Disease Resistance Genetics and Genomics in Octoploid Strawberry

Christopher R. Barbey,*^{,†,1} Seonghee Lee,[‡] Sujeet Verma,[‡] Kevin A. Bird,^{§,**} Alan E. Yocca,^{††}

Patrick P. Edger, ^{§,**} Steven J. Knapp,^{‡‡} Vance M. Whitaker,[‡] and Kevin M. Folta^{*,†}

*Horticultural Sciences Department, [†]Graduate Program in Plant Molecular and Cellular Biology, University of Florida, Gainesville, FL, [‡]Gulf Coast Research and Education Center, University of Florida, Wimauma, FL, [§]Department of Horticulture, **Ecology, Evolutionary Biology and Behavior, ^{††}Department of Plant Biology, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI, and ^{‡‡}Department of Plant Sciences, University of California, Davis, CA

ORCID IDs: 0000-0002-2759-6081 (C.R.B.); 0000-0002-5190-8014 (S.L.); 0000-0002-4083-8022 (S.V.); 0000-0002-3174-3646 (K.A.B.); 0000-0002-0974-364X (A.E.Y.); 0000-0001-6836-3041 (P.P.E.); 0000-0001-6498-5409 (S.J.K.); 0000-0002-2172-3019 (V.M.W.); 0000-0002-3836-2213 (K.M.F.)

ABSTRACT Octoploid strawberry (Fragaria × ananassa) is a valuable specialty crop, but profitable production and availability are threatened by many pathogens. Efforts to identify and introgress useful disease resistance genes (R-genes) in breeding programs are complicated by strawberry's complex octoploid genome. Recentlydeveloped resources in strawberry, including a complete octoploid reference genome and high-resolution octoploid genotyping, enable new analyses in strawberry disease resistance genetics. This study characterizes the complete R-gene collection in the genomes of commercial octoploid strawberry and two diploid ancestral relatives, and introduces several new technological and data resources for strawberry disease resistance research. These include octoploid R-gene transcription profiling, dN/dS analysis, expression quantitative trait loci (eQTL) analysis and RenSeg analysis in cultivars. Octoploid fruit eQTL were identified for 76 putative R-genes. R-genes from the ancestral diploids Fragaria vesca and Fragaria iinumae were compared, revealing differential inheritance and retention of various octoploid R-gene subtypes. The mode and magnitude of natural selection of individual F. xananassa R-genes was also determined via dN/dS analysis. R-gene sequencing using enriched libraries (RenSeq) has been used recently for R-gene discovery in many crops, however this technique somewhat relies upon a priori knowledge of desired sequences. An octoploid strawberry captureprobe panel, derived from the results of this study, is validated in a RenSeq experiment and is presented for community use. These results give unprecedented insight into crop disease resistance genetics, and represent an advance toward exploiting variation for strawberry cultivar improvement.

KEYWORDS

Strawberry Disease Resistance R-gene eQTL Subgenome Dominance RenSeq

affected by disease. The strawberry fruit presents a vulnerable target for microbial pathogens (Farzaneh et al. 2015), as it is soft, moist, carbohydrate rich, and subject to damage from forces as seemingly innocuous as rain (Herrington et al. 2011). Genetic disease resistance has been a longstanding breeding priority. While breeders have made progress in producing varieties with tolerance to some pathogens, growers remain dependent on exogenous crop protection strategies to reduce pathogen loads (Cordova et al. 2017).

Plant R-genes are mediators of resistance to specific pathogens via effector triggered immunity, which results in the hypersensitive response and cell death (Amil-Ruiz et al. 2011). R-genes require a high degree of regulation to maintain homeostatic transcript levels to mitigate offtarget protein interactions (Hammond-Kosack and Jones 1997). For this reason, many classes of functional R-genes are expressed at low levels unless elicited by pathogens (Lai and Eulgem 2017), contributing

Genes | Genomes | Genetics

Cultivated strawberry (Fragaria × ananassa) is an important specialty

crop that is cultivated world-wide for its sweet and flavorful fruit.

However, marketable yields and post-harvest quality are significantly

Manuscript received May 20, 2019; accepted for publication August 9, 2019;

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons

Copyright © 2019 Barbey et al.

doi: https://doi.org/10.1534/g3.119.400597

published Early Online August 16, 2019.

Attribution 4.0 International License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium,

provided the original work is properly cited. Supplemental material available at FigShare: https://doi.org/10.25387/ a3.8143961.

¹Corresponding author: Horticultural Sciences Department, University of Florida, Gainesville FL 32611. E-mail: cbarbey@ufl.edu

to the challenges of R-gene genomic and functional annotation. About 60% of characterized plant R-genes contain nucleotide-binding (NB-ARC) and leucine-rich-repeat (LRR) domains, and are referred to NLR genes (Funk et al. 2018). Plant R-genes are frequent targets for genetic improvement via breeding and genetic engineering (Baumgartner et al. 2015; Djian-Caporalino et al. 2014), and gene editing methods may accelerate their introduction into already-elite varieties. However, progress has been hindered because relatively few R-genes conferring novel resistance have been characterized (Amil-Ruiz et al. 2011). This problem is appreciable in strawberry, where the genetic complexity of octoploid cultivars presents unique challenges for functional identification and cloning of causal variants. An analysis of diploid R-genes across the Rosaceae genus was previously conducted (Arya et al. 2014). New genetic resources for high-resolution genotyping in octoploid strawberry have resulted in the recent identification of several disease resistance loci (Mangandi et al. 2017; Nellist et al. 2019; Cockerton et al. 2018; Pincot et al. 2018; Salinas et al. 2018; Anciro et al. 2018; Roach et al. 2016; Verma et al. 2018). However, the specific genes mediating resistance in these QTL intervals typically remain unresolved, as genomic resources for octoploid strawberry have not kept pace with genetic mapping.

Cultivated strawberry shares common ancestors with the extant diploid species F. vesca, F. iinumae, F. nipponica, and F. viridis (Edger et al. 2019). A high-quality octoploid strawberry genome has been recently developed (Edger et al. 2019), enabling new kinds analyses and improved resolution compared with previous studies involving Fragaria NLRs (Jia et al. 2015; Zhong et al. 2018). Analysis of this F. ×ananassa 'Camarosa' genome identified the repertoire of octoploid R-gene sequences and further demonstrated a general genomic retention bias toward F. vesca-like sequences (Edger et al. 2019).

This research compares R-genes from octoploid strawberry with its diploid ancestors and provides additional analysis into the genetic control of R-gene expression and retention patterns. Additional bias toward retention of F. vesca-like R-genes was detected in octoploid strawberry, beyond the bias observed in non-R-gene coding sequences. This finding provides insight into potential practical drivers of biased gene retention. Conserved domains were compared to describe specific R-gene phylogenic relationships. The octoploid genome was used to assemble 61 fruit transcriptomes, and used to discover subgenomic expression quantitative trait loci (eQTL) for R-genes expressed in octoploid fruit. Data from the octoploid 'Camarosa' strawberry gene expression atlas (Sánchez-Sevilla et al., 2017) was also used to determine R-gene transcript accumulation throughout the strawberry plant.

Resistance gene enrichment and sequencing (RenSeq) is an advantageous method for sequencing R-genes (Andolfo et al. 2014), and is likely to be very useful for *de novo* resolution of causal mutations (Witek et al. 2016). This method can be used to identify casual mutations within existing disease resistance QTL. For this purpose, a novel octoploid strawberry RenSeq capture probe library was designed using the R-genes identified in this analysis. This panel was experimentally validated using the University of Florida breeding germplasm. The results demonstrate robust capture and resequencing of octoploid and diploid R-genes using only short second-generation sequence reads and with relatively deep genomic multiplexing.

This report characterizes the complete R-gene collection in the genomes of commercial octoploid strawberry and two diploid ancestral relatives, providing the genome-level resolution necessary for fully exploiting genetic disease resistance in strawberry. This research introduces several new technology and data resources that now may be applied in study of strawberry disease resistance.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Plant populations and genetic materials

Three pedigree-connected and segregating strawberry populations were created from crosses 'Florida Elyana' × 'Mara de Bois', 'Florida Radiance' × 'Mara des Bois', and 'Strawberry Festival' × 'Winter Dawn' (Figure S1). These cultivars and 54 progeny were selected for RNAseq and Istraw35 SNP genotyping analysis (Verma et al. 2017), and were used to identify expressed genes and R-gene eQTL. De novo assemblies of 'Mara des Bois' and 'Florida Elyana' were also used to help design RenSeq capture probes.

For RenSeq, 14 disease resistant octoploid cultivars and elite breeding lines were selected from the University of Florida breeding program, and supplemented with 'Camarosa' and with the ancestral diploid F. vesca. The RenSeq lines are F. vesca genotype Hawaii 4, 'Camarosa', Sweet Sensation 'Florida127', 'Florida Elyana', 11.28-34, 11.77-96, 11.98-41, 12.115-10, 12.121-5, 13.26-134, 13.42-5, 13.55-195, 14.100-58, 14.100-59, 14.101-154, and 14.101-225.

Identification of R-genes in strawberry spp

R-genes were predicted from the strawberry octoploid 'Camarosa' draft genome "F_ana_Camarosa_6-28-17.rm" (Edger et al. 2019), the diploid F. vesca reassembly "Fragaria_vesca_v2.0.a2" (Tennessen et al. 2014), and the diploid F. innumae assembly "FII_r1.1" (Hirakawa et al. 2014). Domain-level analysis was performed using the CLC Genomics Workbench 11 HMM implementation to search for Pfam- v29 domains on translated gene models from all genomic and transcriptomic strawberry resources. Motif search was performed on all translated gene models, using 56 R-gene-associated motifs collected from (Van Ghelder and Esmenjaud 2016; Lukasik and Takken 2009; Jupe et al. 2012). The CLC Genomics Workbench 11 (CLC Bio, Denmark) pattern discovery tool was trained on a preliminary list of strawberry R-genes, and novel motifs were reiterated back to all protein models. The ncoils sequence analysis algorithm (Lupas et al. 1991) was used to detect coiled-coil domains, and the output was parsed into GFF3 format for protein list reannotation. BLAST2GO annotation (Conesa et al. 2005) was performed to assign putative functions to all genes and confirm sequence association with disease resistance in a cross-referenced database.

Protein models containing canonical R-gene domains (e.g., NB-ARC domain) were selected for inclusion as R-genes, as were gene models with more common domains (e.g., LRR) with supporting evidence of an R-gene-associated motif. BLAST2GO annotated disease resistance associated genes not meeting the domain and motif-level criteria were manually analyzed for potential inclusion, leading to the inclusion of many LRR-containing RLK putative R-genes.

NB-ARC phylogenetic analysis

NB-ARC domains were extracted from F. iinumae, F. vesca, and F. ×ananassa 'Camarosa'. The CIPRES Science Gateway (Miller et al. 2010) was utilized for full-length protein sequence alignment using MUSCLE v3.7 (Edgar 2004) and Maximum likelihood analysis using RAxML v8.2.10 (Stamatakis 2014). Tree construction was performed using the PROTGAMMA rate distribution model with 100 bootstrap replicates, and rooted with human APAF-1. This process was replicated five times using different random number seeds. Trees were visualized in CLC Genomic Workbench 11 with a 50% threshold bootstrap value. Word clouds were generated per clade based on the relative domain content of the full proteins.

dN/dS analysis

*d*N and *d*S values were computed using a set of custom scripts (https:// github.com/Aeyocca/ka_ks_pipe/). Orthologous genes between the *F.* ×ananassa and *F.* vesca v4 (Edger et al. 2017b) genomes were identified using the compara module in JCVI utilities library (Tang et al., 2015). Filtering of the JCVI utilities output was performed using a custom Perl script to identify the best syntenic ortholog and best blast hit below e-value 1e-4. Alignment of each orthologous gene pair was performed using MUSCLE v3.8.31 (Edgar 2004), followed by PAL2-NAL (v14) (Suyama et al. 2006) to convert the peptide alignment to a nucleotide alignment. Finally, *d*N and *d*S values were computed between those gene pairs using codeml from PAML Version 4.9h (Yang 2007) with parameters specified in the control file found in the GitHub repository listed above.

