DOI: 10.1111/imr.13111

INVITED REVIEW

My story of sex, gender, and women's health in a pandemic*

Sabra L. Klein^{1,2,3,4}

¹W. Harry Feinstone Department of Molecular Microbiology and Immunology, The Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, Maryland, USA

²Department of Biochemistry and Molecular Biology, The Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, Maryland, USA

³Department of International Health, The Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, Maryland, USA

⁴Department of Medicine, Johns Hopkins School of Medicine, Baltimore, Maryland, USA

Correspondence

Sabra L. Klein, Department of Molecular Microbiology and Immunology, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, MD, USA. Email: sklein2@jhu.edu

Abstract

After more than 20 years of studying sex differences in viral pathogenesis and immunity to vaccines, the COVID-19 pandemic provided me with a unique opportunity to raise awareness about biological sex differences. The scientific community and public, alike, embraced the clinical and epidemiological data and supported inquiries into how males are twice as likely to be hospitalized and die from COVID-19. Immunological changes associated with pregnancy also contribute to worse outcomes from COVID-19. Collectively, we are finding that inflammation is a critical mediator of worse outcomes for males and pregnant females. The pandemic gave me a platform to discuss and address sex differences on a bigger stage, but two decades of studies working with other viruses prepared me for this moment in history.

KEYWORDS

COVID-19, inflammation, influenza, pregnancy, sex difference

Early data emerging out of Wuhan, China from late 2019 and early 2020 showed that men were more likely to be hospitalized and die from COVID-19 than women.¹ The trend continued as SARS-CoV-2 spread throughout Europe.² As the virus took hold in the United States, reports from New York, one of the first states to disaggregate data separately for males and females, mirrored what was seen elsewhere in the world—men were at least twice as likely as women to be admitted into the intensive care unit (ICU) and die from COVID-19.³ We still do not know the cause, but this likely reflects an interaction between biological sex and gender,^{4,5} which further intersects with age,⁶ comorbidities,² and social determinants of health.^{7,8}

I had been studying sex differences in susceptibility to infectious diseases for more than 20 years at the start of the pandemic.⁹ In fact, that was the topic of my postdoctoral fellowship. Even in the early years of my career, I had studied sex differences in infectious diseases in human populations,¹⁰ reservoir hosts,¹¹ and mathematical S-I-R models.¹² I had worked with RNA viruses characterizing the mechanisms of sex differences in acute disease,¹³⁻¹⁵ virus persistence,¹⁶⁻¹⁸ transmission,^{19,20} and protection following vaccination.²¹⁻²³ I had studied how sex steroids,²⁴⁻²⁶ aging,^{27,28}

pregnancy.^{29,30} and behavior^{19,20} affect the dynamics of viral pathogenesis differently for males compared with females. When the COVID-19 pandemic was declared, I was armed with decades of knowledge to help me interpret the real-time epidemiological and clinical data being reported from around the world. In retrospect, I was similarly prepared during the 2009 H1N1 pandemic.^{31,32} While the world was still debating whether COVID-19 was a pandemic and whether we should be wearing masks, I wrote and submitted newspaper op-eds throughout the early spring of 2020. All were rejected as I was told that my focus on sex differences was premature. I contacted journal editors in chief, many of whom I knew because these were journals where I was an editor. They approved and fast-tracked commentaries from me, my collaborators, and trainees.³³⁻³⁵ Realtime surveillance kept illustrating that across the adult life course, males were being hospitalized at greater rates than females. Finally, I was invited to write a commentary about our hypothesized mechanisms for how males and females were responding differently to SARS-CoV-2.⁴ We illustrated that sex differences in immunity can be mediated by direct effects of sex chromosome complement and X-linked genes that exhibit dosage effects, differential expression of

This is an open access article under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

© 2022 The Author. Immunological Reviews published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd.

