias in meta-analysis. *Biometrics* 2000;56:455–63.
- Higgins JP, Thompson SG. Quantifying heterogeneity in a metaanalysis. *Stat Med* 2002;21:1539–58.
- Viechtbauer W. Conducting Meta-Analyses in R with the metafor Package. J Stat Softw 2010;36.
- Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, et al. Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. PLoS Med 2009;6:e1000097.
- Regassa N. Infant and child feeding practices among farming communities in Southern Ethiopia. *Kontakt* 2014;16:e215–22.
- Alemayehu M. Factors Associated with Timely Initiation and Exclusive Breast Feeding among Mothers of Axum Town, Northern Ethiopia. Science Journal of Public Health 2014;2:394–401.
- 27. Berhe H, Mekonnen B, Bayray A, *et al.* Determinants of Breast feeding Practices Among Mothers Attending Public Health Facilities, Mekelle, Northern Ethiopia; A Cross Sectional Study. *International Journal of Pharmaceutical Sciences and Research* 2013;4:650.
- Beyene MG, Geda NR, Habtewold TD, et al. Early initiation of breastfeeding among mothers of children under the age of 24 months in Southern Ethiopia. Int Breastfeed J 2016;12.
- Lakew Y, Tabar L, Haile D. Socio-medical determinants of timely breastfeeding initiation in Ethiopia: Evidence from the 2011 nation wide Demographic and Health Survey. *Int Breastfeed J* 2015;10.

### <u>6</u>

- Liben ML, Yesuf EM. Determinants of early initiation of breastfeeding in Amibara district, Northeastern Ethiopia: a community based crosssectional study. *Int Breastfeed J* 2016;11.
- Setegn T, Gerbaba M, Belachew T. Determinants of timely initiation of breastfeeding among mothers in Goba Woreda, South East Ethiopia: a cross sectional study. *BMC Public Health* 2011;11:217,2458–11-217.
- Wolde T, Birhanu T, Ejeta E. Prevalence and determinants of timely initiation of breastfeeding among lactating mothers of urban dwellers in Western Ethiopia: A community based cross sectional study. *Food Science and Quality Management* 2014:31.
- Woldemichael B. Timely Initiation of Breastfeeding and Its Associated Factors among Mothers in Tiyo Woreda, Arsi Zone, Ethiopia: A Community- Based Cross Sectional Study. *Clinics in Mother and Child Health* 2016;13:221.
- Mekonen L, Seifu W, Shiferaw Z. Timely initiation of breastfeeding and associated factors among mothers of infants under 12 months in South Gondar zone, Amhara regional state, Ethiopia; 2013. *Int Breastfeed J* 2018;13:17.
- Gultie T, Sebsibie G. Determinants of suboptimal breastfeeding practice in Debre Berhan town, Ethiopia: a cross sectional study. Int Breastfeed J 2016;11.
- Tamiru D, Belachew T, Loha E, et al. Sub-optimal breastfeeding of infants during the first six months and associated factors in rural communities of Jimma Arjo Woreda, Southwest Ethiopia. BMC Public Health 2012;12:363,2458–12-363.
- 37. Tamiru D, Tamrat M. Constraints to the optimal breastfeeding practices of breastfeeding mothers in the rural communities of Arba Minch Zuria Woreda, Ethiopia: a community-based, cross-sectional study. South African Journal of Clinical Nutrition 2015;28:134–9.
- Adugna DT. Women's perception and risk factors for delayed initiation of breastfeeding in Arba Minch Zuria, Southern Ethiopia. Int Breastfeed J 2014;9.
- Derso T, Biks GA, Tariku A, et al. Correlates of early neonatal feeding practice in Dabat HDSS site, northwest Ethiopia. Int Breastfeed J 2017;12.
- Tewabe T. Timely initiation of breastfeeding and associated factors among mothers in Motta town, East Gojjam zone, Amhara regional state, Ethiopia, 2015: a cross-sectional study. *BMC Pregnancy Childbirth* 2016;16:314.
- Musa Seid A. Vaginal Delivery and Maternal Knowledge on Correct Breastfeeding Initiation Time as Predictors of Early Breastfeeding Initiation: Lesson from a Community-Based Cross-Sectional Study. ISRN Epidemiology 2014;2014:1–6.
- Asemahagn MA. Determinants of exclusive breastfeeding practices among mothers in azezo district, northwest Ethiopia. *Int Breastfeed J* 2016;11.
- Setegn T, Belachew T, Gerbaba M, et al. Factors associated with exclusive breastfeeding practices among mothers in Goba district, south east Ethiopia: A cross-sectional study. Int Breastfeeding J 2012:7.
- 44. Sonko A, Worku A. Prevalence and predictors of exclusive breastfeeding for the first six months of life among women in Halaba special woreda, Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples' Region/SNNPR/, Ethiopia: a community based cross-sectional study. *Arch Public Health* 2015;73.
- 45. Biks GA, Tariku A, Tessema GA. Effects of antenatal care and institutional delivery on exclusive breastfeeding practice in northwest Ethiopia: a nested case-control study. *Int Breastfeed J* 2015;10:30.
- Arage G, Gedamu H. Exclusive Breastfeeding Practice and Its Associated Factors among Mothers of Infants Less Than Six Months of Age in Debre Tabor Town, Northwest Ethiopia: A Cross-Sectional Study. *Adv Public Health* 2016;2016:1–7.
- Adugna B, Tadele H, Reta F, et al. Determinants of exclusive breastfeeding in infants less than six months of age in Hawassa, an urban setting, Ethiopia. Int Breastfeed J 2017;12:45.
- Egata G, Berhane Y, Worku A. Predictors of non-exclusive breastfeeding at 6 months among rural mothers in east Ethiopia: a community-based analytical cross-sectional study. *Int Breastfeed J* 2013;8:8.
- Teka B, Assefa H, Haileslassie K. Prevalence and determinant factors of exclusive breastfeeding practices among mothers in Enderta woreda, Tigray, North Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. *Int Breastfeed J* 2015;10:2.
- 50. Sefene A. Determinants of Exclusive Breastfeeding Practice among Mothers of Children Age Less Than 6 Month in Bahir Dar