Tissue-specific transcriptome analysis

Raw short read RNAseq libraries from various 'Camarosa' tissue (Sánchez-Sevilla *et al.* 2017) with the study reference PRJEB12420 were download from the European Nucleotide Archive (https://www.ebi.a-c.uk/ena). The complete 54 library RNAseq experiment consisted of six independent green receptacle libraries, six white receptacle libraries, six turning receptacle libraries, six red receptacle libraries, three root libraries, three leaf libraries, and six achene libraries each for all corresponding fruit stages. Raw RNAseq reads were assembled to the 'Camarosa' reference using the same pipeline as previously described for fruit transcriptome population analysis. Expression values from biologically-replicated libraries were averaged. Clustvis (Metsalu and Vilo 2015) was used for tissue-based RNAseq clustering and heatmap visualization using correlation distance and average linkage with scaling applied using default parameters.

Fruit transcriptome analysis

61 fruit transcriptomes were sequenced via Illumina paired-end RNAseq (Avg. 65million reads, 2x100bp), and consisted of parents and progeny from crosses of 'Florida Elyana' \times 'Mara de Bois', 'Florida Radiance' \times 'Mara des Bois', and 'Strawberry Festival' × 'Winter Dawn'. Reads were trimmed and mapped to the F. × ananassa octoploid 'Camarosa' annotated genome using CLC Genomic Workbench 11 (mismatch cost of 2, insertion cost of 3, deletion cost of 3, length fraction of 0.8, similarity fraction of 0.8, 1 maximum hit per read). Reads that mapped equally well to more than one locus were discarded from the analysis. RNAseq counts were calculated in Transcripts Per Million (TPM). Threedimensional principle component analysis (PCA) was performed on all RNAseq assemblies, including two replicates of 'Mara des Bois' fruit harvested three years apart and sequenced independently (Figure S2). Transcript abundances were normalized via the Box-Cox transformation algorithm performed in R (R. Development Core Team 2014) prior to eQTL analysis. The BLAST2GO pipeline was used to annotate the full 'Camarosa' predicted gene complement.

Genotyping and genetic association of octoploid fruit R-genes

The Affymetrix IStraw35 Axiom SNP array (Verma *et al.* 2017) was used to genotype 60 individuals, including six parental lines from three independent biparental RNAseq populations (Figure S1). Sequence variants belonging to the Poly High Resolution (PHR) and No Minor Homozygote (NMH) marker classes were included for association mapping. Mono High Resolution (MHR), Off-Target Variant (OTV), Call Rate Below Threshold (CRBT), and Other marker quality classes, were discarded and not used for mapping. Individual marker calls inconsistent with Mendelian inheritance from parental lines were

removed. The *F. vesca* physical map was used to orient marker positions as current octoploid maps do not include a majority of the available IStraw35 markers. A genome-wide analysis study (GWAS) was performed using GAPIT v2 (Tang *et al.* 2016) performed in R. R-gene eQTL were evaluated for significance based on the presence of multiple co-locating markers of *p*-value < 0.05 after false discovery rate correction for multiple comparisons. *Cis vs. trans* eQTL determinations were made by corroborating known 'Camarosa' physical gene position with the eQTL position the *F. vesca* map. In the example case of *FaDRL28*, subgenomic localization was confirmed via BLAST of the associated markers to the correct 'Camarosa' homeologous chromosome.

Subgenome dominance in octoploid strawberry R-genes

The closest homolog for each *F.* ×*ananassa* 'Camarosa' gene in either Fragaria_vesca_v2.0.a2.cds or FII_r1.1cds was determined via BLAST analysis (e-value threshold < 0.1, word size = 25, match = 1, mismatch = l, existence = 0, extension = 2). *F. vesca*-like and *F. iinumae*-like gene counts and TPMs were independently calculated for each octoploid chromosome. This process was performed first on all genes in the 'Camarosa' genome to establish the baseline gene retention and expression bias. This process was then repeated using only predicted NLR genes containing an NB-ARC domain, as

RenSeq probe design and validation

A panel of 39,501 of 120mer-length capture probes were designed based on the set of discovered strawberry R-genes from F. × ananassa 'Camarosa', F. vesca genotype Hawaii 4, F. iinumae genomes, and de novo fruit transcriptomes from F. ×ananassa 'Mara des Bois' and 'Florida Elyana'. A proprietary algorithm was used to select for capture probes of ideal hybridization thermodynamics and screened for potential off-target capture in the intergenic regions of 'Camarosa' and F. vesca (Rapid Genomics LLC, Gainesville FL). Probes were designed to not span exon-exon junction, to facilitate cross-utility for both genomic and cDNA libraries (Figure S3). A minimum baseline of 1x probe coverage was provided across the length of every predicted R-gene coding sequence, and additional probes were designed against conserved R-gene domains in order to promote capture of unknown and divergent R-genes across diverse octoploid accessions. RenSeq capture was performed on genomic libraries from fifteen octoploid disease-resistant cultivars and advanced breeding selections, and F. vesca, based on conditions set by (Jupe et al. 2014), with optimizations provided by Rapid Genomics LLC. Captured libraries were sequenced via 16x multiplexed Illumina HiSeq $(2 \times 100 \text{bp})$ and mapped to their respective annotated genomic references using CLC Genomic Workbench 11 (CLCBio, Aarhus, Denmark) (Similarity fraction = 0.9, Length fraction = 0.9, Match score = 1, Mismatch cost = 2, Insertion cost = 3, Deletion cost = 3).

Data availability

Supplementary figures, tables, files, and raw data are available at FigShare. Custom scripts used for performing *dN/dS* analysis are available at GitHub: https://github.com/Aeyocca/ka_ks_pipe/. Raw short read RNAseq data from fruit transcriptomes are available from the NCBI Short Read Archive under project SRP039356 (http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/sra/?term=SRP039356). Raw short read RNAseq data from the 'Camarosa' gene expression atlas (Sánchez-Sevilla *et al.*, 2017) are available at the European Nucleotide Archive (https://www.ebi.ac.uk/ena) with the study reference PRJEB12420. Results derived from these data are compiled in Table S1. File S1 contains a GFF3 file for annotating the octoploid genome (Edger *et al.* 2019) with R-genes and R-gene domains. Renseq probe sequences are provided in File S2. IStraw35 marker names, map

Table 1 NLR-gene subtype distribution across three strawberry species

	F imes ananassa 'Camarosa'	F. vesca	F. iinumae
NBS	193 (19.8%)	65 (17.7%)	45 (11.6%)
NBS-LRR	22 (2.3%)	7 (1.9%)	20 (5.2%)
NBS-only type	215 (22.1%)	72 (19.6%)	65 (16.8%)
CC-NBS	163 (16.6%)	45 (12.3%)	126 (32.6%)
CC-NBS-LRR	30 (3.1%)	9 (2.5%)	8 (2.1%)
CNL-type	192 (19.7%)	54 (14.7%)	134 (34.6%)
RPW8	91 (9.3%)	40 (10.9%)	23 (5.9%)
RPW8-NBS	45 (4.6%)	31 (8.4%)	13 (3.4%)
RPW8-type	136 (13.9%)	71 (19.3%)	36 (9.3%)
TIR	134 (13.7%)	136 (37.1%)	86 (22.2%)
TIR-NBS	195 (20.0%)	18 (4.9%)	51 (13.2%)
TIR-NBS-LRR	103 (10.6%)	16 (4.4%)	15 (3.9%)
TNL-type	432 (40.3%)	170 (46.3%)	152 (39.3%)
Total	975	367	387

Absolute and relative distribution of NLR-gene subtypes and truncated subtypes are shown. Domain combinations are shown for coiled coil (CC), toll interleukin receptor-like (TIR), leucine rich repeat (LRR), and nucleotide binding - APAF-1 (apoptotic protease-activating factor-1), R proteins and CED-4 (*Caenorhabditis elegans* death-4 protein) (NBS, or NB-ARC), and resistance to powdery mildew 8 (RPW8) domains.

positions, and genotype sequences used in eQTL analysis are available in File S3. Supplemental material available at FigShare: https://doi.org/ 10.25387/g3.8143961. in strawberry and is present in 136 (13.9%) of octoploid NLRs (Table 1). Basic trends in NLR-subtype genomic content in 'Camarosa' does not more strongly resemble either *F. vesca* or *F. innumae*.

RESULTS

Octoploid and diploid R-genes

The genomes of octoploid 'Camarosa', diploid *F. vesca*, and diploid *F. iinumae* were analyzed for R-gene signatures. The *F.iinumae* genome was selected to represent the closely-related 'old world' diploid ancestors *F.iinumae*, *F. nipponica* and *F. viridis*, which each have highly similar but fragmented genomic assemblies.

Putative R-genes were identified based on protein domain and motif analysis, which identified gene models with traditional NLR-type domains, including coiled coil (CC), Toll Interleukin Receptor-like (TIR), Leucine Rich Repeat (LRR), and Nucleotide Binding - APAF-1 (apoptotic protease-activating factor-1), R proteins and CED-4 (*Caenorhabditis elegans* death-4 protein) (NBS, or NB-ARC). Gene models with NLR-type domains that are not highly specific to NLR sequences (*e.g.*, LRR domains) were included if there was also supporting evidence of an additional NLR-associated motif. BLAST2GO annotated disease resistance associated genes not meeting these criteria were analyzed manually, leading to the intentional inclusion of many putative Receptor-like Kinase (RLK-type) R-genes in this analysis.

Octoploid F. × ananassa 'Camarosa' carries 1,962 putative resistance genes (1.82% of all genes) (Table S1), including 975 complete or truncated NLR genes (Table 1). NLR gene content is similar in genic proportion to the 367 complete or truncated NLR genes in F. vesca (1.09% of all genes) and 387 in F. iinumae (0.5% of all genes). Traditional NLR domains comprise the majority of domain classes in all predicted resistance gene models in diploid and octoploid strawberry accessions (Figure 1). In many categories, the three genomes show somewhat dissimilar ratios of relative NLR-subtype content (Table 1). These include biases toward TIR-only proteins in F. vesca and CNL-type (CC-containing) NLR genes in F. innumae. Octoploid 'Camarosa' is proportionally intermediate for many NLR categories relative to F. vesca and F. innumae. A high proportion of TIR-NBS and TIR-NBS-LRR-containing genes is observed in 'Camarosa'. However, the overall proportion of TNL-type (TIR-containing) NLR genes is similar when including TIR-only truncations. The Resistance to Powdery Mildew 8 (RPW8) domain, a disease resistance domain associated with broad-spectrum mildew resistance in Arabidopsis, appears frequently In the 'Camarosa' genome, 750 of 975 NLR genes contain at least one NB-ARC domain, which is the most characteristic domain of NLRtype R-genes (Table 1). The ratio of 'Camarosa' NB-ARC-containing genes to total predicted gene content (1:144) is higher than in *F. vesca* (1:171) and *F. iinumae* (1:262), possibly indicating diversifying selection of NLR genes in octoploid *F.* ×*ananassa*. A substantial number of atypical domains are present on strawberry R-genes, including malectin-like carbohydrate-binding domains, RNA-binding domains, transcription factor-like WRKY and F-box domains, and several types of protein kinase domains (Figure 1).

Tandem clusters of R-genes were observed in all three of the analyzed strawberry genomes. The phenomena of R-gene expansion through tandem duplication is exemplified in the RPW8-containing R-gene class. Of the seventy-one RPW8-containing R-genes in *F. vesca*, all but seven reside in one of a few genomic clusters (Figure S4A-B). The major RPW8 cluster observed in *F. vesca* chromosome 1 is strongly retained in 'Camarosa' (Figure S4C). Similar R-gene hotspots are observed throughout the diploid and octoploid strawberry reference genomes. Genome annotations for all R-genes and NLR domains in 'Camarosa' are provided in File S1. Annotations are also available on the JBrowse web-based genome browser at the Genome Database for the Rosaceae (www.rosaceae.org).