^{*}This article is part of a series of reviews covering SARS-CoV-2 Immunity appearing in Volume 309 of Immunological Reviews

autosomal genes, sex steroids signaling in immune cells to transcriptionally regulate immune responses, or a combination of these sexrelated factors.⁴ We highlighted that the SARS-CoV-2 virus could enter cells from males more readily than cells from females because ACE2 is an X chromosome-encoded gene that is downregulated by estrogens.³⁶ Previous work from our laboratory and others have shown that innate sensing of viral RNA by the TLR7 pattern recognition receptor is sex-biased. The TLR7 gene, which is X-linked and escapes X-inactivation resulting in greater expression in female immune cells, has been linked to sex differences in autoimmunity^{37,38} and vaccine outcomes.²¹ There also is greater production of IFN α from plasmacytoid dendritic cells from adult females than males,^{39,40} an effect modulated by sex steroids,⁴¹⁻⁴³ which could contribute to faster innate immune cell recognition of SARS-CoV-2 and downstream signaling in cells from females than males. Elite laboratories began taking notice and either reporting⁴⁴ or mechanistically studying⁴⁵ sex differences. Major newspapers, media outlets, and podcast hosts began interviewing me and wanting to know more about sex and gender differences. Most thought that this was the first time that these types of differences in infectious disease susceptibility were being reported, but I educated them and the public about the 1918 H1N1 pandemic, 1968 H3N2 pandemic, 2009 H1N1 pandemic, H5N1 outbreaks, SARS-CoV outbreak, MERS outbreak, and ongoing HIV epidemic, all of which showed profound sex differences.⁴⁶⁻⁴⁸ I provided examples in which men suffered worse outcomes than women (e.g., 1918 H1N1, SARS, MERS, and SARS-CoV-2), and other examples in which women suffered worse outcomes than men for reasons including but not limited to pregnancy increasing the severity of viral outcomes (e.g., 1968 H3N2, 2009 H1N1, H5N1, and HIV). The media, the public, and my colleagues listened, and I received the blue check on Twitter, illustrating that I was a trusted expert.

As my laboratory shut down research during the worst of the pandemic, we began adapting our existing protocols for influenza viruses to SARS-CoV-2. We began testing immune responses to SARS-CoV-2 in patients who recovered from infection and showed that despite men and older aged individuals being more likely than women or younger aged individuals to be hospitalized with severe disease, they were mounting greater antibody responses to SARS-CoV-2⁴⁹ and others were reporting the same observations.⁵⁰ Greater antibody responses in males following SARS-CoV-2 infection might induce potent inflammatory responses, as observed for SARS-CoV,³⁶ and contribute to immune-mediated pathology. I then began working in large teams of scientists to analyze data from electronic medical records⁵¹ and develop animal models to interrogate whether replicating virus, inflammatory immune responses, or both contributed to worse outcomes in males.⁵² We knew from our studies of H1N1 influenza viruses that disease can be caused by either an inability to resist a virus (i.e., control virus replication) or an inability to tolerate the damage caused by immune responses to a virus (i.e., immunemediated pathology).^{25,26} The hypothesis that severe COVID-19 outcomes were immune-mediated, rather than mediated by replicating virus, was gaining empirical support and both our animal models and clinical data suggested that immune-mediated inflammation was the

Immunological Reviews – WILEY

cause of worse SARS-CoV-2 outcomes in males than females. At this time, we also began recognizing that SARS-CoV-2 was more likely to cause hospitalization in pregnant than non-pregnant women and we collected samples, evaluated immune responses, and showed that infection caused heightened systemic inflammatory responses, including IL-1 β , and impaired antibody responses in pregnant women infected with SARS-CoV-2.⁵³

For decades, I had struggled to get funding for sex differences and pregnancy research. Several years ago, it was the National Institutes of Health (NIH) Office of Research on Women's Health and their Specialized Centers of Research Excellence in sex differences program that gave me the break that I needed to study sex and age differences in vaccine-induced immunity against influenza in human populations and animal models. During the early days of the pandemic, my collaborators and I leveraged our Center to get emergency funds to translate our knowledge about sex and age differences in responses to influenza vaccines,⁵⁴ to studies of SARS-CoV-2 vaccines.⁵⁵ Through support from the leadership at Johns Hopkins, I was asked to lead an application for an NIHfunded COVID-19 Serology Center of Excellence with another female clinician-scientist at Johns Hopkins University. Together, as multi-principal investigators, we got a COVID-19 Serology Center of Excellence funded; one of eight in the United States, and the only Center led solely by women. We leveraged this Center to support the efforts of junior scientists and clinicians, and we began applying for funding to support complementary efforts (e.g., to study how pregnancy affects vaccine-induced immunity and protection). My laboratory members showed a work ethic and commitment that made me proud. We began publishing at a rate unrealized prior to the pandemic. Junior faculty, postdocs, and students from my group were finding themselves selected for talks at major conferences. The public and scientific community, alike, wanted to understand disparities between the sexes.

