

LETTER TO THE EDITOR

Genetic screening in thrombotic microangiopathy: a plea for methylmalonic aciduria with cobalamine C deficiency detection

Cédric Rafat^{1,3,5}, Alice Doreille^{1,2,3}, Marine Dancer⁸, Alexis Werion^{1,4}, Jean-François Benoist^{7,8}, Laure Raymond⁹ and Laurent Mesnard^{1,2,3,5}

¹Service des soins intensifs, Cliniques universitaires Saint Luc, Brussels, Belgium, ²Faculté de médecine, Sorbonne Université, Paris, France, ³French Intensive Renal Network, France, ⁴Faculté de médecine, Université Catholique de Louvain, Belgium, ⁵Centre national de Référence des Microangiopathies Thrombotiques, ⁶Service de néphrologie et dialyses, Hôpital Tenon, Assistance Publique – Hôpitaux de Paris, France, ⁷Service des explorations fonctionnelles, Hôpital Universitaire Necker-Enfants Malades, Assistance Publique – Hôpitaux de Paris, France, ⁸Faculté de Pharmacie, Université Paris Saclay, France and ⁹Département de génétique, Eurofins Biomnis, Lyon, France

Correspondence to: Cédric Rafat; E-mail: cedric.rafat@aphp.fr

The recent reviews by Knoers *et al.* [1] highlights the opportunities afforded by massively parallel sequencing (MPS) and lays the groundwork for empowerment of the clinician in his day-to-day exploration of kidney disease.

Atypical hemolytic uremic syndrome (aHUS) is an obvious application of MPS given the involvement of complement genetics which have paved the way for specific anti-C5-based treatments [2]. Accordingly, the authors recommend that genetic explorations should include *CFH*, *CD46*, *CFI*, *C3*, *CFB*, *THBD* and *DGKE* as part of a targeted gene panel sequencing strategy (TGPS).

We suggest that: (i) *MMACHC*, responsible for the processing and intracellular trafficking of vitamin B12, and *PRDX1*, a flanking gene involved in the regulation of *MMACHC* transcription, are known to cause autosomal recessive disease termed methylmalonic aciduria with cobalamin C deficiency (cblC) (OMIM #277 400). They represent genes worthy of first-line genetic investigation. (ii) It follows from this example that whole-exome sequencing or whole-genome sequencing (ES/GS) may represent a reasonable alternative to the TGPS approach.

In addition to HUS (Table 1), cblC is known for causing a wide range of (i) neurological, visual and neuropsychiatric manifesta-

tions, (ii) hematopoietic disorders, and (iii) pulmonary hypertension and thromboembolic complications, primarily in the neonatal period and early years. Numerous reports of adult-onset cblC have demonstrated that the disease spans the age spectrum [3, 4] with 45 recent cases of adult-onset cblC [5]. Adult patients display fewer features specific to cblC, thus making genotype predictions based solely on the phenotype challenging [3, 4]. Adult-onset cblC remains a rare disease, but is more common than, for instance, *DKGE*-related aHUS diagnosed in this age range, with a prevalence of 1:46 000 compared with 0.0015/million/year.

The diagnosis of cblC should not be postponed, as expeditious initiation of hydroxycobalamin has been demonstrated to partly reverse kidney failure and neurological impairment [5, 6]. Conversely, failure to recognize cblC carries a poor prognosis, including end-stage kidney disease, neurological disability, cardiovascular complications and death [3, 5]. Patients with undiagnosed cblC may be started on unnecessary antiC5 treatment trial or plasmatherapy within the traditional framework of HUS with negative genetic investigations, or unwarranted inclusion in clinical studies. Recently, the PanelApp consortium, an organization designed to adjudicate on the relevance of a

Received: 10.1.2023; Editorial decision: 19.4.2023

© The Author(s) 2023. Published by Oxford University Press on behalf of the ERA. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), which permits non-commercial re-use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited. For commercial re-use, please contact journals.permissions@oup.com

Table 1: Summary of cases of adult-onset cbIC with thrombotic microangiopathy.