Phylogenetic analysis of strawberry NLRs

The conserved NB-ARC domains from 'Camarosa', *F. vesca*, and *F. iinumae* were compared via maximum likelihood analysis to examine evolutionary trends among NLR genes. NB-ARCs from all three genomes phylogenetically organized mostly according to their extended R-gene domain structures, with TNLs, CNLs, and RPW8-associated NB-ARCs forming clades based on this criteria (Figure 2). Minor NLR subtypes, such as WRKY-associated NLR genes, also sorted into a unique subclade based only on NB-ARC sequence. Multiple distinct clades with identical domain architectures were detected, and in a few cases these subclades are relatively distant from one another.

R-gene transcript accumulation

Raw RNAseq expression data from different tissues of 'Camarosa', derived from the octoploid strawberry gene expression atlas (Sánchez-Sevilla *et al.* 2017), were reassembled based on the homeolog-level



Figure 1 Canonical and non-Canonical R-Gene Domains in octoploid 'Camarosa'. Classic TNL/CNL-type R-gene domains (TIR, NB-ARC, LRR, etc.) comprise the majority of domain classes in predicted R-genes, however a number of atypical domains are observed in high frequency. Domains below a count of five are not shown.

octoploid 'Camarosa' genome assembly (Edger *et al.* 2019). Out of 975 'Camarosa' genome-predicted NLRs, 478 NLRs show evidence of RNAseq expression in any 'Camarosa' tissue (>1 Transcript per Million, TPM). A majority of 'Camarosa' NLR genes are predominantly expressed in the roots and leaves (Figure 3A-B). Comparatively few NLRs are predominantly or specifically expressed in the mature receptacle (139 expressed NLRs). Many NLR type R-genes are broadly specific to only one or two tissues. Expressed NLR genes from root, leaf, green and white receptacles show fairly poor overlap. Overall NLR transcript accumulation is correlated with ripening, with strongest expression in the earlier stages and decreasing with maturity in both the receptacle and achene. Complete R-gene expression values for each tissue are provided in Table S1.

Mature receptacle transcriptomes from 61 field-grown individuals of three octoploid populations reveal broadly stable R-gene expression levels (SD 0.09). R-genes comprise 1.8% of the predicted gene models in the 'Camarosa' genome, but represent an average of only 0.48% of total transcripts in the mature receptacle (Figure 3C). Minute but statistically significant absolute differences were observed between each of the three populations [F (2, 59) = 19.06, P < 0.00001]. To explore possible biases in the gene expression analysis caused by confounding environmental factors, principal component analysis (PCA) was performed on all RNAseq assemblies including two replicates of 'Mara des Bois' fruit harvested in different seasons (Figure S2). Total transcript-accumulation variation clusters most strongly according to familial relationship, with the 'Mara des Bois' replicates showing similar expression patterns. A measured amount of variation due to environmental influence can also be seen, as the two 'Mara des Bois' RNAseq replicates cluster somewhat more closely with their co-harvested progeny.

R-gene eQTL in 61 strawberry fruit transcriptomes

eQTL analysis was performed to evaluate heritable genotypic effects on R-gene transcription, using 61 mature fruit octoploid transcriptomes and octoploid genotypes from the IStraw35 SNP array (Verma *et al.* 2017). This analysis identified 76 R-gene-like sequences with at least one highly-significant locus explaining differential expression (3.9% of octoploid genome-predicted R-genes). These R-genes include 39 NB-ARC containing genes, comprised of 16 TNL's, 13 CNL's, 3 NBS-RPW8 proteins, and 5 NB-ARC-only proteins, and an additional 6 RPW8-only genes and 4 TIR-only R-genes (Table S1). The majority of the remaining eQTL genes are LRR-containing RLK putative R-genes. As the 'Camarosa' genomic locus of each transcript is known, *cis vs. trans* eQTL status was determined. Of 76 significant R-gene eQTL transcripts, 52 R-genes are regulated via a *cis*-genetic locus (Table 2), and 24 R-genes are under regulation of both *cis* and *trans*-eQTL (Table 3). No solely *trans*-eQTL were discovered among this set of R-genes. The most significant IStraw35 SNP marker name and position for each R-gene transcript is provided with the eQTL phase, minor allele frequency, *p*-value (FDR-adjusted), heritability estimate, expression in parental lines, and BLAST2GO description.

A representative eQTL R-gene (maker-fvb5-2-snap-gene-4.75) is detailed in Figure 4. Analysis by BLAST2GO indicates a probable disease resistance gene homologous to the Arabidopsis thaliana gene At4g27220 with the Uniprot identifier DRL28_ARATH. This gene is hereafter referred to as "FaDRL28". A CC-NBS-NLR structure is predicted for FaDRL28 (Figure 4A). An eQTL was detected for this gene relative to chromosome 5 on the F. vesca genome position (Figure 4B). This eQTL is associated with increased transcription of FaDRL28 from near-zero to above 25 TPM (single-marker ANOVA p-value 1.6E-12) (Figure 4C). This eQTL is superficially analogous to the physical position of octoploid FaDRL28 on chromosome 5, homeolog 2 (Figure 4D). The significant markers are not included in the 'Holiday' × 'Korona' octoploid genetic map, impeding a recombination-based subgenomic genetic association (van Dijk et al. 2014). However, the associated marker physical sequences match fairly uniquely to the 'Camarosa' chromosome 5-2 subgenomic locus, confirming a cis-eQTL designation (Figure 4E). One eQTL marker locates inside the FaDRL28 coding sequence.

Evolutionary pressure on F. ×ananassa R-genes

Elevated median dN/dS ratios were observed across all 1,962 predicted *F*. × *ananassa* R-genes (0.47) compared to non R-genes (0.35)



Figure 2 Phylogenetic Relationship of NB-ARC domains in *F. vesca, F. iinumae, & F. × ananassa* 'Camarosa'. A. Full-length NB-ARC domains from strawberry spp. organize into clades based on NLR-gene subtype (CC, TIR, NB-ARC, LRR, and RPW8-containing combinations). Maximum likelihood bootstrap values (100 replicates) above a threshold of 50% are shown with the NB-ARC domain from human *Apaf1* as the outgroup. Clades are delineated by color and number (red). Word sizes correspond to relative domain content within each clade.

(Figure 5). Fewer R-genes exhibited extremely low dN/dS ratios, indicating that high degrees of R-gene conservation are less common. However, a similar rate of hypervariable genes (dN >> dS) was observed between R-genes and non R-genes. Median dN/dS values for RPW8-type R-genes (0.62) are significantly higher than for general R-genes (0.47) as confirmed by one-way ANOVA [F (1, 1911) = 10.6, P < 0.0012] (Table S1). A complete list of dN/dS ratios for each *F*. × *ananassa* R-gene is provided in Table S1.

R-gene dN/dS values were compared against transcript accumulation across various strawberry tissues and receptacle stages. R-genes with low transcript accumulation across all tissues were correlated with higher dN/dS ratios (Pearson's r = -0.69, P < 0.0001) (Figure S5). In other words, R-genes with poor evidence of expression also have higher ratios of non-synonymous mutation capable of altering amino acid sequences and affecting protein function.

Subgenome dominance in octoploid strawberry

Polyploidization is associated with rapid genome remodeling events to establish a new homeostasis, including selective gene loss and methylation. While R-gene expansiveness is often considered evolutionarily favorable, genes that are stoichiometrically or dosage sensitive are more commonly retained in duplicate after polyploidization (Edger and Pires 2009; Birchler and Veitia 2012; Edger *et al.* 2017a). The 'Camarosa' octoploid genome, in comparison with the genomes from its diploid



Figure 3 RNAseq-based Detection of Octoploid NLR Transcripts. A. Tissue-based heatmap of transcript accumulation (TPM) of NLRs in 'Camarosa'. B. Total and proportional number of expressed NLRs (TPM >1) (left y-axis) with averaged 'Camarosa' transcript abundance (right y-axis), per tissue and in all tissues (global). C. Generalized R-gene mature-fruit expression across three segregating populations (n = 61).

F. vesca-like and *F. iinumae*-like ancestors, has provided an ideal platform to study the general biological phenomena of post-hybridization genome remodeling and subgenome dominance (Edger *et al.* 2019). To gauge R-gene post-hybridization retention specifically, a genefocused baseline assessment of subgenome dominance in the 'Camarosa' octoploid genome was necessary. Putative gene ancestry was predicted

DR100_ARATH DNA damage-repair HSL1_ARATH Receptor kinase HSL1 HSL1_ARATH Receptor kinase HSL1 HSL1_ARATH Receptor kinase HSL1 TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N -RX2_ARATH Leucine-rich repeat -RX2_ARATH Leucine-rich repeat .RX2_ARATH Leucine-rich repeat DRL30_ARATH Probable disease Y4294_ARATH LRR receptor-like MKKA_DICDI Mitogen-activated RGA1_SOLBU disease resistance MKKA_DICDI Mitogen-activated RGA1_SOLBU disease resistance resistance **MKKA_DICDI** Mitogen-activated RGA1_SOLBU disease resistance MKKA_DICDI Mitogen-activated DRL1_ARATH Probable disease IR_ARATH Toll interleukin-1 TIR_ARATH Toll interleukin-1 PLT5_ARATH Sugar-proton serine threonine- kinase Description resistance At1g12280 resistance At5g04720 uncharacterized protein RGA1_SOLBU disease toleration DRT100 extensin 2 2 LRR extensin 2 2 LRR RGA1 RGA3-blb RGA1 RGA3-blb RGA1 RGA3-blb RGA1 RGA3-blb symporter PLT5 LOC101293711 HAESA-LIKE1 HAESA-LIKE1 HAESA-LIKE1 kinase kinase kinase kinase kinase kinase extensin 2 receptor receptor kinase Winter 34.3 2.5 1.6 1.3 0.3 0.4 4.9 1.8 <u>.</u> 0.5 3.0 0.0 0.8 1.8 2.2 13.2 0.0 2.2 11.5 0.8 1.2 dawn <u>0</u> <u>0</u> Festi-val 21.3 8.0 1.0 0.0 2.5 3.8 1.8 0.8 2.6 0.8 1.3 2.1 0.2 0.3 4.2 3.2 2.0 1.4 2.8 4.4 0.4 4.1 0.1 Radi-ance 32.2 2.8 0.7 5.5 5.6 2.5 2.5 0.6 4.0 0.0 1.2 1.4 1.4 10.3 0.1 0.7 4.1 2.1 0.5 0.4 2.2 0.0 3.1 Elya-na 113.3 0.0 3.0 0.0 0.2 0.2 0.0 0.2 3.8 4.8 0.0 0.0 0.8 0.0 0.6 0.4 0.4 4. 0.1 0.7 <u>0</u>.1 0.4 Mara 36.6 0.0 6.0 0.5 0.5 2.3 2.5 2.3 0.8 0.6 0.0 4.6 0.8 0.8 4. 1.8 1.2 9.9 0.5 0.1 1.7 2.1 h² estimate 31.7% 30.4% 43.4% 80.9% 41.8% 30.4% 81.7% 91.5% 25.1% 74.1% 35.5% 63.7% 26.6% 64.9% 73.3% 69.2% 35.7% 63.8% 80.9% 100% 100% 100% 100% 0.0418 0.0012 0.0118 p-value 0.0114 0.0014 0.0124 0.0003 0.0175 0.0002 0.0294 0.0009 0.0032 0.0202 0.0080 0.0007 0.0050 0.0083 0.0121 0.0225 0.0015 0.0110 0.0150 0.0083 (FDR) 0.43 0.12 MAF 0.16 0.29 0.50 0.38 0.23 0.28 0.43 0.18 0.35 0.48 0.26 0.35 0.44 0.29 0.49 0.49 0.33 0.46 0.29 0.09 0.21 Straw35 AX-89817565 166509530 89786873 166523635 166509572 66509530 23365069 89877559 166503168 166502627 166511589 166513199 166504873 166505902 166505336 23365994 166524323 23525092 166527457 166518037 I 66524541 166517211 I 66503861 phase eQTL CIS. CIS. CIS CIS CIS. Cis. CIS. CIS. CIS. CIS CIS. CIS. CIS. CIS. CIS. CIS. CIS. CIS. CIS CIS. CIS. CIS. CIS: augustus_masked-fvb4-2-processed-gene-107.10 augustus_masked-fvb6-1-processed-gene-345.10 augustus_masked-fvb7-2-processed-gene-302.13 augustus_masked-fvb2-4-processed-gene-105.5 augustus_masked-fvb3-1-processed-gene-107.3 augustus_masked-fvb3-3-processed-gene-283.7 augustus_masked-fvb4-1-processed-gene-166.2 augustus_masked-fvb4-2-processed-gene-258.8 augustus_masked-fvb5-1-processed-gene-238.7 augustus_masked-fvb5-3-processed-gene-135.4 augustus_masked-fvb5-4-processed-gene-241.6 augustus_masked-fvb1-2-processed-gene-27.2 augustus_masked-fvb3-3-processed-gene-38.8 augustus_masked-fvb3-4-processed-gene-19.4 augustus_masked-fvb5-1-processed-gene-71.8 augustus_masked-fvb5-4-processed-gene-18.1 augustus_masked-fvb7-1-processed-gene-57.2 augustus_masked-fvb7-2-processed-gene-53.6 augustus_masked-fvb1-4-processed-gene-7.11 augustus_masked-fvb7-2-processed-gene-54.1 maker-fvb2-1-augustus-gene-182.42 maker-fvb1-4-augustus-gene-30.48 maker-fvb2-1-snap-gene-111.27 **R-gene Name**