At home, my teenage daughters persevered, and I got to know them in new and different ways. I had never stayed home with them, and now I was home more than ever. I binge-watched shows, exercised, laughed, and studied with them. My husband, whose career trajectory was steeper than mine, was there to take on the family responsibilities in major ways to give me the freedom to work and manage my growing laboratory and budgets. Once we were all vaccinated, I began visiting with my parents more and was saddened by how hard the pandemic was for older adults as routine checkups, surgeries, and functioning outside of the home became increasingly more difficult. In fact, my parents both got SARS-CoV-2 after receiving their vaccines—my mom remained asymptomatic, whereas my dad was admitted into the ICU, ventilated, and survived COVID-19, only to come back stronger and more immune.

We each have a story to tell from our experiences during the pandemic. My story is one of perseverance, skill, and luck. It took a pandemic for the world to notice sex differences in the pathogenesis of viruses and responses to vaccines. As Pasture lamented, "chance favors the prepared mind." With over two decades of preparation, when the time came, I was ready.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

Open access funding enabled and organized by ProjektDEAL.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

None.

DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

Data sharing not applicable to this article as no datasets were generated or analysed during the current study

ORCID

Sabra L. Klein 🔟 https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0730-5224

REFERENCES

- 1. Guan WJ, Ni ZY, Hu Y, et al. Clinical characteristics of coronavirus disease 2019 in China. N Engl J Med. 2020;382:1708-1720.
- Gebhard C, Regitz-Zagrosek V, Neuhauser HK, Morgan R, Klein SL. Impact of sex and gender on COVID-19 outcomes in Europe. *Biol Sex Differ*. 2020;11(1):29.
- Richardson S, Hirsch JS, Narasimhan M, et al. Presenting characteristics, comorbidities, and outcomes among 5700 patients hospitalized with COVID-19 in the New York City area. JAMA. 2020;323:2052-2059.
- Scully EP, Haverfield J, Ursin RL, Tannenbaum C, Klein SL. Considering how biological sex impacts immune responses and COVID-19 outcomes. *Nat Rev Immunol.* 2020;20:442-447.
- Danielsen AC, Lee KM, Boulicault M, et al. Sex disparities in COVID-19 outcomes in the United States: quantifying and contextualizing variation. Soc Sci Med. 2022;294:114716.
- Chen Y, Klein SL, Garibaldi BT, et al. Aging in COVID-19: vulnerability, immunity and intervention. *Ageing Res Rev.* 2021;65:101205.
- Shapiro JR, Klein SL, Morgan R. COVID-19: use intersectional analyses to close gaps in outcomes and vaccination. *Nature*. 2021;591(7849):202.
- Rushovich T, Boulicault M, Chen JT, et al. Sex disparities in COVID-19 mortality vary across US racial groups. J Gen Intern Med. 2021;36(6):1696-1701.
- 9. Klein SL. The effects of hormones on sex differences in infection: from genes to behavior. *Neurosci Biobehav Rev.* 2000;24(6):627-638.
- Klein SL, Marks MA, Li W, et al. Sex differences in the incidence and case fatality rates from hemorrhagic fever with renal syndrome in China, 2004–2008. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2011;52(12):1414-1421.
- Klein SL, Bird BH, Glass GE. Sex differences in immune responses and viral shedding following Seoul virus infection in Norway rats. *Am J Trop Med Hyg.* 2001;65(1):57-63.
- Allen LJ, Brown VL, Jonsson CB, et al. Mathematical modeling of viral zoonoses in wildlife. Nat Resour Model. 2012;25(1):5-51.
- Lorenzo ME, Hodgson A, Robinson DP, Kaplan JB, Pekosz A, Klein SL. Antibody responses and cross protection against lethal influenza A viruses differ between the sexes in C57BL/6 mice. *Vaccine*. 2011;29(49):9246-9255.
- Robinson DP, Lorenzo ME, Jian W, Klein SL. Elevated 17betaestradiol protects females from influenza a virus pathogenesis by suppressing inflammatory responses. *PLoS Pathog.* 2011;7(7):e1002149.
- Giurgea LT, Cervantes-Medina A, Walters KA, et al. Sex differences in influenza: the challenge study experience. J Infect Dis. 2021;225:715-722.
- Easterbrook JD, Klein SL. Corticosteroids modulate Seoul virus infection, regulatory T-cell responses and matrix metalloprotease 9 expression in male, but not female Norway rats. J Gen Virol. 2008;89(Pt 11):2723-2730.