Case	Age at onset (years)	Gender	Kidney function at diagnosis: eGFR (mL/min/1.73 m ²)	Nadir hemoglobin (g/dL)/platelets (G/L)	LDH (U/L)	Homocysteinemia upon diagnosis (μmol/l) (N < 15 μmol/L)	Kidney histological findings	Extra-renal features	Disease course and final eGFR (mL/min/1.73 m ²)	Genotype	Reference
1	26	F	18	7.0/74	3000	230	Arteriolar and glomerular TMA	No	Control of TMA, persisting kidney graft dysfunction	c.271dupA	c.389A > G [3]
2	18	M	Dialysis	7.8/141	787	73	Arteriolar and glomerular TMA	Delayed language acquisition at 3 years old	Dialysis discontinuation 5 months after treatment initiation; eGFR: 58	c.271dupA	c.82-9_12delITTC [6]
3	18	M	Dialysis	12.5/191	444	NA	Arteriolar and glomerular TMA	Pulmonary hypertension	Death (autopsic diagnosis)	c.271dupA	c.82-9_12delITTC [4]
4	20	M	Dialysis	11.6/101	1044	185	Arteriolar and glomerular TMA	No	Dialysis discontinuation 3 months after treatment initiation; eGFR: 32	c.271dupA	c.389A > G [7]
5	28	F	Dialysis	6.2/83	635	75	TMA (no specification)	Coma, pulmonary hypertension	Neurological recovery, no kidney function improvement	c.565C > A	c.565C > A [8]
6	23	M	Dialysis	7.3/88	NA	250	NA	Attention deficit in childhood, depressive episode at 20 years old	Improved psychosocial status, no renal function improvement	c.565C > A	c.565C > A [8]
7	18	F	Dialysis	6.7/50	NA	344	NA	Epilepsy	Dialysis discontinuation after several months; eGFR: 50	c.271dupA	c.565C > A [9]
8	34	F	34	8.2/NA	NA	100	Arteriolar and glomerular TMA	Pregnancy loss at 20 weeks	Normalization of kidney function, second pregnancy with healthy baby	c.388T > C	c.666C > A [10]
9	19	F	7	8.9/151	700	285	Arteriolar and glomerular TMA	No	Control of TMA and normalization of kidney function	c.566G > A	c.271dupA [11]
10	45	M	Dialysis	12.6/87	557	130	Arteriolar and glomerular TMA	Psychiatric symptoms and cognitive decline	Improvement of neurological symptoms; dialysis discontinuation; eGFR: 20	c.220delA	c.395_397delGAC [12]
11	22 onset; 29 flare	M	Dialysis	6.0/83	297	175	Arteriolar and glomerular TMA	No	Control of TMA, no kidney function improvement	c.271dupA	c.389A > G UP
12	26	M	49	12.4/207	352	346	Arteriolar and glomerular TMA	High blood pressure at 22 years old	Improvement of kidney function (eGFR: 83) and blood pressure control	c.566G > A	PRDX1 c.515-IG > T UP

N: normal; TMA: thrombotic microangiopathy; F: female; M: male; eGFR: estimated glomerular filtration rate; LDH: lactate dehydrogenase; NA: not available; UP: unpublished (personal communication).

given gene, has integrated MMACHC as a gene involved in HUS (<https://panelapp.genomicsengland.co.uk/>). Patients with *cblC* are prone to exhibit hyperhomocysteinemia. Nevertheless, this useful marker for routine screening is not infallible as its interpretation may be obscured by kidney failure and reciprocally patients with *cblC* may exhibit only mild levels of hyperhomocysteinemia. Ultimately, the diagnosis rests on genetic testing. This example also showcases the arbitrary character of TGPS gene selection. Simply incorporating MMACHC alongside the other genes indicated is not a lasting solution since a steady stream of novel genes has been incriminated in the pathogenesis of aHUS, including *PLG*, *VTN*, *IFN2* and *CLU* [2]. Any sequencing approach based on a predetermined list of genes may be hindered from the outset since it fails to capture new gene variants in a fast-changing field. Adjusting TGPS so that it integrates new findings comes at a cost, including crafting and validating a new panel [1]. ES/GS also have their own share of drawbacks, namely management of secondary findings, a reliance on powerful bioinformatic tools and failure to recognize complex *CFH/CFRH* rearrangements, whilst its cost-effectiveness has yet to be proven superior. Other hybrid strategies such as *in silico* panel and the so-called “mendeliome” may prove useful by meshing the benefits of TGPS and ES/GS while mitigating their flaws. Irrespective of the MPS utilized, MMACHC/PRDX1 should rank among the genes analyzed. An etiological diagnosis requires the meticulous integration of clinical, biological and genetic investigations.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST STATEMENT