Table 2 Cis eQTL pertaining to fruit-expressed genes in F. ×ananassa

(continued)

RGA3_SOLBU RGA3 Blight resistance HSL1_ARATH Receptor kinase HSL1 HSL1_ARATH Receptor kinase HSL1 TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N MVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N probable LRR receptor-like serine LRX2_ARATH Leucine-rich repeat RGA1_SOLBU disease resistance .RX2_ARATH Leucine-rich repeat -RX2_ARATH Leucine-rich repeat RPM1_ARATH Disease resistance RPM1_ARATH Disease resistance **MKKA_DICDI** Mitogen-activated MKKA_DICDI Mitogen-activated RGA1_SOLBU disease resistance Y3475_ARATH LRR receptor-like DRL28_ARATH Probable disease GLO5_ARATH Peroxisomal(S)-2threonine- kinase At5g48740 P2B10 ARATH F-box PP2-B10 hydroxy-acid oxidase GLO5 P2B11_ARATH F-box PP2-B11 P2B11_ARATH F-box PP2-B11 IR_ARATH Toll interleukin-1 PHLOEM PROTEIN 2-LIKE PHLOEM PROTEIN 2-LIKE PHLOEM PROTEIN 2-LIKE TIR_ARATH Toll interleukin-1 serine threonine- kinase Description resistance At4g27220 kinase kinase kinase extensin 2 2 LRR extensin 2 2 LRR **RGA1 RGA3-blb** HAESA-LIKE1 HAESA-LIKE1 extensin 2 2 receptor receptor kinase **RPM1** B149 RGA1 **RPM1** Winter 1.7 0.2 1.6 0.4 2.2 2.0 3.4 1.3 0.0 0.0 0.0 5.2 0.8 0.8 :-1.4 0.3 1.3 0.5 0.1 1.4 dawn 0.7 0.1 Festi-val 0.0 4.0 0.5 0.0 43.0 0.1 1.6 0.5 2.3 0.0 0.0 3.6 1.5 12.0 3.7 0.0 1.4 0.0 0.4 8.8 1.6 1.4 0.3 <u>.</u> Radi-ance 0.6 0.1 2.0 0.6 0.0 8.5 2.0 2.6 2.2 3.5 37.2 0.1 1.8 2.1 0.9 0.0 0.0 0.0 4.0 1.3 1.6 0.1 Elya-na 0.2 0.1 0.0 0.0 0.0 2.6 0.5 0.0 0.3 9.3 1.8 0.2 19.2 0.0 0.0 5.3 0.3 0.0 0.1 0.4 0.4 0.2 0.0 Mara 2.4 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.1 0.5 0.6 0.9 13.3 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.3 0.1 2.3 2.1 0.2 0.9 4.4 2.1 estimate 70.3% 75.1% 4.7% 44.8% 82.6% 98.3% 75.1% 11.4% 98.9% 24.2% 36.5% 35.7% 54.7% 36.5% 46.0% 71.7% 16.5% 29.9% 78.4% 94.4% 51.8% 93.2% 11.5% 100% μ2 0.0045 0.0002 0.0319 0.0014 0.0072 0.0155 0.0078 p-value 0.0077 0.0064 0.0092 0.0068 0.0011 0.0084 0.0095 0.0011 0.0007 0.0000 0.0036 0.0000 0.0040 0.0016 0.0291 0.0357 0.0411 (FDR) 0.45 MAF 0.34 0.50 0.50 0.17 0.08 0.22 0.37 0.45 0.33 0.43 0.13 0.13 0.46 0.46 0.46 0.32 0.46 0.21 0.11 0.21 0.18 0.34 0.37 Straw35 AX-123540423 23359450 166509770 166506813 23524810 166508582 23359751 89780995 123361033 66519417 166513103 166523649 123364094 123364094 89832439 89893608 166518351 166518351 123357141 166508667 123364094 123364094 66523796 66506186 phase eQTL CIS. CIS CIS CIS cis CIS. cis 5 snap_masked-fvb7-2-processed-gene-254.35 snap_masked-fvb2-1-processed-gene-107.14 snap_masked-fvb1-2-processed-gene-79.33 snap_masked-fvb3-2-processed-gene-11.25 snap_masked-fvb6-1-processed-gene-37.31 snap_masked-fvb3-3-processed-gene-288. maker-fvb3-4-augustus-gene-265.40 maker-fvb5-3-augustus-gene-135.25 maker-fvb5-2-augustus-gene-61.13 maker-fvb5-2-augustus-gene-59.20 maker-fvb5-2-augustus-gene-63.17 maker-fvb4-3-snap-gene-155.68 maker-fvb5-3-snap-gene-221.67 maker-fvb5-3-snap-gene-254.50 maker-fvb5-4-snap-gene-125.42 maker-fvb7-1-snap-gene-223.45 maker-fvb5-1-snap-gene-191.37 maker-fvb7-1-snap-gene-273.51 maker-fvb7-4-snap-gene-48.49 maker-fvb7-4-snap-gene-59.59 maker-fvb7-4-snap-gene-59.63 maker-fvb5-2-snap-gene-61.17 maker-fvb7-4-snap-gene-69.51 maker-fvb5-2-snap-gene-4.75 maker-fvb5-4-snap-gene-125. **R-gene Name**

(continued)

	eQTL			p-value						Winter	
R-gene Name	phase	IStraw35 AX-	MAF	(FDR)	h ² estimate	Mara	Elya-na	Radi-ance	Festi-val	dawn	Description
maker-fvb6-1-augustus-gene-153.32	CiS	166507404	0.17	0.0000	76.3%	0.0	0.0	23.5	6.8	17.5	RGA3_SOLBU RGA3 Blight resistance B149
maker-fvb5-2-augustus-gene-61.14	CIS	123358673	0.47	0.0167	44.9%	0.0	0.1	0.7	1.2	0.3	P2B10_ARATH F-box PP2-B10 PHLOEM PROTEIN 2-LIKE
augustus_masked-fvb7-1-processed-gene-284.2	CIS	123359573	0.4	0.0139	95.1%	0.3	0	0.1	0.3	0.2	EMS1_ARATH Leucine-rich repeat receptor kinase EMS1
snap_masked-fvb6-2-processed-gene-263.31	cis	89781514	0.24	0.0084	54.9%	0	0	4.3	4.3	2.2	TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N
maker-fvb6-1-augustus-gene-160.45	cis	166515747	0.21	0.0340	38.4%	12.6	8.8	11.9	4.2	10.3	DGK5_ARATH Diacylglycerol kinase 5
Genetic association results for 61 transcriptomes are sho narrow sense heritability, transcript accumulation in culti	wn, detail vars, and	ing <i>cis</i> genetic fa BLAST2GO desc	actors c cription	ontrolling c are shown.	lifferentially ex _l	oressed	R-genes.	The most sigr	nificant mar	ker name	, minor allele frequency, FDR-adjusted p-value,

based on gene-by-gene sequence comparisons to determine the closest 'Camarosa' gene homologs in F. vesca (Fragaria_vesca_ v2.0.a2.cds) and F. iinumae (FII_r1.1cds), which is representative of the highly similar 'old world' subgenomes. This gene-by-gene putative orthology analysis was selected over a total comparison of homeologous chromosomes, as extensive genetic transfer from the F. vesca-like subgenome has strongly converted all subgenomes to contain F. vesca-like genes over time (Tennessen et al. 2014), and because the F. iinumae FII_r1.1 genome is incompletely assembled and is not amenable to whole-genome alignment. By this facile codingsequence comparison method, a significant bias toward the retention and/or expansion of F. vesca-like genes is observed in the 'Camarosa' genome (Figure 6A), with an even stronger bias toward F. vesca-like fruit gene expression (Figure 6B) consistent with previous analyses (Edger et al. 2019). Of 108,087 F. ×ananassa 'Camarosa' predicted gene models, 68,664 genes (63.5%) were most similar to an F. vesca gene model, with 35,377 (32.7%) most similar to an F. iinumae gene model, with a minority of genes not closely matching either. A single homeologous chromosome with significantly more F. vesca-like genes (~80% F. vesca-like) was seen in every chromosomal group. In a majority of cases, this putative F. vesca-derived chromosome possesses the greatest total gene content of the chromosome group. Gene expression-based subgenome bias was assessed using mature fruit transcriptomes averaged from the cultivars 'Florida Elyana', 'Mara de Bois', 'Florida Radiance', 'Mara des Bois', 'Strawberry Festival', and 'Winter Dawn'. In these cultivars, 73.7% of total transcripts derived from a gene sequence most similar to F. vesca, corresponding to a 10.2% expression increase relative to the baseline genomic retention bias. This bias toward the expression of F. vesca-like sequences was seen on every subgenome (Figure 6B, yellow highlight).

NLR-gene subgenome dominance

Significant gene retention bias toward NLR genes that are more F. vescalike is observed in 'Camarosa' gene models (Figure 7). Of the 750 predicted NLR-gene models containing an NB-ARC domain, 69.3% more closely resemble a F. vesca gene rather than an F. iinumae gene (Figure 7A). This is somewhat higher than the baseline retention bias toward F. vesca-like genes in octoploid (63.8%) from this analysis. In every chromosome group, the F. vesca-like homeologous chromosomes (yellow highlight) retained the greatest number of NB-ARC domain containing-NLRs. Overall, 538 NB-ARC domain containing-NLRs demonstrate the highest sequence identity with an F. vesca gene, 210 show highest sequence identity with an F. iinumae gene, and 2 (an RPW8-only gene, and an LRR_8-only gene) are without significant matches to either diploid genome. While F. vesca-like genes contribute the most to total NLR expression across 61 mature fruit transcriptomes (70.5% of transcripts), this is proportional to F. vesca-like NLR genome content (71.3%) and is similar in magnitude to general F. vesca expression bias (73.7%) (Figure 7B). In other words, F. vesca-like NLR genes are retained in the octoploid genome somewhat above the baseline bias, but do not experience the additional expression magnitude bias that is a generic feature of F. vesca-like transcripts. A greater breadth of genome-predicted NLR genes had evidence of expression across mature fruit transcriptomes (246 genes, n = 61) (Figure 7B) than in the 'Camarosa' mature fruit transcriptome alone (139 genes, n = 5) (Figure 3B) however averaged transcriptional magnitude was similar (Figure 3C).