- Easterbrook JD, Klein SL. Seoul virus enhances regulatory and reduces proinflammatory responses in male Norway rats. *J Med Virol*. 2008;80(7):1308-1318.
- Easterbrook JD, Zink MC, Klein SL. Regulatory T cells enhance persistence of the zoonotic pathogen Seoul virus in its reservoir host. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA*. 2007;104(39):15502-15507.
- Easterbrook JD, Kaplan JB, Glass GE, Pletnikov MV, Klein SL. Elevated testosterone and reduced 5-HIAA concentrations are associated with wounding and hantavirus infection in male Norway rats. *Horm Behav.* 2007;52(4):474-481.
- Hinson ER, Shone SM, Zink MC, Glass GE, Klein SL. Wounding: the primary mode of Seoul virus transmission among male Norway rats. *Am J Trop Med Hyg.* 2004;70(3):310-317.
- 21. Fink AL, Engle K, Ursin RL, Tang WY, Klein SL. Biological sex affects vaccine efficacy and protection against influenza in mice. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA*. 2018;115(49):12477-12482.
- Kuo H, Shapiro JR, Dhakal S, et al. Sex-specific effects of age and body mass index on antibody responses to seasonal influenza vaccines in healthcare workers. *Vaccine*. 2022;40(11):1634-1642.
- 23. Potluri T, Fink AL, Sylvia KE, et al. Age-associated changes in the impact of sex steroids on influenza vaccine responses in males and females. *NPJ Vaccines*. 2019;4:29.
- Hall OJ, Limjunyawong N, Vermillion MS, et al. Progesterone-based therapy protects against influenza by promoting lung repair and recovery in females. *PLoS Pathog.* 2016;12(9):e1005840.
- Vom Steeg LG, Dhakal S, Woldetsadik YA, et al. Androgen receptor signaling in the lungs mitigates inflammation and improves the outcome of influenza in mice. *PLoS Pathog.* 2020;16(7):e1008506.
- Robinson DP, Hall OJ, Nilles TL, Bream JH, Klein SL. 17betaestradiol protects females against influenza by recruiting neutrophils and increasing virus-specific CD8 T cell responses in the lungs. J Virol. 2014;88(9):4711-4720.
- Vom Steeg LG, Attreed SE, Zirkin B, Klein SL. Testosterone treatment of aged male mice improves some but not all aspects of age-associated increases in influenza severity. *Cell Immunol.* 2019;345:103988.
- Vom Steeg LG, Vermillion MS, Hall OJ, et al. Age and testosterone mediate influenza pathogenesis in male mice. Am J Physiol Lung Cell Mol Physiol. 2016;311(6):L1234-L1244.
- Vermillion MS, Nelson A, Vom Steeg L, Loube J, Mitzner W, Klein SL. Pregnancy preserves pulmonary function following influenza virus infection in C57BL/6 mice. Am J Physiol Lung Cell Mol Physiol. 2018;315(4):L517-L525.
- Vermillion MS, Lei J, Shabi Y, et al. Intrauterine Zika virus infection of pregnant immunocompetent mice models transplacental transmission and adverse perinatal outcomes. *Nat Commun.* 2017;8:14575.
- Klein SL, Passaretti C, Anker M, Olukoya P, Pekosz A. The impact of sex, gender and pregnancy on 2009 H1N1 disease. *Biol Sex Differ*. 2010;1(1):5.
- Klein SL, Pekosz A, Passaretti C, Anker M, Olukoya P. Sex, gender and influenza. World Health Organization; 2010.
- Klein SL, Dhakal S, Ursin RL, Deshpande S, Sandberg K, Mauvais-Jarvis F. Biological sex impacts COVID-19 outcomes. *PLoS Pathog*. 2020;16(6):e1008570.
- Klein SL, Creisher PS, Burd I. COVID-19 vaccine testing in pregnant females is necessary. J Clin Invest. 2021;131.
- Bischof E, Wolfe J, Klein SL. Clinical trials for COVID-19 should include sex as a variable. J Clin Invest. 2020;130:3350-3352.
- Liu J, Ji H, Zheng W, et al. Sex differences in renal angiotensin converting enzyme 2 (ACE2) activity are 17beta-oestradioldependent and sex chromosome-independent. *Biol Sex Differ*. 2010;1(1):6.
- Souyris M, Cenac C, Azar P, et al. TLR7 escapes X chromosome inactivation in immune cells. *Sci Immunol.* 2018;3(19):1-10.