C.R. declares lecture fees with Alexion Pharma France and travel grants with Sanofi. L.M. declares lecture fees with Traverso Pharmaceutical and Sanofi Pharma, and a travel grant with Sanofi France Pharma. None of the results presented in this paper has been published previously in whole or part.

REFERENCES

1. Knoers N, Antignac C, Bergmann C et al. Genetic testing in the diagnosis of chronic kidney disease: recommendations for clinical practice. *Nephrol Dial Transplant* 2022;37:239–54.
2. Fakhouri F, Frémeaux-Bacchi V. Thrombotic microangiopathy in aHUS and beyond: clinical clues from complement genetics. *Nat Rev Nephrol* 2021;17:543–53. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41581-021-00424-4>.
3. Lemoine M, François A, Grangé S et al. Cobalamin C deficiency induces a typical histopathological pattern of renal arteriolar and glomerular thrombotic microangiopathy. *Kidney Int Rep* 2018;3:1153–62. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ekir.2018.05.015>.
4. Cornec-Le Gall E, Delmas Y, De Parscau L et al. Adult-onset eculizumab-resistant hemolytic uremic syndrome associated with cobalamin C deficiency. *Am J Kidney Dis* 2014;63:119–23. <https://doi.org/10.1053/j.ajkd.2013.08.031>.
5. Kalantari S, Brezzi B, Bracciamà V et al. Adult-onset CblC deficiency: a challenging diagnosis involving different adult clinical specialists. *Orphanet J Rare Dis* 2022;17:33. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13023-022-02179-y>.
6. Grangé S, Bekri S, Artaud-Macari E et al. Adult-onset renal thrombotic microangiopathy and pulmonary arterial hypertension in cobalamin C deficiency. *Lancet North Am Ed* 2015;386:1011–2. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(15\)00076-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(15)00076-8).
7. Medhioub Kaaniche F, Chaari A, Bacouch N et al. Hemolytic uremic syndrome in young adult with metabolic disorder of cobalamin: a case report. *Presse Med* 2016;45:148–50. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lpm.2015.10.014>.
8. Huemer M, Scholl-Bürgi S, Hadaya K et al. Three new cases of late-onset *cblC* defect and review of the literature illustrating when to consider inborn errors of metabolism beyond infancy. *Orphanet J Rare Dis* 2014;9:161. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13023-014-0161-1>.
9. Jiménez Varo I, Bueno Delgado M, Dios Fuentes E et al. Combined methylmalonic acidemia and homocystinuria; a case report. *Nutr Hosp* 2015;31:1885–8.
10. Grandone E, Martinelli P, Villani M et al. Prospective evaluation of pregnancy outcome in an Italian woman with late-onset combined homocystinuria and methylmalonic aciduria. *BMC Pregnancy Childbirth* 2019;19:318. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12884-019-2474-5>.
11. Philipponnet C, Desenclos J, Brailova M et al. Cobalamin c deficiency associated with antifactor h antibody-associated hemolytic uremic syndrome in a young adult. *BMC Nephrol* 2020;21:96. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12882-020-01748-2>.
12. Kalantari S, Brezzi B, Bracciamà V et al. Adult-onset CblC deficiency: a challenging diagnosis involving different adult clinical specialists. *Orphanet J Rare Dis* 2022;17:33.