RenSeq for strawberry resistance genes

A panel of sequence capture probes was designed based on putative R-gene sequences discovered in the genomes of *F.* ×*ananassa* 'Camarosa', *F. vesca* genotype Hawaii 4, *F. iinumae*, and *de novo* fruit transcriptomes from

Table 2, continued

Table 3 Cis and trans eQTL pertaining to fruit-expressed genes in F. × ananassa

(continued)

Regen NameDataStraw35 AX:MAFFDRN= etimateMarEquitationDescriptionmaker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-136.47cis1635339380.430.01179.%0.30.00.40.40.2TMVRN_INCGU TMV resistance Nmaker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-147.47cis1233343350.420.001152.3%1.10.25.53.12.1TMVRN_INCGU TMV resistance Nmaker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-147.47cis1233653590.420.001152.3%0.345.2%1.10.25.53.12.1TMVRN_INCGU TMV resistance Nmaker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-161.40cis1233653590.420.001152.3%0.345.2%1.10.27.90.8RGA3_SOLBU disease resistance Nmaker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-65.21cis1233643490.390.001152.3%0.30.32.00.90.8RGA3_SOLBU disease resistance Nmaker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-65.21cis1233643490.390.001152.3%0.30.32.00.90.8RGA3_SOLBU disease resistance Nmaker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-65.21cis1665071340.30.002338.9%2.41.00.38.02.12.00.90.8maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-161.50cis165507390.210.00338.9.5%2.41.00.32.00.90.8RGA3_SOLBU disease resistance Nmaker-fvb7-2-sugustus-gene-161.50cis165		eQTL			p-value						Winter	
	R-gene Name	phase	IStraw35 AX-	MAF	(FDR)	h ² estimate	Mara	Elya-na	Radi-ance	Festi-val	dawn	Description
	maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-136.47	cis	166526312	0.43	0.0116	79.9%	0.3	0.0	0.4	0.4	0.2	TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N
maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-147.47 cis 12335938 0.45 0.0001 45.2% 1.1 0.2 5.5 3.1 2.1 TMVRN_INIGGUTMV resistance N maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-163.44 cis 123365359 0.42 0.0011 52.3% 0.7 0.3 2.0 0.9 0.8 RGA3_SOLBU disease resistance RGA3 maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-163.41 cis 166512110 0.21 0.0031 59.2% 5.3 0.3 0.9 1.2 RPA RPA14 Probable disease resistance RGA3 maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-65.21 cis 16650978 0.21 0.0031 59.2% 5.3 0.3 0.9 1.2 0.5 RPB14 Probable disease resistance RGA3 maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-65.21 cis 16650978 0.21 0.0031 58.2% 2.4 1.0 0.3 2.0 0.3 2.0 0.3 2.0 0.3 2.0 0.3 2.0 2.0 0.3 2.0 2.0 0.3 2.0 0.3 2.0 2.0 2.0 <td>1</td> <td>trans</td> <td>123359434</td> <td>0.46</td> <td>0.0371</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>	1	trans	123359434	0.46	0.0371							
	maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-147.47	cis	123359385	0.45	0.0003	45.2%	1.1	0.2	5.5	3.1	2.1	TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N
maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-163.44 cis 123364494 0.39 0.0011 52.3% 0.7 0.3 2.0 0.8 RGA3_SOLBU disease resistance RGA3 maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-65.21 cis 123365359 0.42 0.0055 69.2% 5.3 0.3 0.9 1.2 0.8 RGA3_SOLBU disease resistance B149 maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-65.21 cis 166509598 0.21 0.0031 69.2% 5.3 0.3 0.9 1.2 0.5 RPR8_2 maker-fvb7-2-snap-gene-161.50 cis 123365359 0.21 0.0031 89.2% 2.4 1.0 4.0 2.0 2.6 MAP1A_RATH Methionine maker-fvb7-2-snap-gene-161.50 cis 123365359 0.42 0.052 38.9% 2.4 1.0 4.0 2.0 2.6 MAP1A_RATH Methionine maker-fvb7-2-snap-gene-161.50 cis 123365359 0.42 0.052 38.9% 2.4 1.0 2.0 2.6 MAP1A_RATH Methionine snap_maked-fvb3-4-proccessed- cis 1.66521734		trans	123365359	0.42	0.0011							
maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-65.21 trans 123365359 0.42 0.0055 5.3 0.3 0.9 1.2 0.5 RPB2_ARATH Probable disease resistance maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-65.21 trans 166509598 0.21 0.0031 69.2% 5.3 0.3 0.9 1.2 0.5 RPB2_ARATH Probable disease resistance maker-fvb7-2-snap-gene-161.50 trans 166509598 0.21 0.0052 38.9% 2.4 1.0 4.0 2.0 2.6 MaP1A_ARATH Methionine snap_masked-fvb3-4-processed- trans 123365359 0.42 0.0154 38.9% 2.4 1.0 4.0 2.0 2.6 MaP1A_ARATH Methionine snap_masked-fvb3-4-processed- trans 123365359 0.42 0.0154 2.2 4.3 6.2 7.0 7.6 MaP1A_ARATH Methionine snap_masked-fvb3-4-processed- trans 123365359 0.42 0.0154 2.2 4.3 6.2 4.0 TMVRN_INCGU TMV resistance N snap_masked-fvb6-1-processed- trans 89826525	maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-163.44	cis	123364494	0.39	0.0011	52.3%	0.7	0.3	2.0	0.9	0.8	RGA3_SOLBU disease resistance RGA3 Blight resistance B149
maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-65.21 cis 166512110 0.21 0.0031 69.2% 5.3 0.3 0.9 1.2 0.5 RP8L2_ARATH Probable disease resistance trans 166509598 0.21 0.0031 69.2% 38.9% 2.4 1.0 4.0 2.6 MAP1A_ATH Methionine maker-fvb7-2-snap-gene-161.50 cis 123364494 0.39 0.0052 38.9% 2.4 1.0 4.0 2.0 2.6 MAP1A_ATH Methionine snap_maked-fvb7-2-snap-gene-161.50 cis 123365359 0.42 0.0154 38.9% 2.4 1.0 4.0 2.0 2.6 MAP1A_ATH Methionine snap_maked-fvb3-4-processed- cis 123365359 0.42 0.0154 69.6% 2.2 4.3 6.2 7.0 </td <td></td> <td>trans</td> <td>123365359</td> <td>0.42</td> <td>0.0055</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>0</td>		trans	123365359	0.42	0.0055							0
maker-fvb7-2-snap-gene-161.50 trans 166509598 0.21 0.0031 38.9% 2.4 1.0 4.0 2.0 2.6 MAP1A_ARATH Methionine snap-gene-161.50 cis 123364494 0.39 0.0052 38.9% 2.4 1.0 4.0 2.0 2.6 MAP1A_ARATH Methionine snap-maked-fvb3-4-processed- trans 123365359 0.42 0.0154 5.2 4.3 6.2 5.2 4.0 TMVRN_INCGU TMV resistance N gene-8.19 trans 89826525 0.17 0.00336 76.8% 0.1 0.0 0.8 1.1 0.8 TMVRN_INCGU TMV resistance N snap-masked-fvb6-1-processed- cis 123365334 0.27 0.0336 76.8% 0.1 0.0 0.8 1.1 0.8 TMVRN_INCGU TMV resistance N snap-masked-fvb6-1-processed- cis 123366334 0.26 0.0465 1.1 0.0 0.8 1.1 0.8 TMVRN_INCGU TMV resistance N gene-352.19 trans 123357007 0.45 0.04	maker-fvb7-2-augustus-gene-65.21	CIS.	166512110	0.21	0.0031	69.2%	5.3	0.3	0.9	1.2	0.5	RP8L2_ARATH Probable disease resistance RPP8 2
maker-fvb7-2-snap-gene-161.50 cis 123364494 0.39 0.0052 38.9% 2.4 1.0 4.0 2.0 2.6 MAP1A_ARATH Methionine snap-maker-fvb7-2-snap-gene-161.50 cis 123365359 0.42 0.0052 38.9% 2.4 1.0 4.0 2.0 2.6 MAP1A_ARATH Methionine snap-maked-fvb3-4-processed- cis 123365359 0.42 0.0154 2.2 4.3 6.2 5.2 4.0 TMVRN_INCGU TMV resistance N snap-masked-fvb3-1-processed- cis 123365334 0.27 0.0033 76.8% 0.1 0.0 0.8 1.1 0.8 TMVRN_INCGU TMV resistance N snap-masked-fvb6-1-processed- cis 123366334 0.27 0.0336 76.8% 0.1 0.0 0.8 1.1 0.8 TMVRN_INCGU TMV resistance N gene-352.19 trans 123357007 0.42 0.0465 0.4665 0.4665 0.4665		trans	166509598	0.21	0.0031							
trans 123365359 0.42 0.0154 snap_masked-fvb3-4-processed- cis 166521734 0.16 0.0023 69.6% 2.2 4.3 6.2 5.2 4.0 TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N gene-8.19 trans 89826525 0.17 0.0033 76.8% 0.1 0.0 0.8 1.1 0.8 TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N snap_masked-fvb6-1-processed- cis 123366334 0.27 0.0306 76.8% 0.1 0.0 0.8 1.1 0.8 TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N gene-352.19 trans 123357007 0.42 0.0465 0.1 0.0 0.8 1.1 0.8 TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N	maker-fvb7-2-snap-gene-161.50	cis	123364494	0.39	0.0052	38.9%	2.4	1.0	4.0	2.0	2.6	MAP1A_ARATH Methionine aminopeptidase 1A MAP 1A 1A
snap_masked-fvb3-4-processed- cis 166521734 0.16 0.0023 69.6% 2.2 4.3 6.2 5.2 4.0 TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N gene-8.19 trans 89826525 0.17 0.0033 snap_masked-fvb6-1-processed- cis 123366334 0.27 0.0306 76.8% 0.1 0.0 0.8 1.1 0.8 TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N gene-352.19 trans 123357007 0.42 0.0465		trans	123365359	0.42	0.0154							
trans 89826525 0.17 0.0033 snap_masked-fvb6-1-processed- cis 123366334 0.27 0.0306 76.8% 0.1 0.0 0.8 1.1 0.8 TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N gene-352.19 trans 123357007 0.42 0.0465	snap_masked-fvb3-4-processed- gene-8.19	cis	166521734	0.16	0.0023	<i></i> %9.6%	2.2	4.3	6.2	5.2	4.0	TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N
snap_masked-fvb6-1-processed- cis 123366334 0.27 0.0306 76.8% 0.1 0.0 0.8 1.1 0.8 TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N gene-352.19 trans 123357007 0.42 0.0465)	trans	89826525	0.17	0.0033							
trans 123357007 0.42 0.0465	snap_masked-fvb6-1-processed- gene-352.19	CIS.	123366334	0.27	0.0306	76.8%	0.1	0.0	0.8	1.1	0.8	TMVRN_NICGU TMV resistance N
		trans	123357007	0.42	0.0465							

F. ×ananassa cultivars 'Mara des Bois' and 'Florida Elyana'. Benchtop RenSeq capture on genomic DNA was performed on a collection of sixteen strawberry genotypes, including twelve F. × ananassa advanced breeding selections, three F. ×ananassa disease-resistant cultivars, and a diploid F. vesca. As a preliminary validation of capture efficiency with this novel RenSeq probe panel, multiplexed Illumina sequencing was performed on captured R-gene genomic libraries. An average of 2.60 million reads $(2 \times 100 \text{ bp})$ was obtained for each of sixteen libraries from a single lane. Reads from octoploid and diploid lines were mapped to their respective annotated genomic references. An average R-gene resequencing depth of 26x was achieved in the 'Camarosa' RenSeq line and 30x in the F. vesca, with similar coverage ranges in the other diverse octoploid accessions (Figure 8). In the 'Camarosa' RenSeq line, 68% of reads mapped to an annotated resistance gene, while an additional 20% of reads mapped to a non-Rgene gene model. In F. vesca this efficiency was lower, where 36% of reads mapped to an annotated R-gene. A FASTA of RenSeq probes is provided for use in File S2. Example probe coverage is detailed in Figure S3.