Immunological Reviews -WILE

- Souyris M, Mejia JE, Chaumeil J, Guery JC. Female predisposition to TLR7-driven autoimmunity: gene dosage and the escape from X chromosome inactivation. *Semin Immunopathol.* 2019;41(2):153-164.
- Berghofer B, Frommer T, Haley G, Fink L, Bein G, Hackstein H. TLR7 ligands induce higher IFN-alpha production in females. *J Immunol.* 2006;177(4):2088-2096.
- Meier A, Chang JJ, Chan ES, et al. Sex differences in the Toll-like receptor-mediated response of plasmacytoid dendritic cells to HIV-1. Nat Med. 2009;15(8):955-959.
- Griesbeck M, Ziegler S, Laffont S, et al. Sex differences in plasmacytoid dendritic cell levels of IRF5 drive higher IFN-alpha production in women. J Immunol. 2015;195(11):5327-5336.
- 42. Laffont S, Rouquie N, Azar P, et al. X-Chromosome complement and estrogen receptor signaling independently contribute to the enhanced TLR7-mediated IFN-alpha production of plasmacytoid dendritic cells from women. J Immunol. 2014;193(11):5444-5452.
- Seillet C, Laffont S, Tremollieres F, et al. The TLR-mediated response of plasmacytoid dendritic cells is positively regulated by estradiol in vivo through cell-intrinsic estrogen receptor alpha signaling. *Blood*. 2012;119(2):454-464.
- 44. Bastard P, Rosen LB, Zhang Q, et al. Autoantibodies against type I IFNs in patients with life-threatening COVID-19. *Science*. 2020;370(6515):1-12.
- Takahashi T, Ellingson MK, Wong P, et al. Sex differences in immune responses that underlie COVID-19 disease outcomes. *Nature*. 2020;588(7837):315-320.
- Ursin RL, Klein SL. Sex differences in respiratory viral pathogenesis and treatments. Annu Rev Virol. 2021;8:393-414.
- vom Steeg LG, Klein SL. SeXX matters in infectious disease pathogenesis. PLoS Pathog. 2016;12(2):e1005374.
- Vom Steeg LG, Klein SL. Sex and sex steroids impact influenza pathogenesis across the life course. Semin Immunopathol. 2019;41(2):189-194.

- 49. Klein SL, Pekosz A, Park HS, et al. Sex, age, and hospitalization drive antibody responses in a COVID-19 convalescent plasma donor population. *J Clin Invest*. 2020;130(11):6141-6150.
- Robbiani DF, Gaebler C, Muecksch F, et al. Convergent antibody responses to SARS-CoV-2 in convalescent individuals. *Nature*. 2020;584:437-442.
- Scully EP, Schumock G, Fu M, et al. Sex and gender differences in testing, hospital admission, clinical presentation, and drivers of severe outcomes from COVID-19. Open Forum Infect Dis. 2021;8(9):ofab448.
- 52. Dhakal S, Ruiz-Bedoya CA, Zhou R, et al. Sex differences in lung imaging and SARS-CoV-2 antibody responses in a COVID-19 golden Syrian hamster model. *MBio*. 2021;12(4):e0097421.
- 53. Sherer ML, Lei J, Creisher PS, et al. Pregnancy alters interleukin-1 beta expression and antiviral antibody responses during severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 infection. *Am J Obstet Gynecol.* 2021;225(3):301.e1-301.e14.
- Shapiro JR, Li H, Morgan R, et al. Sex-specific effects of aging on humoral immune responses to repeated influenza vaccination in older adults. NPJ Vaccines. 2021;6(1):147.
- Shapiro JR, Sitaras I, Park H-S, et al. Association of frailty, age, and biological sex with SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccine-induced immunity in older adults. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2022. doi:10.1093/cid/ciac397

How to cite this article: Klein SL. My story of sex, gender, and women's health in a pandemic. *Immunol Rev.* 2022;309:86-89. doi: 10.1111/imr.13111