City Administration, Northwest Ethiopia; A Community Based Cross-Sectional Survey. *Science Journal of Clinical Medicine* 2013;2:153–9.

- Seid AM, Yesuf ME, Koye DN. Prevalence of Exclusive Breastfeeding Practices and associated factors among mothers in Bahir Dar city, Northwest Ethiopia: a community based cross-sectional study. *Int Breastfeed J* 2013;8:14.
- Hunegnaw MT, Gezie LD, Teferra AS. Exclusive breastfeeding and associated factors among mothers in Gozamin district, northwest Ethiopia: a community based cross-sectional study. *Int Breastfeed J* 2017;12.
- Lenja A, Demissie T, Yohannes B, et al. Determinants of exclusive breastfeeding practice to infants aged less than six months in Offa district, Southern Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. Int Breastfeed J 2016;11:32.
- 54. Tadesse T, Mesfin F, Chane T. Prevalence and associated factors of non-exclusive breastfeeding of infants during the first six months in rural area of Sorro District, Southern Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. *Int Breastfeed J* 2016;11. 25,016-0085-6. eCollection 2016.
- Tariku A, Alemu K, Gizaw Z, et al. Mothers' education and ANC visit improved exclusive breastfeeding in Dabat Health and Demographic Surveillance System Site, northwest Ethiopia. PLoS One 2017;12:e0179056.
- Abera K. Infant and young child feeding practices among mothers living in Harar, Ethiopia. *Harar Bulletin of Health Sciences* 2012;4:66–78.
- Taddele M. Exclusive Breastfeeding and Maternal Employment in Ethiopia: A Comparative Cross- Sectional Study. *International Journal of Nutrition and Food Sciences* 2014;3:497–503.
- Echamo M. Exclusive breast feeding in Arbaminch, SNNPR, Ethiopia. Harar Bull Health Sci 2012;5:44–59.
- 59. Chekol DA, Biks GA, Gelaw YA, *et al.* Exclusive breastfeeding and mothers' employment status in Gondar town, Northwest Ethiopia: a comparative cross-sectional study. *Int Breastfeed J* 2017;12:27.
- Tewabe T, Mandesh A, Gualu T, *et al.* Exclusive breastfeeding practice and associated factors among mothers in Motta town, East Gojjam zone, Amhara Regional State, Ethiopia, 2015: a crosssectional study. *Int Breastfeed J* 2016;12.
- Patel A, Badhoniya N, Khadse S, et al. South Asia Infant Feeding Research Netwoork. Infant and young child feeding indicators and determinants of poor feeding practices in India: secondary data analysis of National Family Health Survey 2005-06. Food Nutr Bull 2010;31:314–33.
- Mihrshahi S, Kabir I, Roy SK, et al. South Asia Infant Feeding Research Network. Determinants of infant and young child feeding practices in Bangladesh: secondary data analysis of Demographic and Health Survey 2004. Food Nutr Bull 2010;31:295–313.
- Senarath U, Dibley MJ, Godakandage SS, et al. South Asia Infant Feeding Research Network (SAIFRN)\*. Determinants of infant and young child feeding practices in Sri Lanka: secondary data analysis of Demographic and Health Survey 2000. Food and nutrition bulletin 2010;31:352–65.
- Ogunlesi TA. Maternal socio-demographic factors influencing the initiation and exclusivity of breastfeeding in a Nigerian semi-urban setting. *Matern Child Health J* 2010;14:459–65.
- Okafor IP, Olatona FA, Olufemi OA. Breastfeeding practices of mothers of young children in Lagos, Nigeria. *Niger J Paediatr* 2014;41:43–7.
- Subedi N, Paudel S, Rana T, et al. Infant and young child feeding practices in Chepang communities. J Nepal Health Res Counc 2012;10:141-6.
- Bashour HN, Kharouf MH, Abdulsalam AA, et al. Effect of postnatal home visits on maternal/infant outcomes in Syria: a randomized controlled trial. *Public Health Nurs* 2008;25:115–25.
- Su LL, Chong YS, Chan YH, et al. Antenatal education and postnatal support strategies for improving rates of exclusive breast feeding: randomised controlled trial. *BMJ* 2007;335:596.
- Agho KE, Dibley MJ, Odiase JI, et al. Determinants of exclusive breastfeeding in Nigeria. BMC Pregnancy Childbirth 2011;11:2.
- Ogada IA. Effectiveness of couple counselling versus maternal counselling in promoting exclusive breast feeding: a randomised controlled trial in Nyando District, Kenya. 2014.
- Al Ghwass MM, Ahmed D. Prevalence and predictors of 6-month exclusive breastfeeding in a rural area in Egypt. *Breastfeed Med* 2011;6:191–6.