DISCUSSION

1 1

These results provide a characterization of the R-gene complement of cultivated octoploid strawberry and the relationship to the extant diploid relatives, F. vesca and F. iinumae. Commercial strawberry is hypothesized to contain a single F. vesca-like subgenome, and three highlysimilar 'old world' subgenomes which are likely derived from F. iinumae, F. viridis, and F. nipponica (Edger et al. 2019). Polyploidization is associated with massive genome remodeling events including gene loss (Edger et al. 2018; Edger et al. 2017a). Linkage-map comparisons in octoploid and diploid strawberry have uncovered extensive unidirectional homeologous exchanges which have broadly converted the three 'old world' F. innumae-like subgenomes to be more F. vesca-like (Tennessen et al. 2014). This finding explains the difficulties of clear ancestral delineation of strawberry homeologs (Vining et al. 2017). Recent analysis of the octoploid genome reveals that biased homologous exchanges have converted other subgenomes to be more like the dominant F. vesca-like subgenome (Edger et al. 2019). The present gene-level homology and expression analysis shows the majority of F. vesca-like dominance is derived from F. vesca-like genes residing on alternate subgenomes. For NLR genes in particular, the bias toward F. vesca-like genomic retention was more pronounced. Unlike general octoploid genes, expression of F. vesca-like and F. iinumae-like NLRs is proportional to their genomic representation. This finding provides potential insight into the practical drivers of subgenome conversion. Consolidation of redundant genes and maintenance of stoichiometrically sensitive genes has been hypothesized as a driver for gene retention bias (Edger and Pires 2009; Birchler and Veitia 2012; Edger et al. 2017a). NLRs are involved in consequential and sensitive protein-level interactions, including signaling functions requiring homo- and hetero-dimerizations (El Kasmi and Nishimura 2016). Avoidance of dysfunctional NLR molecular interactions may have contributed to the observed biases in NLR retention and expression, post-polyploidization.

Multiple distinct NLR clades with identical domain architectures were detected, likely distinguishing intra-subgenome homologs from different subgenomes. These likely reflect broad ancestral sequence divergences prior to hybridization. Comparison of R-genes in octoploid and diploid strawberry reveals enrichment of different subtypes. The 'Camarosa' genome shows a large increase in complete TNL-type R-genes and a concomitant decrease in truncated TIR-only genes, relative to its diploid ancestral relatives. The F. iinumae genome shows a

Table 3, continued



Figure 4 Example *cis*-eQTL of a Fruit-Expressed Strawberry R-gene. A. Domain analysis of the 'Camarosa' putative resistance gene *FaDRL28*, a CC-NBS-LRR R-gene. Gray lines delineate exon-exon borders in the predicted mature transcript. B. Octoploid fruit expression of *FaDRL28* associates with a single locus on chromosome 5. C. A single dose of an "A" allele increases mean transcription of *FaDRL28* to above 25 TPM ("AB" genotype) from a mean approximately 1 TPM ("BB" genotype) (single-marker ANOVA *p*-value 1.6E-12). D. The *Fvb5-2* subgenomic location of *FaDRL28* in the octoploid 'Camarosa' genome is indicated (purple vertical line). E. Seven equally-significant eQTL markers (*p*-value 2.73E-05, post-FDR adjustment) show close subgenomic co-localization with *FaDRL28*, including one marker within the *FaDRL28* coding sequence (AX-123366087).

considerably larger amount of CNL-types. TNLs have been nearly eliminated from most monocot genomes in bias toward CNL-types (Nepal *et al.* 2017). The reasons for emerging divisions in TNL/CNL content in plant genomes remains unclear. In hybrid *F. ×ananassa*, it is possible that relatively high number of complete TNL genes is a result of higher rate of retention post-polyploidization in this category. Many of the non-classical domains discovered in 'Camarosa' R-genes have also been found and characterized in the R-genes of other species. These include an LRR/Malectin-like RLK protein, which mediates powdery mildew resistance in barley and wheat (Rajaraman *et al.* 2016). Atypical R-gene domains physically associated with NB-ARCs have been implicated in a variety of active disease resistance functions, including signal transduction and defense gene activation, and serving as decoy endogenous sequences to bait pathogen effectors into direct interaction and detection (Khan *et al.* 2016).

A large proportion of strawberry NLR genes from octoploid and diploid genomes are associated with RPW8 domains. It has been suggested that the RPW8 domain emerged with the earliest land plants and subsequently merged with NLR genes, however their prevalence across plant genomes varies widely (Zhong and Cheng 2016). The RPW8 domain appears to have been completely lost in monocots,

and is rare in many other species. R-gene genomic studies frequently neglect to assess the presence of NLR-associated RPW8 domains. Two NBS-RPW8 proteins conferring mildew-resistance have been described in the Arabidopsis thaliana genome (Xiao et al. 2001) that retained their function when expressed in grape (Hu et al. 2018). The AtRPW8.2 gene was recently shown to induce the expression of defense-related genes when expressed in strawberry leaves (Cui et al. 2017). This R-gene subtype has apparently expanded in strawberry, possibly due to unusually high mildew disease pressure exerted on strawberry species and intense selection for resistance. However, R-gene domain content is not reliably predictive of resistance specificity, and close R-gene paralogs are known to confer resistance to pathogens in entirely different kingdoms (Wen et al. 2015). Interestingly, the strawberry RPW8 domain is frequently found in association with NB-ARC-containing genes but never with TIRs. RPW8-containing genes are similar to general R-genes in terms of their frequency of expression, eQTL discovery rate, and putative orthology with F. vesca (Table S1). However, a significant and large difference was noted in terms of dN/dS ratio, indicating a higher degree of protein-level variability for this subclass. The purpose of RPW8 gene diversification and expansion in strawberry remains an interesting open question.



Figure 5 Evolutionary Pressures on F. × ananassa R-genes. The median dN/dS ratio for R-genes (0.47) is higher than for non R-genes (0.35). Density curves for F. × ananassa R-genes (blue) and non R-genes (red) are calculated based on comparison to the closest ancestral diploid homolog from F. vesca.

Octoploid NLR transcript accumulation is low throughout the strawberry plant, but is particularly low in the mature receptacle. This is an unexpected result due to the many pathogens targeting this susceptible organ. It is possible that only certain R-genes are highly upregulated in the response to pathogen attack. Another possibility is that resistance based on the hypersensitive response may be less effective

at mature stages, where cell wall disruption has already initiated with ripening and the intercellular environment is conducive to pathogen growth. Transcriptional response to *Botrytis cinerea* infection in the mature octoploid receptacle led to differential expression of over 1,500 genes, including secondary metabolism and pathogenesis-related (PR) genes, but only 15 NLR genes (Xiong *et al.* 2018). In the present study,

Α		Gene	Conten	t		в		Fruit Express	ion	
	<i>F. iinumae-</i> like	F. vesca- like	nie the r	% F. vesca- like	Total genes		F. iinumae-like TPM (12,762 expressed genes)	F. vesca -like TPM (32,663 expressedgenes)	nie the r TPM (559 expressed genes)	Total TPM
Fvb1-1	1,188	1,736	108	57.3%	3,032	Fvb1-1	8,360	24,301	277	32,939
Fvb1-2	1,443	1,930	112	55.4%	3,485	Fvb1-2	9,064	15,374	87	24,525
Fvb1-3	1,243	1,798	106	57.1%	3,147	Fvb1-3	7,666	15,364	243	23,272
Fvb1-4	504	2,593	132	80.3%	3,229	Fvb1-4	2,296	33,504	133	35,933
Fvb2-1	1,293	2,124	109	60.2%	3,526	Fvb2-1	8,291	24,535	138	32,963
Fvb2-2	588	2,836	163	79.1%	3,587	Fvb2-2	1,864	33,012	2,456	37,333
Fvb2-3	1,217	1,895	110	58.8%	3,222	Fvb2-3	7,893	25,382	210	33,485
Fvb2-4	1,631	2,017	118	53.6%	3,766	Fvb2-4	10,471	26,313	527	37,312
Fvb3-1	1,487	2,270	114	58.6%	3,871	Fvb3-1	16,794	19,921	388	37,103
Fvb3-2	1,830	2,102	139	51.6%	4,071	Fvb3-2	23,304	19,340	158	42,802
Fvb3-3	1,463	2,156	132	57.5%	3,751	Fvb3-3	17,609	21,526	231	39,365
Fvb3-4	697	3,206	138	79.3%	4,041	Fvb3-4	3,948	30,368	166	34,482
Fvb4-1	961	1,386	82	57.1%	2,429	Fvb4-1	6,457	37,194	31	43,682
Fvb4-2	1,245	1,743	148	55.6%	3,136	Fvb4-2	7,317	21,620	322	29,259
Fvb4-3	634	3,534	191	81.1%	4,359	Fvb4-3	4,118	37,246	231	41,595
Fvb4-4	1,319	1,537	130	51.5%	2,986	Fvb4-4	11,480	20,677	214	32,371
Fvb5-1	728	3,671	198	79.9%	4,597	Fvb5-1	3,275	33,971	284	37,531
Fvb5-2	1,199	2,018	118	60.5%	3,335	Fvb5-2	7,435	16,610	347	24,392
Fvb5-3	1,492	2,066	139	55.9%	3,697	Fvb5-3	11,851	17,926	220	29,997
Fvb5-4	1,232	1,902	137	58.1%	3,271	Fvb5-4	5,311	15,460	49	20,820
Fvb6-1	927	4,820	233	80.6%	5,980	Fvb6-1	3,522	65,588	348	69,458
Fvb6-2	1,782	2,919	203	59.5%	4,904	Fvb6-2	9,648	28,090	552	38,290
Fvb6-3	2,555	3,091	188	53.0%	5,834	Fvb6-3	26,622	32,002	555	59,178
Fvb6-4	1,810	2,670	145	57.7%	4,625	Fvb6-4	13,270	33,673	195	47,138
Fvb7-1	1,483	2,730	161	62.4%	4,374	Fvb7-1	7,579	20,190	612	28,381
Fvb7-2	1,046	3,853	231	75.1%	5,130	Fvb7-2	1,548	26,160	285	27,993
Fvb7-3	1,414	1,990	118	56.5%	3,522	Fvb7-3	11,301	20,874	74	32,248
Fvb7-4	966	2,071	143	65.1%	3,180	Fvb7-4	4,835	20,881	437	26,152
Total Genes	35,377	68,664	4,046	63.5%	108,087	Total TPM	253,128	737,102	9,770	1,000,000

Figure 6 General Retention and Expression Bias in Octoploid Strawberry. 'Camarosa' gene models from every chromosome are categorized as either more *F. vesca*-like, more *F. iinumae*-like, or neither. Red-green color scale indicates low-to-high gene content, respectively. Yellow highlight indicates the most *F. vesca*-like homeologous chromosome. A. Gene content per homeologous chromosome, by putative ancestral gene similarity. B. Relative transcript accumulation of all genes in the fruit, by putative ancestral similarity.

25.31%

73.71%

Percent

32.7%

63.5%

3.7%

Percent

0.98%

В

NLR Gene Fruit Expression



Figure 7 NLR-gene Retention and Expression Bias in Octoploid Strawberry. 'Camarosa' NB-ARC domain containing-NLR models from every chromosome are categorized as either more *F. vesca*-like, more *F. iinumae*-like, or neither. Red-green color scale indicates low-to-high gene content, respectively. Yellow highlight indicates the most F. vesca-like homeologous chromosome. A. NLR-gene content per homeologous chromosome, by putative ancestral gene similarity. B. Relative transcript accumulation of NLR-genes in the fruit, by putative ancestral similarity.

elevated NLR transcription in the green, white, and turning stages suggest NLR-based resistance may be more prevalent at these earlier developmental stages. The highest levels of NLR expression were seen in the roots and leaves, indicating this mode of resistance may be more common in these tissues. Root-dominant expression of NLRs is common in many but not all plant species (Munch et al. 2018). Strawberry NLR expression overlaps poorly between tissues, supporting the concept that NLRs are optimized for each tissue (Munch et al. 2018). Based on these patterns of expression, resistance to soil-borne pathogens via NLR-genes may be more common in strawberry. It would be interesting to examine the patterns of tissue-specific expression of R-genes against different strawberry pathogens, particularly the common soilborne pathogens causing strawberry verticillium wilt (Verticillium dahlia), charcol rot (Macrophomina phaseolina), and Fusarium wilt (Fusarium oxysporum f.sp. fragariae) (Zurn et al. 2018). Across 61 mature fruit transcriptomes, a greater number of putatively expressed NLR genes were found compared to 'Camarosa' mature fruit alone. This signifies possible genetic/environmental variabilities which can be measured via eQTL analysis.

The genetics of differential fruit expression of all R-genes in strawberry cultivars was examined via eQTL analysis. In many cases, the identified genetic markers described presence/absence of R-gene expression. The identified eQTLs were often due to a *cis* variant at a single detectable locus, very close to the physical position of the gene itself. This is suggestive of a mutation in a *cis*-regulatory element, such as the gene promoter or 5'-UTR, or a genic presence/absence structural variation. Such presence/absence variation affects nearly 20% of genes in

the Brassica oleracea pangenome and is a major contributor of agronomic trait diversity (Golicz et al. 2016). As these strawberry R-gene eQTL are derived from crosses of cultivars with differing ranges of pathogen susceptibility, these eQTL genes represent strong candidates for functional disease resistance and potential genetic improvement. These disclosed R-gene eQTL marker sequences may be cross-referenced with existing disease-resistance QTL to potentially identify causal R-genes. As categories of R-genes are expressed at very low levels unless induced by pathogens (Lai and Eulgem 2017), the genotype × pathogen interaction may have lowered confidence values or introduced possible type II errors in eQTL detection. However, the reproducibility of cis-eQTL tends to be particularly high in related populations (Peirce et al. 2006). Additional replicates and infected/non-infected challenge conditions will likely reveal additional eQTL associations and greatly improve the confidence of heritability estimates, and may be used to validate pathogen-induced R-gene candidates.

F. × *ananassa* predicted R-genes (NLRs and other R-gene types) have elevated average dN/dS ratios compared to non R-genes, indicating greater overall tendency toward divergent selection. R-genes with very low dN/dS ratios are likely to be conserved disease resistance genes. This active evolutionary selection is highly indicative of function. Of particular interest are strawberry R-genes demonstrating both low dN/dS values and low transcript levels across all tissues (Table S1). Many functional R-genes are expressed at low levels, either constitutively or until elicited by the proper pathogen (Lai and Eulgem 2017). Such R-genes may be difficult to distinguish from pseudogenes on a purely transcriptional bases. Low dN/dS values demonstrate selective



Figure 8 RenSeq Increases Sequencing Depth for R-gene Loci in Multiplexed Octoploid Genomes. Sixteen disease-resistant strawberry genomic libraries (fifteen octoploid accessions and diploid F. vesca) were enriched for R-genes and sequenced via Illumina HiSeq yielding an average of 2.60 million reads per genomic library. Violin plots indicate the range of R-gene resequencing depth from each genomic RenSeq library. Roughly half of all sequencing reads mapped to a previously-identified R-gene locus, representing a substantial sequence enrichment relative to R-gene genomic representation.

pressure to maintain these sequences, offering evidence of maintained function despite low expression. The results of this combinatorial analysis can be used help identify novel sources of R-gene-based resistance which may be otherwise difficult to detect. It should be noted that this analysis is performed in the context of a single cultivar, which has undergone several centuries of artificial selection. It is possible that wild octoploid species may reveal different and more natural patterns of disease-resistance selection. More sequenced accessions from geographically diverse wild and cultivated germplasm are needed. Further analysis on the octoploid pangenome will reveal more detailed selection patterns, and more importantly, reveal recent selection sweep events which may have occurred in certain R-gene groups.

Many R-genes were discovered clustered in the genomes of both octoploid and diploid strawberry, highlighting the challenges of resolving individual R-genes via association mapping and positional cloning. The difficulty of isolating functional R-genes from strawberry disease resistance QTL was the principle motivator of this analysis. A thorough identification of R-genes in the octoploid genome is necessary for future genomics and genetics analysis in strawberry disease-resistance breeding programs. Additionally, this information is prerequisite for creating a RenSeq probe panel, to facilitate targeted R-gene sequencing in breeding programs.

A novel strawberry RenSeq capture-probe library was developed based on the R-gene sequences identified from genomic and transcriptomic resources. This 39,501-probe panel was experimentally validated using octoploid and diploid genomes and resulted in an average \sim 20× R-gene resequencing depth per genomic library, using only multiplexed short reads. RenSeq assembly in 'Camarosa' and the F. vesca genotype Hawaii 4 resulted in significant coverage of R-genes. Despite having the highest total resequencing depth, the capture efficiency in F. vesca (R-gene reads over total reads) was somewhat lower. It is possible that this represents the saturation of capture probes in a smaller genome. It is also possible that probes designed from non-F. vesca-like octoploid sequences bound spuriously in the F. vesca genome. Similar rates of perfect sequence matching along the entire read in 'Camarosa' and F. vesca (66.24% and 69.68%, respectively) indicates that theoretical octoploid reference sequence errors are not likely promoting RenSeq assembly error in 'Camarosa'. However, 14.4% of mapped 'Camarosa' R-gene reads have an equally valid alternative R-gene mapping locus, compared with just 4.83% in F. vesca. This difference indicates that homeologous sequence redundancy is an appreciable issue for mapping short-reads in polyploids, even with an isogenic (but not haplotype-specific) mapping reference. Longer sequencing read-lengths, spanning less well-conserved non-coding sequences, will assist in de novo resolution of similar loci in octoploid strawberry. Combining RenSeq with long-read sequencing technologies will allow for improved de novo assembly of R-gene loci, and will greatly facilitate causal mutation detection within disease resistance QTL in octoploid strawberry.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We acknowledge Aristotle Koukoulidis for ncoils prediction and annotation, Matthew Robinson for assistance with data normalization, Rapid Genomics LLC for technical assistance in probe generation and sequence capture, Anne Schwartz, Max Hogshead, Kiran Sharma and Nadia Mourad for assistance in data compilation, Ben Harrison and Max Hogshead for assistance in gDNA isolation of eQTL lines, and Dr. Alan Chambers and Dr. Jeremy Pillet for RNA isolation and RNAseq line selection. This research is supported by grants to SJK, VMW, and SL from the United Stated Department of Agriculture (http://dx.doi.org/10.13039/100000199) National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) Specialty Crops Research Initiative (#2017-51181-26833) and to SJK from the California Strawberry Commission (http://dx.doi.org/10.13039/100006760).

LITERATURE CITED

- Amil-Ruiz, F., R. Blanco-Portales, J. Muñoz-Blanco, and J. L. Caballero, 2011 The Strawberry Plant Defense Mechanism: A Molecular Review. Plant Cell Physiol. 52: 1873–1903. https://doi.org/10.1093/pcp/pcr136
- Anciro, A., J. Mangandi, S. Verma, N. Peres, V.M. Whitaker *et al.*, 2018 FaRCg1: a quantitative trait locus conferring resistance to Colletotrichum crown rot caused by Colletotrichum gloeosporioides in octoploid strawberry. Theoretical and Applied Genetics. https://doi.org/ 10.1007/s00122-018-3145-z
- Andolfo, G., F. Jupe, K. Witek, G. J. Etherington, M. R. Ercolano *et al.*, 2014 Defining the full tomato NB-LRR resistance gene repertoire using genomic and cDNA RenSeq. BMC Plant Biol. 14: 120. https://doi.org/ 10.1186/1471-2229-14-120
- Arya, P., G. Kumar, V. Acharya, and A. K. Singh, 2014 Genome-Wide Identification and Expression Analysis of NBS-Encoding Genes in Malus x domestica and Expansion of NBS Genes Family in Rosaceae. PLoS One 9: e107987. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0107987
- Baumgartner, I. O., A. Patocchi, J. E. Frey, A. Peil, and M. Kellerhals, 2015 Breeding Elite Lines of Apple Carrying Pyramided Homozygous Resistance Genes Against Apple Scab and Resistance Against Powdery Mildew and Fire Blight. Plant Mol. Biol. Report. 33: 1573–1583. https:// doi.org/10.1007/s11105-015-0858-x
- Birchler, J. A., and R. A. Veitia, 2012 Gene balance hypothesis: Connecting issues of dosage sensitivity across biological disciplines. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 109: 14746–14753. https://doi.org/10.1073/ pnas.1207726109
- Cockerton, H. M., R. J. Vickerstaff, A. Karlström, F. Wilson, M. Sobczyk et al., 2018 Identification of powdery mildew resistance QTL in strawberry (Fragaria × ananassa). Theor. Appl. Genet. 131: 1995–2007. https:// doi.org/10.1007/s00122-018-3128-0
- Conesa, A., S. Götz, J. M. García-Gómez, J. Terol, M. Talón et al., 2005 Blast2GO: a universal tool for annotation, visualization and analysis in functional genomics research. Bioinformatics 21: 3674–3676. https://doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/bti610
- Cordova, L. G., A. Amiri, and N. A. Peres, 2017 Effectiveness of fungicide treatments following the Strawberry Advisory System for control of Botrytis fruit rot in Florida. Crop Prot. 100: 163–167. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.cropro.2017.07.002
- Cui, M.-Y., W. Wei, K. Gao, Y.-G. Xie, Y. Guo et al., 2017 A rapid and efficient Agrobacterium-mediated transient gene expression system for strawberry leaves and the study of disease resistance proteins. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 131: 233–246 (PCTOC). https://doi.org/10.1007/ s11240-017-1279-3
- Djian-Caporalino, C., A. Palloix, A. Fazari, N. Marteu, A. Barbary *et al.*, 2014 Pyramiding, alternating or mixing: comparative performances of deployment strategies of nematode resistance genes to promote plant resistance efficiency and durability. BMC Plant Biol. 14: 53. https:// doi.org/10.1186/1471-2229-14-53
- Edgar, R. C., 2004 MUSCLE: multiple sequence alignment with high accuracy and high throughput. Nucleic Acids Res. 32: 1792–1797. https:// doi.org/10.1093/nar/gkh340
- Edger, P. P., M. R. McKain, K. A. Bird, and R. VanBuren, 2018 Subgenome assignment in allopolyploids: challenges and future directions. Curr. Opin. Plant Biol. 42: 76–80. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pbi.2018.03.006

- Edger, P. P., and J. C. Pires, 2009 Gene and genome duplications: the impact of dosage-sensitivity on the fate of nuclear genes. Chromosome Res. 17: 699–717. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10577-009-9055-9
- Edger, P. P., T. J. Poorten, R. VanBuren, M. A. Hardigan, M. Colle *et al.*,
 2019 Origin and evolution of the octoploid strawberry genome.
 Nat. Genet. 51: 541–547. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41588-019-0356-4
- Edger, P. P., R. Smith, M. R. McKain, A. M. Cooley, M. Vallejo-Marin et al., 2017a Subgenome Dominance in an Interspecific Hybrid, Synthetic Allopolyploid, and a 140-Year-Old Naturally Established Neo-Allopolyploid Monkeyflower. Plant Cell 29: 2150–2167. https://doi.org/ 10.1105/tpc.17.00010
- Edger, P. P., R. VanBuren, M. Colle, T. J. Poorten, C. M. Wai et al., 2017b Single-molecule sequencing and optical mapping yields an improved genome of woodland strawberry (Fragaria vesca) with chromosome-scale contiguity. Gigascience 7: 1–7. https://doi.org/ 10.1093/gigascience/gix124
- El Kasmi, F., and M. T. Nishimura, 2016 Structural insights into plant NLR immune receptor function. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 113: 12619–12621. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1615933113
- Farzaneh, M., H. Kiani, R. Sharifi, M. Reisi, and J. Hadian, 2015 Chemical composition and antifungal effects of three species of Satureja (S. hortensis, S. spicigera, and S. khuzistanica) essential oils on the main pathogens of strawberry fruit. Postharvest Biol. Technol. 109: 145–151. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.postharvbio.2015.06.014
- Funk, A., P. Galewski, and J. M. McGrath, 2018 Nucleotide-binding resistance gene signatures in sugar beet, insights from a new reference genome. Plant J. 95: 659–671. https://doi.org/10.1111/tpj.13977
- Golicz, A. A., P. E. Bayer, G. C. Barker, P. P. Edger, H. Kim *et al.*, 2016 The pangenome of an agronomically important crop plant Brassica oleracea. Nat. Commun. 7: 13390. https://doi.org/10.1038/ncomms13390
- Hammond-Kosack, K. E., and J. D. G. Jones, 1997 Plant Disease Resistance Genes. Annu. Rev. Plant Physiol. Plant Mol. Biol. 48: 575–607. https:// doi.org/10.1146/annurev.arplant.48.1.575
- Herrington, M. E., C. Hardner, M. Wegener, L. L. Woolcock, and M. J. Dieters, 2011 Rain Damage to Strawberries Grown in Southeast Queensland: Evaluation and Genetic Control. HortScience 46: 832–837. https://doi.org/10.21273/HORTSCI.46.6.832
- Hirakawa, H., K. Shirasawa, S. Kosugi, K. Tashiro, S. Nakayama *et al.*, 2014 Dissection of the Octoploid Strawberry Genome by Deep Sequencing of the Genomes of Fragaria Species. DNA Res. 21: 169–181. https://doi.org/10.1093/dnares/dst049
- Hu, Y., Y. Li, F. Hou, D. Wan, Y. Cheng *et al.*, 2018 Ectopic expression of Arabidopsis broad-spectrum resistance gene RPW8.2 improves the resistance to powdery mildew in grapevine (Vitis vinifera). Plant Sci. 267: 20–31. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.plantsci.2017.11.005
- Jia, Y., Y. Yuan, Y. Zhang, S. Yang, and X. Zhang, 2015 Extreme expansion of NBS-encoding genes in Rosaceae. BMC Genet. 16: 48. https://doi.org/ 10.1186/s12863-015-0208-x
- Jupe, F., X. Chen, W. Verweij, K. Witek, J. D. G. Jones et al., 2014 Genomic DNA Library Preparation for Resistance Gene Enrichment and Sequencing (RenSeq) in Plants, pp. 291–303 in *Plant-Pathogen Interactions: Methods and Protocols*, edited by Birch, P., J. T. Jones, and J. I. B. Bos. Humana Press, Totowa, NJ. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-62703-986-4_22
- Jupe, F., L. Pritchard, G. J. Etherington, K. MacKenzie, P. J. A. Cock et al., 2012 Identification and localisation of the NB-LRR gene family within the potato genome. BMC Genomics 13: 75. https://doi.org/10.1186/ 1471-2164-13-75
- Khan, M., R. Subramaniam, and D. Desveaux, 2016 Of guards, decoys, baits and traps: pathogen perception in plants by type III effector sensors. Curr. Opin. Microbiol. 29: 49–55. https://doi.org/10.1016/ j.mib.2015.10.006
- Lai, Y., and T. Eulgem, 2017 Transcript-level expression control of plant NLR genes. Mol. Plant Pathol. 19: 1267–1281. https://doi.org/10.1111/ mpp.12607
- Lukasik, E., and F. L. W. Takken, 2009 STANDing strong, resistance proteins instigators of plant defence. Curr. Opin. Plant Biol. 12: 427–436. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pbi.2009.03.001

Lupas, A., M. Van Dyke, and J. Stock, 1991 Predicting Coiled Coils from Protein Sequences. Science 252: 1162–1164. https://doi.org/10.1126/ science.252.5009.1162

Mangandi, J., S. Verma, L. Osorio, N.A. Peres, E. van de Weg et al., 2017 Pedigree-Based Analysis in a Multiparental Population of Octoploid Strawberry Reveals QTL Alleles Conferring Resistance to Phytophthora cactorum. G3: (Bethesda)7: 1707.

Metsalu, T., and J. Vilo, 2015 ClustVis: a web tool for visualizing clustering of multivariate data using Principal Component Analysis and heatmap. Nucleic Acids Res. 43: W566–W570. https://doi.org/10.1093/nar/gkv468

Miller, M. A., W. Pfeiffer, and T. Schwartz, 2010 Creating the CIPRES Science Gateway for inference of large phylogenetic trees, pp. 1–8 in *Proceedings of the Gateway Computing Environments Workshop (GCE)*. IEEE, New Orleans.

Munch, D., V. Gupta, A. Bachmann, W. Busch, S. Kelly et al., 2018 The Brassicaceae Family Displays Divergent, Shoot-Skewed NLR Resistance Gene Expression. Plant Physiol. 176: 1598–1609. https://doi.org/10.1104/ pp.17.01606

Nellist, C. F., R. J. Vickerstaff, M. K. Sobczyk, C. Marina-Montes, F. M. Wilson *et al.*, 2019 Quantitative trait loci controlling Phytophthora cactorum resistance in the cultivated octoploid strawberry (Fragaria × ananassa). Hortic. Res. 6: 60. https://doi.org/10.1038/ s41438-019-0136-4

Nepal, P. M., J. E. Andersen, S. Neupane, and V. B. Benson, 2017 Comparative Genomics of Non-TNL Disease Resistance Genes from Six Plant Species. Genes (Basel) 8. https://doi.org/10.3390/ genes8100249

Peirce, J. L., H. Li, J. Wang, K. F. Manly, R. J. Hitzemann et al., 2006 How replicable are mRNA expression QTL? Mamm. Genome 17: 643–656. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00335-005-0187-8

Pincot, D. D. A., T. J. Poorten, M. A. Hardigan, J. M. Harshman, C. B. Acharya *et al.*, 2018 Genome-Wide Association Mapping Uncovers *Fw1*, a Dominant Gene Conferring Resistance to Fusarium Wilt in Strawberry. G3: (Bethesda)8: 1817.

R. Development Core Team, 2014 R: A language and environment for statistical computing.

Rajaraman, J., D. Douchkov, G. Hensel, F. L. Stefanato, A. Gordon *et al.*, 2016 An LRR/Malectin Receptor-Like Kinase Mediates Resistance to Non-adapted and Adapted Powdery Mildew Fungi in Barley and Wheat. Front. Plant Sci. 7: 1836. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2016.01836

Roach, J. A., S. Verma, N. A. Peres, A. R. Jamieson, W. E. van de Weg et al., 2016 FaRXf1: a locus conferring resistance to angular leaf spot caused by Xanthomonas fragariae in octoploid strawberry. Theor. Appl. Genet. 129: 1191–1201. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00122-016-2695-1

Salinas, N., S. Verma, N. Peres, and V.M. Whitaker, 2018 FaRCa1: a major subgenome-specific locus conferring resistance to Colletotrichum acutatum in strawberry. *Theoretical and Applied Genetics*.

Stamatakis, A., 2014 RAxML version 8: a tool for phylogenetic analysis and post-analysis of large phylogenies. Bioinformatics 30: 1312–1313. https:// doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btu033

Suyama, M., D. Torrents, and P. Bork, 2006 PAL2NAL: robust conversion of protein sequence alignments into the corresponding codon alignments. Nucleic acids research 34 (suppl_2): W609–W612. https://doi.org/ 10.1093/nar/gkl315

Sánchez-Sevilla, J. F., J. G. Vallarino, S. Osorio, A. Bombarely, D. Posé et al., 2017 Gene expression atlas of fruit ripening and transcriptome assembly from RNA-seq data in octoploid strawberry (Fragaria×ananasa). Sci. Rep. 7: 13737. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-017-14239-6

Tang, H., V. Krishnakumar, and J. Li, 2015 jcvi: JCVI utility libraries.

Tang, Y., X. Liu, J. Wang, M. Li, Q. Wang et al., 2016 GAPIT Version 2: An Enhanced Integrated Tool for Genomic Association and Prediction. Plant Genome 9: 2. https://doi.org/10.3835/ plantgenome2015.11.0120

Tennessen, J. A., R. Govindarajulu, T.-L. Ashman, and A. Liston, 2014 Evolutionary Origins and Dynamics of Octoploid Strawberry Subgenomes Revealed by Dense Targeted Capture Linkage Maps. Genome Biol. Evol. 6: 3295–3313. https://doi.org/10.1093/gbe/evu261

van Dijk, T., G. Pagliarani, A. Pikunova, Y. Noordijk, H. Yilmaz-Temel *et al.*, 2014 Genomic rearrangements and signatures of breeding in the allooctoploid strawberry as revealed through an allele dose based SSR linkage map. BMC Plant Biol. 14: 55. https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2229-14-55

Van Ghelder, C., and D. Esmenjaud, 2016 TNL genes in peach: insights into the post-LRR domain. BMC Genomics 17: 317. https://doi.org/ 10.1186/s12864-016-2635-0

Verma, S., N. V. Bassil, E. van de Weg, R. J. Harrison, A. Monfort *et al.*, 2017 Development and evaluation of the Axiom IStraw35 384HT array for the allo-octoploid cultivated strawberry Fragaria ×ananassa. Acta Hortic. 1156: 75–82.

Verma, S., L. F. Osorio, S. Lee, N. V. Bassil, and V. M. Whitaker, 2018 Genome-Assisted Breeding in the Octoploid Strawberry, pp. 161–184 in *The Genomes of Rosaceous Berries and Their Wild Relatives*, edited by Hytönen, T., J. Graham, and R. Harrison. Springer International Publishing, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-76020-9_12

Vining, K. J., N. Salinas, J. A. Tennessen, J. D. Zurn, D. J. Sargent *et al.*, 2017 Genotyping-by-sequencing enables linkage mapping in three octoploid cultivated strawberry families. PeerJ 5: e3731. https://doi.org/ 10.7717/peerj.3731

Wen, Z., L. Yao, R. Wan, Z. Li, C. Liu *et al.*, 2015 Ectopic Expression in Arabidopsis thaliana of an NB-ARC Encoding Putative Disease Resistance Gene from Wild Chinese Vitis pseudoreticulata Enhances Resistance to Phytopathogenic Fungi and Bacteria. Front. Plant Sci. 6: 1087. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2015.01087

Witek, K., F. Jupe, A. I. Witek, D. Baker, M. D. Clark *et al.*, 2016 Accelerated cloning of a potato late blight-resistance gene using RenSeq and SMRT sequencing. Nat. Biotechnol. 34: 656–660. https:// doi.org/10.1038/nbt.3540

Xiao, S., S. Ellwood, O. Calis, E. Patrick, T. Li *et al.*, 2001 Broad-Spectrum Mildew Resistance in Arabidopsis thaliana Mediated by RPW8. https:// doi.org/10.1126/science.291.5501.118

Xiong, J.-S., H.-Y. Zhu, Y.-B. Bai, H. Liu, and Z.-M. Cheng, 2018 RNA sequencing-based transcriptome analysis of mature strawberry fruit infected by necrotrophic fungal pathogen Botrytis cinerea. Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol. 104: 77–85. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pmpp.2018.08.005

Yang, Z., 2007 PAML 4: phylogenetic analysis by maximum likelihood. Mol. Biol. Evol. 24: 1586–1591. https://doi.org/10.1093/molbev/msm088

Zhong, Y., and Z.-M. M. Cheng, 2016 A unique RPW8-encoding class of genes that originated in early land plants and evolved through domain fission, fusion, and duplication. Sci. Rep. 6: 32923. https://doi.org/ 10.1038/srep32923

Zhong, Y., X. Zhang, and Z.-M. Cheng, 2018 Lineage-specific duplications of NBS-LRR genes occurring before the divergence of six Fragaria species. BMC Genomics 19: 128. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12864-018-4521-4

Zurn, J. D., K. L. Ivors, V. M. Whitaker, S. J. Knapp, K. E. Hummer et al., 2018 Searching for resistance to soilborne pathogens in cultivated strawberries and the Fragaria supercore. American Phytopathological Society Annual Meeting.

Communicating editor: J. Holland